# Manuscript evaluation guidelines Title: Abortion, Stakeholders and Judicial Responses: Global Milieu and the Indian Supreme Court

1. Importance of the paper  
  
           Does it address issues relevant to the fields of bioethics and medical ethics in the developing countries?

Yes it does  
  
2. Is it topical?  
  
           Is the issue discussed from another country's/culture perspective?

It has a global perspective  
  
           Will it influence practice or policy?

It might not  
  
           Is it too specialized for the journal?

No it is not  
  
3. Originality  
  
           Is the information /comment new?

It looks at the latest developments in the Indian law on abortion and discusses the cases and judgments in various jurisdictions. While there are several articles which deal with the issues, this is contemporary and attempts to analyze the Indian judgments and trace the development of the case law in India

Is there any likelihood of plagiarism?  
No  
  
4. Conclusions  
           Is the interpretation warranted, unwarranted, well developed?

Does the article contain loose generalisations?  
  
           Are there any important omissions?

The article fails to look at the demographic considerations of the abortion law. The MTP Act in India was passed not as a victory of pro-choice movement, but due to demographic considerations. Similarly in the US, there is literature on the racial differential in the implementation of the abortion policy. The author has failed to look at these issues. Similarly there are feminist writings on the development of fetal rights to defeat the pro choice movement and the medicalization of the debate. There is no critique of the manner of implementation and development of the law. There is an implied assumption of state neutrality in the implementation of competing rights which fails to take into account the politics of abortion. The discussion also fails to look at the questions raised by the differently abled groups on the development of abortion rights. The discussion on the Indian law also fails to look at the PCPNDT Act and the issue of sex selective abortions. The author could delete the section which lists and describes the various judgments and instead should focus on the discussion and analysis of the judgments and the role of medical personnel in shaping the law- it would be interesting to know what are the factors that lead the courts to decide when to permit and when to disallow abortions.

             
  
5. Other comments  
  
  
6. Recommendation  
  
 Accept as is  
  
 Accept with modifications (specify)   
  
 - style

- substance- As stated in S.NO.4  
  
  
7. Separate comments for the author