**Title**: Combating Corruption in the Pharmaceutical Arena

**Authors**: Joel Lexchin, Jillian Kohler, Marc-Andre Gagnon, James Crombie, Paul Thacker, Adrienne Shnier

**Review Comments:**

**Reviewer 1**

1. There are some unwarranted or inadequate arguments at places: for example, the argument about delinking profits from sales is not clear in the absence of details as to how will the pharma sector function in a capitalist paradigm. If an alternative socio-political paradigm is being advocated, it needs to be fleshed out and a road map indicated.
2. The article is a broad-brush survey and may not touch concerns in India without specific examples. Even for a Western audience it touches on various issues but they are not fleshed out. They do not deal with the politics of price gouging in US for instance and the response of the US Administration. The article does not interrogate the costs and prices unethically claimed by pharma companies.
3. Important omissions include: issues pertaining to WHO regulation, vaccine approval, GAVI, IP rights, et al and how they influence and are influenced by pharma companies?
4. Value based pricing alluded to seems to be vague. Suggest the article mention the broad factors – somewhat well known – but focus on the how value based pricing can really work in the real world. That will be a new contribution to IJME readers.
5. Maybe include some search on issues relevant to India where majority of health care is in private hands.

**Reviewer 2**

This is a very well written article on corruption in the pharma industry. I am however concerned for two reasons.

1. It is highly relevant to the USA and Canada context, but how is it relevant to the reader of the Indian subcontinent, or even the South Asian context is questionable.
2. It is a topic which has been handled extensively in the past. What new perspective does it bring to the discourse on corruption in the pharma industry?