**Title:** Evaluation of adherence of Case Reports published in PUBMED indexed Indian medical journals in one year with the CARE 2013 guidelines

**Authors**: Renju Ravi, Alhad Mulkalwar, Urmila Thatte, Nithya Gogtay

Recommendation:

Rework and submit to be considered for review.

Editor Comments:

1. There is an important point being made regarding case reports – the key ethical issue is the need to obtain informed consent as these do not actually constitute research and therefore are exempt from review by IECs. However, each person reporting is required to obtain written informed consent from the patient whose case is being reported. This is very important in the light of the need to sufficiently anonymise the case report to avoid identification.

2. However, by merely focusing on CARE guidelines and not mentioning the care taken to ensure reporting on obtaining consent is a serious lacunae. The authors need to focus on this in the introduction – but they focus on CARE guidelines for reporting – without mentioning what is required. Item 13 of the CARE checklist requires provision of information on the informed consent.

3. This will shift the focus of the paper from one on adherence to CARE guidelines in Indian Journals to lack of reporting on Informed consent as required in Indian journals reporting of case reports. That will bring the paper within the ambit of IJME.

Please rework the paper along these lines before we can send it for review.