Banwari – Fatal surgical errors

Review:

1. It is not clear who the author is and how he or she has access to patient records
2. The article makes a number of statements for which we have no proof other than the word of the doctor.
3. The article refers to photographs. I did not see any. It is also a matter of concern how these photographs were obtained.
4. The subject matter of the article is highly contentious. The author is stating that many medical practitioners in the Transkei region of Africa are criminally negligent. If this is so, it is worth highlighting but without independent corroboration, I suggest caution.
5. Article has several lines like the one quoted below – the conclusion does not follow from the initial statement.

“Xhosa society is not litigious in nature. They leave everything to God. This is because the people are poor and illiterate”

I strongly advise sending it to another reviewer and also the editor in chief Dr. Amar Jesani.

George Thomas