**Manuscript evaluation guidelines**Title:  
  
  
1. Importance of the paper  
  
           Does it address issues relevant to the fields of bioethics and medical ethics in the developing countries? YES  
  
2. Is it topical?  
  
           Is the issue discussed from another country's/culture perspective? NO  
  
           Will it influence practice or policy? IT COULD  
  
           Is it too specialized for the journal? NO  
  
3. Originality  
  
           Is the information /comment new? NO

Is there any likelihood of plagiarism? NO  
  
  
4. Conclusions  
           Is the interpretation warranted, unwarranted, well developed? UNWARRANTED  
  
           Does the article contain loose generalisations? YES  
  
           Are there any important omissions? YES  
  
  
5. Other comments: This is an important topic in Public health ethics- the ethics governing immunistion. Unfortunately the authors have primarily approached it from a clinical perspective and largely ignored the substantive literature on Public Health Ethics. The discussion could have been much richer had they consulted the original writings on Public Health Ethics, though they do mention the principles of utilitarianism and rights. The different options should have been discussed in detail. As an example, though the immunization program in India for Polio does not offer a choice, there is no legal sanction against opting out. And the weighing of rights of the child to be immunized, versus the choice of the parent, is another important issue which is completely ignored  
  
  
6. Recommendation  
  
 Accept as is  
  
 Accept with modifications (specify)  
  
 - style

- substance  
  
**This is about an important topic, so I would not recommend rejection. But it has to be rewritten extensively to be considered for publication**  
7. Separate comments for the author

Please consult the extensive literature on Public health ethics and how it differs from clinical/ research ethics, as well as its implications for immunization.

Please let us know whether you would like your name to be published as a reviewer of the manuscript.

This is optional. NO