

# On upper bounds on the smallest size of a saturating set in a projective plane\*

Daniele Bartoli<sup>1</sup>, Alexander A. Davydov<sup>2</sup>, Massimo Giulietti<sup>3</sup>,  
Stefano Marcugini<sup>4</sup>, and Fernanda Pambianco<sup>5</sup>

**Abstract:** Using probabilistic methods the following upper bound on the smallest size  $s(2, q)$  of a saturating set in a projective plane  $\Pi_q$  (not necessary Desarguesian) of order  $q$  is proved:

$$s(2, q) \leq 2\sqrt{(q+1)\ln(q+1)} + 2 \sim 2\sqrt{q\ln q}.$$

As byproduct, we obtain that in  $\Pi_q$  a random point  $k$ -set with

$$k \leq 2c\sqrt{(q+1)\ln(q+1)} + 2 < \frac{q^2 - 1}{q + 2}, \quad c \geq 1 \text{ independent of } q,$$

is a saturating set with probability

$$p > 1 - \frac{1}{q^{2c^2-2}}.$$

---

\*D. Bartoli acknowledges the support of the European Community under a Marie-Curie Intra-European Fellowship (FACE project: number 626511). The research of M. Giulietti, S. Marcugini, and F. Pambianco was supported by Ministry for Education, University and Research of Italy (MIUR) (Project "Geometrie di Galois e strutture di incidenza") and by the Italian National Group for Algebraic and Geometric Structures and their Applications (GNSAGA - INdAM). The research of A.A. Davydov was carried out at the IITP RAS at the expense of the Russian Foundation for Sciences (project 14-50-00150).

<sup>1</sup>Department of Mathematics Ghent University, Ghent, 9000, Belgium, E-mail: dbartoli@cage.ugent.be

<sup>2</sup>Institute for Information Transmission Problems (Kharkevich institute), Russian Academy of Sciences, GSP-4, Moscow, 127994, Russian Federation, E-mail: adav@iitp.ru

<sup>3</sup>Department of Mathematics and Informatics, Perugia University, Perugia, 06123, Italy, E-mail: massimo.giulietti@unipg.it

<sup>4</sup>Department of Mathematics and Informatics, Perugia University, Perugia, 06123, Italy, E-mail: stefano.marcugini@unipg.it

<sup>5</sup>Department of Mathematics and Informatics, Perugia University, Perugia, 06123, Italy, E-mail: fernanda.pambianco@unipg.it

**Mathematics Subject Classification:** 51E21, 51E22, 94B05

**Keywords:** saturating sets, projective plane, small saturating sets, upper bounds

## 1 Introduction

We denote by  $\Pi_q$  a projective plane (not necessary Desarguesian) of order  $q$  and by  $PG(2, q)$  the projective plane over the Galois field of  $q$  elements. For an introduction to projective geometries over finite fields see [13].

A point set  $S \subset \Pi_q$  is *saturating* if any point of  $\Pi_q \setminus S$  is collinear with two points in  $S$ , see [8, 9, 12, 17] and references therein. It should be noted that saturating sets are also called “saturated sets” [15, 17], “spanning sets” [5], and “dense sets” [3, 10, 11].

The points of a saturating set in  $PG(2, q)$  form a parity check matrix of a  $q$ -ary linear covering code with codimension 3, covering radius 2, and minimum distance 3 or 4. For an introduction to covering codes see [4, 6]. An online bibliography on covering codes is given in [16].

The main problem in this context is to find small saturating sets (i.e. short covering codes).

Let  $s(2, q)$  be the smallest size of a saturating set in  $\Pi_q$ .

In [3] using the approach of [15] by probabilistic methods the following upper bound is proved:

$$s(2, q) < 3\sqrt{2}\sqrt{q \ln q} < 5\sqrt{q \ln q}. \quad (1.1)$$

Surveys on random constructions for geometrical objects can be found in [3, 10, 14, 15], see also references therein. Saturating sets in  $PG(2, q)$  obtained by algebraic constructions and computer search can be found in [2, 5, 7–9, 11, 12, 17].

In this paper, we use probabilistic methods to obtain upper bounds on  $s(2, q)$ . The main results are given by the following theorems.

**Theorem 1.** *For the smallest size  $s(2, q)$  of a saturating set in the projective plane (not necessary Desarguesian) of order  $q$  the following upper bound holds.*

$$s(2, q) \leq 2\sqrt{(q+1) \ln(q+1)} + 2 \sim 2\sqrt{q \ln q}. \quad (1.2)$$

**Theorem 2.** *Let*

$$k \leq 2c\sqrt{(q+1) \ln(q+1)} + 2 < \frac{q^2 - 1}{q + 2}, \quad c \geq 1 \text{ independent of } q.$$

*Then in the projective plane (not necessary Desarguesian) of order  $q$ , a random point  $k$ -set is a saturating set with probability*

$$p > 1 - \frac{1}{q^{2c^2-2}}. \quad (1.3)$$

It is worth noting that, even if the bounds (1.1) and (1.2) have the same shape, the constant in (1.2) is slightly smaller than the one in (1.1). Also, we use a different approach from those in [3, 15] where random sets placed on two or three lines are constructed. In this paper we consider arbitrary random sets.

The *length function*  $\ell(2, 3, q)$  denotes the smallest length of a  $q$ -ary linear code with covering radius 2 and codimension 3; see [4–6]. The result of Theorem 1 means that

$$\ell(2, 3, q) \leq 2\sqrt{(q+1)\ln(q+1)} + 2 \sim 2\sqrt{q\ln q}. \quad (1.4)$$

## 2 Upper bound on the smallest size of a saturating set

Let  $w$  be a fixed integer and consider a random  $(w+1)$ -subset  $\mathcal{K}_{w+1}$  of  $\Pi_q$ . The total number of such subsets is  $\binom{q^2+q+1}{w+1}$ . A fixed point  $A$  of  $\Pi_q$  is *covered* by  $\mathcal{K}_{w+1}$  if it belongs to an  $r$ -secant of  $\mathcal{K}_{w+1}$  with  $r \geq 2$ . We denote by  $\text{Prob}(\diamond)$  the probability of some event  $\diamond$ .

We estimate

$$\pi := \text{Prob}(A \text{ not covered by } \mathcal{K}_{w+1})$$

as the ratio of the number of  $(w+1)$ -subsets not covering  $A$  to the total number of subsets of size  $(w+1)$ . Since a set  $\mathcal{K}_{w+1}$  does not cover  $A$  if and only if every line through  $A$  contains at most one point of  $\mathcal{K}_{w+1}$ , we have

$$\pi = \frac{q^{w+1} \binom{q+1}{w+1}}{\binom{q^2+q+1}{w+1}}.$$

By straightforward calculations,

$$\begin{aligned} \pi &= \frac{(q^2+q)(q^2) \cdots (q^2+q-iq) \cdots (q^2+q-wq)}{(q^2+q+1)(q^2+q) \cdots (q^2+q-i) \cdots (q^2+q+1-w)} = \\ &= \prod_{i=0}^w \frac{q^2+q-iq}{q^2+q+1-i} = \prod_{i=0}^w \left(1 - \frac{iq-i+1}{q^2+q+1-i}\right) < \prod_{i=0}^w \left(1 - \frac{i(q-1)}{q^2+q+1}\right). \end{aligned}$$

Using the classical inequality  $1-x \leq e^{-x}$  we obtain that

$$\pi < e^{-\sum_{i=0}^w \frac{i(q-1)}{q^2+q+1}} = e^{-\frac{(w^2+w)(q-1)}{2(q^2+q+1)}},$$

which implies

$$\pi < e^{-\frac{(w^2+w)(q-1)}{2(q^2+q+1)}} < e^{-\frac{w^2}{2q+2}}, \quad (2.1)$$

provided that

$$\frac{(w+1)(q^2-1)}{(q^2+q+1)} > w$$

that is

$$w < \frac{q^2 - 1}{q + 2} \sim q.$$

The set  $\mathcal{K}_{w+1}$  is not saturating if at least one point  $A \in \Pi_q$  is not covered by  $\mathcal{K}_{w+1}$ . Similarly to [3, Proposition 4.1], we note that

$$\text{Prob}(\mathcal{K}_{w+1} \text{ is not saturating set}) \leq \sum_{A \in \Pi_q} \text{Prob}(A \text{ is not covered}).$$

Now, using (2.1), we obtain that

$$\text{Prob}(\mathcal{K}_{w+1} \text{ is not saturating set}) \leq (q^2 + q + 1)\pi < (q + 1)^2 e^{-\frac{w^2}{2q+2}}.$$

Therefore, the probability that all the points of  $\Pi_q$  are covered is

$$\text{Prob}(\mathcal{K}_{w+1} \text{ is saturating set}) > 1 - (q + 1)^2 e^{-w^2/(2q+2)}. \quad (2.2)$$

This quantity is larger than 0 taking for instance

$$w = \left\lceil \sqrt{(2q + 2) \ln((q + 1)^2)} \right\rceil.$$

This shows that in  $\Pi_q$  there exists a saturating  $k$ -set with

$$k \leq 2\sqrt{(q + 1) \ln(q + 1)} + 2 \sim 2\sqrt{q \ln q}$$

and therefore Theorem 1 is proved.

In conclusion, we note that any

$$w = \left\lceil c\sqrt{(2q + 2) \ln((q + 1)^2)} \right\rceil < \frac{q^2 - 1}{q + 2}$$

with the parameter  $c \geq 1$  independent of  $q$ , is such that (2.2) is positive; therefore Theorem 2 holds true.

It is worth noting that in (1.3) for  $q$  large enough, choosing  $c = 1 + \varepsilon$ , with  $\varepsilon = o(1) > 0$ , the probability  $p$  is close to 1.

**Remark 3.** Let an  $[n, n - r]_q$  code be a linear  $q$ -ary code of length  $n$ , codimension  $r$ , and covering radius 2. Columns of a parity check matrix of the code can be treated as points of a saturating  $n$ -set in the space  $PG(r - 1, q)$  [5–8, 12]. Let

$$n_q = 2\sqrt{(q + 1) \ln(q + 1)} + 2 \sim 2\sqrt{q \ln q}. \quad (2.3)$$

By above, there exists a saturating  $n_q$ -set in  $PG(2, q)$ ; hence there is the corresponding  $[n_q, n_q - 3]_q$  code. From this code, using the construction of [7, Ex. 6], see also [8, Th. 4.4],

one can obtain an  $[n, n-r]_q$  code with  $q \geq 7$ ,  $r = 2t-1 \geq 7$ ,  $r \neq 9, 13$ ,  $n = n_q q^{t-2} + 2q^{t-3}$ . It means that in  $PG(r-1, q)$  there exists a saturating  $(n_q q^{t-2} + 2q^{t-3})$ -set. This implies the following upper bound on the smallest size  $s(N, q)$  of a saturating set in  $PG(N, q)$ :

$$s(N, q) \leq n_q q^{t-2} + 2q^{t-3}, \quad q \geq 7, \quad N = 2t - 2 \geq 6, \quad N \neq 8, 12. \quad (2.4)$$

Surveys of the known  $[n, n-r]_q$  codes and saturating sets in  $PG(N, q)$  can be found in [8, 12]. In a number cases the bound (2.4) is better than the known one.

**Remark 4.** In [1], the concept of multiple saturating sets is introduced. In particular, a point set  $S \subset PG(2, q)$  is  $(1, \mu)$ -saturating if every point  $Q$  in  $PG(2, q)$  not belonging to  $S$  is such that the number of secants of  $S$  through  $Q$  is at least  $\mu$ , counted with multiplicity. The multiplicity  $m_\ell$  of a secant  $\ell$  is computed as  $m_\ell = \binom{\#(\ell \cap S)}{2}$ . A probabilistic upper bound  $66\sqrt{\mu q \ln q}$  on the smallest size of a  $(1, \mu)$ -saturating set in  $PG(2, q)$  is given by [1, Prop. 5.2(ii)]. If one can found  $\mu$  *disjoint* saturating  $n_q$ -sets in  $PG(2, q)$ , see (2.3), then the upper bound is roughly  $\sim 2\mu\sqrt{q \ln q}$  that is smaller than the known one for  $\mu < 33\sqrt{\mu}$ .

## References

- [1] D. Bartoli, A. A. Davydov, M. Giulietti, S. Marcugini, and F. Pambianco, Multiple coverings of the farthest-off points with small density from projective geometry, *Adv. Math. Commun.* **9** (2015), 63–85.
- [2] D. Bartoli, G. Faina, S. Marcugini, and F. Pambianco, On the minimum size of complete arcs and minimal saturating sets in projective planes, *J. Geom.* **104** (2013), 409–419.
- [3] E. Boros, T. Szőnyi, and K. Tichler, On defining sets for projective planes, *Discrete Math.* **303** (2005), 17–31.
- [4] R. A. Brualdi, S. Litsyn, and V. S. Pless, Covering Radius, In: *Handbook of Coding Theory*, V. S. Pless, W. C. Huffman and R. A. Brualdi (Editors), Elsevier, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, volume 1, 1998, pp. 755–826.
- [5] R. A. Brualdi, V. S. Pless, and R. M. Wilson, Short codes with a given covering radius, *IEEE Trans. Inform. Theory* **35** (1989), 99–109.
- [6] G. Cohen, I. Honkala, S. Litsyn, and A. Lobstein, *Covering Codes*, North-Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1997.
- [7] A. A. Davydov, Constructions and families of nonbinary linear codes with covering radius 2, *IEEE Trans. Inform. Theory* **45** (1999) 1679–1686.

- [8] A. A. Davydov, M. Giulietti, S. Marcugini, and F. Pambianco, Linear nonbinary covering codes and saturating sets in projective spaces, *Adv. Math. Commun.* **5** (2011) 119–147.
- [9] A. A. Davydov, S. Marcugini, and F. Pambianco, On saturating sets in projective spaces, *J. Combin. Theory Ser. A* **103** (2003), 1–15.
- [10] A. Gács and T. Szőnyi, Random constructions and density results, *Des. Codes Cryptogr.* **47** (2008), 267–287.
- [11] M. Giulietti, On small dense sets in Galois planes, *Electronic J. Combin.* **14** (2007), #75.
- [12] M. Giulietti, The geometry of covering codes: small complete caps and saturating sets in Galois spaces, In: *Surveys in Combinatorics 2013*, S. R. Blackburn, R. Holloway, M. Wildon (Editors), London Math. Soc. Lect. Note Series, Cambridge Univ Press, volume 409, 2013, pp. 51–90.
- [13] J. W. P. Hirschfeld, *Projective geometries over finite fields*, Oxford, 2nd edition, Clarendon Press, 1998.
- [14] J. H. Kim and V. H. Vu, Small complete arcs in projective planes, *Combinatorica* **23** (2003), 311–363.
- [15] S. J. Kovács, Small saturated sets in finite projective planes, *Rend. Mat. (Roma)*, **12** (1992), 157–164.
- [16] A. Lobstein, Covering radius, a bibliography, available online at <http://www.infres.enst.fr/~lobstein/bib-a-jour.pdf>
- [17] E. Ughi, Saturated configurations of points in projective Galois spaces, *Europ. J. Combin.* **8** (1987), 325–334.