

We close this section by listing some miscellaneous properties of compact sets.

**Theorem 12.5.10.** *Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space.*

- (a) *If  $Y$  is a compact subset of  $X$ , and  $Z \subseteq Y$ , then  $Z$  is compact if and only if  $Z$  is closed.*
- (b) *If  $Y_1, \dots, Y_n$  are a finite collection of compact subsets of  $X$ , then their union  $Y_1 \cup \dots \cup Y_n$  is also compact.*
- (c) *Every finite subset of  $X$  (including the empty set) is compact.*

*Proof.* See Exercise 12.5.7. □

*Exercise 12.5.1.* Show that Definitions 9.1.22 and 12.5.3 match when talking about subsets of the real line with the standard metric.

*Exercise 12.5.2.* Prove Proposition 12.5.5. (Hint: prove the completeness and boundedness separately. For both claims, use proof by contradiction. You will need the axiom of choice, as in Lemma 8.4.5.)

*Exercise 12.5.3.* Prove Theorem 12.5.7. (Hint: use Proposition 12.1.18 and Theorem 9.1.24.)

*Exercise 12.5.4.* Let  $(\mathbf{R}, d)$  be the real line with the standard metric. Give an example of a continuous function  $f : \mathbf{R} \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ , and an open set  $V \subseteq \mathbf{R}$ , such that the image  $f(V) := \{f(x) : x \in V\}$  of  $V$  is *not* open.

*Exercise 12.5.5.* Let  $(\mathbf{R}, d)$  be the real line with the standard metric. Give an example of a continuous function  $f : \mathbf{R} \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ , and a closed set  $F \subseteq \mathbf{R}$ , such that  $f(F)$  is *not* closed.

*Exercise 12.5.6.* Prove Corollary 12.5.9. (Hint: work in the compact metric space  $(K_1, d|_{K_1 \times K_1})$ , and consider the sets  $V_n := K_1 \setminus K_n$ , which are open on  $K_1$ . Assume for sake of contradiction that  $\bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} K_n = \emptyset$ , and then apply Theorem 12.5.8.)

*Exercise 12.5.7.* Prove Theorem 12.5.10. (Hint: for part (c), you may wish to use (b), and first prove that every singleton set is compact.)

*Exercise 12.5.8.* Let  $(X, d_1)$  be the metric space from Exercise 12.1.15. For each natural number  $n$ , let  $e^{(n)} = (e_j^{(n)})_{j=0}^\infty$  be the sequence in  $X$  such that  $e_j^{(n)} := 1$  when  $n = j$  and  $e_j^{(n)} := 0$  when  $n \neq j$ . Show that the set  $\{e^{(n)} : n \in \mathbb{N}\}$  is a closed and bounded subset of  $X$ , but is not compact. (This is despite the fact that  $(X, d_1)$  is even a complete metric space - a fact which we will not prove here. The problem is that not that  $X$  is incomplete, but rather that it is “infinite-dimensional”, in a sense that we will not discuss here.)

*Exercise 12.5.9.* Show that a metric space  $(X, d)$  is compact if and only if every sequence in  $X$  has at least one limit point.

*Exercise 12.5.10.* A metric space  $(X, d)$  is called *totally bounded* if for every  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists a positive integer  $n$  and a finite number of balls  $B(x^{(1)}, \varepsilon), \dots, B(x^{(n)}, \varepsilon)$  which cover  $X$  (i.e.,  $X = \bigcup_{i=1}^n B(x^{(i)}, \varepsilon)$ ).

- Show that every totally bounded space is bounded.
- Show the following stronger version of Proposition 12.5.5: if  $(X, d)$  is compact, then complete and totally bounded. (Hint: if  $X$  is not totally bounded, then there is some  $\varepsilon > 0$  such that  $X$  cannot be covered by finitely many  $\varepsilon$ -balls. Then use Exercise 8.5.20 to find an infinite sequence of balls  $B(x^{(n)}, \varepsilon/2)$  which are disjoint from each other. Use this to then construct a sequence which has no convergent subsequence.)
- Conversely, show that if  $X$  is complete and totally bounded, then  $X$  is compact. (Hint: if  $(x^{(n)})_{n=1}^\infty$  is a sequence in  $X$ , use the total boundedness hypothesis to recursively construct a sequence of subsequences  $(x^{(n;j)})_{n=1}^\infty$  of  $(x^{(n)})_{n=1}^\infty$  for each positive integer  $j$ , such that for each  $j$ , the elements of the sequence  $(x^{(n;j)})_{n=1}^\infty$  are contained in a single ball of radius  $1/j$ , and also that each sequence  $(x^{(n;j+1)})_{n=1}^\infty$  is a subsequence of the previous one  $(x^{(n;j)})_{n=1}^\infty$ . Then show that the “diagonal” sequence  $(x^{(n;n)})_{n=1}^\infty$  is a Cauchy sequence, and then use the completeness hypothesis.)

*Exercise 12.5.11.* Let  $(X, d)$  have the property that every open cover of  $X$  has a finite subcover. Show that  $X$  is compact. (Hint: if  $X$  is not compact, then by Exercise 12.5.9, there is a sequence  $(x^{(n)})_{n=1}^\infty$  with no limit points. Then for every  $x \in X$  there exists a ball  $B(x, \varepsilon)$  containing  $x$  which contains at most finitely many elements of this sequence. Now use the hypothesis.)

*Exercise 12.5.12.* Let  $(X, d_{disc})$  be a metric space with the discrete metric  $d_{disc}$ .

- (a) Show that  $X$  is always complete.
- (b) When is  $X$  compact, and when is  $X$  not compact? Prove your claim. (Hint: the Heine-Borel theorem will be useless here since that only applies to Euclidean spaces with the Euclidean metric.)

*Exercise 12.5.13.* Let  $E$  and  $F$  be two compact subsets of  $\mathbf{R}$  (with the standard metric  $d(x, y) = |x - y|$ ). Show that the Cartesian product  $E \times F := \{(x, y) : x \in E, y \in F\}$  is a compact subset of  $\mathbf{R}^2$  (with the Euclidean metric  $d_{l^2}$ ).

*Exercise 12.5.14.* Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space, let  $E$  be a non-empty compact subset of  $X$ , and let  $x_0$  be a point in  $X$ . Show that there exists a point  $x \in E$  such that

$$d(x_0, x) = \inf\{d(x_0, y) : y \in E\},$$

i.e.,  $x$  is the closest point in  $E$  to  $x_0$ . (Hint: let  $R$  be the quantity  $R := \inf\{d(x_0, y) : y \in E\}$ . Construct a sequence  $(x^{(n)})_{n=1}^\infty$  in  $E$  such that  $d(x_0, x^{(n)}) \leq R + \frac{1}{n}$ , and then use the compactness of  $E$ .)

*Exercise 12.5.15.* Let  $(X, d)$  be a compact metric space. Suppose that  $(K_\alpha)_{\alpha \in I}$  is a collection of closed sets in  $X$  with the property that any finite subcollection of these sets necessarily has non-empty intersection, thus  $\bigcap_{\alpha \in F} K_\alpha \neq \emptyset$  for all finite  $F \subseteq I$ . (This property is known as the *finite intersection property*.) Show that the *entire* collection has non-empty intersection, thus  $\bigcap_{\alpha \in I} K_\alpha \neq \emptyset$ . Show that by counterexample this statement fails if  $X$  is not compact.

## Chapter 13

### Continuous functions on metric spaces

#### 13.1 Continuous functions

In the previous chapter we studied a single metric space  $(X, d)$ , and the various types of sets one could find in that space. While this is already quite a rich subject, the theory of metric spaces becomes even richer, and of more importance to analysis, when one considers not just a single metric space, but rather *pairs*  $(X, d_X)$  and  $(Y, d_Y)$  of metric spaces, as well as *continuous functions*  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  between such spaces. To define this concept, we generalize Definition 9.4.1 as follows:

**Definition 13.1.1** (Continuous functions). Let  $(X, d_X)$  be a metric space, and let  $(Y, d_Y)$  be another metric space, and let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  be a function. If  $x_0 \in X$ , we say that  $f$  is *continuous at*  $x_0$  iff for every  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists a  $\delta > 0$  such that  $d_Y(f(x), f(x_0)) < \varepsilon$  whenever  $d_X(x, x_0) < \delta$ . We say that  $f$  is *continuous* iff it is continuous at every point  $x \in X$ .

**Remark 13.1.2.** Continuous functions are also sometimes called *continuous maps*. Mathematically, there is no distinction between the two terminologies.

**Remark 13.1.3.** If  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  is continuous, and  $K$  is any subset of  $X$ , then the restriction  $f|_K : K \rightarrow Y$  of  $f$  to  $K$  is also continuous (why?).

We now generalize much of the discussion in Chapter 9. We first observe that continuous functions preserve convergence:

**Theorem 13.1.4** (Continuity preserves convergence). *Suppose that  $(X, d_X)$  and  $(Y, d_Y)$  are metric spaces. Let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  be a function, and let  $x_0 \in X$  be a point in  $X$ . Then the following three statements are logically equivalent:*

- (a)  $f$  is continuous at  $x_0$ .
- (b) Whenever  $(x^{(n)})_{n=1}^{\infty}$  is a sequence in  $X$  which converges to  $x_0$  with respect to the metric  $d_X$ , the sequence  $(f(x^{(n)}))_{n=1}^{\infty}$  converges to  $f(x_0)$  with respect to the metric  $d_Y$ .
- (c) For every open set  $V \subset Y$  that contains  $f(x_0)$ , there exists an open set  $U \subset X$  containing  $x_0$  such that  $f(U) \subseteq V$ .

*Proof.* See Exercise 13.1.1. □

Another important characterization of continuous functions involves open sets.

**Theorem 13.1.5.** *Let  $(X, d_X)$  be a metric space, and let  $(Y, d_Y)$  be another metric space. Let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  be a function. Then the following four statements are equivalent:*

- (a)  $f$  is continuous.
- (b) Whenever  $(x^{(n)})_{n=1}^{\infty}$  is a sequence in  $X$  which converges to some point  $x_0 \in X$  with respect to the metric  $d_X$ , the sequence  $(f(x^{(n)}))_{n=1}^{\infty}$  converges to  $f(x_0)$  with respect to the metric  $d_Y$ .
- (c) Whenever  $V$  is an open set in  $Y$ , the set  $f^{-1}(V) := \{x \in X : f(x) \in V\}$  is an open set in  $X$ .
- (d) Whenever  $F$  is a closed set in  $Y$ , the set  $f^{-1}(F) := \{x \in X : f(x) \in F\}$  is a closed set in  $X$ .

*Proof.* See Exercise 13.1.2. □

**Remark 13.1.6.** It may seem strange that continuity ensures that the *inverse* image of an open set is open. One may guess instead that the reverse should be true, that the *forward* image of an open set is open; but this is not true; see Exercises 12.5.4, 12.5.5.

As a quick corollary of the above two Theorems we obtain

**Corollary 13.1.7** (Continuity preserved by composition). *Let  $(X, d_X)$ ,  $(Y, d_Y)$ , and  $(Z, d_Z)$  be metric spaces.*

- (a) *If  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  is continuous at a point  $x_0 \in X$ , and  $g : Y \rightarrow Z$  is continuous at  $f(x_0)$ , then the composition  $g \circ f : X \rightarrow Z$ , defined by  $g \circ f(x) := g(f(x))$ , is continuous at  $x_0$ .*
- (b) *If  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  is continuous, and  $g : Y \rightarrow Z$  is continuous, then  $g \circ f : X \rightarrow Z$  is also continuous.*

*Proof.* See Exercise 13.1.3. □

**Example 13.1.8.** If  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is a continuous function, then the function  $f^2 : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  defined by  $f^2(x) := f(x)^2$  is automatically continuous also. This is because we have  $f^2 = g \circ f$ , where  $g : \mathbf{R} \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is the squaring function  $g(x) := x^2$ , and  $g$  is a continuous function.

*Exercise 13.1.1.* Prove Theorem 13.1.4. (Hint: review your proof of Proposition 9.4.7.)

*Exercise 13.1.2.* Prove Theorem 13.1.5. (Hint: Theorem 13.1.4 already shows that (a) and (b) are equivalent.)

*Exercise 13.1.3.* Use Theorem 13.1.4 and Theorem 13.1.5 to prove Corollary 13.1.7.

*Exercise 13.1.4.* Give an example of functions  $f : \mathbf{R} \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $g : \mathbf{R} \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  such that

- (a)  $f$  is not continuous, but  $g$  and  $g \circ f$  are continuous;
- (b)  $g$  is not continuous, but  $f$  and  $g \circ f$  are continuous;
- (c)  $f$  and  $g$  are not continuous, but  $g \circ f$  is continuous.

Explain briefly why these examples do not contradict Corollary 13.1.7.

**Exercise 13.1.5.** Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space, and let  $(E, d|_{E \times E})$  be a subspace of  $(X, d)$ . Let  $\iota_{E \rightarrow X} : E \rightarrow X$  be the inclusion map, defined by setting  $\iota_{E \rightarrow X}(x) := x$  for all  $x \in E$ . Show that  $\iota_{E \rightarrow X}$  is continuous.

**Exercise 13.1.6.** Let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  be a function from one metric space  $(X, d_X)$  to another  $(Y, d_Y)$ . Let  $E$  be a subset of  $X$  (which we give the induced metric  $d_X|_{E \times E}$ ), and let  $f|_E : E \rightarrow Y$  be the restriction of  $f$  to  $E$ , thus  $f|_E(x) := f(x)$  when  $x \in E$ . If  $x_0 \in E$  and  $f$  is continuous at  $x_0$ , show that  $f|_E$  is also continuous at  $x_0$ . (Is the converse of this statement true? Explain.) Conclude that if  $f$  is continuous, then  $f|_E$  is continuous. Thus restriction of the domain of a function does not destroy continuity. (Hint: use Exercise 13.1.5.)

**Exercise 13.1.7.** Let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  be a function from one metric space  $(X, d_X)$  to another  $(Y, d_Y)$ . Suppose that the image  $f(X)$  of  $X$  is contained in some subset  $E \subset Y$  of  $Y$ . Let  $g : X \rightarrow E$  be the function which is the same as  $f$  but with the range restricted from  $Y$  to  $E$ , thus  $g(x) = f(x)$  for all  $x \in X$ . We give  $E$  the metric  $d_Y|_{E \times E}$  induced from  $Y$ . Show that for any  $x_0 \in X$ , that  $f$  is continuous at  $x_0$  if and only if  $g$  is continuous at  $x_0$ . Conclude that  $f$  is continuous if and only if  $g$  is continuous. (Thus the notion of continuity is not affected if one restricts the range of the function.)

## 13.2 Continuity and product spaces

Given two functions  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  and  $g : X \rightarrow Z$ , one can define their *direct sum*  $f \oplus g : X \rightarrow Y \times Z$  defined by  $f \oplus g(x) := (f(x), g(x))$ , i.e., this is the function taking values in the Cartesian product  $Y \times Z$  whose first co-ordinate is  $f(x)$  and whose second co-ordinate is  $g(x)$  (cf. Exercise 3.5.7). For instance, if  $f : \mathbf{R} \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is the function  $f(x) := x^2 + 3$ , and  $g : \mathbf{R} \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is the function  $g(x) = 4x$ , then  $f \oplus g : \mathbf{R} \rightarrow \mathbf{R}^2$  is the function  $f \oplus g(x) := (x^2 + 3, 4x)$ . The direct sum operation preserves continuity:

**Lemma 13.2.1.** *Let  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  be functions, and let  $f \oplus g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}^2$  be their direct sum. We give  $\mathbf{R}^2$  the Euclidean metric.*

- (a) *If  $x_0 \in X$ , then  $f$  and  $g$  are both continuous at  $x_0$  if and only if  $f \oplus g$  is continuous at  $x_0$ .*

(b)  $f$  and  $g$  are both continuous if and only if  $f \oplus g$  is continuous.

*Proof.* See Exercise 13.2.1. □

To use this, we first need another continuity result:

**Lemma 13.2.2.** *The addition function  $(x, y) \mapsto x + y$ , the subtraction function  $(x, y) \mapsto x - y$ , the multiplication function  $(x, y) \mapsto xy$ , the maximum function  $(x, y) \mapsto \max(x, y)$ , and the minimum function  $(x, y) \mapsto \min(x, y)$ , are all continuous functions from  $\mathbf{R}^2$  to  $\mathbf{R}$ . The division function  $(x, y) \mapsto x/y$  is a continuous function from  $\mathbf{R} \times (\mathbf{R} \setminus \{0\}) = \{(x, y) \in \mathbf{R}^2 : y \neq 0\}$  to  $\mathbf{R}$ . For any real number  $c$ , the function  $x \mapsto cx$  is a continuous function from  $\mathbf{R}$  to  $\mathbf{R}$ .*

*Proof.* See Exercise 13.2.2. □

Combining these lemmas we obtain

**Corollary 13.2.3.** *Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space, let  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  be functions. Let  $c$  be a real number.*

- (a) *If  $x_0 \in X$  and  $f$  and  $g$  are continuous at  $x_0$ , then the functions  $f + g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ ,  $f - g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ ,  $fg : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ ,  $\max(f, g) : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ ,  $\min(f, g) : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ , and  $cf : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  (see Definition 9.2.1 for definitions) are also continuous at  $x_0$ . If  $g(x) \neq 0$  for all  $x \in X$ , then  $f/g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is also continuous at  $x_0$ .*
- (b) *If  $f$  and  $g$  are continuous, then the functions  $f + g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ ,  $f - g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ ,  $fg : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ ,  $\max(f, g) : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ ,  $\min(f, g) : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$ , and  $cf : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  are also continuous at  $x_0$ . If  $g(x) \neq 0$  for all  $x \in X$ , then  $f/g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is also continuous at  $x_0$ .*

*Proof.* We first prove (a). Since  $f$  and  $g$  are continuous at  $x_0$ , then by Lemma 13.2.1  $f \oplus g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}^2$  is also continuous at  $x_0$ . On the other hand, from Lemma 13.2.2 the function  $(x, y) \mapsto x + y$  is continuous at every point in  $\mathbf{R}^2$ , and in particular is continuous at  $f \oplus g(x_0)$ . If we then compose these two functions using Corollary



13.1.7 we conclude that  $f + g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is continuous. A similar argument gives the continuity of  $f - g$ ,  $fg$ ,  $\max(f, g)$ ,  $\min(f, g)$  and  $cf$ . To prove the claim for  $f/g$ , we first use Exercise 13.1.7 to restrict the range of  $g$  from  $\mathbf{R}$  to  $\mathbf{R} \setminus \{0\}$ , and then one can argue as before. The claim (b) follows immediately from (a).  $\square$

This corollary allows us to demonstrate the continuity of a large class of functions; we give some examples below.

*Exercise 13.2.1.* Prove Lemma 13.2.1. (Hint: use Proposition 12.1.18 and Theorem 13.1.4.)

*Exercise 13.2.2.* Prove Lemma 13.2.2. (Hint: use Theorem 13.1.5 and limit laws (Theorem 6.1.19).)

*Exercise 13.2.3.* Show that if  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is a continuous function, so is the function  $|f| : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  defined by  $|f|(x) := |f(x)|$ .

*Exercise 13.2.4.* Let  $\pi_1 : \mathbf{R}^2 \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $\pi_2 : \mathbf{R}^2 \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  be the functions  $\pi_1(x, y) := x$  and  $\pi_2(x, y) := y$  (these two functions are sometimes called the *co-ordinate functions* on  $\mathbf{R}^2$ ). Show that  $\pi_1$  and  $\pi_2$  are continuous. Conclude that if  $f : \mathbf{R} \rightarrow X$  is any continuous function into a metric space  $(X, d)$ , then the functions  $g_1 : \mathbf{R}^2 \rightarrow X$  and  $g_2 : \mathbf{R}^2 \rightarrow X$  defined by  $g_1(x, y) := f(x)$  and  $g_2(x, y) := f(y)$  are also continuous.

*Exercise 13.2.5.* Let  $n, m \geq 0$  be integers. Suppose that for every  $0 \leq i \leq n$  and  $0 \leq j \leq m$  we have a real number  $c_{ij}$ . Form the function  $P : \mathbf{R}^2 \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  defined by

$$P(x, y) := \sum_{i=0}^n \sum_{j=0}^m c_{ij} x^i y^j.$$

(Such a function is known as a *polynomial of two variables*; a typical example of such a polynomial is  $P(x, y) = x^3 + 2xy^2 - x^2 + 3y + 6$ .) Show that  $P$  is continuous. (Hint: use Exercise 13.2.4 and Corollary 13.2.3.) Conclude that if  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  are continuous functions, then the function  $P(f, g) : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  defined by  $P(f, g)(x) := P(f(x), g(x))$  is also continuous.

*Exercise 13.2.6.* Let  $\mathbf{R}^m$  and  $\mathbf{R}^n$  be Euclidean spaces. If  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}^m$  and  $g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}^n$  are continuous functions, show that  $f \oplus g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}^{m+n}$  is also continuous, where we have identified  $\mathbf{R}^m \times \mathbf{R}^n$  with  $\mathbf{R}^{m+n}$  in the obvious manner. Is the converse statement true?

**Exercise 13.2.7.** Let  $k \geq 1$ , let  $I$  be a finite subset of  $\mathbf{N}^k$ , and let  $c : I \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  be a function. Form the function  $P : \mathbf{R}^k \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  defined by

$$P(x_1, \dots, x_k) := \sum_{(i_1, \dots, i_k) \in I} c(i_1, \dots, i_k) x_1^{i_1} \dots x_k^{i_k}.$$

(Such a function is known as a *polynomial of  $k$  variables*; a typical example of such a polynomial is  $P(x_1, x_2, x_3) = 3x_1^3 x_2 x_3^2 - x_2 x_3^2 + x_1 + 5$ .) Show that  $P$  is continuous. (Hint: use induction on  $k$ , Exercise 13.2.6, and either Exercise 13.2.5 or Lemma 13.2.2.)

**Exercise 13.2.8.** Let  $(X, d_X)$  and  $(Y, d_Y)$  be metric spaces. Define the metric  $d_{X \times Y} : (X \times Y) \times (X \times Y) \rightarrow [0, \infty)$  by the formula

$$d_{X \times Y}((x, y), (x', y')) := d_X(x, x') + d_Y(y, y').$$

Show that  $(X \times Y, d_{X \times Y})$  is a metric space, and deduce an analogue of Proposition 12.1.18 and Lemma 13.2.1.

**Exercise 13.2.9.** Let  $f : \mathbf{R}^2 \rightarrow X$  be a function from  $\mathbf{R}^2$  to a metric space  $X$ . Let  $(x_0, y_0)$  be a point in  $\mathbf{R}^2$ . If  $f$  is continuous at  $(x_0, y_0)$ , show that

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow x_0} \limsup_{y \rightarrow y_0} f(x, y) = \lim_{y \rightarrow y_0} \limsup_{x \rightarrow x_0} f(x, y) = f(x_0, y_0)$$

and

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow x_0} \liminf_{y \rightarrow y_0} f(x, y) = \lim_{y \rightarrow y_0} \liminf_{x \rightarrow x_0} f(x, y) = f(x_0, y_0).$$

In particular, we have

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow x_0} \lim_{y \rightarrow y_0} f(x, y) = \lim_{y \rightarrow y_0} \lim_{x \rightarrow x_0} f(x, y)$$

whenever the limits on both sides exist. (Note that the limits do not necessarily exist in general; consider for instance the function  $f : \mathbf{R}^2 \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  such that  $f(x, y) = y \sin \frac{1}{x}$  when  $xy \neq 0$  and  $f(x, y) = 0$  otherwise.) Discuss the comparison between this result and Example 1.2.7.

**Exercise 13.2.10.** Let  $f : \mathbf{R}^2 \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  be a continuous function. Show that for each  $x \in \mathbf{R}$ , the function  $y \mapsto f(x, y)$  is continuous on  $\mathbf{R}$ , and for each  $y \in \mathbf{R}$ , the function  $x \mapsto f(x, y)$  is continuous on  $\mathbf{R}$ . Thus a function  $f(x, y)$  which is jointly continuous in  $(x, y)$  is also continuous in each variable  $x, y$  separately.

**Exercise 13.2.11.** Let  $f : \mathbf{R}^2 \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  be the function defined by  $f(x, y) := \frac{xy}{x^2+y^2}$  when  $(x, y) \neq (0, 0)$ , and  $f(x, y) = 0$  otherwise. Show that for each fixed  $x \in \mathbf{R}$ , the function  $y \mapsto f(x, y)$  is continuous on  $\mathbf{R}$ , and that for each fixed  $y \in \mathbf{R}$ , the function  $x \mapsto f(x, y)$  is continuous on  $\mathbf{R}$ , but that the function  $f : \mathbf{R}^2 \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  is not continuous on  $\mathbf{R}^2$ . This shows that the converse to Exercise 13.2.10 fails; it is possible to be continuous in each variable separately without being jointly continuous.

### 13.3 Continuity and compactness

Continuous functions interact well with the concept of compact sets defined in Definition 12.5.1.

**Theorem 13.3.1** (Continuous maps preserve compactness). *Let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  be a continuous map from one metric space  $(X, d_X)$  to another  $(Y, d_Y)$ . Let  $K \subseteq X$  be any compact subset of  $X$ . Then the image  $f(K) := \{f(x) : x \in K\}$  of  $K$  is also compact.*

*Proof.* See Exercise 13.3.1. □

This theorem has an important consequence. Recall from Definition 9.6.5 the notion of a function  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  attaining a maximum or minimum at a point. We may generalize Proposition 9.6.7 as follows:

**Proposition 13.3.2** (Maximum principle). *Let  $(X, d)$  be a compact metric space, and let  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  be a continuous function. Then  $f$  is bounded. Furthermore,  $f$  attains its maximum at some point  $x_{\max} \in X$ , and also attains its minimum at some point  $x_{\min} \in X$ .*

*Proof.* See Exercise 13.3.2. □

**Remark 13.3.3.** As was already noted in Exercise 9.6.1, this principle can fail if  $X$  is not compact. This proposition should be compared with Lemma 9.6.3 and Proposition 9.6.7.

Another advantage of continuous functions on compact sets is that they are *uniformly continuous*. We generalize Definition 9.9.2 as follows:

**Definition 13.3.4** (Uniform continuity). Let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  be a map from one metric space  $(X, d_X)$  to another  $(Y, d_Y)$ . We say that  $f$  is *uniformly continuous* if, for every  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists a  $\delta > 0$  such that  $d_Y(f(x), f(x')) < \varepsilon$  whenever  $x, x' \in X$  are such that  $d_X(x, x') < \delta$ .

Every uniformly continuous function is continuous, but not conversely (Exercise 13.3.3). But if the domain  $X$  is compact, then the two notions are equivalent:

**Theorem 13.3.5.** *Let  $(X, d_X)$  and  $(Y, d_Y)$  be metric spaces, and suppose that  $(X, d_X)$  is compact. If  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  is function, then  $f$  is continuous if and only if it is uniformly continuous.*

*Proof.* If  $f$  is uniformly continuous then it is also continuous by Exercise 13.3.3. Now suppose that  $f$  is continuous. Fix  $\varepsilon > 0$ . For every  $x_0 \in X$ , the function  $f$  is continuous at  $x_0$ . Thus there exists a  $\delta(x_0) > 0$ , depending on  $x_0$ , such that  $d_Y(f(x), f(x_0)) < \varepsilon/2$  whenever  $d_X(x, x_0) < \delta(x_0)$ . In particular, by the triangle inequality this implies that  $d_Y(f(x), f(x')) < \varepsilon$  whenever  $x \in B_{(X, d_X)}(x_0, \delta(x_0)/2)$  and  $d_X(x', x) < \delta(x_0)/2$  (why?).

Now consider the (possibly infinite) collection of balls

$$\{B_{(X, d_X)}(x_0, \delta(x_0)/2) : x_0 \in X\}.$$

Each ball in this collection is of course open, and the union of all these balls covers  $X$ , since each point  $x_0$  in  $X$  is contained in its own ball  $B_{(X, d_X)}(x_0, \delta(x_0)/2)$ . Hence, by Theorem 12.5.8, there exist a finite number of points  $x_1, \dots, x_n$  such that the balls  $B_{(X, d_X)}(x_j, \delta(x_j)/2)$  for  $j = 1, \dots, n$  cover  $X$ :

$$X \subseteq \bigcup_{j=1}^n B_{(X, d_X)}(x_j, \delta(x_j)/2).$$

Now let  $\delta := \min_{j=1}^n \delta(x_j)/2$ . Since each of the  $\delta(x_j)$  are positive, and there are only a finite number of  $j$ , we see that  $\delta > 0$ . Now let  $x, x'$  be any two points in  $X$  such that  $d_X(x, x') < \delta$ . Since the balls  $B_{(X, d_X)}(x_j, \delta(x_j)/2)$  cover  $X$ , we see that there must exist

$1 \leq j \leq n$  such that  $x \in B_{(X, d_X)}(x_j, \delta(x_j)/2)$ . Since  $d_X(x, x') < \delta$ , we have  $d_X(x, x') < \delta(x_j)/2$ , and so by the previous discussion we have  $d_Y(f(x), f(x')) < \varepsilon$ . We have thus found a  $\delta$  such that  $d_Y(f(x), f(x')) < \varepsilon$  whenever  $d(x, x') < \delta$ , and this proves uniform continuity as desired.  $\square$

*Exercise 13.3.1.* Prove Theorem 13.3.1.

*Exercise 13.3.2.* Prove Proposition 13.3.2. (Hint: modify the proof of Proposition 9.6.7.)

*Exercise 13.3.3.* Show that every uniformly continuous function is continuous, but give an example that shows that not every continuous function is uniformly continuous.

*Exercise 13.3.4.* Let  $(X, d_X)$ ,  $(Y, d_Y)$ ,  $(Z, d_Z)$  be metric spaces, and let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$  and  $g : Y \rightarrow Z$  be two uniformly continuous functions. Show that  $g \circ f : X \rightarrow Z$  is also uniformly continuous.

*Exercise 13.3.5.* Let  $(X, d_X)$  be a metric space, and let  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  be uniformly continuous functions. Show that the direct sum  $f \oplus g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}^2$  defined by  $f \oplus g(x) := (f(x), g(x))$  is uniformly continuous.

*Exercise 13.3.6.* Show that the addition function  $(x, y) \mapsto x + y$  and the subtraction function  $(x, y) \mapsto x - y$  are uniformly continuous from  $\mathbf{R}^2$  to  $\mathbf{R}$ , but the multiplication function  $(x, y) \mapsto xy$  is not. Conclude that if  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  are uniformly continuous functions on a metric space  $(X, d)$ , then  $f + g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  and  $f - g : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  are also uniformly continuous. Give an example to show that  $fg : X \rightarrow \mathbf{R}$  need not be uniformly continuous. What is the situation for  $\max(f, g)$ ,  $\min(f, g)$ ,  $f/g$ , and  $cf$  for a real number  $c$ ?

## 13.4 Continuity and connectedness

We now describe another important concept in metric spaces, that of *connectedness*.

**Definition 13.4.1** (Connected spaces). Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space. We say that  $X$  is *disconnected* iff there exist disjoint non-empty open sets  $V$  and  $W$  in  $X$  such that  $V \cup W = X$ . (Equivalently,  $X$  is disconnected if and only if  $X$  contains a non-empty