

Likelihood ratio test equivalence to one-way ANOVA F-test

Brenton Horne

19th September 2021

Contents

Hypotheses and notation

Let Y_{ij} denote the j th observation of the i th treatment group. Where $i = 1, 2, 3, \dots, m$ and $j = 1, 2, 3, \dots, n_i$. Under the null hypothesis: $Y_{ij} \sim N(\mu, \sigma^2)$. Under the alternative hypothesis: $Y_{ij} \sim N(\mu_i, \sigma^2)$, where $\mu_i \neq \mu_k$ for at least one pair of i and k values.

Definitions

$$\begin{aligned} n &= \sum_{i=1}^m n_i \\ \bar{Y} &= \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} Y_{ij} \\ \bar{Y}_i &= \frac{1}{n_i} \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} Y_{ij} \\ \text{Total SS} &= \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y})^2 \\ \text{SST} &= \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (\bar{Y}_i - \bar{Y})^2 \\ \text{SSE} &= \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y}_i)^2. \end{aligned}$$

We will later show that:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{SSE} &= \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y})^2 - (\bar{Y}_i - \bar{Y})^2 \\ &= \text{Total SS} - \text{SST}. \end{aligned}$$

We will later use δ_{ik} , which is the Kronecker delta symbol. It equals 0 if $i \neq k$ and 1 otherwise.

F statistic for the one-way ANOVA test is:

$$\begin{aligned} F &= \frac{\text{MST}}{\text{MSE}} \\ &= \frac{\text{SST}/(m-1)}{\text{SSE}/(n-m)} \\ &= \frac{(n-m)\text{SST}}{(m-1)\text{SSE}}. \end{aligned}$$

Which has $m - 1$ numerator and $n - m$ denominator degrees of freedom.

Derivation of maximum likelihood under the null

Let us denote the likelihood under the null as $L(H_0)$.

$$\begin{aligned} L(H_0) &= \prod_{i=1}^m \prod_{j=1}^{n_i} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi\sigma^2}} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2\sigma^2}(Y_{ij} - \mu)^2\right) \\ &= (2\pi\sigma^2)^{-n/2} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2\sigma^2} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \mu)^2\right). \\ \ln L(H_0) &= -\frac{n}{2} \ln 2\pi - \frac{n}{2} \ln \sigma^2 - \frac{1}{2\sigma^2} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \mu)^2. \end{aligned} \tag{1}$$

Setting the partial derivative with respect to σ^2 to zero to maximize the likelihood:

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \ln L(H_0)}{\partial \sigma^2} \Big|_{\sigma^2=\widehat{\sigma^2}, \mu=\widehat{\mu}} &= -\frac{n}{2\widehat{\sigma^2}} + \frac{1}{2\widehat{\sigma^4}} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \widehat{\mu})^2 \\ &= 0. \end{aligned} \tag{2}$$

Multiplying Equation ?? by $2\widehat{\sigma^4}$ yields:

$$\begin{aligned} -n\widehat{\sigma^2} + \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \widehat{\mu})^2 &= 0 \\ \implies \widehat{\sigma^2} &= \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \widehat{\mu})^2. \end{aligned} \tag{3}$$

Next we will set the partial derivative with respect to μ to zero to find the MLE of μ :

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \ln L(H_0)}{\partial \mu} \Big|_{\sigma^2=\widehat{\sigma^2}, \mu=\widehat{\mu}} &= -\frac{1}{2\widehat{\sigma^2}} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} 2 \cdot (-1) \cdot (Y_{ij} - \widehat{\mu}) \\ &= \frac{1}{\widehat{\sigma^2}} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \widehat{\mu}) \\ &= 0. \end{aligned} \tag{4}$$

Multiplying Equation ?? by $\widehat{\sigma^2}$ yields:

$$\begin{aligned} \therefore \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \widehat{\mu}) &= 0 \\ n\overline{Y} - n\widehat{\mu} &= 0 \\ \implies \widehat{\mu} &= \overline{Y}. \end{aligned} \tag{5}$$

Substituting Equations ?? and ?? into Equation ?? yields:

$$\begin{aligned} L(H_0) &= (2\pi\widehat{\sigma^2})^{-n/2} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2\widehat{\sigma^2}} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \widehat{\mu})^2\right) \\ &= (2\pi\widehat{\sigma^2})^{-n/2} \exp\left(-\frac{n}{2}\right) \\ &= (2\pi e\widehat{\sigma^2})^{-n/2} \\ &= \left(\frac{2\pi e}{n} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \overline{Y})^2\right)^{-n/2}. \end{aligned} \tag{6}$$

Derivation of the unrestricted maximum likelihood

Let us denote the unrestricted likelihood as L_u .

$$\begin{aligned} L_u &= \prod_{i=1}^m \prod_{j=1}^{n_i} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi\sigma^2}} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2\sigma^2} (Y_{ij} - \mu_i)^2\right) \\ &= (2\pi\sigma^2)^{-n/2} \exp\left(-\frac{1}{2\sigma^2} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \mu_i)^2\right) \\ \ln L_u &= -\frac{n}{2} \ln 2\pi - \frac{n}{2} \ln \sigma^2 - \frac{1}{2\sigma^2} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \mu_i)^2 \end{aligned} \tag{7}$$

Setting the partial derivative with respect to σ^2 to zero to find the MLE of σ^2 :

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial \ln L_u}{\partial \sigma^2} \Big|_{\sigma^2=\widehat{\sigma^2}, \mu_i=\widehat{\mu}_i} &= -\frac{n}{2\widehat{\sigma^2}} + \frac{1}{2\widehat{\sigma^4}} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \widehat{\mu}_i)^2 \\ &= 0. \end{aligned} \tag{8}$$

Multiplying Equation ?? by $2\widehat{\sigma^4}$ yields:

$$\begin{aligned} -n\widehat{\sigma^2} + \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \widehat{\mu}_i)^2 &= 0 \\ \implies \widehat{\sigma^2} &= \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \widehat{\mu}_i)^2 \end{aligned} \quad (9)$$

Setting the partial derivative with respect to μ_i to zero to find the MLE of μ_k :

$$\begin{aligned} \left. \frac{\partial \ln L_u}{\partial \mu_k} \right|_{\sigma^2=\widehat{\sigma^2}, \mu_i=\widehat{\mu}_i} &= -\frac{1}{2\widehat{\sigma^2}} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} 2 \cdot (-1) \cdot (Y_{ij} - \widehat{\mu}_i) \delta_{ik} \\ &= 0 \\ \frac{1}{\widehat{\sigma^2}} \sum_{j=1}^{n_k} (Y_{kj} - \widehat{\mu}_k) &= 0. \end{aligned} \quad (10)$$

Multiplying both sides of Equation ?? by $\widehat{\sigma^2}$ yields:

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{j=1}^{n_k} (Y_{kj} - \widehat{\mu}_k) &= 0 \\ n_k \overline{Y}_k - n_k \widehat{\mu}_k &= 0 \\ \implies \widehat{\mu}_k &= \overline{Y}_k. \end{aligned} \quad (11)$$

Substituting Equations ?? and ?? into Equation ?? yields:

$$\begin{aligned} L_u &= (2\pi\widehat{\sigma^2})^{-n/2} \exp \left(-\frac{1}{2\widehat{\sigma^2}} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \widehat{\mu}_i)^2 \right) \\ &= (2\pi\widehat{\sigma^2})^{-n/2} \exp \left(-\frac{n}{2} \right) \\ &= \left(\frac{2\pi e}{n} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \overline{Y}_i)^2 \right)^{-n/2}. \end{aligned} \quad (12)$$

Likelihood ratio

$$\begin{aligned}\lambda &= \frac{L(H_0)}{L_u} \\ &= \left(\frac{\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y}_i)^2}{\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y})^2} \right)^{n/2} \\ \lambda^{-2/n} &= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y})^2}{\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y}_i)^2}.\end{aligned}\tag{13}$$

Let us try to simplify our denominator in Equation ??:

$$\begin{aligned}\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y}_i)^2 &= \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y} + \bar{Y} - \bar{Y}_i)^2 \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y})^2 + 2(Y_{ij} - \bar{Y})(\bar{Y} - \bar{Y}_i) + (\bar{Y} - \bar{Y}_i)^2\end{aligned}\tag{14}$$

Next let us try to simplify the second term in Equation ??.

$$\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y})(\bar{Y} - \bar{Y}_i) = \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y})\bar{Y} - (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y})\bar{Y}_i\tag{15}$$

Let us now simplify the first term in Equation ??.

$$\begin{aligned}\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y})\bar{Y} &= \bar{Y} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} Y_{ij} - \bar{Y} \\ &= \bar{Y}(n\bar{Y} - \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} \bar{Y}) \\ &= \bar{Y}(n\bar{Y} - n\bar{Y}) \\ &= 0.\end{aligned}\tag{16}$$

Substituting Equation ?? into Equation ?? yields:

$$\begin{aligned}
\therefore \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y})(\bar{Y} - \bar{Y}_i) &= \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} -(Y_{ij} - \bar{Y})\bar{Y}_i \\
&= - \sum_{i=1}^m \bar{Y}_i \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \bar{Y}) \\
&= - \sum_{i=1}^m \bar{Y}_i (n_i \bar{Y}_i - n_i \bar{Y}) \\
&= - \sum_{i=1}^m n_i \bar{Y}_i (\bar{Y}_i - \bar{Y}).
\end{aligned} \tag{17}$$

Equation ?? can be shown to be equivalent to $-\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (\bar{Y}_i - \bar{Y})^2$. Namely:

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (\bar{Y}_i - \bar{Y})^2 &= \sum_{i=1}^m n_i (\bar{Y}_i - \bar{Y})^2 \\
&= \sum_{i=1}^m n_i (\bar{Y}_i - \bar{Y})(\bar{Y}_i - \bar{Y}) \\
&= \sum_{i=1}^m n_i \bar{Y}_i (\bar{Y}_i - \bar{Y}) - n_i \bar{Y} (\bar{Y}_i - \bar{Y}) \\
&= \left(\sum_{i=1}^m n_i \bar{Y}_i (\bar{Y}_i - \bar{Y}) \right) - \bar{Y} \sum_{i=1}^m n_i (\bar{Y}_i - \bar{Y}) \\
&= \left(\sum_{i=1}^m n_i \bar{Y}_i (\bar{Y}_i - \bar{Y}) \right) - \bar{Y} \sum_{i=1}^m n_i \bar{Y}_i - n_i \bar{Y}.
\end{aligned} \tag{18}$$

Simplifying the second term in Equation ?? yields:

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{i=1}^m n_i \bar{Y}_i &= \sum_{i=1}^m n_i \frac{1}{n_i} \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} Y_{ij} \\
&= \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} Y_{ij} \\
&= n \bar{Y}.
\end{aligned} \tag{19}$$

Substituting Equation ?? into Equation ?? yields:

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y})^2 &= \left(\sum_{i=1}^m n_i \overline{Y}_i (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y}) \right) - \overline{Y} (n\overline{Y} - \sum_{i=1}^m n_i \overline{Y}) \\ &= \left(\sum_{i=1}^m n_i \overline{Y}_i (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y}) \right) - \overline{Y} (n\overline{Y} - \overline{Y} \sum_{i=1}^m n_i) \\ &= \left(\sum_{i=1}^m n_i \overline{Y}_i (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y}) \right) - \overline{Y} (n\overline{Y} - \overline{Y} n) \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^m n_i \overline{Y}_i (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y}). \end{aligned}$$

Therefore:

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \overline{Y})(\overline{Y} - \overline{Y}_i) &= - \sum_{i=1}^m n_i (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y})^2 \\ &= - \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y})^2. \end{aligned}$$

Thus Equation ?? becomes:

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \overline{Y}_i)^2 &= \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \overline{Y})^2 - 2(\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y})^2 + (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y})^2 \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \overline{Y})^2 - (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y})^2. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore Equation ?? becomes:

$$\begin{aligned} \lambda^{-2/n} &= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \overline{Y})^2}{\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \overline{Y})^2 - (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y})^2} \\ &= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \overline{Y})^2 - (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y})^2 + (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y})^2}{\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \overline{Y})^2 - (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y})^2} \\ &= 1 + \frac{\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y})^2}{\sum_{i=1}^m \sum_{j=1}^{n_i} (Y_{ij} - \overline{Y})^2 - (\overline{Y}_i - \overline{Y})^2} \\ &= 1 + \frac{\text{SST}}{\text{SSE}} \\ &= 1 + \frac{F(m-1)}{(n-m)} \\ \implies \lambda &= \left(\frac{1}{1 + \frac{F(m-1)}{n-m}} \right)^{n/2}. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore as λ is a monotone decreasing function of F , testing whether $\lambda < k$ is equivalent to testing whether $F > k^*$, which forms the basis of the one-way ANOVA F-test.