- Pre-audit Assessment for Readiness: Graph Horizon and Subgraph Services
  - Scope Details
    - \* Subgraph Services
    - \* Horizon
    - \* Main Contracts
  - Test Information
    - \* Subgraph Services
    - \* Horizon
    - \* Main Contracts
  - Validation of Prior Critical & High Issues
    - \* OpenZeppelin The Graph Horizon Audit (September 5, 2024)
    - \* Trust Security The Graph Horizon Upgrade Audit (December 17, 2024)
  - Automated Scanning Results
    - \* Boolean Literals Used in Complex Expressions or as Conditionals
    - \* Floating Pragma
    - \* Incomplete Docstrings
    - \* Lack of Storage Gap in Upgradeable Contracts
    - \* Missing Docstrings
    - \* Require Statement Does Not Check for Any Conditions
    - \* Require Statement With Multiple Conditions
    - \* Missing Error Message in Revert Statement
    - \* Unsafe ABI Encoding
    - $\ast$  Use calldata Instead of memory
    - \* Duplicate Imports
    - \* File and Contract Names Mismatch
    - \* Todo Comments in the Code
    - \* Inconsistent Use of Named Returns in a Function
    - \* Prefix Increment Operator ++i Can Save Gas in Loops
    - \* Indecisive Licenses
    - \* Lack of Indexed Event Parameters
    - \* Lack of Security Contact
    - \* Modifiers Could Be Used
    - \* Non-explicit Imports Are Used
    - \* Redundant Getter Functions
    - \* Redundant Return Statement
    - \* Use Custom Errors
    - \* Unnecessary Casts
    - \* Unsafe Casts
    - \* Unused Functions With Internal or Private Visibility
    - \* Unused Imports
    - \* Unused Modifiers
    - \* Unused Named Return Variables
    - \* Variables Could Be constant

# Pre-audit Assessment for Readiness: Graph Horizon and Subgraph Services

Link to the repo: Graph Protocol

Report commit: 7bac074

## Scope Details

Audit of pull request #944 which concerns the below contracts.

## Subgraph Services

```
9 contracts, 3 libraries, 2 interfaces:
subgraph-service
  contracts
      DisputeManager.sol
      DisputeManagerStorage.sol
      SubgraphService.sol
      SubgraphServiceStorage.sol
      interfaces
          IDisputeManager.sol
          ISubgraphService.sol
      libraries
          Allocation.sol
          Attestation.sol
          LegacyAllocation.sol
      utilities
          AllocationManager.sol
          AllocationManagerStorage.sol
           AttestationManager.sol
          AttestationManagerStorage.sol
          Directory.sol
```

#### Horizon

```
20 contracts, 7 libraries, 15 interfaces:
horizon
contracts
data-service
DataService.sol
DataServiceStorage.sol
extensions
DataServiceFees.sol
DataServiceFeesStorage.sol
```

DataServicePausable.sol DataServicePausableUpgradeable.sol DataServiceRescuable.sol interfaces IDataService.sol IDataServiceFees.sol IDataServicePausable.sol IDataServiceRescuable.sol libraries ProvisionTracker.sol utilities ProvisionManager.sol ProvisionManagerStorage.sol interfaces IAuthorizable.sol IGraphPayments.sol IGraphProxyAdmin.sol IGraphTallyCollector.sol IHorizonStaking.sol IPaymentsCollector.sol IPaymentsEscrow.sol internal IHorizonStakingBase.sol IHorizonStakingExtension.sol IHorizonStakingMain.sol IHorizonStakingTypes.sol libraries Denominations.sol LibFixedMath.sol LinkedList.sol MathUtils.sol PPMMath.sol UintRange.sol payments GraphPayments.sol PaymentsEscrow.sol collectors GraphTallyCollector.sol staking HorizonStaking.sol HorizonStakingBase.sol HorizonStakingExtension.sol HorizonStakingStorage.sol libraries ExponentialRebates.sol

utilities

```
Managed.sol
utilities
Authorizable.sol
GraphDirectory.sol
```

#### **Main Contracts**

10 contract, 6 interfaces (selected based on PR changes, but auditors might need to reference other contracts within contracts/contracts):

```
contracts
  contracts
      curation
          Curation.sol
          CurationStorage.sol
          ICuration.sol
      governance
          Controller.sol
          Governed.sol
          IController.sol
          IManaged.sol
          Managed.sol
          Pausable.sol
      12
          curation
              IL2Curation.sol
              L2Curation.sol
      rewards
          IRewardsIssuer.sol
          IRewardsManager.sol
          RewardsManager.sol
          RewardsManagerStorage.sol
      staking
          Staking.sol
```

## **Test Information**

Complete testing suite.

### Subgraph Services

Great coverage. No failing tests. 144 total Foundry tests:

```
| 94.5
| contracts/SubgraphService.sol
                                               | 94.90% (93/98)
                                                                   | 95.65% (110/115)
| contracts/libraries/Allocation.sol
                                               | 100.00% (30/30)
                                                                   | 100.00% (42/42)
                                                                                         | 66.6
| contracts/libraries/Attestation.sol
                                              | 100.00% (15/15)
                                                                   | 100.00% (19/19)
                                                                                         | 50.0
| contracts/libraries/LegacyAllocation.sol
                                                66.67% (6/9)
                                                                   | 58.33% (7/12)
                                                                                           62.
| contracts/utilities/AllocationManager.sol
                                                97.22% (70/72)
                                                                   | 95.51% (85/89)
                                                                                           95.0
| contracts/utilities/AttestationManager.sol |
                                                100.00% (7/7)
                                                                   | 100.00% (9/9)
                                                                                          | 100
| contracts/utilities/Directory.sol
                                              | 87.50% (7/8)
                                                                   | 90.00% (9/10)
                                                                                          | 50.0
| test/SubgraphBaseTest.t.sol
                                              | 98.51% (66/67)
                                                                   | 98.67% (74/75)
                                                                                          | 100
                                              | 99.20% (249/251)
| test/disputeManager/DisputeManager.t.sol
                                                                   | 98.68% (299/303)
                                                                                         | 78.9
| test/mocks/MockCuration.sol
                                              | 100.00% (1/1)
                                                                   | 100.00% (1/1)
                                                                                         | 100
| test/mocks/MockEpochManager.sol
                                              | 50.00% (6/12)
                                                                   | 36.00% (9/25)
                                                                                          | 100
| test/mocks/MockGRTToken.sol
                                                66.67% (2/3)
                                                                   | 66.67% (2/3)
                                                                                           100
| test/mocks/MockRewardsManager.sol
                                                100.00% (12/12)
                                                                   | 100.00% (15/15)
                                                                                           100
| test/shared/HorizonStakingShared.t.sol
                                              | 100.00% (38/38)
                                                                   | 100.00% (41/41)
                                                                                          | 100
| test/shared/SubgraphServiceShared.t.sol
                                              | 97.22% (70/72)
                                                                   | 97.70% (85/87)
                                                                                          100
| test/subgraphService/SubgraphService.t.sol |
                                                100.00% (187/187) | 100.00% (235/235)
                                                                                          | 100
| test/utils/Utils.sol
                                                100.00% (2/2)
                                                                   | 100.00% (2/2)
                                                                                          | 100
| Total
                                              | 97.56% (998/1023) | 96.64% (1208/1250)
                                                                                         | 87.5
```

#### Horizon

Great coverage. No failing tests. 315 total Foundry tests:

Ran 46 test suites in 145.00s (1808.56s CPU time): 315 tests passed, 0 failed, 0 skipped (3						
·	% Lines					
contracts/data-service/DataService.sol	100.00% (5/5)					
contracts/data-service/extensions/DataServiceFees.sol	100.00% (26/26)					
contracts/data-service/extensions/DataServicePausable.sol	100.00% (6/6)					
contracts/data-service/extensions/DataServicePausableUpgradeable.sol	16.67% (1/6)					
contracts/data-service/extensions/DataServiceRescuable.sol	0.00% (0/7)					
contracts/data-service/libraries/ProvisionTracker.sol	70.00% (7/10)					
contracts/data-service/utilities/ProvisionManager.sol	88.37% (38/43)					
contracts/libraries/Denominations.sol	0.00% (0/1)					
contracts/libraries/LibFixedMath.sol	89.66% (78/87)					
contracts/libraries/LinkedList.sol	100.00% (21/21)					
contracts/libraries/MathUtils.sol	100.00% (3/3)					
contracts/libraries/PPMMath.sol	100.00% (5/5)					
contracts/libraries/UintRange.sol	100.00% (2/2)					
contracts/mocks/ControllerMock.sol	0.00% (0/15)					
contracts/mocks/CurationMock.sol	100.00% (4/4)					
contracts/mocks/EpochManagerMock.sol	50.00% (6/12)					
contracts/mocks/MockGRTToken.sol	66.67% (2/3)					
contracts/mocks/RewardsManagerMock.sol	100.00% (4/4)					
contracts/payments/GraphPayments.sol	100.00% (21/21)					
contracts/payments/PaymentsEscrow.sol	100.00% (37/37)					

ı	contracts/payments/collectors/GraphTallyCollector.sol	96.97% (32/33)
i	contracts/staking/HorizonStaking.sol	98.99% (293/296)
i	contracts/staking/HorizonStakingBase.sol	85.92% (61/71)
i	contracts/staking/HorizonStakingExtension.sol	94.12% (112/119)
i	contracts/staking/libraries/ExponentialRebates.sol	100.00% (9/9)
	<u> </u>	66.67% (2/3)
1	contracts/staking/utilities/Managed.sol	
!	contracts/utilities/Authorizable.sol	100.00% (23/23)
!	contracts/utilities/GraphDirectory.sol	100.00% (26/26)
	test/GraphBase.t.sol	100.00% (83/83)
	test/data-service/implementations/DataServiceBase.sol	100.00% (8/8)
	test/data-service/implementations/DataServiceBaseUpgradeable.sol	100.00% (3/3)
	test/data-service/implementations/DataServiceImpFees.sol	33.33% (2/6)
	test/data-service/implementations/DataServiceImpPausable.sol	100.00% (4/4)
1	test/data-service/implementations/DataServiceImpPausableUpgradeable.sol	100.00% (4/4)
1	test/data-service/implementations/DataServiceOverride.sol	100.00% (4/4)
1	test/data-service/libraries/ProvisionTracker.t.sol	100.00% (2/2)
	test/escrow/GraphEscrow.t.sol	96.77% (60/62)
	test/libraries/ListImplementation.sol	100.00% (11/11)
	test/payments/GraphPayments.t.sol	100.00% (1/1)
1	test/payments/graph-tally-collector/GraphTallyCollector.t.sol	100.00% (51/51)
1	test/shared/horizon-staking/HorizonStakingShared.t.sol	99.08% (863/871)
1	test/shared/payments-escrow/PaymentsEscrowShared.t.sol	100.00% (18/18)
1	test/staking/HorizonStaking.t.sol	93.94% (31/33)
1	test/utilities/Authorizable.t.sol	100.00% (32/32)
1	test/utilities/GraphDirectoryImplementation.sol	81.82% (9/11)
1	test/utils/Bounder.t.sol	100.00% (8/8)
1	test/utils/Utils.sol	100.00% (2/2)
1	Total	95.64% (2020/211

## Main Contracts

Great coverage. No failing tests. 724 total Hardhat tests:

## 724 passing (15m)

721 pubbing (10m)	11			1	1	1
File	   % S	tmts	% Branch	% Funcs	% Lines	Unco
base/	 	100	100	100	   100	
IMulticall.sol		100	100	l 100	100	l
Multicall.sol		100	100	100	100	1
curation/		100	90.91	100	100	1
Curation.sol		100	90.91	100	100	1
CurationStorage.sol		100	100	100	100	l
GraphCurationToken.sol	1	100	100	100	100	l
ICuration.sol	1	100	100	100	100	
IGraphCurationToken.sol	1	100 l	100	l 100	100	I

discovery/	1	99.59	92.39	100	99.59	1
GNS.sol	1	99.36	94.23	100	99.37	1
GNSStorage.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
IGNS.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
IServiceRegistry.sol	1	100	100	100	100	
ISubgraphNFT.sol	1	100	100	100	100	
ISubgraphNFTDescriptor.sol	1	100	100	100	100	
L1GNS.sol	1	100	93.75	100	100	1
L1GNSStorage.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
ServiceRegistry.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
ServiceRegistryStorage.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
SubgraphNFT.sol	1	100	78.57	100	100	1
SubgraphNFTDescriptor.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
discovery/erc1056/	1	0	0	0	0	1
EthereumDIDRegistry.sol	1	0	0	0	0	1
IEthereumDIDRegistry.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
disputes/	1	99.17	l 86	100	99.19	1
DisputeManager.sol	1	99.17	l 86	100	99.19	1
DisputeManagerStorage.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
IDisputeManager.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
epochs/	1	77.78	J 50	81.82	77.78	1
EpochManager.sol	1	77.78	J 50	81.82	77.78	1
EpochManagerStorage.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
IEpochManager.sol	1	100	100	100	100	
gateway/	1	100	76.83	100	100	1
BridgeEscrow.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
<pre>GraphTokenGateway.sol</pre>	1	100	87.5	100	100	1
ICallhookReceiver.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
L1GraphTokenGateway.sol	1	100	75.68	100	100	1
governance/	1	97.56	89.47	100	97.73	1
Controller.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
Governed.sol	1	100	83.33	100	100	1
IController.sol	1	100	100	100	100	1
<pre>IManaged.sol</pre>	1	100	100	100	100	
Managed.sol	1	100	93.75	100	100	
Pausable.sol	1	86.67	75	100	86.67	
12/curation/	1	100	87.5	100	100	
IL2Curation.sol	1	100	100	100	100	
L2Curation.sol	1	100	87.5	100	100	
12/discovery/	1	100	96.15	100	100	
IL2GNS.sol	1	100	100	100	100	
L2GNS.sol	1	100	96.15	100	100	
L2GNSStorage.sol		100				
12/gateway/		100				
${\tt L2GraphTokenGateway.sol}$		100				
12/staking/	1	100	100	100	100	

IL2Staking.sol	100	100	100	100	I
IL2StakingBase.sol	100	100	100	100	1
IL2StakingTypes.sol	100	100	100	100	l
L2Staking.sol	100	100	100	100	l
12/token/	100	80	100	100	l
GraphTokenUpgradeable.sol	100	91.67	100	100	l
L2GraphToken.sol	100	62.5	100	100	l
libraries/	95.24	50	100	97.67	l
Base58Encoder.sol	96.3	50	100	100	l
HexStrings.sol	93.33	50 l	100	93.75	
payments/	92.59	85	87.5	92.59	
AllocationExchange.sol	92.59	85	87.5	92.59	
rewards/	96.69	92	93.1	96.83	
IRewardsIssuer.sol	100	100	100 l	100	
IRewardsManager.sol	100	100	100 l	100	
RewardsManager.sol	94.94	86.36	90.48	95	126,
RewardsManagerStorage.sol	100	100	100 l	100	
SubgraphAvailabilityManager.sol	100	96.43	100 l	100	
staking/	98.49	96.81	96.97	98.51	
IL1GraphTokenLockTransferTool.sol	100	100	100 l	100	
IL1Staking.sol	100	100	100 l	100	
IL1StakingBase.sol	100	100	100 l	100	
IStaking.sol	100	100	100 l	100	
IStakingBase.sol	100	100	100 l	100	
IStakingData.sol	100	100	100 l	100	
IStakingExtension.sol	100	100	100 l	100	
L1Staking.sol	100	100	100 l	100	
L1StakingStorage.sol	100	100	100 l	100	
Staking.sol	97.71	95.92	96.08	97.72	1
StakingExtension.sol	99.12	95.45	97.44	99.12	
StakingStorage.sol	100	100	100	100	
staking/libs/	60.1	47.83	77.14	60.1	
Exponential.sol	100	100	100	100	
LibFixedMath.sol	50	38.16	57.89	50	l:
MathUtils.sol	100	100	100	100	
Stakes.sol	100	90	100	100	
tests/	100	60 l	100	100	
CallhookReceiverMock.sol	100	100	100	100	
GovernedMock.sol	100	100	100	100	
L1GraphTokenLockTransferToolBadMock.sol	100	50 l	100	100	
L1GraphTokenLockTransferToolMock.sol	100	50 l	100	100	
LegacyGNSMock.sol	100	100	100	100	
tests/ens/	100	100	100	100	
IENS.sol	100	100	100 l	100	
IPublicResolver.sol	100	100	100	100	
ITestRegistrar.sol	100	100	100	100	I

token/	1	100		100	100	100	
GraphToken.sol	1	100	1	100	100	100	
IGraphToken.sol	1	100	1	100	100	100	
upgrades/	1	98.28	1	65.38	96.97	97.22	1
GraphProxy.sol	1	100	1	71.43	100	100	1
GraphProxyAdmin.sol	1	100	1	50	100	100	1
GraphProxyStorage.sol	1	92.31	1	0	85.71	90	1
GraphUpgradeable.sol	1	100	1	100	100	100	1
${\tt IGraphProxy.sol}$	1	100		100	100	100	
utils/	1	100		90	100	100	
TokenUtils.sol	1	100		90	100	100	
	-						
All files	1	92.38	1	82.88	93.06	92.48	1
	.		1		l	l	1

## Validation of Prior Critical & High Issues

These will validated later.

OpenZeppelin - The Graph Horizon Audit (September 5, 2024)

Link

Trust Security - The Graph Horizon Upgrade Audit (December 17, 2024)

Link

## **Automated Scanning Results**

These are curated issues from the Inspector scan. See closed issues in the audit repository for false positives.

### Boolean Literals Used in Complex Expressions or as Conditionals

Boolean literals in code have only a few legitimate uses. Other uses (in complex expressions, as conditionals) indicate either an error or, most likely, the presence of faulty code.

Throughout the codebase, there are multiple potentially misused Boolean literals.

- Boolean literal True within the contract HorizonStakingExtension in HorizonStakingExtension.sol.
- Boolean literal True within the contract Staking in Staking.sol.
- Boolean literal True within the contract StakingExtension in StakingExtension.sol.

To avoid misuse of a Boolean literal, ensure it aligns with intended behavior and is well documented.

#### Floating Pragma

Auditor's comment: It seems to be for backwards compatibility. However, I'm still concerned with  $0.7.6 \parallel 0.8.27$ . Arithmetic operations have different behaviours in these versions. So any contract with this pragma directive must be confirmed to not have any arithmetic operation.

Pragma directives should be fixed to clearly identify the Solidity version with which the contracts will be compiled.

Throughout the codebase, there are multiple floating pragma directives:

- Controller.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.
- Curation.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- Curation.sol has the abicoder v2 floating pragma directive.
- CurationStorage.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- Exponential.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- Governed.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.
- GraphUpgradeable.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.
- IController.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.
- ICuration.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.
- IEpochManager.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.
- $\bullet\,$  IGNS.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- IGraphCurationToken.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- IGraphProxy.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.
- IGraphToken.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.

- IL2Curation.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- IManaged.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive
- IMulticall.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- IMulticall.sol has the abicoder v2 floating pragma directive.
- IRewardsIssuer.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.
- IRewardsManager.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.
- IStaking.sol has the solidity >=0.6.12 <0.8.0 floating pragma directive.
- IStaking.sol has the abicoder v2 floating pragma directive.
- IStakingBase.sol has the solidity >=0.6.12 <0.8.0 floating pragma directive.
- IStakingBase.sol has the abicoder v2 floating pragma directive.
- IStakingData.sol has the solidity >=0.6.12 <0.8.0 floating pragma directive.
- IStakingExtension.sol has the solidity >=0.6.12 <0.8.0 floating pragma directive.
- IStakingExtension.sol has the abicoder v2 floating pragma directive.
- ITokenGateway.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.
- L2Curation.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- L2Curation.sol has the abicoder v2 floating pragma directive.
- LibFixedMath.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- Managed.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- MathUtils.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- Multicall.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- Multicall.sol has the abicoder v2 floating pragma directive.
- Pausable.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.
- RewardsManager.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- $\bullet$  RewardsManager.sol has the abicoder v2 floating pragma directive.

- RewardsManagerStorage.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.
- Stakes.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- Stakes.sol has the abicoder v2 floating pragma directive.
- Staking.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- Staking.sol has the abicoder v2 floating pragma directive.
- StakingExtension.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- StakingExtension.sol has the abicoder v2 floating pragma directive.
- StakingStorage.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 floating pragma directive.
- TokenUtils.sol has the solidity ^0.7.6 || 0.8.27 floating pragma directive.

Consider using fixed pragma directives.

#### **Incomplete Docstrings**

Throughout the codebase, multiple instances of incomplete docstrings were identified:

- In Authorizable.sol, the authorizeSigner function For example:
  - The signer, proofDeadline, proof parameters are not documented.
- In Authorizable.sol, the thawSigner function For example:
  - The signer parameter is not documented.
- In Authorizable.sol, the cancelThawSigner function For example:
  - The signer parameter is not documented.
- In Authorizable.sol, the revokeAuthorizedSigner function For example:
  - The signer parameter is not documented.
- In Authorizable.sol, the getThawEnd function For example:
  - The signer parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In Authorizable.sol, the isAuthorized function For example:
  - The authorizer, signer parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In Controller.sol, the SetContractProxy event For example:

- The id, contractAddress parameters are not documented.
- In Controller.sol, the getGovernor function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In Curation.sol, the Signalled event For example:
  - The curator, subgraphDeploymentID, tokens, signal, curationTax parameters are not documented.
- In Curation.sol, the Burned event For example:
  - The curator, subgraphDeploymentID, tokens, signal parameters are not documented.
- In Curation.sol, the Collected event For example:
  - The subgraphDeploymentID, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In DataService.sol, the getThawingPeriodRange function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In DataService.sol, the getVerifierCutRange function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In DataService.sol, the getProvisionTokensRange function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In DataService.sol, the getDelegationRatio function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In DataServiceFees.sol, the releaseStake function For example:
  - The numClaimsToRelease parameter is not documented.
- In DataServiceRescuable.sol, the rescueGRT function For example:
  - The to, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In DataServiceRescuable.sol, the rescueETH function For example:
  - The to, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In DisputeManager.sol, the createIndexingDispute function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In DisputeManager.sol, the createQueryDispute function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.

- In DisputeManager.sol, the createQueryDisputeConflict function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In DisputeManager.sol, the getStakeSnapshot function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In DisputeManager.sol, the areConflictingAttestations function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In DisputeManager.sol, the isDisputeCreated function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In Governed.sol, the NewPendingOwnership event For example:
  - The from, to parameters are not documented.
- In Governed.sol, the NewOwnership event For example:
  - The from, to parameters are not documented.
- In GraphPayments.sol, the collect function For example:
  - The paymentType, receiver, tokens, dataService, dataServiceCut parameters are not documented.
- In GraphTallyCollector.sol, the collect function For example:
  - The paymentType, data parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In GraphTallyCollector.sol, the recoverRAVSigner function For example:
  - The signedRAV parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In GraphTallyCollector.sol, the encodeRAV function For example:
  - The rav parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the stake function For example:
  - The tokens parameter is not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the stakeTo function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the stakeToProvision function For example:

- The serviceProvider, verifier, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the unstake function For example:
  - The tokens parameter is not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the provision function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier, tokens, maxVerifierCut, thawingPeriod parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the addToProvision function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the thaw function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier, tokens parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the deprovision function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier, nThawRequests parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the reprovision function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, oldVerifier, newVerifier, nThawRequests parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the setProvisionParameters function For example:
  - The <code>serviceProvider</code>, <code>verifier</code>, <code>newMaxVerifierCut</code>, <code>newThawingPeriod</code> parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the acceptProvisionParameters function For example:
  - The serviceProvider parameter is not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the delegate function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier, tokens, minSharesOut parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the addToDelegationPool function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the undelegate function For example:

- The serviceProvider, verifier, shares parameters are not documented.
- Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the withdrawDelegated function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier, nThawRequests parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the redelegate function For example:
  - The oldServiceProvider, oldVerifier, newServiceProvider, newVerifier, minSharesForNewProvider, nThawRequests parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the setDelegationFeeCut function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier, paymentType, feeCut parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the delegate function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the undelegate function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, shares parameters are not documented.
- $\bullet$  In HorizonStaking.sol, the withdrawDelegated function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, None parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the slash function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, tokens, tokensVerifier, verifierDestination parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the provisionLocked function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier, tokens, maxVerifierCut, thawingPeriod parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the setOperatorLocked function For example:
  - The verifier, operator, allowed parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the setAllowedLockedVerifier function For example:
  - The verifier, allowed parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the setMaxThawingPeriod function For example:
  - $-% \frac{1}{2}$  The  $\verb|maxThawingPeriod|$  parameter is not documented.

- In HorizonStaking.sol, the setOperator function For example:
  - The verifier, operator, allowed parameters are not documented.
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the isAuthorized function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier, operator parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getServiceProvider function For example:
  - The serviceProvider parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getStake function For example:
  - The serviceProvider parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getIdleStake function For example:
  - The serviceProvider parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getDelegationPool function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getDelegation function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier, delegator parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getDelegationFeeCut function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier, paymentType parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getProvision function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getTokensAvailable function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier, delegationRatio parameters are not documented.

- Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getProviderTokensAvailable function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getDelegatedTokensAvailable function For example:
  - The serviceProvider, verifier parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getThawRequest function For example:
  - The requestType, thawRequestId parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getThawRequestList function For example:
  - The requestType, serviceProvider, verifier, owner parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getThawedTokens function For example:
  - The requestType, serviceProvider, verifier, owner parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the getMaxThawingPeriod function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the isAllowedLockedVerifier function For example:
  - The verifier parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the isDelegationSlashingEnabled function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In HorizonStakingExtension.sol, the getAllocationData function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In IAuthorizable.sol, the getThawEnd function For example:

- The signer parameter is not documented.
- Not all return values are documented.
- In IAuthorizable.sol, the isAuthorized function For example:
  - The authorizer, signer parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In IDataServiceRescuable.sol, the RescuerSet event For example:
  - The account, allowed parameters are not documented.
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the QueryDisputeCreated event For example:
  - The disputeId, indexer, fisherman, tokens, subgraphDeploymentId, attestation, stakeSnapshot parameters are not documented.
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the IndexingDisputeCreated event For example:
  - The disputeId, indexer, fisherman, tokens, allocationId, poi, stakeSnapshot parameters are not documented.
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the DisputeAccepted event For example:
  - The disputeId, indexer, fisherman, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the DisputeRejected event For example:
  - The disputeId, indexer, fisherman, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the DisputeDrawn event For example:
  - The disputeId, indexer, fisherman, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the DisputeLinked event For example:
  - The disputeId1, disputeId2 parameters are not documented.
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the DisputeCancelled event For example:
  - The disputeId, indexer, fisherman, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In IGNS.sol, the tokensToNSignal function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In IGNS.sol, the nSignalToTokens function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In IGraphTallyCollector.sol, the collect function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.

- In IHorizonStakingBase.sol, the getServiceProvider function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In IHorizonStakingBase.sol, the getMaxThawingPeriod function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In IHorizonStakingBase.sol, the isDelegationSlashingEnabled function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In IHorizonStakingExtension.sol, the AllocationClosed event For example:
  - The indexer, subgraphDeploymentID, epoch, tokens, allocationID, sender, poi, isPublic parameters are not documented.
- In IHorizonStakingExtension.sol, the RebateCollected event For example:
  - The assetHolder, indexer, subgraphDeploymentID, allocationID, epoch, tokens, protocolTax, curationFees, queryFees, queryRebates, delegationRewards parameters are not documented.
- In IHorizonStakingExtension.sol, the StakeSlashed event For example:
  - The indexer, tokens, reward, beneficiary parameters are not documented.
- In IHorizonStakingMain.sol, the withdrawDelegated function For example:
  - The None parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In IPaymentsCollector.sol, the collect function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In IPaymentsEscrow.sol, the getBalance function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In IStakingBase.sol, the StakeDeposited event For example:
  - The indexer, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In IStakingBase.sol, the StakeLocked event For example:
  - The indexer, tokens, until parameters are not documented.

- In IStakingBase.sol, the StakeWithdrawn event For example:
  - The indexer, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In IStakingBase.sol, the AllocationCreated event For example:
  - The indexer, subgraphDeploymentID, epoch, tokens, allocationID, metadata parameters are not documented.
- In IStakingBase.sol, the AllocationClosed event For example:
  - The indexer, subgraphDeploymentID, epoch, tokens, allocationID, sender, poi, isPublic parameters are not documented.
- In IStakingBase.sol, the RebateCollected event For example:
  - The assetHolder, indexer, subgraphDeploymentID, allocationID, epoch, tokens, protocolTax, curationFees, queryFees, queryRebates, delegationRewards parameters are not documented.
- In IStakingBase.sol, the DelegationParametersUpdated event For example:
  - The indexer, indexingRewardCut, queryFeeCut, \_\_DEPRECATED\_cooldownBlocks parameters are not documented.
- In IStakingBase.sol, the SetOperator event For example:
  - The indexer, operator, allowed parameters are not documented.
- In IStakingBase.sol, the SetRewardsDestination event For example:
  - The indexer, destination parameters are not documented.
- In IStakingBase.sol, the ExtensionImplementationSet event For example:
  - The extensionImpl parameter is not documented.
- In IStakingBase.sol, the setDelegationParameters function For example:
  - The None parameter is not documented.
- In IStakingBase.sol, the getAllocationData function For example:
  - The \_allocationID parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In IStakingBase.sol, the isActiveAllocation function For example:
  - The \_allocationID parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In IStakingExtension.sol, the StakeDelegated event For example:

- The indexer, delegator, tokens, shares parameters are not documented.
- In IStakingExtension.sol, the StakeDelegatedLocked event For example:
  - The indexer, delegator, tokens, shares, until parameters are not documented.
- In IStakingExtension.sol, the StakeDelegatedWithdrawn event For example:
  - The indexer, delegator, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In IStakingExtension.sol, the StakeSlashed event For example:
  - The indexer, tokens, reward, beneficiary parameters are not documented.
- In IStakingExtension.sol, the SlasherUpdate event For example:
  - The caller, slasher, allowed parameters are not documented.
- In IStakingExtension.sol, the withdrawDelegated function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In ISubgraphService.sol, the getAllocation function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In ISubgraphService.sol, the getLegacyAllocation function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In ISubgraphService.sol, the encodeAllocationProof function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In L2Curation.sol, the Signalled event For example:
  - The curator, subgraphDeploymentID, tokens, signal, curationTax parameters are not documented.
- $\bullet\,$  In L2Curation.sol, the Burned event For example:
  - The curator, subgraphDeploymentID, tokens, signal parameters are not documented.
- In L2Curation.sol, the Collected event For example:
  - The subgraphDeploymentID, tokens parameters are not documented.

- In L2Curation.sol, the SubgraphServiceSet event For example:
  - The newSubgraphService parameter is not documented.
- In L2Curation.sol, the setDefaultReserveRatio function For example:
  - The None parameter is not documented.
- In L2Curation.sol, the mint function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In Managed.sol, the ParameterUpdated event For example:
  - The param parameter is not documented.
- In Managed.sol, the SetController event For example:
  - The controller parameter is not documented.
- In Managed.sol, the ContractSynced event For example:
  - The nameHash, contractAddress parameters are not documented.
- In Pausable.sol, the PartialPauseChanged event For example:
  - The isPaused parameter is not documented.
- In Pausable.sol, the PauseChanged event For example:
  - The isPaused parameter is not documented.
- In Pausable.sol, the NewPauseGuardian event For example:
  - The oldPauseGuardian, pauseGuardian parameters are not documented.
- In PaymentsEscrow.sol, the deposit function For example:
  - The collector, receiver, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In PaymentsEscrow.sol, the depositTo function For example:
  - The payer, collector, receiver, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In PaymentsEscrow.sol, the thaw function For example:
  - The collector, receiver, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In PaymentsEscrow.sol, the cancelThaw function For example:
  - The collector, receiver parameters are not documented.
- In PaymentsEscrow.sol, the withdraw function For example:
  - The collector, receiver parameters are not documented.
- In PaymentsEscrow.sol, the collect function For example:

- The paymentType, payer, receiver, tokens, dataService, dataServiceCut parameters are not documented.
- In PaymentsEscrow.sol, the getBalance function For example:
  - The payer, collector, receiver parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In RewardsManager.sol, the HorizonRewardsAssigned event For example:
  - The indexer, allocationID, amount parameters are not documented.
- In RewardsManager.sol, the RewardsDenied event For example:
  - The indexer, allocationID parameters are not documented.
- In RewardsManager.sol, the RewardsDenylistUpdated event For example:
  - The subgraphDeploymentID, sinceBlock parameters are not documented.
- In RewardsManager.sol, the SubgraphServiceSet event For example:
  - The oldSubgraphService, newSubgraphService parameters are not documented.
- $\bullet\,$  In RewardsManager.sol, the initialize function For example:
  - The controller parameter is not documented.
- In RewardsManager.sol, the getRewards function For example:
  - The \_rewardsIssuer parameter is not documented.
- In Staking.sol, the getAllocationData function For example:
  - The allocationID parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In Staking.sol, the isActiveAllocation function For example:
  - The \_allocationID parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In Staking.sol, the setDelegationParameters function For example:
  - The None parameter is not documented.
- In StakingExtension.sol, the initialize function For example:
  - The None parameter is not documented.
- In StakingExtension.sol, the withdrawDelegated function For example:

- Not all return values are documented.
- $\bullet$  In SubgraphService.sol, the acceptProvisionPendingParameters function For example:
  - The None parameter is not documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the collect function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the closeStaleAllocation function For example:
  - The allocationId parameter is not documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the resizeAllocation function For example:
  - The indexer, allocationId, tokens parameters are not documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the migrateLegacyAllocation function For example:
  - The indexer, allocationId, subgraphDeploymentID parameters are not documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the setPauseGuardian function For example:
  - The pauseGuardian, allowed parameters are not documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the setRewardsDestination function For example:
  - The rewardsDestination parameter is not documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the setMinimumProvisionTokens function For example:
  - The minimumProvisionTokens parameter is not documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the setDelegationRatio function For example:
  - The delegationRatio parameter is not documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the setStakeToFeesRatio function For example:
  - The stakeToFeesRatio\_ parameter is not documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the setMaxPOIStaleness function For example:
  - The maxPOIStaleness parameter is not documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the setCurationCut function For example:

- The curationCut parameter is not documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the getAllocation function For example:
  - The allocationId parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the getLegacyAllocation function For example:
  - The allocationId parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the getDisputeManager function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the getGraphTallyCollector function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the getCuration function For example:
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the encodeAllocationProof function For example:
  - The indexer, allocationId parameters are not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.
- In SubgraphService.sol, the isOverAllocated function For example:
  - The indexer parameter is not documented.
  - Not all return values are documented.

Consider thoroughly documenting all functions/events (and their parameters or return values) that are part of a contract's public API. When writing docstrings, consider following the Ethereum Natural Specification Format (NatSpec).

### Lack of Storage Gap in Upgradeable Contracts

Throughout the codebase, there are several contracts that are inherited by upgradeable contracts that do not have a storage gap:

- The CurationV1Storage contract.
- The CurationV2Storage contract.
- The CurationV3Storage contract.

To allow the addition of new state variables without compromising storage compatibility with existing deployments, consider leaving a storage gap at the end of each contract.

### Missing Docstrings

Throughout the codebase, multiple instances of missing docstrings were identified:

- In AllocationManagerStorage.sol, the AllocationManagerV1Storage abstract contract
- In AttestationManagerStorage.sol, the AttestationManagerV1Storage abstract contract
- In CurationStorage.sol, the subgraphService state variable
- In DataServiceFeesStorage.sol, the feesProvisionTracker state variable
- In DataServiceStorage.sol, the DataServiceV1Storage abstract contract
- In DisputeManager.sol, the MAX\_FISHERMAN\_REWARD\_CUT state variable
- In DisputeManager.sol, the MIN\_DISPUTE\_DEPOSIT state variable
- In DisputeManagerStorage.sol, the DisputeManagerV1Storage abstract contract
- In GraphTallyCollector.sol, the collect function
- In HorizonStaking.sol, the fallback function
- In HorizonStakingExtension.sol, the legacySlash function
- In HorizonStakingExtension.sol, the <code>\_\_DEPRECATED\_getThawingPeriod</code> function
- In IController.sol, the IController interface
- In IController.sol, the getGovernor function
- In IController.sol, the setContractProxy function
- In IController.sol, the unsetContractProxy function
- In IController.sol, the updateController function
- In IController.sol, the getContractProxy function
- In IController.sol, the setPartialPaused function
- In IController.sol, the setPaused function
- In IController.sol, the setPauseGuardian function
- In IController.sol, the paused function
- In IController.sol, the partialPaused function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the IDisputeManager interface

- In IDisputeManager.sol, the setDisputePeriod function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the setArbitrator function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the setDisputeDeposit function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the setFishermanRewardCut function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the setMaxSlashingCut function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the createQueryDispute function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the createQueryDisputeConflict function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the createIndexingDispute function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the acceptDispute function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the acceptDisputeConflict function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the rejectDispute function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the drawDispute function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the cancelDispute function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the setSubgraphService function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the getVerifierCut function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the getDisputePeriod function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the isDisputeCreated function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the encodeReceipt function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the getAttestationIndexer function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the getStakeSnapshot function
- In IDisputeManager.sol, the areConflictingAttestations function
- In IEpochManager.sol, the IEpochManager interface
- In IEpochManager.sol, the setEpochLength function
- In IEpochManager.sol, the runEpoch function
- In IEpochManager.sol, the isCurrentEpochRun function
- In IEpochManager.sol, the blockNum function
- In IEpochManager.sol, the blockHash function
- In IEpochManager.sol, the currentEpoch function
- In IEpochManager.sol, the currentEpochBlock function
- In IEpochManager.sol, the currentEpochBlockSinceStart function
- In IEpochManager.sol, the epochsSince function

- In IEpochManager.sol, the epochsSinceUpdate function
- In IGraphCurationToken.sol, the IGraphCurationToken interface
- In IGraphCurationToken.sol, the initialize function
- $\bullet\,$  In <code>IGraphCurationToken.sol</code>, the <code>burnFrom</code> function
- In IGraphCurationToken.sol, the mint function
- In IGraphProxy.sol, the IGraphProxy interface
- In IGraphProxy.sol, the admin function
- In IGraphProxy.sol, the setAdmin function
- In IGraphProxy.sol, the implementation function
- In IGraphProxy.sol, the pendingImplementation function
- In IGraphProxy.sol, the upgradeTo function
- In IGraphProxy.sol, the acceptUpgrade function
- In IGraphProxy.sol, the acceptUpgradeAndCall function
- In IGraphToken.sol, the IGraphToken interface
- In IGraphToken.sol, the burn function
- In IGraphToken.sol, the burnFrom function
- In IGraphToken.sol, the mint function
- In IGraphToken.sol, the addMinter function
- In IGraphToken.sol, the removeMinter function
- In IGraphToken.sol, the renounceMinter function
- In IGraphToken.sol, the isMinter function
- In IGraphToken.sol, the permit function
- In IGraphToken.sol, the increaseAllowance function
- In IGraphToken.sol, the decreaseAllowance function
- In IHorizonStakingExtension.sol, the \_\_DEPRECATED\_getThawingPeriod function
- In IRewardsIssuer.sol, the IRewardsIssuer interface
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the IRewardsManager interface
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the setIssuancePerBlock function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the setMinimumSubgraphSignal function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the setSubgraphService function

- In IRewardsManager.sol, the setSubgraphAvailabilityOracle function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the setDenied function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the isDenied function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the getNewRewardsPerSignal function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the getAccRewardsPerSignal function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the getAccRewardsForSubgraph function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the getAccRewardsPerAllocatedToken function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the getRewards function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the calcRewards function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the updateAccRewardsPerSignal function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the takeRewards function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the onSubgraphSignalUpdate function
- In IRewardsManager.sol, the onSubgraphAllocationUpdate function
- In ITokenGateway.sol, the ITokenGateway interface
- In ITokenGateway.sol, the outboundTransfer function
- In ITokenGateway.sol, the finalizeInboundTransfer function
- In Pausable.sol, the Pausable abstract contract
- In RewardsManager.sol, the setSubgraphService function
- $\bullet \ \, \hbox{In} \quad \hbox{RewardsManagerStorage.sol}, \quad \hbox{the} \quad \hbox{RewardsManagerV1Storage} \\ \quad \hbox{contract} \\$
- In RewardsManagerStorage.sol, the accRewardsPerSignal state variable
- $\bullet \ \ In \ Rewards Manager Storage.sol, the \ accRewards Per Signal Last Block Updated state \ variable \\$
- In RewardsManagerStorage.sol, the subgraphAvailabilityOracle state variable
- In RewardsManagerStorage.sol, the subgraphs state variable
- In RewardsManagerStorage.sol, the denylist state variable
- $\bullet \ \, \hbox{In} \quad \hbox{RewardsManagerStorage.sol}, \quad \hbox{the} \quad \hbox{RewardsManagerV2Storage} \\ \quad \hbox{contract} \\$

- In RewardsManagerStorage.sol, the minimumSubgraphSignal state variable
- $\bullet \ \, \text{In} \quad \text{RewardsManagerStorage.sol}, \quad \text{the} \quad \text{RewardsManagerV3Storage} \\ \quad \text{contract}$
- $\bullet \ \, \hbox{In} \quad \hbox{RewardsManagerStorage.sol}, \quad \hbox{the} \quad \hbox{RewardsManagerV4Storage} \\ \quad \hbox{contract} \\$
- In RewardsManagerStorage.sol, the issuancePerBlock state variable
- In RewardsManagerStorage.sol, the RewardsManagerV5Storage contract
- In RewardsManagerStorage.sol, the subgraphService state variable
- In Staking.sol, the fallback function
- In StakingStorage.sol, the StakingV1Storage contract
- In SubgraphServiceStorage.sol, the SubgraphServiceV1Storage abstract contract

Consider thoroughly documenting all functions (and their parameters) that are part of any contract's public API. Functions implementing sensitive functionality, even if not public, should be clearly documented as well. When writing docstrings, consider following the Ethereum Natural Specification Format (Nat-Spec).

#### Require Statement Does Not Check for Any Conditions

Auditor's comment: This seems like a high risk DOS issue as the function always reverts.

In Solidity, using revert() is recommended when no conditions are being checked.

In the file BancorFormula.sol, the line 495 uses require(False) where revert() would be more appropriate.

• The require(False) in the line 495.

Consider replacing instances of require(False) with revert() for better clarity and maintainability of the codebase.

#### Require Statement With Multiple Conditions

Throughout the codebase, there are require statements that require multiple conditions to be satisfied.

• The require( \_tokensSlash != 0 && \_tokensSlash <= maxTokensSlash, DisputeManagerInvalidTokensSlash(\_tokensSlash, maxTokensSlash) ) in DisputeManager.sol.

- The require(oldPendingGovernor != address(0) && msg.sender == oldPendingGovernor, "Caller must be pending governor") in Governed.sol.
- The require(shares != 0 && shares >= \_minSharesOut, HorizonStakingSlippageProtection(sh \_minSharesOut)) in HorizonStaking.sol.

To simplify the codebase and raise the most helpful error messages for failing require statements, consider having a single require statement per condition.

### Missing Error Message in Revert Statement

Auditor's comment: The finding seems like a false positive. However revert message handling is incorrect. It doesn't account for Panic(uint256) and custom error messages. Especially for custom error messages with length greater than 0x64 it might result in reverts during decoding.

It is recommended to provide informative error messages in **revert** statements. This practice improves code clarity and assists with troubleshooting when a requirement is not satisfied.

Within Multicall.sol, there is a revert statement in line 24 that lacks an error message.

• The revert statement on line 24.

To improve the clarity and maintainability of the code, consider adding informative error messages to all revert statements.

#### Unsafe ABI Encoding

It is not an uncommon practice to use abi.encodeWithSignature or abi.encodeWithSelector to generate calldata for a low-level call. However, the first option is not typo-safe and the second option is not type-safe. The result is that both of these methods are error-prone and should be considered unsafe.

Throughout the codebase, there are multiples uses of unsafe ABI encodings:

- The use of abi.encodeWithSelector within the HorizonStaking.sol
- The use of abi.encodeWithSelector within the Staking.sol

## Use calldata Instead of memory

When dealing with the parameters of external functions, it is more gas-efficient to read their arguments directly from calldata instead of storing them to memory. calldata is a read-only region of memory that contains the arguments of incoming external function calls. This makes using calldata as the data location for such parameters cheaper and more efficient compared to memory.

Thus, using calldata in such situations will generally save gas and improve the performance of a smart contract.

Throughout the codebase, multiple instances where function parameters should use calldata instead of memory were identified:

- In DisputeManager.sol, the receipt parameter
- In DisputeManager.sol, the attestation1 parameter
- In DisputeManager.sol, the attestation2 parameter
- In GraphTallyCollector.sol, the data parameter
- In GraphTallyCollector.sol, the data parameter

Consider using calldata as the data location for the parameters of external functions to optimize gas usage.

#### **Duplicate Imports**

Throughout the codebase, there are duplicate imports.

- Import import "@openzeppelin/contracts/math/SafeMath.sol"; in RewardsManager.sol.
- Import import "./IRewardsManager.sol"; in RewardsManager.sol.
- Import import { IRewardsIssuer } from "./IRewardsIssuer.sol"; imports duplicated alias IRewardsIssuer in RewardsManager.sol.
- Import import "@openzeppelin/contracts/math/SafeMath.sol"; in Stakes.sol.

Consider removing duplicate imports to improve the overall clarity and readability of the codebase.

## File and Contract Names Mismatch

Throughout the codebase, there are multiple file names containing contracts with different names.

The Exponential.sol file name does not match the LibExponential contract name.

To make the codebase easier to understand for developers and reviewers, consider renaming the files to match the contract names.

### Todo Comments in the Code

During development, having well described TODO/Fixme comments will make the process of tracking and solving them easier. Without this information these comments might age and important information for the security of the system might be forgotten by the time it is released to production. These comments should be tracked in the project's issue backlog and resolved before the system is deployed.

Throughout the codebase, multiple instances of TODO/Fixme comments were found.

- The TODO comment in line 59 of GraphDirectory.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 435 of HorizonStaking.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 668 of HorizonStaking.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 723 of HorizonStaking.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 253 of HorizonStakingBase.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 268 of HorizonStakingBase.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 22 of HorizonStakingExtension.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 63 of HorizonStakingExtension.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 77 of HorizonStakingExtension.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 225 of HorizonStakingExtension.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 235 of HorizonStakingExtension.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 246 of HorizonStakingExtension.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 260 of HorizonStakingExtension.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 288 of HorizonStakingExtension.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 316 of HorizonStakingExtension.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 11 of HorizonStakingStorage.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 19 of IHorizonStakingBase.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 5 of IHorizonStakingTypes.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 69 of LegacyAllocation.sol.
- The TODO comment in line 7 of Managed.sol.

Consider removing all instances of TODO/Fixme comments and instead tracking them in the issues backlog. Alternatively, consider linking each inline TODO/Fixme to the corresponding issues backlog entry.

### Inconsistent Use of Named Returns in a Function

To improve the readability of the function, use the same return style.

Throughout the codebase, there are multiple instances where functions have inconsistent usage of named returns.

- In \_deprovision function.
- In \_getThawingPeriodRange function.
- In \_getThawingPeriodRange function.
- In \_getVerifierCutRange function.
- In \_getVerifierCutRange function.
- In \_collectQueryFees function.

Consider being consistent with the use of named returns throughout the functions.

#### Prefix Increment Operator ++i Can Save Gas in Loops

Throughout the codebase, there are multiple opportunities where this optimization could be applied.

- The i++ in Multicall.sol.
- The i++ in RewardsManager.sol.

Consider using the prefix increment operator ++i instead of the post-increment operator i++ in order to save gas. This optimization skips storing the value before the incremental operation, as the return value of the expression is ignored.

### Indecisive Licenses

Throughout the codebase, there are multiple files having indecisive SPDX licenses.

- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in Allocation.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in AllocationManager.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in AllocationManagerStorage.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in Attestation.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in AttestationManager.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in AttestationManagerStorage.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in Authorizable.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in Controller.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in Curation.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in CurationStorage.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in DataService.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in DataServiceFees.sol.

- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in DataServiceFeesStorage.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in DataServicePausable.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in DataServicePausableUpgradeable.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in DataServiceRescuable.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in DataServiceStorage.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in Denominations.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in Directory.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in DisputeManager.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in DisputeManagerStorage.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in Exponential.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in ExponentialRebates.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in Governed.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in GraphDirectory.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in GraphPayments.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in GraphTallyCollector.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in GraphUpgradeable.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in HorizonStaking.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in HorizonStakingBase.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in HorizonStakingExtension.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in HorizonStakingStorage.sol.
- The  $\mathtt{GPL}\text{--}3.0\text{--}\mathtt{or-later}$   $\mathtt{SPDX}$  license in  $\mathtt{IAuthorizable.sol}.$
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IController.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in ICuration.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in IDataService.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in IDataServiceFees.sol.
- $\bullet$  The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in <code>IDataServicePausable.sol</code>.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in IDataServiceRescuable.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IDisputeManager.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IEpochManager.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IGNS.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IGraphCurationToken.sol.

- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in IGraphPayments.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IGraphProxy.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IGraphProxyAdmin.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in IGraphTallyCollector.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IGraphToken.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IHorizonStaking.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IHorizonStakingBase.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IHorizonStakingExtension.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IHorizonStakingMain.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IHorizonStakingTypes.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IL2Curation.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IManaged.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IMulticall.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IPaymentsCollector.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in IPaymentsEscrow.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IRewardsIssuer.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IRewardsManager.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IStaking.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IStakingBase.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IStakingData.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in IStakingExtension.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in ISubgraphService.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in L2Curation.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in LegacyAllocation.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in LinkedList.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in Managed.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in Managed.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in MathUtils.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in MathUtils.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in Multicall.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in PPMMath.sol.

- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in Pausable.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in PaymentsEscrow.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in ProvisionManager.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in ProvisionManagerStorage.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in ProvisionTracker.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in RewardsManager.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in RewardsManagerStorage.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in Stakes.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in Staking.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in StakingExtension.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in StakingStorage.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in SubgraphService.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in SubgraphServiceStorage.sol.
- The GPL-2.0-or-later SPDX license in TokenUtils.sol.
- The GPL-3.0-or-later SPDX license in UintRange.sol.

Consider specifying only one license to prevent possible licensing ambiguity.

## Lack of Indexed Event Parameters

Throughout the codebase, several events do not have indexed parameters:

- The MaxPOIStalenessSet event of AllocationManager.sol.
- The SubgraphServiceDirectoryInitialized event of Directory.sol.
- The DisputePeriodSet event of IDisputeManager.sol.
- The DisputeDepositSet event of IDisputeManager.sol.
- The MaxSlashingCutSet event of IDisputeManager.sol.
- The FishermanRewardCutSet event of IDisputeManager.sol.
- The MaxThawingPeriodSet event of IHorizonStakingMain.sol.
- $\bullet$  The StakeToFeesRatioSet event of ISubgraphService.sol.
- The CurationCutSet event of ISubgraphService.sol.
- The ParameterUpdated event of Managed.sol.
- The SetController event of Managed.sol.
- The PartialPauseChanged event of Pausable.sol.

- The PauseChanged event of Pausable.sol.
- The ProvisionTokensRangeSet event of ProvisionManager.sol.
- The DelegationRatioSet event of ProvisionManager.sol.
- The VerifierCutRangeSet event of ProvisionManager.sol.
- The ThawingPeriodRangeSet event of ProvisionManager.sol.

To improve the ability of off-chain services to search and filter for specific events, consider indexing event parameters.

## Lack of Security Contact

Providing a specific security contact (such as an email or ENS name) within a smart contract significantly simplifies the process for individuals to communicate if they identify a vulnerability in the code. This practice is quite beneficial as it permits the code owners to dictate the communication channel for vulnerability disclosure, eliminating the risk of miscommunication or failure to report due to a lack of knowledge on how to do so. In addition, if the contract incorporates third-party libraries and a bug surfaces in those, it becomes easier for their maintainers to contact the appropriate person about the problem and provide mitigation instructions.

Throughout the codebase, there are contracts that do not have a security contact:

- The Allocation library.
- The AllocationManager abstract contract.
- ullet The AllocationManagerV1Storage abstract contract.
- The Attestation library.
- The AttestationManager abstract contract.
- The AttestationManagerV1Storage abstract contract.
- The Controller contract.
- The Curation contract.
- The CurationV1Storage abstract contract.
- The CurationV2Storage abstract contract.
- The CurationV3Storage abstract contract.
- The DataService abstract contract.
- The DataServiceFees abstract contract.
- $\bullet~$  The <code>DataServiceFeesV1Storage</code> abstract contract.

- The DataServicePausable abstract contract.
- The DataServicePausableUpgradeable abstract contract.
- The DataServiceRescuable abstract contract.
- The DataServiceV1Storage abstract contract.
- The Denominations library.
- The Directory abstract contract.
- The DisputeManagerV1Storage abstract contract.
- The LibExponential library.
- The ExponentialRebates library.
- The Governed abstract contract.
- The GraphDirectory abstract contract.
- The GraphUpgradeable abstract contract.
- The HorizonStakingBase abstract contract.
- The HorizonStakingV1Storage abstract contract.
- The IAuthorizable interface.
- The IController interface.
- The ICuration interface.
- The IDataService interface.
- The IDataServiceFees interface.
- The IDataServicePausable interface.
- $\bullet$  The <code>IDataServiceRescuable</code> interface.
- $\bullet$  The  ${\tt IDisputeManager}$  interface.
- The IEpochManager interface.
- The IGNS interface.
- The IGraphCurationToken interface.
- $\bullet$  The <code>IGraphPayments</code> interface.
- The IGraphProxy interface.
- The IGraphProxyAdmin interface.
- The IGraphTallyCollector interface.
- The IGraphToken interface.
- $\bullet$  The <code>IHorizonStaking</code> interface.

- The IHorizonStakingBase interface.
- The IHorizonStakingExtension interface.
- The IHorizonStakingMain interface.
- The IHorizonStakingTypes interface.
- The IL2Curation interface.
- The IManaged interface.
- The IMulticall interface.
- $\bullet$  The <code>IPaymentsCollector</code> interface.
- The IPaymentsEscrow interface.
- The IRewardsIssuer interface.
- The IRewardsManager interface.
- The IStaking interface.
- The IStakingBase interface.
- The IStakingData interface.
- The IStakingExtension interface.
- The ISubgraphService interface.
- The ITokenGateway interface.
- The L2Curation contract.
- The LegacyAllocation library.
- The LibFixedMath library.
- $\bullet$  The LibFixedMath library.
- The LinkedList library.
- The Managed abstract contract.
- The Managed abstract contract.
- The MathUtils library.
- The MathUtils library.
- The Multicall abstract contract.
- The PPMMath library.
- The Pausable abstract contract.
- The ProvisionManager abstract contract.
- The ProvisionManagerV1Storage abstract contract.

- The ProvisionTracker library.
- The RewardsManager contract.
- The RewardsManagerV1Storage contract.
- $\bullet \ \ {\rm The} \ {\tt RewardsManagerV2Storage} \ {\rm contract}.$
- The RewardsManagerV3Storage contract.
- The RewardsManagerV4Storage contract.
- The RewardsManagerV5Storage contract.
- The Stakes library.
- The Staking abstract contract.
- The StakingExtension contract.
- The StakingV1Storage contract.
- The StakingV2Storage contract.
- The StakingV3Storage contract.
- The StakingV4Storage contract.
- The SubgraphServiceV1Storage abstract contract.
- The TokenUtils library.
- The UintRange library.

Consider adding a NatSpec comment containing a security contact above each contract definition. Using the @custom:security-contact convention is recommended as it has been adopted by the OpenZeppelin Wizard and the ethereum-lists.

### Modifiers Could Be Used

Throughout the codebase, there are modifiers that could be used:

• The register function could use the onlyRegisteredIndexer modifier in SubgraphService.sol.

Consider using any modifier that could be used, to avoid code duplication.

## Non-explicit Imports Are Used

The use of non-explicit imports in the codebase can decrease code clarity and may create naming conflicts between locally-defined and imported variables. This is particularly relevant when multiple contracts exist within the same Solidity file or when inheritance chains are long.

Throughout the codebase, global imports are being used:

- The import "@openzeppelin/contracts-upgradeable/token/ERC20/IERC20Upgradeable.sol"; import in IGraphCurationToken.sol.
- The import "@openzeppelin/contracts/token/ERC20/IERC20.sol"; import in IGraphToken.sol.
- The import "@openzeppelin/contracts/math/SafeMath.sol"; import in MathUtils.sol.
- The import "./IMulticall.sol"; import in Multicall.sol.
- The import "@openzeppelin/contracts/math/SafeMath.sol"; import in RewardsManager.sol.
- The import "../upgrades/GraphUpgradeable.sol"; import in RewardsManager.sol.
- The import "../staking/libs/MathUtils.sol"; import in RewardsManager.sol.
- The import "./RewardsManagerStorage.sol"; import in RewardsManager.sol.
- The import "./IRewardsManager.sol"; import in RewardsManager.sol.
- The import "./IRewardsManager.sol"; import in RewardsManagerStorage.sol.
- The import "../governance/Managed.sol"; import in RewardsManagerStorage.sol.
- The import "@openzeppelin/contracts/math/SafeMath.sol"; import in Stakes.sol.
- The import "./MathUtils.sol"; import in Stakes.sol.
- The import "../token/IGraphToken.sol"; import in TokenUtils.sol.

Following the principle that clearer code is better code, consider using the named import syntax (import {A, B, C} from "X") to explicitly declare which contracts are being imported.

### **Redundant Getter Functions**

When state variables use public visibility in a contract, a getter method for the variable is automatically included.

Throughout the codebase, there are various redundant getter functions.

- Within the Controller contract in Controller.sol, the getGovernor function is redundant because the governor state variable already has a getter.
- Within the DisputeManager contract in DisputeManager.sol, the getVerifierCut function is redundant because the fishermanRewardCut state variable already has a getter.
- Within the DisputeManager contract in DisputeManager.sol, the getDisputePeriod function is redundant because the disputePeriod state variable already has a getter.

To improve the overall clarity, intent, and readability of the codebase, consider removing the redundant getter functions.

#### Redundant Return Statement

To improve the readability of the contract, it is recommended to remove redundant return statements from functions that have named returns.

Throughout the codebase, there are multiple instances of redundant return statements:

- The return tokensThawed\_; statement in HorizonStaking.sol.
- The return \_getIdleStake(serviceProvider); statement in HorizonStakingBase.sol.
- The return f / FIXED\_1; statement in LibFixedMath.sol.
- The return f / FIXED\_1; statement in LibFixedMath.sol.
- The return (minimumProvisionTokens, maximumProvisionTokens); statement in ProvisionManager.sol.
- The return (minimumThawingPeriod, maximumThawingPeriod); statement in ProvisionManager.sol.
- The return (minimumVerifierCut, maximumVerifierCut); statement in ProvisionManager.sol.
- The return (\_disputeManager().getDisputePeriod(), DEFAULT\_MAX\_THAWING\_PERIOD); statement in SubgraphService.sol.
- The return (\_disputeManager().getVerifierCut(), DEFAULT\_MAX\_VERIFIER\_CUT); statement in SubgraphService.sol.
- The return tokensCollected; statement in SubgraphService.sol.

Consider removing the redundant return statement in functions with named returns to improve the readability of the contract.

### Use Custom Errors

Auditor's comment: Multicall contract expects Error(string) revert messages, so using custom errors might cause an issue there.

Since Solidity version 0.8.4, custom errors provide a cleaner and more cost-efficient way to explain to users why an operation failed.

Throughout the codebase, instances of revert and/or require messages were found:

• In the Controller.sol file, the require(msg.sender == governor || msg.sender == pauseGuardian, "Only Governor or Guardian can call") statement.

- In the Controller.sol file, the require(\_contractAddress != address(0), "Contract address must be set") statement.
- In the Controller.sol file, the require(\_controller != address(0), "Controller must be set") statement.
- In the Controller.sol file, the require(\_newPauseGuardian != address(0), "PauseGuardian must be set") statement.
- In the Governed.sol file, the require(msg.sender == governor, "Only Governor can call") statement.
- In the Governed.sol file, the require(\_newGovernor != address(0), "Governor must be set") statement.
- In the Governed.sol file, the require(oldPendingGovernor!= address(0) && msg.sender == oldPendingGovernor, "Caller must be pending governor") statement.
- In the GraphUpgradeable.sol file, the require(msg.sender == \_proxy.admin(), "Caller must be the proxy admin") statement.
- In the GraphUpgradeable.sol file, the require(msg.sender == \_implementation(), "Only implementation") statement.
- In the HorizonStaking.sol file, the require(tokensToWithdraw > 0, "!tokens") statement.
- In the HorizonStaking.sol file, the require(success, "Delegatecall: legacySlash failed") statement.
- In the HorizonStakingBase.sol file, the revert("RECEIVE\_ETH\_NOT\_ALLOWED") statement.
- In the HorizonStakingExtension.sol file, the require(msg.sender == address(\_graphTokenGateway()), "ONLY\_GATEWAY") statement.
- In the HorizonStakingExtension.sol file, the require(\_\_DEPRECATED\_slashers[msg.sender] == true, "!slasher") statement.
- In the HorizonStakingExtension.sol file, the require(allocationID != address(0), "!alloc") statement.
- In the HorizonStakingExtension.sol file, the require(allocState != AllocationState.Null, "!collect") statement.
- In the HorizonStakingExtension.sol file, the require(tokens > 0, "!tokens") statement.
- In the HorizonStakingExtension.sol file, the require(tokens >= reward, "rewards>slash") statement.
- In the HorizonStakingExtension.sol file, the require(indexerStake.tokensStaked > 0, "!stake") statement.

- In the HorizonStakingExtension.sol file, the require(tokens <= indexerStake.tokensStaked, "slash>stake") statement.
- In the HorizonStakingExtension.sol file, the require(beneficiary != address(0), "!beneficiary") statement.
- In the HorizonStakingExtension.sol file, the require(allocState == AllocationState.Active, "!active") statement.
- In the HorizonStakingExtension.sol file, the require(isIndexerOrOperator, "!auth") statement.
- In the LibFixedMath.sol file, the revert("out-of-bounds") statement.
- In the LibFixedMath.sol file, the revert("out-of-bounds") statement.
- In the LibFixedMath.sol file, the revert("out-of-bounds") statement.
- In the LibFixedMath.sol file, the revert("overflow") statement.
- In the TokenUtils.sol file, the require(\_graphToken.transferFrom(\_from, address(this), \_amount), "!transfer") statement.
- In the TokenUtils.sol file, the require(\_graphToken.transfer(\_to, \_amount), "!transfer") statement.

For conciseness and gas savings, consider replacing require and revert messages with custom errors.

#### **Unnecessary Casts**

Throughout the codebase, multiple instances of unnecessary casts were identified:

- The address(subgraphAvailabilityOracle) cast in the RewardsManager contract
- The address(subgraphAvailabilityOracle) cast in the RewardsManager contract
- The uint256(\_percentage) cast in the StakingExtension contract

To improve the overall clarity and intent of the codebase, consider removing any unnecessary casts.

## **Unsafe Casts**

Throughout the codebase, there are unsafe casts.

- The int32 cast in the LibExponential contract.
- The int256 cast in the LibExponential contract.
- The int256 cast in the LibExponential contract.
- The int32 cast in the ExponentialRebates contract.
- $\bullet$  The int32 cast in the ExponentialRebates contract.
- $\bullet\,$  The int32 cast in the ExponentialRebates contract.
- The int32 cast in the ExponentialRebates contract.
- $\bullet$  The int256 cast in the ExponentialRebates contract.
- The int256 cast in the ExponentialRebates contract.
- The int256 cast in the ExponentialRebates contract.
- The uint160 cast in the SubgraphService contract.

To avoid unexpected behavior of the codebase, ensure that the casts are used well.

## Unused Functions With Internal or Private Visibility

Throughout the codebase, there are unused functions.

• The \_getVerifierCutRange function in SubgraphService.sol.

To improve the overall clarity, intentionality, and readability of the codebase, consider using or removing any currently unused functions.

# **Unused Imports**

Throughout the codebase, there are imports that are unused and could be removed.

- The import import { ICuration } from "./ICuration.sol"; imports unused alias ICuration in Curation.sol.
- The import import { IStakingBase } from "../staking/IStakingBase.sol"; imports unused alias IStakingBase in Managed.sol.

Consider removing unused imports to improve the overall clarity and readability of the codebase.

## **Unused Modifiers**

Throughout the codebase, there are unused modifiers:

• The onlyL2Gateway modifier in HorizonStakingExtension.sol.

To improve the overall clarity, intentionality, and readability of the codebase, consider either using or removing any unused modifier.

#### **Unused Named Return Variables**

Named return variables are a way to declare variables that are meant to be used within a function's body for the purpose of being returned as that function's output. They are an alternative to explicit in-line return statements.

Throughout the codebase, multiple instances of unused named return variables were identified:

- In HorizonStaking.sol, the tokensThawed return variable of the \_deprovision function
- In HorizonStakingBase.sol, the tokens return variable of the getIdleStake function
- In LibFixedMath.sol, the n return variable of the toInteger function
- In LibFixedMath.sol, the r return variable of the exp function
- In LibFixedMath.sol, the n return variable of the toInteger function
- In LibFixedMath.sol, the r return variable of the ln function
- In LibFixedMath.sol, the c return variable of the \_mul function
- In LibFixedMath.sol, the r return variable of the exp function
- In LibFixedMath.sol, the c return variable of the \_mul function
- In ProvisionManager.sol, the min return variable of the \_getProvisionTokensRange function
- In ProvisionManager.sol, the max return variable of the \_getProvisionTokensRange function
- In ProvisionManager.sol, the  $\min$  return variable of the  $\_getThawingPeriodRange$  function
- In ProvisionManager.sol, the max return variable of the \_getThawingPeriodRange function
- In ProvisionManager.sol, the min return variable of the \_getVerifierCutRange function
- In ProvisionManager.sol, the max return variable of the \_getVerifierCutRange function

- $\bullet$  In SubgraphService.sol, the min return variable of the <code>\_getThawingPeriodRange</code> function
- $\bullet$  In SubgraphService.sol, the max return variable of the <code>\_getThawingPeriodRange</code> function
- In SubgraphService.sol, the  $\min$  return variable of the  $\_getVerifierCutRange$  function
- In SubgraphService.sol, the max return variable of the \_getVerifierCutRange function
- In SubgraphService.sol, the feesCollected return variable of the \_collectQueryFees function

Consider either using or removing any unused named return variables.

### Variables Could Be constant

If a variable is only ever assigned a value when it is declared, then it could be declared as constant.

Throughout the codebase, there are variables that could be constant.

- The fixedReserveRatio state variable variable in L2Curation.sol.
- The CURATION state variable variable in Managed.sol.
- The EPOCH\_MANAGER state variable variable in Managed.sol.
- The REWARDS\_MANAGER state variable variable in Managed.sol.
- The STAKING state variable variable in Managed.sol.
- The GRAPH\_TOKEN state variable variable in Managed.sol.
- The GRAPH\_TOKEN\_GATEWAY state variable variable in Managed.sol.
- The GNS state variable variable in Managed.sol.

To better convey the intended use of variables and to potentially save gas, consider adding the **constant** keyword to variables that are only set when they are declared.