

MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING
TUESDAY- -APRIL 5, 2022- -5:00 P.M.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft convened the meeting at 5:04 p.m.

Roll Call – Present: Councilmembers Daysog, Herrera Spencer, Knox White, Vella and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft – 5. [Note: Vice Mayor Vella arrived at 5:21 p.m. The meeting was held via Zoom.]

Absent: None.

The meeting was adjourned to Closed Session to consider:

(22-200) Public Employee Appointment/Hiring (Pursuant to Government Code Section 54957); Title/Description of Positions to be Filled: City Manager.

(22-201) Conference With Labor Negotiators (Government Code Section 54957.6); City Negotiators: Gerry Beaudin, Assistant City Manager, Nancy Bronstein, Human Resources Director, Jessica Romeo, Human Resources Manager, and Steve Woo, Human Resources Analyst; Employee Organizations: Alameda City Employees Association (ACEA), Management and Confidential Employees Association (MCEA), Electric Utility Professionals Association (EUPA), International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers (IBEW), Alameda Police Officers Non-Sworn (PANS), Alameda Municipal Power Unrepresented Employees (AMPU), and Alameda Police Management Association (APMA); Under Negotiation: Salaries, Employee Benefits and Terms of Employment.

Following the Closed Session, the meeting was reconvened and the City Clerk announced that regarding the Public Employee Appointment, 1) Council gave direction to have the Human Resources Department conduct the search for the permanent City Manager position, instead of an outside search firm, 2) Council gave direction to the City Attorney to return with an Interim City Manager agreement at the next regular City Council meeting on April 19, 2022, and 3) Council gave direction to have the Human Resources Director begin the search for a long-term City Manager and return at the next closed session in two weeks with the process for hiring a permanent City Manager by the following three roll call votes: Vote 1: Councilmembers Daysog: No; Herrera Spencer: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye; Ayes: 4. Noes: 1, Vote 2: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye; Ayes: 5, and Vote 3: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye; Ayes: 5; regarding Labor, staff provided information and Council provided direction, by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Abstain; Herrera Spencer: No; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye; Ayes: 4. Abstain: 1.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft adjourned the meeting at 7:13 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lara Weisiger
City Clerk

The agenda for this meeting was posted in accordance with the Sunshine Ordinance.

Special Meeting
Alameda City Council
April 5, 2022

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING
TUESDAY- -APRIL 5, 2022- -7:00 P.M.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft convened the meeting at 7:37 p.m. Councilmember Daysog led the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL - Present: Councilmembers Daysog, Herrera Spencer, Knox White, Vella, and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft – 5. [Note: The meeting was conducted via Zoom.]

Absent: None.

AGENDA CHANGES

(22-202) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the Five Keys agreement [paragraph no. 22-225] is time sensitive and would be addressed after the State of the City [paragraph no. 22-226].

In response to Councilmember Herrera Spencer's inquiry, the City Clerk stated the Mayor can revise the order of agenda items and Councilmembers can also propose motions to change the order.

Councilmember Knox White suggested the Five Keys agreement be heard after the Continued Items.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft agreed.

PROCLAMATIONS, SPECIAL ORDERS OF THE DAY AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

(22-203) Proclamation Declaring April 2022 as National Arab American Heritage Month.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft read the proclamation.

(22-204) Proclamation Declaring April 2022 as Parkinson's Awareness Month.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA

(22-205) Denyse Trepanier, Bike Walk Alameda, announced a Waterfront Park launch event on Saturday; urged attendees to join Bike Walk Alameda on a ride to the park; noted the ride will be slow-paced and family friendly.

(22-206) Anna Rossi, Shelter in Peace, expressed appreciation for the City leasing a house to Shelter in Peace for refugees and immigrants and for working with Shelter in Peace.

(22-207) Stephen Van Lare, Shelter in Peace, stated that he wants to thank the City for the cooperation in making the house available; discussed his work with Shelter in Peace and housing 31 individuals.

(22-208) Brian Kennedy, Alameda, discussed Sanctuary City provisions; read a list of child victims' names; urged the City remove the Sanctuary City designation.

(22-209) Jenice Anderson, Alameda, discussed not feeling safe in Alameda due to people in her neighborhood.

CONSENT CALENDAR

Councilmember Herrera Spencer recorded a no vote on the teleconference findings [paragraph no. 22-214] and the emergency declaration [paragraph no. 22-217]; and requested the SCI Consulting Group agreement [paragraph no. 22-215] and the power purchase agreement [paragraph no. 22-216] be removed from the Consent Calendar for discussion.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer moved approval of the remainder of the Consent Calendar.

Councilmember Knox White seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: Ayes; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5. [Items so enacted or adopted are indicated by an asterisk preceding the paragraph number.]

(*22-210) Minutes of the Special City Council Meeting, the Special Joint City Council and Successor Agency to the Community Improvement Commission Meeting and the Regular City Council Meeting Held on March 1, 2022. Approved.

(*22-211) Ratified bills in the amount of \$4,918,697.98.

(*22-212) Recommendation to Accept the Quarterly Sales Tax Report for the Reporting Period Ending September 30, 2021 (Funds Collected During the Period April 1, 2021 to June 30, 2021). Accepted.

(*22-213) Recommendation to Accept the Quarterly Sales Tax Report for the Reporting Period Ending December 31, 2021 (Funds Collected During the Period July 1, 2021 to September 30, 2021). Accepted.

(*22-214) Recommendation to Approve Findings to Allow City Meetings to be Conducted via Teleconference.

Since Councilmember Herrera Spencer recorded a no vote, the item carried by the following vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: No; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4. Noes: 1.

(22-215) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager to Execute a Second Amendment to the Agreement with SCI Consulting Group for Fee Levy Administrative Services for the 1992 Urban Runoff Fee and the 2019 Water Quality and Flood Protection Fee in an Amount Not to Exceed \$86,479 for an Aggregate Amount Not to Exceed \$157,849.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired the total amount the City receives from the two types of taxes that the services agreement will continue to monitor.

The Assistant City Manager responded the 1992 fee brings in about \$2.4 million per year and the 2019 Water Quality fee brings in about \$2.8 million per year.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer expressed appreciation for the information being provided and support for the agreement.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer moved approval of the staff recommendation.

Vice Mayor Vella seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: Ayes; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

(22-216) Resolution No. 15879, "Approving a Second Amendment to the Power Purchase Agreement between Ameresco Keller Canyon, LLC ("Ameresco") and Alameda Municipal Power ("AMP") Decreasing Ameresco's Power Output Obligations in Exchange for Compensation to AMP for its Administrative Costs in an Amount Not to Exceed \$250,000 per Year, a Payment to AMP Not to Exceed \$135,000 per Year to Compensate AMP for its Loss of Resource Adequacy Capacity, and Compensation to AMP for California Independent System Operator (CAISO) Charges in an Amount Not to Exceed a Total of \$50,000." Adopted.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired what the matter will look like for the City and whether the matter will not contribute to any additional rolling blackouts.

The City Manager responded the amendment will reduce AMP's share of the output facility and provides cost-savings for AMP customers; stated the resource is not necessary to address rolling blackouts; AMP has access to other resources.

The AMP Energy Resources Supervisor stated AMP is fully resourced; rotating outages are driven at the Statewide level based on shortages; the agreement will have no impact on rotating outages.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer moved adoption of the resolution.

Councilmember Knox White seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: Ayes; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

(22-217) Resolution No. 15880, "Continuing the Declaration of the Existence of a Local Emergency in Response to the COVID-19 Pandemic, Consistent with Government Code Section 8630(c)." Adopted.

Since Councilmember Herrera Spencer recorded a no vote, the item carried by the following vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: No; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4. Noes: 1.

(*22-218) Ordinance No. 3316, "Authorizing the City Manager or Designee to Execute a First Amendment to the Lease with Park Street Wine Cellars, Inc., a California Corporation, for Approximately 700 Square Feet of Retail Space in the Historic Alameda Theatre Located at 2315 Central Avenue, Suite 122, to Provide Six Months of Rent Deferral with a Three Year Repayment Period." Finally passed.

CONTINUED AGENDA ITEMS

(22-219) Recommendation to Provide Direction to Staff Regarding the Draft Alameda Police Department Policy for Fixed Automatic License Plate Technology.

The Police Chief gave a Power Point presentation.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the draft policy stating: “once an alert is received, the operator should confirm that the observed license plate from the system matches the license plate...” can be revised to: “must” or “shall.”

The Police Chief responded that he has no problem with replacing the word “should” with “must;” stated “must” captures the intent of the policy.

Commended the Police Chief for adding another safety tool; stated the policy is similar to DNA requirements; expressed support for the tool being implemented: Rockne Harmon, Alameda.

Stated that she is disappointed the Council decided to go forward with the license plate camera plan; studies have shown the readers do not decrease crime; expressed support for the time and care taken with the proposed policy; discussed shorter retention: Rebecca Jeschke, Alameda.

Urged the retention timeline be greatly reduced and auditing be done every 30 days with oversight: Marilyn Rothman, Alameda.

Expressed support for retaining data for 30 days or less; expressed concern that a yearly audit is not often enough and over who owns the data: Jenice Anderson, Alameda.

Stated the retention policy is too long; San Leandro adopted a 15-day policy; there is no reason Alameda needs to retain data longer; discussed data: Mike Katz-Lacabe, Oakland Privacy.

Encouraged looking at the matter from an equity lens; urged the policy address dragnet issues, such as parking tickets and expired tags: Jennifer Rakowski, Alameda.

Expressed appreciation for the Police Chief adding guard rails; discussed data not showing Automatic License Plate Readers (ALPRs) are effective; suggested the data retention be based on actual use: Brian Hofer, Alameda.

Councilmember Knox White moved approval of the revised policy with changing “should” to “must” in Section C on page 3.

Councilmember Daysog seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Daysog expressed support for staff being responsive to questions and concerns raised; stated Alameda needs a tool like ALPRs in order to prevent crimes.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that she would like reassurance there will be enough staff to preserve the data needed if retention is reduced.

The Police Chief stated staff will assess the process; he feels comfortable with the 60 day retention period.

Vice Mayor Vella stated that she appreciates staff's willingness to work through the questions raised around data retention and privacy; she will be supporting the matter; however, she would like the City to think about the duration of the data retention; the retention time could be reduced; she intends to continue to watch and monitor the use of ALPRs to ensure compliance.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft requested clarification of concerns raised about low-income individuals being stopped for unpaid parking tickets and other minor violations via ALPRs.

The Police Chief stated the system would not be used to address parking tickets or low level offenses; ALPRs are used after crimes have occurred; staff would use the tool for serious crimes, such as a felony want audit; the technology will not be used to identify parking tickets or low level offenses.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she is impressed with the work done; expressed support for the work done with Secure Justice; stated staff has put together an excellent policy; she is ready to support the matter.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer requested clarification about the possibility of editing footage.

The Police Chief stated the technology only takes photographs of license plates; the images cannot be edited; the system is designed to prevent edits.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired what happens when a vehicle does not have a license plate.

The Police Chief responded staff can do other things if a crime is committed using a vehicle without a license plate; stated the technology has utility for vehicles without license plates; staff can look for the specific vehicle that matches the description and examine the vehicle features.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

Councilmember Knox White stated increasing and changing technology brings a host of ethical issues which are just starting to be studied and discovered; expressed support for staff returning in June with a work program to ensure the City has a staff member that will stay on top of technology ethics to provide input and guidance; stated technology is not a Police Department specific issue and is used throughout the City; he would like staff to come back with a proposal for Council consideration.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the topic could be discussed during the upcoming Council priorities work session; inquired whether Councilmember Knox White's proposal is specific to the Police Department or Citywide.

Councilmember Knox White responded Citywide; stated the comment is not only related to Police.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the proposal discussion is able to be added to the current agenda item.

The City Attorney responded Council has discretion to discuss the matter; stated Council could provide brief direction to staff without substantial discussion.

Councilmember Knox White stated that he is proposing brief Council direction to have staff return in June with a more robust discussion around moving forward with privacy and surveillance.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft expressed support for also discussing the matter at the priority setting workshop.

Councilmember Daysog stated that he believes the proposed matter should be brought forward as a Council Referral; the matter is separate from the agenda item.

Vice Mayor Vella stated the City has Council direction on overall privacy policies that have been pending for years; it is not necessary for the proposed matter to go through the Council Referral process; expressed support for a report back from staff of the status of the Citywide privacy policy.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer concurred with Councilmember Daysog; stated the proposed matter would be more appropriate as a Council Referral; expressed support for staff bringing back information on mobile APLRs; stated that she understands mobile APLRs will be coming back to Council.

The Police Chief stated the Police Department has a mobile ALPR system; he would like to expand the program and will work with the City Manager.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated the current mobile cameras are not functional.

In response to Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft's inquiry, the City Attorney stated the commitment from the Police Chief is all which can be discussed at the time, given the agenda title.

Vice Mayor Vella stated that she would like to know when the privacy policy will return; the topic is related to the policy at-hand; the privacy policy is over-arching.

The Police Chief stated that he will prioritize the matter; he would like to discuss timing with the City Manager.

Vice Mayor Vella stated the Police Chief would not be heading the Citywide privacy policy which will interact with other Departments.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft noted the policy update will be provided by the City Manager.

The City Manager stated staff has discussed bringing the policy discussion back in June.

Councilmember Knox White stated the last time Council voted on ALPRs specifically, the mobile ALPR expansion program was not included; the motion only addressed fixed ALPRs; said direction is inconsistent with Council vote.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she supported bifurcating the two matters to help establish the policy on fixed ALPRs and then move on to mobile ALPRs; she understands mobile ALPRs are a tool the department uses; the mobile ALPR matter can return once the policy is established; much of the fixed ALPR policy should apply to the mobile ALPRs as well.

Councilmember Knox White stated that he possibly misheard a Councilmember directing staff to return with an extended camera program and the purchase of new mobile ALPR cameras, not a policy.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the Police Chief will confer with the City Manager regarding timing.

(22-220) Recommendation to Provide Direction to Staff Regarding Crime Prevention Programs to Deter and Reduce Catalytic Converter Thefts.

The Police Captain gave a Power Point presentation.

In response to Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft's inquiry regarding the last slide presented, the Police Captain responded the slide is a mock up if Council approves the event.

In response to Councilmember Herrera Spencer's inquiry regarding alternatives, the Police Captain stated that he searched for peer review articles on efficacy of theft prevention with little results; expressed support for even a minor amount of prevention.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired the cost for etching and how many units can be etched per day.

The Police Captain responded that he has seen the process completed in a couple of different ways; stated one option includes heat resistant paint or fluorescent badges; expressed concern about potentially overwhelming auto-repair shops.

Councilmember Knox White expressed concern about the proposed etching not having an impact across the City; stated that he has championed catalytic converter cages for some time; he does not think staff needs to ask for permission to host an event and etch 100 units; he would like the budget discussion to include a request to provide a substantial number of cages; expressed support for the City helping to prevent the thefts from occurring; stated the City can provide services for 1,000 cars to have cages installed; Council needs to help people install cages on catalytic converters to prevent thefts; encouraged people to park off-street when possible.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she is in favor of ramping up as the program goes along; the public education campaign is a must; expressed support for etching units; discussed an event sponsored by the League of California Cities regarding catalytic converter thefts; stated the City is supporting legislation that imposes liability on catalytic converter buyers; starting with etching units makes sense; the City can gauge community interest; she is not opposed to the idea of the City subsidizing cages; however, there is no evidence of efficacy; she would prefer to start with etching and public education first then revisit the matter later in the year.

Vice Mayor Vella stated that she supports subsidizing cages; cages have been effective in other instances and are recommended; cages add a level of deterrence; etching is helpful; however, a lot needs to be done on the recycling side; the State will be monitoring the situation; the public

education and awareness campaign is important; many units are being stolen in front of homes and everyone does not have access to a locked garage to park their vehicle.

Councilmember Daysog discussed a catalytic converter theft; stated that he understands the importance of the matter; he does not think City Hall should be subsidizing cage installations; the City has a role to play in educating residents; expressed support for cracking down on those trying to sell catalytic converters and an emphasis on enforcement and education; stated that he is aware of the catalytic converter theft crisis.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated most cars that have catalytic converter stolen are totaled and the price is too high to pay for most people; catalytic converters are difficult to come by and can be costly, which affects working class community members; she supports coming up with a subsidy for theft prevention; expressed support for finding out the cost for an etching program and cages; stated Alameda can send a clear message to people trying to steal catalytic converters; discussed correspondence related to legislation; stated that she would like the City to support legislation that criminally punishes theft offenders; having a catalytic converter stolen is a large price to pay.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer moved approval of having staff return with a proposal for an etching program and subsidizing cages, along with support of additional legislation if further direction is needed.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft requested clarification that the motion is to direct staff to come back with a proposal for subsidizing the purchase of cages.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated the direction is for staff to return; expressed support for an etching event; stated that she would like staff to continue the etching proposal; she supports doing everything in the hopes of sending a clear message.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether public education is included in the motion.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer responded in the negative; stated the motion includes supporting legislation as represented in the correspondence; she would like an update on whether the City will take a position; staff can return to Council if further direction is needed.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that the City might not be ready to take a position; inquired the reasoning.

Vice Mayor Vella stated the matter of legislation is not agendaized; Council can provide direction; however, the discussion is getting outside the bounds of the agenda.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she is interpreting it as an inquiry of the staff report; the correspondence is part of the staff report.

The City Manager stated staff has had a chance to talk about legislation; there are some questions about whether or not the City can support certain legislation; staff can bring the matter back for Council consideration.

The Communications and Legislative Affairs Officer stated the legislative agenda item related to catalytic converters is specific to restricting the sales of catalytic converters; staff was able to

identify several bills which would restrict the sales of catalytic converters; staff has put support positions in for the related pieces of legislation; other bills dealing with catalytic converters increase the penalties for theft up to a felony, rather than addressing sale, which goes against some of the Police reform recommendations supported by Council.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer amended the motion to add direction to staff to bring the legislative matter back to Council for consideration.

The City Attorney expressed support for staff bringing the information back for future Council discussion.

Councilmember Daysog requested a friendly amendment to bifurcate the vote on the subsidy matter.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer moved approval of staff bringing back the three legislative bills mentioned in the correspondence attached to the report with more information and Council consideration and the etching program as proposed by staff.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the motion should include an etching event or an etching program.

The Police Captain responded that his goal is to go beyond a one day event if people use the program; the etching program is not meant to be limited to one day; staff wants to see how many people show interest before a program is developed.

Councilmember Daysog seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Knox White stated that he would like to understand the etching program if Council is approving a program; the proposal is not what Council is being asked to approve; he would like to know the cost and time involved.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the motion is directing staff to return with information about the etching program.

The Police Captain stated that he has looked at other programs and sometimes there is no cost when collaborating with local businesses; many businesses provide the service for free; his proposal is to find a local business that will partner with the City.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer expressed support for the program.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated many local body shops tend to provide etching for free as a service to customers and the process is not long or difficult.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated staff does not need to return if the program is free of cost; staff can proceed with the program; if a monetary cost is eventually reached, staff can return to Council.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she does not want to assume the local shops will provide the service for free; staff can look into the possibility.

Councilmember Knox White stated that he is still confused and will not be supporting the motion.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: Aye; Knox White: No; Vella: No; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 3. Noes: 2.

Councilmember Knox White stated bringing back the legislation for discussion is of no interest to him; expressed support for the etching program; stated the program does not need Council approval.

Councilmember Knox White moved approval of Council directing staff to develop a program and return with a budget request as part of the mid-cycle budget process to provide support and substantially ensure that people in Alameda have access to cages.

Councilmember Knox White stated that there are a multitude of ways for this to be accomplished; he would like to see a substantial budget request for the City to provide cages to enough people to ensure there is an impact.

Vice Mayor Vella seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Daysog stated residents are asking Council to enforce laws and crack down on those that are stealing catalytic converters as well as those that are buying and selling stolen units; he does not believe residents are asking Council for a handout to cover the costs of stolen units; stolen units are not the responsibility of City Hall; the City cannot cover the cost of all stolen catalytic converters; covering the cost for a few people does not seem fair; covering the cost does not seem like a good use of City funds.

Vice Mayor Vella stated that she views the matter as subsidizing a crime prevention measure similar to ALPRs; the cages are a preventative tool; discretion is being given to allow Police Department staff to look into different possibilities; she did not support the previous motion based on her position relative to legislation about being tough on crime; expressed support for the etching program proposal.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft expressed concern about the proposed subsidy; questioned whether the subsidy will be an administrative nightmare; inquired who will administer the program and who would be eligible for the cages; stated there is a lot to be done with City funding; inquired whether the motion includes direction for the program or whether staff will return with information.

Councilmember Knox White responded Council is directing staff to provide and fund a program; staff is capable of figuring out how to implement the program and return to Council with costs and considerations; some residents feel strongly about locking up offenders; however, most residents want crime to stop and catalytic converters to stop being stolen; Council can spend money after the crime or can spend money ahead of time in a preventative manner with better outcomes; Council can consider the matter further if staff returns with administrative issues.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the conventional wisdom around catalytic converter thefts is to approach it from different angles; expressed support for making the theft less attractive as well as the units not being valuable; questioned whether the motion is to have staff return to Council

with an analysis; stated that she does not have enough information to decide whether or not she would support the program.

Councilmember Knox White stated the motion is to have staff come back with a budget request for a program; Council could approve the budget request in order for the program to launch.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer expressed support for the motion; stated the matter is worthy; she would like an outline for similar programs from other jurisdictions.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft concurred with Councilmember Herrera Spencer.

The Police Captain stated that he currently does not know of any programs and will do research.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer expressed support for initially limiting the program to one cage per household; stated the opportunity will allow for one working car per household; the program is one way to prevent thefts; however, units are still stolen after cages are installed; the cages are not an end-all for catalytic converter thefts.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she is hesitant to limit the cages to one per household due to multiple people each needing a car to get to work; inquired the cost per cage.

The Police Captain responded the cost ranges between one hundred to a few hundred dollars each; stated costs depend on installation.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she would be supportive of directing staff to come back to Council with a proposal; the motion sounds like a program is being put into the budget.

Vice Mayor Vella stated the direction is for staff to provide a budget proposal with options; the matter is not a preemptive blank check budget request.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether Council will have a menu of options to select from.

Councilmember Knox White responded the motion is for a budget proposal; stated staff can bring multiple options; staff will bring something that is actionable during the budget discussion.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: No; Herrera Spencer: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4. Noes: 1.

(22-221) Recommendation to Discontinue the Alameda Loop Shuttle; and Authorize the City Manager to Negotiate and Execute a Three-Year Agreement with AC Transit, Substantially the Same as Exhibit 4, for an Amount Not to Exceed \$673,000 to Provide a Free AC Transit Bus Pass Pilot Program for Seniors and People with Disabilities as Part of the City's Paratransit Program.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director gave a brief presentation.

Stated that he would like Council to reconsider the recommendation of discontinuing the Alameda Loop Shuttle; many seniors were not using public transportation during the pandemic

and many are late to adopt public transportation; ridership is generally starting to rise; it is premature to discontinue the service; Stephen Zimmerman, Waters Edge Lodge (WEL).

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft discussed a shuttle service; inquired whether there has been communication with WEL; noted WEL has transportation options.

The Paratransit Coordinator responded a WEL van provides medical rides for residents; stated that she has received feedback from WEL residents; she has been able to help every resident sign up with East Bay Paratransit and other programs, including bus services and the Alameda Independent Mobility (AIM) program; there are not as many Alameda County (AC) Transit routes on Bay Farm Island; however, she has not encountered anyone that has not been satisfied.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft requested clarification of the AIM program.

The Paratransit Coordinator stated the AIM program is for East Bay Paratransit members; five subsidized rides on Uber and Lyft are allowed using the 2-1-1 system; the program provides oversight and an on-demand ride for members; the program has been growing successfully.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the five rides are free.

The Paratransit Coordinator responded in the negative; stated the member pays the first \$4 and everything above \$20, the City pays the in-between amount.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired the cost for rides, to which the Paratransit Coordinator responded the cost depends on the destination.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director stated there is no cost to seniors or people with disabilities to ride AC Transit; the program pays 100% of the cost.

The Paratransit Coordinator discussed a “Hop on the Bus with Us” program user being ecstatic with her ability to be independent.

The Senior Transportation Coordinator stated the “Hop on the Bud with Us” program trains riders; noted the AC Transit Board unanimously approved the three-year pilot program.

Margaret Tseng, AC Transit, stated many seniors and people with disabilities are on a fixed-income; the program allows travel on transit without running the risk of being unable to cover expenses; the pilot program uses the pay-per-ride model and invoices participating cities based on actual boarding; the program is a benefit to seniors and those who are disabled.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired whether the program is all seniors and people with disabilities or low-income seniors and people with disabilities, to which the Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded low-income seniors and people with disabilities.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer further inquired whether the Alameda Loop Shuttle is for all seniors, to which the Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated seniors have signed a petition; inquired whether staff

has reached out to all everyone who signed the petition.

The Paratransit Coordinator responded that she set up a meeting with WEL when the petition began; stated the meeting was advertised and was open to everyone; everyone is satisfied; people are not happy that the shuttle is going away; however, people are being provided other alternatives.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that her concern is whether or not riders are happy; expressed concern about petition signers not being satisfied; stated the information received by WEL staff is likely not outdated; something appears to be inconsistent; the program being limited to low-income individuals needs to be qualified; many seniors living may not qualify for services; noted the proposed program using Uber or Lyft requires a call for each leg of a trip and can be costly.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director stated the Uber and Lyft AIM program is in place and will not be changed; staff is recommending providing a free bus pass to low-income seniors and people with disabilities instead of a free Alameda Loop Shuttle; AC Transit buses run 7 days per week for 12 hours instead of 3 days per week for 4 hours; staff believes the service is much better; staff has structured a 3-year agreement, which is capped at \$673,000; the City will pay per-ride; the program will be opened to low-income seniors and people with disabilities first as the highest priority and most vulnerable; since the City pays per-ride, staff can monitor how many rides are being taken and how fast the budget is being used; the program can be opened up if the budget is not used up.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the senior bus pass or Clipper Card provides for a lower bus ride cost.

The Paratransit Coordinator responded a senior Clipper Card provides a 50% discount for AC Transit rides, as well as discounts for 22 other agencies; stated people should keep their senior Clipper Card in addition to the free bus pass.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated some people do not prefer AC Transit; noted the Commission on Persons with Disabilities (CPD) recommended that the Alameda Loop Shuttle be phased out and continued through the end of the calendar year.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director stated the City has the money to continue the Loop Shuttle to the end of the year or extend the transition period if Council so desires.

The Senior Transportation Coordinator stated staff is seeing 25 to 50 regular Loop Shuttle riders; the Paratransit Coordinator has done a great job of reaching out proactively to the regular riders to get them signed up for the free bus pass program, East Bay Paratransit and AIM; staff has been performing leg-work and recommend concluding the Alameda Loop Shuttle at the end of June.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired how many current riders the Loop Shuttle has.

The Paratransit Coordinator responded the City is averaging 485 rides per month.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated the number of rides shows that the shuttle is still being used; inquired whether riders are not using the shuttle due to being transitioned to AC Transit.

The Paratransit Coordinator responded many rides are round-trips; stated the ridership average is 242; the shuttle service has not been reliable due to driver issues; reluctance to get on buses goes away when people actually ride the bus.

In response to Councilmember Herrera Spencer's inquiry related to March ridership, the Paratransit Coordinator stated that she does not have March ridership numbers yet.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired the ridership for February.

The Paratransit Coordinator responded the average rides for February were 485.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated 485 rides is a great number; the number shows that the shuttle riders have not been transitioned to AC Transit yet and that there is work to be done; expressed concern about abruptly ending a service with that many riders; discussed her recent experience riding AC Transit from the airport and the bus being empty; stated that she sees many seniors getting off the shuttle near Trader Joe's; the shuttle is still being used; it is premature to end the service at this time; expressed support for the matter returning to Council when the transition can be shown as successful; stated the issue of not having a driver is a different problem and should be addressed separately the numbers confirm the demand for service.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether there is a report of passenger amounts that the ridership numbers represent.

The Paratransit Coordinator responded in the negative; stated staff brought the matter to the Alameda County Transportation Commission (ACTC); the pre-pandemic ridership average was 1,100; ACTC looked at Alameda's ridership numbers compared to similar cities; the ridership in other cities is close to pre-pandemic numbers; the Alameda shuttle ridership has not consistently returned; many people are riding both the bus and the shuttle; many people with a free bus pass are also seen on the shuttle; the transition will not be a challenge for many riders.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director stated the program comes down to the per-ride cost of the shuttle; the cost exceeds the standard to be met by the City for use of public money; there is a fundamental problem that the City is spending too much per ride for the shuttle service, which is not sustainable; the City is out of compliance with the funding guidelines; there might be a handful of people that love the shuttle and want to continue riding; however, the public paying \$25 for each ride cannot continue; staff is recommending moving to the other free program which costs \$2 per ride.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated the Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART) and AC Transit ridership is significantly down from pre-pandemic levels; public transportation being down is not unusual.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director stated the City had been exceeding the standard pre-pandemic; the issue is not directly related to the pandemic; the cost per ride was too high before COVID-19 hit; ridership became worse throughout the pandemic.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the City being out of compliance is related to Measure B/BB funds, to which the Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded in the

affirmative; stated the City should not be paying so much per ride.

Councilmember Daysog stated Council has received a lot of correspondence from WEL; WEL is located on Island Drive next to the Harbor Bay Landing shopping center; noted the shuttle only stops near the WEL location on Wednesdays every 30 minutes; residents of WEL would take AC Transit Line 21 if they switch to riding the bus, which is available daily every 30 minutes; Line 21 not stopping directly at WEL could be a concern; the City could work with AC Transit on the stop location; staff is trying to provide more robust service with AC Transit; WEL residents could find a less occupied bus positive; the Line 21 route does not go directly into the South Shore shopping center; however, the route comes close and is similar to the route the shuttle takes.

Councilmember Knox White expressed support for the staff recommendation; stated a lot of work has been put into the matter of changing services and deep engagement has occurred; the proposed program will likely serve many more people; the concern about stopping shuttle service is understandable; it is possible that some people will not see the same level of service; however, many people cannot use the services due to the single-day per week schedule; discussed people's support for the shuttle, AC Transit scheduling and an Inter-Agency Liaison Committee (ILC) meeting presentation; expressed support for the program and continued engagement with WEL residents to ensure the City is meeting needs; stated the City can discuss ways to have Line 21 better serve the WEL residents; the possibility can be raised at the next ILC meeting; the shuttle ridership is not a lot; it is unreasonable to think that the City will wait until all riders make the change and stop using the free shuttle while it is still operates; staff has a solid transition plan as the City moves from one service to another.

Councilmember Knox White moved approval of the staff recommendation.

Councilmember Daysog seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Daysog stated hopefully, AC Transit will work with the City on moving the current Line 21 bus stop on Mecartney Road closer to Safeway.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the matter can be brought to the next ILC meeting.

Vice Mayor Vella stated changes and transitions are always difficult; concurred with Councilmember Knox White's comments; stated that she appreciates the advocacy from both Councilmembers Knox White and Daysog at the ILC meetings around increasing access and accessibility to transit stops to make the new system work for everyone impacted; urged people to continue ensuring the system works for those most in need; discussed her grandmother using AC Transit and the shuttle; stated the options provided lifelines and allowed for socialization and independence; the shuttle is appreciated; however, there has been amazing expansion of AC Transit lines; it is important to invest and maintain public transit; expressed support for a cohesive, subsidized system providing benefits to a broad pool of people; stated the goal is to make public transit work for everyone; expressed support for the staff recommendation.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she is impressed with the care and thoughtfulness of the personal service teaching seniors how to ride public transportation; discussed her use of Line 51; stated many people with wheelchairs or physical limitations utilize the bus route; expressed support for the compassionate AC Transit drivers helping seniors and people with disabilities.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated the bus does not go to Mastick Senior Center, which is another important area of access to figure out; the CPD recommended phasing the shuttle out through the end of the calendar year; the City Manager concurred with the CPD recommendation; proposed a friendly amendment to the motion to approve phasing out the shuttle until the end of the calendar year.

Councilmember Knox White requested clarification about the City Manager concurring with the CPD recommendation.

The City Manager stated the CPD raised good points; Council may extend the transition period to the end of the calendar year if desired; staff has indicated the City has funds to do so.

Councilmember Knox White accepted the friendly amendment to the motion to extend the transition period to the end of the year.

Councilmember Daysog seconded the amended motion.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the program needs to be extended to the end of the calendar year; expressed concern about unreliable drivers.

The Senior Transportation Coordinator stated the 480 ridership number relates to 480 boarding instances per month; the number includes round trips equaling 240 boarding instances for 20 to 50 regular riders per month; staff is not as concerned about the transition because the Paratransit Coordinator is working with the 25 to 50 regular riders; at least one third of the riders are already riding AC Transit; if Council extends the shuttle service, the cost will be \$90,000, which does not feel appropriate from staff's perspective.

Councilmember Daysog stated that he would like to begin the program as soon as possible so the City can begin to acclimate people; Line 21 runs every 30 minutes 7 days per week; the AC Transit system is more robust than the shuttle for WEL residents; he understands that many people love the shuttle service on Wednesday; however, the City can help people understand that AC Transit is a better alternative and will likely win more people over.

Councilmember Knox White concurred with Councilmember Daysog; stated phasing out the service does not phase people off the shuttle; expressed support for a 4 to 6 week time frame to let people know that the shuttle is going away and providing alternative options; stated that he hopes staff can explain Lines 21 and 51 options; he would like to ensure staff is continuing to provide the intensive outreach.

Councilmember Knox White reverted to the original motion approving the staff recommendation.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated the public commenter understands the residents he serves; catching two buses to get to Mastick Senior Center can be a big deal; it is unfortunate that Council is not going to accept the CPD recommendation; she will not support the motion; it is difficult to take two buses; the shuttle has more riders per trip than AC Transit.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she is supporting increased mobility for seniors; people are able to get on one bus are able to get on a second bus; expressed support for the opportunity to provide seniors with transit opportunities 7 days per week.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: No; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4. Noes: 1.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft called a recess at 10:18 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 10:33 p.m.

(22-222) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she would like Council to continue the three Council Referrals to the Council Priority Setting Workshop on April 12th.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer expressed concern about continuing the referrals to the workshop due to limited broadcast options and participants.

Councilmember Knox White stated the workshop will be recorded; expressed support for continuing the referrals to the Council workshop.

The City Manager stated the Council workshop will not be televised; however, it will be broadcast via Facebook Live.

The City Attorney stated the motion should continue the referrals to a date, time, and location specific.

Councilmember Knox White moved approval of hearing the referrals at 8:30 p.m. on April 12th.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft expressed concern over cutting the workshop time short.

Councilmember Knox White withdrew his motion.

Vice Mayor Vella inquired whether the workshop can be extended by 15 minutes and schedule the referrals for the last 5 minutes of the workshop; stated that she feels as though the referrals can be completed; the referrals can be scheduled for 8:50 p.m. on April 12th providing Council with a little time to get through the referrals.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated Council is being vague about what is to be considered; the referrals include a matter on the Harbor Bay Club zoning [paragraph no. 22-230], which could have public speakers; public comment is allowed for Council Referrals; another referral is on the rent program [paragraph no. 22-232] being moved to the City Attorney's office; she has already received emails related to the matter; both of the referrals could have public speakers; expressed concern about timing; stated it is important to share the discussion with the public.

Councilmember Knox White stated that he would like to honor concerns raised by Councilmember Herrera Spencer; the rent program matter is Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft and Vice Mayor Vella's referral.

Councilmember Knox White moved approval of hearing the rent program referral at 8:50 p.m. on April 12th.

Vice Mayor Vella seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote:

Councilmembers Daysog: No; Herrera Spencer: No; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 3. Noes: 2.

(22-223) Councilmember Knox White proposed Council hear the Five Keys agreement [paragraph no. 22-225] and continue the CARP [paragraph no. 22-224] to the Continued Agenda Items agenda section at the next Council meeting.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired what will happen with the remaining agenda items.

Councilmember Knox White expressed concern over loading the upcoming Council meeting by adding to the Housing Element discussion; expressed support for hearing the CARE [paragraph no. 22-227] and parking ordinance [paragraph no. 22-228] matters until 12:00 midnight.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft expressed support for the possibility of providing the State of the City [paragraph no. 22-226] and for moving CARP to the Continued Agenda Items agenda section.

Councilmember Knox White stated the Five Keys agreement can be heard next; the CARE program and parking ordinance are time intensive; the State of the City can also be heard; inquired whether Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft would like to provide the State of the City first.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft responded that she would like to complete the substantive matters, including the Five Keys agreement, first, followed by the State of the City; expressed support for staff leaving the meeting if their matters are being continued; inquired the items moving to the Continued Agenda Items section.

Councilmember Knox White moved approval of continuing the CARP and CARE programs to the beginning of the Continued Agenda Items section on April 19th; stated Council should hear the Five Keys agreement, the State of the City, and the parking ordinance past 11:00 p.m.

Vice Mayor Vella inquired whether the meeting will have an end time of 12:00 midnight.

Councilmember Knox White responded that he hopes so; stated that he would prefer to commit to finishing the matters.

Vice Mayor Vella seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired whether going past 11:00 p.m. requires four affirmative votes.

The City Clerk responded the Rules of Order require Council consideration of new items past 11:00 p.m. to have four affirmative votes; the motion on the table will require four affirmative votes.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that she will not be support the motion.

On the call for the question, the motion, which required four affirmative votes failed by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: No; Herrera Spencer: No; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 3. Noes: 2.

Councilmember Knox White moved approval of hearing the Five Keys agreement next, and continuing the parking ordinance and State of the City to the Continued Agenda Items section of the April 19th meeting.

Councilmember Daysog made a substitute motion to approve hearing the Five Keys agreement and State of the City.

Councilmember Knox White seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: No; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4. Noes: 1.

Councilmember Knox White moved approval of hearing the CARP and CARE items under Continued Agenda Items section on April 19, 2022.

Councilmember Daysog seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

(22-224) Recommendation to Accept the Annual Report on the Climate Action and Resiliency Plan (CARP) and the Annual Report on Transportation. Continued to April 19, 2022.

REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

(22-225) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager to Execute an Interim Funding Agreement and a Promissory Note, both in Substantially the Form Attached to this Staff Report, to Memorialize a Short-Term Loan from the City of Alameda General Fund to Five Keys Schools and Programs in the Amount of \$2,000,000 for Use on General Development Costs for an Interim Supportive Homeless Housing Project on the Bottle Parcel at 2530 5th Street;

(22-225 A) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager to Execute a Service Provider Agreement, in Substantially the Form Attached to this Staff Report, in an Amount Not to Exceed \$1,000,000, Between the City of Alameda and Five Keys Schools and Programs, for Five Keys Schools and Programs to Serve as Project Manager for the Design and Construction of Electrical Work and Water, Storm and Sewer Infrastructure for an Interim Supportive Homeless Housing Project on the Bottle Parcel at 2530 5th Street;

(22-225 B) Resolution No. 15881, "Amending the Fiscal Year 2021-22 General Fund Budget to Appropriate an Additional \$2,000,000 to Fund General Development Costs for an Interim Supportive Homeless Housing Project on the Bottle Parcel at 2350 5th Street." Adopted; and

(22-225 C) Resolution No. 15882, "Increasing Expenditure Appropriations in the American Rescue Plan 2021 Project (C99300) in the Capital Projects Fund (310) by \$1,000,000 to Pay Costs to Design and Construct Electrical Work and Water, Storm and Sewer Mains and Laterals for an Interim Supportive Homeless Housing Project on the Bottle Parcel at 2350 5th Street." Adopted.

The Community Development Director gave a Power Point presentation.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft expressed support for the matter; stated Alameda is among a couple other cities in the County to have received funds.

The Community Development Director stated Alameda and Oakland were the only cities in the County to receive funding.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired whether Council is being asked to take \$1 million out of the City's American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) funds for the project and the City will not be reimbursed for the funding.

The Community Development Director responded in the affirmative; stated there is service provider funding for five years and staff will actively be pursuing future grant funding.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired whether the grant funding language commits the City to provide the transitional housing for more than five years.

The Community Development Director responded in the affirmative; stated the County requires a 20 year commitment; the City received \$2.3 million from the County; the State requires a 15 year commitment; staff has 5 years secured already; staff will continue to find additional funds.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired whether the City will need to come up with 15 years of funding for the project if the grant money is accepted, to which the Community Development Director responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired where funding will come from in the future.

The Community Development Director responded staff will be pursuing other funding opportunities; stated there is currently a lot of energy around homeless housing efforts; there will continue to be opportunities at the federal, State and local levels; staff will be aggressively pursuing the opportunities and will look into private funding as well as fundraising; noted Dignity Moves is also pursuing alternative funding.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that she has not seen an updated five-year forecast update; expressed concern about the City committing to 20 years of funding for the project and funding coming from the General Fund if it cannot be found somewhere else.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated ARPA funds are not General Fund money; Council has allocated a portion of ARPA funds to address homelessness; she agrees with comments related to the housing and homelessness crisis throughout the State; money is being allocated to address homelessness; the City is laying a strong foundation; doing nothing leaves people to languish and die on the streets, which has a cost.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that she understands ARPA funds are not General Fund; ARPA funds will not continue for 20 years; inquired whether the funding for the program would come from General Fund in the future once ARPA funds are exhausted; inquired whether ARPA is a short-term commitment.

The Assistant City Manager responded in the affirmative; stated ARPA funding only runs through 2026; funding for homelessness and housing issues will be up against other Council priorities; the City is committing to an ongoing funding obligation; the project creates new

opportunities to address homelessness, which is a priority; addressing homelessness takes time to ramp up; staff will be looking to the State and county for continued support.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired whether the obligations from the grant will force the City to continue to pay for the project using General Fund money, which may result in cuts to City staff and services.

The Assistant City Manager responded there are some challenging years in the upcoming five year forecast; stated beyond the next five years, City revenues continue to grow with expenses likely to be contained; the City's finances look relatively strong based on revenue expectations; the City will be able to meet needs across the board depending on future priorities and allocation of resources; the goal is for the City not to struggle financially in the future; pension issues will create financial strain if not addressed with strong revenues.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired whether there will be a legal obligation attached to accepting grant funds which creates a contract and the contract will be separate from any additional Council desires regarding expenditures.

The City Attorney responded the City will be committing to 20 years of operations.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer questioned whether the commitment is similar to a contract, where the City will have to perform.

The City Attorney stated the City has a greater commitment towards contractual obligations rather than non-contractual obligations.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer expressed concern over the contractual obligation; stated if grant funding is not available for the project, the City will have to use General Fund money to keep the transitional housing operating; the program will end up being a forced priority of expenditure from the General Fund; there is uncertainty; stating that the City will have great financials for the next 20 years is untrue; expressed concern about the transitional housing obligation needing to be funded ahead of other City staff and services.

Councilmember Knox White stated that he is comfortable in the City's ability to find funding for the program moving forward through grants and the General Fund.

Councilmember Knox White moved approval of the staff recommendation [including adoption of the resolutions].

Vice Mayor Vella seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that she previously supported the project; she did not expect the project to circle back so soon without sufficient funds; the project will become a priority obligation for the City to fund; 20 years is a long time to agree to use General Fund money ahead of other things; she will not be able to support the matter.

Councilmember Daysog stated the project is necessary; ARPA and State funds are paying for the project's capital costs; there is no doubt that ongoing operational costs will be needed; the housing crisis will not go away anytime soon; the project is a vital service for Alameda; the City will face fiscal challenges due to a tightly wound economy; the City will have to decide to tighten

its belt when fiscal challenges arise, including letting City staff and services go to preserve the project services; the project is necessary, exciting and appropriate due to its proximity to services and amenities; he will continue to support the project; Councilmembers make difficult decisions and will have to prioritize housing for vulnerable families similar to the proposed project.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft concurred with Councilmember Daysog; stated the project is a stepping stone as part of the solution to ending homelessness in the region; the transitional housing is providing an opportunity for people to get off the street with wrap around services in order to help gain permanent housing; as people transition out to permanent housing, another group of formerly homeless individuals will come in; the project is something that is desired for other communities in the area; expressed support for the project and grant application.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: No; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4. Noes: 1.

(22-226) Mayor's State of the City Address.

The Mayor gave the State of the City Address.

(22-227) Recommendation to Receive an Update on the Community Assessment Response and Engagement (CARE) Team Pilot Program and Authorize the Extension of the CARE Team Pilot Program until June 30, 2023. Continued to April 19, 2022.

(22-228) Public Hearing to Consider Introduction of Ordinance Amending Alameda Municipal Code Chapter VIII and Chapter XII Authorizing Public Works to Enforce Parking Provisions and Ensuring Consistency with California Vehicle Code. Not heard.

CITY MANAGER COMMUNICATIONS

(22-229) The City Manager discussed the draft Housing Element being available for public review and comment at: www.alameda2040.org/housing, and a Posey/Webster Street Tube closure; announced the annual Alameda Free Library annual Peeps contest; discussed Alameda Restaurant Week.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA

None.

COUNCIL REFERRALS

(22-230) Consider Having the City Council Address the Zoning of the Harbor Bay Club. (Councilmember Herrera Spencer) Not heard.

(22-231) Consider Having the City Council Review Recreation and Parks Department Community Events. (Councilmember Herrera Spencer) Not heard.

(22-232) Consider Directing Staff to Bring the Rent Program "In-House" to the City Attorney's Office. (Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft and Vice Mayor Vella) Continued to April 12, 2022.

COUNCIL COMMUNICATIONS

(22-233) Councilmember Daysog discussed his attendance at the 2022 all-City concert at Encinal High School.

(22-234) Councilmember Knox White made an announcement regarding ACTC meetings and workshops; discussed an upcoming ILC meeting; expressed his appreciation for the City Manager.

(22-235) Councilmember Herrera Spencer discussed her attendance at the Afghan Resource Fair held at Alameda Point and the Navy League Crab Feed; announced her participation as a judge for the Boy Scouts Pinewood Derby; discussed the five year anniversary event for Feathered Outlaw and her attendance at a webinar for Project Opioid; stated that she attended a Bay East Real Estate Summit; expressed support for the City Clerk presenting information on NextRequest at a League of Women Voters event; expressed her appreciation for the City Manager.

(22-236) Vice Mayor Vella discussed her attendance at the Lead Abatement Board meeting; expressed her appreciation for the City Manager.

(22-237) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft expressed support and bid an early farewell to the City Manager; discussed the early stages of the pandemic; announced an event put on by the East Bay Economic Development Alliance promoting the Resilient East Bay launch; discussed an event honoring Chris Tam; announced a memorial ceremony at the USS Hornet recognizing the 80th anniversary of the Bataan Death March; discussed the Ukraine conflict and opportunities for support.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft adjourned the meeting at 11:47 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lara Weisiger
City Clerk

The agenda for this meeting was posted in accordance with the Sunshine Ordinance.