

**MINUTES OF HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD
REGULAR MEETING OF THURSDAY, JULY 7, 2005
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL
2263 SANTA CLARA AVENUE – 7:00 PM**

Vice Chair Anderson called the meeting to order at 7:07 pm. Vice-Chair Miller called the roll.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Vice-Chair Miller, Boardmembers Lynch & Tilos.

MEMBERS ABSENT: Chair Anderson.

STAFF PRESENT: Acting Planning & Building Director Greg McFann, Allen Tai, Planner III, Emily Pudell, Planner II, Recording Secretary Debbie Gremminger.

MINUTES:

M/S (Lynch, Tilos) to continue the minutes of the Special meeting of March 10, 2005 due to lack of quorum. 3-0-1.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1; Motion carries.

M/S (Tilos/Lynch) to approve the Minutes of the Regular Meeting of April 7, 2005 with corrections. 3-0-1.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1; Motion carries.

M/S (Lynch/Tilos) to continue the minutes of the Regular Meeting of June 2, 2005 due to lack of quorum.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1; Motion carries.

AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSIONS:

None.

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS: (Discussion only)

Boardmember Lynch has provided additional information regarding the constructions dates and historicial significance of the projects to be heard tonight for the Board's review.

ACTION ITEMS: (Discussion/Action)

1. CA05-0008, 1305-1311 Park Street, Applicant: Italo Calpestri for Anita Ng. The applicants request a Certificate of Approval for demolition of previous additions, including an un-reinforced masonry addition, at the rear of an existing one and two story commercial building. The demolition is part of a proposal to replace the previous additions with a new two-story rear addition. The proposed demolition exceeds 30% of the value of the structure and requires a Certificate of Approval pursuant to AMC Subsection 13-21.7. The building is listed as a Contributing Structure in the Park Street C-C, Community Commercial Zoning District.

Allen Tai, Planner III, briefly reviewed staff report as presented. Mr. Tai stated that the proposed demolition is part of a project to build a new two-story addition that will replace the two existing additions at the rear of the property. No changes are proposed to the façade or sides of the main building; the historical fabric will not be disturbed.

In order for these additions to be considered historical resources, they must possess and retain enough of their historic character or appearance to be recognizable as historical resources. There is no evidence that these structures exhibit any architectural or historical merit. Furthermore, these additions are incompatible with the design of the existing main building. Staff recommends that the Board approve the Certificate of Approval as stated in draft Resolution.

Vice-Chair Miller opened the floor to public comment.

Chris Buckley, 1017 San Antonio stated that a state historic resources inventory form was done for this property. The property as a whole including the addition is part of the Park Street National Register District. The reference period extends from the late 1800's to 1900. The brick addition does have historical significance. He stated that staff has been applying the National Register Criteria to all of the properties before the Board tonight. This criteria should only be used if it is designated as a monument. He feels this property does fall under criteria B, from the Historical Building Study List which states "A resource which, due to its scale, massing, materials, style, and other features, is similar to a nearby "N" or "S" resource and serves as Background support for it."

Italo Calpestri, architect, stated the proposal is to build a new two-story addition that will replace the two existing additions at the rear of the property. The front façade will not be affected. Parking that currently exists in the rear will also remain as it is. Mr. Calpestri informed the Board that a Building Inspection Report has been submitted which concluded the existing additions are structurally inadequate under current seismic safety standards and require significant alterations in order to render the structures safe. Mr. Calpestri thanked staff Planner Allen Tai for his work on this project.

Boardmember Lynch would like clarification on the Environmental Determination in staff report.

Allen Tai stated that staff determined this project qualifies for a Categorical Exemption because the portion of the building to be demolished is an accessory structure and is not historically significant therefore, this project qualifies for a Categorical Exemption from CEQA Guidelines per Section 15301 (1)(3).

Boardmember Lynch asked Mr Calpestri if any thought was given to saving the structure?

Mr. Calpestri responded by stating that the existing rear building was constructed with unreinforced masonry and does not blend with the front of the building. He also stated the the current space is unsuitable for tenant use and would not be financially viable to keep.

Vice-Chair Miller closed public comments and opened Board discussion.

Boardmember Lynch would like staff to revise the draft resolution so it is clear that it refers only to the two rear accessory buildings and not the front façade. Staff noted the revision.

Boardmember Tilos feels the accessory structures are as historically significant as the main building and does meet the criteria to be a historic resource.

Motion (Lynch) to approve Certificate of Approval CA05-0008, as stated in draft resolution with the correction that staff revise the language so it is clear that this applies only the accessory buildings in the rear of the building.

Motion failed due to lack of a second.

M/S (Tilos, Lynch) to continue this item until such time there is a full Board. 3-0-1.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1; Motion carries.

2. CA05-0011, 1013 Fair Oaks Avenue, Applicant: Derwin Cheung/David Deng. The applicants request a Certificate of Approval to remove a Coast Live Oak tree (*Quercus Agrifolia*) located along the western edge of the property. The tree has a 24" diameter and is only 30" from the main building's brick foundation. Per an Arborist, the tree is interfering with the proposed foundation reconstruction and would become unstable as part of that process. The site is located at 1013 Fair Oaks Avenue, within an R-1, One Family Residence Zoning District.

Emily Pudell, Planner II briefly reviewed staff report as presented. Per the arborist report submitted by the applicant, removal of this tree, located on the western side of the property, will stabilize their property and eliminate the potential of the tree causing damage to the neighboring property. Staff recommends approval Certificate of Approval CA05-0011 with conditions as stated in draft Resolution.

Vice-Chair Miller stated there where no speaker slips submitted, and opened the floor for Board discussion.

Boardmember Lynch informed the Board she visited the property. The tree appears to be in bad shape and is in favor of removing the tree for health and safety reasons.

Vice-Chair Miller is also in favor of removing the tree.

Staff informed the Board that the Recreation & Park Department has been accepting fees in lui of replacement trees. They have not found locations for the replacement trees as of yet. Staff will notify the Board when and where a replacement tree has been planted.

M/S (Tilos, Lynch) to approve Certificate of Approval CA05-0011, to remove a Coast Live Oak tree (*Quercus Agrifolia*) located along the western edge of the property at 1013 Fair Oaks as stated in in draft Resolution. 3-0-1.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1; Motion carries.

3. CA04-0006, 826 Lincoln Avenue, Applicant: Cindy Li. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Approval to demolish the existing single-family dwelling, located at the above address, for the purposes of clearing a dilapidated structure from the site and constructing a new residential duplex. The site is located at 826 Lincoln Avenue, within an R-4, Neighborhood Residential Zoning District.

Emily Pudell, Planner II, briefly reviewed staff report as presented. Applicant wishes to completely demolish a single-family dwelling. This building is not listed on the Historical Building Study List but was built prior to 1942. The condition of the existing building is poor according to a building inspection report letter prepared in 2004. Permit records indicate the building has been significantly altered over time.

Staff feels the existing building is not historically significant and does not meet the criteria to be considered a historical resource. Staff recommends approval of CA04-0006.

Vice-Chair Miller opened the floor for Public comment.

Ivan Chiu, designer with Bill Wong Engineers, who spoke on behalf of the applicant informed the Board that they are ready to proceed with proposed project upon approval. Applicants plan to construct a new duplex on this site.

Boardmember Lynch asked Mr. Chiu if there are parking spaces provided in rear of proposed siteplan. Mr. Chiu answered in the affirmative.

Christopher Buckley, 1017 San Antonio Ave., agrees with staff that this property does not have historical significance but feels staff is applying the wrong criteria to this property as well. Staff

Minutes of July 7, 2005
Regular Historical Advisory Board Meeting

should not be applying the National Register Criteria. In the Ordinance, the National Register Criteria is cited in the definition, Sec 13-21-2, as part of the definition as Historical Monument. It is not referenced in the definition of a Historical Building. Study List. Currently there is no specific criteria in the Ordinance stating what is or what isn't eligible for the Study List. He feels this should be addressed in a future meeting. However, he feels the building does not meet the criteria of the study list. He also stated that he feels that the design quality of the replacement structure should be of the same quality of what it is replacing. He is in favor of the proposed design, with minor changes.

Staff noted his changes, and informed Mr. Buckley that he may submit his comments during the design review process.

Vice-Chair Miller opened the floor to Board discussion.

Boardmember Lynch stated this building does not have any historic value, but would like staff to work closely with the applicant on the design of the proposed project.

M/S (Lynch, Tilos) to approve Certificate of Approval, CA04-0006, to approve the demolition of an existing residence at 826 Lincoln Ave. as stated in draft Resolution. 3-0-1.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 1; Motion carries.

4. CA05-0010, 1815 Sherman Street, Applicant: Jules Garibaldi. The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Approval to alter more than thirty percent (30%) of the historic structure, located at the above address, for the purposes of remodeling the existing single-family dwelling. The site is located at 1815 Sherman Street, within an R-2, Two Family Residence Zoning District.

Emily Purdell reviewed staff report as presented. She would like the Board to omit paragraph 2 of Section III due to a staff error. The demolition plan that was submitted shows retention of the majority of the dwelling's exterior walls; including all of the first-floor front elevations and the majority of the first-floor side and rear elevations. The proposal does not include any changes to the existing porch area. Staff used the same criteria as prior application, and concluded that although there is some local history associated with this property, it is not significant enough to consider this building a historic resource.

Staff feels the proposed additions and remodel of this single family home are restricted to the rear elevations and maintains the character of the existing structure, therefore staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Approval as stated in the draft Resolution.

Vice-Chair Miller opened the floor for public comment.

Jules Garibaldi, owner, informed the Board that he grew up in this house, would like to expand the upper level bedrooms and feels the best way to do this is to dismantle and reconstruct. There

Minutes of July 7, 2005
Regular Historical Advisory Board Meeting