

APPROVED MINUTES  
REGULAR MEETING OF THE  
CITY OF ALAMEDA PLANNING BOARD  
MONDAY, OCTOBER 12, 2015

1. CONVENE

President Knox White called meeting to order at 7:00pm.

2. FLAG SALUTE

Board Member Köster led the flag salute.

3. ROLL CALL

Present: President Knox White, Board Members Burton, Henneberry, Köster, Mitchell, Sullivan. Board Member Zuppan arrived at 7:04pm, during item 5 (Oral Communications).

4. AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSION

President Knox White moved Board Communications, for one item, in front of item 7.

5. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

Sean Whiskeman, from Catellus, gave an update on the shopping cart containment system at Alameda Landing. He said the issue is being resolved and that carts will be able to be used throughout the entire project site. He also said they have a vendor that will be installing some electric vehicle chargers.

6. CONSENT CALENDAR

**6-A 2015-2147**

Recommend that the City Council Approve the City of Alameda Housing Element Annual Report

Board Member Burton made a motion to accept the report. Board Member Henneberry seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

7. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

**7-A 2015-2146**

PLN14-0701 - 2100 Clement Avenue - Applicant: City Ventures. Public Hearing to consider Design Review application for 52 Units on a 2.78 Acre Parcel Located at 2100 Clement Avenue and a Street Tree Replacement Plan. The proposal is categorically exempt from further review under the California Environmental Quality Act pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15332 Infill Development Projects.

Andrew Thomas, Assistant Community Development Director, introduced the item. The staff report and attachments can be found at:  
<https://alameda.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=2475408&GUID=65AA5E51-0D6A-4032-801C-4E0BFF8A5835&FullText=1>

Andrew Warner, from City Ventures, gave a presentation on the architectural design, park designs, and street tree plan.

Board Member Sullivan said she did not think the strawberry trees would be good choices in the landscape plan due to the mess they create. She also said the bay trees are carriers of live oak disease. She said she hoped they would add some canopy trees to the interior of the site.

Board Member Burton asked about the Fire Department desires for access in the park space.

Andrew Thomas explained that a subsurface improvement below the grass turf would provide enough support for emergency access, which a user of the park would not readily notice.

Board Member Mitchell asked about the maintenance responsibility of the interior landscaping and trees within the public space.

The applicant explained that they would be owned and maintained by the homeowners association, but would be publicly accessible.

Board Member Zuppan asked for more details about the lighting of the park and design for keeping eyes on the park for safety.

The applicant said that they are planning to light the path of travel with bollards, but not large overhead lights to light the play area. He said the patios fronting on the park would hopefully keep eyes on any activity.

Board Member Zuppan asked about barbecue smoke blowing towards homes.

The applicant said that it could be a factor for some of the homes.

Board Member Köster asked about whether the power lines would be undergrounded.

The applicant explained their plans for undergrounding utilities, which they would be doing on both Willow and Clement.

President Knox White asked how the public would know the park and grills would be publicly available.

The applicant said a sign would be an easy solution.

President Knox White asked if they planned to use gas for the grills which would be less smoky, instead of charcoal, given the green nature of the project.

The applicant said they could do that if there was a desire.

Board Member Henneberry made a motion to reduce the speaking time for public comment from five minutes to three minutes. Board Member Mitchell seconded the motion. The motion failed 3-4. (Ayes: Knox White, Henneberry, Mitchell. Noes: Köster, Zuppan, Burton, Sullivan)

President Knox White opened the public hearing.

Christopher Buckley, Alameda Architectural Preservation Society, summarized comments from AAPS's letter. He said they were concerned with the Mediterranean design especially. He said they ask that the windows be wood or wood-like material. He said they wanted the muntins be put back into the designs, as well as stronger column bases. He said some of the roof pitches had been reduced, which they did not like.

Stephanie Butler, an Eagle Ave neighbor, said she would like to see the Mediterranean buildings go and rely on the Victorian, Craftsman and Colonial Revival designs.

Dorothy Freeman, a neighbor, said she wanted a project that would integrate into the surrounding neighborhood. She said she wants the plans to not be approved so City Ventures could improve the design. She asked that the street tree plan come back later.

Joseph Woodard, an Eagle Ave neighbor, said the AAPS letter was very important. He said the disappearance of some elements outlined before are key to successfully integrating the project into the neighborhood.

Ginni Dofflemyer, an Eagle Ave neighbor, said she agrees that some of the tree issues need to come back for review. She said the details in the AAPS letter are very important. She said the parking CC&Rs are very important because parking is such a problem in the area.

Jim Strehlow said there was confusion over the public park. He asked if the HOA would have to come to the city before changing use or putting restrictions on the park. Andrew Thomas explained that there would be public access easements on the park.

President Knox White closed the public hearing.

Board Member Mitchell asked for more information about the AUSD building adjacent to the project. Mr. Thomas gave an update on the discussions with the school district.

Board Member Burton said the overall architecture has improved on the project. He said the columns on some of the buildings needed refinement. He said the gabled pieces in the middle of the long building on Clement did not work. He asked about the window conditions. Mr. Thomas explained that the previous conditions included wood windows on street facing elevations. Board Member Burton said the steeper roof pitches in the AAPS letter are a good idea. He said the stucco trim on the Mediterranean windows is okay, but should be the same color as the walls. He agreed that the stucco siding should be smooth, not rough, as it looks more authentic.

Board Member Köster said the design has come a long way. He said the design of the Mediterranean buildings, D specifically, did not fit in. He agreed that the Victorian building could benefit from steeper roof pitches. He said the porch bracket details could be larger. He said one of the yellow colors seemed off to him. He said he is glad about the plans to save as many street trees as possible.

Board Member Sullivan thanked Mr. Buckley for the time he spent and said that she agreed with most of what he said, especially about the roof pitches. She said building D looked too much like an apartment building and wondered if there was a way to make it look more like row houses. She says there is a little more work to be done.

Board Member Zuppan said she hoped the windows would be wood all the way around the site. She thinks the muntins are important and agreed with other comments about the roof pitch. She said she likes the mix of designs and she likes the mediterranean style. She said she liked the previous design with the stone base. She asked the applicant about the windows.

The applicant said multi-family projects rarely, if ever, have wood windows and that a primary concern is waterproofing.

Board Members Burton, Köster and Mitchell commented further on the costs and design tradeoffs of wood vs. vinyl window options.

Board Member Zuppan said she did not support adding no storage requirements on the garages. She said the barbecue would be nice but maintenance and smoke issues concerned her. She said she wanted more canopy trees on the site in order to fit into the neighborhood. She said it would be helpful if there were some way for people to prepare food, even in a limited way, on the units with first floor bathrooms and bedrooms.

Board Member Henneberry said the project has come a long way and the applicant has done everything they asked in working with the community. He said the AAPS letter made some good points.

Board Member Burton said he wondered if the language around the fire access on the turf needed to be clarified.

Board Member Mitchell said the trees in front of the park might need to be omitted to make it inviting to the public.

President Knox White said the location of the grills was a concern. He also said he wants them to be gas. He said the large building on Clement had some design issues, and agreed with many of the other comments regarding windows and other details. He said he agreed with Board Member Zuppan that the Mediterranean buildings fit with what the board asked the applicant to do. He said the diversity in design adds to the neighborhood.

Mr. Thomas said he would like to bring the item back with changes and clarifications incorporating the Board's feedback.

Board Member Burton said the stone base would not look good and said he hoped we would not require that.

Board Member Zuppan made a motion to continue the item to the October 26th, 2015 meeting. The motion was seconded by Board Member Sullivan. The motion passed 7-0.

#### **7-B 2015-2143**

Hold a public workshop on the proposed conceptual approach and process for design review of the initial phase of Site A development.

Andrew Thomas introduced the item. The staff report and attachments can be found at: <https://alameda.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=2475407&GUID=B21A9EDB-5DA5-4F7E-AEF0-19DBC5F976BC&FullText=1>

President Knox White opened the public hearing.

Kevin Jordan spoke about his concerns regarding development, traffic and parking issues on the island. He said the island is maxed out.

President Knox White closed the public hearing.

David Israel, of BAR Architects, gave a presentation.

Board Member Mitchell asked what the process for these items will be, given the very large scope of the projects.

Andrew Thomas explained how items would be brought piece by piece before the Planning Board.

President Knox White re-opened the public hearing.

Carol Gottstein said she hoped there would be three dimensional representations to help the public better comprehend what is being proposed.

Jim Strehlow said he is worried that the developer will build a ghost town if there are not tenant commitments before commencing building. He said the Navy housing was workforce housing for local workers that did not generate as much traffic, and wanted to know what the developer planned for this project.

President Knox White closed the public hearing.

Board Member Henneberry said this project is a long time coming and looks forward to seeing it realized. He said the rounded edges of the building at lot 11 was “too showboat-y.”

Board Member Mitchell said he liked the re-use of the historic elements of the site. He said he worried that parcel 9 looked too much like Emeryville, and this site deserves more.

Board Member Zuppan said she liked the show boat building. She agreed that parcel 9 looked too much like Emeryville or Walnut Creek. She said she liked the idea of something iconic announcing the location across the water, but did not want just a big neon sign. She said she liked that the developer is preserving even more of the buildings than the City asked them to.

Board Member Köster said he wanted to move as much of the public amenities to the front of the phasing as possible. He said he liked the curved building. He agreed with other members that the look of parcel 9 did not work.

Board Member Sullivan said she liked where parcel 11 was headed, but not parcels 8 and 9. She said parcel 8 looked like a tenement in the making. She asked what type of residents would be targeted for the units at Site A.

Board Member Burton asked about the timing of the ferry terminal construction. He said he liked much of the design direction of parcel 11. He said the sub-committee structure should work well as buildings come before them.

President Knox White said he loved the design for block 11. He said this should be the identifying building of Alameda Point that everyone should recognize. He said it would be helpful to have staff meet with the newer members to give a presentation and answer questions about how we got where we are today with Alameda Point. He said the City should use "Apprezzato" instead of "RAMP" when referring to Ralph Appezato Memorial Parkway.

No action was taken.

## 8. MINUTES

### **8-A 2015-2141**

Draft Planning Board Minutes - July 13, 2015

Board Member Burton pointed out an amendment that was not captured in the minutes that the Harbor Bay hotel project finished floor level meet the same standard as the buildings at Site A. Board Member Zuppan pointed out the misspelling of President Knox White's name.

Board Member Zuppan made a motion to approve the minutes with the two amendments (finished floor requirements & correcting President Knox White's name). Board Member Henneberry seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0 with three abstentions (Köster, Mitchell, Sullivan).

### **8-B 2015-2142**

Draft Planning Board Minutes - June 8, 2015

Board Member Burton made a motion to approve the minutes. Board Member Henneberry seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0 with three abstentions (Köster, Mitchell, Sullivan).

## 9. STAFF COMMUNICATIONS

### **9-A 2015-2148**

Zoning Administrator and Design Review Recent Actions and Decisions

Andrew Thomas said there were several design reviews ready for approval and no Zoning Administrator hearings.

Board Member Zuppan said she had some questions on some of the items and was waiting to see if staff approved them.

President Knox White explained that the process had been flipped to have the hearings come first and the department approvals second.

#### 10. WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS

**\*none\***

#### 11. BOARD COMMUNICATIONS

Board Member Burton said he attended a planning conference in Oakland and attended several sessions. He said some programs were outlined for potentially good grant sources for Alameda Point where affordable housing and transit options are combined.

Andrew Thomas said that Planning Staff also attended several workshops at the conference and that it was very helpful.

Board Member Zuppan made a motion to extend the meeting beyond 11:00pm, if necessary. Board Member Köster seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

Board Member Zuppan said many members of the community have approached her about the bright white LED street lights being put in by AMP. She also asked for an update on where the resolutions would be posted after they are passed.

##### **11-A 2015-2099**

Report from the Alameda Point Site A - Ad-Hoc Sub-Committee

**\*None\***

##### **11-B 2015-2185**

Report from the Boatworks - Ad-Hoc Sub-Committee

President Knox White gave a report. He said the issues they are working on are: making sure the open space is continuous and publically available, universal design issues, and street widths. Board Member Burton said the buildings they showed the sub-committee were "truly awful." He said they have made progress with the site plan and that the architecture is a big question mark.

#### 12. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

**\*None\***



### 13. ADJOURNMENT

President Knox White adjourned the meeting at 11:00pm.