



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA
WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 15, 2014**

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 p.m. by Board President Peter Horikoshi.

2. ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: President Peter Horikoshi, Vice President Dean Batchelor, Members Linda McHugh, Marguerite Malloy and Zara Santos

ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Jill Kovacs, Acting Human Resources Director and Executive Secretary to the Board
Stephanie Sierra, Administrative Services Director
Michael Roush, Attorney – Civil Service Board Legal Counsel
Chris Low, Senior Human Resources Analyst
Tiffany Ilacqua, Human Resources Analyst I
Monica Selles, Human Resources Analyst II
Sharlene Shikhmuradova, Administrative Technician II
Beth Fritz, Administrative Assistant II
Terry Flippo, ACEA Representative

3. MINUTES:

A. Approval of Minutes of the Regular meeting of October 2, 2013.

Member McHugh moved that the October 2, 2013 Minutes be approved as written. Motion was seconded by Member Malloy which was passed by a 5-0 vote.

4. CONSENT CALENDAR:

SUMMARY REPORT FOR EXAMINATION ELIGIBLE LISTS AND CLASSIFICATIONS FOR JANUARY 15, 2014.

4-A-i. ELIGIBLE LIST ESTABLISHED

	DATE ESTABLISHED	EXAM NO.
Compliance Superintendent	12/20/2013	2013-37PR
Energy Resources Analyst	10/02/2013	2013-25
Finance Supervisor	11/13/2013	2013-32
Human Resources Analyst II	10/17/2013	2013-28
Intermediate Clerk	10/10/2013	2013-30
Maintenance Worker II	10/01/2013	2013-27
Office Assistant	10/28/2013	2013-31
System Operations and Field Service Supt	12/16/2013	2013-38PR
Traffic Signal Maintenance Technician	12/19/2013	2013-35PR

4-A-ii ELIGIBLE LIST EXTENDED

	DATE ESTABLISHED	EXAM NO.
Administrative Technician II	01/09/2013	2012-42
Fire Captain	01/30/2012	2011-32PR
Human Resources Analyst I	06/27/2013	2013-21PR
Police Captain	05/01/2013	2013-12PR
Supervising Librarian	05/24/2012	2012-18

Police Officer	02/19/2013	2013-05
Anderson, Travis	Hamilton, George	Reimche, Craig
Bauman, Benjamin	Hernandez, Zachary	Rodriguez, Brauli
Burnaugh, Michael	Ho, Scott	Sipes, Carson
Canterbury, Robert	Martinez, Carlos	
Canty, Arsenio	McCarthy, Nicholas	
Garcia, Marshall	Melara, Fausto	

4-A-iii ELIGIBLE LIST EXPIRED/CANCELLED/ EXHAUSTED

	DATE ESTABLISHED	EXAM NO.
Compliance Superintendent	12/20/2013	2013-37PR
Division Chief	10/10/2011	2011-16PR
Journey Lineworker	03/11/2013	2013-04
Paralegal	04/18/2013	2013-09
Police Officer	08/04/2012	2012-27
Supervising Civil Engineer	04/30/2013	2013-10
System Operations and Field Service Supt	12/16/2013	2013-38PR

4-A-iv LIST OF SPECIFICATIONS

Existing Classification Specification Revision:

Line Worker Supervisor
Substation and Meter Supervisor
Traffic Signal Maintenance Technician

New Class Specifications:

Compliance Superintendent
Economic Development Manager
Senior Human Resources Analyst
System Operations & Field Service Superintendent

Vice President Batchelor asked about the Compliance Superintendent eligible list established on 12/20/2013 and the System Operations and Field Service Superintendent list established on 12/16/2013. Both lists were cancelled on the same day they were established. Acting Human Resources Director Kovacs stated that these lists each had one candidate. Senior Human Resources Analyst Low stated that for both jobs there was only one candidate placed on the eligible list for each position. Both were offered appointment and both accepted. As a result, each eligible list was exhausted on the same day it was established.

Vice President Batchelor asked if the City was satisfied with these positions being offered for that short of time. Senior Human Resources Analyst Low stated that the candidates were in-house and that internal promotional exams were conducted. Acting Human Resources Director Kovacs advised the Board that when there is a "PR" after the exam number that means it is a promotional recruitment.

Vice President Batchelor asked if the IBEW will be agreeable with the Line Working Supervisor job specification revision to duty #6 (assists in the supervision, training and evaluation of assigned staff). Senior Human Resources Analyst Low stated that the description was vetted to the IBEW and they agreed.

Acting Human Resources Director Kovacs stated there were changes to the previously provided Substation and Meter Supervisor specification and provided the Board with a memo from Senior Human Resources Analyst Low describing the changes. Member McHugh asked if both the Line Working Supervisor and the Substation Meter Supervisor classifications were non-exempt. Senior Human Resources Analyst Low stated yes both are non-exempt and eligible for overtime.

Member Santos asked if two years of experience is typical for advanced journey level classifications like these. Senior Human Resources Analyst Low stated yes, two years is appropriate because before applying for the journey level working supervisor classification, the journey level candidates must complete a four year apprenticeship program.

Vice President Batchelor moved that Consent Calendar items be approved. Motion was seconded by Member McHugh which was passed by a 5-0 vote.

5. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

5-A. Appeal of Notice of Termination by Barbara Hawkins.

Acting Human Resources Director Kovacs introduced Michael Roush who will be legal counsel to the Civil Service Board for the appeal of termination by Barbara Hawkins.

Acting Human Resources Director Kovacs stated that the City received the October 29, 2013 letter appealing the notice of termination from the employee's attorney included in the agenda packet. Ms. Kovacs thanked the Board for responding to staff inquiries regarding their availability and stated that

as a result, the hearing dates are scheduled for February 11, 12, and 13. Ms. Kovacs asked the Board to approve the hearing dates.

Member Santos asked if the City needs a particular quorum for the hearing, that she may have a schedule conflict. Acting Human Resources Director Kovacs stated that four members attending the hearing would work, but four is not preferable because then there could possibly be a tie decision. Member Santos stated that she will try to be at the hearing.

Mr. Roush stated that staff will have to check with the City's outside attorney and the appellant's attorney to see if they would prefer to wait until all five members can be present, rather than have to go with four members. Mr. Roush asked Member Santos when she would know if she could attend. Member Santos stated she would let staff know as soon as possible, probably next week.

Acting Human Resources Director Kovacs stated that the hearing dates are scheduled for February 11-13, based on Member Santos availability, and asked Members about a start time. Member Santos stated 5:30 p.m. would be good.

Member Malloy asked about an end time. Acting Human Resources Director stated the facility is booked until 9:30 p.m. on each date in the Stafford Room at the Alameda Free Library. Technically when the meeting ends is up to the Civil Service Board. Staff anticipates that the hearing will only go two days. Staff booked these days so that we would not have to meet many weeks out in case additional time was needed.

Member McHugh asked if in this type of hearing the Board will need to do any fact gathering. Mr. Roush stated no, all information relied upon will be presented at the hearing. It would not be appropriate to do fact finding outside the boundaries of the hearing because the Board is acting as both triers of fact as well as the judge. The Board's decision should be based on the evidence that is presented at the hearing itself.

Member McHugh stated that at the last hearing there was some research that needed to be done which extended the time required to deal with the issue. Acting Human Resources Director Kovacs stated that was a different situation in that it was a review of an exam process and this hearing is an appeal of termination.

Member Santos stated that the name of the lawyer representing the appellant looks very familiar to her and she may have practiced law with or against him a long time ago; she asked if this would be an issue. Mr. Roush stated that as long as she had not represented the appellant in the past or had a financial connection with the law firm, it should not be a problem. If Ms. Santos did not see a conflict of interest other than the possibility of having a case with that person, then there is not a reason to sit out of the hearing.

Member Malloy made a motion that the Appeal of Notice of Termination submitted by Barbara Hawkins be heard on February 11, 12 and 13 at 5:30 p.m. and to end at such time the Civil Service Board deems appropriate. Motion was seconded by Vice President Batchelor which passed by a 5-0 vote.

**5-B. Approval of Request for Lateral Transfer to New Classification
- Senior Management Analyst to Senior Human Resources Analyst**

Acting Human Resources Director Kovacs stated that this notice is to advise the Board that she has approved this lateral transfer. This is in keeping with moving people into function specific classifications rather than the general classifications. This is a slow process because priorities keep shifting and Human Resources is working with limited resources.

In this particular case, Senior Human Resources Analyst Low was moved laterally from the Senior Management Analyst classification to the Senior Human Resources Analyst classification.

Vice President Batchelor asked if the plan was that everyone would be in this type of classification. Acting Human Resources Director Kovacs explained that the City is moving from general classifications into more specific classifications. For instance, Tiffany Ilacqua and Monica Selles, who both recently joined Human Resources, were hired into Human Resources specific analyst classifications instead of general management analyst classifications which were used before. She further explained that as the City brings in new employees we try to hire people into the more function specific classifications in those situations where the associated classification work can keep up with staffing needs.

5-C. Ordinance Review/Update

Stephanie Sierra, Administrative Services Director, stated that it was brought to staff's attention by Member Santos that one of the Civil Service Rules was not compliant with current Disability Law. The Civil Service Rules, Article VI. Examinations, Section 1. (b) and (c), need to be modified to reflect current law. Possible suggested language change was provided as a draft working document to the Board. The change needs to be made to the Civil Service Rules, not the Civil Service Ordinance as originally thought. The Board is solely in charge of the Civil Service Rules and this is/ something the Board can do without Council approval.

Members Malloy and Santos were pleased with the suggested language change to the Rules to Article VI. Examinations, Section 1. (b). Director Sierra stated that staff will bring this item back to the Board for further review.

5-D. Activity Report – Period of September 1, 2013 through November 30, 2013.

FULL-TIME HIRES

DATE	DEPARTMENT	JOB CLASSIFICATION
09/23/13	Fire	Firefighter
09/23/13	Library	Library Technician
09/30/13	Police	Police Officer
10/07/13	Alameda Municipal Power	Journey Line Worker
10/14/13	Alameda Municipal Power	Journey Line Worker
10/21/13	Alameda Municipal Power	Distribution Engineer
10/28/13	Public Works	Maintenance Worker I
11/04/13	City Manager	Office Assistant
11/12/13	Public Works	Maintenance Worker I
11/12/13	Public Works	Maintenance Worker II
11/12/13	Public Works	Intermediate Clerk
11/25/13	Human Resources	Human Resources Analyst II

PROMOTIONS

DATE	DEPARTMENT	JOB CLASSIFICATION
09/08/13	Public Works	Public Works Supervisor
09/08/13	Police	Police Sergeant
10/06/13	Finance	Finance Director
11/17/13	Human Resources	Administrative Services Director
11/17/13	Police	Chief of Police
11/17/13	Community Development	Community Development Director

JOB TITLE CHANGED

DATE	DEPARTMENT	JOB CLASSIFICATION
11/17/13	Community Development From	Chief Operating Officer-Alameda Point Alameda Point Project Manager

RETIREMENTS

DATE	DEPARTMENT	JOB CLASSIFICATION
11/01/13	Alameda Municipal Power	Electrical Mtce Working Supervisor
11/30/13	Police	Intermediate Clerk

SEPARATIONS

DATE	DEPARTMENT	JOB CLASSIFICATION
09/05/13	Community Development	Planner I
09/06/13	Alameda Municipal Power	Electrical Maintenance Tech
10/28/13	Public Works	City Engineer
11/19/13	Alameda Municipal Power	Sr Energy Resources Analyst
11/29/13	Alameda Municipal Power	Assistant General Manager-Customer Resources

President Horikoshi brought to staff's attention that the Activity Report should be labeled item 5-D., not Item 5-B.

Acting Human Resources Director Kovacs stated that under Job Title Changed, Community Development Chief Operating Officer-Alameda Point should be corrected to Alameda Point Project Manager, not Deputy City Manager.

Acting Human Resources Director Kovacs stated that reasons for separation were:

Planner I – Resigned (went to work for San Francisco)
Electrical Maintenance Tech – Resigned (returned to former employer)
City Engineer – Termination
Sr Energy Resources Analyst – Resigned (returned to former employer-Modesto Irrigation)
Assistant General Manager-Customer Resources – Resigned (went to work for EBMUD)

Member McHugh asked if staff was seeing a little poaching going on and is it going to be a problem. Acting Human Resources Director Kovacs stated it probably will be, particularly in areas such as AMP where specialized skills are needed. Member Santos asked how big the compensation difference

was. Senior Human Resources Analyst Low stated that based on exit interviews, two of the positions were in excess of 30 percent. Ms. Kovacs stated some of the people went to special districts which are better funded and can offer better packages and compensation.

President Horikoshi asked if it will be difficult to recruit replacements for those people. Senior Human Resources Analyst Low stated that they are currently recruiting for the Electrical Maintenance Technician and have received a decent number of applicants which they will be assessing in the next couple of weeks. With regard to the Senior Energy Resource Analyst, staff took the opportunity to fill the position with a lower level Energy Resources Analyst. The hope is to train people in-house and retain them. AMP has a work force training initiative and will be talking to the Public Utility Board about a compensation policy for AMP.

6. **ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA (PUBLIC COMMENT)**

(Any person may address the Civil Service Board in regard to any matter over which the Civil Service Board has jurisdiction or of which it may take cognizance that is not on the agenda)

None.

7. **CIVIL SERVICE BOARD COMMUNICATIONS (COMMUNICATIONS FROM BOARD)**

None

8. **CIVIL SERVICE BOARD COMMUNICATIONS (COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF)**

None.

9. **CONFIRMATION OF NEXT CIVIL SERVICE BOARD MEETING**

Wednesday, April 2, 2014 (Member Santos will be absent on April 2)

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

Meeting was adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Jill Kovacs
Acting Human Resources Director and
Executive Secretary to the Civil Service Board