

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY ISSUES
MEETING MINUTES OF
Wednesday, April 13, 2016 6:30 p.m.
Item 2-A

1. ROLL CALL

The meeting was called to order at 6:36 p.m.

Present: Chair Kenny, Vice-Chair Brillinger, Commissioners Aghapekian, Franco, Deutsch, Linton, Lewis, Tsztoo

Absent: Commissioner Wilkinson

We have a quorum.

2. MINUTES

The minutes for the February 10, 2016 meeting of the Commission on Disability Issues was approved with minor edits.

Chair Kenny moved to approve minutes.

Commissioner Lewis seconded.

All Commissioners in favor. 8-0

3. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS/NON-AGENDA (PUBLIC COMMENT)

- 3-A Newly appointed Commissioner Michaela Tsztoo was introduced. She will be finishing Ethel Warren's term which ends June of 2017.

4. NEW BUSINESS

- 4-A. Study Session to: 1) Consider Draft Citywide Universal Design Ordinance Requirements and Standards, and 2) Review Progress on Universal Design Requirements and Standards for Site A at Alameda Point (Andrew Thomas, Assistant Community Development Director)

Mr. Thomas gives background on Universal Design Ordinance (UDO) development that has been going on since 2012. Discusses the interest and intent of the Planning Board and staff to make sure an ordinance is implemented that works. Says that projects that have been coming before the Planning Board have UDO elements implemented already. Brings up Site A at Alameda Point and its 800 living units. There are people in the room that can discuss what they have implemented.

Site A has already been designed and approved. This ordinance will not affect Site A's 800 units. They can

The state of CA has a model ordinance that we could follow. We edit and modify it to make it work for Alameda's needs. Not a lot of cities in California have adopted UDO. We don't have a lot of models to follow with this implementation. Brings up TriPointe development at Alameda Landing (townhomes, generally), and Lennar at Marina Shores on Buena Vista.

Discusses UDO options at point of purchase. Universal design options are included as varying building finishes are offered. Customize unit. If Alameda passes a UDO ordinance, accessible improvements will be a required menu item as a custom finish.

A few cities have adopted this. Staff's research says only a few UDO units are being built to these specifications. Staff is proposing that in these larger developments there is a desire to have a percentage of units that have accessible options already built in.

Chair Kenny asks about the 10% percentage. Site A has 10% that have UDO attributes.

Access to the front door, access through the unit, ...

Discusses multifamily development versus townhomes or single family projects. Every unit in a multifamily complex that has several levels will have an elevator. That raises the accessibility to entering those units to 100%.

Townhomes are more difficult. Mentions 2100 Clement development. Second and third floors would have stairs. Garage is on first floor.

Chair Kenny believes things are missing from the proposal – doesn't see where there are any universal requirements of all units in a base model – like accessibility to the units at Marina Shores. Every unit has a stair or two at the entrance. She has received several different reports from staff but doesn't feel as though the CDI's comments have been included. Mr. Thomas asks for specific items. Chair Kenny says every single unit should have reinforcement in the walls of bathrooms for grab bars. Would like to see a higher percentage of units that these requirements would be applied to.

Mr. Thomas would like a list from the CDI that lists the elements that must be included for all units. Reinforced backing in walls, stairway widths, and other things. Commissioner Kenny says this will be submitted to him.

Commissioner Lewis asks about elements taking the affordability into account, like changing stairs into a ramp. Asks about accessibility in the public right-of-way. Mr. Thomas says this is something he wants to include in the ordinance. Affordability is the critical issue here. Developers will pass on cost to buyer with such a requirement. Need to create a balance. Adaptability may be what the ordinance strives for, creating an affordable way to adapt or modify a unit to be accessible. Elevators are hugely expensive.

Commissioner Deutsch wonders why the stairs need to be included at all. Mr. Thomas discusses design requirements, historic modification requirements, and clean water requirements. Drainage issues. Water has to be treated onsite via bioswales, meaning it processes through designed landscaping, so draining water goes through the topography of the site for the first filtering of the water. Elevations become important in this design. Commissioner Deutsch says that even a person with a child's stroller would appreciate a ramp at the entrance to a unit. Mr. Thomas agrees, thinks more can benefit from this.

Vice-Chair Brillinger says from the report that only one of the units will have these elements. Why only one of the models? Why not 100? Of the units will have the wall backing, and the other attributes? Mr. Thomas says they were taking the language from the state model ordinance.

Commissioner Aghapekian understands that writing this ordinance and all that it needs won't be easy, that model is not built out, but that a brochure of extra attributes are given. It implicates exclusivity, prejudice, that the elements would be "extra", and that is not a good way to approach this. Commissioner Lewis says that a brochure may not even be helpful to someone is blind and in a wheelchair. Would like to take Commissioner Aghapekian's comments seriously.

Mr. Thomas says he is going to be taking this to the Planning Board, and thinks that these comments are part of the process. The next step could be to have a joint hearing on the Ordinance. It may have compromised elements, but can be the most agreeable outcome.

Chair Kenny introduces the idea of a cooperative workgroup with Planning Board members for the development of this ordinance. Mr. Thomas thinks that's a great idea. He also mentions that the Development community will probably have input on this.

Chair Kenny wonders if there will be any reports of sales of such units. Mr. Thomas says that there is such a unit at Alameda Landing. He says he asked about the unit, and that the sellers report that the buyers like it, that they would rather not have stairs.

Commissioner Aghapekian said that he's noticed most of the discussion is about transportation, not about those with disabilities. Mr. Thomas agrees that these discussions would work better with an ordinance to guide his staff.

Vice chair Brillinger mentions the discussion of "clear access" which means a lot to him being in a steel-framed wheelchair. He discusses the design of doorframes and door requirements, and how a steel wheelchair needs certain requirements for accessibility. Has typographical edits to offer staff.

Commissioner Tsztoo says that she doesn't see anything proposed for people who are hearing impaired. Intercoms with doorbells so opening the door is not required. And electronic fixtures would lend more accessibility.

Commissioner Lewis asked about transit issues he has been hearing about recently, namely AC Transit routes being improved. Mr. Thomas says yes, says that Alameda received more money with the passage of Measure BB, and mentions the old line 19 being added back into operation, that was to go directly to Fruitvale BART from the Northern Waterfront District of Alameda. Discusses transit passes being included with a developers' offer of a housing unit.

Commissioner Kenny opens the discussion up to public comment. Member of the public Audrey Lord-Hausman commends the Commission and the Planning Board for the efforts toward this ordinance and Mr. Thomas for the presentation. Agrees that there should be a menu of items offered for every unit, and said that when she went to Marina Shores to look at units and asked for Universal Design options, and the gentleman there did not really know what she was talking about. She looked at Alameda Landing's TriPointe unit, Unit 5, said it was very nice but it had a bathtub. She asked if it could instead have a shower if she were to buy it, and they said no, the City's permitting methods wouldn't allow it. She said that did not make sense. The developers need to

understand that Alameda is serious about this, and that we want a good plan. A combined meeting between the CDI and the Planning Board would be great, and keep up the good work.

Vice Chair Brillinger says that these universal design elements only improve the value of the unit, not the opposite. Chair Kenny asks Mr. Thomas asks about the planning procedure, and about the City's permitting process keeping a shower from being installed. Mr. Thomas says this is not the issue. The market is hot, and developers are selling units without making changes.

4-B. Introduction of Aaron B. Zisser, Vice Chair of City of Oakland's Mayor's Commission on Persons with Disabilities (Vice Chair Brillinger)

Mr. Zisser thanks Vice-Chair Brillinger for inviting him. Said he went as the second agenda item on purpose to be able report back to his Commission on our meeting methods. He said that was a great presentation about the Universal Design Ordinance. Appreciates the process that Alameda is pursuing. The fact that city staff proposed a joint hearing seems amazing, and that he is looking forward to reporting back on this. Would love to show this to the City of Oakland.

Mr. Zisser invites everyone to contact him to collaborate on shared issues. Says his commission is a brand new group of people, who wishes to become a systems-oriented group, focus more on mental health disability issues as well as physical. People with many different perspectives on the commission. Introducing a new committee structure. Brought in a facilitator to help define these committees to align with Mayor's goals. Came up with guiding principles for commission. Discussed projects of Oakland's commission. Discussed regional and state concerns.

5. **OLD BUSINESS**

(None)

6. **STAFF COMMUNICATIONS**

(None due to time needed for boards and commissions, and staff needs to speak into the mic! ☺)

8. **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

8-A Commissioner Reports on Assigned Boards and Commissions (All)

Commissioner Aghapekian visited the Planning Board, met with Gail Payne, walked Central Avenue to scout out the proposed Central Avenue project. Has some observations. Deliberated on complaint regarding no accessible parking at Shore Line Drive. What was most concerning is that the Central Avenue project had no discussion paper about accessibility, and he wanted to have more attention paid to this issue in the project so attention could be drawn to it, and discussed.

Chair Kenny visited Rent Review Advisory Board, new ordinance is effective March 31, 2016, there will be community workshops held for tenants and landlords. Chair Kenny will be attending.

Chair Kenny stated that City Council had a Proclamation that Autism Awareness Month is in April, would like the Commission to be aware. Also, Council will be discussion the Recreation and Parks Department regarding accessibility in parks and recreation centers.

Commissioner Deutsch was ready to attend the Rec and Parks Board Meeting, but they canceled it.

Commissioner Lewis attended the Transportation Commission Meeting, there is a new bus line #19. He would like to be part of the community discussion of the transit issues, and wondered if the City would consider a route along Encinal Avenue and High Street, and to the Ferry Terminal. BART wanted to have a bond approved, which was discussed.

Commissioner Brillinger went to the Transportation Commission meeting. There was another meeting today, between Mayor Spencer and AC Transit. Transit is at capacity with the ferries. People are being left at the ferry terminals. WETA is considering putting older boats back in the schedule to alleviate.

Chair Kenny gave Commissioner Aghapekian the advice to use CDI Staff Kerry Parker for introductions to project owners in city departments. Ms. Parker said she would be happy to

Work group formed during discussion:

Events Workgroup: Commissioners Franco, Brillinger, Lewis

This group will meet to discuss attendance and/or participation of the CDI at events, and how to plan and organize this attendance. This group can report back at our next meeting.

Vice Chair Brillinger has been looking at other similar commissions and their activities for ideas of effectiveness, and suggests a scholarship from the CDI offered to high school seniors. Suggests recognizing local employers who hire those with disabilities. Suggests subcommittee for Accessible Transportation, Parking, and Pedestrian Safety Committee. If problems are noticed in Alameda, then report it to the Subcommittee.

Staff Parker says the City is fully engaged with SeeClickFix to report issues that you see around the City. And for correspondence for the commission, use the email address, disabilitycomm@alamedaca.gov.

9. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:46 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Kerry Parker
City Staff Liaison
Commission on Disability Issues