

# APPROVED MEETING MINUTES

## REGULAR MEETING OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA PLANNING BOARD MONDAY, OCTOBER 24, 2011

1. CONVENE: 7:08 pm
2. FLAG SALUTE: Board member Zuppan
3. ROLL CALL: Present: President Ezzy Ashcraft, Board members Burton, Henneberry, and Zuppan.  
Absent: Vice-President Autorino and Board member Kohlstrand
4. MINUTES:

Minutes from the Regular meeting of April 25, 2011

Minutes from the Regular meeting of September 26, 2011

Board member Burton clarified his statement on page 3, first paragraph, stating his objection was that the use was not consistent with the goals of the City of Alameda's Local Action Plan for Climate Control. He also stated for the record that the applicant was not present at the hearing. President Ezzy Ashcraft the spelling of speaker names on page 2. **Minutes approved as amended 4-0.**

Minutes from the Regular meeting of October 10, 2011, (Pending)

### 5. AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSION:

**None**

### 6. STAFF COMMUNICATIONS:

#### Written Report

#### **6-A** Future Agendas

Andrew Thomas, Planning Services Manager, provided an overview of upcoming projects.

Board member Zuppan requested that the Master Street Plan be brought to a future Planning Board meeting to review the policies.

### 7. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS:

Nancy Braham, resident, expressed outrage over the removal of the street trees on Park Street between Central Avenue and San Jose Avenue.

Stuart Rickard, resident, expressed outrage over the removal of the street trees on Park Street between Central Avenue and San Jose Avenue.

Chuck Kapelke, resident, expressed outrage over the removal of the street trees on Park Street between Central Avenue and San Jose Avenue.

Trish Spencer, resident, expressed outrage over the removal of the street trees on Park Street between Central Avenue and San Jose Avenue.

#### 8. CONSENT CALENDAR:

**8-A Public Art Proposal – Grand Marina – Warmington Residential CA.** Two freestanding metal sculptures to be located on private property off Hibbard Street and at the foot of Grand Street adjacent to the Grand Marina and the Oakland/Alameda Estuary. If approved, the sculptures will satisfy the Alameda public art requirement.

The motion was made and approved to move the item off the consent calendar.

President Ezzy Ashcraft opened the public comment period.

Carol Gottstein, resident, raised concerns about the copper material the art is to be made of for fear that it will be stolen.

President Ezzy Ashcraft closed the public comment period.

Mr. Thomas gave a brief overview of the Public Art Program stating that the project is a public art proposal for Warmington Residential California (commonly referred to as Warmington Homes) at Grand Marina. Pursuant to the requirements of the City of Alameda Public Art Ordinance, the applicant is requesting approval of on-site artwork in the form of two metal sculptures. The sculptures will be installed on private property along the publicly accessible shoreline. He stated that the proposed artwork will be maintained and protected by the project owners, as required by the conditions of approval. Should any damage or theft occur to the art over time the applicant will be responsible for repair or replacement.

The motion was made by Board member Henneberry and seconded by Board member Burton to approve the Public Art project. **Approved 4-0.**

#### 9. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS:

**9-A PLN11-0286 Design Review - Ploughshares Nursery at 2701 West Main Street.** The project consists of a 2,580 square feet plant nursery retail building for Ploughshares Nursery. The one-story structure will utilize strawbale and earthbag construction and incorporate solar energy and on-site stormwater treatment. The project is located within an M-2-F zoning district.

Mr. Thomas gave an overview of the project. This design review application is a proposal to build a new freestanding building at the Ploughshares Nursery. He stated that the proposed design includes a number of unique sustainable design features. The structure will provide Ploughshares with a new visual presence on Main Street and provide space for year-round, indoor retail sales and educational workshops. The building itself is a demonstration of sustainable design principles. The building will employ a number of sustainable design

strategies and alternative construction technologies including straw bale construction, earth bag construction, and the use of salvaged, donated and surplus materials for non-structural building components such as windows, doors, flooring and wall materials.

Doug Biggs, Director, Alameda Point Collaborative gave an overview of the nursery and its connection with the residents of the Collaborative. He stated that the new building will enhance the retail and wholesale business at the nursery and act as an education center.

President Ezzy Ashcraft spoke fondly of the nursery and its contributions to the City.

Board member Zuppan commended the Alameda Point Collaborative for the work they do at the nursery.

Board member Burton asked what the estimated timeline was for construction.

Mr. Biggs stated that the construction is slated to being in the spring of 2012.

Board member Burton mentioned that fund raising efforts by Community Action for Sustainable Alameda (CASA) could possibly be done to add to the solar panels and additional items for the building. He stated that it is an exciting project and Ploughshares Nursery is a great asset to the City.

Motion was made by Board member Burton and seconded by Board member Zuppan to find the project exempt from further review under CEQA pursuant to guideline section 15303; and approve Design Review Application PLN11-0286. **Approved 4-0.**

**9-B Recommend Adoption of An Ordinance for Food Truck Operations** Amending Alameda Municipal Code Sections 6-27.4, 6-52.1 and 22-8.1 to allow Sale of Goods from a Rolling Store with Approval of a Special Event Permit or Conditional Use Permit; and Adopt Food Truck Program Guidelines, including Standard Conditions of approval for Conditional Use Permit or Encroachment Permit for Rolling Stores.  
**Staff requests continuance to a future meeting.**

**9-C Public Hearing / Scoping Session** of the Environmental Impact Report for the proposal to reconfigure the Chuck Corica Golf Course, build up to 130 housing units on the lands currently occupied by the Mif Albright 9-hole course and build playing fields on 12 acres of land on North Loop Road in the Harbor Bay Business Park.

Mr. Thomas stated that the purpose of the hearing is to provide a forum for the public to identify issues or questions that may be of concern to the community. Also to provide an opportunity for the public to submit comments on the scope of a Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR) that will be prepared if the City Council chooses to examine the proposal. The DEIR should fully inform the community and City decision makers about the potential environmental impacts of the proposal and enable a well-informed decision at a future date on the project. He stated that there would not be any action taken by the Planning Board at this meeting but should the City Council decide to go forward with the project the Planning Board will play a very important role in making the final recommendation on the project to the Council.

Mr. Thomas reported that on December 13, 2011, the City Council will consider a staff recommendation to enter into a Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) with Harbor Bay Island Associates (HBIA). The MOA is designed to create a process and a funding source for the evaluation of a proposal that would entail a land swap between the City of Alameda and HBIA to provide private funds for improvements at the Golf Complex and land and funds to build a new 12-acre public sports center.

If the City Council approves the MOA, then staff and a team of consultants will prepare a comprehensive evaluation of all the potential environmental impacts of all aspects of the proposal and a range of project alternatives. Specifically, the DEIR will address Transportation, Aesthetics, Air Quality, Biological Resources, Cultural Resources, Geology, Soils, and Seismicity, Greenhouse Gas Emissions, Hazardous Materials, Hydrology and Water Quality, Land Use, Plans, and Zoning, Noise, Population, Employment, and Housing, Public Services, Utilities and Service Systems, and Alternatives to the project, including a No-Project alternative.

Once the DEIR is completed and circulated for public review, the Planning Board will hold a second public hearing to provide an opportunity to comment on the adequacy of the analysis included in the DEIR. Staff will then prepare a Final EIR for public circulation before any final actions on the project can be taken on the proposal.

He stated that the proposed project has three principal components:

1. **Redesign, relocation, construction, and operation of a new 9-hole Mif Albright Par 3 Golf Course adjacent to the redesigned 18 hole Jack Clark Course.** This portion of the total Project includes: (1) construction of a new 9-hole Mif Albright Par 3 Golf Course located on the easterly side of the Lucious Bateman Driving Range and a reconfigured layout for the Jack Clark South Course and some other land in the southeasterly portion of the City's Chuck Corica Golf Complex to accommodate the new Mif Albright Course; (2) drainage and other improvements to the Jack Clark South Course, and (3) construction of a new entry at Clubhouse Memorial Road. No General Plan or zoning amendments would be necessary for this portion of the project.
2. **Construction and occupancy of up to 130 new housing units on the 12 acres currently occupied by the 9-hole Mif Albright Golf Course acreage.** This portion of the Project includes development of up to 130 new homes on the 12 acres of land currently occupied by the 9-hole Mif Albright Golf Course. The City's General Plan would be amended to change the Land Use designation of this new parcel from "Parks and Public Open Space" to "Medium-Density Residential," and the City's Zoning Map would be amended to change the Zoning District classification of this new parcel from "O – Open Space" to R-2-PD, i.e. R-2 Residential, with a Planned Development Overlay. It is anticipated that the P.D. Overlay will specify standards and requirements for the development of the site for up to 130 single family detached homes. The subdivision would have up to 130 residential lots sized at least 35 feet by 70 feet. The homes can be up to three stories in height, with variety in home sizes permitted. Each home would have two covered parking spaces, and the new neighborhood would provide off-street guest parking. The new neighborhood would have three entry points: (1) off Island Drive by way of Clubhouse Memorial Road; (2) off Maitland Drive; and (3) off Flower Road.

3. **Construction and operation of 12 acres of active recreational facilities and public sports fields on 12 acres of land located in the Harbor Bay Business Park on North Loop Road.** Under the proposal, the 12 acres on North Loop Road will become part of the City's public park system and developed with public sports fields.

Also, the City's General Plan would need to be amended to change the Land Use designation of the North Loop Road parcels from "Business Park" to "Parks and Public Open Space," and the City's Zoning Map would be amended to change the Zoning District classification of the North Loop Road parcels from "C-M-PD (Commercial-Manufacturing, with a Planned Development Overlay)" to "O – Open Space." Preliminary plans for the site include two soccer fields and two baseball fields and supportive facilities such as public restrooms, a concession stand, and off-street parking areas could be accommodated on the North Loop Road parcels.

Mr. Thomas mentioned that the City received over 150 letters of opposition to the land swap project.

Board member Zuppan asked how the Park Maintenance Fund was going to pay for the additional sports fields and will there be a tipping point with the traffic study regarding the impact during a lane closure on Island Drive. She also asked who would be paying for the EIR and additional studies concerning the project.

Mr. Thomas responded that that one of the unanswered questions regarding the project is how is the City going to fund the maintenance of the new sports fields. He acknowledged that the impacts of a lane closure should be looked at in the traffic study. He reported that all studies and staff expenses will be paid for by the applicant.

President Ezzy Ashcraft asked where the number of 130 homes came from.

Mr. Thomas responded that HBIA came up with the total.

Board member Henneberry asked why the Planning Board was hearing the item if no action was being taken.

Mr. Thomas stated that the project has caused a lot of public outcry and the City wanted to get all of the information out to the residents prior to it being heard by the City Council.

Board member Burton asked if a study has or will be done to attest that the Golf Complex improvements will bring in more rounds/revenue to the facility. He also questioned the \$7.2 million dollar amount to build the sports fields yet the actual cost has not yet been determined and can that original amount be increased should future studies show the cost to be more.

Mr. Thomas responded the National Golf Foundation (NGF) analyzed the Golf Complex in 2008 and recommended that improvements would help with the revenue and rounds. He stated that the \$7.2 million dollar amount is certainly open for discussion.

The motion was made and seconded to limit the speaker time to 3 minutes due to the large

number of speakers. Motion approved 4-0.

President Ezzy Ashcraft opened the public comment period.

Michael Robles-Wong, Community of Harbor Bay Isle Owners Assoc., spoke in opposition of the project.

James Leach, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Lola Brown, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Norma Arnerich, Golf Complex Beautification Program, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Connie Wendling, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

George Humphreys, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Sam Moriana, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Barbara Hoepner, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Dorothy Moody, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Alexander Stevens, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Red Wetherill, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Sandy Sullivan, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Jim Strehlow, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Brian Schumacher, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Brad Murphy, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Dianne Emery, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Len Peters, CLASS, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

George Gammell, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Lil Arnerich, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Ken Peterson, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Barbara Price, North Loop Business Group, wanted to ensure that at no time would the vacant land at North Loop Road be considered for residential development.

Dan Saso, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Joe Van Winkle, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

James Manning, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Patricia Gannon, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Karen Bey, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

William Smith, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Bill McNamara, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Jane Sullwold, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Trish Spencer, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Jon Spangler, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Nancy Hird, ACT, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

Hilary Woo, resident, spoke in opposition to the land swap.

President Ezzy Ashcraft closed the public comment period.

President Ezzy Ashcraft asked for clarification on the Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) Item #7 which reads:

"HBIA's Work with Harbor Bay Business Park-HBIA shall make commercially reasonable efforts to work with other property owners and businesses in the Harbor Bay Business Park to encourage them to agree to make financial contributions to the cost of construction of the new sports fields and related facilities, and to encourage them to arrange for the ongoing maintenance of the sports fields and related facilities to be included in the scope of work of the Harbor Bay Business Park Zone of the City's Island City Landscape and Lighting District 84-2 and paid for from assessments levied on the properties in the Harbor Bay Business Park".

Mr. Thomas responded that the owners in the Harbor Bay Business Park have special assessments on their property taxes for the maintenance of the business park and HBIA is going to try and convince the business owners to include the maintenance of the Sports Complex and facilities in their assessment district.

President Ezzy Ashcraft asked if HBIA has secured any agreements so far and if the property owners do not agree what are the other alternatives.

Mr. Thomas stated that HBIA has not secured any agreements with the business owners and the other alternatives have not been discussed.

President Ezzy Ashcraft expressed concern regarding economic development and requiring businesses to maintain these types of facilities.

Board member Burton reiterated the fact that there are quite a few unknowns about the potential costs associated with the project and very little guarantees that the City would not end up accruing costs for the maintenance or the facilities.

President Ezzy Ashcraft mentioned that read the following summary of the three emails received supporting the project into the record:

Doric Development created Harbor Bay Isle, which is a very nice development.  
130 new homes will bring more property tax money to the City.  
Please vote yes.

She recapped on other emails received but concerns not mentioned tonight:  
3-story homes, not consistent with Bay Farm Island homes.  
Only one bridge to get on and off the island.  
Lack of homes for the elderly or disabled.

Board member Zuppan stated that the traffic problems need to consider other areas of Alameda. Also how will the project affect the Golf Complex and the wildlife there with the construction, traffic, and increase population? She stated concern that a speaker mentioned that the City is killing squirrels at the Golf Complex.

10. WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS: **None.**

11. BOARD COMMUNICATIONS: **None.**

12. ADJOURNMENT: **11:25 p.m.**