

**MINUTES OF HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD
REGULAR MEETING OF THURSDAY, AUGUST 7, 2008
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL
2263 SANTA CLARA AVENUE – 7:00 PM**

CONVENE: 7:02 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: Vice Chair Miller, Board Members Irons and Lynch

ABSENT: None

STAFF PRESENT: Jon Biggs, Planning Services Manager/Secretary to the Historical Advisory Board; Doug Vu, Planner III; Tony Ebster, Permit Technician I/Recording Secretary

MINUTES: Minutes from the meeting of June 5, 2008
Motion (Lynch)/Second (Irons) to Approve with changes
Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: None
Motion Carries

Minutes from the meeting of July 3, 2008
Motion (Irons)/Second (Lynch) to Approve with changes
Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 0
Motion Carries

AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSIONS:

None

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS:

Stuart Ricard addressed the Board regarding the Del Monte building.

WRITTEN COMMUNICATION:

None

REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS:

(7-A) Certificate of Approval – PLN08-0244 – 1327 Sherman Street. The applicant requests a Certificate of Approval for demolition of more than thirty percent (30%) of the value of a single-family residence built in 1905. Exterior alterations including a 123 square foot addition, roofline changes, as well as new and replacement windows.

Mr. Jon Biggs presented the staff report and noted the changes made to the project in response to Board comments.

Board Member Lynch reminded the Board of the gable issue.

Board Member Irons commended the designer and applicants for their flexibility.
Motion (Lynch)/ Second (Miller) to approve the Certificate of Approval with conditions.
Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 0
Motion carries.

(7-B) Certificate of Approval – PLN08-0035 – 1150 Bay Street. The applicant requests a Certificate of Approval to alter more than thirty percent (30%) of the value of a historically designated residential building for the purpose of remodeling a previous addition and adding a front porch.

Mr. Doug Vu presented the staff report.

Board Member Lynch asked if there were any pictures from the 1979 survey indicating what the building looked like at the time.

Board Member Irons asked about the front yard setback.

Vice Chair Miller opened the public comment.

Mr. Craig Coombs, representing the property owners, addressed the Board regarding the design and gave some history of the project and its progression.

Mr. Jerry Wilkins, with Custom Kitchens, addressed the Board. He gave a brief history of the work his company has done and shared some of his experiences with remodeling homes around the Bay Area.

Mr. Robert Ramos addressed the Board regarding the setback of the porch and stated that it goes beyond the seven feet allowed. He expressed concern regarding the view from his house and said it would be obstructed if the project is built as designed.

Mr. Jeff Oster addressed the Board and said that he feels that the property owners should be able to do what they want with their properties. However, he felt that the preservation of this neighborhood block is necessary. He also stated that he feels this project may set an undesirable precedent.

Mr. Christopher Buckley with the Alameda Architecture Preservation Society addressed the Board regarding the front setbacks and stated that he feels their uniformity is what makes the neighborhood unique.

Board Member Lynch said that it was an exciting proposal but was concerned about the precedent that would be set if the porch was built as proposed. She asked about alternatives to the design of the porch.

Mr. Vu replied said that they had talked about alternative designs and could pursue a design that was similar to other houses in the neighborhood.

Board Member Irons pointed out that there were drawings in the supplemental report that illustrate other options. He read from the report including the Secretary of Interior's standards regarding the construction of new additions. He also discussed the front yard setbacks.

Vice Chair Miller expressed concern with the precedent that would be set if the project is built as proposed.

Board Member Irons asked about the encroachment into the side yard and if there were zoning issues involved.

Mr. Vu replied that the applicant would need a variance to allow the addition to encroach into the setback.

Mr. Woody Minor asked how the changes were reviewed under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). He said as much information should be obtained as possible to make a sound judgment with regards to the remodel.

Mr. Minor noted that out the building permit ledger book was available in the Planning & Building Department and that this book may contain more information on the structure.

Mr. Biggs clarified CEQA review, and suggested that the Board could refer the project back to the applicants to obtain more information on the history of the structure and to redesign the project.

Board Member Lynch stated that she believes there is not enough information to make a decision and that the design needs to be addressed.

Motion (Lynch)/Second (Miller) to refer the project back to the applicant to restudy the design and allow staff to obtain more information on the history of the structure and continue the item to the meeting of September 4, 2008.

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 0

Motion carries.

(7-C) PLN08-0185 – 1501 Buena Vista Avenue. The applicant proposes structural alterations, including alterations to the building's exterior, for the rehabilitation of the Del Monte Building. The Board will review and comment on findings regarding the consistency of the proposed alterations with the *Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Restoration*.

Mr. Biggs presented the staff report.

Board Member Lynch inquired about the number of rooms the hotel would have. She also asked about material and color samples for the proposed alterations, and if they would go to the Board.

Mr. Michael Rockhold, architect, presented the project to the Board.

Board Member Lynch asked about the letters that Mr. Rockhold mentioned regarding the status of the property, including its listing as a federal historic monument.

Mr. Steve O'Brien, architect, gave a presentation about the proposed structural modifications.

Ms. Eliza Skaggs, historic preservation consultant, described some of the history of the Del Monte property.

Ms. Erin McKlosky, historic preservation consultant, discussed some of the existing conditions and the preservation work that would be done.

Mr. O'Brien talked about some of the interior elements of the design proposal. He also talked about the openings and the awning over the loading dock.

Board Member Miller asked about the awning and the material that is being proposed.

Mr. O'Brien offered to provide a sample of the awning material.

Mr. Rockhold addressed the letters that Board Member Lynch asked about. He clarified the stages that the project must go through and noted that they are through the second stage.

Board Member Irons asked about the solar panels and how they are integrated into the roof. He also expressed concern regarding the heating and cooling of the big, open space.

Board Member Lynch asked if the Board could receive updates on the project and what they were drilling for.

Mr. Rockhold said that he would be glad to update the Board as they wish.

Mr. Woody Minor expressed his confusion regarding the certification process. He reiterated that this site is one of the last historic industrial buildings left in Alameda. He encouraged the Board to scrutinize the project as much as possible.

Mr. Barbara Kerr expressed her concern with the project and stated that it does not conform to the Northern Waterfront General Plan Amendment. She also expressed concern with the landscaping, noting that it needs to conform to the City's General Plan.

Mr. Christopher Buckley commended the project and expressed excitement that it is moving forward. He also addressed a few points in the letter the Alameda Architectural Preservation Society sent to the Board regarding elements of the design including:

- Retention of the corrugated metal canopies
- Maintenance of industrial sash look in new ground floor windows
- Recessing the ground floor windows

Mr. Anthony Jones addressed the Board and expressed excitement about the building being rehabilitated. He asked about the supermarket and what kind of market it is going to be. He also asked if the hotel is going to be economically sustainable.

Vice Chair Miller expressed his concern with how the windows would be installed.

Ms. Barbara Kerr expressed her concern with the parking and the parcel on the corner of Buena Vista and Sherman and the ownership and transfer of the parcel.

Mr. Jon Biggs clarified questions regarding the parcel

The Board expressed some concerns with the design elements and how they would to be implemented. They asked questions concerning the new windows, glass awning and the maintenance of the awning. The Board asked how the developers had decided on the materials that they are proposing to use.

The design team replied by saying that the decisions were made based on the practicality of the application and how it would be maintained. They were also given input by federal and state agencies on how to incorporate the new design elements.

The Board clarified that they are supposed to look at the entire site and not just the building. They would like to see plans for signage, landscape, lighting and other aspects of the project, such as samples of the materials to be used.

Board Member Lynch expressed her concern regarding how the renovation would affect the surrounding neighborhood and wanted to ensure that the historic character of the neighborhood will be preserved.

The Board added conditions to the project that would require that certain aspects of the project come back to the Board at a later time for review and approval. The Board also wanted to ensure that the project complies with appropriate elements of the General Plan and the Northern Waterfront Plan.

Motion (Irons)/ Second (Lynch) to approve the Certificate of Approval based on the findings suggested by staff and subject to the following special conditions in addition to the other conditions in the resolution of approval for this project:

Ayes: 3; Noes: 0; Absent: 0

Motion Carries

Special Conditions –

- Materials and features are to come back to the Historical Advisory Board for review and approval rather than staff.
- The project must be compliant with the Northern Waterfront General Plan.
- The landscape plan for the Del Monte Site must come back to the Historical Advisory Board for approval.
- The exterior lighting plan for the Del Monte Site must come back to the Historical Advisory Board for approval.

BOARD COMMUNICATIONS:

Board Member Lynch mentioned there would be a lecture regarding the Del Monte building on Thursday, September 25, 2008 as part of the 2008 Alameda Museum Lecture Series.

STAFF COMMUNICATIONS:

Mr. Biggs stated the Board had been provided a copy of their rules and procedures. He also mentioned that there will be workshop on heritage tourism in Monterey on September 19, 2008.

ADJOURNMENT: 10:49 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted by:

Jon Biggs

Planning Services Manager/Secretary, Historical Advisory Board