

National Committee on Uniform Traffic Control Devices

13236 North 7th Street, Suite 4-259, Phoenix, Arizona 85022 Phone/Text: 231-4-NCUTCD (231-462-8823) E-mail: secretary@ncutcd.org Website: https://ncutcd.org

National Committee on Uniform Traffic Control Devices (NCUTCD)

Recommended Changes to Proposed Text for 11th Edition of the MUTCD

Docket Number: FHWA-2020-0001

3 4 5

6

7

8

9

10

11

1

2

Federal Register Item Number: 453 to 459 NPA MUTCD Section Numbers: Chapter 5B

Legend: Base text shown in proposal is the NPA "clean" proposed text.

- NCUTCD recommendation for text to be added in final rule.
- NCUTCD recommendation for text to be deleted in final rule.
- NCUTCD recommendation for text to be moved/relocated in final rule.
- NPA text that was not previously approved by NCUTCD but is now approved.
- Explanatory note: [Note that explains purpose of recommended change.]

12 13 14

The following pages present NCUTCD recommendations for changes to the MUTCD NPA proposed text for Chapter 5B. Below is a summary of the NCUTCD position for each section of this chapter. A more detailed summary is provided at the beginning of each section.

16 17 18

20

23

24

15

- NPA #453, Chapter 5B: NCUTCD agrees with NPA (no changes recommended).
- 19 NPA #454, Section 5B.01: Changes recommended based on Council action in virtual meetings in spring 2021.
 - NPA #455, Section 5B.02: Changes recommended based on Council action in virtual meetings in spring 2021.
- NPA #456, Section 5B.03: Changes recommended based on Council action in virtual meetings in spring 2021.
- NPA #457, Section 5B.04: Changes recommended based on Council action in virtual meetings in spring 2021.
 - NPA #458, Section 5B.05: Changes recommended based on Council action in virtual meetings in spring 2021.
 - NPA #459, Section 5B.06: Changes recommended based on Council action in virtual meetings in spring 2021.

25

26 27

28

CHAPTER 5B. PROVISIONS FOR TRAFFIC CONTROL DEVICES

29 30 31

32 33 **Part 5 Comments:** This is a new Part added to the MUTCD in the NPA. NCUTCD recommends all of Part 5 be revised from Standard, Guidance, or Option to Support so agencies can obtain information they can use to prepare their network for Automated Vehicles (AVs) and continue to be in compliance with the Manual without the burden of having to conform to new provisions in Part 5 different from those in other parts of the MUTCD.

34 35

3637

New Section 5B.01 Comments: NCUTCD recommends adding a new Support section to Chapter 5B to reinforce the intent of this Chapter.

42 43 44

45

46

47 48

49

50

41

5B.01 General

Support:

The purpose of this Chapter is to provide agencies with specific traffic control device provisions that support automated vehicle deployment. The provisions described in this Chapter are based on the current body of knowledge recognizing that this is an evolving area.

Agencies can help to prepare a roadway to support the safe deployment of automated vehicle technology by focusing maintenance, replacement and new construction on the uniform application of traffic control devices as described below. [New section to reinforce the intent of this Chapter]

51 52

53 54

55

56

57

61

62

63 64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

82

83

Section 5B.01 Comments: NCUTCD recommends revising 5B.01 (now 5B.02) as follows:

- Revise Guidance to Support (see general Part 5 comment)
- Revise references to DAS to AVs
- 58 Add section references as appropriate
- 59 • Revise content for simplicity and clarity and delete content that is unnecessary or not specific to 60 AVs
 - Revise the content on LED refresh rate to simplify wording and add reference to FCC compliance (47 CFR)

Section 5B.012 Signs

Support:

DAS AVs uses machine vision technology to locate, read, and comprehend traffic signs and appropriately make vehicle operational decisions. Location, condition, uniformity, design characteristics, and consistent application (see Sections 2A.04 to 2A.21) all affect the ability of machine vision to perform these functions.

Guidance: [changed to Support]

Sign location and application of should be clearly associated with the displayed message to the specific lane or road to which it applies, such as in In the case of parallel roads or lanes with different speed limits or restrictions, AV operation can be enhanced by sign applications that of should be clearly associated with the displayed message to the specific lane or road to which it applies. [relocated text and edited for clarity]

The practice of sign and information spreading (see Section 24.19) should be used to limit the amount of information displayed in one location or on one sign to minimize sign clutter.

Signs with designs that are otherwise not provided for in this Manual or the Standard Highway Signs publication should use standardized sign design practices and features as provided for in this Manual for the type of sign, the location, and character of the roadway on which it is used. [delete as unnecessary and not specific to AVs]

AV detection The illuminated portion of fixed-location CMS electronic display signs using LEDs should have a standard refresh/flicker rate. The can be enhanced by application of an LED refresh rate of the LEDs should be greater than 200 Hz to reduce refresh/flicker rate impacts (for refresh rates above 240 Hz consider FCC compliance under 47CFR part 2, subpart J; part 15, subpart B; and part 90, subpart J). be easier for the camera to detect. [edited for clarity and expanded to provide additional information]

84 85

- 89 Section 5B.02 Comments: NCUTCD recommends revising 5B.02 (now 5B.03) as follows:
- Revise Guidance to Support (see general Part 5 comment)
- Revise references to DAS to AVs
- Revise content for simplicity and clarity and delete content that is unnecessary or not specific to AVs
 - Delete references to line widths, as this is addressed in Part 3
 - Relocate material on work zones to 5B.04 (now 5B.05)
- Add a reference to broken lines with 15-foot line segments and 25-foot gaps on Interstates,
 freeways, and expressways in accordance with NCUTCD recommendation 19B-MKG-02
 - Delete references to decorative items in crosswalks, since NCUTCD is unaware of specific information relative to negative impacts of decorative elements in crosswalks on roadways with low speeds

Section 5B.023 Markings

Support:

94

95

98

99

100

101 102

103

104

105 106

107

108

109

110

111

112 113

114

115

116 117

118

119

120

121

122

123 124

125

126

127

128

129 130

131

132

133

134

DAS AVs uses machine vision camera technology to locate, read and comprehend pavement markings. Location, condition, uniformity, design characteristics, and consistent application all have some effect on the ability of machine vision to perform this function. Certain pavement marking applications and practices have been shown through research to better support AV operations, while also benefiting, or at least not detracting from, the performance of the human operator. Such practices include the following:

- A. Normal-width longitudinal lines on freeways, expressways, and ramps of at least 6 inches wide (see Section 3A.04).
- B. Edge lines of at least 6 inches in width on roadways with posted speeds greater than 40 mph (see Section 3B.09). [delete line width is addressed in Part 3]

Guidance: [Change to Support]

The following should be considered to better accommodate machine vision used to support the automation of vehicles:

- A. Normal width longitudinal lines of at least 6 inches wide on conventional roadways. [delete line width is addressed in Part 3]
- BA. Edge lines of at least 6 inches in width on conventional roadways with posted speeds of 40 mph or greater less. [retain, as this statement is specific to supporting driving automation system technologies, since many lane departure warning and lane-keeping technologies engage when vehicle speeds reach 40 mph]
- C. Dotted edge line extensions along all entrance and exit ramps, all auxiliary lanes, and all tapers where a deceleration or auxiliary lane is added (see Section 3B.11). [delete addressed in Part 3]
- DB. Chevron markings (see Section 3B.25) in the neutral areas of exit gores to distinguish them from travel lanes.
- E. Continuous markings at the beginning of work zones and in all lane transitions [relocate to 5B.04 (now 5B.05)]
- F. Raised pavement markers only as a supplement to, rather than as a substitute for, markings (see Sections 3B.16 and 3B.17). [delete addressed in Part 3]
- GC. Uniform contrast markings on light-colored pavements to create greater contrast.
- H. Broken lines (see Section 3B.06) of at least 10 ft in length with a maximum gap of 30 ft. [delete addressed in Part 3]
- D. Broken lines with 15-foot line segments and 25-foot gaps on Interstates, freeways, and expressways. [add per 19B-MKG-02]
- I. Avoidance of decorative elements in crosswalks. [delete unsupported]

Section 5B.03 Comments: NCUTCD recommends revising 5B.03 (now 5B.04) as follows:

- Revise Guidance to Support (see general Part 5 comment)
- Revise content for simplicity and clarity and delete content that is unnecessary or not specific to AVs
- Revise the content on LED refresh rate to specify a refresh rate greater than 200 Hz, since refresh
 rates below 200 Hz may cause traffic signal indications to appear dark to machine vision, even if
 they appear normal to human vision
- Add a reference to signal backplates with retroreflective borders, since machine vision may not
 recognize the presence of the traffic signal, especially at night also, retroreflective backplates
 corroborate the presence of the traffic signal and the need to treat a dark signal as a stop condition
- Add content on the use of flashing yellow arrows for permissive left turns, since a circular green
 indication over an exclusive turn lane could be mistaken as a protected turn treatment by machine
 vision

Section 5B.034 Highway Traffic Signals

Guidance Support: [change to Support]

The following considerations *should* can be used to better accommodate machine vision used to support the automation of vehicles and benefit the performance of the human vehicle operator:

- A. Consistency of Ttraffic signal design should be consistent along corridors with respect to the placement of signal faces overhead on span-wire and mast arms versus post-mounting on the side of the roadway.
- B. Consistency along a corridor in <u>T</u>the number of signal faces for approach lanes and the selection of signal indications and signal clusters <u>should be consistent along a corridor</u> to promote uniform displays for identical or similar situations.
- C. The Refresh rates greater than 200 Hz (see Section 5B.02) of the LED traffic signals should be consistent throughout the jurisdiction and be greater than 200 Hz to allow for greater consistency in machine vision detection.

[specify refresh rates above 200 Hz]

- D. Providing signal faces with backplates having retroreflective borders (see Section 4D.05) to make signals more prominent and detectable by machine vision systems.

 [add material on backplates]
- E. <u>Using signal display designs that utilize a FLASHING YELLOW ARROW for permissive left-turns.</u>

 <u>Signal faces that display a CIRCULAR GREEN indication and which are located over or directly in line with a left-turn lane can be difficult for machine vision systems to interpret regarding left-turn right of way.</u>

[add material on permissive left turns]

Support:

Achieving uniformity along a corridor is desirable for machine vision technology, but can be challenging. Multiple options are available for traffic signal displays to allow design variations based on specific intersection variables such as available overhead clearance, utility conflicts, signal support design constraints and other factors. Where possible, connected and automated vehicles (CAV) needs with respect to traffic signals are better addressed through vehicle to infrastructure everything (V2XI) for the reasons stated above and for reliability and accuracy of critical communications under all environmental conditions.

Section 5B.04 Comments: NCUTCD recommends revising 5B.04 (now 5B.05) as follows:

- Revise Guidance to Support (see general Part 5 comment)
- Extensively revise content for simplicity and clarity and delete content that is unnecessary or not specific to AVs
- Add content on markings from 5B.02 (now 5B.03)

2.12

Section 5B.045 Temporary Traffic Control

Guidance: [change to Support]

Considerations should be given to better accommodate machine vision used to support the automation of vehicles and benefit the performance of the human vehicle operator in and through work zones.

The type of signs, spacing and mounting height should follow the requirements of Section 6B.04 Advance Warning Area and 6F.02 Sign Placement. The END ROAD WORK (G20-2) sign should be used to establish the end of the work zone. [Moved and reworded as item A below] Standard: Support:

Automated vehicles use machine vision technology to detect and safely navigate work zones. The following considerations can be used to support the automated vehicles and benefit the performance of the human vehicle operator:

- A. Uniform application and maintenance of TTC devices (Section 6A.03).
- B. Maintenance of Existing pavement markings shall be maintained in all long-term stationary (see Section 6G.02) temporary traffic control zones in accordance with Chapters 3A and 3B, except as otherwise provided for temporary pavement markings in Section 6F.78. Pavement markings shall match the alignment of the markings in place at both ends of the TTC zone.
- C. Use of Pavement markings as applicable (see Part 3) shall be placed along the entire length of any paved detour or temporary roadway prior to the detour or roadway being opened to road users.
- D. Removal of or obliterate pavement markings that are no longer applicable as soon as practical, for long-term stationary operations in the temporary traveled way. shall be. Pavement marking obliteration shall remove the non-applicable pavement marking material, and the obliteration method shall minimize pavement scarring. Painting over existing pavement markings with black paint or spraying with asphalt shall not be accepted as a substitute for removal or obliteration.

Guidance: [change to Support]

To better accommodate machine vision used to support the automation of vehicles,

- E. Use of wider channelizing devices should be (at least 8 inches wide) with retroreflective material to machine detection in all weather conditions.
- F. Use of continuous markings at the beginning of work zones and in lane transitions, Markings entering the work zone and through lane shifts should be made with highly visible and continuous materials, (not intermittent buttons and reflectors). [relocated from 5B.02 (now 5B.03) and edited]

- Section 5B.05 Comments: NCUTCD recommends revising 5B.05 (now 5B.06) as follows:
- Revise Guidance to Support (see general Part 5 comment)
- Extensively revise content for simplicity and clarity and delete content that is unnecessary or not specific to AVs

237238239

240

241

242

243

244245

246

247

248249

250

251

252

253

254

255

256

257

258

259

260

261

262

234

235

236

Section 5B.056 Traffic Control for Railroad and Light Rail Transit Grade Crossings

Support Guidance: [change to Support]

Automated vehicles use machine vision technology to detect and comprehend signs and markings at active and passive grade crossings.

Promote uniformity and improve the ability of machine vision technology to recognize grade crossings, by providing consistent location and condition of the appropriate signs and markings, including the removal of signs and markings associated with railroad crossings and tracks that are paved over, removed, out of service, or no longer active (see Section 8A.09 and 8B.08).

For passive and active grade crossings, placement of signs and markings should be consistent along a corridor to promote uniformity and to improve the ability of machine vision technology to recognize highway-rail grade crossings.

V2X is one example of communication technology that can be used to relay information regarding the arrival or presence of a train at a grade crossing.

For active grade crossings, V2I communication should be used to relay information on the arrival or presence of a train at a highway rail grade crossing. [edited for clarity]

To better accommodate machine vision used to support the automation of vehicles, the signs and pavement markings associated with railroad crossings and tracks that are no longer active should be removed. [edited for clarity]

Where possible, the use of V2X infrastructure can improve reliability and accuracy of critical communications at grade crossings and involves coordination with and approval by the railroad, transit agency, road authority and regulatory agency with statutory authority (if applicable).

Support:

Where possible, CAV needs with respect to highway rail grade crossings are better addressed through V2I infrastructure for reasons of reliability and accuracy of critical communications under all environmental conditions. [edited for clarity]

263264265

266267

268269

270

Section 5B.06 Comments: NCUTCD recommends revising 5B.06 (now 5B.07) as follows:

- Revise Guidance to Support (see general Part 5 comment)
- Revise content on segregated bicycle facilities, as separation is inappropriate, infeasible, or impractical due to cost or maintenance impacts on a large percentage of streets or highways
- Delete the sentence referencing markings for the ends of bike lanes, as no uniform markings have vet been established for this condition

271272273

274

275

276

277

278

Section 5B.067 Traffic Control for Bicycle Facilities

Guidance: Support: [change to Support]

To better accommodate machine vision used to support the automation of vehicles, bicycle facilities should be segregated from other vehicle traffic using physical barriers where practicable.

Bicycle facilities that are separated from other vehicle traffic using physical barriers better accommodate machine vision used to support the automation of vehicles. [revise]

Road markings should indicate the end of a bike lane that is merged with other traffic. [delete]