| **Total Deficiencies** | 21 |
| --- | --- |
| **Merged Deficiencies** | 8 |
| **Valid Deficiencies** | 1 |
| **Invalid Deficiencies** | 7 |

| **Merged Deficiency Category** | **Overall Response** | **Deficiency ID** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Incorrect Deficiencies** | * Deficiencies aren’t entirely true.   + D1: Referring a paper to utilize it’s approach   + D2: First deficiency location incorrect. Conclusion is correct.   + D3: Page 71 has DOI. It doesn't impact information conveyance. | **D1, D2, D3** |
| **Incorrect Interpretation** | Favored XG-Boost for accuracy from table discussions (D4). Aimed readers to build ML models from the survey paper (D19). Data-Preprocessing/NLP means both or either (D21), NLP explanation: 4.5. | **D4, D19, D21** |
| **Unspecified Abbreviations** | Abbreviating is standard in technology reports for concise communication, not indicating a deficiency. We either clarify in the detailed results section or omit non-relevant details due to the 70-page limit. | **D5, D18** |
| **Paper Age & Relevance** | Content matters, not the year. The paper concisely elucidates efficient privacy preserving data mining approach, proving its relevance regardless of time. | **D6, D20** |
| **Incorrect page numbers** | The table of contents includes hyperlinks for easy navigation, ensuring no significant deficiency as all information remains intact. | **D7, D13** |
| **Blurry Images** | We have explained the figure in the text and the image is visible and clear. So this is not a major deficiency. | **D8** |
| **Lack of Information** | We have contained all the relevant details. Any omissions were either irrelevant or had no impact on conveyed information. | **D14, D15** |
| **Error in Citations** | Human Error. We had to rearrange the papers and they got incorrectly numbered. | **D9, D10, D11, D12, D16, D17** |

| **ID** | **Name** | **Deficiency** | **Response** | **Verdict** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| D1 | Prakhar Gupta | **Incorrect Deficiencies** Wrong citations are given for [11], [14]. Also [37] was a research paper on cloud security, but cited for cyber-bullying | * Deficiencies aren’t entirely true.   + D1: Referring a paper to utilize it’s approach | **INVALID** |
| D2 | Prakhar Gupta | **IIncorrect Deficiencies**  [45]’s Conclusion was its Introduction and vice versa, [15] talks about fig 4.3.1 which is from [38] | * Deficiencies aren’t entirely true.   + D2: First deficiency location incorrect. Conclusion is correct. | **INVALID** |
| D3 | Prakhar Gupta | **Incorrect Deficiencies** Certain reference entries lack DOI, Secure multiparty computation(SMC) was acronymized as SCM | * Deficiencies aren’t entirely true.   + D3: Page 71 has DOI. It doesn't impact information conveyance. | **INVALID** |
| D4 | Sai Nikhit Gulla | **Incorrect interpretation** "Table 4.4.2 Result Summary " is listed on line 8 and page 34 but not referred to in the narrative text. | We discussed the table and concluded that the XG-Boost is the most accurate. We concluded that because of that table only. | **INVALID** |
| D5 | Sai Nikhit Gulla | **Unspecified Abbreviations** Abbreviations "CNN" and "Bi-LSTM" without definition in the text on line 4, page 10 of the report. | We are talking about the deep neural networks discussed and we just provided examples of those types of CNN in this section. And we abbreviated and explained clearly in the detailed summary section | **INVALID** |
| D6 | Sai Nikhit Gulla | **Paper Age and Relevance** Reference 44 listed on line 1 and page 74 is older than 2020 | Content matters, not the year. The paper concisely elucidates an efficient privacy preserving data mining approach, proving its relevance regardless of time. | **INVALID** |
| D7 | Zachary Ipema | **Incorrect page numbers** In the Table of Contents, the Conclusion section is labeled at page 41 when it starts at page 61. | Not a major deficiency.  None of the information got miscommunicated and we've provided hyperlinks so anyone can navigate to sections. The page numbers were automated in the Google docs and it might have changed at the end. | **INVALID** |
| D8 | Zachary Ipema | **Blurry Images** Figure 4.5.4 is blurry and unreadable without excessive zooming in. | We have explained the figure in the text and the image is visible and clear. So not a major deficiency. | **INVALID** |
| D9 | Zachary Ipema | **Error in Citations** Paper 43 has 2 different sections in the Conclusion area even though all conclusions are grouped together by each reference. | Human Error. We had to rearrange the papers and they got incorrectly numbered. | **VALID** |
| D10 | Akash Nair | **Error in Citations** Mentions Paper [45] but no citation is present in the references  section. | Human Error. We had to rearrange the papers and they got incorrectly numbered. | **VALID** |
| D11 | Akash Nair | **Error in Citations** The reference made to paper [44] in the summary does not accurately represent the content of paper [44] | Human Error. We had to rearrange the papers and they got incorrectly numbered. | **VALID** |
| D12 | Akash Nair | **Error in Citations** The summary provides an inaccurate interpretation of the  content presented in the referenced paper [11] | Human Error. We had to rearrange the papers and they got incorrectly numbered. | **VALID** |
| D13 | Teja Reddy Nagireddy | **Incorrect page numbers**  Incorrect page number listed for "Conclusions and Recommendations" section. | The table of contents includes hyperlinks for easy navigation, ensuring no significant deficiency as all information remains intact. | **INVALID** |
| D14 | Teja Reddy Nagireddy | **Lack of Information**  Insufficient information on WEKA's feature selection process. | We have contained all the relevant details. Any omissions were either irrelevant or had no impact on conveyed information. | **INVALID** |
| D15 | Teja Reddy Nagireddy | **Lack of Information**  Absence of an overarching conclusion summarizing the project's findings and outcomes | We have contained all the relevant details. Any omissions were either irrelevant or had no impact on conveyed information. | **INVALID** |
| D16 | Esha Sood | **Error in Citations** Paper [45] has a conclusion but absent from References; it's not cited elsewhere in the document. | Human Error. We had to rearrange the papers and they got incorrectly numbered. | **VALID** |
| D17 | Esha Sood | **Error in Citations** The section incorporates two tables from paper [15] but incorrectly cites them as figures from [16]. | Human Error. We had to rearrange the papers and they got incorrectly numbered. | **VALID** |
| D18 | Esha Sood | **Unspecified Abbreviations** Full forms of abbreviations IMAP, ROC, AUC not mentioned even once; P, R, Acc meanings unclear. | We are discussing only the machine learning models. Given the content limit, we could only talk about the models and their accuracy and we felt we had added the required information. | **INVALID** |
| D19 | Debbie Thai | **Incorrect Interpretation** Page 7, Line 8: Misleading goals, paper identifies building machine learning models and creating adaptive learning systems but no new models were developed | This content focuses on studying rather than developing models. It aims to help readers detect suspicious activities in social media, empowering them to build such models—a primary objective. | **INVALID** |
| D20 | Debbie Thai | **Paper Age & Relevance** Page 24, line 2: Reference from 2004, data mining is a rapidly evolving field and sources more than 10 y/o may not be as relevant | Content matters, not the year. The paper concisely elucidates efficient privacy preserving data mining approach, proving its relevance regardless of time. | **INVALID** |
| D21 | Debbie Thai | **Incorrect Interpretation** Page 6, line 8: Misleading line that suggests that NLP and data preprocessing are equivalent, and overall lack of explanation for NLP | We mentioned Data Preprocessing/NLP—A/B implies A, or B, or both, not equating A to B. Section 4.1 features 7 papers exclusively addressing Data Preprocessing and NLP. | **INVALID** |

| **NAME OF EVALUATOR** | **NUMBER OF DEFICIENCIES SUBMITTED** | **DEFICIENCY ID NUMBER** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Prakhar Gupta | 3 | D1, D2, D3 |
| Sai Nikhit Gulla | 3 | D4, D5, D6 |
| Zachary Ipema | 3 | D7, D8, D9 |
| Akash Ajay Nair | 3 | D10, D11, D12 |
| Teja Reddy Nagireddy | 3 | D13, D14, D15 |
| Esha Naveen Sood | 3 | D16, D17, D18 |
| Debbie Thai | 3 | D19, D20, D21 |