CENG 796 - Peer-review form

Reviewed project ID: Group 04

Reviewed project's title (title of the paper): MaskGIT: Masked Generative Image Transformer

Reviewer name(s): Batuhan Bal, Onat Özdemir

Instructions:
- Answer = *Yes*, *No* or *Partial*.
- You may expand sections as necessary.
- For most questions, you do not need to add comments, unless the instructions tell you otherwise.
- "Notebook" refers to "Jupyter Notebook" file that is expected to be named as main.ipynb

Question	Answer	Comments
Contains a jupyter notebook file	Yes	
Notebook is located at <project_root>/main.ipynb	Yes	
Notebook's first section contains paper information (paper title, paper authors, and project group members' name & contact information) Some good examples: see group03, group10, group11 (and a couple of other groups).	Yes	
Notebook contains a section for hyper-parameters of the model.	Yes	
Notebook contains a section for training & saving the model.	Partial	The notebook calls the train function implemented in an external Python file (train.py). The model saving part is also given in this external file. However, the implementation of this function is not directly given in the notebook.
Notebook contains a section (or a few sections) for loading a pre-trained model & computing qualitative samples/outputs.	Partial	Again it would be better if there is a separate section for this which includes a code snippet for model loading.
Notebook contains reproduced plots and/or tables, as declared.	Partial	The notebook contains reproduced qualitative results. However, the quantitative results are not given in the notebook.
Notebook contains pre-computed outputs.	Yes	There are pre-computed qualitative results.

Data is included and/or a proper download script is provided.	Yes	
Notebook contains a section describing the difficulties encountered.	Yes	
The paper has achieved its goals and/or explained what is missing.	Yes	Although they did not produce the quantitative results, they stated that the results were not complete yet in goals.txt.
The notebook contains a section that reproduces the figure(s) and table(s) declared in the goals.	Partial	We could not see any table or figure for quantitative results.
The notebook also reports the original values of the targeted quantitative results, for comparison.	No	
MIT License is included.	Yes	
As the reviewer(s), you have read the paper & understood it.	Yes	
Implementation of the model seems correct.	Yes	* We have located the usage of VQGAN model for the first stage, it seems to be correctly implemented. * We have located the implementations of 3.2.1, 3.2.2, 3.2.3 and 3.2.4 and they seem to be correctly implemented. * The developers also correctly implemented the cosine scheduler as a concave function which is mentioned in 3.3. * There is a "break" command given at the 100th line in MaskGIT.py. We believe it is a typo.
Notebook looks professional (in terms of notation, readability, etc.)	Yes	The textual information and the general structure of the notebook seems well. Markdown cells can be written in a more readable way.
Source code looks professional (in terms of coding style, comments, etc.)	Yes	

Additional comments:

Please write any suggestions that can content-wise and/or aesthetically improve the notebook or the source code.

You may also add your lengthy comments (eg. mathematical problems that you have found in the implementation) here, and, refer to this text in your comments above.