

Sensor and Data Fusion

**A Tool for Information Assessment
and Decision Making**

Sensor and Data Fusion

**A Tool for Information Assessment
and Decision Making**

Lawrence A. Klein



SPIE PRESS

A Publication of SPIE—The International Society for Optical Engineering
Bellingham, Washington USA

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Klein, Lawrence A.

Sensor and data fusion : a tool for information assessment and decision making /
by Lawrence A. Klein.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-8194-5435-4

1. Signal processing—Digital techniques. 2. Multisensor data fusion. I. Title.

TK5102.9.K53 2004

681'.2—dc22

2004003963

Published by

SPIE—The International Society for Optical Engineering

P.O. Box 10

Bellingham, Washington 98227-0010 USA

Phone: +1 360 676 3290

Fax: +1 360 647 1445

Email: spie@spie.org

Web: <http://spie.org>

Copyright © 2004 The Society of Photo-Optical Instrumentation Engineers

Third printing 2010.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or distributed
in any form or by any means without written permission of the publisher.

The content of this book reflects the work and thought of the author(s).

Every effort has been made to publish reliable and accurate information herein,
but the publisher is not responsible for the validity of the information or for any
outcomes resulting from reliance thereon.

Printed in the United States of America.

To Jonathan, Amy, and Gregory

Contents

| | |
|------------------------------|-------------|
| List of Figures | xiii |
|------------------------------|-------------|

| | |
|-----------------------------|-------------|
| List of Tables | xvii |
|-----------------------------|-------------|

| | |
|----------------------|------------|
| Preface | xxi |
|----------------------|------------|

| | |
|--|----------|
| Chapter 1 Introduction | 1 |
|--|----------|

| | |
|--|----------|
| Chapter 2 Multiple Sensor System Applications, Benefits, and Design Considerations | 7 |
|--|----------|

| | | |
|--------|--|----|
| 2.1 | Data fusion applications to multiple sensor systems | 8 |
| 2.2 | Selection of sensors | 10 |
| 2.3 | Benefits of multiple sensor systems | 16 |
| 2.4 | Influence of wavelength on atmospheric attenuation | 18 |
| 2.5 | Fog characterization | 21 |
| 2.6 | Effects of operating frequency on MMW sensor performance .. | 22 |
| 2.7 | Absorption of MMW energy in rain and fog | 23 |
| 2.8 | Backscatter of MMW energy from rain | 25 |
| 2.9 | Effects of operating wavelength on IR sensor performance | 28 |
| 2.10 | Visibility metrics | 29 |
| 2.10.1 | Visibility | 29 |
| 2.10.2 | Meteorological range | 30 |
| 2.11 | Attenuation of IR energy by rain | 31 |
| 2.12 | Extinction coefficient values (typical) | 32 |
| 2.13 | Summary of attributes of electromagnetic sensors | 32 |
| 2.14 | Atmospheric and sensor system computer simulation models .. | 38 |
| 2.14.1 | LOWTRAN attenuation model | 38 |
| 2.14.2 | FASCODE and MODTRAN attenuation models | 40 |
| 2.14.3 | EOSAEL sensor performance model | 41 |
| 2.15 | Summary | 43 |
| | References | 46 |

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Chapter 3 Data Fusion Algorithms and Architectures | 51 |
|--|-----------|

| | | |
|-------|---|----|
| 3.1 | Definition of data fusion | 51 |
| 3.2 | Level 1 processing | 54 |
| 3.2.1 | Detection, classification, and identification algorithms for data fusion | 55 |
| 3.2.2 | State estimation and tracking algorithms for data fusion | 71 |

| | | |
|------------------|---|------------|
| 3.3 | Level 2, 3, and 4 processing | 78 |
| 3.4 | Data fusion processor functions | 80 |
| 3.5 | Definition of an architecture | 82 |
| 3.6 | Data fusion architectures | 83 |
| 3.6.1 | Sensor-level fusion | 83 |
| 3.6.2 | Central-level fusion | 87 |
| 3.6.3 | Hybrid fusion | 89 |
| 3.6.4 | Pixel-level fusion | 91 |
| 3.6.5 | Feature-level fusion | 92 |
| 3.6.6 | Decision-level fusion | 93 |
| 3.7 | Sensor footprint registration and size considerations | 93 |
| 3.8 | Summary | 95 |
| | References | 97 |
| Chapter 4 | Classical Inference..... | 101 |
| 4.1 | Estimating the statistics of a population | 102 |
| 4.2 | Interpreting the confidence interval | 103 |
| 4.3 | Confidence interval for a population mean | 105 |
| 4.4 | Significance tests for hypotheses | 109 |
| 4.5 | The z -test for the population mean | 109 |
| 4.6 | Tests with fixed significance level | 112 |
| 4.7 | The t -test for a population mean | 114 |
| 4.8 | Caution in use of significance tests | 117 |
| 4.9 | Inference as a decision | 118 |
| 4.10 | Summary | 122 |
| | References | 125 |
| Chapter 5 | Bayesian Inference | 127 |
| 5.1 | Bayes' rule | 127 |
| 5.2 | Bayes' rule in terms of odds probability and likelihood ratio .. | 130 |
| 5.3 | Direct application of Bayes' rule to cancer screening test example | 132 |
| 5.4 | Comparison of Bayesian inference with classical inference ... | 133 |
| 5.5 | Application of Bayesian inference to fusing information from multiple sources | 135 |
| 5.6 | Combining multiple sensor information using the odds probability form of Bayes' rule | 136 |
| 5.7 | Recursive Bayesian updating | 137 |
| 5.8 | Posterior calculation using multivalued hypotheses and recursive updating | 139 |
| 5.9 | Enhancing underground mine detection using two sensors that produce data generated by uncorrelated phenomena | 142 |
| 5.10 | Summary | 146 |
| | References | 147 |

| | | |
|------------------|---|------------|
| Chapter 6 | Dempster-Shafer Evidential Theory | 149 |
| 6.1 | Overview of the process | 149 |
| 6.2 | Implementation of the method | 150 |
| 6.3 | Support, plausibility, and uncertainty interval | 151 |
| 6.4 | Dempster's rule for combination of multiple sensor data | 156 |
| 6.4.1 | Dempster's rule with empty set elements | 158 |
| 6.4.2 | Dempster's rule when only singleton propositions are reported..... | 159 |
| 6.5 | Comparison of Dempster-Shafer with Bayesian decision theory | 161 |
| 6.5.1 | Dempster-Shafer–Bayesian equivalence example..... | 162 |
| 6.5.2 | Dempster-Shafer–Bayesian computation time comparisons | 163 |
| 6.6 | Probabilistic models for transformation of Dempster-Shafer belief functions for decision making | 163 |
| 6.6.1 | Pignistic transferable belief model | 164 |
| 6.6.2 | Plausibility transformation function | 166 |
| 6.6.3 | Modified Dempster-Shafer rule of combination | 171 |
| 6.7 | Summary | 178 |
| | References | 180 |
| Chapter 7 | Artificial Neural Networks | 183 |
| 7.1 | Applications of artificial neural networks | 184 |
| 7.2 | Adaptive linear combiner | 184 |
| 7.3 | Linear classifiers | 185 |
| 7.4 | Capacity of linear classifiers | 187 |
| 7.5 | Nonlinear classifiers | 188 |
| 7.5.1 | Madaline | 188 |
| 7.5.2 | Feedforward network..... | 190 |
| 7.6 | Capacity of nonlinear classifiers | 192 |
| 7.7 | Supervised and unsupervised learning | 193 |
| 7.8 | Supervised learning rules | 195 |
| 7.8.1 | μ -LMS steepest descent algorithm | 196 |
| 7.8.2 | α -LMS error correction algorithm | 196 |
| 7.8.3 | Comparison of the μ -LMS and α -LMS algorithms | 197 |
| 7.8.4 | Madaline I and II error correction rules..... | 197 |
| 7.8.5 | Perceptron rule..... | 198 |
| 7.8.6 | Backpropagation algorithm | 200 |
| 7.8.7 | Madaline III steepest descent rule | 202 |
| 7.8.8 | Dead zone algorithms | 203 |
| 7.9 | Generalization | 204 |
| 7.10 | Other artificial neural networks and processing techniques..... | 205 |
| 7.11 | Summary | 207 |

| | |
|--|------------|
| References | 213 |
| Chapter 8 Voting Logic Fusion | 215 |
| 8.1 Sensor target reports | 217 |
| 8.2 Sensor detection space | 218 |
| 8.2.1 Venn diagram representation of detection space | 218 |
| 8.2.2 Confidence levels | 218 |
| 8.2.3 Detection modes | 219 |
| 8.3 System detection probability | 221 |
| 8.3.1 Derivation of system detection and false alarm probability for nonnested confidence levels | 221 |
| 8.3.2 Relation of confidence levels to detection and false alarm probabilities | 223 |
| 8.3.3 Evaluation of conditional probability | 224 |
| 8.3.4 Establishing false alarm probability | 225 |
| 8.3.5 Calculating system detection probability | 226 |
| 8.3.6 Summary of detection probability computation model | 226 |
| 8.4 Application example without singleton sensor detection modes | 227 |
| 8.4.1 Satisfying the false alarm probability requirement | 228 |
| 8.4.2 Satisfying the detection probability requirement | 228 |
| 8.4.3 Observations | 230 |
| 8.5 Hardware implementation of voting logic sensor fusion | 231 |
| 8.6 Application example with singleton sensor detection modes | 231 |
| 8.7 Comparison of voting logic fusion with Dempster-Shafer evidential theory | 233 |
| 8.8 Summary | 234 |
| References | 235 |
| Chapter 9 Fuzzy Logic and Fuzzy Neural Networks | 237 |
| 9.1 Conditions under which fuzzy logic provides an appropriate solution | 237 |
| 9.2 Illustration of fuzzy logic in an automobile antilock braking system | 238 |
| 9.3 Basic elements of a fuzzy system | 239 |
| 9.4 Fuzzy logic processing | 239 |
| 9.5 Fuzzy centroid calculation | 241 |
| 9.6 Balancing an inverted pendulum with fuzzy logic control | 243 |
| 9.6.1 Conventional mathematical solution | 243 |
| 9.6.2 Fuzzy logic solution | 245 |
| 9.7 Fuzzy logic applied to multitarget tracking | 248 |
| 9.7.1 Conventional Kalman filter approach | 249 |
| 9.7.2 Fuzzy Kalman filter approach | 251 |
| 9.8 Fuzzy neural networks | 256 |

| | | |
|-------------------|--|------------|
| 9.9 | Fusion of fuzzy-valued information from multiple sources | 258 |
| 9.10 | Summary | 259 |
| | References | 261 |
| Chapter 10 | Passive Data Association Techniques for Unambiguous Location of Targets | 263 |
| 10.1 | Data fusion options..... | 263 |
| 10.2 | Received-signal fusion | 265 |
| 10.2.1 | Coherent processing technique | 267 |
| 10.2.2 | System design issues | 269 |
| 10.3 | Angle data fusion | 271 |
| 10.3.1 | Solution space for emitter locations | 272 |
| 10.3.2 | Zero-one integer programming algorithm development..... | 275 |
| 10.3.3 | Relaxation algorithm development | 280 |
| 10.4 | Decentralized fusion architecture | 282 |
| 10.4.1 | Local optimization of direction angle track association | 283 |
| 10.4.2 | Global optimization of direction angle track association | 285 |
| 10.5 | Passive computation of range using tracks from a single sensor site | 287 |
| 10.6 | Summary | 288 |
| | References | 290 |
| Chapter 11 | Retrospective Comments | 293 |
| Appendix A | Planck Radiation Law and Radiative Transfer | 299 |
| A.1 | Planck radiation law | 299 |
| A.2 | Radiative transfer theory | 301 |
| | References | 305 |
| Appendix B | Bayesian Inference Applied to Freeway Incident Detection..... | 307 |
| B.1 | Problem statement and development..... | 307 |
| B.2 | Numerical Examples | 311 |
| Appendix C | Plausible and Paradoxical Reasoning..... | 313 |
| C.1 | Example of unexpected results arising from conflicting information sources | 313 |
| C.2 | Plausible and paradoxical reasoning | 314 |
| C.3 | Resolution of medical diagnosis dilemma..... | 316 |

| | | |
|--------------------|---|------------|
| Appendix D | Summary of Results from Alternative Dempster-Shafer Models Applied to Godfather-Mr. Jones Saga | 319 |
| D.1 | Coin toss (E_1) only evidence | 319 |
| D.2 | Coin toss (E_1) and Peter's alibi (E_2) evidence..... | 319 |
| Appendix E | Training-Set Size for Valid Generalization..... | 321 |
| Appendix F | Voting Fusion with Nested Confidence Levels | 323 |
| Appendix G | Fuzzy-Set Boundaries, Fuzzy-Set Widths, and Defuzzification Methods | 325 |
| G.1 | Fuzzy-set boundaries..... | 325 |
| G.2 | Effects of fuzzy-set widths on control..... | 325 |
| G.3 | Defuzzification methods | 326 |
| Index | | 329 |

List of Figures

| | | |
|-------------|--|----|
| Figure 2.1 | Signature-generation phenomena in the electromagnetic spectrum | 10 |
| Figure 2.2 | Bistatic radar geometry | 12 |
| Figure 2.3 | Active and passive sensors operating in different regions of the electromagnetic spectrum produce target signatures generated by independent phenomena | 13 |
| Figure 2.4 | Sensor resolution versus wavelength | 14 |
| Figure 2.5 | Sensor fusion concept for ATR using multiple sensor data. | 15 |
| Figure 2.6 | Multiple sensor versus single sensor performance with suppressed target signatures | 16 |
| Figure 2.7 | Target discrimination with MMW radar and radiometer data | 17 |
| Figure 2.8 | Atmospheric attenuation spectrum from 0.3 μm to 3 cm..... | 19 |
| Figure 2.9 | Absorption coefficient in rain and fog as a function of operating frequency and rain rate or water concentration..... | 24 |
| Figure 2.10 | Rain backscatter coefficient as a function of frequency and rain rate..... | 27 |
| Figure 2.11 | Rain backscatter coefficient reduction by circular polarization | 27 |
| Figure 2.12 | IR transmittance of the atmosphere..... | 28 |
| Figure 2.13 | Atmospheric transmittance in rain | 33 |
| Figure 2.14 | Typical 94-GHz radar backscatter from test area in absence of obscurants..... | 36 |
| Figure 2.15 | Visible, mid-IR, and 94-GHz sensor imagery obtained during dispersal of water fog | 36 |
| Figure 2.16 | Visible, mid- and far-IR, and 94-GHz sensor imagery obtained during dispersal of graphite dust along road | 37 |
| Figure 3.1 | Data fusion model showing processing levels 0, 1, 2, 3, and 4..... | 53 |
| Figure 3.2 | Data fusion processing levels 1, 2, and 3 | 53 |
| Figure 3.3 | Taxonomy of detection, classification, and identification algorithms..... | 55 |
| Figure 3.4 | Physical model concept..... | 57 |
| Figure 3.5 | Laser radar imagery showing shapes of man-made and natural objects..... | 58 |
| Figure 3.6 | Classical inference concept | 59 |
| Figure 3.7 | Parametric templating concept based on measured emitter signal characteristics..... | 64 |
| Figure 3.8 | Parametric templating using measured multispectral radiance values | 65 |

| | | |
|-------------|---|-----|
| Figure 3.9 | Cluster analysis concept | 66 |
| Figure 3.10 | Knowledge-based expert system concept | 70 |
| Figure 3.11 | Taxonomy of state estimation and tracking algorithms | 71 |
| Figure 3.12 | Military command and control system architecture showing fusion of information from multiple sources at multiple locations | 81 |
| Figure 3.13 | Sensor-level fusion | 84 |
| Figure 3.14 | Central-level fusion | 87 |
| Figure 3.15 | Hybrid fusion | 89 |
| Figure 3.16 | Distributed fusion architecture | 90 |
| Figure 3.17 | Pixel-level fusion in a laser radar | 92 |
| Figure 3.18 | Feature-level fusion in an artificial neural network classifier | 93 |
| Figure 4.1 | Interpretation of the standard deviation of the sample mean for a normal distribution | 102 |
| Figure 4.2 | Central area of normal distribution included in a confidence level C | 104 |
| Figure 4.3 | Interpretation of confidence interval with repeated sampling | 105 |
| Figure 4.4 | Confidence intervals of 90 and 99 percent for specimen analysis example | 107 |
| Figure 4.5 | Confidence intervals of 90, 95, and 99 percent for roadway sensor spacing example | 109 |
| Figure 4.6 | Interpretation of two-sided P -value for metal sheet thickness example when sample mean = 2.98 mm | 111 |
| Figure 4.7 | Upper critical value z^* used in fixed significance level test | 112 |
| Figure 4.8 | Upper and lower $\alpha/2$ areas that appear in two-sided significance test | 114 |
| Figure 4.9 | Comparison of t distribution with four degrees of freedom with standardized normal distribution | 116 |
| Figure 4.10 | Hypothesis rejection regions for single-sided power of a test example | 121 |
| Figure 4.11 | Hypothesis rejection regions for double-sided power of a test example | 122 |
| Figure 5.1 | Venn diagram illustrating intersection of events E (person chosen at random is left-handed) and H (person chosen at random is female) | 127 |
| Figure 5.2 | Bayesian fusion process | 135 |
| Figure 5.3 | Influence diagram for two-sensor mine detection | 143 |
| Figure 6.1 | Dempster-Shafer data fusion process | 150 |
| Figure 6.2 | Dempster-Shafer uncertainty interval for a proposition | 153 |
| Figure 7.1 | Adaptive linear combiner | 185 |
| Figure 7.2 | Linearly and nonlinearly separable pattern pairs | 186 |
| Figure 7.3 | Adaptive linear element (Adaline) | 186 |

| | | |
|-------------|--|-----|
| Figure 7.4 | Probability of training pattern separation by an Adaline | 187 |
| Figure 7.5 | Madaline constructed of two Adalines with an AND threshold logic output..... | 188 |
| Figure 7.6 | Threshold functions used in artificial neural networks | 189 |
| Figure 7.7 | Fixed-weight Adaline implementations of AND, OR, and MAJORITY threshold logic functions..... | 190 |
| Figure 7.8 | Three-layer fully connected feedforward neural network..... | 191 |
| Figure 7.9 | Effect of number of hidden elements on feedforward neural network training time and output accuracy for a specific problem | 194 |
| Figure 7.10 | Learning rules for artificial neural networks that incorporate adaptive linear elements..... | 195 |
| Figure 7.11 | Rosenblatt's perceptron..... | 199 |
| Figure 7.12 | Adaptive threshold element of perceptron | 199 |
| Figure 8.1 | Attributes of series and parallel sensor output combinations..... | 216 |
| Figure 8.2 | Detection modes for a three-sensor system..... | 218 |
| Figure 8.3 | Nonnested sensor confidence levels..... | 219 |
| Figure 8.4 | Detection modes formed by combinations of allowed sensor outputs..... | 222 |
| Figure 8.5 | Sensor system detection probability computation model..... | 227 |
| Figure 8.6 | Hardware implementation for three-sensor voting logic fusion with multiple sensor detection modes | 231 |
| Figure 8.7 | Hardware implementation for three-sensor voting logic fusion with single sensor detection modes..... | 233 |
| Figure 9.1 | Fuzzy logic computation process | 240 |
| Figure 9.2 | Shape of consequent membership functions for correlation-minimum and correlation-product inferencing | 241 |
| Figure 9.3 | Model for balancing an inverted pendulum | 243 |
| Figure 9.4 | Triangle-shaped membership functions for the inverted pendulum example | 246 |
| Figure 9.5 | Fuzzy logic inferencing and defuzzification process for balancing an inverted pendulum | 247 |
| Figure 9.6 | Validity membership function..... | 253 |
| Figure 9.7 | Size-difference and intensity-difference membership functions.. | 253 |
| Figure 9.8 | Similarity membership functions | 252 |
| Figure 9.9 | Innovation vector and the differential error antecedent membership functions..... | 255 |
| Figure 9.10 | Correction vector consequent membership functions | 256 |
| Figure 9.11 | Improving performance of the fuzzy tracker by applying gains to the crisp inputs and outputs..... | 256 |
| Figure 9.12 | Yamakawa's fuzzy neuron..... | 257 |
| Figure 9.13 | Nakamura's and Tokunaga's fuzzy neuron..... | 258 |

| | | |
|--------------|---|-----|
| Figure 10.1 | Passive sensor data association and fusion techniques for estimating location of emitters | 264 |
| Figure 10.2 | Coherent processing of passive signals | 267 |
| Figure 10.3 | Cross-correlation processing of the received passive signals | 269 |
| Figure 10.4 | Law of sines calculation of emitter location | 269 |
| Figure 10.5 | Unacceptable emitter locations | 272 |
| Figure 10.6 | Ambiguities in passive localization of three emitter sources with two receivers | 273 |
| Figure 10.7 | Ambiguities in passive localization of N emitter sources with three receivers | 274 |
| Figure 10.8 | Passive localization of 10 emitters using zero-one integer programming | 279 |
| Figure 10.9 | All subsets of possible emitter positions before prefiltering and cost constraints are applied | 279 |
| Figure 10.10 | Potential emitter positions that remain after prefiltering input to zero-one integer programming algorithm | 280 |
| Figure 10.11 | Average scan-to-scan association error of auction algorithm over 15 scans | 284 |
| Figure 10.12 | Varad hinge angle | 287 |
| Figure A.1 | Radiative transfer in an Earth-looking radiometer sensor | 301 |
| Figure A.2 | Definition of incidence angle θ | 302 |
| Figure B.1 | Influence diagram for freeway event detection using data from three uncorrelated information sources | 308 |
| Figure F.1. | Nested sensor confidence levels | 323 |
| Figure G.1 | Short, medium, and tall sets as depicted in conventional and fuzzy set theory | 325 |
| Figure G.2 | Influence of fuzzy set widths on fuzzy set overlap | 326 |
| Figure G.3 | Defuzzification methods | 326 |

List of Tables

| | | |
|------------|--|-----|
| Table 2.1 | Common sensor functions and their implementations in precision guided weapons applications | 9 |
| Table 2.2 | Radar spectrum letter designations..... | 11 |
| Table 2.3 | Extinction coefficient model for snow | 21 |
| Table 2.4 | Influence of MMW frequency on sensor design parameters..... | 22 |
| Table 2.5 | Approximate ranges of extinction coefficients of atmospheric obscurants (Np/km) | 34 |
| Table 2.6 | Electromagnetic sensor performance for object discrimination and track estimation..... | 35 |
| Table 2.7 | LOWTRAN 7 input card information | 39 |
| Table 2.8 | LOWTRAN aerosol profiles | 40 |
| Table 2.9 | EOSAEL 87 modules and their functions | 43 |
| Table 3.1 | Object discrimination categories | 54 |
| Table 3.2 | Feature categories and representative features used in developing physical models | 56 |
| Table 3.3 | Keno payoff amounts as a function of number of correct choices... | 67 |
| Table 3.4 | Comparison of statistical, syntactic, and neural pattern recognition (PR) approaches..... | 69 |
| Table 3.5 | Distance measures..... | 73 |
| Table 3.6 | Suggested data and track association techniques for different levels of tracking complexity | 77 |
| Table 3.7 | Signature-generation phenomena | 85 |
| Table 3.8 | Sensor, target, and background attributes that contribute to object signature characterization | 86 |
| Table 3.9 | Comparative attributes of sensor-level and central-level fusion | 88 |
| Table 3.10 | Advantages and issues associated with a distributed fusion architecture | 90 |
| Table 4.1 | Standard normal probabilities showing z^* for various confidence levels..... | 104 |
| Table 4.2 | Relation of upper p critical value and C to z^* | 113 |
| Table 4.3 | Values of t^* for several confidence levels and degrees of freedom..... | 117 |
| Table 4.4 | Comparison of z -test and t -test confidence intervals..... | 117 |
| Table 4.5 | Type 1 and Type 2 errors in decision making | 119 |
| Table 4.6 | Characteristics of the classical inference method..... | 124 |
| Table 5.1 | Comparison of classical and Bayesian inference | 134 |

| | | |
|------------|--|-----|
| Table 5.2 | $P(E^k H_i)$: Likelihood functions corresponding to evidence produced by k^{th} sensor with 3 output states in support of 4 hypotheses | 134 |
| Table 6.1 | Interpretation of uncertainty intervals for proposition a_i | 154 |
| Table 6.2 | Uncertainty interval calculation for propositions $a_1, \bar{a}_1, a_1 \cup a_2, \Theta$ | 155 |
| Table 6.3 | Subjective and evidential vocabulary | 155 |
| Table 6.4 | Application of Dempster's rule | 157 |
| Table 6.5 | Application of Dempster's rule with an empty set | 158 |
| Table 6.6 | Probability masses of nonempty set elements increased by K | 159 |
| Table 6.7 | Application of Dempster's rule with singleton events | 160 |
| Table 6.8 | Redistribution of probability mass to nonempty set elements..... | 160 |
| Table 6.9 | Probability masses resulting from conditioning coin toss evidence E_1 on alibi evidence E_2 | 166 |
| Table 6.10 | Arguments and counter-arguments for selection of Mary, Peter, or Paul as the assassin..... | 168 |
| Table 6.11 | Pointwise multiplication of plausibility probability function $Pl_P_{m_1}$ by itself | 169 |
| Table 6.12 | Normalized pointwise multiplied plausibility probability function $Pl_P_{m_1}$ | 169 |
| Table 6.13 | Application of ordinary Dempster's rule to $B \oplus B_1$ | 173 |
| Table 6.14 | Normalized ordinary Dempster's rule result for $B \oplus B_1$ ($K^{-1} = 0.76$) | 173 |
| Table 6.15 | Application of modified Dempster's rule to $B \oplus B_1$ | 173 |
| Table 6.16 | Normalized modified Dempster's rule result for $B \oplus B_1$ ($K^{-1} = 0.412$) | 174 |
| Table 6.17 | Application of ordinary Dempster's rule to $B \oplus B_2$ | 174 |
| Table 6.18 | Normalized ordinary Dempster's rule result for $B \oplus B_2$ ($K^{-1} = 0.76$) | 174 |
| Table 6.19 | Application of modified Dempster's rule to $B \oplus B_2$ | 175 |
| Table 6.20 | Normalized modified Dempster's rule result for $B \oplus B_2$ ($K^{-1} = 0.145$) | 175 |
| Table 6.21 | Application of ordinary Dempster's rule to $B \oplus B_3$ | 175 |
| Table 6.22 | Application of modified Dempster's rule to $B \oplus B_3$ | 175 |
| Table 6.23 | Normalized modified Dempster's rule result for $B \oplus B_3$ ($K^{-1} = 0.0334$) | 176 |
| Table 6.24 | Application of ordinary Dempster's rule to $B \oplus B_4$ | 176 |
| Table 6.25 | Normalized ordinary Dempster's rule result for $B \oplus B_4$ ($K^{-1} = 0.52$) | 176 |
| Table 6.26 | Application of modified Dempster's rule to $B \oplus B_4$ | 177 |
| Table 6.27 | Normalized modified Dempster's rule result for $B \oplus B_4$ ($K^{-1} = 0.0187$) | 177 |
| Table 6.28 | Values of ODS and MDS agreement functions for combinations of evidence from B, B_i | 177 |

| | | |
|------------|--|-----|
| Table 7.1 | Comparison of artificial neural network and von Neumann architectures..... | 183 |
| Table 7.2 | Truth table after training by 1-taught and 0-taught sets | 204 |
| Table 7.3 | Truth table after neuron generalization with a Hamming distance firing rule | 205 |
| Table 7.4 | Properties of other artificial neural networks | 209 |
| Table 8.1 | Multiple sensor detection modes that incorporate confidence levels in a three-sensor system | 220 |
| Table 8.2 | Distribution of detections and signal-to-noise ratios among sensor confidence levels | 228 |
| Table 8.3 | Inherent and conditional false alarm probabilities at the confidence levels and detection modes of the three-sensor system | 229 |
| Table 8.4 | Detection probabilities for the confidence levels and detection modes of the three-sensor system..... | 230 |
| Table 8.5 | Detection modes that incorporate single sensor outputs and multiple confidence levels in a three-sensor system..... | 232 |
| Table 9.1 | Production rules for balancing an inverted pendulum..... | 246 |
| Table 9.2 | Outputs for the inverted pendulum example | 248 |
| Table 9.3 | Fuzzy associative memory rules for degree of similarity..... | 253 |
| Table 9.4 | Fuzzy associative memory rules for the fuzzy state correlator..... | 255 |
| Table 10.1 | Fusion techniques for associating passively acquired data to locate and track multiple targets..... | 266 |
| Table 10.2 | Major issues influencing the design of the coherent receiver fusion architecture | 270 |
| Table 10.3 | Speedup of relaxation algorithm over a branch-and-bound algorithm (averaged over 20 runs)..... | 282 |
| Table 11.1 | Information needed to apply classical inference, Bayesian inference, Dempster-Shafer decision theory, artificial neural networks, voting logic, and fuzzy logic data fusion algorithms to a target detection, classification, or identification application. | 294 |
| Table A.1 | Effect of quadratic correction term on emitted energy calculated from Planck radiation law ($T = 300\text{K}$)..... | 300 |
| Table A.2 | Downwelling atmospheric temperature T_D and atmospheric attenuation A for a zenith-looking radiometer..... | 304 |
| Table B.1 | Likelihood functions for road sensors, cellular telephones, and radios for the three-hypothesis freeway incident detection problem | 311 |

| | | |
|-----------|---|-----|
| Table C.1 | Orthogonal sum calculation for conflicting medical diagnosis example (step 1) | 313 |
| Table C.2 | Normalization of non-empty set matrix element for conflicting medical diagnosis example (step 2)..... | 314 |
| Table C.3 | Two-information source, two-hypothesis application of plausible and paradoxical theory | 315 |
| Table C.4 | Resolution of medical diagnosis example through plausible and paradoxical reasoning..... | 316 |
| Table D.1 | Probability summary using evidence set E_1 only | 319 |
| Table D.2 | Probability summary using evidence sets E_1 and E_2 | 320 |

Preface

Sensor and Data Fusion: A Tool for Information Assessment and Decision Making is the latest version of *Sensor and Data Fusion Concepts and Applications*, which last appeared as Tutorial Text 35 from SPIE. The information in this edition has been substantially expanded and updated to incorporate recent approaches to data and sensor fusion.

The book serves as a companion text to courses taught by the author on multisensor, multitarget data fusion techniques for tracking and identification of potential targets. Material regarding the benefits of multisensor systems and data fusion originally developed for courses on advanced sensor design for defense applications was utilized in preparing the original edition. Those topics that deal with applications of multiple sensor systems; target, background, and atmospheric signature-generation phenomena and modeling; and methods of combining multiple sensor data in target identity and tracking data fusion architectures were expanded for this book. Chapter 6 on Dempster-Shafer theory now incorporates discussions about several proposed modifications to the original theory, which provide alternate methods for assigning probability mass to compatible and conflicting propositions. Revisions and additions were also made to all subsequent chapters that appeared in previous editions of this book. Most signature phenomena and data fusion techniques are explained with a minimum of mathematics or use relatively simple mathematical operations to convey the underlying principles. Understanding of concepts is aided by the nonmathematical explanations provided in each chapter.

Multisensor systems are frequently designed to overcome space limitations associated with smart weapons applications or to combine and assess information from non-collated or dissimilar sources. Packaging volume restrictions associated with the construction of fire-and-forget missile systems often constrain sensor selection to those operating at infrared and millimeter-wave frequencies. In addition to having relatively short wavelengths and hence occupying small volumes, these sensors provide high resolution and complementary information as they respond to different signature-generation phenomena. The result is a large degree of immunity to inclement weather, clutter, and signature masking produced by countermeasures. Sensor and data fusion architectures are utilized in these multisensor systems to combine information from the individual sensors and other sources in an efficient and effective manner.

This book discusses the benefits of infrared and millimeter-wave sensor operation including atmospheric effects; multiple sensor system applications;

definitions and examples of data fusion architectures and algorithms; classical inference, which forms a foundation for the more general Bayesian inference and Dempster-Shafer evidential theory that follow in succeeding chapters; artificial neural networks; voting logic as derived from Boolean algebra expressions; fuzzy logic; detecting and tracking objects using only passively acquired data; and a summary of the information required to implement each of the data fusion methods discussed.

Weather forecasting, Earth resource surveys that use remote sensing, vehicular traffic management, target classification and tracking, and battlefield assessment are some of the applications that will benefit from the discussions provided of signature-generation phenomena, sensor fusion architectures, and data fusion algorithms. There continues to be high interest in military and homeland defense usage of data fusion to assist in the identification of missile threats, suicide bombers, strategic and tactical targets, assessment of information, evaluation of potential responses to a threat, and allocation of resources. The signature-generation phenomena and fusion architectures and algorithms presented in this book continue to be applicable to these areas as well as the growing number of nondefense applications.

Several people have made valuable suggestions that were incorporated into this work. Henry Heidary, in addition to his major contributions to Chapter 10, reviewed other sections of the original manuscript. Sam Blackman reviewed the original text and provided several references for new material that was subsequently incorporated. Pat Williams reviewed sections on tracking and provided data concerning tracking algorithm execution times. Martin Dana, with whom I teach the multisensor, multitarget data fusion course, reviewed several of the newer sections. His insightful suggestions have improved upon the text. Merry Schnell, Sharon Streams, Eric Pepper, and the rest of the SPIE staff provided, as usual, technical and editorial assistance that improved the quality of the material in the text. That the book has many strengths, I am indebted to these and so many other colleagues. Its faults, of course, are mine.

Lawrence A. Klein
June 2004

Sensor and Data Fusion

**A Tool for Information Assessment
and Decision Making**