

Memo for:

Family History Matters: Immigration Stories Moderate Policy Opinions Mary Soledad Craig , Jiyeon Lee

By George Yean

Overview and Theory:

- This is a very interesting replication-extension and provides interesting findings.
- For the theory part, you may provide more data analysis, interviews, etc to provide a complete mechanism for your arguments. This can unveil theory for reasons such as slavery.
- You may play with other individuals' characteristics to see if there are more interesting observational patterns, such as education, race, and occupation. The findings may confirm or overturn existing literature.

Method and Data:

- The counterintuitive coefficients of the interaction terms in the first model may not matter, as they are small in magnitude compared those of reasons for immigration. I suggest removing interaction terms altogether in main models, and the results are consistent after removal. You can leave the models with interaction terms in the appendix.
- In the second model, the null results for reasons feel counterintuitive to me. Why individuals differ regarding policy rather than emotion? Again, conducting some interviews may help answer the question.
- The R^2 values for two models are relatively small, 0.03 and 0.07 respectively. This suggests the fitness of the model is relatively weak. One may add more control variables of responders to the model. In fact, non-econ responders may differ a lot from econ responders w.r.t partisanship, ages, education, etc.
- The data itself seems of good quality: there are few missing data. The coding of different treatments depends on the topic model being used.