Practical 3: Inconsistency in network meta-analysis

R packages

We will use the package **readxl** to import excel data and the packages **netmeta** to run network meta-analyses.

```
library(readxl)
library(netmeta)
```

Datasets

We will again use the Acute mania and Schizophrenia datasets; see the Practical 6-8 for more information on these datasets. You only have to re-run the following commands if the R objects *AcuteMania* and *Leucht* do no longer exist.

```
AcuteMania = read_excel("AcuteMania.xls")
AcuteMania = as.data.frame(AcuteMania)

Leucht = read_excel("Leucht.xls")
Leucht = as.data.frame(Leucht)
```

Network meta-analyses

Re-run the following R commands if the R object *net1* and *net3* do no longer exist.

```
AcuteManiaPair = pairwise(treat = treatment, event = r, n = n, data = AcuteMania, studlab = studyid, sm = "OR")

net1 = netmeta(AcuteManiaPair, ref = "PLA", comb.fixed = FALSE)

net3 = netmeta(effect, se, treat1, treat2, study, data = Leucht, sm = "SMD", ref = "PBO", comb.fixed = FALSE, tol.multiarm = 0.075)
```

Inconsistency evaluation in acute mania dataset

First, we print the number of designs

```
net1$d
## [1] 30
```

and the list of all designs (to see how many designs have two and three studies)

```
## [13] "PLA:DIV"
                        "PLA:OLA"
                                        "PLA:PAL"
                                                       "PLA:OUE"
## [17] "PLA:RIS"
                                        "PLA:ZIP"
                        "PLA:TOP"
                                                       "PLA:ARI:HAL"
## [21]
        "PLA:ARI:LITH"
                        "PLA:ASE:OLA"
                                        "PLA:DIV:LITH"
                                                       "PLA:DIV:OLA"
                                                       "PLA:HAL:ZIP"
## [25] "PLA:HAL:OLA"
                        "PLA:HAL:QUE"
                                       "PLA:HAL:RIS"
## [29] "PLA:LITH:QUE" "PLA:PAL:QUE"
```

We see that the acute mania dataset contains 30 designs of which 11 are three-arm designs.

Next, we apply the SIDE method and print the results for the random effects model.

```
split1 = netsplit(net1)
print(split1, show = "both", digits = 2)
## Back-calculation method to split direct and indirect evidence
##
## Random effects model:
##
##
    comparison k prop
                      nma direct indir.
                                          RoR
                                                  z p-value
##
       ARI:HAL 2 0.46 0.88
                             1.16
                                                     0.1398
                                    0.70 1.65
                                              1.48
##
      ARI:LITH 1 0.34 1.13
                             1.09
                                    1.15 0.95 -0.12
                                                     0.9044
##
       ARI:PLA 6 0.83 1.99
                             1.77
                                    3.55 0.50 -1.93
                                                     0.0534
##
       ASE:OLA 1 0.82 0.78
                             0.69
                                    1.37 0.50 -0.85
                                                     0.3938
##
      ASE:PLA 1 0.67 1.69
                             2.04
                                    1.15 1.78 0.85
                                                     0.3938
##
                             0.42
      CARB:DIV 1 0.16 1.25
                                    1.55 0.27 -1.46
                                                     0.1455
##
      CARB:HAL 1 0.11 1.10
                             0.80
                                    1.14 0.70 -0.33
                                                     0.7415
##
      CARB:PLA 1 0.78 2.47
                             3.10
                                    1.10 2.83 1.41
                                                     0.1579
##
      DIV:LITH 2 0.25 1.12
                             0.78
                                    1.25 0.62 -0.90
                                                     0.3704
##
      DIV:OLA 2 0.48 0.91
                             0.77
                                    1.06 0.73 -0.89
                                                     0.3712
##
       DIV:PLA 5 0.70 1.98
                             2.16
                                    1.60 1.35 0.85
                                                     0.3955
##
      HAL:OLA 2 0.31 1.03
                             1.21
                                    0.97 1.25
                                               0.62
                                                     0.5363
##
      HAL:PLA 5 0.57 2.25
                             2.26
                                    2.24 1.01 0.03
                                                     0.9753
                             1.72
##
      HAL:QUE 1 0.23 1.16
                                    1.03 1.66
                                              1.12
                                                     0.2612
##
      HAL:RIS 1 0.31 0.95
                             0.95
                                    0.96 0.99 -0.01
                                                     0.9902
##
      HAL:ZIP 1 0.32 1.64
                             2.05
                                    1.48 1.38 0.76
                                                     0.4468
##
                             0.62
      LITH:OLA 2 0.20 0.81
                                    0.87 0.72 -0.67
                                                     0.5050
##
                             2.28
                                    1.28 1.78
      LITH:PLA 3 0.56 1.77
                                              1.60
                                                     0.1100
      LITH:QUE 2 0.47 0.91
##
                             0.70
                                    1.15 0.61 -1.22
                                                     0.2242
                             1.90
##
      OLA:PLA 8 0.67 2.18
                                    2.89 0.66 -1.66
                                                     0.0971
##
       OLA:RIS 1 0.28 0.92
                             1.20
                                    0.83 1.45
                                               0.89
                                                     0.3750
##
                             1.57
       PAL:PLA 2 0.85 1.72
                                    2.85 0.55 -0.92
                                                     0.3601
##
                             1.25
       PAL:QUE 1 0.53 0.89
                                    0.60 2.08
                                              1.47
                                                     0.1426
##
       QUE:PLA 6 0.83 1.94
                             1.98
                                    1.77 1.12
                                               0.29
                                                     0.7724
##
       RIS:PLA 4 0.74 2.36
                             2.51
                                    1.99 1.26
                                               0.60
                                                     0.5503
##
       ZIP:PLA 5 0.91 1.37
                             1.48
                                    0.63 2.33
                                               1.46
                                                     0.1447
##
## Legend:
##
   comparison - Treatment comparison
##
               - Number of studies providing direct evidence
   k
##
               - Direct evidence proportion
   prop
##
   nma
               - Estimated treatment effect (OR) in network meta-analysis
   direct
               - Estimated treatment effect (OR) derived from direct evidence
```

```
## indir. - Estimated treatment effect (OR) derived from indirect
evidence
## ROR - Ratio of Ratios (direct versus indirect)
## z - z-value of test for disagreement (direct versus indirect)
## p-value - p-value of test for disagreement (direct versus indirect)
```

How do you interpret the results? Are there any large discrepancies between the direct and indirect estimates?

As the columns 'RoR', 'z', and 'p-value' indicate there is no single pairwise comparison showing large inconsisteny between direct and indirect evidence.

Finally, we look at the design-by-treatment interaction model.

```
decomp.design(net1)
## Q statistics to assess homogeneity / consistency
##
##
                      Q df p-value
## Total
                  88.39 45
                            0.0001
## Within designs 33.62 17
                            0.0094
## Between designs 54.77 28
                            0.0018
##
## Design-specific decomposition of within-designs Q statistic
##
##
      Design
               Q df p-value
##
   LITH:OLA 2.71 1 0.0995
    PLA:ARI 7.32 3
##
                     0.0623
##
    PLA:DIV 3.38 2 0.1842
    PLA:OLA 6.88 4 0.1426
##
##
    PLA:QUE 1.66 2 0.4350
##
    PLA:RIS 6.73 2 0.0345
##
    PLA:ZIP 4.93 3 0.1771
##
## Between-designs Q statistic after detaching of single designs
##
##
                       Q df p-value
   Detached design
##
           ARI:HAL 48.70 27
                             0.0064
##
          CARB:DIV 51.94 27
                             0.0027
##
          CARB:HAL 54.51 27
                             0.0013
##
          DIV:LITH 51.82 27
                             0.0028
##
           DIV:OLA 51.67 27
                             0.0029
##
           HAL:OLA 54.68 27
                             0.0013
##
          LITH:OLA 54.11 27
                             0.0015
##
          LITH:QUE 49.78 27
                             0.0048
##
           OLA:RIS 52.71 27
                             0.0022
##
           PLA:ARI 54.23 27
                             0.0014
           PLA:CARB 51.97 27
##
                             0.0027
##
            PLA:DIV 54.18 27
                             0.0014
##
            PLA:OLA 54.27 27
                             0.0014
##
           PLA:PAL 48.07 27 0.0075
```

```
##
            PLA:QUE 54.33 27
                              0.0014
##
            PLA:RIS 51.38 27
                              0.0031
##
            PLA:ZIP 54.77 27
                              0.0012
##
        PLA:ARI:HAL 51.92 26
                              0.0018
##
       PLA:ARI:LITH 54.34 26
                              0.0009
##
        PLA:ASE:OLA 53.23 27
                              0.0019
##
       PLA:DIV:LITH 51.82 26
                              0.0019
##
        PLA:DIV:OLA 52.20 26
                              0.0017
##
        PLA:HAL:OLA 50.78 26
                              0.0025
##
        PLA:HAL:QUE 52.09 26
                              0.0018
##
        PLA:HAL:RIS 53.82 26
                              0.0011
                              0.0056
##
        PLA:HAL:ZIP 47.87 26
##
       PLA:LITH:QUE 49.80 26
                              0.0033
##
        PLA:PAL:QUE 47.93 26 0.0055
##
## Q statistic to assess consistency under the assumption of
## a full design-by-treatment interaction random effects model
##
##
                       Q df p-value tau.within tau2.within
## Between designs 28.27 28 0.4503
                                        0.2861
                                                    0.0819
```

How do you interpret the overall results (Q statistics)?

The overall Q statistics show that both within-design heterogeneity and between-design inconsistency exists.

Which individual comparison contributes most to the within-design heterogeneity?

The comparison 'PLA:RIS' contributes most to the within-design heterogenity.

Which designs show the largest between-design inconsistency?

The designs 'ARI:HAL' and 'PLA:PAL' have the largest p-values for the between-designs Q statistic after detaching a single design. Accordingly, these two designs contribute most to the inconsistency in the network.

Is any residual inconsistency left after allowing for a full design by treatment interaction model?

No residual inconsistency remains after allowing for a full design by treatment interaction model.

Inconsistency evaluation in schizophrenia dataset

Again, we print the number of designs

```
net3$d
## [1] 63
```

and the list of all designs (to see how many designs have two, three, and four studies)

```
[7] "ARI:ZIP"
##
                            "ASE:OLA"
                                               "CLO:CPZ"
## [10]
        "CLO:HAL"
                           "CLO:OLA"
                                              "CLO:RIS"
## [13]
        "CLO:ZOT"
                           "CPZ:QUE"
                                               "HAL:ILO"
                           "HAL:QUE"
                                              "HAL:RIS"
## [16] "HAL:OLA"
## [19]
        "HAL:SER"
                           "HAL:ZIP"
                                               "HAL:ZOT"
## [22]
        "OLA:QUE"
                           "OLA:RIS"
                                               "OLA:SER"
## [25]
        "OLA:ZIP"
                           "PBO:ARI"
                                              "PBO:CPZ"
## [28]
        "PBO:HAL"
                           "PBO:LURA"
                                              "PBO:OLA"
## [31] "PBO:pal"
                           "PBO:QUE"
                                              "PBO:RIS"
## [34]
                           "PBO:ZIP"
                                              "PBO:ZOT"
        "PBO:SER"
## [37] "QUE:RIS"
                           "RIS:SER"
                                              "RIS:ZIP"
## [40]
        "ARI:OLA:QUE:RIS"
                           "CLO:HAL:OLA"
                                               "CLO:HAL:RIS"
                           "OLA:QUE:RIS:ZIP"
                                              "PBO:ARI:HAL"
## [43] "OLA:QUE:RIS"
## [46]
        "PBO:ARI:RIS"
                           "PBO:ASE:HAL"
                                               "PBO:ASE:OLA"
## [49]
        "PBO:ASE:RIS"
                           "PBO:CLO:CPZ"
                                               "PBO:CPZ:HAL"
                           "PBO:HAL:ILO"
## [52] "PBO:CPZ:ZOT"
                                              "PBO:HAL:LURA"
## [55] "PBO:HAL:QUE"
                           "PBO:HAL:RIS"
                                              "PBO:HAL:SER"
## [58] "PBO:HAL:ZIP"
                           "PBO:ILO:RIS"
                                              "PBO:ILO:ZIP"
## [61] "PBO:LURA:OLA"
                           "PBO:LURA:QUE"
                                               "PBO:OLA:pal"
```

We see that the schizophrenia dataset contains 63 designs of which 22 are three-arm designs and 2 are four-arm designs.

Next, we apply the SIDE method and print the results for the random effects model.

```
split3 = netsplit(net3)
print(split3, show = "both", digits = 2)
## Back-calculation method to split direct and indirect evidence
##
## Random effects model:
##
##
    comparison
                k prop
                         nma direct indir.
                                             Diff
                                                      z p-value
##
       AMI:HAL
                6 0.40 -0.21
                              -0.30
                                      -0.14 -0.16 -1.33
                                                         0.1827
##
       AMI:OLA
                5 0.37 -0.07
                              -0.01
                                      -0.10
                                             0.09
                                                   0.75
                                                         0.4558
##
       AMI:RIS
                4 0.35 -0.10
                              -0.05
                                      -0.13
                                                         0.5253
                                             0.08
                                                   0.64
##
                4 0.34
                        0.02
                                       0.04 -0.05 -0.48
       ARI:HAL
                              -0.01
                                                         0.6278
##
       ARI:OLA 4 0.36
                       0.16
                                0.23
                                       0.11 0.12
                                                   1.17
                                                         0.2418
##
       ARI:PBO
                6 0.42 -0.43
                               -0.44
                                      -0.42 -0.03 -0.28
                                                         0.7825
##
       ARI:QUE
                1 0.03
                        0.00
                                0.38
                                      -0.01 0.39
                                                   1.14
                                                         0.2530
##
       ARI:RIS
                3 0.17
                        0.13
                                0.10
                                       0.13 -0.04 -0.25
                                                         0.7990
##
                1 0.14 -0.04
                              -0.16
                                     -0.02 -0.14 -0.80
       ARI:ZIP
                                                         0.4244
                1 0.18
                        0.07
##
       ASE:HAL
                               -0.02
                                       0.09 -0.11 -0.64
                                                         0.5205
##
       ASE:OLA 3 0.57
                        0.21
                                0.13
                                       0.32 -0.19 -1.43
                                                         0.1538
##
       ASE:PBO 4 0.58 -0.37
                              -0.18
                                      -0.64 0.46
                                                  3.43
                                                         0.0006
##
       ASE:RIS
                1 0.10
                        0.18
                              -0.15
                                       0.22 -0.37 -1.61
                                                         0.1078
##
       CLO:CPZ 5 0.49 -0.48
                              -0.42
                                      -0.53 0.11 0.61
                                                         0.5421
##
       CLO:HAL
                8 0.51 -0.40
                              -0.48
                                      -0.32 -0.16 -1.02
                                                         0.3057
##
       CLO:OLA
                2 0.15 -0.26
                                0.07
                                      -0.32 0.39
                                                   1.71
                                                         0.0879
##
       CLO:PBO
                1 0.02 -0.85
                               -1.64
                                      -0.83 -0.81 -1.51
                                                         0.1299
##
       CLO:RIS 2 0.13 -0.29 -0.36 -0.28 -0.08 -0.33
                                                         0.7401
```

```
##
       CLO:ZOT
                2 0.27 -0.36
                              -0.43
                                     -0.33 -0.10 -0.40
                                                         0.6868
##
       CPZ:HAL
                1 0.04
                        0.08
                              -0.29
                                      0.09 -0.39 -0.91
                                                         0.3640
##
       CPZ:PBO 11 0.53 -0.37
                              -0.39
                                     -0.34 -0.04 -0.26
                                                         0.7945
##
       CPZ:QUE
               1 0.24
                        0.06
                               0.05
                                      0.07 -0.02 -0.08
                                                         0.9380
##
       CPZ:ZOT
               1 0.25
                        0.12
                               0.76
                                     -0.09 0.85
                                                   3.28
                                                         0.0011
       HAL:ILO 4 0.51 -0.12
##
                              -0.08
                                     -0.18
                                            0.10
                                                   0.94
                                                         0.3494
##
      HAL:LURA 1 0.13 -0.12
                              -0.28
                                     -0.10 -0.18 -0.94
                                                         0.3468
       HAL:OLA 11 0.31
##
                       0.14
                               0.14
                                      0.14
                                            0.00
                                                   0.04
                                                         0.9679
##
       HAL:PBO 21 0.42 -0.45
                              -0.50
                                     -0.41 -0.09 -1.44
                                                         0.1491
##
       HAL:QUE 4 0.22 -0.02
                              -0.07
                                     -0.00 -0.07 -0.63
                                                         0.5302
##
       HAL:RIS 17 0.37
                        0.11
                               0.16
                                      0.07 0.09
                                                  1.25
                                                         0.2111
##
       HAL:SER
               3 0.53 -0.06
                              -0.12
                                      0.01 -0.13 -0.95
                                                         0.3396
##
               3 0.23 -0.05
                                     -0.03 -0.09 -0.77
                                                         0.4413
       HAL:ZIP
                              -0.13
       HAL:ZOT 4 0.45 0.04
##
                              -0.09
                                      0.15 -0.24 -1.31
                                                         0.1892
##
       ILO:PBO 4 0.51 -0.32
                                     -0.39
                                            0.13
                              -0.26
                                                   1.15
                                                         0.2493
##
       ILO:RIS
               2 0.29
                        0.23
                               0.29
                                      0.21 0.09
                                                   0.69
                                                         0.4932
##
       ILO:ZIP
                1 0.21
                       0.07
                               0.02
                                      0.08 -0.06 -0.38
                                                         0.7004
##
      LURA:OLA 1 0.19
                        0.26
                               0.16
                                      0.28 -0.12 -0.71
                                                         0.4758
##
      LURA: PBO 6 0.82 -0.33
                              -0.34
                                     -0.29 -0.05 -0.30
                                                         0.7621
##
      LURA: QUE
               1 0.22
                        0.10
                               0.17
                                      0.08 0.09
                                                   0.50
                                                         0.6145
##
       OLA:pal 4 0.51 -0.09
                                     -0.13
                                                         0.5514
                              -0.06
                                            0.07
                                                   0.60
##
       OLA:PBO 14 0.40 -0.58
                              -0.58
                                     -0.59
                                            0.01
                                                   0.16
                                                         0.8728
##
               7 0.29 -0.15
                                     -0.19
                                            0.10
       OLA:QUE
                              -0.08
                                                   1.00
                                                         0.3164
##
       OLA:RIS 10 0.31 -0.03
                              -0.05
                                     -0.02 -0.04 -0.44
                                                         0.6591
##
       OLA:SER
               1 0.22 -0.20
                              -0.23
                                     -0.19 -0.04 -0.26
                                                         0.7928
##
       OLA:ZIP
               5 0.42 -0.19
                              -0.14
                                     -0.23
                                            0.09
                                                   0.84
                                                         0.3988
##
       pal:PBO 8 0.85 -0.49
                              -0.50
                                     -0.46 -0.04 -0.25
                                                         0.7990
       QUE:PBO 7 0.44 -0.43
##
                              -0.42
                                     -0.43
                                            0.01
                                                   0.14
                                                         0.8874
##
       RIS:PBO 12 0.42 -0.55
                              -0.58
                                     -0.53 -0.05 -0.76
                                                         0.4483
##
       SER:PBO
               3 0.39 -0.39
                              -0.35
                                     -0.41 0.06 0.43
                                                         0.6704
##
       ZIP:PBO 4 0.30 -0.39
                              -0.40
                                     -0.39 -0.01 -0.10
                                                         0.9212
                                                         0.6737
##
       ZOT:PBO 2 0.37 -0.49
                              -0.54
                                     -0.46 -0.08 -0.42
##
       QUE:RIS
                6 0.39
                       0.12
                               0.06
                                      0.17 -0.11 -1.13
                                                         0.2586
                1 0.19 -0.04
##
       QUE:ZIP
                              -0.02
                                     -0.04
                                            0.02
                                                   0.14
                                                         0.8876
##
       RIS:SER
                1 0.15 -0.17
                               0.15
                                     -0.22
                                             0.37
                                                   1.87
                                                         0.0612
##
                2 0.26 -0.16
                                     -0.19
                                            0.10
       RIS:ZIP
                              -0.09
                                                   0.85
                                                         0.3941
##
## Legend:
##
    comparison - Treatment comparison
               - Number of studies providing direct evidence
##
##
    prop
               - Direct evidence proportion
               - Estimated treatment effect (SMD) in network meta-analysis
##
    nma
               - Estimated treatment effect (SMD) derived from direct
##
    direct
evidence
               - Estimated treatment effect (SMD) derived from indirect
## indir.
evidence
## Diff
               - Difference between direct and indirect treatment estimates
               z-value of test for disagreement (direct versus indirect)
## Z
## p-value

    p-value of test for disagreement (direct versus indirect)
```

How do you interpret the results? Are there any large discrepancies between the direct and indirect estimates?

Taking into account the large number of 54 pairwise comparisons, only the p-value from the comparison 'ASE:PBO' indicates that direct and indirect evidence differs substantially (p = 0.0006 < 0.05 / 54).

Finally, we look at the design-by-treatment interaction model.

```
decomp.design(net3)
## Q statistics to assess homogeneity / consistency
##
##
                              p-value
                       0
                         df
                  279.59 192 < 0.0001
## Total
## Within designs 139.67 118
                               0.0846
## Between designs 139.93 74 < 0.0001
##
## Design-specific decomposition of within-designs Q statistic
##
##
        Design
                   Q df p-value
##
       AMI:HAL 2.15
                         0.8287
                      5
                         0.0059
##
       AMI:OLA 14.48 4
##
       AMI:RIS 1.92
                         0.5897
                      3
##
       ARI:OLA 0.14
                      2
                         0.9320
##
       CLO:CPZ 5.93
                      3
                         0.1151
##
       CLO:HAL 8.03
                      5
                         0.1549
##
       CLO:ZOT 3.06
                      1
                         0.0804
##
       HAL:ILO 0.19
                      2
                         0.9109
##
       HAL:OLA 8.85
                      9
                         0.4510
##
       HAL:QUE 0.76 2
                         0.6844
##
       HAL:RIS 24.26 12
                         0.0187
       HAL:ZIP 0.03 1
##
                         0.8619
##
       HAL:ZOT 6.39 3
                         0.0942
##
       OLA:QUE 0.31
                      1
                         0.5781
##
       OLA:RIS 0.04
                      4
                         0.9998
##
       OLA:ZIP
                2.23
                      3
                         0.5269
##
       PBO:ARI 0.27
                      1
                         0.6027
##
       PBO:CPZ 2.87
                      7
                         0.8968
##
       PBO:HAL 8.52
                      6
                         0.2025
##
      PBO:LURA 3.89
                         0.1432
                      2
##
       PBO:OLA 13.24
                      6
                         0.0394
##
       PBO:pal 2.86
                      3
                         0.4136
##
       PBO:QUE
                5.03
                      4
                         0.2844
##
       PBO:RIS 3.27
                      4
                         0.5143
##
       PBO:ZIP
                0.02
                      1
                         0.8806
##
   OLA:QUE:RIS 2.69
                      4
                         0.6102
##
   PBO:ARI:HAL
                3.66
                      4
                         0.4537
   PBO:ASE:OLA 4.44
                      2
##
                         0.1087
##
   PBO:HAL:RIS 4.16
                         0.3850
                      4
##
   PBO:HAL:SER 1.24
                      2
                         0.5377
## PBO:ILO:RIS 0.77 2 0.6796
```

```
##
    PBO:OLA:pal 3.99 6 0.6774
##
## Between-designs Q statistic after detaching of single designs
##
##
    Detached design
                         Q df p-value
##
            AMI:HAL 137.90 73 < 0.0001
            AMI:OLA 139.51 73 < 0.0001
##
##
            AMI:RIS 139.32 73 < 0.0001
##
            ARI:HAL 139.35 73 < 0.0001
##
            ARI:OLA 138.16 73 < 0.0001
##
            ARI:RIS 139.89 73 < 0.0001
##
            ARI:ZIP 138.79 73 < 0.0001
            ASE:OLA 134.81 73 < 0.0001
##
##
            CLO:CPZ 137.81 73 < 0.0001
##
            CLO:HAL 138.95 73 < 0.0001
##
            CLO:OLA 139.93 73 < 0.0001
##
            CLO:RIS 139.79 73 < 0.0001
##
            CLO:ZOT 139.50 73 < 0.0001
##
            CPZ:QUE 139.89 73 < 0.0001
##
            HAL:ILO 137.71 73 < 0.0001
            HAL:OLA 139.75 73 < 0.0001
##
##
            HAL:QUE 138.57 73 < 0.0001
##
            HAL:RIS 139.74 73 < 0.0001
##
            HAL:SER 139.86 73 < 0.0001
##
            HAL:ZIP 139.92 73 < 0.0001
##
            HAL:ZOT 137.86 73 < 0.0001
##
            OLA: QUE 139.36 73 < 0.0001
            OLA:RIS 139.69 73 < 0.0001
##
##
            OLA:SER 139.85 73 < 0.0001
##
            OLA:ZIP 139.91 73 < 0.0001
##
            PBO:ARI 139.83 73 < 0.0001
##
            PBO:CPZ 138.83 73 < 0.0001
##
            PBO:HAL 136.40 73 < 0.0001
##
           PBO:LURA 139.93 73 < 0.0001
##
            PBO:OLA 137.62 73 < 0.0001
##
            PBO:pal 133.19 73 < 0.0001
##
            PBO:QUE 134.12 73 < 0.0001
##
            PBO:RIS 139.50 73 < 0.0001
##
            PBO:SER 139.52 73 < 0.0001
##
            PBO:ZIP 139.07 73 < 0.0001
            PBO:ZOT 139.05 73 < 0.0001
##
##
            QUE:RIS 139.93 73 < 0.0001
##
            RIS:SER 134.82 73 < 0.0001
##
            RIS:ZIP 139.72 73 < 0.0001
##
    ARI:OLA:OUE:RIS 137.29 71 < 0.0001
##
        CLO:HAL:OLA 135.71 72 < 0.0001
##
        CLO:HAL:RIS 132.96 72 < 0.0001
##
        OLA:QUE:RIS 139.58 72 < 0.0001
##
    OLA:QUE:RIS:ZIP 133.26 71 < 0.0001
##
        PBO:ARI:HAL 139.18 72 < 0.0001
```

```
PBO:ARI:RIS 139.62 72 < 0.0001
##
##
        PBO:ASE:HAL 138.94 72 < 0.0001
##
        PBO:ASE:OLA 116.83 72
                                0.0007
##
        PBO:ASE:RIS 137.26 72 < 0.0001
##
        PBO:CLO:CPZ 137.10 72 < 0.0001
##
        PBO:CPZ:HAL 136.48 72 < 0.0001
##
        PBO:CPZ:ZOT 124.04 72
                                0.0001
##
        PBO:HAL:ILO 139.08 72 < 0.0001
##
       PBO:HAL:LURA 131.62 72 < 0.0001
##
        PBO:HAL:QUE 138.66 72 < 0.0001
##
        PBO:HAL:RIS 131.06 72 < 0.0001
        PBO:HAL:SER 137.11 72 < 0.0001
##
##
        PBO:HAL:ZIP 138.36 72 < 0.0001
##
        PBO:ILO:RIS 138.59 72 < 0.0001
##
        PBO:ILO:ZIP 139.30 72 < 0.0001
##
       PBO:LURA:OLA 138.41 72 < 0.0001
##
       PBO:LURA:QUE 124.26 72
                                0.0001
##
        PBO:OLA:pal 130.89 72 < 0.0001
##
## Q statistic to assess consistency under the assumption of
## a full design-by-treatment interaction random effects model
##
##
                        Q df p-value tau.within tau2.within
## Between designs 113.70 74 0.0021
                                          0.0728
                                                      0.0053
```

How do you interpret the overall results (Q statistics)?

The overall Q statistics shows that large between-design inconsistency exists, however, that results within-designs do - in total - not differ substantially.

Which individual comparisons contribute most to the within-design heterogeneity?

The comparisons 'AMI:OLA' and 'HAL:RIS' contribute most to the (non-significant) within-study heterogeneity.

Which designs show the largest between-design inconsistency?

Looking at the Q statistics and noticing that the degrees of freedom are very similar, we see that the designs 'PBO:ASE:OLA', 'PBO:CPZ:ZOT', and 'PBO:LURA:QUE' contribute most to the between-study inconsistency.

Is any residual inconsistency left after allowing for a full design by treatment interaction model?

Substantial residual inconsistency remains in a full design by treatment interaction model.