

We update the CAVI algorithm with

$$q_j^*(\nu_j) \propto \exp \left(\mathbb{E}_{q_{-\nu_j}} [\ln p(\nu_j, \boldsymbol{\nu}_{-j}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}, \mathbf{r}, \mathbf{y})] \right) = \exp \left(\mathbb{E}_{q_{-\nu_j}} [\ln p(\mathbf{y} | \boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}, \mathbf{r}) p(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma})] \right),$$

hence we would like to calculate

$$\mathbb{E}_{q_{-\nu_j}} [\ln p(\mathbf{y} | \boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}, \mathbf{r})] \quad \text{and} \quad \mathbb{E}_{q_{-\nu_j}} [\ln p(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma})],$$

where

- $q_{-\nu_j}$ is the distribution over $(\boldsymbol{\nu}_{-j}, \boldsymbol{\gamma})$ that assumes the variables are independent Gaussians with mean vector $(\mathbf{m}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}_{-j}}, \mathbf{m}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}})$ and variance vector $(\mathbf{s}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}_{-j}}, \mathbf{s}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}})$,
- $p(\mathbf{y} | \boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}, \mathbf{r}) = \prod_{i=1}^n p(y_i | \boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}_i, \mathbf{r}_i)$ with $p(y_i | \boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}_i, \mathbf{r}_i) \sim \mathcal{N}(\boldsymbol{\nu}^T \mathbf{t}_i + \boldsymbol{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r}_i, \sigma_\epsilon^2)$, and
- $p(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}) = p(\boldsymbol{\nu})p(\boldsymbol{\gamma})$ with $p(\boldsymbol{\nu}) \sim \mathcal{N}(\boldsymbol{\mu}_\nu, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_\nu)$ and $p(\boldsymbol{\gamma}) \sim \mathcal{N}(\boldsymbol{\mu}_\gamma, \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_\gamma)$.

1 Calculating $\mathbb{E}_{q_{-\nu_j}} [\ln p(\mathbf{y} | \boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}, \mathbf{r})]$

First notice that

$$\begin{aligned} \ln p(\mathbf{y} | \boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}, \mathbf{r}) &= \ln \prod_{i=1}^n p(y_i | \boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}_i, \mathbf{r}_i) \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^n \ln p(y_i | \boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}_i, \mathbf{r}_i) \\ &= -\frac{n}{2} \ln (2\pi\sigma_\epsilon^2) - \frac{1}{2\sigma_\epsilon^2} \sum_{i=1}^n (y_i - \boldsymbol{\nu}^T \mathbf{t}_i - \boldsymbol{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r}_i)^2, \end{aligned} \tag{1}$$

Therefore, we have

$$\mathbb{E}_{q_{-\nu_j}} [\ln p(\mathbf{y} | \boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}, \mathbf{r})] = -\frac{n}{2} \ln (2\pi\sigma_\epsilon^2) - \frac{1}{2\sigma_\epsilon^2} \sum_{i=1}^n \mathbb{E}_{q_{-\nu_j}} \left[(y_i - \boldsymbol{\nu}^T \mathbf{t}_i - \boldsymbol{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r}_i)^2 \right], \tag{2}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E}_{q_{-\nu_j}} \left[(y - \boldsymbol{\nu}^T \mathbf{t} - \boldsymbol{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r})^2 \right] &= \mathbb{E}_{q_{-\nu_j}} \left[y^2 + (\boldsymbol{\nu}^T \mathbf{t})^2 + (\boldsymbol{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r})^2 - 2y\boldsymbol{\nu}^T \mathbf{t} - 2y\boldsymbol{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r} + 2(\boldsymbol{\nu}^T \mathbf{t})(\boldsymbol{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r}) \right] \\ &= y^2 + \mathbb{E}_{q_{-\nu_j}} \left[(\boldsymbol{\nu}^T \mathbf{t})^2 \right] + \mathbb{E}_{q_{-\nu_j}} \left[(\boldsymbol{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r})^2 \right] - 2y\nu_j t_j - 2y\mathbf{m}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}_{-j}}^T \mathbf{t}_{-j} - 2\mathbf{m}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}^T \mathbf{r} + 2(\nu_j t_j + \mathbf{m}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}_{-j}}^T \mathbf{t}_{-j})(\mathbf{m}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}^T \mathbf{r}) \end{aligned} \tag{3}$$

where we simplify further using that

$$\begin{aligned}
\mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j} [(\boldsymbol{\nu}^T \mathbf{t})^2] &= \mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j} \left[\sum_{i=1}^{n_\nu} \sum_{i'=1}^{n_\nu} \nu_i \nu_{i'} t_i t_{i'} \right] \\
&= \sum_{i=1}^{n_\nu} \sum_{i'=1}^{n_\nu} t_i t_{i'} \mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j} [\nu_i \nu_{i'}] \\
&= t_j^2 \nu_j^2 + \sum_{i' \neq j} t_j t_{i'} \nu_j [m_\nu]_{i'} + \sum_{i \neq j} t_i t_j [m_\nu]_i \nu_j + \sum_{i \neq j} \sum_{i' \neq j} t_i t_{i'} \mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j} [\nu_i \nu_{i'}] \\
&= t_j^2 \nu_j^2 + 2 \sum_{i' \neq j} t_j t_{i'} \nu_j [m_\nu]_{i'} + \sum_{i \neq j} \sum_{i' \neq j; i' \neq i} t_i t_{i'} [m_\nu]_i [m_\nu]_{i'} + \sum_{i \neq j} t_i^2 \mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j} [\nu_i^2] \\
&= t_j^2 \nu_j^2 + 2 \sum_{i' \neq j} t_j t_{i'} \nu_j [m_\nu]_{i'} + \sum_{i \neq j} \sum_{i' \neq j; i' \neq i} t_i t_{i'} [m_\nu]_i [m_\nu]_{i'} + \sum_{i \neq j} t_i^2 ([s_\nu]_i + [m_\nu]_i^2) \\
&= t_j^2 \nu_j^2 + 2 \sum_{i' \neq j} t_j t_{i'} \nu_j [m_\nu]_{i'} + \sum_{i \neq j} \sum_{i' \neq j} t_i t_{i'} [m_\nu]_i [m_\nu]_{i'} + \sum_{i \neq j} t_i^2 [s_\nu]_i
\end{aligned} \tag{4}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned}
\mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j} [(\boldsymbol{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r})^2] &= \sum_{i=1}^{n_\gamma} \sum_{i'=1}^{n_\gamma} r_i r_{i'} \mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j} [\gamma_i \gamma_{i'}] \\
&= \sum_{i=1}^{n_\gamma} r_i^2 \mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j} [\gamma_i^2] + \sum_{i=1}^{n_\gamma} \sum_{i' \neq i} r_i r_{i'} \mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j} [\gamma_i \gamma_{i'}] \\
&= \sum_{i=1}^{n_\gamma} r_i^2 ([s_\gamma]_i + [m_\gamma]_i^2) + \sum_{i=1}^{n_\gamma} \sum_{i' \neq i} r_i r_{i'} [m_\gamma]_i [m_\gamma]_{i'} \\
&= \sum_{i=1}^{n_\gamma} r_i^2 [s_\gamma]_i + \sum_{i=1}^{n_\gamma} \sum_{i'=1}^{n_\gamma} r_i r_{i'} [m_\gamma]_i [m_\gamma]_{i'} \\
&= \mathbf{s}_\gamma^T \mathbf{r}^2 + (\mathbf{m}_\gamma^T \mathbf{r})^2.
\end{aligned} \tag{5}$$

Excluding terms that don't contain a ν_j we have

$$\begin{aligned}
\mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j} [\ln p(\mathbf{y} | \boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}, \mathbf{r})] &= -\frac{1}{2\sigma_\epsilon^2} \sum_{i=1}^n \left(t_{ij}^2 \nu_j^2 + 2t_{ij} \nu_j \sum_{k \neq j} t_{ik} [m_\nu]_k - 2\nu_j t_{ij} (y_i - \mathbf{m}_\gamma^T \mathbf{r}_i) \right) \\
&= -\frac{1}{2\sigma_\epsilon^2} \sum_{i=1}^n (t_{ij}^2 \nu_j^2 + 2\nu_j t_{ij} (\mathbf{m}_\nu^T \mathbf{t}_i - t_{ij} [m_\nu]_j) - 2\nu_j t_{ij} (y_i - \mathbf{m}_\gamma^T \mathbf{r}_i)) \\
&= -\frac{\nu_j^2}{2\sigma_\epsilon^2} \sum_{i=1}^n t_{ij}^2 + \frac{\nu_j}{\sigma_\epsilon^2} \sum_{i=1}^n t_{ij} (y_i - \mathbf{m}_\gamma^T \mathbf{r}_i - \mathbf{m}_\nu^T \mathbf{t}_i + [m_\nu]_j t_{ij}).
\end{aligned} \tag{6}$$

2 Calculating $\mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j}[\ln p(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma})]$

First, we simplify:

$$\begin{aligned} \ln p(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}) &= \ln p(\boldsymbol{\nu}) + \ln p(\boldsymbol{\gamma}) \\ &= -\left(\frac{n_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}}{2} + \frac{n_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}}{2}\right) \ln(2\pi) - \frac{1}{2}(\ln|\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}| + \ln|\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}|) - \frac{1}{2}(\boldsymbol{\nu} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}})^T \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\nu} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}) - \frac{1}{2}(\boldsymbol{\gamma} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}})^T \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\gamma} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}). \end{aligned} \quad (7)$$

Then, we find

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j}[\ln p(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma})] &= -\left(\frac{n_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}}{2} + \frac{n_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}}{2}\right) \ln(2\pi) - \frac{1}{2}(\ln|\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}| + \ln|\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}|) \\ &\quad - \frac{1}{2}\mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j}[(\boldsymbol{\nu} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}})^T \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\nu} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}})] - \frac{1}{2}\mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j}[(\boldsymbol{\gamma} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}})^T \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\gamma} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}})], \end{aligned} \quad (8)$$

where we find the final result using

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j}[(\boldsymbol{\nu} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}})^T \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\nu} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}})] &= \sum_{i=1}^{n_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}} \sum_{i'=1}^{n_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}} [\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}^{-1}]_{ii'} \mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j}[(\nu_i - [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i)(\nu_{i'} - [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_{i'})] \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^{n_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}} \sum_{i'=1}^{n_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}} [\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}^{-1}]_{ii'} \mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j}[\nu_i \nu_{i'} - [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i \nu_{i'} - [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_{i'} \nu_i + [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_{i'}] \\ &= \sum_{i=1}^{n_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}} \sum_{i'=1}^{n_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}} [\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}^{-1}]_{ii'} \mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j}[\nu_i \nu_{i'} - [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i \nu_{i'} - [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_{i'} \nu_i + [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_{i'}] \\ &= [\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}^{-1}]_{jj} (\nu_j^2 - 2[\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_j \nu_j + [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_j^2) + 2 \sum_{i \neq j} [\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}^{-1}]_{ij} ([m_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i \nu_j - [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i \nu_j - [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_j [m_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i + [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_j) \\ &\quad + \sum_{i \neq j} \sum_{i' \neq j} [\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}^{-1}]_{ii'} ([m_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i [m_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_{i'} - [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i [m_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_{i'} - [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_{i'} [m_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i + [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_{i'}), \end{aligned} \quad (9)$$

and

$$\mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j}[(\boldsymbol{\gamma} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}})^T \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}^{-1}(\boldsymbol{\gamma} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}})] = (\mathbf{m}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}})^T \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}^{-1}(\mathbf{m}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}). \quad (10)$$

Putting this together and excluding terms that don't contain a ν_j we have

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E}_{q-\nu_j}[\ln p(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma})] &= -\frac{1}{2} \left([\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}^{-1}]_{jj} (\nu_j^2 - 2[\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_j \nu_j) + 2\nu_j \sum_{i \neq j} [\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}^{-1}]_{ij} ([m_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i - [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_i) \right) \\ &= -\frac{\nu_j^2}{2} [\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}^{-1}]_{jj} + \nu_j [\boldsymbol{\Sigma}_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}^{-1}]_{jj} [\mu_{\boldsymbol{\nu}}]_j. \end{aligned} \quad (11)$$

3 CAVI Update

Therefore, we have

$$\ln q_j^*(\nu_j) \propto -\frac{\nu_j^2}{2} \left([\Sigma_{\nu}^{-1}]_{jj} + \frac{1}{\sigma_{\epsilon}^2} \sum_{i=1}^n t_{ij}^2 \right) + \nu_j \left([\Sigma_{\nu}^{-1}]_{jj} [\mu_{\nu}]_j + \frac{1}{\sigma_{\epsilon}^2} \sum_{i=1}^n t_{ij} (y_i - \mathbf{m}_{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r}_i - \mathbf{m}_{\nu}^T \mathbf{t}_i + [m_{\nu}]_j t_{ij}) \right),$$

hence $q_j^*(\nu_j)$ is Gaussian with mean

$$\frac{[\Sigma_{\nu}^{-1}]_{jj} [\mu_{\nu}]_j + \frac{1}{\sigma_{\epsilon}^2} \sum_{i=1}^n t_{ij} (y_i - \mathbf{m}_{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r}_i - \mathbf{m}_{\nu}^T \mathbf{t}_i + [m_{\nu}]_j t_{ij})}{[\Sigma_{\nu}^{-1}]_{jj} + \frac{1}{\sigma_{\epsilon}^2} \sum_{i=1}^n t_{ij}^2},$$

and variance

$$\left([\Sigma_{\nu}^{-1}]_{jj} + \frac{1}{\sigma_{\epsilon}^2} \sum_{i=1}^n t_{ij}^2 \right)^{-1}.$$

The γ updates are similar.

4 Calculating the ELBO

Recall that the ELBO equals

$$ELBO(q) = \mathbb{E}_q[\ln p(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}, \mathbf{r}, \mathbf{y})] - \mathbb{E}_q[\ln q(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma})]$$

where in any iteration of the CAVI algorithm, q is the distribution over $(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma})$ that assumes the variables are independent Gaussians with mean vector $(\mathbf{m}_{\nu}, \mathbf{m}_{\gamma})$ and variance vector $(\mathbf{s}_{\nu}, \mathbf{s}_{\gamma})$.

We know that

$$\mathbb{E}_q[\ln p(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}, \mathbf{r}, \mathbf{y})] = \mathbb{E}_q[\ln p(\mathbf{y}|\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}, \mathbf{r})] + \mathbb{E}_q[\ln p(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma})],$$

hence, from work similar to what was previously computed,

$$\begin{aligned} & \mathbb{E}_q[\ln p(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}, \mathbf{t}, \mathbf{r}, \mathbf{y})] \\ &= -\frac{1}{2\sigma_{\epsilon}^2} \sum_{i=1}^n [y_i^2 + \mathbf{s}_{\nu}^T \mathbf{t}_i^2 + (\mathbf{m}_{\nu}^T \mathbf{t}_i)^2 + \mathbf{s}_{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r}_i^2 + (\mathbf{m}_{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r}_i)^2 - 2y_i \mathbf{m}_{\nu}^T \mathbf{t}_i - 2\mathbf{m}_{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r}_i + 2(\mathbf{m}_{\nu}^T \mathbf{t}_i)(\mathbf{m}_{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r}_i)] \\ & \quad - \frac{1}{2}(\mathbf{m}_{\nu} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\nu})^T \Sigma_{\nu}^{-1}(\mathbf{m}_{\nu} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\nu}) - \frac{1}{2}(\mathbf{m}_{\gamma} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\gamma})^T \Sigma_{\gamma}^{-1}(\mathbf{m}_{\gamma} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\gamma}) \\ &= -\frac{1}{2\sigma_{\epsilon}^2} \sum_{i=1}^n (y_i - \mathbf{m}_{\nu}^T \mathbf{t}_i - \mathbf{m}_{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r}_i)^2 - \frac{1}{2\sigma_{\epsilon}^2} \sum_{i=1}^n (\mathbf{s}_{\nu}^T \mathbf{t}_i^2 + \mathbf{s}_{\gamma}^T \mathbf{r}_i^2) \\ & \quad - \frac{1}{2}(\mathbf{m}_{\nu} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\nu})^T \Sigma_{\nu}^{-1}(\mathbf{m}_{\nu} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\nu}) - \frac{1}{2}(\mathbf{m}_{\gamma} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\gamma})^T \Sigma_{\gamma}^{-1}(\mathbf{m}_{\gamma} - \boldsymbol{\mu}_{\gamma}). \end{aligned} \tag{12}$$

In the above, we have dropped constants that will not change as the algorithm updates.

We finally note that

$$q(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}) = \prod_{k=1}^{n_\nu} \prod_{k'=1}^{n_\gamma} q(\nu_k) q(\gamma_{k'}) = \prod_{k=1}^{n_\nu} \prod_{k'=1}^{n_\gamma} \frac{1}{2\pi \sqrt{[s_\nu]_k [s_\gamma]_{k'}}} \exp \left(-\frac{(\nu_k - [m_\nu]_k)^2}{2[s_\nu]_k} - \frac{(\gamma_{k'} - [m_\gamma]_{k'})^2}{2[s_\gamma]_{k'}} \right).$$

Hence,

$$\ln q(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma}) = - \left(\sum_{k=1}^{n_\nu} \sum_{k'=1}^{n_\gamma} \ln \left(2\pi \sqrt{[s_\nu]_k [s_\gamma]_{k'}} \right) + \frac{(\nu_k - [m_\nu]_k)^2}{2[s_\nu]_k} + \frac{(\gamma_{k'} - [m_\gamma]_{k'})^2}{2[s_\gamma]_{k'}} \right),$$

and so it follows

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E}_q [\ln q(\boldsymbol{\nu}, \boldsymbol{\gamma})] &= - \left(\sum_{k=1}^{n_\nu} \sum_{k'=1}^{n_\gamma} \ln \left(2\pi \sqrt{[s_\nu]_k [s_\gamma]_{k'}} \right) + \frac{\mathbb{E}_q [(\nu_k - [m_\nu]_k)^2]}{2[s_\nu]_k} + \frac{\mathbb{E}_q [(\gamma_{k'} - [m_\gamma]_{k'})^2]}{2[s_\gamma]_{k'}} \right) \\ &= - \sum_{k=1}^{n_\nu} \sum_{k'=1}^{n_\gamma} \left(\ln \left(2\pi \sqrt{[s_\nu]_k [s_\gamma]_{k'}} \right) + 1 \right). \end{aligned} \tag{13}$$

Next, combining (12) and (13) we can compute the ELBO as

$$\begin{aligned} ELBO(q) &= \frac{1}{\sigma_\epsilon^2} \sum_{i=1}^n (y_i - \mathbf{m}_\nu^T \mathbf{t}_i - \mathbf{m}_\gamma^T \mathbf{r}_i)^2 + \frac{1}{\sigma_\epsilon^2} \sum_{i=1}^n (\mathbf{s}_\nu^T \mathbf{t}_i^2 + \mathbf{s}_\gamma^T \mathbf{r}_i^2) \\ &\quad + (\mathbf{m}_\nu - \boldsymbol{\mu}_\nu)^T \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_\nu^{-1} (\mathbf{m}_\nu - \boldsymbol{\mu}_\nu) + (\mathbf{m}_\gamma - \boldsymbol{\mu}_\gamma)^T \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_\gamma^{-1} (\mathbf{m}_\gamma - \boldsymbol{\mu}_\gamma) - \sum_{k=1}^{n_\nu} \sum_{k'=1}^{n_\gamma} \ln ([s_\nu]_k [s_\gamma]_{k'}). \end{aligned} \tag{14}$$

Noticing further that \mathbf{s}_ν and \mathbf{s}_γ do not change as the algorithm iterates, we have

$$ELBO(q) = \frac{1}{\sigma_\epsilon^2} \sum_{i=1}^n (y_i - \mathbf{m}_\nu^T \mathbf{t}_i - \mathbf{m}_\gamma^T \mathbf{r}_i)^2 + (\mathbf{m}_\nu - \boldsymbol{\mu}_\nu)^T \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_\nu^{-1} (\mathbf{m}_\nu - \boldsymbol{\mu}_\nu) + (\mathbf{m}_\gamma - \boldsymbol{\mu}_\gamma)^T \boldsymbol{\Sigma}_\gamma^{-1} (\mathbf{m}_\gamma - \boldsymbol{\mu}_\gamma). \tag{15}$$