**CEE 573: Snow Hydrology**

**P7 reviewing P8**

**Proposal Review:**

Follow the directions for the proposal specified in the term project description on canvas.

Please bring this page to class. We will review each other’s proposals in class following NSF’s “intellectual merit” criteria. For each proposal you review, you need to address the following. (Keep this in mind as you prepare your own proposal.)

• Comment in detail on the quality of the proposal

The scope of the project is well refined and the understanding of what is to be accomplished is reasonable for this stage in the timeline of the project. The proposal is in need of references for different claims listed throughout the document. The motivations are clear and well communicated (but need some citations) and the work to be completed is outlined well.

• Provide an overall rating of the proposal (1 to 5): \_\_\_\_\_

• Identify the proposal’s strengths and weaknesses for each of the following NSF Merit Review Criteria:

• How important is the proposed activity to advancing knowledge and understanding within its own field or across different fields?

This will be an applied investigation into changing snow conditions in a watershed that is ecologically and societally relevant. The contribution to the field is reasonable and valuable given the narrow timeframe allotted to this class project.

• To what extent does the proposed activity suggest and explore creative and original concepts?

The team is planning to apply commonly used techniques to an area where they haven’t been done before

• How well-conceived and organized is the proposed activity?

Well conceived.

• Is there sufficient access to the necessary resources? Is the proposed work appropriate for the time allotted?

yes

In addition, please comment on

1. Any topics or ideas that are unclear in the proposal

There aren’t any references, so it is hard to be convinced of some of the claims made throughout

1. Any proposed work that you think will be especially difficult to carry out and why

This sentence: “. Additionally, with data on estimations of how much temperatures are supposed to increase due to climate change, predictions can then be made as to how these parameters will change in the future.” is suggesting that they can use trends from the last decade to predict future changes to climate, which may be an overstatement of what is possible in this analysis. It could be clarified to provide a more realistic scope (contribute to more complex climate predictions) or detail could be added to explain how they will accomplish this.

1. Any topics or ideas that you think should have been included

--

1. Any suggestions you have to make this project better

I’m excited to see what you find!