

# **‘Does Democracy Die in Darkness?’**

**Morgan Wack & Tine Paulsen**

Discussant comments

Guillermo Toral (IE University)

# Contributions

- Examines **short-term shocks to vital public infrastructures in the lead-up to local elections** to engage with classic debates on electoral accountability

# Contributions

- Examines **short-term shocks to vital public infrastructures in the lead-up to local elections** to engage with classic debates on electoral accountability
- **Highly relevant treatment** – load-shedding, common in many settings in the global south

# Contributions

- Examines **short-term shocks to vital public infrastructures in the lead-up to local elections** to engage with classic debates on electoral accountability
- **Highly relevant treatment** – load-shedding, common in many settings in the global south
- **Relevant and under-studied context** – local elections in a dominant-party system

# Points for discussion

- Developing the theory

# Points for discussion

- Developing the theory
- Validating the research design

# Points for discussion

- Developing the theory
- Validating the research design
- Additional tests you can run using your data

# Points for discussion

- Developing the theory
- Validating the research design
- Additional tests you can run using your data
- Smaller suggestions



# Developing the theory

- **Rethinking the treatment**

# Developing the theory

- **Rethinking the treatment**
  - Short-term experience of load-shedding

# Developing the theory

- **Rethinking the treatment**
  - Short-term experience of load-shedding
  - In a context where load shedding was already rampant

# Developing the theory

- **Rethinking the treatment**
  - Short-term experience of load-shedding
  - In a context where load shedding was already rampant
  - With occurrences being exogenous (and understood as such by citizens)?

# Developing the theory

- **Rethinking the treatment**

- Short-term experience of load-shedding
- In a context where load shedding was already rampant
- With occurrences being exogenous (and understood as such by citizens)?
- And centrally controlled (and understood as such?)

# Developing the theory

- **Rethinking the treatment**
  - Short-term experience of load-shedding
  - In a context where load shedding was already rampant
  - With occurrences being exogenous (and understood as such by citizens)?
  - And centrally controlled (and understood as such?)
- **So how can such a treatment affect electoral behavior?**

# Developing the theory

- **Rethinking the treatment**

- Short-term experience of load-shedding
- In a context where load shedding was already rampant
- With occurrences being exogenous (and understood as such by citizens)?
- And centrally controlled (and understood as such?)

- **So how can such a treatment affect electoral behavior?**

- Updates on the incumbent? National vs local

# Developing the theory

- **Rethinking the treatment**

- Short-term experience of load-shedding
- In a context where load shedding was already rampant
- With occurrences being exogenous (and understood as such by citizens)?
- And centrally controlled (and understood as such?)

- **So how can such a treatment affect electoral behavior?**

- Updates on the incumbent? National vs local
- Updates on the quality or reliability of public services? The ANC's commitment to its voters?



# Developing the theory

- **Rethinking the treatment**

- Short-term experience of load-shedding
- In a context where load shedding was already rampant
- With occurrences being exogenous (and understood as such by citizens)?
- And centrally controlled (and understood as such?)

- **So how can such a treatment affect electoral behavior?**

- Updates on the incumbent? National vs local
- Updates on the quality or reliability of public services? The ANC's commitment to its voters?
- Short-term increase in the salience of electricity provision?

# Developing the theory

- **Rethinking the treatment**

- Short-term experience of load-shedding
- In a context where load shedding was already rampant
- With occurrences being exogenous (and understood as such by citizens)?
- And centrally controlled (and understood as such?)

- **So how can such a treatment affect electoral behavior?**

- Updates on the incumbent? National vs local
- Updates on the quality or reliability of public services? The ANC's commitment to its voters?
- Short-term increase in the salience of electricity provision?
- Shocks to people's livelihoods in the short term?

# Developoing the theory

- **What does that imply for electoral accountability?**

# Developing the theory

- **What does that imply for electoral accountability?**
- Is this a case of blind accountability?

# Developing the theory

- **What does that imply for electoral accountability?**
  - Is this a case of blind accountability?
  - Is abstention really exit, or simply the way ANC supporters can express voice?

# Developing the theory

- **What does that imply for electoral accountability?**
  - Is this a case of blind accountability?
  - Is abstention really exit, or simply the way ANC supporters can express voice?
  - de Kadt's & Liebermann's story of *nuanced accountability* in their 2020 BJPS study of services and voting in South Africa

# Validating the research design

- If load shedding schedules are truly random, we should see **balance across social and political pre-treatment covariates**

# Validating the research design

- If load shedding schedules are truly random, we should see **balance across social and political pre-treatment covariates**
- There seem to be issues of **non-compliance with the schedule**



# Validating the research design

- If load shedding schedules are truly random, we should see **balance across social and political pre-treatment covariates**
- There seem to be issues of **non-compliance with the schedule**
  - Should we think of your estimates as akin to an ITT?

# Validating the research design

- If load shedding schedules are truly random, we should see **balance across social and political pre-treatment covariates**
- There seem to be issues of **non-compliance with the schedule**
  - Should we think of your estimates as akin to an ITT?
  - Can you examine balance in real allocation of electricity, even if in a subset of your sample?

# Validating the research design

- If load shedding schedules are truly random, we should see **balance across social and political pre-treatment covariates**
- There seem to be issues of **non-compliance with the schedule**
  - Should we think of your estimates as akin to an ITT?
  - Can you examine balance in real allocation of electricity, even if in a subset of your sample?
- By specifying the treatment as a continuous measure (hours of scheduled load shedding), you impose an assumption that the treatment effect is linear

# Validating the research design

- If load shedding schedules are truly random, we should see **balance across social and political pre-treatment covariates**
- There seem to be issues of **non-compliance with the schedule**
  - Should we think of your estimates as akin to an ITT?
  - Can you examine balance in real allocation of electricity, even if in a subset of your sample?
- By specifying the treatment as a continuous measure (hours of scheduled load shedding), you impose an assumption that the treatment effect is linear
  - Try instead a **binned version of the treatment** (e.g., low, medium and high) – Hainmueller et al 2018 PA

## Additional tests you can run

- Can you **exploit South Africa's mixed electoral system** for local elections?

## Additional tests you can run

- Can you **exploit South Africa's mixed electoral system** for local elections?
  - One ballot for a candidate using FPTP

## Additional tests you can run

- Can you **exploit South Africa's mixed electoral system** for local elections?
  - One ballot for a candidate using FPTP
  - One ballot for a party list using PR – arguably here we should see more punishment

## Additional tests you can run

- Can you **exploit South Africa's mixed electoral system** for local elections?
  - One ballot for a candidate using FPTP
  - One ballot for a party list using PR – arguably here we should see more punishment
- Can you **exploit variation across voting stations** within a municipality?



## Additional tests you can run

- Can you **exploit South Africa's mixed electoral system** for local elections?
  - One ballot for a candidate using FPTP
  - One ballot for a party list using PR – arguably here we should see more punishment
- Can you **exploit variation across voting stations** within a municipality?
  - For instance, households wealthier neighborhoods more likely to have generators and thus to be insulated from the more serious effects of load shedding

## Additional tests you can run

- Can you **exploit South Africa's mixed electoral system** for local elections?
  - One ballot for a candidate using FPTP
  - One ballot for a party list using PR – arguably here we should see more punishment
- Can you **exploit variation across voting stations** within a municipality?
  - For instance, households wealthier neighborhoods more likely to have generators and thus to be insulated from the more serious effects of load shedding
- Can you **exploit your data on the prevalence of load shedding across time**?

## Additional tests you can run

- Can you **exploit South Africa's mixed electoral system** for local elections?
  - One ballot for a candidate using FPTP
  - One ballot for a party list using PR – arguably here we should see more punishment
- Can you **exploit variation across voting stations** within a municipality?
  - For instance, households wealthier neighborhoods more likely to have generators and thus to be insulated from the more serious effects of load shedding
- Can you **exploit your data on the prevalence of load shedding across time**?
  - Should we expect stronger effects for occurrences immediately before the election, but not further away?

## Additional tests you can run

- Can you **exploit South Africa's mixed electoral system** for local elections?
  - One ballot for a candidate using FPTP
  - One ballot for a party list using PR – arguably here we should see more punishment
- Can you **exploit variation across voting stations** within a municipality?
  - For instance, households wealthier neighborhoods more likely to have generators and thus to be insulated from the more serious effects of load shedding
- Can you **exploit your data on the prevalence of load shedding across time**?
  - Should we expect stronger effects for occurrences immediately before the election, but not further away?
  - Why not operationalize treatment also as a Delta?

## Smaller suggestions to consider

- You cluster at the level of the “block” – are municipalities within blocks, or vice versa?

## Smaller suggestions to consider

- You cluster at the level of the “block” – are municipalities within blocks, or vice versa?
- Effects on Figure 4 do not seem statistically significant?

## Smaller suggestions to consider

- You cluster at the level of the “block” – are municipalities within blocks, or vice versa?
- Effects on Figure 4 do not seem statistically significant?
- Any differential effects on turnout in the FPTP and the PR ballots?