The Impact of Fixed-Cost Pooling Strategies on Test Collection Bias

anonymized

ABSTRACT

In Information Retrieval, test collections are usually built using the pooling method. Many pooling strategies have been developed for the pooling method. Herein, we address the question of identifying the best pooling strategy in the presence of budget constraints on the number of documents to be evaluated. As a quality measurement we use the bias introduced by the pooling strategy, measured both in terms of Mean Absolute Error of the scores and in terms of ranking errors. Based on experiments on 15 test collections, we conclude that the best strategy is one based on the Rank-Biased Precision (RBP) scoring strategy and using some relevance information. In the absence of such relevance information, the second best strategy is still based on the RBP scoring strategy, using the sum of weights of all documents provided by the participating systems. These results can inform collection creator because they suggest that, under fixed assessment budget constraints, RBP-based sampling produces less biased pools than other alternatives.

Keywords

Pooling Method, Pooling Strategies, Pool Bias

1. INTRODUCTION

Traditional evaluation of information retrieval systems relies on the idea of a controlled test collection, comprising of documents, information need statements synthesized into queries, and relevance assessments that capture the relevance relations between documents and information needs. Due to the large scale of modern test collections, it is infeasible to assess every document in the collection for relevance to a query. Instead, documents for which relevance assessments are required are selected from document rankings generated by systems for the queries in the test collection [4]. This mechanism of selection of documents for relevance assessment is called *pooling*. The assumption behind pooling is that if a large enough variety of (good) systems contribute results for pooling and pools are sampled at large enough

Permission to make digital or hard copies of all or part of this work for personal or classroom use is granted without fee provided that copies are not made or distributed for profit or commercial advantage and that copies bear this notice and the full citation on the first page. Copyrights for components of this work owned by others than ACM must be honored. Abstracting with credit is permitted. To copy otherwise, or republish, to post on servers or to redistribute to lists, requires prior specific permission and/or a fee. Request permissions from permissions@acm.org.

WOODSTOCK '97 El Paso, Texas USA

© 2016 ACM. ISBN 123-4567-24-567/08/06...\$15.00

 ${\rm DOI:}\,10.475/123_4$

depths, then the pool should contain the almost totality of relevant documents and thus provide reliable evaluations.

Different pooling strategies exist that influence the number of documents that are required to be assessed, the type of measures that can be used to evaluate the systems, the bias of the collection towards specific systems or retrieval techniques and features and thus the reusability of the test collection to evaluate systems that did not contribute to the pool. A standard pooling strategy, called fixed-depth pooling, consists of using all documents retrieved by systems up to a cut-off depth k. Alternative pooling strategies extend the fixed-depth strategy by sampling documents from this pool to create smaller pools, or by combining sampled portions of document rankings (strata) to form stratified pools. Finally, more sophisticated pooling strategies have also been proposed. For example, in this paper we consider the strategies proposed by Moffat et al. [3], aimed at reducing the volume of required relevance assessments and based on RBP.

The generation of pools of limited size is vital to remain within an assessment budget (and thus test collection creation costs). However, small pools may be affected by large bias and may render the collection unsuited to evaluate systems that did not participate in the pool. Previous work has investigated the influence of pooling bias on inferred measures and precision at cut-off depth (P@n) when pooling with fixed-depth, uniform sampling, and stratified pooling strategies [5, 2]. Other work has examined how to correct bias towards unpooled systems [6, 1].

In this paper, we focus on controlling the balance between the cost of relevance assessments required by specific pooling strategies (and thus the pool size) and the bias introduced by different pooling strategies (and thus the reliability and reusability of the test collection). Specifically, we consider the setting where a fixed budget for relevance assessments has been given. We then empirically investigate which strategy among (a) a standard constrained pooling strategy and (b) Moffat et al.'s pool strategy variants [3], would manifest a lower bias.

The results of our empirical investigation demonstrate that the least bias is obtained when we use information generated in the assessment process itself. This result is of interest for researchers creating new test collections because it suggests that, under fixed budget constraint for relevance assessment, they should prefer RBP-based sampling over the alternatives investigated in this work because it returns pools with less bias towards specific systems.

BACKGROUND

In this section we introduce the pooling strategies analyzed in this paper. The first two are variations of the most common fixed depth at k (Depth@k), already described in the introduction. The remaining three pooling strategies were developed by Moffat et al. [3]. First, let us fix the notations and the shared elements required among all of the following strategies, R the set of runs to be pooled and Nthe maximum number of documents to be judged.

We start with the variants of Depth@k. Despite its common use in practice, Depth@k does not allow to impose a fixed number of documents to be judged. For this reason, we explore two possible variants, Take@N and Take+@K&Nthat allows to fix such constraint:

Take@N (strategy T): This strategy is the most commonly adopted in practice if a fixed pool size is required (e.g., due to budget constraints) and is based on the rank at which documents have been retrieved. It starts assigning to every retrieved document d the highest rank ρ to which d has been retrieved by R, then it continues taking the first N documents with the highest ρ and pool them. The main drawback of this strategy with respect to Depth@kis that it does not guarantee fairness among all the pooled runs. In Depth@k all the runs contribute equally to the pool with their first k documents, here some runs can get more judged documents than others.

Take+@K&N (strategy T+): This strategy addresses the lack of fairness of the previous strategy by introducing a non-deterministic selection of the documents to be judged. It may be thought of as an application of the Stratified pooling strategy [7]. The Stratified strategy defines multiple strata, each characterized by a depth and a sample rate. Each document is assigned to a stratum based on the rank at which it has been retrieved first, then sampled based on the sample rate of the stratum. By definition, this strategy guarantees fairness because it forces a constant number of pooled documents per run. The Take+@K&Nstrategy defines a stratification of two strata, where K is its maximum depth. For the first stratum we fix a sample rate $r_1 = 1.0$ and depth k_1 as deep as the number of documents to be judged does not overcome the imposed limit of N judgments. If we call N^{k_1} and N^K the estimated pooled documents for a Depth@k strategy at depth k_1 and K, the second stratum is characterized by $k_2 = K - k_1$ and sample rate $r_2 = (N - N^{k_1})/(N^K - N^{k_1})$, which makes the stratification able to reach, in expectation, N, the number of documents to be judged.

In the above strategies, documents that have been retrieved on top by at least one run are more likely to be pooled, but no distinction is made if a document has been retrieved by multiple runs or just by one. If we were to apply this last distinction as a mere pooling strategy we would count how many runs have retrieved a certain document, and pool the most retrieved ones. Such a strategy would have the effect of over-emphasizing the importance of highly retrieved documents with respect to the uniquely retrieved ones, thereby rewarding conformity and creating collections with the strongest pool bias possible due to the systematic avoidance of documents that have been uniquely retrieved by a single run. But if this distinction is combined with information about the rank at which the documents

were retrieved, as pointed out by Moffat et al. [3], it may lead to pooling strategies that are more effective in selecting documents to pool, because it would select documents that provide more benefit to the final result.

Before describing the three variants of this strategy, let us review some terminology. Moffat et al. [3] defined base RBP as the RBP calculated on the assumption that unjudged documents are non-relevant. It is a lower threshold to the real RBP value which would have been obtained had all documents been judged. For instance, if RBP is defined as:

$$RBP = (1 - p) \sum_{i=1}^{n} u_i \cdot p^{i-1}$$
 (1)

where $u_i \in [0,1] \cup \{?\}$ denotes the relevance judgment of the document at position i (taking values between 0 and 1 if judged and? if unjudged), then the base RBP is

$$b_r = (1 - p) \sum_{i=1} \bar{u}_i \cdot p^{i-1}$$
 (2)

where

$$b_r = (1 - p) \sum_{i=1} \bar{u}_i \cdot p^{i-1}$$
$$\bar{u}_i = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } u_i = ?. \\ u_i, & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

As a complement, the paper also defined residual RBP as

$$e_r = (1-p) \sum_{i:u_i=?} p^{i-1}$$
 (3)

For a run r, $b_r + e_r$ is therefore the maximum RBP value that could be obtained by that run (i.e., if all unjudged documents are actually relevant). Given these definitions, the following pooling strategies can be formalized:

RBPBasedA@N&p (strategy A): To every retrieved din every pooled run $r \in R$ is associated a score equal to the RBP residual, in Eq. (4), which is a function of the rank ρ to which d has been retrieved in r and a parameter p, fixed in advance:

$$c_{r,d} = (1-p)p^{\rho(r,d)-1} \tag{4}$$

Then, a weight is assigned to every retrieved d, which is calculated by summing up all the scores obtained in the pooled runs R_p , as follows:

$$w_d = \sum_{r \in B} c_{r,d} \tag{5}$$

Finally, the first N documents with highest weight are included in the pool. This strategy rewards documents that have been retrieved by multiple runs at high ranks, but it has the drawback of leaving runs' residuals free, which may be undesirable.

RBPBasedB@N&p (strategy B): Like strategy A, but the weighting function is calculated by multiplying the RBP gain-based score with the current residual of r from which d comes:

$$w_d = \sum_{r \in R} c_{r,d} \cdot e_r \tag{6}$$

This pooling strategy, with respect to the others, adapts the weights w_d at every pooled document, due to the inclusion in the weighing schema of the residuals, which are in function of the current set of judged documents. This strategy is characterized by N sequential re-weighting stages in which at each stage the document with the highest w_d is pooled. It is worth mentioning that the re-weighting is independent of the actual judgment of the document.

RBPBasedC@N&p (strategy C): Like strategy B, but the weighting function is calculated taking into account also the current RBP score of the run T:

$$w_d = \sum_{r \in R_p} c_{r,d} \cdot e_r \cdot (b_r + e_r/2)^3 \tag{7}$$

This strategy rewards the runs that have retrieved more relevant documents.

Note that pooling strategies B and C are adaptive, in that they select the next document to pool according to the relevance assessments done up to that point.

3. EXPERIMENTS & RESULTS

To determine which of the examined pooling strategies produces a test collection with lower bias we use a set of 15 test collections selected from TREC: 7 test collections from the Ad-Hoc track, 3 from the Web track, and 5 from more domain specific IR tracks: Genomics, Robust, Legal, Medical and Microblog. Each collection was created using a Depth@k pooling strategy; this allows us to create synthetic pools with the pooling strategies examined here. In particular this is done for the only pooled runs $R_p \subseteq R$ of the test collections, for which the pooling strategy guarantees the complete judgment of the first k documents. To measure the bias that a new run would have observed if it had not been part of the construction of the pool, we simulate its absence performing a leave-one-organization-out approach for which at each iteration a new synthetic pool is generated excluding all the runs submitted by the organization for which the selected run belongs to. The bias measures used, as in a previous study [1, 2], are: 1) Mean Absolute Error (MAE), 2) System Rank Error (SRE), and 3) System Rank Error with Statistical Significance (SRE*). MAE is the mean, over all the runs, of the absolute difference between the score of a run when it is and is not part of the pool. SRE is the sum, over all the runs, of the difference in ranks between the run when it is and is not part of the pool. SRE* is like SRE, but the difference is counted only if the runs in between are statistically different (Tukey's test, p < 0.05).

Herein, we experiment with a real case study where we have a budget that allows the collection creator to judge a maximum of 10,000 documents (N). We also assume that the measures targeted by the evaluation task are P@10 and RBP with p=0.80 (this is a common setting for p). We test all the pooling strategies with fixed N. For strategy S, we fixed K to 20. For strategies A, B and C, two instantiations of p have been tested, p=0.80 (in line with the setting for the RBP evaluation measure), indicated by A^{80} , B^{80} and C^{80} in Tab. 1 and p=0.73, indicated by A^{73} , B^{73} and C^{73} in Tab. 1 (this value was found to correlate best with observed user behavior, see Zhang et al. [8]).

4. DISCUSSION & CONCLUSION

In Tab. 1 we observe that the best performing pooling strategy is RBPBasedC@N&p with p=0.80 (C^{80}), which sometimes matches the performance of the same strategy but with p=0.73 (C^{73}). This is an expected result since this strategy uses the most information. However, although this is the best performing strategy, it presents several limitations when used for building test collections in practice:

 If the test collection creators require that relevance labels for a document are aggregated across judgements from multiple assessors, then the use of this pooling strategies puts an additional burden on the collection creators. This is because the strategies requires information about the relevance of documents already assessed to decide which documents to pool next (i.e., the strategy is adaptive). This in turns requires that the assessment process is coordinated such that the selection and assessment of the next document to assess cannot start until all assessors have judged the current document: this may happen at different times due to different assessor cognitive abilities, workload, and work scheduling.

- 2. A per-topic parallelization of the assessment exercise is not possible (i.e., the practice of distributing across multiple assessors documents that retrieved for the same query to speed up assessment). However, this limitation could be potentially mitigated, till a certain extent, by parallelizing the process across topics (i.e., exclusively assign each topic to an assessor, but assigning different topics to different assessors).
- 3. The third limitation is introduced by the impossibility of randomizing the pooled documents in order to mitigate assessment bias coming from the judgment of documents in order of their predicted relevance. This bias is usually overcome by the standard pooling strategies by randomizing the pooled documents before have them presented to the assessors.

These limitations make the RBPBasedC@N&p strategy of difficult practical application.

The second best strategy is RBPBasedA@N&p (A^{80}) with p=0.80. This strategy does not present the previous limitations since all the documents to be assessed are pooled with no required human intervention. The peculiarity of this strategy is that it rewards documents that have been retrieved by multiple runs at high ranks, yet it does minimize pool bias.

In summary, this paper examined a number of strategies aimed at selecting documents for relevance assessment under fixed budget constraints while minimizing pool bias. The empirical results demonstrate that variants A and C of Moffat et al.'s strategies [3], respectively a static and an adaptive strategy based on RBP, should be preferred over traditional fixed-depth or stratified pooling when deciding upon the pooling strategy to be used to form a new test collection under fixed assessment budget constraints. However, due the limitations introduced by the strategy C, we recommend in practice the strategy A.

Implementations of the pool strategies examined in this paper are made available at http://anonymized, along with the empirical results presented here.

5. REFERENCES

- A. Lipani, M. Lupu, and A. Hanbury. Splitting water: Precision and anti-precision to reduce pool bias. In *Proc. of SIGIR*, pages 103–112, 2015.
- [2] A. Lipani, M. Lupu, and A. Hanbury. The curious incidence of bias corrections in the pool. In *Proc. of ECIR*, pages 267–279, 2016.
- [3] A. Moffat, W. Webber, and J. Zobel. Strategic system comparisons via targeted relevance judgments. In *Proc.* of SIGIR, pages 375–382, 2007.

Table 1: Results obtained using only the pooled runs (R_p) of each test collection. Pool bias measures, MAE, SRE and SRE* (the lowest the values, the better; bold values are the best for the test collection), computed on five pooling strategies via leave-one-organization-out. |R| total run of the test collection; |O| number of organizations; k depth of the original pool; |T| number of topics; k number of judged documents; k number of documents judged relevant, and; k number of documents judged relevant for the synthetic pool.

	_				P@10		RBP	(p = 0.	80)
C	Stats	M	$ Q_n^r $	MAE	SRE	SRE*	MAE	SRE	SRE*
	R :38	Т	3634	0.0440	116	5	0.0040	108	8
Ad Hoc 2	101 . 99	T+ A ⁸⁰	3523	0.0447	102	7	0.0043	103	9
	O : 22 $ R_p $: 32	B^{80}	3667 3642	0.0409 0.0435	107 116	5 5	0.0038 0.0040	102 105	8 9
	k:100	C^{80}	3824	0.0433	100	4	0.0040	95	7
	T : 50	A^{73}	3651	0.0423	111	5	0.0039	103	8
	$ Q^r $: 11645	B^{73}	3640	0.0439	117	5	0.0040	109	9
	Q : 62620	C^{73}	3793	0.0408	108	4	0.0038	102	7
	R :40	Т	2952	0.0255	22	0	0.0022	19	0
		T+	2520	0.0331	26	0	0.0029	23	1
c 3	O : 22	$A^{80} = B^{80}$	2978	0.0248	21	0	0.0022	18	0
Ad Hoc	$ R_p : 23$	C^{80}	2937 3157	0.0253	21 16	0	0.0022	19 15	0
ρĄ	k:200 T :50	A^{73}	2971	0.0222 0.0251	21	0	0.0019 0.0022	19	0
	$ Q^r $: 9805	B^{73}	2944	0.0251	22	0	0.0022	18	0
	Q : 97319	C^{73}	3136	0.0227	17	0	0.0022	17	0
H	R :33	Т	1954	0.0373	67	3	0.0035	66	2
	1 -1	T+	1920	0.0371	60	3	0.0035	59	1
4	O : 19	480	1979	0.0353	62	2	0.0033	61	1
Ad Hoc 4	$ R_p : 32$	B_{80}^{80}	1946	0.0369	65	3	0.0034	62	1
[P]	k:100	C^{80}	2224	0.0292	53	0	0.0028	53	0
4	T :50	A^{73} B^{73}	1970	0.0359	64	3	0.0033	62	1 1
	$ Q^r $: 6503 Q : 87069	C^{73}	1946 2199	0.0370 0.0296	66 53	0	0.0034 0.0028	63 52	0
H	R : 61	T	1487	0.0230	147	19	0.0020	130	15
	h :01	T+	1493	0.0211	176	23	0.0020	139	16
20	O : 21	A^{80}	1536	0.0194	139	16	0.0018	133	11
Нос	$ R_p : 60$	B^{80}	1472	0.0203	138	16	0.0019	129	15
Ad H	k:100	C^{80}	1767	0.0182	124	6	0.0017	115	3
¥	T : 50	A^{73}	1515	0.0198	141	16	0.0019	131	13
	$ Q^r $: 5524	R^{73}	1483	0.0210	144	16	0.0020	136	15
	Q : 133681	C^{73}	1741	0.0184	122	6	0.0017	113	3
	R : 74	T T+	1538 1595	0.0314 0.0292	37 31	2 0	0.0029 0.0028	33 31	2
9	O :29	A^{80}	1557	0.0304	35	0	0.0028	34	1
) oc					37				
1.8		B^{80}	1526	0.0311	01	2	0.0029	35	2
і Нос	$ R_p : 28$ k : 100	B^{80} C^{80}	1526 1759	0.0311 0.0255	25	2 0	0.0029 0.0025	35 27	2 1
Ad Hoc	$ R_p : 28$ k : 100 T : 50	C^{80} A^{73}	1759 1551	0.0255 0.0305	25 35	0 0	0.0025 0.0028	27 35	1 2
Ad Hoc	$ R_p : 28$ k : 100 T : 50 $ Q^r : 4611$	C^{80} A^{73} B^{73}	1759 1551 1533	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314	25 35 38	0 0 2	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029	27 35 35	1 2 2
Ad Hoc	$ R_p : 28$ k : 100 T : 50 $ Q^r : 4611$ Q : 72270	C^{80} A^{73} B^{73} C^{73}	1759 1551 1533 1736	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261	25 35 38 27	0 0 2 0	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025	27 35 35 29	1 2 2 1
Ad Hoc	$ R_p : 28$ k : 100 T : 50 $ Q^r : 4611$	C^{80} A^{73} B^{73} C^{73}	1759 1551 1533 1736	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138	25 35 38 27	0 0 2 0	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025	27 35 35 29 114	1 2 2 1
	$ R_p $: 28 k: 100 T : 50 $ Q^r $: 4611 Q : 72270 R : 103	C^{80} A^{73} B^{73} C^{73} T_{+}	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148	25 35 38 27 100 103	0 0 2 0 15 15	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013	27 35 35 29 114 116	1 2 2 1 22 25
	$ R_p : 28$ $k : 100$ $ T : 50$ $ Q^r : 4611$ $ Q : 72270$ $ R : 103$ $ O : 42$	C^{80} A^{73} B^{73} C^{73} C^{73} C^{73}	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124	25 35 38 27 100 103 79	0 0 2 0 15 15 10	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011	27 35 35 29 114 116 86	1 2 2 1 22 25 12
	$ R_p : 28$ $k: 100$ $ T : 50$ $ Q^r : 4611$ $ Q : 72270$ $ R : 103$ $ O : 42$ $ R_p : 74$	C^{80} A^{73} B^{73} C^{73} C^{73} C^{73}	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148	25 35 38 27 100 103	0 0 2 0 15 15	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013	27 35 35 29 114 116	1 2 2 1 22 25
	$ R_p : 28$ $k : 100$ $ T : 50$ $ Q^r : 4611$ $ Q : 72270$ $ R : 103$ $ O : 42$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ \end{array} $	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124 0.0139	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 108	1 2 2 1 22 25 12 25
	$ R_p : 28$ $k: 100$ $ T : 50$ $ Q^r : 4611$ $ Q : 72270$ $ R : 103$ $ O : 42$ $ R_p : 74$ $k: 100$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ \end{array} $	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124 0.0139 0.0114 0.0126 0.0138	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82 99	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012 0.0010	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 108 89 91 114	1 2 2 1 22 25 12 25 11
	$\begin{aligned} R_p : 28 \\ k : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4611 \\ Q : 72270 \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} R : 103 \\ O : 42 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k : 100 \\ Q^r : 4674 \\ Q : 80344 \end{aligned}$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T+ \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124 0.0139 0.0114 0.0126	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012 0.0010 0.0011	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 108 89 91	1 2 2 1 22 25 12 25 11 12
	$\begin{aligned} R_p &: 28 \\ k &: 100 \\ T &: 50 \\ Q^r &: 4611 \\ Q &: 72270 \end{aligned}$ $ R &: 103$ $ O &: 42 \\ R_p &: 74 \\ k &: 100 \\ T &: 50 \\ Q^r &: 4674 \end{aligned}$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} C^{73} \\ T \\ $	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124 0.0139 0.0114 0.0126 0.0138 0.0122	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82 99 81	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012 0.0010 0.0011 0.0012 0.0011	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 108 89 91 114 92	1 2 2 2 25 12 25 11 12 25 11 19
Ad Hoc 7	$\begin{aligned} R_p &: 28 \\ k &: 100 \\ T &: 50 \\ Q^r &: 4611 \\ Q &: 72270 \end{aligned}$ $ R &: 103 \\ O &: 42 \\ R_p &: 74 \\ k &: 100 \\ T &: 50 \\ Q^r &: 4674 \\ Q &: 80344 \end{aligned}$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T^{7} \\ T + \\ T + \end{array} $	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560 1609	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124 0.0139 0.0114 0.0126 0.0138 0.0122 0.0172 0.0189	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82 99 81 114 128	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012 0.0010 0.0011 0.0016 0.0017	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 108 89 91 114 92	1 2 2 2 25 12 25 11 12 25 11 19 18
8 Ad Hoc 7	$\begin{aligned} R_p &: 28 \\ k &: 100 \\ T &: 50 \\ Q^r &: 4611 \\ Q &: 72270 \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} R &: 103 \\ O &: 42 \\ R_p &: 74 \\ k &: 100 \\ T &: 50 \\ Q^r &: 4674 \\ Q &: 80344 \end{aligned}$ $ R &: 129 \\ O &: 41 \end{aligned}$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T^{3} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{80} \\ \end{array} $	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560 1609 1649	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0124 0.0139 0.0114 0.0126 0.0132 0.0122 0.0172 0.0189 0.0154	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82 99 81 114 128 100	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 108 89 91 114 92 109 106 84	1 2 2 1 22 25 12 25 11 12 25 11 19 18 15
8 Ad Hoc 7	$\begin{aligned} R_p : 28 \\ k : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4611 \\ Q : 72270 \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} R : 103 \\ O : 42 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k : 100 \\ Q^r : 4674 \\ Q : 80344 \end{aligned}$ $ R : 129 \\ O : 41 \\ R_p : 74 \end{aligned}$	C^{80} A^{73} B^{73} C^{73} T C^{73} T C^{80} C^{80} C^{80} T C^{80} C^{80}	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560 1609 1649 1554	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124 0.0139 0.0114 0.0126 0.0138 0.0122 0.0172 0.0184 0.0166	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82 99 81 114 128 100 110	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0012 0.0011 0.0011 0.0014 0.0014	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 108 89 91 114 92 109 106 84 87	1 2 2 2 1 22 25 12 25 11 12 25 11 19 18 15 15
Ad Hoc 7	$\begin{aligned} R_p : 28 \\ k : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4611 \\ Q : 72270 \end{aligned}$ $ R : 103 $ $ O : 42 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4674 \\ Q : 80344 $ $ R : 129 $ $ O : 41 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k : 100 $	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} C^{73} \\ T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ \end{array} $	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560 1609 1649 1554 1873	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124 0.0139 0.0114 0.0126 0.0138 0.0122 0.0172 0.0172 0.0166 0.0166 0.0140	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82 99 81 114 128 100 110 81	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 7	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012 0.0011 0.0012 0.0011 0.0016 0.0017 0.0016 0.0016 0.0014	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 108 89 91 114 92 109 106 84 87 74	1 2 2 2 1 1 2 25 11 12 25 11 19 18 15 15 8
8 Ad Hoc 7	$\begin{aligned} R_p &: 28 \\ k &: 100 \\ T &: 50 \\ Q^r &: 4611 \\ Q &: 72270 \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} R &: 103 \\ R &: 103 \\ R_p &: 74 \\ k &: 100 \\ T &: 50 \\ Q^r &: 4674 \\ Q &: 80344 \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} R &: 129 \\ O &: 41 \\ R_p &: 74 \\ k &: 100 \\ T &: 50 \end{aligned}$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T^{+} \\ A^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560 1609 1649 1554	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124 0.0139 0.0114 0.0126 0.0138 0.0122 0.0172 0.0184 0.0166	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82 99 81 114 128 100 110	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0012 0.0011 0.0011 0.0014 0.0014	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 108 89 91 114 92 109 106 84 87	1 2 2 2 1 22 25 12 25 11 12 25 11 19 18 15 15
8 Ad Hoc 7	$\begin{aligned} R_p : 28 \\ k : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4611 \\ Q : 72270 \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} R : 103 \\ O : 42 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k : 100 \\ Q^r : 4674 \\ Q : 80344 \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} R : 129 \\ O : 41 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4728 \\ Q^r : 4728 \\ Q^r : 86830 \end{aligned}$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T \\ A^{80} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560 1609 1649 1554 1873 1612	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124 0.0139 0.0114 0.0126 0.0138 0.0122 0.0172 0.0189 0.0154 0.0166 0.0163	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82 99 81 114 128 100 110 81 109	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 7	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0021 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0016 0.0016 0.0016	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 108 89 91 114 92 109 106 84 87 74	1 2 2 2 1 1 2 25 11 12 25 11 19 18 15 15 8 15
8 Ad Hoc 7	$\begin{aligned} R_p : 28 \\ k : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4611 \\ Q : 72270 \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} R : 103 \\ O : 42 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4674 \\ Q : 80344 \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} R : 129 \\ O : 41 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 474 \\ R : 129 \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} O : 41 \\ R_p : 74 \\ R : 129 \\ C : 4728 \\ C : 4728 \end{aligned}$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ C$	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560 1609 1654 1873 1612 1553 1852	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124 0.0139 0.0114 0.0126 0.0138 0.0122 0.0172 0.0189 0.0154 0.0166 0.0140 0.0163 0.0170 0.0146	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82 99 81 114 128 100 110 81 109 116 84	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 7	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012 0.0011 0.0016 0.0014 0.0014 0.0015 0.0014 0.0014	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 108 89 91 114 92 109 106 84 87 74 87 95 72	1 2 2 2 1 1 22 25 12 25 11 12 25 11 15 8 15 17 8 0 0
8 Ad Hoc 7	$\begin{aligned} R_p : 28 \\ k : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4611 \\ Q : 72270 \end{aligned}$ $ R : 103 \\ O : 42 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4674 \\ Q : 80344 \\ R : 129 \\ O : 41 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4728 \\ Q : 86830 \\ R : 104 \end{aligned}$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T^{+} \\ A^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T^{+} \\ T^{+} \\ \end{array} $	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560 1609 1649 1554 1873 1612 1553 1852	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124 0.0126 0.0138 0.0122 0.0172 0.0189 0.0154 0.0163 0.0163 0.0170 0.0146 0.0146 0.0146	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82 99 81 114 128 100 110 81 109 116 84 78	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 5 7 10 15 5 10 15 15 10 15 15 15 15 16 16 17 17 17 18 18 18 18 18 18 18 18 18 18 18 18 18	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0017 0.0014 0.0015 0.0014 0.0015 0.0016 0.0011	27 35 35 39 114 116 86 108 89 91 114 92 109 106 84 87 74 87 95 72 71 67	1 2 2 2 25 12 25 11 12 25 11 19 18 15 15 17 8 0 0
Ad Hoc 8 Ad Hoc 7	$\begin{array}{c} R_p : 28 \\ k: 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4611 \\ Q : 72270 \\ \hline R : 103 \\ \hline O : 42 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k: 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4674 \\ Q : 80344 \\ \hline R : 129 \\ \hline O : 41 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k: 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4728 \\ Q : 86830 \\ \hline R : 104 \\ \hline O : 23 \\ \hline \end{array}$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T \\ A^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T \\ A^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T \\ A^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ A^{73} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560 1609 1649 1553 1612 1553 1852	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124 0.0139 0.0114 0.0126 0.0138 0.0122 0.0172 0.0189 0.0154 0.0166 0.0163 0.0170 0.0164 0.0164 0.0146 0.01462 0.0138	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82 99 81 114 128 100 110 81 109 116 84 78 79 80	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 5 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 15 10 10 15 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0014 0.0015 0.0016 0.0014 0.0015 0.0014 0.0012 0.0012	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 108 89 91 114 92 109 106 84 87 74 87 95 72	1 2 2 2 1 1 22 25 12 25 11 12 25 11 15 15 8 15 17 8 0 0 0 0
Ad Hoc 8 Ad Hoc 7	$\begin{aligned} R_p : 28 \\ k : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4611 \\ Q : 72270 \\ \\ R : 103 \\ \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} O : 42 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k : 100 \\ Q^r : 4674 \\ Q : 80344 \\ \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} R : 129 \\ \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} O : 41 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k : 100 \\ Q^r : 4674 \\ Q : 80344 \\ \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} R : 129 \\ \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} O : 41 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k : 100 \\ Q^r : 4728 \\ Q : 86830 \\ \\ R : 104 \\ \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} O : 23 \\ R_p : 62 \end{aligned}$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ C^{8$	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560 1609 1654 1873 1612 1553 1852 911 952 936 915	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0129 0.0114 0.0126 0.0189 0.0154 0.0166 0.0166 0.0140 0.0163 0.0170 0.0146 0.0146 0.0146 0.0146 0.0146 0.0146	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 20 82 99 81 114 128 100 110 81 109 116 84 78 79 80 79	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 7 15 7 10 15 7 15 7	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012 0.0011 0.0016 0.0016 0.0016 0.0016 0.0016 0.0014 0.0015 0.0012 0.0012 0.0012	27 35 35 29 1114 1116 86 108 89 91 1114 92 109 106 84 87 74 87 95 72 71 67 70 69	1 2 2 2 25 11 12 25 11 15 15 8 15 17 8 0 0 0 0 0
8 Ad Hoc 7	$\begin{array}{c} R_p : 28 \\ k: 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4611 \\ Q : 72270 \\ \hline R : 103 \\ \hline O : 42 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k: 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4674 \\ Q : 80344 \\ \hline R : 129 \\ \hline O : 41 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k: 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q : 86830 \\ \hline R : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q : 80344 \\ \hline R : 129 \\ \hline O : 41 \\ R : 129 \\ \hline O : 41 \\ R : 129 \\ \hline O : 41 \\ R : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q : 86830 \\ \hline R : 104 \\ \hline O : 23 \\ R : 62 \\ k: 100 \\ \hline \end{array}$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T \\ + A^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T \\ A^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T \\ T \\ A^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ C^{8$	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560 1609 1649 1554 1873 1612 1553 1852 911 952 936 915	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0124 0.0129 0.0122 0.0172 0.0189 0.0156 0.0163 0.0163 0.0176 0.0146 0.0132 0.0146 0.0146 0.0146	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82 99 81 114 128 100 81 110 81 109 116 84 78 79 80 67	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 7 15 7 10 15 7 15 10 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012 0.0011 0.0016 0.0017 0.0014 0.0016 0.0014 0.0015 0.0014 0.0015 0.0014 0.0013 0.0013	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 89 91 114 92 109 106 84 87 74 87 72 71 67 70 69 56	1 2 2 2 25 11 12 25 11 19 18 15 15 8 15 17 8 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Ad Hoc 8 Ad Hoc 7	$\begin{aligned} R_p &: 28 \\ k &: 100 \\ T &: 50 \\ Q^r &: 4611 \\ Q &: 72270 \\ \\ R &: 103 \\ \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} O &: 42 \\ R_p &: 74 \\ k &: 100 \\ T &: 50 \\ Q^r &: 4674 \\ Q &: 80344 \\ \hline R &: 129 \\ \end{aligned}$ $\begin{aligned} O &: 41 \\ R_p &: 74 \\ k &: 100 \\ T &: 50 \\ Q^r &: 4728 \\ Q &: 86830 \\ \hline R &: 104 \\ O &: 23 \\ R_p &: 62 \\ k &: 100 \\ T &: 50 \end{aligned}$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \hline \\ T \\ + A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \hline \\ T \\ + A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \hline \\ T \\ + A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{80} \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ A^{80} \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ A^{80} \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ A^{80} \\ A$	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560 1609 1649 1553 1852 911 952 936 915 1054	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0148 0.0124 0.0126 0.0138 0.0122 0.0189 0.0154 0.0163 0.0163 0.0170 0.0146 0.0146 0.0146 0.0146 0.0146 0.0142 0.0146 0.0146 0.0141	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 170 82 99 81 114 128 100 110 81 109 116 84 79 80 79 80 77	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 7 15 7 10 15 7 15 7	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0011 0.0014 0.0015 0.0014 0.0015 0.0014 0.0015 0.0013 0.0013 0.0013 0.0013	27 35 35 29 1114 1116 86 108 89 91 1114 92 109 106 84 87 74 87 95 72 71 67 70 69 67 71	1 2 2 2 25 11 12 25 11 12 25 11 15 8 15 17 8 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Ad Hoc 8 Ad Hoc 7	$\begin{array}{c} R_p : 28 \\ k: 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4611 \\ Q : 72270 \\ \hline R : 103 \\ \hline O : 42 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k: 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q^r : 4674 \\ Q : 80344 \\ \hline R : 129 \\ \hline O : 41 \\ R_p : 74 \\ k: 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q : 86830 \\ \hline R : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q : 80344 \\ \hline R : 129 \\ \hline O : 41 \\ R : 129 \\ \hline O : 41 \\ R : 129 \\ \hline O : 41 \\ R : 100 \\ T : 50 \\ Q : 86830 \\ \hline R : 104 \\ \hline O : 23 \\ R : 62 \\ k: 100 \\ \hline \end{array}$	$ \begin{array}{c} C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ A^{73} \\ B^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ B^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ A^{73} \\ A^{73} \\ C^{73} \\ \end{array} $ $ \begin{array}{c} T \\ T + \\ A^{80} \\ C^{80} \\ C^{8$	1759 1551 1533 1736 1697 1697 1731 1681 1924 1726 1688 1899 1560 1609 1649 1554 1873 1612 1553 1852 911 952 936 915	0.0255 0.0305 0.0314 0.0261 0.0138 0.0124 0.0129 0.0122 0.0172 0.0189 0.0156 0.0163 0.0163 0.0176 0.0146 0.0132 0.0146 0.0146 0.0146	25 35 38 27 100 103 79 101 70 82 99 81 114 128 100 81 110 81 109 116 84 78 79 80 67	0 0 2 0 15 15 10 15 7 10 15 7 10 15 7 13 12 7 9 5 11 11 11 5	0.0025 0.0028 0.0029 0.0025 0.0012 0.0013 0.0011 0.0012 0.0011 0.0016 0.0017 0.0014 0.0016 0.0014 0.0015 0.0014 0.0015 0.0014 0.0013 0.0013	27 35 35 29 114 116 86 89 91 114 92 109 106 84 87 74 87 72 71 67 70 69 56	1 2 2 2 25 11 12 25 11 19 18 15 15 8 15 17 8 0 0 0 0 0 0 0

- [4] K. Spärck Jones and C. J. van Rijsbergen. Report on the need for and provision of an" ideal" information retrieval test collection. *British Library Research and Development Report No. 5266*, 1975.
- [5] E. M. Voorhees. The effect of sampling strategy on inferred measures. In *Proc. of SIGIR*, pages 1119–1122,

$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$										
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		C4 - 4 -	м				RBP $(p = 0.80)$			
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		Stats	IVI	$ Q_n $	MAE	SRE	SRE*	MAE	SRE	SRE*
$ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	01	R : 97	Т	1269	0.0122	64	0	0.0010	43	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$			T+	1211	0.0117	64	0	0.0010	46	0
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q^* : 3363 \\ Q : 70400 \end{vmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} R^{73} \\ 1367 \end{vmatrix} = 1256 \end{vmatrix} = 0.0119 \end{vmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 64 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ $		O : 29	A^{80}	1285	0.0110	56	0	0.0009	40	0
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q^* : 3363 \\ Q : 70400 \end{vmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} R^{73} \\ 1367 \end{vmatrix} = 1256 \end{vmatrix} = 0.0119 \end{vmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 64 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ $	20	$ R_p : 59$	B^{80}	1255	0.0117	61	0	0.0010	41	0
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q^* : 3363 \\ Q : 70400 \end{vmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} R^{73} \\ 1367 \end{vmatrix} = 1256 \end{vmatrix} = 0.0119 \end{vmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 64 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ $	ą	k: 100	C^{80}	1380	0.0092	48	0	0.0008	33	0
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q^T : 3363 & B^{73} & 1256 & 0.0119 & 64 & 0 & 0.0010 & 41 & 0 \\ Q : 70400 & C^{73} & 1367 & 0.0094 & 50 & 0 & 0.0008 & 35 & 0 \\ \hline \\ R : 69 & T & 589 & 0.0151 & 266 & 0 & 0.0015 & 240 & 0 \\ C : 16 & A^{80} & 627 & 0.0157 & 262 & 0 & 0.0015 & 226 & 0 \\ C : 16 & A^{80} & 627 & 0.0157 & 262 & 0 & 0.0015 & 226 & 0 \\ C : 16 & A^{80} & 627 & 0.0157 & 262 & 0 & 0.0015 & 225 & 0 \\ C : 16 & A^{80} & 627 & 0.0157 & 262 & 0 & 0.0015 & 225 & 0 \\ C : 1570 & A^{73} & 618 & 0.0165 & 280 & 0 & 0.0016 & 250 & 0 \\ C : 1574 & B^{73} & 596 & 0.0159 & 282 & 0 & 0.0015 & 249 & 0 \\ C : 1574 & B^{73} & 596 & 0.0159 & 282 & 0 & 0.0015 & 249 & 0 \\ C : 1574 & B^{73} & 596 & 0.0226 & 322 & 2 & 0.0019 & 243 & 0 \\ C : 32 & A^{80} & 1924 & 0.0207 & 294 & 2 & 0.0018 & 233 & 0 \\ C : 32 & A^{80} & 1924 & 0.0207 & 294 & 2 & 0.0018 & 233 & 0 \\ C : 32 & A^{80} & 1924 & 0.0207 & 294 & 2 & 0.0018 & 233 & 0 \\ C : 4584 & B^{73} & 1889 & 0.0222 & 314 & 2 & 0.0019 & 233 & 0 \\ C : 4584 & B^{73} & 1888 & 0.0222 & 314 & 2 & 0.0019 & 243 & 0 \\ C : 39988 & C^{73} & 2029 & 0.0199 & 292 & 0.0017 & 221 & 0 \\ C : 17 & A^{80} & 2645 & 0.0428 & 34 & 10 & 0.0041 & 34 & 11 \\ C : 3798 & C^{73} & 2640 & 0.0444 & 36 & 10 & 0.0041 & 35 & 11 \\ C : 3798 & C^{73} & 2640 & 0.0436 & 34 & 10 & 0.0041 & 35 & 11 \\ C : 3798 & C^{73} & 2998 & 0.0379 & 31 & 10 & 0.0042 & 35 & 11 \\ C : 3798 & C^{73} & 2998 & 0.0379 & 31 & 10 & 0.0042 & 35 & 11 \\ C : 37798 & C^{73} & 2998 & 0.0379 & 35 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ C : 17 & 34 & A^{73} & 539 & 0.0703 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ C : 17 & 34 & A^{73} & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0022 & 104 & 0 \\ C : 17 & 34 & A^{73} & 539 & 0.0703 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ C : 17 & 34 & A^{73} & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0022 & 104 & 0 \\ C : 17 & 34 & A^{73} & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0002 & 105 & 0 \\ C : 17 & 34 & A^{73} & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0002 & 105 & 0 \\ C : 17 & 34 & A^{73} & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0002 & 105 & 0 \\ C : 17 & 34 & A^{73} & 1443 & 0.0251 & 126 & 0 $	×		A^{73}	1279	0.0113	58	0	0.0009	45	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$			B^{73}	1256	0.0119	64	0	0.0010	41	0
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		Q :70400	C^{73}	1367	0.0094	50	0	0.0008	35	0
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		R :69		589	0.0151	266	0	0.0015	240	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$			T+	584	0.0143	243	0	0.0014	224	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	0.5	O : 16		627	0.0157	262	0	0.0015	226	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	20	$ R_p : 69$		602	0.0161	276	0	0.0016	255	0
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q^r : 1574 & B^{73} & 596 & 0.0159 & 282 & 0 & 0.0015 & 249 & 0 \\ Q : 56650 & C^{73} & 649 & 0.0137 & 219 & 0 & 0.0013 & 209 & 0 \\ \hline R : 62 & T & 1905 & 0.0226 & 322 & 2 & 0.0019 & 233 & 0 \\ T+ & 1925 & 0.0213 & 306 & 2 & 0.0018 & 229 & 0 \\ C : 32 & A^{80} & 1924 & 0.0207 & 294 & 2 & 0.0018 & 233 & 0 \\ R_p : 55 & B^{80} & 1894 & 0.0218 & 307 & 2 & 0.0019 & 233 & 0 \\ R_p : 55 & B^{80} & 2046 & 0.0196 & 290 & 2 & 0.0017 & 221 & 0 \\ C : 484 & B^{73} & 1912 & 0.0214 & 300 & 2 & 0.0018 & 238 & 0 \\ C : 1484 & B^{73} & 1912 & 0.0214 & 300 & 2 & 0.0018 & 238 & 0 \\ C : 1484 & B^{73} & 1912 & 0.0214 & 300 & 2 & 0.0019 & 243 & 0 \\ C : 17 & A^{80} & 2626 & 0.0447 & 35 & 10 & 0.0041 & 34 & 11 \\ C : 17 & A^{80} & 2645 & 0.0428 & 34 & 10 & 0.0041 & 35 & 11 \\ R_p : 18 & B^{80} & 2610 & 0.0444 & 36 & 10 & 0.0041 & 35 & 11 \\ C : 17 : 50 & A^{73} & 2640 & 0.0436 & 34 & 10 & 0.0041 & 35 & 11 \\ C : 17 : 50 & A^{73} & 2640 & 0.0436 & 34 & 10 & 0.0041 & 33 & 11 \\ C : 37798 & C^{73} & 2998 & 0.0379 & 31 & 10 & 0.0036 & 26 & 10 \\ C : 18 & A^{80} & 539 & 0.0703 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ C : 18 & A^{80} & 539 & 0.0703 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ C : 31739 & C^{73} & 539 & 0.0803 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ C : 31739 & C^{73} & 539 & 0.0742 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ C : 31739 & C^{73} & 539 & 0.0742 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ C : 31739 & C^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ C : 31739 & C^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ C : 31739 & C^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ C : 31739 & C^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ C : 3184 & T & 1760 & 0.0166 & 92 & 0 & 0.0016 & 93 & 0 \\ C : 3865 & C^{73} & 1443 & 0.0243 & 118 & 0 & 0.0019 & 103 & 0 \\ C : 8865 & C^{73} & 1443 & 0.0243 & 118 & 0 & 0.0019 & 103 & 0 \\ C : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 94 & 0 \\ C : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 94 & 0 \\ C : 17 : 49 & A^{73} & 1788 & 0.0167 & 105 & 27 & 0.0016 & 88 & 0 \\ C : 17 : 1960 $	e	k:50		651	0.0135	220	0	0.0013	199	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	🔰	T : 50	A^{73}	618	0.0165	280	0	0.0016	250	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$		$ Q^r $: 1574	B^{73}	596	0.0159	282	0	0.0015	249	0
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		Q :56650	C^{73}	649	0.0137	219	0		209	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$		R :62		1905	0.0226	322		0.0019	243	0
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	05		T+	1925	0.0213	306	2	0.0018	229	0
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	20	O :32	A^{80}	1924	0.0207	294	2	0.0018	233	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	CS	$ R_p : 55$	B^{80}	1894	0.0218	307	2	0.0019	233	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	B.	k:60	C^{80}	2046	0.0196	290		0.0017	221	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	l g	T :49	A^{73}	1912	0.0214	300	2	0.0018	238	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	Ğ	$ Q^r $: 4584	B^{73}	1898	0.0222	314	2	0.0019	243	0
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		Q : 39958	C^{73}	2029	0.0199	292	2	0.0017	219	0
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		R :74	Т	2626	0.0447	35	10	0.0041	34	11
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	1,0		T+	2325	0.0511	43	13		41	13
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q' : 6361 & B^{13} & 2615 & 0.0448 & 36 & 10 & 0.0042 & 35 & 11 \\ Q : 37798 & C^{73} & 2998 & 0.0379 & 31 & 10 & 0.0036 & 28 & 10 \\ \hline R : 34 & T & 539 & 0.0803 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 53 & 6 \\ T+ & 539 & 0.1040 & 77 & 26 & 0.0092 & 65 & 15 \\ C : 8 & A^{80} & 539 & 0.0793 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ C : 8 & C^{80} & 539 & 0.0801 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ R_p : 14 & B^{80} & 539 & 0.0801 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ R_p : 14 & B^{80} & 539 & 0.0742 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ T : 39 & A^{73} & 539 & 0.0799 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ Q^* : 4323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0799 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ Q^* : 4323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ Q^* : 14323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ Q^* : 14323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ Q^* : 1727 & T & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0020 & 103 & 0 \\ T & T & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0022 & 114 & 0 \\ Q^* : 176 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.0240 & 116 & 0 & 0.0019 & 103 & 0 \\ R_p : 46 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.0251 & 126 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Q^* : 1765 & B^{73} & 1443 & 0.0254 & 129 & 0 & 0.0016 & 105 & 0 \\ Q : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ R_p : 49 & B^{80} & 1767 & 0.0176 & 105 & 27 & 0.0016 & 89 & 0 \\ R_p : 49 & B^{80} & 1767 & 0.0178 & 105 & 27 & 0.0017 & 94 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1788 & 0.0167 & 107 & 29 & 0.0016 & 88 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E $	00	O :17	A^{80}	2645	0.0428	34	10	0.0040	32	11
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q' : 6361 & B^{13} & 2615 & 0.0448 & 36 & 10 & 0.0042 & 35 & 11 \\ Q : 37798 & C^{73} & 2998 & 0.0379 & 31 & 10 & 0.0036 & 28 & 10 \\ \hline R : 34 & T & 539 & 0.0803 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 53 & 6 \\ T+ & 539 & 0.1040 & 77 & 26 & 0.0092 & 65 & 15 \\ C : 8 & A^{80} & 539 & 0.0793 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ C : 8 & C^{80} & 539 & 0.0801 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ R_p : 14 & B^{80} & 539 & 0.0801 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ R_p : 14 & B^{80} & 539 & 0.0742 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ T : 39 & A^{73} & 539 & 0.0799 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ Q^* : 4323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0799 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ Q^* : 4323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ Q^* : 14323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ Q^* : 14323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ Q^* : 1727 & T & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0020 & 103 & 0 \\ T & T & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0022 & 114 & 0 \\ Q^* : 176 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.0240 & 116 & 0 & 0.0019 & 103 & 0 \\ R_p : 46 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.0251 & 126 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Q^* : 1765 & B^{73} & 1443 & 0.0254 & 129 & 0 & 0.0016 & 105 & 0 \\ Q : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ R_p : 49 & B^{80} & 1767 & 0.0176 & 105 & 27 & 0.0016 & 89 & 0 \\ R_p : 49 & B^{80} & 1767 & 0.0178 & 105 & 27 & 0.0017 & 94 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1788 & 0.0167 & 107 & 29 & 0.0016 & 88 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E $	2	$ R_p : 18$	B^{80}	2610	0.0444	36	10	0.0041	35	11
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q' : 6361 & B^{13} & 2615 & 0.0448 & 36 & 10 & 0.0042 & 35 & 11 \\ Q : 37798 & C^{73} & 2998 & 0.0379 & 31 & 10 & 0.0036 & 28 & 10 \\ \hline R : 34 & T & 539 & 0.0803 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 53 & 6 \\ T+ & 539 & 0.1040 & 77 & 26 & 0.0092 & 65 & 15 \\ C : 8 & A^{80} & 539 & 0.0793 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ C : 8 & C^{80} & 539 & 0.0801 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ R_p : 14 & B^{80} & 539 & 0.0801 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ R_p : 14 & B^{80} & 539 & 0.0742 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ T : 39 & A^{73} & 539 & 0.0799 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ Q^* : 4323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0799 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ Q^* : 4323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ Q^* : 14323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ Q^* : 14323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ Q^* : 1727 & T & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0020 & 103 & 0 \\ T & T & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0022 & 114 & 0 \\ Q^* : 176 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.0240 & 116 & 0 & 0.0019 & 103 & 0 \\ R_p : 46 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.0251 & 126 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Q^* : 1765 & B^{73} & 1443 & 0.0254 & 129 & 0 & 0.0016 & 105 & 0 \\ Q : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ R_p : 49 & B^{80} & 1767 & 0.0176 & 105 & 27 & 0.0016 & 89 & 0 \\ R_p : 49 & B^{80} & 1767 & 0.0178 & 105 & 27 & 0.0017 & 94 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1788 & 0.0167 & 107 & 29 & 0.0016 & 88 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E $	SE		C^{80}	3030	0.0378	31	10	0.0036	26	10
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q' : 6361 & B^{13} & 2615 & 0.0448 & 36 & 10 & 0.0042 & 35 & 11 \\ Q : 37798 & C^{73} & 2998 & 0.0379 & 31 & 10 & 0.0036 & 28 & 10 \\ \hline R : 34 & T & 539 & 0.0803 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 53 & 6 \\ T+ & 539 & 0.1040 & 77 & 26 & 0.0092 & 65 & 15 \\ C : 8 & A^{80} & 539 & 0.0793 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ C : 8 & C^{80} & 539 & 0.0801 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ R_p : 14 & B^{80} & 539 & 0.0801 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ R_p : 14 & B^{80} & 539 & 0.0742 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ T : 39 & A^{73} & 539 & 0.0799 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ Q^* : 4323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0799 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ Q^* : 4323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ Q^* : 14323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ Q^* : 14323 & B^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ Q^* : 1727 & T & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0020 & 103 & 0 \\ T & T & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0022 & 114 & 0 \\ Q^* : 176 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.0240 & 116 & 0 & 0.0019 & 103 & 0 \\ R_p : 46 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.0251 & 126 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Q^* : 1765 & B^{73} & 1443 & 0.0254 & 129 & 0 & 0.0016 & 105 & 0 \\ Q : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ R_p : 49 & B^{80} & 1767 & 0.0176 & 105 & 27 & 0.0016 & 89 & 0 \\ R_p : 49 & B^{80} & 1767 & 0.0178 & 105 & 27 & 0.0017 & 94 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1788 & 0.0167 & 107 & 29 & 0.0016 & 88 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ E $	23	T : 50	A^{73}	2640	0.0436	34	10	0.0041	33	11
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	14	$ Q^r $: 6561	B^{73}	2615	0.0448	36	10	0.0042	35	11
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		Q :37798	C^{73}	2998	0.0379	31	10	0.0036	28	10
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		R :34	Т	539	0.0803	59	8	0.0071	53	6
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$			T+	539	0.1040	77	26	0.0092	65	15
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	90	O : 8	A^{80}	539	0.0793	59	8	0.0071	52	6
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	20	$ R_p : 14$	B^{80}	539	0.0801	59	8	0.0071	52	6
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q' : 4323 & B^{13} & 539 & 0.0801 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ Q : 31739 & C^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ \hline R : 127 & T & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0022 & 103 & 0 \\ T+ & 1443 & 0.0285 & 137 & 2 & 0.0022 & 114 & 0 \\ Q : 29 & A^{80} & 1443 & 0.0240 & 116 & 0 & 0.0019 & 103 & 0 \\ R_p : 46 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.02251 & 126 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : 46 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.0251 & 126 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : 46 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.0243 & 118 & 0 & 0.0016 & 93 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : 46 & R_p : 444 & 0.0196 & 92 & 0 & 0.0016 & 93 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : 44 & R_p : 443 & 0.0243 & 118 & 0 & 0.0019 & 104 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : 46 & R_p : 443 & 0.0254 & 129 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : & 165 & R_p : & 1443 & 0.0254 & 129 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : & 184 & T : & T_{0}0176 & T_{0}5 : & T_{0}76 $	gal		C^{80}	539	0.0742	55	6	0.0067	49	3
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q' : 4323 & B^{13} & 539 & 0.0801 & 59 & 8 & 0.0071 & 52 & 6 \\ Q : 31739 & C^{73} & 539 & 0.0745 & 55 & 6 & 0.0067 & 49 & 3 \\ \hline R : 127 & T & 1443 & 0.0250 & 126 & 0 & 0.0022 & 103 & 0 \\ T+ & 1443 & 0.0285 & 137 & 2 & 0.0022 & 114 & 0 \\ Q : 29 & A^{80} & 1443 & 0.0240 & 116 & 0 & 0.0019 & 103 & 0 \\ R_p : 46 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.02251 & 126 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : 46 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.0251 & 126 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : 46 & B^{80} & 1443 & 0.0243 & 118 & 0 & 0.0016 & 93 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : 46 & R_p : 444 & 0.0196 & 92 & 0 & 0.0016 & 93 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : 44 & R_p : 443 & 0.0243 & 118 & 0 & 0.0019 & 104 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : 46 & R_p : 443 & 0.0254 & 129 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : & 165 & R_p : & 1443 & 0.0254 & 129 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ Z : & R_p : & 184 & T : & T_{0}0176 & T_{0}5 : & T_{0}76 $	Ę	T :39	A^{73}	539	0.0799	59	8	0.0071	52	6
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$		$ Q^r $: 4323	B^{73}	539	0.0801	59	8	0.0071	52	6
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$		Q :31739	C^{73}	539	0.0745	55	6	0.0067	49	3
$ \begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$		R :127	Т	1443	0.0250	126	0	0.0020	103	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	-			1443	0.0285	137	2	0.0022	114	0
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q' : 1765 & B^{18} & 1443 & 0.0294 & 129 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Q : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ \hline Q : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ \hline R : 184 & T & 1760 & 0.0176 & 105 & 27 & 0.0016 & 89 & 0 \\ \hline T & T+ & 1717 & 0.0176 & 101 & 26 & 0.0017 & 86 & 0 \\ Q : 58 & A^{80} & 1790 & 0.0161 & 96 & 26 & 0.0015 & 85 & 0 \\ B_p : 49 & B^{80} & 1767 & 0.0178 & 105 & 27 & 0.0017 & 94 & 0 \\ \hline Q & k : 30 & C^{80} & 1912 & 0.0134 & 75 & 18 & 0.0013 & 61 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1788 & 0.0167 & 107 & 29 & 0.0016 & 88 & 0 \\ E & Q^r : 2965 & B^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ \hline \end{tabular} $	010	O :29	A^{80}	1443	0.0240	116	0	0.0019	103	0
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q' : 1765 & B^{18} & 1443 & 0.0294 & 129 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Q : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ \hline Q : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ \hline R : 184 & T & 1760 & 0.0176 & 105 & 27 & 0.0016 & 89 & 0 \\ \hline T & T+ & 1717 & 0.0176 & 101 & 26 & 0.0017 & 86 & 0 \\ Q : 58 & A^{80} & 1790 & 0.0161 & 96 & 26 & 0.0015 & 85 & 0 \\ B_p : 49 & B^{80} & 1767 & 0.0178 & 105 & 27 & 0.0017 & 94 & 0 \\ \hline Q & k : 30 & C^{80} & 1912 & 0.0134 & 75 & 18 & 0.0013 & 61 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1788 & 0.0167 & 107 & 29 & 0.0016 & 88 & 0 \\ E & Q^r : 2965 & B^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ \hline \end{tabular} $	2		B^{80}	1443	0.0251	126	0	0.0020	105	0
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q' : 1765 & B^{18} & 1443 & 0.0294 & 129 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Q : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ \hline Q : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ \hline R : 184 & T & 1760 & 0.0176 & 105 & 27 & 0.0016 & 89 & 0 \\ \hline T & T+ & 1717 & 0.0176 & 101 & 26 & 0.0017 & 86 & 0 \\ Q : 58 & A^{80} & 1790 & 0.0161 & 96 & 26 & 0.0015 & 85 & 0 \\ B_p : 49 & B^{80} & 1767 & 0.0178 & 105 & 27 & 0.0017 & 94 & 0 \\ \hline Q & k : 30 & C^{80} & 1912 & 0.0134 & 75 & 18 & 0.0013 & 61 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1788 & 0.0167 & 107 & 29 & 0.0016 & 88 & 0 \\ E & Q^r : 2965 & B^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ \hline \end{tabular} $	lica		C^{80}	1442	0.0196	92	0	0.0016	93	0
$ \begin{vmatrix} Q' : 1765 & B^{18} & 1443 & 0.0294 & 129 & 0 & 0.0020 & 105 & 0 \\ Q : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ \hline Q : 8865 & C^{73} & 1442 & 0.0207 & 97 & 0 & 0.0017 & 91 & 0 \\ \hline R : 184 & T & 1760 & 0.0176 & 105 & 27 & 0.0016 & 89 & 0 \\ \hline T & T+ & 1717 & 0.0176 & 101 & 26 & 0.0017 & 86 & 0 \\ Q : 58 & A^{80} & 1790 & 0.0161 & 96 & 26 & 0.0015 & 85 & 0 \\ B_p : 49 & B^{80} & 1767 & 0.0178 & 105 & 27 & 0.0017 & 94 & 0 \\ \hline Q & k : 30 & C^{80} & 1912 & 0.0134 & 75 & 18 & 0.0013 & 61 & 0 \\ E & T : 49 & A^{73} & 1788 & 0.0167 & 107 & 29 & 0.0016 & 88 & 0 \\ Q^r : 2965 & B^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ \hline Q & Q^r : 2965 & B^{73} & 1756 & 0.0177 & 108 & 29 & 0.0017 & 93 & 0 \\ \hline Q & $	[ed	T : 34	A^{73}	1443	0.0243	118	0	0.0019	104	0
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	2		B^{73}		0.0254			0.0020		
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	<u></u>					l				
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$		R :184								
	1 = 1			!	!	!			!	
	2		A80							
	log						1		1	
	obj		$C_{-\hat{\alpha}}^{80}$							
	ici.		$A_{\pi e}^{73}$							
$ Q :60129$ C^{73} 1887 0.0139 77 20 0.0013 60 0	Σ		B_{-}^{73}				1		1	
		Q :60129	C^{73}	1887	0.0139	77	20	0.0013	60	0

2014

- [6] W. Webber and L. A. Park. Score adjustment for correction of pooling bias. In *Proc. of SIGIR*, pages 444–451, 2009.
- [7] E. Yilmaz, E. Kanoulas, and J. A. Aslam. A simple and efficient sampling method for estimating AP and NDCG. In *Proc. of SIGIR*, pages 603–610, 2008.
- [8] Y. Zhang, L. A. F. Park, and A. Moffat. Click-based evidence for decaying weight distributions in search effectiveness metrics. *Information Retrieval*, 13(1):46–69, 2009.