

Triage Against the Machine: Can AI Reason Deliberatively? Part II

Francesco Veri, Gustavo Umbelino

2025-08-14

Large-Language Models (LLMs) Preview

Table 1: LLMs

| | Provider | Model |
|---|-----------|------------------------------|
| 1 | anthropic | claude-3-5-sonnet-20241022 |
| 2 | anthropic | claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 |
| 3 | google | gemini-2.5-pro-preview-03-25 |
| 4 | xai | grok-3-beta |

Building on our previous analysis, we selected only top models.

Cases

Table 2: Deliberative Cases

| | case | survey | N | topic | subtopic |
|---|-----------------------|---------------------|----|----------------|----------------|
| 1 | UBC Bio | biobanking_mayo_abc | 17 | genomics | genomics |
| 2 | CCPS ACT Deliberative | ccps | 31 | climate | climate |
| 3 | CSIRO WA | energy_futures | 17 | climate | energy |
| 4 | FNQCJ | fnqcj | 11 | climate | transportation |
| 5 | Forest Lay Citizen | forestera | 9 | climate | forest |
| 6 | Fremantle | fremantle | 41 | transportation | transportation |
| 7 | Activate | uppsala_speaks | 26 | immigration | immigration |
| 8 | Standard | uppsala_speaks | 22 | immigration | immigration |
| 9 | Winterthur | zh_winterthur | 16 | climate | climate |

Surveys

Table 3: Surveys

| | survey | considerations | policies | scale_max | q_method |
|---|---------------------|----------------|----------|-----------|----------|
| 1 | biobanking_mayo_abc | 38 | 7 | 11 | FALSE |
| 2 | ccps | 33 | 7 | 11 | FALSE |
| 3 | energy_futures | 45 | 9 | 11 | FALSE |
| 4 | fnqcj | 42 | 5 | 12 | FALSE |
| 5 | forestera | 45 | 7 | 11 | FALSE |

| | survey | considerations | policies | scale_max | q_method |
|---|----------------|----------------|----------|-----------|----------|
| 6 | fremantle | 36 | 6 | 11 | TRUE |
| 7 | uppsala_speaks | 42 | 7 | 7 | FALSE |
| 8 | zh_winterthur | 30 | 6 | 7 | FALSE |

Prompts

Table 4: System Prompts

| | uid | type | role | description |
|----|-----|-------------|------------------------|--|
| 1 | csk | devils | climate skeptic | prioritizes economic growth over CO2 emission cuts, fossil fuels over renewable energy, and does not believe in climate science |
| 2 | ana | ideology | anarchist | rejects all coercive authority and hierarchical government, advocating stateless, voluntary societies |
| 3 | con | ideology | conservative | seeks to preserve traditional institutions, customs, and values, favoring order and gradual change |
| 4 | eco | ideology | ecologist | focuses on environmental protection and sustainability, advocating for societal change to ecological limits |
| 5 | fas | ideology | fascist | promotes extreme nationalism, authoritarianism, militarism, and a totalitarian state |
| 6 | fem | ideology | feminist | advocates for gender equality, challenging patriarchal structures and discrimination against women |
| 7 | fun | ideology | fundamentalist | adheres strictly to core beliefs, often religious, applying these principles to all life aspects |
| 8 | lib | ideology | liberal | advocates individual liberty, rights, limited government, and free markets, emphasizing individual autonomy |
| 9 | nat | ideology | nationalist | prioritizes the interests and identity of a particular nation, often seeking self-determination |
| 10 | pop | ideology | populist | appeals directly to “the people” against a perceived corrupt elite using anti-establishment rhetoric |
| 11 | soc | ideology | socialist | aims for social ownership or control of production, emphasizing equality and collective welfare |
| 12 | coa | perspective | coastal resident | endures chronic flooding and salinization, forced to relocate due to rising sea levels and intense storms worsened by climate change |
| 13 | ctr | perspective | construction worker | suffers from extreme heat stress and lost work hours, perceiving climate change making outdoor labor unbearable and life-threatening |
| 14 | dis | perspective | disease survivor | recovers from dengue fever, aware that climate change’s rising temperatures are expanding the range of disease-carrying mosquitoes in their region |
| 15 | eld | perspective | elderly urban resident | endures intensified city heatwaves, struggling with disrupted services and feeling the direct, severe impact of climate change |
| 16 | far | perspective | displaced family | loses their home due to unprecedented wildfires, experiencing displacement and recognizing climate change as the major driver of the devastation |
| 17 | fis | perspective | fisher | notes his declining catches due to warming oceans, understanding that climate change is reorganizing marine life and reducing their traditional yield |
| 18 | lan | perspective | landowner | surveys his parched fields after a prolonged drought, feeling the compounding impacts of climate change that reduce crop yields and family income |
| 19 | par | perspective | parent | sees their child fall ill from a water-borne disease, attributing its spread to the increased heavy rainfall and warmer temperatures brought by climate change |
| 20 | sub | perspective | subsistence farmer | watches his crops wither under erratic rainfall patterns, and who sees these changes as direct consequence of climate change |

| | uid | type | role | description |
|----|-----|-------------|----------|--|
| 21 | vil | perspective | villager | faces dwindling, contaminated water supplies due to extended draughts and floods, aware that climate change is altering their water security |

LLM Data Collection

```
## Rows: 9 Columns: 5
## -- Column specification -----
## Delimiter: ","
## chr (4): case, survey, topic, subtopic
## dbl (1): N
##
## i Use `spec()` to retrieve the full column specification for this data.
## i Specify the column types or set `show_col_types = FALSE` to quiet this message.
## Rows: 4 Columns: 19
## -- Column specification -----
## Delimiter: ","
## chr (7): provider, model, series, num_parameters, arch, api, comment
## dbl (10): version, context_length, cost_per_completion, total_cost, fail_rat...
## lgl (2): is_reasoner, included
##
## i Use `spec()` to retrieve the full column specification for this data.
## i Specify the column types or set `show_col_types = FALSE` to quiet this message.
## `summarise()` has grouped output by 'model', 'survey'. You can override using the `.groups` argument
```

Table 5: Data Generation Progress

| model | survey | prompt_uid | n |
|----------------------------|---------------------|------------|---|
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | biobanking_mayo_ubc | ana | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | biobanking_mayo_ubc | con | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | biobanking_mayo_ubc | csk | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | biobanking_mayo_ubc | eco | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | biobanking_mayo_ubc | fas | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | biobanking_mayo_ubc | nat | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | ccps | ana | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | ccps | con | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | ccps | csk | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | ccps | eco | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | ccps | fas | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | ccps | nat | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | energy_futures | ana | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | energy_futures | con | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | energy_futures | csk | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | energy_futures | eco | 4 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | energy_futures | fas | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | energy_futures | nat | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | fnqcj | ana | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | fnqcj | con | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | fnqcj | csk | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | fnqcj | eco | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | fnqcj | fas | 5 |

| model | survey | prompt_uid | n |
|----------------------------|----------------|------------|---|
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | fnqcj | nat | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | forestera | ana | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | forestera | con | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | forestera | csk | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | forestera | eco | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | forestera | fas | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | forestera | nat | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | fremantle | ana | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | fremantle | con | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | fremantle | csk | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | fremantle | eco | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | fremantle | fas | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | fremantle | nat | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | uppsala_speaks | ana | 4 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | uppsala_speaks | con | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | uppsala_speaks | csk | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | uppsala_speaks | eco | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | uppsala_speaks | fas | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | uppsala_speaks | nat | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | zh_winterthur | ana | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | zh_winterthur | con | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | zh_winterthur | csk | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | zh_winterthur | eco | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | zh_winterthur | fas | 5 |
| claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | zh_winterthur | nat | 5 |

References