# Triage Against the Machine: Can AI Reason Deliberatively?

Francesco Veri, Gustavo Umbelino

2025-04-04

# Preparing data for analysis

## Define helper functions

```
Maybe move this to it's own package...
create_file_path <- function(provider, model, survey, file_type) {
    file.path("llm_data", provider, model, survey, pasteO(file_type, ".csv"))
}

output.file.exists <- function(file_name) {
    file.exists(paste(OUTPUT_DIR, file_name, sep = "/"))
}

read_output_csv <- function(file_name) {
    read_csv(paste(OUTPUT_DIR, file_name, sep = "/"), show_col_types = FALSE)
}

write_output_csv <- function(data, file_name) {
    write_output_csv <- function(data, file_name, sep = "/"))
}

now_utc <- function() {
    now <- Sys.time()
    attr(now, "tzone") <- "UTC"
    now
}</pre>
```

### Get available LLMs

```
# get models info
models <- read_csv(LLMS_FILE, show_col_types = FALSE)

# initialize a vector to store the 'has_data' values
has_data_flags <- logical(nrow(models))

# iterate over each row in the models data frame
for (i in 1:nrow(models)) {
   provider <- models$provider[i]
   model <- models$model[i]

# create the data path</pre>
```

```
path <- paste0("llm_data/", provider, "/", model)</pre>
  # check if the path exists and set the 'has_data' flag accordingly
 has_data_flags[i] <- file.exists(path)</pre>
# add the 'has_data' column to the models data frame
models <- models %>%
  mutate(has_data = has_data_flags) %>%
  arrange(provider, model)
# print rows where has_data is TRUE
if (!any(models$has_data)) {
  warn("No data available!")
# print ordered survey names
for (i in 1:nrow(models)){
  cat(paste0(i, ". ", models[i,]$provider, "/", models[i,]$model, if(models[i,]$has_data) " | has data"
## 1. anthropic/claude-3-5-haiku-20241022 | has data
## 2. anthropic/claude-3-5-sonnet-20241022 | has data
## 3. anthropic/claude-3-7-sonnet-20250219 | has data
## 4. anthropic/claude-3-haiku-20240307 | has data
## 5. anthropic/claude-3-opus-20240229 | has data
## 6. anthropic/claude-3-sonnet-20240229 | has data
## 7. cohere/command | has data
## 8. cohere/command-r-08-2024 | has data
## 9. cohere/command-r-plus-08-2024 | has data
## 10. cohere/command-r7b-12-2024 | has data
## 11. deepseek/deepseek-chat | has data
## 12. deepseek/deepseek-reasoner | has data
## 13. deepseek/deepseek-v2 | has data
## 14. deepseek/deepseek-v2.5
## 15. google/gemini-1.5-flash | has data
## 16. google/gemini-1.5-flash-8b | has data
## 17. google/gemini-1.5-pro | has data
## 18. google/gemini-2.0-flash | has data
## 19. google/gemma | has data
## 20. google/gemma2:27b | has data
## 21. google/gemma3:12b | has data
## 22. meta/llama2:13b | has data
## 23. meta/llama2:70b | has data
## 24. meta/llama3.1:405B-turbo | has data
## 25. meta/llama3.2 | has data
## 26. meta/llama3.3:70b | has data
## 27. meta/llama3:70b | has data
## 28. microsoft/phi | has data
## 29. microsoft/phi2
## 30. microsoft/phi3 | has data
## 31. microsoft/phi3.5 | has data
## 32. microsoft/phi4 | has data
## 33. mistralai/ministral-3b-latest | has data
```

```
## 34. mistralai/ministral-8b-latest | has data
## 35. mistralai/mistral-large-latest | has data
## 36. mistralai/mistral-small-latest | has data
## 37. mistralai/open-mistral-7b | has data
## 38. mistralai/open-mistral-nemo | has data
## 39. mistralai/open-mixtral-8x22b | has data
## 40. mistralai/open-mixtral-8x7b | has data
## 41. openai/gpt-3.5-turbo | has data
## 42. openai/gpt-4 | has data
## 43. openai/gpt-4-turbo | has data
## 44. openai/gpt-40 | has data
## 45. openai/gpt-4o-mini | has data
## 46. openai/o1 | has data
## 47. openai/o1-mini | has data
## 48. openai/o3-mini | has data
## 49. qwen/qwen-max | has data
## 50. qwen/qwen-plus | has data
## 51. gwen/gwen-turbo | has data
## 52. qwen/qwen1.5-110b-chat | has data
## 53. qwen/qwen1.5-72b-chat | has data
## 54. qwen/qwen2-72b-instruct | has data
## 55. qwen/qwen2.5-72b-instruct | has data
## 56. qwen/qwq-plus | has data
```

There are 54 models with data out of 56 (96%).

#### Surveys

```
# read the sheet names of the Excel file
survey_names <- excel_sheets(SURVEY_FILE)</pre>
# remove invalid and "template"
survey_names <- sort(survey_names[!grepl("^~", survey_names) & survey_names != "template"])</pre>
get surveys <- function(survey names) {</pre>
  surveys <- list()</pre>
  # Iterate over each sheet in the workbook
  for (survey name in survey names) {
    # Read the current sheet into a data frame
    df <- read_excel(SURVEY_FILE, sheet = survey_name)</pre>
    # Check if required columns exist
    required_columns <- c("considerations", "policies", "scale_max", "q-method")
    missing_cols <- setdiff(required_columns, colnames(df))</pre>
    if (length(missing_cols) > 0) {
      cat(
        "Sheet",
        survey_name,
        "is missing the following columns:",
        paste(missing_cols, collapse = ", "),
        "\n\n"
```

```
next
    }
    \# Calculate the number of non-NA rows in "considerations" column
    n_c <- sum(!is.na(df$considerations))</pre>
    # Calculate the number of non-NA rows in "policies" column
    n_p <- sum(!is.na(df$policies))</pre>
    # Extract integer values from "scale_max" column, assuming they are already integers
    scale_max <- as.integer(na.omit(df$scale_max))</pre>
    # Extract logical (boolean) values from "q-method" column
    q_method <- as.logical(na.omit(df$`q-method`))</pre>
    surveys[[length(surveys) + 1]] <- tibble(</pre>
      survey = survey_name,
      considerations = n_c,
      policies = n_p,
      scale_max,
      q_method,
    )
  }
  surveys <- bind_rows(surveys)</pre>
  surveys
}
surveys <- get_surveys(survey_names)</pre>
# define file types
file_types <- c("considerations", "policies", "reasons")</pre>
kable(surveys %>% arrange(survey), caption = "Surveys")
```

Table 1: Surveys

survey	considerations	policies	$scale\_max$	$q$ _method
acp	48	5	11	FALSE
auscj	45	8	7	FALSE
bep	43	7	7	FALSE
biobanking_mayo_ubc	38	7	11	FALSE
biobanking_wa	49	7	11	FALSE
ccps	33	7	11	FALSE
ds_aargau	33	7	7	FALSE
ds_bellinzona	32	7	7	FALSE
energy_futures	45	9	11	FALSE
fnqcj	42	5	12	FALSE

survey	considerations	policies	scale_max	$q_method$
forestera	45	7	11	FALSE
fremantle	36	6	11	TRUE
gbr	35	7	7	FALSE
swiss_health	24	6	7	FALSE
uppsala_speaks	42	7	7	FALSE
valsamoggia	36	4	11	TRUE
zh_thalwil	31	7	7	FALSE
zh_uster	31	7	7	FALSE
$zh$ _winterthur	30	6	7	FALSE
zukunft	20	7	7	FALSE

# Read and format LLM data

```
get_llm_data <- function() {</pre>
  # initialize an empty list to store the data frames
 data_list <- list()</pre>
  # iterate over each survey
  for (survey_name in survey_names) {
    # iterate over each row in the models data frame where has_data is TRUE
    for (i in 1:nrow(models)) {
      if (!models$has_data[i]) {
        next
      }
      provider <- models$provider[i]</pre>
      model <- models$model[i]</pre>
      min_iterations <- models$min_iterations[i]</pre>
      # check if any file for the survey exists
      survey_path <- paste0("llm_data/", provider, "/", model, "/", survey_name, "/")</pre>
      if (!any(file.exists(pasteO(survey_path, file_types, ".csv")))) {
        next
      # iterate over each file type
      for (file_type in file_types) {
        # create the file path
        file_path <- create_file_path(provider, model, survey_name, file_type)</pre>
        # check if the file exists
        if (!file.exists(file_path)) {
          break
        }
        # read the CSV file
        temp_data <- read_csv(file_path, show_col_types = FALSE)</pre>
        # skip file if file exists but has no data
```

```
if (nrow(temp_data) == 0) {
    break
  }
  # select the relevant columns based on file type
  if (file_type == "considerations") {
    # initialize survey_data
    survey data <- temp data %>%
      rename_with(~ paste0("C", seq_along(.)),
                  starts_with("C", ignore.case = FALSE))
    # add column "survey" to meta data
    survey_data <- survey_data %>%
      mutate(survey = survey_name) %>%
      relocate(survey, .after = model)
    # ensure survey_data has columns up to C50
    # skip 8 rows of meta data
    for (j in (ncol(survey_data) - 7):50) {
      survey_data[[paste0("C", j)]] <- as.numeric(NA)</pre>
    # go to next file type
    next
  } else if (file_type == "policies") {
    temp_data <- temp_data %>%
      select(cuid, starts_with("P", ignore.case = FALSE)) %>%
      rename_with(~ paste0("P", seq_along(.)),
                  starts_with("P", ignore.case = FALSE))
    # ensure temp_data has columns up to P10
    for (j in (ncol(temp_data)):10) {
      temp_data[[paste0("P", j)]] <- as.numeric(NA)</pre>
  } else if (file_type == "reasons") {
    temp_data <- temp_data %>%
      select(cuid, reason) %>%
      rename(R = reason)
  # merge the data frames by 'cuid' and keep all rows
  survey_data <- full_join(survey_data, temp_data, by = c("cuid"))</pre>
}
# add the survey_data to the list
if (exists("survey_data")) {
  data_list[[length(data_list) + 1]] <- survey_data</pre>
  # remove the survey_data data frame to free up memory
  rm(survey_data)
```

```
}
    }
  }
  # Combine all data frames in the list into a single data frame
  llm_data <- bind_rows(data_list)</pre>
 return(llm data)
}
# get llm data
llm_data <- get_llm_data()</pre>
# aggregate llm_data by provider, model, and survey and N the number of rows
llm_surveys <- llm_data %>%
  group_by(provider, model, survey) %>%
  summarise(
    N = n(),
    mean_input_tokens = as.integer(mean(input_tokens)),
    mean_output_tokens = as.integer(mean(output_tokens)),
    .groups = 'drop'
  )
models <- llm surveys %>%
  group_by(provider, model) %>%
  summarise(
    surveys_with_data = n(),
    min_iterations_completed = min(N, na.rm = TRUE),
    max_iterations_completed = max(N, na.rm = TRUE),
    .groups = 'drop'
  ) %>%
  full_join(models, by = c("provider", "model")) %>%
  mutate(done = (min_iterations <= min_iterations_completed) &</pre>
           (surveys_with_data == length(survey_names)))
models["done"][is.na(models["done"])] <- FALSE</pre>
# write resutls to file
write_csv(llm_data, paste(OUTPUT_DIR, "llm_data.csv", sep = "/"))
write_csv(llm_surveys, paste(OUTPUT_DIR, "llm_surveys.csv", sep = "/"))
```

#### Cost analysis

```
# calculate costs in tokens
cost_tokens <- llm_data %>%
  group_by(provider, model) %>%
summarise(
  total_iterations_completed = n(),
  total_input_tokens = as.integer(sum(input_tokens)),
  total_output_tokens = as.integer(sum(output_tokens)),
  input_output_ratio = total_input_tokens/total_output_tokens,
  .groups = 'drop'
```

```
models <- full_join(models, cost_tokens, by = c("provider", "model")) %>%
    cost_input = (total_input_tokens / 1000000) * price_1M_input,
    cost_output = (total_output_tokens / 1000000) * price_1M_output,
   total_cost = cost_input + cost_output
  )
api_costs <- read_excel(EXPENSES_FILE)</pre>
api_costs <- api_costs %>%
  group_by(api) %>%
  summarise(
    credits_paid = sum(as.numeric(credits), na.rm = TRUE),
    total_cost = sum(as.numeric(paid), na.rm = TRUE),
    .groups = "drop"
  )
api_costs <- models %>%
  group_by(api) %>%
  summarise(
    credits_used = sum(total_cost, na.rm = TRUE),
    estimate = sum(total estimate, na.rm = TRUE)) %>%
  full_join(api_costs, by="api") %>%
  mutate(
    credits_left = credits_paid - credits_used,
  ) %>%
  select(
    api,
    credits_paid,
    credits_used,
    credits_left,
    total_cost,
    estimate) %>%
  arrange(desc(credits_paid))
write_csv(api_costs, paste(OUTPUT_DIR, "api_costs.csv", sep = "/"))
cat("Total spent: USD", sum(api_costs$credits_paid, na.rm = TRUE))
## Total spent: USD 225.19
```

# Execution analysis

NOTE: Execution data is NOT completely accurate. A few (3-5) executions failed and, as a result, we have no record of it.

```
# read exec log
# NOTE: not all executions were logged due to technical issues
# so the number of completions in this log will not add up to those in llm_data
exec_log <- read_csv(EXEC_LOG_FILE, show_col_types = FALSE)</pre>
```

```
# fill missing columns
exec_log <- exec_log %>%
  arrange(model) %>%
  mutate(
   fixed_num_errors = (`num surveys` * `num iterations`) - (`num fail completions` + `num success comp
  relocate(fixed_num_errors, .before = `num errors`) %>%
  # remove trial columns
  filter(is.na(`template success rate (%)`)) %>%
  select(-`template success rate (%)`) %>%
  # remove models with no completion data
  filter(`num completions` > 0)
exec_models <- exec_log %>%
  group_by(provider, model) %>%
  summarise(
   num exec = n(),
   total_cost_USD = sum(`total cost ($)`, na.rm = TRUE),
   total_time_min = sum(`total elapsed time (min)`, na.rm = TRUE),
   num_completions = sum(`num completions`, na.rm = TRUE),
   num_success = sum(`num success completions`, na.rm = TRUE),
   num_error = sum(fixed_num_errors, na.rm = TRUE),
   num_fail = sum(`num fail completions`, na.rm = TRUE),
    .groups = "drop"
  ) %>%
  mutate(
   fail_rate = num_fail / num_completions,
   success_rate = num_success / num_completions,
   cost_per_completion = total_cost_USD / num_completions,
   cost_per_success = total_cost_USD / num_success,
   time_per_completion_s = total_time_min / num_completions * 60
  )
models <- full_join(models, exec_models, by=c("provider", "model"))</pre>
exec models surveys <- exec log %>%
  pivot_longer(19:38, names_to = "survey", values_to = "success_rate", values_drop_na = TRUE) %>%
  mutate(
   success_iterations = round(success_rate / 100 * `num iterations`),
    survey = str_extract(survey, "([^]+)\\s*") %>%
           trimws()
  ) %>%
  group_by(provider, model, survey) %>%
  summarise(
   num_execs = n(),
   num_success = sum(success_iterations, na.rm = TRUE),
   num_iterations = sum(`num iterations`, na.rm = TRUE),
   success_rate = num_success / num_iterations,
    .groups = "drop"
```

```
exec_surveys <- exec_models_surveys %>%
  group_by(survey) %>%
  summarise(
    num execs = sum(num execs),
    num_iterations = sum(num_iterations),
    num_success = sum(num_success),
    success_rate = num_success/num_iterations,
    .groups = "drop"
  )
exec_total <- models %>%
  summarise(
    hours = sum(total_time_min, na.rm = TRUE) / 60,
    cost_USD = sum(total_cost, na.rm = TRUE),
    .groups = "drop"
exec_total <- as.data.frame(t(exec_total))</pre>
colnames(exec_total) <- c("measure")</pre>
exec_total <- rownames_to_column(exec_total, "metric")</pre>
# write summary to file
write csv(exec models, paste(OUTPUT DIR, "exec models.csv", sep = "/"))
write_csv(exec_surveys, paste(OUTPUT_DIR, "exec_surveys.csv", sep = "/"))
write_csv(exec_models_surveys, paste(OUTPUT_DIR, "exec_models_surveys.csv", sep = "/"))
write_csv(exec_total, paste(OUTPUT_DIR, "exec_total.csv", sep = "/"))
```

### Time & costs to complete data collection

```
data_left <- models %>%
  filter(!done, included) %>%
  mutate(
    completions_total = min_iterations * length(survey_names),
    completions_left = completions_total - total_iterations_completed,
    time_left_min = (time_per_completion_s * completions_left) / 60,
    cost_left = cost_per_completion * completions_left
) %>%
  select(
    provider, model,
    completions_total,
    completions_left,
    time_left_min,
    cost_left,
)
write_csv(data_left, paste(OUTPUT_DIR, "data_left.csv", sep = "/"))
```

### Compile model info

```
included_models_summary <- models %>%
  filter(included) %>%
  select(
    provider,
    model,
    type,
    api,
   done,
   cost_per_completion,
   total_cost,
   fail_rate,
    time_per_completion_s,
    total_time_min,
    comment
write_output_csv(included_models_summary, "models_summary.csv")
excluded_models <- models %>% filter(!included) %>% select(provider, model, reason)
cat("\n", nrow(excluded_models), "out of", nrow(models), "were excluded from the analysis for the follo
14 out of 58 were excluded from the analysis for the following reasons.
```

kable(excluded\_models %>% arrange(provider, model), caption = "Excluded models and reasons")

Table 2: Excluded models and reasons

provider	model	reason
anthropic	claude-3-sonnet- 20240229	not available in Anthropic API anymore
deepseek	deepseek-v2	high fail rate $(85\%)$
deepseek	deepseek-v2.5	too big to run locally; not available through APIs
meta	llama2:13b	does not respond to prompts correctly
meta	llama2:70b	does not respond to prompts correctly
meta	llama3.2	3% success rate on auscj
${\rm microsoft}$	phi	does not respond to prompts correctly
${\rm microsoft}$	phi2	same model as phi
${\rm microsoft}$	phi3	does not respond to prompts correctly
${\rm microsoft}$	phi3.5	10% success rate for biobanking_wa
mistralai	open-mistral-7b	11% success rate for auscj, uppsala_speaks, and biobanking_wa
mistralai	open-mixtral-8x7b	6% success rate on fremantle only
openai	o1-mini	0% success rate on uppsala_speaks only; responds with "I'm sorry, but I can't help with that."
qwen	qwen1.5-110b-chat	has API limit of 10 RPM; too slow

# Calculate Cronbach's Alpha

We calculate Cronbach's Alpha from the top 30

```
# Initialize an empty list to store the alpha results
alpha_results <- list()
models_with_data <- llm_data %>%
```

```
distinct(provider, model)
if (output.file.exists(ALPHA_RESULTS_FILE)) {
  last_alpha_results <- read_output_csv(ALPHA_RESULTS_FILE)</pre>
}
# Iterate over each unique provider/model combination
for (row in 1:nrow(models with data)) {
  provider <- models_with_data[row, ]$provider</pre>
 model <- models_with_data[row, ]$model</pre>
  # filter the data for the current provider/model
  provider_model_data <- llm_data %>%
    filter(model == !!model)
  # iterate over each survey
  for (survey_name in unique(provider_model_data$survey)) {
    # filter the data for the current survey
    survey_data <- provider_model_data %>%
      filter(survey == !!survey_name) %>%
      # get only first x iterations, where x = MAX_ITERATIONS
      arrange(created_at) %>%
      head(MAX ITERATIONS)
    # SKIP THIS ITERATION IF PREVIOUS RECORD EXISTS
    # get date of the most data generation
    last_updated <- max(survey_data$created_at, na.rm = TRUE)</pre>
    # if there is a previous record
    if (exists("last_alpha_results")) {
      last_alpha <- last_alpha_results %>% filter(model == !!model, survey == !!survey_name)
      ## and last record is still valid, save it and skip
      ## valid records are more recent than the latest data generated
      if (nrow(last_alpha) == 1 && (last_alpha$created_at > last_updated)) {
        alpha_results[[length(alpha_results) + 1]] <- last_alpha</pre>
        next
      } else {
        cat("updating:", model, "/", survey_name, "\n")
    }
    # Calculate Cronbach's Alpha for considerations (C1..C50)
    considerations_data <- survey_data %>% select(C1:C50)
    if (nrow(considerations_data) > 1) {
      # Check if policies are all equal (no variance)
      # this can happen when there are few iterations
      c_all_equal <- all(apply(considerations_data, 1, function(row)</pre>
        all(row == considerations_data[1, ], na.rm = TRUE)), na.rm = TRUE)
```

```
# TODO: FIXME!
  # NOTE: assign alpha = 1, which should NOT exist!
  # if (c_all_equal) {
  # alpha considerations <- 1
  # } else {
    alpha_considerations <- alpha(</pre>
      considerations_data,
      check.keys = TRUE,
      warnings = FALSE,
    )$total$raw_alpha
  # }
} else {
  alpha_considerations <- NA
# Calculate Cronbach's Alpha for policies (P1..P10)
policies_data <- survey_data %>% select(P1:P10)
if (nrow(policies_data) > 1) {
  # Check if policies are all equal (no variance)
  # this can happen when there are few iterations
  p_all_equal <- all(apply(policies_data, 1, function(row)</pre>
    all(row == policies_data[1, ], na.rm = TRUE)), na.rm = TRUE)
  # NOTE: assign alpha = 1, which should NOT exist!
  if (p_all_equal) {
    alpha_policies <- 1
  # normal case, calculate alpha
  else {
    alpha_policies <- alpha(</pre>
      policies_data,
      check.keys = TRUE,
      warnings = FALSE,
    )$total$raw_alpha
  }
} else {
  alpha_policies <- NA
if (nrow(policies_data) > 1 && nrow(considerations_data) > 1) {
  all_data <- cbind(considerations_data, policies_data)</pre>
  alpha_all <- alpha(</pre>
    all_data,
    check.keys = TRUE,
    warnings = FALSE,
  )$total$raw_alpha
} else {
  alpha_all <- NA
```

```
# Store the results in the list
    alpha_results[[length(alpha_results) + 1]] <- tibble(</pre>
      provider = provider,
      model = model,
      survey = survey_name,
      N = nrow(considerations data),
      created_at = now_utc(),
      alpha considerations = alpha considerations,
      alpha policies = alpha policies,
      alpha_all = alpha_all
    )
 }
}
# Combine all results into a single data frame
alpha_results <- bind_rows(alpha_results)</pre>
rm(models_with_data)
rm(considerations_data)
rm(survey data)
rm(policies data)
rm(provider_model_data)
# write summary to file
write_csv(alpha_results, paste(OUTPUT_DIR, "alpha_results.csv", sep = "/"))
```

#### Check alpha results per model

## Caused by warning in `min()`:

## ! no non-missing arguments to min; returning Inf

```
# Aggregate alpha results by model and calculate summary statistics
alpha_summary <- alpha_results %>%
  group_by(provider, model) %>%
  summarise(
   N = sum(N),
   mean_alpha_all = mean(alpha_all, na.rm = TRUE),
   min_alpha_considerations = min(alpha_considerations, na.rm = TRUE),
   max_alpha_considerations = max(alpha_considerations, na.rm = TRUE),
   mean_alpha_considerations = mean(alpha_considerations, na.rm = TRUE),
   std_alpha_considerations = sd(alpha_considerations, na.rm = TRUE),
   min_alpha_policies = min(alpha_policies, na.rm = TRUE),
   max_alpha_policies = max(alpha_policies, na.rm = TRUE),
   mean_alpha_policies = mean(alpha_policies, na.rm = TRUE),
   std_alpha_policies = sd(alpha_policies, na.rm = TRUE),
## Warning: There were 4 warnings in `summarise()`.
## The first warning was:
## i In argument: `min_alpha_considerations = min(alpha_considerations, na.rm =
    TRUE) `.
## i In group 45: `provider = "qwen"` `model = "qwen1.5-110b-chat"`.
```

## i Run `dplyr::last\_dplyr\_warnings()` to see the 3 remaining warnings.

```
## `summarise()` has grouped output by 'provider'. You can override using the
## `.groups` argument.
```

# Define aggregation functions

```
# function to calculate mode of data, same as stat function
calc_mode <- function(data) {</pre>
  as.numeric(names(sort(table(data), decreasing = TRUE)[1]))
# function to bootstrap mode
bootstrap_mode <- function(data, n_bootstrap = 1000) {</pre>
  # return NA if data contains any NA
  if (any(is.na(data))) {
   return(NA)
  # define the statistic function for bootstrapping to find mode
  stat_function <- function(data, indices) {</pre>
    as.numeric(names(sort(table(data[indices]), decreasing = TRUE)[1]))
  # perform bootstrap
  results <- boot(data = data,
                  statistic = stat_function,
                  R = n_{bootstrap}
  # calculate bootstrapped mode
  b_mode <- calc_mode(results$t)</pre>
  # return the bootstrapped modes
 return(b_mode)
aggregate_llm_considerations <- function(considerations) {</pre>
  # ensure there are at least 2 rows to aggregate
  if (nrow(considerations) < 2) {</pre>
    return(considerations)
  }
  # Calculate the mode for each column
  mode_considerations <- considerations %>%
    summarise(across(everything(), bootstrap_mode))
 return(mode_considerations)
}
aggregate_llm_policies <- function(policies) {</pre>
# ensure there are at least 2 rows to aggregate
```

```
if (nrow(policies) < 2) {</pre>
  return(policies)
# Remove columns with NAs
valid_policies <- policies[, colSums(is.na(policies)) != nrow(policies)]</pre>
# Convert the policies to a ranked matrix
ranked_matrix <- as.matrix(valid_policies)</pre>
# Define the number of winners to all - 1 policies
# stv complains if winners == all policies
num winners <- ncol(valid policies) - 1</pre>
# Run the Single Transferable Vote algorithm
results <- stv(ranked_matrix, num_winners, quiet = TRUE)</pre>
# add last policy to ranked result
last_policy <- setdiff(colnames(valid_policies), results$elected)</pre>
ranked_policies <- c(results$elected, last_policy)</pre>
policy_order <- colnames(valid_policies)</pre>
order <- match(policy_order, ranked_policies)</pre>
# calculate the number of missing values needed to reach length 10
missing_columns <- ncol(policies) - length(order)</pre>
# fill in the missing values with NA
order <- c(order, rep(NA, missing_columns))</pre>
# create a new data frame with aggregated results
policy_ranks <- data.frame(t(order))</pre>
colnames(policy_ranks) <- colnames(policies)</pre>
return(policy_ranks)
```

### Aggregate considerations and preferences

```
aggregate_llm_data <- function(data) {

# get last aggregation results, if it exists
if (output.file.exists(AGGREGATION_RESULTS_FILE)) {
    last_aggr_results <- read_output_csv(AGGREGATION_RESULTS_FILE)
}

# initialize an empty list to store the alpha results
aggr_results <- list()

# iterate over each unique provider/model/survey combination
for (row in 1:nrow(llm_surveys)) {
    provider <- llm_surveys[row, ]$provider</pre>
```

```
model <- llm_surveys[row, ]$model</pre>
  survey <- llm_surveys[row, ]$survey</pre>
 N <- llm_surveys[row, ]$N
  # filter the data for the current survey
  survey_data <- data %>%
    filter(model == !!model, survey == !!survey) %>%
    # get only first x iterations, where x = MAX_ITERATIONS
    arrange(created_at) %>%
    head(MAX_ITERATIONS)
  # SKIP THIS ITERATION IF PREVIOUS RECORD EXISTS
  # get date of the most data generation
 last_updated <- max(survey_data$created_at, na.rm = TRUE)</pre>
  # if there is a previous record
 if (exists("last_aggr_results")) {
    last_aggr <- last_aggr_results %>% filter(model == !!model, survey == !!survey)
    ## and last record is still valid, save it and skip
    ## valid records are more recent than the latest data generated
    if (nrow(last_aggr) == 1 &&
        (last_aggr$created_at > last_updated)) {
     aggr_results[[length(aggr_results) + 1]] <- last_aggr</pre>
     next
    } else {
      cat("updating:", model, "/", survey, "\n")
 }
  # aggregate considerations C1:C50
  considerations_data <- survey_data %>% select(C1:C50)
  aggregated_considerations <- aggregate_llm_considerations(considerations_data)</pre>
  # aggregate policies P1:P10
 policies_data <- survey_data %>% select(P1:P10)
  aggregated_policies <- aggregate_llm_policies(policies_data)
  # store the results in the list
  aggr_result <- tibble(</pre>
   provider = provider,
   model = model,
    survey = survey,
   N = N,
    created_at = now_utc(),
    aggregated_considerations,
    aggregated_policies,
 )
  aggr_results[[length(aggr_results) + 1]] <- aggr_result</pre>
}
```

```
# Combine all results into a single data frame
  aggr_results <- bind_rows(aggr_results)</pre>
  return(aggr results)
}
time start <- Sys.time()</pre>
llm_data_aggregated <- aggregate_llm_data(llm_data)</pre>
time_end <- Sys.time()</pre>
elapsed_time <- difftime(time_end, time_start, units = "auto")</pre>
print(
  paste(
    "Aggregation of",
    nrow(llm_data),
    "LLM responses across",
    length(unique(llm_data$survey)) ,
    "surveys completed in",
    round(as.numeric(elapsed_time), 2),
    units(elapsed time)
  )
)
## [1] "Aggregation of 29431 LLM responses across 20 surveys completed in 2.06 secs"
```

It takes 2.06 secs to run the aggregation script.

write\_output\_csv(llm\_data\_aggregated, AGGREGATION\_RESULTS\_FILE)

#### Read and format human data

# write summary to file

```
# Import the CSV file into a data frame
human_data <- read_csv(HUMAN_DATA_FILE, show_col_types = FALSE)

# Rename columns to be consistent with LLM data
human_data <- human_data %>%
    rename_with( ~ sub("^UO|^U", "C", .), starts_with("U", ignore.case = FALSE)) %>%
    rename_with( ~ sub("^Pref", "P", .), starts_with("Pref", ignore.case = FALSE)) %>%
    filter(Study != "Sydney CC Adaptation")

# Read the mapping file
study_survey_map <- read_csv("data/study_survey_map.csv", show_col_types = FALSE)

# Add a new column 'Survey' to human_data by matching 'Study' with 'survey'
human_data <- human_data %>%
    left_join(study_survey_map, by = c("Study" = "study")) %>%
    relocate(survey, .after = "Study")
```

#### Generate random participants

```
get_random_data <- function(sheet_names, file_path=SURVEY_FILE) {</pre>
  rand <- list()
  # Iterate over each sheet in the workbook
  for (sheet name in sheet names) {
    #cat("Processing sheet:", sheet_name, "\n")
    # Read the current sheet into a data frame
    df <- read_excel(file_path, sheet = sheet_name)</pre>
    # Check if required columns exist
    required_columns <- c("considerations", "policies", "scale_max", "q-method")</pre>
    missing_cols <- setdiff(required_columns, colnames(df))</pre>
    if (length(missing_cols) > 0) {
      cat(
        "Sheet",
        sheet_name,
        "is missing the following columns:",
        paste(missing_cols, collapse = ", "),
        "\n\n"
      )
     next
    }
    # Calculate the number of non-NA rows in "considerations" column
    n c <- sum(!is.na(df$considerations))</pre>
    # Calculate the number of non-NA rows in "policies" column
    n_p <- sum(!is.na(df$policies))</pre>
    # Extract integer values from "scale_max" column, assuming they are already integers
    scale_max <- as.integer(na.omit(df$scale_max))</pre>
    # Extract logical (boolean) values from "q-method" column
    q_method <- as.logical(na.omit(df$`q-method`))</pre>
    # Print the results for each sheet
    #cat("Sheet:", sheet_name, "\n")
    \#cat("Number of considerations:", n_c, "\n")
    \#cat("Number of policies:", n_p, "\n")
    \#cat("Integer\ value\ from\ 'scale\_max'\ column:",\ scale\_max,\ "\n")
    \#cat("Logical\ value\ from\ 'q-method'\ column:",\ q_method,\ "\n")
    ### Make random survey
    # Generate data for C1:C50 with Likert scale values [1, scale_max] randomly assigned
    if (q_method) {
      # get normally distributed data
      c_df <- data.frame(t(round(rnorm(n = n_c, mean = scale_max / 2, sd = scale_max / 4))))</pre>
      # replace values below lower and above upper bound
```

```
c_df[c_df < 1] <- 1
      c_df[c_df > scale_max] <- scale_max</pre>
    } else {
      c_df <- data.frame(t(replicate(n_c, sample(1:scale_max, 1, replace = TRUE))))</pre>
    # fill and rename columns
    c_{df}[1, (n_c + 1):50] <- NA
    colnames(c_df) <- paste0("C", 1:50)</pre>
    \# Generate data for P1:P10 with random unique ranks 1 to n_p for each row
    p_df <- data.frame(t(apply(matrix(0, nrow = 1, ncol = n_p), 1, function(x))</pre>
      sample(1:n_p))))
    p_df[1, (n_p + 1):10] \leftarrow NA
    colnames(p_df) <- paste0("P", 1:10)</pre>
    # Validate data
    c_valid <- !(any(c_df < 1, na.rm = TRUE) || any(c_df > scale_max, na.rm = TRUE))
    p_valid <- !(any(duplicated(p_df[!is.na(p_df)])) ||</pre>
      any(p_df < 1, na.rm = TRUE) ||</pre>
      any(p_df > n_p, na.rm = TRUE))
    \#cat("Valid\ considerations:",\ c\_valid,\ "\n")
    \#cat("Valid policies:", p valid, "\n")
    if (!c_valid || !p_valid) {
      warn(paste("Random generation produced invalid data for", sheet_name))
    # Combine the two datasets into one data frame
    dataset <- as.data.frame(cbind(c_df, p_df))</pre>
    dataset <- dataset %>%
      mutate(survey = sheet_name) %>%
      relocate(survey, .before = 1)
    rand[[length(rand) + 1]] <- dataset</pre>
    #cat(rep("-", 40), "\n")
  }
  rand <- bind rows(rand)
  return(rand)
}
# Example usage
rand_data <- get_random_data(survey_names)</pre>
```

## **DRI** Analysis

```
dri_calc <- function(data, v1, v2) {</pre>
 lambda \leftarrow 1 - (sqrt(2) / 2)
 dri <- 2 * (((1 - mean(abs((data[[v1]] - data[[v2]]) / sqrt(2)</pre>
 ))) - (lambda)) / (1 - (lambda))) - 1
 return(dri)
}
dri_calc_v2 <- function(data, v1, v2) {</pre>
  # Calculate orthogonal distance for each pair
 d <- abs((data[[v1]] - data[[v2]]) / sqrt(2))</pre>
  # Define lambda as in the original
  lambda <- 1 - (sqrt(2) / 2) # ??? 0.293
  \# Calculate penalty: 0.5 if both correlations are in [0, 0.2], 1 otherwise
  penalty <- ifelse(data[[v1]] >= 0 & data[[v1]] <= 0.2 & #0.3</pre>
                       data[[v2]] >= 0 & data[[v2]] <= 0.2, # 0.3
                     0, 1) #0.4
  # Adjusted consistency per pair
  consistency <- (1 - d) * penalty</pre>
  # Average consistency across all pairs
  avg_consistency <- mean(consistency)</pre>
  # Scale to [-1, 1] as in the original
  dri <- 2 * ((avg_consistency - lambda) / (1 - lambda)) - 1</pre>
 return(dri)
get_IC <- function(data, survey, case) {</pre>
  # loop through analysis stages (pre/post)
 for (stage in 1:max(data$StageID)) {
    # select specific data to analyse
    data_stage <- data %>% filter(StageID == stage)
    # make sure there's data to analyze
    if (nrow(data_stage) > 0) {
      # get participant numbers/ids
      PNums <- data_stage$PNum
      # variables for reading COLUMN data
      # Q is a list considerations (Likert scale)
      # - there are up to 50 questions
      # R is a list ratings (rankings)
      Q <- data_stage %>% select(C1:C50)
      R <- data_stage %>% select(P1:P10)
```

```
# remove all NA columns (in case there are less than 50
    # consideration questions
    Q <- Q[, colSums(is.na(Q)) != nrow(Q)]
    R <- R[, colSums(is.na(R)) != nrow(R)]</pre>
    # transpose data
    Q \leftarrow t(Q)
    R \leftarrow t(R)
    # format data as data frame
    Q <- as.data.frame(Q)
    R <- as.data.frame(R)
    # name columns with participant numbers
    colnames(Q) <- PNums</pre>
    colnames(R) <- PNums</pre>
    # obtain a list of correlations without duplicates
    # cor() returns a correlation matrix between Var1 and Var2
    # Var1 and Var2 are the variables being correlated
    # Freq is the correlation
    QWrite <- subset(as.data.frame(as.table(cor(Q, method = "spearman"))),
                      match(Var1, names(Q)) > match(Var2, names(Q)))
    RWrite <- subset(as.data.frame(as.table(cor(R, method = "spearman"))),</pre>
                      match(Var1, names(R)) > match(Var2, names(R)))
    # initialize the output in the first iteration
    if (stage == 1) {
      IC <- data.frame("P_P" = paste0(QWrite$Var1, '-', QWrite$Var2))</pre>
      IC$P1 <- as.numeric(as.character(QWrite$Var1))</pre>
      IC$P2 <- as.numeric(as.character(QWrite$Var2))</pre>
    # prepare QWrite
    QWrite <- as.data.frame(QWrite$Freq)</pre>
    names(QWrite) <- paste0("Q", stage)</pre>
    # prepare RWrite for merge
    RWrite <- as.data.frame(RWrite$Freq)</pre>
    names(RWrite) <- paste0('R', stage)</pre>
    # merge
    IC <- cbind(IC, QWrite, RWrite)</pre>
  }
}
# append case & study info
IC$survey <- survey</pre>
IC$case <- case
## IC Points calculations ##
```

```
IC$IC_PRE <- 1 - abs((IC$R1 - IC$Q1) / sqrt(2))</pre>
  IC\$IC\_POST \leftarrow 1 - abs((IC\$R2 - IC\$Q2) / sqrt(2))
 return(IC)
}
get_ind_DRI <- function(IC) {</pre>
  Plist <- unique(c(IC$P1, IC$P2))</pre>
  Plist <- Plist[order(Plist)]</pre>
  DRIInd <- data.frame('participant' = Plist)</pre>
  DRIInd$survey <- survey
  DRIInd$case <- data_case_study$Case[1]</pre>
  DRIInd <- DRIInd[c("survey", "case", "participant")]</pre>
  #Add individual-level metrics
  for (i in 1:length(Plist)) {
    DRIInd$DRIPre[i] <- dri_calc(</pre>
      data = IC %>% filter(P1 == Plist[i] | P2 == Plist[i]),
      v1 = 'R1'
      v2 = 'Q1'
    DRIInd$DRIPost[i] <- dri_calc(</pre>
      data = IC %>% filter(P1 == Plist[i] | P2 == Plist[i]),
      v1 = 'R2',
      v2 = 'Q2'
    )
    # calculate updated DRI
    DRIInd$DRIPreV2[i] <- dri_calc_v2(</pre>
      data = IC %>% filter(P1 == Plist[i] | P2 == Plist[i]),
      v1 = 'R1'
      v2 = 'Q1'
    )
    DRIInd$DRIPostV2[i] <- dri_calc_v2(</pre>
      data = IC %>% filter(P1 == Plist[i] | P2 == Plist[i]),
      v1 = 'R2',
      v2 = 'Q2'
    )
  }
  return(DRIInd)
get_case_DRI <- function(IC, type="human_only") {</pre>
  ## Group DRI level ##
  DRI_PRE <- dri_calc(data = IC, v1 = 'R1', v2 = 'Q1')</pre>
```

```
DRI_POST <- dri_calc(data = IC, v1 = 'R2', v2 = 'Q2')</pre>
  ## Group DRI level V2 ##
  DRI_PRE_V2 <- dri_calc_v2(data = IC, v1 = 'R1', v2 = 'Q1')</pre>
  DRI_POST_V2 <- dri_calc_v2(data = IC, v1 = 'R2', v2 = 'Q2')</pre>
  #CaseDRI Dataframe
  DRI.Case <- data.frame(</pre>
    survey = survey,
    case = case,
   type = type,
    DRI_PRE,
    DRI_PRE_V2,
    DRI_POST,
    DRI_POST_V2
  #Tests for groups
  DRIOverallSig <- wilcox.test(IC$IC_POST,</pre>
                                 IC$IC_PRE,
                                 paired = TRUE,
                                 alternative = "greater")
  DRIOverallSig_twoside <- wilcox.test(IC$IC_POST,</pre>
                                         IC$IC_PRE,
                                         paired = TRUE,
                                         alternative = "two.side")
  #Adding the results to case data
  DRI.Case$DRI_one_tailed_p <- DRIOverallSig$p.value</pre>
  DRI.Case$DRI_twoside_p <- DRIOverallSig_twoside$p.value</pre>
  return(DRI.Case)
}
mini_publics <- human_data %>%
  group_by(survey, Case) %>%
  summarise(.groups = "drop")
# get_llm_data <- function(provider, model, survey) {</pre>
# llm_participant <- llm_data_aggregated %>%
      filter(provider == !!provider, model == !!model, survey == !!survey)
   return(llm_participant)
# }
get_ind_LLM_DRI <- function(data, provider, model) {</pre>
 llm_DRI <- data %>%
    filter(participant == 0) %>%
    select(-participant) %>%
    mutate(provider = !!provider, model = !!model) %>%
    relocate(provider, model, .before = 1)
```

```
return(llm_DRI)
}
add_llm_participant <- function(data, provider, model, survey) {</pre>
  # print(paste("adding", paste(provider, model, survey, sep = "/"), "to human data."))
  # get llm data
  llm_participant <- llm_data_aggregated %>%
    filter(provider == !!provider, model == !!model, survey == !!survey)
  # check if it exists
  if (nrow(llm_participant) == 0) {
    warn(paste("No human participant found for", paste(provider, model, survey, sep = "/")))
  # create 2 participants, PRE and POST
  llm_participants <- bind_rows(llm_participant, llm_participant)</pre>
  llm_participants$PNum <- 0 # PNum = 0 is LLM</pre>
    llm_participants$StageID <- c(1,2)</pre>
  data_with_llm <- bind_rows(data, llm_participants)</pre>
 return(data_with_llm)
}
DRIInd.LLMs <- list()</pre>
# for each study [1:N], N = 26
for (case_study in 1:nrow(mini_publics)) {
  # select study data
  survey <- mini_publics[case_study, ]$survey</pre>
  case <- mini_publics[case_study, ]$Case</pre>
  # get human data for this case study
  data_case_study <- human_data %>% filter(survey == !!survey &
                                                Case == !!case)
  # intersubject correlations (IC)
  IC <- get_IC(data_case_study, survey, case)</pre>
  ## GROUP DRI ##
  DRI.Case <- get_case_DRI(IC)</pre>
  ## INDIVIDUAL DRI ##
  DRIInd <- get_ind_DRI(IC)</pre>
  # get human average
  # NOTE: this should be the same as human_only group DRI
  human_ind_DRI_mean <- tibble(</pre>
```

```
DRIPre = mean(DRIInd$DRIPre),
  DRIPost = mean(DRIInd$DRIPost)
human_ind_DRI_meanV2 <- tibble(</pre>
 DRIPreV2 = mean(DRIInd$DRIPreV2),
  DRIPostV2 = mean(DRIInd$DRIPostV2)
# Global dataframes for depositing results
# initialize *.Global
if (case_study == 1) {
  IC.Global <- IC</pre>
  DRIInd.Global <- DRIInd
  DRI.Global <- DRI.Case
}
# append to *.Global
else {
  IC.Global <- rbind(IC.Global, IC)</pre>
  DRIInd.Global <- rbind(DRIInd.Global, DRIInd)</pre>
  DRI.Global <- rbind(DRI.Global, DRI.Case)</pre>
}
# check if there are LLM data for this survey
llms <- llm_surveys %>% filter(survey == !!survey)
if (nrow(llms) == 0) {
  next
# iterate through each llm
for (llm in 1:nrow(llms)) {
  provider <- llms[llm,]$provider</pre>
  model <- llms[llm,]$model</pre>
  type <- paste0("human+",paste(provider, model, sep = "/"))</pre>
  data_with_llm <- add_llm_participant(data_case_study, provider, model, survey)</pre>
  IC.LLM <- get_IC(data_with_llm, survey, case)</pre>
  DRI.Case.LLM <- get_case_DRI(IC.LLM, type)</pre>
  DRIInd.LLM <- get_ind_DRI(IC.LLM)</pre>
  DRIInd.LLM.Model <- get_ind_LLM_DRI(DRIInd.LLM, provider, model)</pre>
  DRIInd.LLM.Model$human_only_DRIPre_mean <- human_ind_DRI_mean$DRIPre
  DRIInd.LLM.Model$human_only_DRIPost_mean <- human_ind_DRI_mean$DRIPost</pre>
  ## DRI V2
  DRIInd.LLM.Model$human_only_DRIPre_meanV2 <- human_ind_DRI_meanV2$DRIPreV2
  DRIInd.LLM.Model$human_only_DRIPost_meanV2 <- human_ind_DRI_meanV2$DRIPostV2
  get_bm_index <- function(diff) {</pre>
    bm_index <- (diff + 2) / 4</pre>
```

```
return(bm_index)
   }
    DRIInd.LLM.Model <- DRIInd.LLM.Model %>%
      mutate(DRIPre_diff = DRIPre - human_only_DRIPre_mean,
             DRIPost_diff = DRIPost - human_only_DRIPost_mean) %>%
      # benchmark index = use DRIPost & normalize it to be >= 0
      mutate(bm_index = get_bm_index(DRIPost_diff)) %>%
          mutate(DRIPre_diffV2 = DRIPreV2 - human_only_DRIPre_meanV2,
             DRIPost_diffV2 = DRIPostV2 - human_only_DRIPost_meanV2) %>%
      # benchmark index = use DRIPost & normalize it to be >= 0
      mutate(bm_indexV2 = get_bm_index(DRIPost_diffV2))
   DRIInd.LLMs[[length(DRIInd.LLMs) + 1]] <- DRIInd.LLM.Model</pre>
   DRI.Global <- rbind(DRI.Global, DRI.Case.LLM)</pre>
 }
} # end for each case study
## Warning in cor(Q, method = "spearman"): the standard deviation is zero
## Warning in cor(Q, method = "spearman"): the standard deviation is zero
## Warning in cor(Q, method = "spearman"): the standard deviation is zero
## Warning in cor(Q, method = "spearman"): the standard deviation is zero
DRIInd.LLMs <- bind rows(DRIInd.LLMs)</pre>
missing <-setdiff(unique(llm_data$survey), unique(DRIInd.LLMs$survey))
if (length(missing) > 0) {
  warn(paste("Missing", missing, "from DRIInd.LLMs!"))
## Warning: Missing swiss_health from DRIInd.LLMs!
# add delta column
DRI.Global <- DRI.Global %>%
  mutate(DRI_DELTA = DRI_POST - DRI_PRE)
# write summary to file
write_csv(DRIInd.LLMs, paste(OUTPUT_DIR, "DRIInd_LLMs.csv", sep = "/"))
write_csv(DRI.Global, paste(OUTPUT_DIR, "DRI_global.csv", sep = "/"))
```

#### **DRI** Benchmark

```
DRI_benchmark <- DRIInd.LLMs %>%
  group_by(provider, model) %>%
  summarise(
   N = n(),
```

```
.groups = "drop",
    agg_bm_index = mean(bm_indexV2, na.rm = TRUE)
  filter(N == max(N)) %>% # only include models with all surveys
  arrange(desc(agg_bm_index))
DRI_benchmark %>%
  mutate(label = paste(provider, model, sep = "/")) %>%
  ggplot(aes(
   x = reorder(label, agg_bm_index),
    y = agg_bm_index,
   fill = provider
  )) +
  geom_bar(stat = "identity") +
  coord_flip() +
  geom_text(aes(label = round(agg_bm_index, 3)), hjust = -0.3, size = 3) +
  theme minimal() +
  theme(
   axis.text.x = element_text(angle = 45, hjust = 1),
   plot.background = element_rect(fill = "white"),
   legend.position = "none"
  ) +
  scale_y_continuous(limits = c(0, 1)) +
  labs(x = "", y = "DRI benchmark") -> plot
ggsave(
  paste(OUTPUT_DIR, "benchmarkV1.png", sep = "/"),
  plot,
 width = 10,
  height = 6
)
DRIInd.LLMs %>%
  filter(model %in% DRI_benchmark$model) %>% # only include models with all surveys
  mutate(label = paste(provider, model, sep = "/")) %>%
  ggplot(aes(
   x = reorder(label, bm_indexV2, FUN = median, na.rm = TRUE),
    y = bm_indexV2,
    color = provider
  )) +
  geom_boxplot() +
  coord_flip() +
  theme_minimal() +
  theme(plot.background = element_rect(fill = "white"),
        legend.position = "none") + scale_y_continuous(limits = c(-0.1, 1)) +
  labs(x = "", y = "DRI benchmark") -> plot
ggsave(
  paste(OUTPUT_DIR, "benchmarkV2.png", sep = "/"),
  plot,
  width = 10,
  height = 6
```

```
## Warning: Removed 17 rows containing non-finite outside the scale range
## (`stat_boxplot()`).
## Trying a 2-dimension benchmark
DRI_benchmark <- full_join(alpha_results, DRIInd.LLMs, by = c("provider", "model", "survey")) %>%
     filter(model %in% DRI_benchmark$model) # only include models with all surveys
DRI_benchmark %>%
     # filter(provider == "google") %>%
     #mutate(label = paste(provider, model, sep = "/")) %>%
     group by(provider, model, .groups = "drop") %>%
     summarise(
         mean_alpha = mean(alpha_all, na.rm = TRUE),
         mean_bm_index = mean(bm_indexV2, na.rm = TRUE),
         se_alpha = sd(alpha_all, na.rm = TRUE),
         se_bm_index = sd(bm_indexV2, na.rm = TRUE)
     ) %>%
     ggplot(aes(x = mean_alpha, y = mean_bm_index, color = provider)) +
     geom_point(size = 5) + # Adjust size as needed
     #geom_errorbar(aes(ymin = mean_bm_index - se_bm_index, ymax = mean_bm_index + se_bm_index), width = 0
     \#geom\_errorbarh(aes(xmin = mean\_alpha - se\_alpha, xmax = mean\_alpha + se\_alpha), height = 0.02) + \#Easterness + 
     geom_text(aes(label = model), vjust = -2, size = 2) + # Add labels above each dot
     \#scale\ x\ continuous(limits = c(0, 1)) +
     \#scale_y\_continuous(limits = c(0, 1)) +
     labs(x = "Cronbach's alpha (mean)", y = "DRI Benchmark Index (mean)", color = "Provider") +
     theme_minimal() +
     theme(plot.background = element rect(fill = "white"),
                   legend.position = "none") -> plot # Remove text from color legend
## `summarise()` has grouped output by 'provider', 'model'. You can override using
## the `.groups` argument.
# Set the theme to minimal
ggsave(
     paste(OUTPUT_DIR, "benchmarkV3.png", sep = "/"),
    plot,
    width = 10,
    height = 6
)
```