# CIS 700: "algorithms for Big Data"

#### **Lecture 5: Dimension Reduction**

Slides at http://grigory.us/big-data-class.html

#### **Grigory Yaroslavtsev**

http://grigory.us



#### Today

- Dimensionality reduction
  - AMS as dimensionality reduction
  - Johnson-Lindenstrauss transform

# $L_p$ -norm Estimation

- Stream: m updates  $(x_i, \Delta_i) \in [n] \times \mathbb{R}$  that define vector f where  $f_j = \sum_{i:x_i=j} \Delta_i$ .
- Example: For n=4

$$\langle (1,3), (3,0.5), (1,2), (2,-2), (2,1), (1,-1), (4,1) \rangle$$
  
 $f = (4,-1,0.5,1)$ 

•  $L_p$ -norm:  $||f||_p = (\sum_i |f|^p)^{\frac{1}{p}}$ 

# $L_p$ -norm Estimation

• 
$$L_p$$
-norm:  $||f||_p = (\sum_i |f|^p)^{\frac{1}{p}}$ 

- Two lectures ago:
  - $-\left||f|\right|_0 = F_0$ -moment
  - $-\left||f|\right|_{2}^{2}=F_{2}$ -moment (via AMS sketching)
- Space:  $O\left(\frac{\log n}{\epsilon^2}\log \frac{1}{\delta}\right)$
- Technique: linear sketches
  - $-||f||_0$ :  $\sum_{i\in S} f_i$  for random sets S
  - $-||f||_2^2: \sum_i \sigma_i f_i$  for random signs  $\sigma_i$

#### AMS as dimensionality reduction

Maintain a "linear sketch" vector

$$\mathbf{Z} = (Z_1, ..., Z_k) = Rf$$

$$Z_i = \sum_{j \in [n]} \sigma_{ij} f_j, \text{ where } \sigma_{ij} \in_R \{-1,1\}$$

• Estimator Y for  $||f||_2^2$ :

$$\frac{1}{k} \sum_{i=1}^{k} Z_i^2 = \frac{||Rf||_2^2}{k}$$

• "Dimensionality reduction":  $x \to Rx$ , "heavy" tail

$$\Pr\left[\left|Y - \left||f|\right|_{2}^{2}\right| \ge c \left(\frac{2}{k}\right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \left|\left|f\right|\right|_{2}^{2}\right] \le \frac{1}{c^{2}}$$

#### **Normal Distribution**

- Normal distribution N(0,1)
  - Range:  $(-\infty, +\infty)$
  - Density:  $\mu(x) = (2\pi)^{-\frac{1}{2}} e^{-\frac{x^2}{2}}$
  - Mean = 0, Variance = 1
- Basic facts:
  - If X and Y are independent r.v. with normal distribution then X + Y has normal distribution
  - $-Var[cX] = c^2 Var[X]$
  - If X, Y are independent, then Var[X + Y] = Var[X] + Var[Y]

#### Johnson-Lindenstrauss Transform

• Instead of  $\pm 1$  let  $\sigma_i$  be i.i.d. random variables from normal distribution N(0,1)

$$Z = \sum_{i} \sigma_{i} f_{i}$$

- We still have  $\mathbb{E}[Z^2] = \sum_i f_i^2 = \left| |f| \right|_2^2$  because:
  - $-\mathbb{E}[\sigma_i]\mathbb{E}[\sigma_j] = 0$ ;  $\mathbb{E}[\sigma_i^2] =$  "variance of  $\sigma_i$ " = 1
- Define  $\mathbf{Z} = (Z_1, ..., Z_k)$  and define:

$$\left|\left|\mathbf{Z}\right|\right|_{2}^{2} = \sum_{i} Z_{j}^{2} \quad \left(\mathbb{E}\left[\left|\left|\mathbf{Z}\right|\right|_{2}^{2}\right] = k\left|\left|f\right|\right|_{2}^{2}\right)$$

• JL Lemma: There exists C > 0 s.t. for small enough  $\epsilon > 0$ :

$$\Pr\left[\left|\left||\boldsymbol{Z}|\right|_{2}^{2} - k\left||f|\right|_{2}^{2}\right| > \epsilon k \left|\left|f\right|\right|_{2}^{2}\right] \le \exp(-C\epsilon^{2}k)$$

#### Proof of JL Lemma

• JL Lemma:  $\exists C > 0$  s.t. for small enough  $\epsilon > 0$ :

$$\Pr\left[\left|\left||\boldsymbol{Z}|\right|_{2}^{2} - k\left|\left|f\right|\right|_{2}^{2}\right| > \epsilon k \left|\left|f\right|\right|_{2}^{2}\right] \le \exp(-C\epsilon^{2}k)$$

- Assume  $||f||_2^2 = 1$ .
- We have  $\mathbf{Z}_i = \sum_j \sigma_{ij} f_i$  and  $\mathbf{Z} = (\mathbf{Z_1}, ..., \mathbf{Z_k})$   $\mathbb{E}\left[\left||\mathbf{Z}|\right|_2^2\right] = k \left||f|\right|_2^2 = k$
- Alternative form of JL Lemma:

$$\Pr\left[\left||\boldsymbol{Z}|\right|_{2}^{2} > k(1+\epsilon)^{2}\right] \leq \exp(-\epsilon^{2}k + O(k\epsilon^{3}))$$

#### Proof of JL Lemma

Alternative form of JL Lemma:

$$\Pr\left[\left||\boldsymbol{Z}|\right|_{2}^{2} > k(1+\epsilon)^{2}\right] \leq \exp(-\epsilon^{2}k + O(k\epsilon^{3}))$$

- Let  $Y = ||Z||_2^2$  and  $\alpha = k(1 + \epsilon)^2$
- For every s > 0 we have:

$$Pr[Y > \alpha] = Pr[e^{sY} > e^{s\alpha}]$$

• By Markov and independence of  $Z_i's$ :

$$\Pr[e^{sY} > e^{s\alpha}] \le \frac{\mathbb{E}[e^{sY}]}{e^{s\alpha}} = e^{-s\alpha} \mathbb{E}\left[e^{s\sum_{i} Z_{i}^{2}}\right] = e^{-s\alpha} \prod_{i=1}^{K} \mathbb{E}\left[e^{sZ_{i}^{2}}\right]$$

• We have  $Z_i \in N(0,1)$ , hence:

$$\mathbb{E}\left[e^{s\mathbf{Z}_{i}^{2}}\right] = (2\pi)^{-\frac{1}{2}} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} e^{st^{2}} e^{-\frac{t^{2}}{2}} dt = \frac{1}{\sqrt{1-2s}}$$

#### Proof of JL Lemma

Alternative form of JL Lemma:

$$\Pr\left[\left||\boldsymbol{Z}|\right|_{2}^{2} > k(1+\epsilon)^{2}\right] \leq \exp(-\epsilon^{2}k + O(k\epsilon^{3}))$$

• For every s > 0 we have:

$$\Pr[Y > \alpha] \le e^{-s\alpha} \prod_{i=1}^{k} \mathbb{E}\left[e^{sZ_i^2}\right] = e^{-s\alpha} (1 - 2s)^{-\frac{k}{2}}$$

- Let  $s = \frac{1}{2} \left( 1 \frac{k}{\alpha} \right)$  and recall that  $\alpha = k(1 + \epsilon)^2$
- A calculation finishes the proof:

$$\Pr[Y > \alpha] \le \exp(-\epsilon^2 k + O(k \epsilon^3))$$

#### Johnson-Lindenstrauss Transform

- Single vector:  $k = O\left(\frac{\log_{\delta}^{1}}{\epsilon^{2}}\right)$ 
  - Tight:  $k = \Omega\left(\frac{\log_{\delta}^{1}}{\epsilon^{2}}\right)$  [Woodruff'10]
- n vectors simultaneously:  $k = O\left(\frac{\log n \log \frac{1}{\delta}}{\epsilon^2}\right)$ 
  - Tight:  $k = \Omega\left(\frac{\log n \log \frac{1}{\delta}}{\epsilon^2}\right)$  [Molinaro, Woodruff, Y. '13]
- Distances between n vectors =  $O(n^2)$  vectors:

$$k = O\left(\frac{\log n \log \frac{1}{\delta}}{\epsilon^2}\right)$$

#### Random Variables and Norms

• For a random variable X and  $p \ge 1$  let:

$$||X||_p = \mathbb{E}[X^p]^{1/p}$$

#### Facts:

- For any c:  $||c\mathbf{X}||_p = c||\mathbf{X}||_p$
- $||\cdot||_p$  is a norm (Minkowski's inequality)
- $||\cdot||_p \le ||\cdot||_q$  for  $p \le q$  (Monotonicity of norms)
- Jensen's inequality (used a lot for  $F = |x|^p$ ): If F is convex then  $F(\mathbb{E}[X]) \leq \mathbb{E}[F(X)]$

# Khintchine Inequality

• [Khintchine]For  $p \ge 1$ ,  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and  $\sigma_i$  i.i.d. Rademachers:

$$\left|\left|\sum_{i} \sigma_{i} x_{i}\right|\right|_{p} \leq \sqrt{p} \left|\left|x\right|\right|_{2}$$

- For  $r_i$  (either  $\sigma_i$  or  $g_i \sim N(0,1)$ ) expand  $\mathbb{E}[(\sum_i r_i x_i)^p]$
- All odd powers of  $r_i$  are zero
- All even moments for  $\sigma_i$  are 1, and for  $g_i$  are  $\geq 1$
- $\left|\left|\sum_{i} \sigma_{i} x_{i}\right|\right|_{p} \leq \left|\left|\sum_{i} g_{i} x_{i}\right|\right|_{p}$
- $\sum_{i} g_{i} x_{i} \sim N\left(0, \left|\left|x\right|\right|_{2}^{2}\right) \Rightarrow \left|\left|\sum_{i} g_{i} x_{i}\right|\right|_{p} \leq \sqrt{p}\left|\left|x\right|\right|_{2}$

#### Symmetrization

• [Symmetrization]: If  $Z_1, \dots, Z_n$  are independent and  $\sigma_i$  are i.i.d. Rademachers:

$$\left\| \sum_{i} Z_{i} - \mathbb{E} \sum_{i} Z_{i} \right\|_{p} \leq 2 \left\| \sum_{i} \sigma_{i} Z_{i} \right\|_{p}$$

- Let  $Y_1 \dots Y_n$  be independent with the same distribution as  $Z_i$
- $\left|\left|\sum_{i} Z_{i} \mathbb{E} \sum_{i} Z_{i}\right|\right|_{p} = \left|\left|\sum_{i} Z_{i} \mathbb{E}_{Y} \sum_{i} Y_{i}\right|\right|_{p}$
- $\leq \left|\left|\sum_{i}(Z_{i}-Y_{i})\right|\right|_{p}$  (Jensen)
- $= ||\sum_{i} \sigma_{i}(Z_{i} Y_{i})||_{p} (Z_{i} Y_{i})$  are independent and symmetric)
- $\leq 2 \left| \left| \sum_{i} \sigma_{i} Z_{i} \right| \right|_{p}$  (triangle inequality)

#### Decoupling

• Let  $x_1, ... x_n$  be independent with mean 0 and  $x_1', ... x_n'$  identically distributed as  $x_i$  and independent of them. For any  $a_{ij}$  and  $p \ge 1$ :

$$\left\| \left| \sum_{i \neq j} a_{ij} x_i x_j \right| \right\|_p \le 4 \left\| \left| \sum_{i,j} a_{ij} x_i x_j' \right| \right\|_p$$

• Let  $\eta_1, \dots, \eta_n$  be i.i.d. Bernoullis (0/1 w.p. 1/2):

$$\begin{aligned} \left| \left| \sum_{i \neq j} a_{ij} x_i x_j \right| \right|_p &= 4 \left| \left| \mathbb{E}_{\eta} \sum_{i \neq j} a_{ij} x_i x_j \eta_i (1 - \eta_j) \right| \right|_p \\ &\leq 4 \left| \left| \sum_{i \neq j} a_{ij} x_i x_j \eta_i (1 - \eta_j) \right| \right|_p \text{(Jensen)} \end{aligned}$$

• There exists  $\eta' \in \{0,1\}^n$  such that:

$$\left|\left|\sum_{i\neq j} a_{ij} x_i x_j \eta_i (1-\eta_j)\right|\right|_p \le \left|\left|\sum_{i\in S} \sum_{j\in \bar{S}} a_{ij} x_i x_j\right|\right|_p$$
 where  $S = \{i: \eta' = 1\}.$ 

# Decoupling (continued)

Let  $x_S$  be an S-dimensional vector of  $x_i$  for  $i \in S$ .

• 
$$\left|\left|\sum_{i\in S}\sum_{j\in \bar{S}}a_{ij}x_{i}x_{j}\right|\right|_{p} = \left|\left|\sum_{i\in S}\sum_{j\in \bar{S}}a_{ij}x_{i}x'_{j}\right|\right|_{p}$$
  
=  $\left|\left|\mathbb{E}_{x_{\bar{S}}}\mathbb{E}_{x'_{S}}\sum_{i,j}a_{ij}x_{i}x'_{j}\right|\right|_{p}$  ( $\mathbb{E}[x_{i}] = \mathbb{E}[x'_{i}] = 0$ )  
 $\leq \left|\left|\sum_{i,j}a_{ij}x_{i}x'_{j}\right|\right|_{p}$  (Jensen)

• Overall:

$$\left\| \left| \sum_{i \neq j} a_{ij} x_i x_j \right| \right\|_p \le 4 \left\| \left| \sum_{i,j} a_{ij} x_i x_j' \right| \right\|_p$$

#### Hanson-Wright Inequality

- For  $\sigma_1, \ldots, \sigma_n$  independent Rademachers and  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$  real and symmetric for all  $p \geq 1$ :  $\left| \left| \sigma^T A \sigma \mathbb{E}[\sigma^T A \sigma] \right| \right|_p \leq \sqrt{p} \left| \left| A \right| \right|_F + p \left| \left| A \right| \right|$
- Recall:

$$-||A||_{F} = \sqrt{\sum_{ij} a_{ij}^{2}} = \sqrt{Tr(A^{T}A)}$$

$$-||A|| = \sup_{\{v \neq 0\}} \frac{||Av||_{2}}{||v||_{2}}$$

#### Hanson-Wright Inequality

• For  $\sigma_1, ..., \sigma_n$  independent Rademachers and  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$  real and symmetric for all  $p \geq 1$ :

Teal and symmetric for all 
$$p \ge 1$$
.
$$\left| \left| \sigma^T A \sigma - \mathbb{E} [\sigma^T A \sigma] \right| \right|_p \le \sqrt{p} \left| \left| A \right|_F + p \left| \left| A \right| \right|$$

$$\left| \left| \sigma^T A \sigma - \mathbb{E} [\sigma^T A \sigma] \right| \right|_p \le \left| \left| \sigma^T A \sigma' \right| \right|_p \text{ (decoupling)}$$

$$\le \sqrt{p} \left| \left| \left| \left| A \sigma \right| \right|_2 \right| \right|_p^{\frac{1}{2}}$$

$$\le \sqrt{p} \left| \left| \left| \left| A \sigma \right| \right|_2^2 \right| \right|_p^{\frac{1}{2}} \text{ (monotonicity of norms)}$$

# Hanson-Wright (continued)

$$\begin{split} &\sqrt{p} \ \left| \left| \left| \left| A\sigma \right| \right|_{2} \right| \right|_{p} \leq \dots \leq \sqrt{p} \ \left| \left| \left| \left| A\sigma \right| \right|_{2}^{2} \right| \right|_{p}^{\frac{1}{2}} \\ &\leq \sqrt{p} \left( \mathbb{E} \left[ \left| \left| A\sigma \right| \right|_{2}^{2} \right] + \left| \left| \left| \left| A\sigma \right| \right|_{2}^{2} - \mathbb{E} \left[ \left| \left| A\sigma \right| \right|_{2}^{2} \right] \right| \right|_{p} \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \text{ (triangle ineq.)} \\ &= \sqrt{p} \left( \left| \left| A \right| \right|_{F}^{2} + \left| \left| \left| \left| A\sigma \right| \right|_{2}^{2} - \mathbb{E} \left[ \left| \left| A\sigma \right| \right|_{2}^{2} \right] \right| \right|_{p} \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \\ &\leq \sqrt{p} \left| \left| A \right| \right|_{F} + \sqrt{p} \left| \left| \left| \left| A\sigma \right| \right|_{2}^{2} - \mathbb{E} \left[ \left| \left| A\sigma \right| \right|_{2}^{2} \right] \right| \right|_{p}^{\frac{1}{2}} \\ &\leq \sqrt{p} \left| \left| A \right| \right|_{F} + \sqrt{p} \left| \left| \left| \sigma^{T}A^{T}A\sigma' \right| \right| \right|_{p}^{\frac{1}{2}} \text{ (decoupling)} \\ &\leq \sqrt{p} \left| \left| A \right| \right|_{F} + p^{\frac{3}{4}} \left| \left| \left| \left| A^{T}A\sigma \right| \right|_{2} \right| \right|_{p}^{\frac{1}{2}} \text{ (Khintchine)} \\ &\leq \sqrt{p} \left| \left| A \right| \right|_{F} + p^{\frac{3}{4}} \left| \left| \left| A \right| \right|_{2}^{\frac{1}{2}} \left| \left| \left| \left| Ax \right| \right|_{2} \right| \right|_{p}^{\frac{1}{2}} \end{split}$$

# Hanson-Wright (continued)

$$\sqrt{p} \left| \left| \left| |A\sigma| \right|_{2} \right| \right|_{p} \leq \sqrt{p} \left| |A| \right|_{F} + p^{\frac{3}{4}} \left| |A| \right|^{\frac{1}{2}} \left| \left| \left| |A\sigma| \right|_{2} \right| \right|_{p}^{\frac{1}{2}}$$

Let 
$$E = \left| \left| \left| \left| Ax \right| \right|_2 \right|_p^{\frac{1}{2}}$$
 then  $E^2 - Cp^{\frac{1}{4}} \left| \left| A \right| \right|_E^{\frac{1}{2}} E - C \left| \left| A \right| \right|_F \le 0$ 

- $E \le larger root of the quadratic equation above$
- $E^2 \le \sqrt{p} \left| |A| \right|_F + p ||A||$
- (Hanson-Wright) For  $\sigma_1, \ldots, \sigma_n$  independent Rademachers and  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$  real and symmetric for all  $p \geq 1$ :

$$\left| \left| \sigma^T A \sigma - \mathbb{E}[\sigma^T A \sigma] \right| \right|_{p} \leq \sqrt{p} \left| \left| A \right| \right|_{F} + p \left| \left| A \right| \right|$$

#### Recap

• For a random variable X and  $p \ge 1$  let:

$$||X||_p = \mathbb{E}[X^p]^{1/p}$$

• [Khintchine] For  $p \ge 1$ ,  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and  $\sigma_i$  i.i.d. Rademachers:

$$\left|\left|\sum_{i} \sigma_{i} x_{i}\right|\right|_{p} \leq \sqrt{p} \left|\left|x\right|\right|_{2}$$

• [Symmetrization]: If  $Z_1, \dots, Z_n$  are independent and  $\sigma_i$  are i.i.d. Rademachers:

$$\left\| \sum_{i} Z_{i} - \mathbb{E} \sum_{i} Z_{i} \right\|_{p} \leq 2 \left\| \sum_{i} \sigma_{i} Z_{i} \right\|_{p}$$

• [Hanson-Wright]For  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_n$  independent Rademachers and  $A \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times n}$  real and symmetric for all  $p \geq 1$ :

$$\left| \left| \sigma^T A \sigma - \mathbb{E}[\sigma^T A \sigma] \right| \right|_{p} \leq \sqrt{p} \left| \left| A \right| \right|_{F} + p \left| \left| A \right| \right|$$

#### Bernstein Inequality

• Let  $X_1, ..., X_n$  be indep. r.v's such that  $|X_i| \le K$  almost surely and  $\mathbb{E}[X_i^2] \le \sigma^2$ . For all  $p \ge 1$ :

$$\left\| \sum_{i} X_{i} - \mathbb{E}[X_{i}] \right\|_{p} \leq \sigma \sqrt{p} + Kp$$

$$\left|\left|\sum_{i} X_{i} - \mathbb{E}[X_{i}]\right|\right|_{p} \leq 2\left|\left|\sum_{i} \sigma_{i} X_{i}\right|\right|_{p}$$
 (symmetrization)

$$\leq \sqrt{p} ||(\sum_i X_i^2)^{\frac{1}{2}}||_p$$
 (Khintchine)

$$=\sqrt{p} || \sum_{i} X_{i}^{2} ||_{\frac{p}{2}}^{\frac{1}{2}}$$

$$\leq \sigma \sqrt{p} + \sqrt{p} \left| \left| \sum_{i} X_{i}^{2} - \mathbb{E}[X_{i}^{2}] \right| \right|_{p}^{1/2}$$
 (triangle inequality)

# Bernstein Inequality (cont.)

$$\begin{aligned} \left| \left| \sum_{i} X_{i} - \mathbb{E}[X_{i}] \right| \right|_{p} &\leq \dots \leq \sqrt{p} |\left| \left( \sum_{i} X_{i}^{2} \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} \right| |_{p} \\ &\leq \sigma \sqrt{p} + \sqrt{p} \left| \left| \sum_{i} X_{i}^{2} - \mathbb{E}[X_{i}^{2}] \right| \right|_{p}^{\frac{1}{2}} \\ &\leq \sigma \sqrt{p} + \sqrt{p} \left| \left| \sum_{i} \sigma_{i} X_{i}^{2} \right| \right|_{p}^{\frac{1}{2}} \text{ (symmetrization)} \\ &\leq \sigma \sqrt{p} + p^{\frac{3}{4}} \left| \left| \sum_{i} \left( X_{i}^{4} \right)^{1/2} \right| \right|_{p}^{\frac{1}{2}} \text{ (Khintchine)} \\ &\leq \sigma \sqrt{p} + p^{\frac{3}{4}} \sqrt{K} \left| \left| \sum_{i} \left( X_{i}^{2} \right)^{1/2} \right| \right|^{\frac{1}{2}} \end{aligned}$$

#### Bernstein Inequality (cont.)

• Let  $E=||(\sum_i X_i^2)^{\frac{1}{2}}||_p$  then for some C>0:  $E^2-Cp^{\frac{1}{4}}\sqrt{K}E-C\sigma\leq 0$ 

- $E \ge$ larger root of this quadratic equation
- $E \leq \sigma \sqrt{p} + Kp$
- [Bernstein] Let  $X_1, ..., X_n$  be indep. r.v's such that  $|X_i| \le K$  almost surely and  $\mathbb{E}[X_i^2] \le \sigma^2$ . For all  $p \ge 1$ :

$$\left\| \sum_{i} X_{i} - \mathbb{E}[X_{i}] \right\|_{p} \leq \sigma \sqrt{p} + Kp$$

# Sparse Johnson-Lindenstrauss Transform

• Let  $\Pi \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times n}$  be a JL-matrix where  $\mathbf{m} = O\left(\frac{1}{\epsilon^2 \log_{\delta}^1}\right)$  which satisfies for  $\left||x|\right|_2 = 1$ :

$$\Pr_{\Pi} \left[ \left| \left| |\Pi x| \right|_{2}^{2} - 1 \right| \ge \epsilon \right] \le \delta$$

- Takes  $O(m||x||_0)$  time to compute JL
- Would be  $O\left(s\big|\big|x\big|\big|_0\right)$  time  $\Pi$  only had s non-zero entries per column

#### **Basic Sparse JL Transform**

- Pick 2-wise indep. hash function  $h:[n] \to [m]$
- Pick 4-wise indep. hash function  $\sigma:[n] \to \{-1,1\}$
- For each  $i \in [n]$  let  $\Pi_{h(i),i} = \sigma(i)$ , the rest are 0
- [Thorup, Zhang'12]: This is JL if  $m \geqslant \frac{1}{\epsilon^2 \delta}$
- Best possible since s=1
- Analysis: standard expectation/variance using bounded independence + Chebyshev
- To improve m let's use Hanson-Wright (higher moment than Chebyshev's second)

# Sparse JL Transform: Construction

- $\Pi_{r,i} = \eta_{r,i} \sigma_{r,i} / \sqrt{s}$ , where  $\eta_i$  are Bernoullis and  $\sigma_i$  are Rademachers
- For all r, i:  $\mathbb{E}[\eta_{r,i}] = \frac{s}{m}$
- For all  $i: \sum_i \eta_{r,i} = s$  (s non-zeros per column)
- $\eta_{r,i}$  are negatively correlated:

$$\mathbb{E}\left[\prod_{(r,i)\in S}\eta_{r,i}\right] \leq \prod_{(r,i)\in S}\mathbb{E}\left[\eta_{r,i}\right] = \left(\frac{S}{m}\right)^{|S|}$$

• Each column chosen uniformly from Binom(m,s) columns of weight s works here

**Thm** [KN'14]: If 
$$m = O\left(\frac{1}{\epsilon^2}\log\frac{1}{\delta}\right)$$
 and  $s \approx \epsilon m$ : 
$$\forall x: \left|\left|x\right|\right|_2 = 1, \Pr_{\Pi}\left[\left|\left|\Pi x\right|\right|_2^2 - 1\right| \ge \epsilon\right] \le \delta$$

• 
$$Z = \left| \left| \Pi x \right| \right|_2^2 - 1 =$$

$$\frac{1}{S} \sum_{r=1}^m \sum_{i \neq j} \eta_{r,i} \, \eta_{r,j} \sigma_{r,i} \sigma_{r,j} x_i x_j \equiv \sigma^T A_{x,\eta \sigma}$$

- $A_{x,\eta}$  is a block-diagonal matrix with m blocks where r-th block is  $\frac{1}{s} x^{(r)} (x^{(r)})^T$  but with zeros on the diagonal
- $x^{(r)}$  is a vector with entries  $x_i^{(r)} = \eta_{r,i} x_i$

• By Hanson-Wright: 
$$||Z||_p \le \left| \left| \sqrt{p} \right| |A_{x,\eta}| \right|_F + p \left| \left| A_{x,\eta} \right| \right|_p$$
  $\le \sqrt{p} || \left| \left| A_{x,\eta} \right| \right|_F + p || \left| A_{x,\eta} \right| || ||_p$ 

- (Operator norm) Since  $A_{x,\eta}$  is block-diagonal  $||A_{x,\eta}||$  is the largest norm of any block
- Eigenvalues in the r-th block are at most

$$\frac{2}{s} \max \left( \left| \left| x^{(r)} \right| \right|_{2}^{2}, \left| \left| x^{(r)} \right| \right|_{\infty}^{2} \right) \leq \frac{2}{s}$$

$$\bullet \ \left| \left| A_{\chi,\eta} \right| \right| \leq \frac{2}{s}$$

• Define  $Q_{i,j} = \sum_{r=1}^m \eta_{r,i} \eta_{r,j}$  so that:

$$||A_{x,\eta}||_F^2 = 1/s^2 \sum_{i \neq j} x_i^2 x_j^2 Q_{i,j}$$

- Lemma: If  $p \approx s^2 m$  then  $\forall i, j ||Q_{i,j}||_p \leq p$

• 
$$\left\| \left\| A_{x,\eta} \right\|_{F} \right\|_{p} = \left\| \left\| A_{x,\eta} \right\|_{F}^{2} \right\|_{\frac{1}{2}p}^{\frac{1}{2}}$$
  
 $\leq \left\| \frac{1}{s^{2}} \sum_{i \neq j} x_{i}^{2} x_{j}^{2} Q_{i,j} \right\|_{p}^{\frac{1}{2}}$ 

$$\leq \frac{1}{s^2} \sum_{i \neq j} x_i^2 x_j^2 \left| \left| Q_{i,j} \right| \right|_p$$
 (triangle ineq.)

$$\leq 1/\sqrt{m}$$

• By Markov 
$$(m = O\left(\frac{1}{\epsilon^2}\log 1/\delta\right), s \approx \epsilon m, p \approx \frac{s^2}{m})$$
:
$$\Pr[\left|\left|\left|\Pi x\right|\right|_2^2 - 1\right| > \epsilon] = \Pr[\left|\sigma^T A_{x,\eta} \sigma\right|^p > \epsilon^p] \le \epsilon^{-p} \mathbb{E}[\left|\sigma^T A_{x,\eta} \sigma\right|^p] \text{ (Markov)}$$

$$\le \epsilon^{-p} C^p \left(\frac{\sqrt{p}}{\sqrt{m}} + \frac{p}{s}\right)^p = \epsilon^{-p} C^p \left(\frac{1}{\epsilon} + \frac{1}{\epsilon}\right)^p \le \delta$$

- Lemma: If  $p \approx s^2 m$  then  $\forall i, j ||Q_{i,j}||_p \leq p$
- Suppose  $\eta_{a_1,i},\ldots,\eta_{a_s,i}$  are all 1 where  $a_1<\cdots< a_s$ .
- Note that  $Q_{ij} = \sum_{t=1}^{S} Y_t$  where t is an indicator r.v. for the event  $\eta_{a_t,i} = 1$ .
- $Y_t$ 's are not indep. but negatively correlated  $\Rightarrow$  p-th moment at most p-th moments of i.i.d. Bernoullis with expectation  $\frac{s}{m}$  (expand  $(\sum_t Y_t)^p$  and compare term by term)
- By Bernstein inequality:

$$\left| \left| Q_{ij} \right| \right|_{p} = \left| \left| \sum_{t} Y_{t} \right| \right| \leq \sqrt{\frac{s^{2}}{m}} \sqrt{p} + p \approx p$$