

Research Proposal and Annotated Bibliography

Hassan Akhter

Professor Abdullah Mirza

CORE101-S10

How to improve Karachi's governance?

Preface:

I plan to explore the topic of governance in Karachi, focusing on what makes the city hard to govern, including its political history and strategic location, its multi-ethnic identity, and widespread overpopulation. I will particularly examine the role of ineffective local government in exacerbating issues of mismanagement and what improvements can be made to tackle these challenges. This will be done by studying various academic and non-academic sources about the historical and current problems the city faces regarding ineffective management. Insights will also be drawn from the outcomes suggested to solve existing and historical problems related to infrastructure development projects, water supply issues, and waste management, among other structural and policy challenges. There will be a particular focus on the failures of civic bodies to maintain the city. According to a World Bank report, 18 civic agencies are responsible for management tasks in Karachi.

Introduction:

Karachi was once a beacon for the new Pakistani state, but over the years, it has experienced a sharp decline, transforming from a thriving city into one afflicted with urban rot. This degradation can be attributed to several factors, including a ballooning population, political instability, rampant corruption, and uncontrollable violence and crime at various stages. Alongside this, the structural governance of the city has also fallen behind, with an ineffective hodgepodge of federal, provincial, and local institutions left to initiate course correction.

Karachi has many management entities, including the Metropolitan Corporation, the Cantonment Board jurisdictions, and various provincial government offices. However, the city lacks a central competent governing authority, causing stakeholders to be unwilling to perform their jobs properly (in some cases, a single building may fall under the jurisdictions of three different authorities). This lack of coherence is the fundamental problem inhibiting the city's natural development and progress.

"What is the 2021-22 budgeted development allocation for the Sindh government's transport department? A paltry Rs8 billion. The city's needs do not match its fiscal, electoral, and administrative reality." [Khan, G. (2022, June 20). *Karachi is hard to love.*] A long history of neglect has created multitudes of problems that are not solved by the minimal resources the government extends toward development. Therefore, the decay spreads unchecked throughout the city, and a thorough administrative revamp is required, along with massive funding, to rectify these wrongs.

Annotated Bibliography

Issue Analysis Matrix

Topic/Debate/Controversy/Issue: Inefficiency & Mismanagement in Karachi

Research Question: How to improve Karachi's governance?

| Article 1 | Article 2 | Article 3 | Article 4 | Article 5 | Article 6 | Article 7 |
|--|---|---|---|--|---|--|
| Author(s): Arif Hasan | Author(s): Humaira Nazir, Muhammed Shahzad Yousuf | Author(s): Jon Kher Kaw, Annie Gapihan, Peter Ellis and Jaafar Sadok Friaa | Author(s): <i>Muhammad Maswood Alam</i> | Author(s): Bilal Khalid | Author(s): Azfar-ul-Ashfaque | Author(s): Jumaina Siddiqui |
| Article title: The political and institutional blockages to good governance: the case of the Lyari expressway in Karachi | Article title: Bahria Town Karachi: A case study in Urban Development | Article title: Transforming Karachi into a Livable and Competitive Megacity | Article title: A Study for Better Solid Waste Management in Karachi | Article title: Will the new local government make Karachi great again? | Article title: PTI blames PPP for civic bodies' woes in Karachi | Article title: In Karachi, Flooding Lays Bare City's Governance Issues |
| Year of publ. 2005 | Year of publ. 2021 | Year of publ. 2018 | Year of publ. 2020 | Year of publ. 2022 | Year of publ. 2021 | Year of publ. 2020 |
| Source: SAGE Journals | Source: Journal of Research in Architecture & Planning | Source: World Bank Blogs | Source: C40 Cities /Author Affiliation (KMC) | Source: Newspaper: Dawn | Source: Newspaper: Dawn | Source: United States Institute of Peace (USIP) - Publications |

Hasan, Arif. (2005). "The political and institutional blockages to good governance: the case of the Lyari expressway in Karachi." *SAGE Journals*

The author examines political and institutional hindrances when it comes to large infrastructure projects in the city, by assessing the Lyari Expressway project as a case study. It is important to understand the bureaucratic, political and policy obstacles that projects like this face, in order to make changes that address these issues.

Kaw, Jon Kher, Gapihan, Annie, Ellis, Peter, and Friaa, Jaafar Sadok. (2018). "Transforming Karachi into a Livable and Competitive Megacity." *World Bank Blogs*

This World Bank study explores the possibility of transforming Karachi into a livable megacity, by improving public services, infrastructure and service delivery. As per the report, 90% of Karachi is controlled by 18 civic agencies that have little coordination between them, which as per Arif Hassan's study can lead to mismanagement when large infrastructure projects fall under the jurisdictions of several public works bodies. Therefore, it is important to understand this divide if measures are to be taken to improve governance structure in the city.

It should be noted that the World Bank regularly funds projects in Karachi, and thus, stands to gain from better city management of its resources. The report also contains an 'at a glance' infographic which is very insightful and easy to understand.

Alam, Muhammad Maswood. (2020). "A Study for Better Solid Waste Management in Karachi." *C40 Cities*

Alam holds a position at the Karachi Metropolitan Corporation, and in this article he discusses methods to improve waste management in this city. This offers a keen insights into how these public service organizations think and the hurdles they face in initiating reform, offering a perspective on how lack of effective control makes Karachi hard to govern.

As the Author holds a position in the KMC, he could be biased in favor of what the KMC considers satisfactory performance or the organization's political preferences and is therefore less reliable than other independent studies of Mismanagement in Karachi.

Ashfaq, Azfar-ul-. (2021). "PTI blames PPP for civic bodies' woes in Karachi." *Dawn Newspaper*

Ashfaq's article offers a glimpse into the blame game that happens between major political parties in Karachi, when both the federal and provincial governments seek to dodge responsibility and instead strike blame on the other. This political point-scoring can tell us how lack of coordination between different political stakeholders can negatively impact governance and contribute to problems of waste management, and infrastructural delays defined in earlier studies.

This article offers direct insights into the political differences alluded to in other sources, however it may contain biases from an editorial perspective of the publishing organizations (news media tends to directly benefit from government advert tenders so might be biased towards the party in power).

Siddiqui, Jumaina. (2020). "In Karachi, Flooding Lays Bare City's Governance Issues." *United States Institute of Peace (USIP)*

Seasonal floods bring the city's issues to the forefront, mainly poor infrastructure, haphazard and uncoordinated response measures and lack of accountability for civic institutions. It is important to understand the civic structure of the city when it comes to disaster management. While other sources might discuss mismanagement in a vacuum, this talks about how these inefficiencies can lead to worse disaster management putting the lives of people at risk with inadequate response to emergencies.

Khalid, Bilal. (2022). "Will the new local government make Karachi great again?" *Dawn Newspaper*

The article explores the historical challenges faced by local governments in Karachi, vis-a-vis lack of effective control when it comes to city management with provincial authorities controlling key sectors like water supply, waste disposal and transport. It also discusses how for a local government structure to be successful, the political players must be willing to decentralize and empower local authorities with city management.

Many sources suggest a revamp of local government in their positive outcomes. However, this study explores how changes in local governance may improve the state of the city and whether they can be effective if control of key organizations is not devolved.