Sequencing Y Chromosomes Resolves Discrepancy in Time to Common Ancestor of Males Versus Females

G. David Poznik,^{1,2} Brenna M. Henn,^{3,4} Muh-Ching Yee,³ Elzbieta Sliwerska,⁵ Ghia M. Euskirchen,³ Alice A. Lin,⁶ Michael Snyder,³ Lluis Quintana-Murci,^{7,8} Jeffrey M. Kidd,^{3,5} Peter A. Underhill,³ Carlos D. Bustamante³*

The Y chromosome and the mitochondrial genome have been used to estimate when the common patrilineal and matrilineal ancestors of humans lived. We sequenced the genomes of 69 males from nine populations, including two in which we find basal branches of the Y-chromosome tree. We identify ancient phylogenetic structure within African haplogroups and resolve a long-standing ambiguity deep within the tree. Applying equivalent methodologies to the Y chromosome and the mitochondrial genome, we estimate the time to the most recent common ancestor (T_{MRCA}) of the Y chromosome to be 120 to 156 thousand years and the mitochondrial genome T_{MRCA} to be 99 to 148 thousand years. Our findings suggest that, contrary to previous claims, male lineages do not coalesce significantly more recently than female lineages.

The Y chromosome contains the longest stretch of nonrecombining DNA in the human genome and is therefore a powerful tool with which to study human history. Estimates of the time to the most recent common ancestor (T_{MRCA}) of the Y chromosome have differed by a factor of about 2 from T_{MRCA} estimates for the mitochondrial genome. Y-chromosome coalescence time has been estimated in the range of 50 to 115 thousand years (ky) $(1-3)$, although larger values have been reported (4, 5), whereas estimates for mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) range from 150 to 240 ky $(3, 6, 7)$. However, the quality and quantity of data available for these two uniparental loci have differed substantially. Whereas

500

the complete mitochondrial genome has been resequenced thousands of times (6, 8), fully sequenced diverse Y chromosomes have only recently become available. Previous estimates of the Y-chromosome T_{MRCA} relied on short resequenced segments, rapidly mutating microsatellites, or single-nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) ascertained in a small panel of individuals and then genotyped in a global panel. These approaches likely underestimate genetic diversity and, consequently, T_{MRCA} (9).

We sequenced the complete Y chromosomes of 69 males from seven globally diverse populations of the Human Genome Diversity Panel (HGDP) and two additional African populations:

San (Bushmen) from Namibia, Mbuti Pygmies from the Democratic Republic of Congo, Baka Pygmies and Nzebi from Gabon, Mozabite Berbers from Algeria, Pashtuns (Pathan) from Pakistan, Cambodians, Yakut from Siberia, and Mayans from Mexico (fig. S1). Individuals were selected without regard to their Y-chromosome haplogroups.

The Y-chromosome reference sequence is 59.36 Mb, but this includes a 30-Mb stretch of constitutive heterochromatin on the q arm, a 3-Mb centromere, 2.65-Mb and 330-kb telomeric pseudoautosomal regions (PAR) that recombine with the X chromosome, and eight smaller gaps. We mapped reads to the remaining 22.98 Mb of assembled reference sequence, which consists of three sequence classes defined by their complexity and degree of homology to the X chromosome (10): X-degenerate, X-transposed, and ampliconic. Both the high degree of self-identity within the ampliconic tracts and the X-chromosome homology of the X-transposed region render portions of the Y chromosome ill suited for short-read sequencing. To address this, we constructed filters that reduced the data to 9.99 million sites (11)

¹ Program in Biomedical Informatics, Stanford University School of Medicine, Stanford, CA, USA. ² Department of Statistics, Stanford University, Stanford, CA, USA.³ Department of Genetics, Stanford University School of Medicine, Stanford, CA, USA. 4 Department of Ecology and Evolution, Stony Brook University, Stony Brook, NY, USA. ⁵Department of Human Genetics and Department of Computational Medicine and Bioinformatics, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI, USA. ⁶Department of Psychiatry, Stanford University, Stanford, CA, USA. ⁷Institut Pasteur, Unit of Human Evolutionary Genetics, 75015 Paris, France. ⁸Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, URA3012, 75015 Paris, France.

*Corresponding author. E-mail: cdbustam@stanford.edu

Depth Filter MQ0 Ratio Filter MMM

the regions within which reliable genotype calls can be made. Below, a scatter plot indicates the positions of all observed SNVs. Those incompatible with the inferred phylogenetic tree (red) are uniformly distributed. The X-degenerate regions yield quality sequence data, ampliconic sequences tend to fail both filters, and mapping quality is poor in the X-transposed region.

(Fig. 1 and fig. S2). We then implemented a haploid model expectation-maximization algorithm to call genotypes (11) .

We identified 11,640 single-nucleotide variants (SNVs) (fig. S3). A total of 2293 (19.7%) are present in dbSNP (v135), and we assigned haplogroups on the basis of the 390 (3.4%) present in the International Society of Genetic Genealogy (ISOGG) database (12) (fig. S4). At SNVs, median haploid coverage was 3.1x (interquartile range 2.6 to 3.8x) (table S1 and fig. S5), and sequence validation suggests a genotype calling error rate on the order of 0.1% (11).

Because mutations accumulate over time along a single lengthy haplotype (13) , the malespecific region of the Y chromosome provides power for phylogenetic inference. We constructed a maximum likelihood tree from 11,640 SNVs using the Tamura-Nei nucleotide substitution

model (Fig. 2) and, in agreement with (14), observe strong bootstrap support (500 replicates) for the major haplogroup branching points. The tree both recapitulates and adds resolution to the previously inferred Y-chromosome phylogeny (fig. S6), and it characterizes branch lengths free of ascertainment bias. We identify extraordinary depth within Africa, including lineages sampled from the San hunter-gatherers that coalesce just short of the root of the entire tree. This stands in contrast to a tree from autosomal SNP genotypes (15), wherein African branches were considerably shorter than others; genotyping arrays primarily rely on SNPs ascertained in European populations and therefore undersample diversity within Africa. Two regions of reduced branch length in our tree correspond to rapid expansions: the out-of-Africa event (downstream of F-M89) and the agriculture-catalyzed Bantu expansions (downstream of E-M2). Among the three hunter-gatherer populations, we find a relatively high number of B2 lineages. Within this haplogroup, six Baka B-M192 individuals form a distinct clade that does not correspond to extant definitions (11) (fig. S7). We estimate this previously uncharacterized structure to have arisen ~35 thousand years ago (kya).

We resolve the polytomy of the Y macrohaplogroup $F(16)$ by determining the branching order of haplogroups G, H, and IJK (Fig. 2 and fig. S6). We identified a single variant (rs73614810, a C→T transition dubbed "M578") for which haplogroup G retains the ancestral allele, whereas its brother clades (H and IJK) share the derived allele. Genotyping M578 in a diverse panel confirmed the finding (table S2). We thereby infer more recent common ancestry between hgH and hgIJK than between either and hgG. M578 de-

Fig. 2. Y-chromosome phylogeny inferred from genomic sequencing. This tree recapitulates the previously known topology of the Y-chromosome phylogeny; however, branch lengths are now free of ascertainment bias. Branches are drawn proportional to the number of derived SNVs. Internal branches are labeled with defining ISOGG variants inferred to have arisen on the branch. Leaves are colored by major haplogroup cluster and labeled with the most derived mutation observed and the population from which the individual was drawn. Previously uncharacterized structure within African hgB2 is indicated in orange. (Inset) Resolution of a polytomy was possible through the identification of a variant for which hgG retains the ancestral allele, whereas hgH and hgIJK share the derived allele.

REPORTS

fines an early diversification episode of the Y phylogeny in Eurasia (11).

To account for missing genotypes, we assigned each SNV to the root of the smallest subtree containing all carriers of one allele or the other and inferred that the allele specific to the subtree was derived (fig. S8). We used the chimpanzee Y-chromosome sequence to polarize 398 variants assigned to the deepest split—a task complicated by substantial structural divergence $(11, 17)$.

We estimated the coalescence time of all Y chromosomes using both a molecular clock–based frequentist estimator and an empirical Bayes approach that uses a prior distribution of T_{MRCA} from coalescent theory and conducts Markov chain simulation to estimate the likelihood of parameters given a set of DNA sequences (GENETREE) $(11, 18)$ (Table 1). To directly compare the T_{MRCA} of the Y chromosome to that of the mtDNA, we estimated their respective mutation rates by calibrating phylogeographic patterns from the initial peopling of the Americas, a recent human event with high-confidence archaeological dating.

Archaeological evidence indicates that humans first colonized the Americas ~15 kya via a rapid coastal migration that reached Monte Verde II in southern Chile by 14.6 kya (19). The two Native American Mayans represent Y-chromosome hgQ lineages, Q-M3 and Q-L54*(xM3), that likely diverged at about the same time as the initial peopling of the continents. Q is defined by the M242 mutation that arose in Asia. A descendent haplogroup, Q-L54, emerged in Siberia and is ancestral to Q-M3. Because the M3 mutation appears to be specific to the Americas (20) , it likely occurred after the initial entry, and the prevalence of M3 in South America suggests that it emerged before the southward migratory wave. Consequently, the divergence between these two lineages provides an appropriate calibration point for the Y mutation rate. The large number of variants that have accumulated since divergence, 120 and 126, contrasts with the pedigree-based estimate of the Y-chromosome mutation rate, which is based on just 4 mutations (21). Using entry to the Americas as a calibration point, we estimate a mutation rate of 0.82×10^{-9} per base pair (bp) per year [95% confidence interval (CI): 0.72×10^{-9} to 0.92×10^{-9} /bp/year] (table S3). False negatives have minimal effect on this estimate due to the low probability, at 5.7x and 8.5x coverage, of observing fewer than two reads at a site (observed proportions: 3.1% and 0.6%) and due to the fact that the number of unobserved singletons possessed by one individual is offset by a similar number of Q doubletons unobserved in the same individual and thereby misclassified as singletons possessed by the other (11) (figs. S9 and S10). This calibration approach assumes approximate coincidence between the expansion throughout the Americas and the divergence of Q-M3 and Q-L54*(xM3), but we consider deviation from this assumption and identify a strict lower bound on the point of

divergence using sequences from the 1000 Genomes Project (11). As a comparison point, we consider the out-of-Africa expansion of modern humans, which dates to approximately 50 kya (22) and yields a similar mutation rate of 0.79×10^{-9} /bp/year.

We constructed an analogous pipeline for high coverage (>250x) mtDNA sequences from the 69 male samples and an additional 24 females from the seven HGDP populations (11) (fig. S11). As in the Y-chromosome analysis, we calibrated the mtDNA mutation rate using divergence within the Americas. We selected the pan-American hgA2, one of several initial founding haplogroups among Native Americans. The star-shaped phylogeny of hgA2 subclades suggests that its divergence was coincident with the rapid dispersal upon the initial colonization of the continents (23). Calibration on 108 previously analyzed hgA2 sequences (11) (fig. S12) yields a point estimate equivalent to that from our seven Mayan mtDNAs, but within a narrower confidence interval. From this within-human calibration, we estimate a mutation rate of 2.3 \times 10⁻⁸/bp/year (95% CI: 2.0 \times 10−⁸ to 2.5 × 10−⁸ /bp/year), higher than that from human-chimpanzee divergence but similar to other estimates using within-human calibration points (24, 25).

The global T_{MRCA} estimate for any locus constitutes an upper bound for the time of human population divergence under models without gene flow. We estimate the Y-chromosome T_{MRCA} to be 138 ky (120 to 156 ky) and the mtDNA T_{MRCA} to be 124 ky (99 to 148 ky) (Table 1) (11). Our mtDNA estimate is more recent than many previous studies, the majority of which used mutation rates extrapolated from between-species divergence. However, mtDNA mutation rates are subject to a time-dependent decline, with pedigreebased estimates on the faster end of the spectrum and species-based estimates on the slower. Because of this time dependency and the need to calibrate the Y and mtDNA in a comparable manner, it is more appropriate here to use withinhuman clade estimates of the mutation rate.

Rather than assume the mutation rate to be a known constant, we explicitly account for the uncertainty in its estimation by modeling each T_{MRCA} as the ratio of two random variables. We estimate the ratio of the mtDNA T_{MRCA} to that of the Y chromosome to be 0.90 (95% CI: 0.68 to 1.11) (fig. S13). If, as argued above, the divergence of the Y-chromosome Q lineages occurred at approximately the same time as that of the mtDNA A2 lineages, then the T_{MRCA} ratio is invariant to the specific calibration time used. Regardless, the conclusion of parity is robust to possible discrepancy between the divergence times within the Americas (11). Using comparable calibration approaches, the Y and

Table 1. T_{MRCA} and N_e estimates for the Y chromosome and mtDNA. Pop., population.

Method	Y chromosome				mtDNA			
	Pop.	n	T_{MRCA} *	N.	Pop.	$\mathbf n$	T_{MRCA} [*]	N.
Molecular clock	All		69 139 (120-156)	4500^{\dagger}	All	93	124 (99-148)	9500^{\dagger}
GENFTRFF [#]	San	6	128 (112-146)	3800	Nzebi	18	$105(91 - 119)$	11,500
	Baka	11	122 (106-137)	1800	Mbuti	6	121 (100-143)	3700

*Employs mutation rate estimated from within-human calibration point. Times measured in ky. †Uses Watterson's estimator, $\hat{\theta}_\mu$, \qquad **±Each coalescent analysis restricted to a single population spanning the ancestral root (11).**

Fig. 3. Similarity of T_{MRCA} does not imply equivalent N_e of males and females. The T_{MRCA} for a given locus is drawn from a predata (i.e., prior) distribution that is a function of N_e , generation time, sample size, and demographic history. Consider the distribution of possible T_{MRCA} s for a set of 100 uniparental chromosomes. Although the Mbuti mtDNA N_e is twice as large as that of the Baka Y chromosome, the corresponding predata T_{MRCA} distributions overlap considerably.

mtDNA coalescence times are not significantly different. This conclusion would hold whether or not an alternative approach would yield more definitive T_{MRCA} estimates.

Our observation that the T_{MRCA} of the Y chromosome is similar to that of the mtDNA does not imply that the effective population sizes (N_e) of males and females are similar. In fact, we observe a larger N_e in females than in males (Table 1). Although, due to its larger N_e , the distribution from which the mitochondrial T_{MRCA} has been drawn is right-shifted with respect to that of the Y-chromosome T_{MRCA} , the two distributions have large variances and overlap (Fig. 3).

Dogma has held that the common ancestor of human patrilineal lineages, popularly referred to as the Y-chromosome "Adam," lived considerably more recently than the common ancestor of female lineages, the so-called mitochondrial "Eve." However, we conclude that the mitochondrial coalescence time is not substantially greater than that of the Y chromosome. Indeed, due to our moderate-coverage sequencing and the existence of additional rare divergent haplogroups, our analysis may yet underestimate the true Y-chromosome T_{MRCA} .

References and Notes

1. J. K. Pritchard, M. T. Seielstad, A. Perez-Lezaun, M. W. Feldman, Mol. Biol. Evol. 16, 1791–1798 (1999).

- 2. R. Thomson, J. K. Pritchard, P. Shen, P. J. Oefner, M. W. Feldman, Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 97, 7360–7365 (2000).
- 3. H. Tang, D. O. Siegmund, P. Shen, P. J. Oefner, M. W. Feldman, Genetics 161, 447–459 (2002).
- 4. M. F. Hammer, Nature 378, 376–378 (1995).
- 5. F. Cruciani et al., Am. J. Hum. Genet. 88, 814–818 (2011).
- 6. M. Ingman, H. Kaessmann, S. Pääbo, U. Gyllensten, Nature 408, 708–713 (2000).
- 7. R. L. Cann, M. Stoneking, A. C. Wilson, Nature 325, 31–36 (1987).
- 8. P. A. Underhill, T. Kivisild, Annu. Rev. Genet. 41, 539–564 (2007).
- 9. M. A. Jobling, C. Tyler-Smith, Nat. Rev. Genet. 4, 598–612 (2003).
- 10. H. Skaletsky et al., Nature 423, 825–837 (2003).
- 11. Materials and methods are available as supplementary materials on Science Online.
- 12. ISOGG, International Society of Genetic Genealogy (2013); available at www.isogg.org/.
- 13. P. A. Underhill et al., Ann. Hum. Genet. 65, 43–62 (2001).
- 14. W. Wei et al., Genome Res. 23, 388–395 (2013).
- 15. J. Z. Li et al., Science 319, 1100–1104 (2008).
- 16. T. M. Karafet et al., Genome Res. 18, 830–838 (2008).
- 17. I. F. Hughes et al., Nature 463, 536-539 (2010).
- 18. R. C. Griffiths, S. Tavaré, Philos. Trans. R. Soc. London B Biol. Sci. 344, 403–410 (1994).
- 19. T. Goebel, M. R. Waters, D. H. O'Rourke, Science 319, 1497–1502 (2008).
- 20. M. C. Dulik et al., Am. J. Hum. Genet. 90, 229–246 (2012).
- 21. Y. Xue et al.; Asan, Curr. Biol. 19, 1453-1457 (2009).
- 22. R. G. Klein, Evol. Anthropol. 17, 267–281 (2008).
- 23. S. Kumar et al., BMC Evol. Biol. 11, 293 (2011).
- 24. S. Y. W. Ho, M. J. Phillips, A. Cooper, A. J. Drummond, Mol. Biol. Evol. 22, 1561–1568 (2005).

25. B. M. Henn, C. R. Gignoux, M. W. Feldman, J. L. Mountain, Mol. Biol. Evol. 26, 217–230 (2009).

Acknowledgments: We thank O. Cornejo, S. Gravel, D. Siegmund, and E. Tsang for helpful discussions; M. Sikora and H. Costa for mapping reads from Gabonese samples; and H. Cann for assistance with HGDP samples. This work was supported by National Library of Medicine training grant LM-07033 and NSF graduate research fellowship DGE-1147470 (G.D.P.); NIH grant 3R01HG003229 (B.M.H. and C.D.B.); NIH grant DP5OD009154 (J.M.K. and E.S.); and Institut Pasteur, a CNRS Maladies Infectieuses Émergentes Grant, and a Foundation Simone et Cino del Duca Research Grant (L.Q.M.). P.A.U. consulted for, P.A.U. and B.M.H. have stock in, and C.D.B. is on the advisory board of a project at 23andMe. C.D.B. is on the scientific advisory boards of Personalis, Inc.; InVitae (formerly Locus Development, Inc.); and Ancestry.com. M.S. is a scientific advisory member and founder of Personalis, a scientific advisory member for Genapsys Former, and a consultant for Illumina and Beckman Coulter Society for American Medical Pathology. B.M.H. formerly had a paid consulting relationship with Ancestry.com. Variants have been deposited to dbSNP (ss825679106–825690384). Individual level genetic data are available, through a data access agreement to respect the privacy of the participants for transfer of genetic data, by contacting C.D.B.

Supplementary Materials

www.sciencemag.org/cgi/content/full/341/6145/562/DC1 Materials and Methods Supplementary Text

Figs. S1 to S13 Tables S1 to S3 Data File S1

References (26*–*51)

11 March 2013; accepted 25 June 2013 10.1126/science.1237619

Low-Pass DNA Sequencing of 1200 Sardinians Reconstructs European Y-Chromosome Phylogeny

Paolo Francalacci,¹* Laura Morelli,¹† Andrea Angius,^{2,3} Riccardo Berutti,^{3,4} Frederic Reinier,³ Rossano Atzeni,³ Rosella Pilu,² Fabio Busonero,^{2,5} Andrea Maschio,^{2,5} Ilenia Zara,³ Daria Sanna, 1 Antonella Useli, 1 Maria Francesca Urru, 3 Marco Marcelli, 3 Roberto Cusano, 3 Manuela Oppo,³ Magdalena Zoledziewska,^{2,4} Maristella Pitzalis,^{2,4} Francesca Deidda,^{2,4} Eleonora Porcu,^{2,4,5} Fausto Poddie,⁴ Hyun Min Kang,⁵ Robert Lyons,⁶ Brendan Tarrier,⁶ Jennifer Bragg Gresham,⁶ Bingshan Li,⁷ Sergio Tofanelli,⁸ Santos Alonso,⁹ Mariano Dei,² Sandra Lai, 2 Antonella Mulas, $^{\bar{2}}$ Michael B. Whalen, 2 Sergio Uzzau, 4,10 Chris Jones, 3 David Schlessinger,¹¹ Gonçalo R. Abecasis,⁵ Serena Sanna,² Carlo Sidore,^{2,4,5} Francesco Cucca^{2,4*}

Genetic variation within the male-specific portion of the Y chromosome (MSY) can clarify the origins of contemporary populations, but previous studies were hampered by partial genetic information. Population sequencing of 1204 Sardinian males identified 11,763 MSY single-nucleotide polymorphisms, 6751 of which have not previously been observed. We constructed a MSY phylogenetic tree containing all main haplogroups found in Europe, along with many Sardinian-specific lineage clusters within each haplogroup. The tree was calibrated with archaeological data from the initial expansion of the Sardinian population ~7700 years ago. The ages of nodes highlight different genetic strata in Sardinia and reveal the presumptive timing of coalescence with other human populations. We calculate a putative age for coalescence of ~180,000 to 200,000 years ago, which is consistent with previous mitochondrial DNA–based estimates.

'ew sequencing technologies have provided genomic data sets that can reconstruct past events in human evolution more accurately (1). Sequencing data from the male-specific portion of the Y chromosome (MSY) (2), because of its lack of recombination and low

mutation, reversion, and recurrence rates, can be particularly informative for these evolutionary analyses (3, 4). Recently, high-coverage Y chromosome sequencing data from 36 males from different worldwide populations (5) assessed 6662 phylogenetically informative variants and estimated the timing of past events, including a putative coalescence time for modern humans of \sim 101,000 to 115,000 years ago.

MSY sequencing data reported to date still represent a relatively small number of individuals from a few populations. Furthermore, dating estimates are also affected by the calibration of the

*Corresponding author. E-mail: pfrancalacci@uniss.it (P.F.); fcucca@uniss.it (F.C.)

†Laura Morelli prematurely passed away on 20 February 2013. This work is dedicated to her memory.

¹ Dipartimento di Scienze della Natura e del Territorio, Università di Sassari, 07100 Sassari, Italy. ²Istituto di Ricerca Genetica e Biomedica (IRGB), CNR, Monserrato, Italy. ³Center for Advanced Studies, Research and Development in Sardinia (CRS4), Pula, Italy. ⁴ Dipartimento di Scienze Biomediche, Università di Sassari, 07100 Sassari, Italy. ⁵Center for Statistical Genetics, Department of Biostatistics, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI 48109, USA. ⁶DNA Sequencing Core, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI 48109, USA. ⁷Center for Human Genetics Research, Department of Molecular Physiology and Biophysics, Vanderbilt University, Nashville, TN 37235, USA. ⁸Dipartimento di Biologia, Università di Pisa, 56126 Pisa, Italy. ⁹Departamento de Genética, Antropología Física y Fisiología Animal, Universidad del País Vasco/Euskal Herriko Unibertsitatea, 48080 Bilbao, Spain. ¹⁰Porto Conte Ricerche, Località Tramariglio, Alghero, 07041 Sassari, Italy. ¹¹Laboratory of Genetics, National Institute on Aging, Baltimore, MD 21224, USA.

Science **341** (6145), 562-565. [doi: 10.1126/science.1237619] Bustamante (August 1, 2013) Quintana-Murci, Jeffrey M. Kidd, Peter A. Underhill and Carlos D. Sliwerska, Ghia M. Euskirchen, Alice A. Lin, Michael Snyder, Lluis G. David Poznik, Brenna M. Henn, Muh-Ching Yee, Elzbieta **Common Ancestor of Males Versus Females Sequencing Y Chromosomes Resolves Discrepancy in Time to**

Editor's Summary

Examining Y

records, were used to calibrate and increase the resolution of the human phylogenetic tree. and genetically informative Sardinian population. The sequence analyses, along with archaeological investigated the sequence divergence of 1204 Y chromosomes that were sampled within the isolated and mitochondria both occurred approximately 120 thousand years ago. **Francalacci** *et al.* (p. 565) relative rates of evolution, which suggested that the coalescence, or origin, of the human Y chromosome chromosome. Sequencing of maternally inherited mitochondrial DNA allowed comparison between the identifying population and individual specific sequence variants that elucidate the evolution of the Y examined 9.9 Mb of the Y chromosome from 69 men from nine globally divergent populations−− nonrecombining, male-specific Y chromosome (see the Perspective by **Cann**). **Poznik** *et al.* (p. 562) The evolution of human populations has long been studied with unique sequences from the

This copy is for your personal, non-commercial use only.

Advancement of Science; all rights reserved. The title *Science* is a registered trademark of AAAS. Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20005. Copyright 2016 by the American Association for the in December, by the American Association for the Advancement of Science, 1200 New York *Science* (print ISSN 0036-8075; online ISSN 1095-9203) is published weekly, except the last week