



PROJECT

Build a Sign Language Recognizer

A part of the Artificial Intelligence Nanodegree Program

PROJECT REVIEW

CODE REVIEW 8

NOTES

▼ my_model_selectors.py 8

```

1 import math
2 import statistics
3 import warnings
4
5 import numpy as np
6 from hmmlearn.hmm import GaussianHMM
7 from sklearn.model_selection import KFold
8 from asl_utils import combine_sequences
9
10 import logging
11
12 class ModelSelector(object):
13     '''
14     base class for model selection (strategy design pattern)
15     '''
16
17     def __init__(self,
18                 all_word_sequences: dict,
19                 all_word_Xlengths: dict,
20                 this_word: str,
21                 n_constant=3,
22                 min_n_components=2,
23                 max_n_components=10,
24                 random_state=14, verbose=False):
25         self.words = all_word_sequences
26         self.hwords = all_word_Xlengths
27         self.sequences = all_word_sequences[this_word]
28         self.X, self.lengths = all_word_Xlengths[this_word]
29         self.this_word = this_word
30         self.n_constant = n_constant
31         self.min_n_components = min_n_components
32         self.max_n_components = max_n_components
33         self.random_state = random_state
34         self.verbose = verbose
35
36     def select(self):
37         raise NotImplementedError
38
39     def base_model(self, num_states):
40         # with warnings.catch_warnings():
41         warnings.filterwarnings("ignore", category=DeprecationWarning)
42         # warnings.filterwarnings("ignore", category=RuntimeWarning)
43         try:
44             hmm_model = GaussianHMM(n_components=num_states, covariance_type="diag", n_iter=1000,
45                                     random_state=self.random_state, verbose=False).fit(self.X, self.lengths)
46             if self.verbose:
47                 print("model created for {} with {} states".format(self.this_word, num_states))
48             return hmm_model
49         except:
50             if self.verbose:
51                 print("failure on {} with {} states".format(self.this_word, num_states))
52             return None
53
54
55 class SelectorConstant(ModelSelector):

```

```

56     """ select the model with value self.n_constant
57
58     """
59
60     def select(self):
61         """ select based on n_constant value
62
63         :return: GaussianHMM object
64         """
65         best_num_components = self.n_constant
66         return self.base_model(best_num_components)
67
68
69     class SelectorBIC(ModelSelector):
70         """
71         Abbreviations:
72         - BIC - Baysian Information Criterion
73         - CV - Cross-Validation
74
75         About BIC:
76         - Maximises the likelihood of data whilst penalising large-size models
77         - Used to scoring model topologies by balancing fit
78           and complexity within the training set for each word
79         - Avoids using CV by instead using a penalty term
80
81         BIC Equation:  $BIC = -2 * \log L + p * \log N$ 
82         (re-arrangement of Equation (12) in Reference [0])
83
84         - where "L" is likelihood of "fitted" model
85         where "p" is the qty of free parameters in model (aka model "complexity"). Reference [2][3]
86         where "p * log N" is the "penalty term" (increases with higher "p"
87           to penalise "complexity" and avoid "overfitting")
88         where "N" is qty of data points (size of data set)
89
90         Notes:
91         -2 * log L    -> decreases with higher "p"
92         p * log N     -> increases with higher "p"
93         N > e^2 = 7.4 -> BIC applies larger "penalty term" in this case
94
95         Selection using BIC Model:
96         - Lower the BIC score the "better" the model.
97         - SelectorBIC accepts argument of ModelSelector instance of base class
98           with attributes such as: this_word, min_n_components, max_n_components,
99         - Loop from min_n_components to max_n_components
100        - Find the lowest BIC score as the "better" model.
101
102        References:
103        [0] - http://www2.imm.dtu.dk/courses/02433/doc/ch6\_slides.pdf
104        [1] - https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Hidden\_Markov\_model#Architecture
105        [2] - https://stats.stackexchange.com/questions/12341/number-of-parameters-in-markov-model
106        [3] - https://discussions.udacity.com/t/number-of-parameters-bic-calculation/233235/8
107        [4] - http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.58.6208&rep=rep1&type=pdf
108        """
109        def calc_score_bic(self, log_likelihood, num_states, num_data_points):
110            return (-2 * log_likelihood) + (num_states * np.log(num_data_points))
111

```

REQUIRED

I agree with all but your value of `p`, it seems like you just used the number of states.

```

112     def calc_best_score_bic(self, score_bics):
113         # Min of list of lists comparing each item by value at index 0
114         return min(score_bics, key = lambda x: x[0])
115
116     def select(self):
117         """ Select best model for self.this_word based on BIC score
118         for n between self.min_n_components and self.max_n_components
119
120         :return: GaussianHMM object
121         """
122         warnings.filterwarnings("ignore", category=DeprecationWarning)
123
124         score_bics = []
125         for num_states in range(self.min_n_components, self.max_n_components + 1):
126             try:
127                 hmm_model = self.base_model(num_states)
128                 log_likelihood = hmm_model.score(self.X, self.lengths)
129                 num_data_points = sum(self.lengths)
130                 score_bic = self.calc_score_bic(log_likelihood, num_states, num_data_points)
131                 score_bics.append(tuple([score_bic, hmm_model]))

```

AWESOME

You calculated almost everything correctly!

```

132         except:
133             pass
134         return self.calc_best_score_bic(score_bics)[1] if score_bics else None
135
136 class SelectorDIC(ModelSelector):
137     """
138     Abbreviations:
139         - DIC - Discriminative Information Criterion
140
141     About DIC:
142         - In DIC we need to find the number of components where the difference is largest.
143         The idea of DIC is that we are trying to find the model that gives a
144         high likelihood (small negative number) to the original word and
145         low likelihood (very big negative number) to the other words
146         - In order to get an optimal model for any word, we need to run the model on all
147         other words so that we can calculate the formula
148         - DIC is a scoring model topology that scores the ability of a
149         training set to discriminate one word against competing words.
150         It provides a "penalty" if model likelihoods
151         for non-matching words are too similar to model likelihoods for the
152         correct word in the word set (rather than using a penalty term for
153         complexity like in BIC)
154         - Task-oriented model selection criterion adapts well to classification
155         problems
156         - Classification task accounts for Goal of model (differs from BIC)
157
158     DIC Equation:
159
160         DIC = log(P(X(i)) - 1/(M - 1) * sum(log(P(X(all but i)))
161
162         (Equation (17) in Reference [0]. Assumes all data sets are same size)
163
164         = log likelihood of the data belonging to model
165         - avg of anti log likelihood of data X and model M
166
167         = log(P(original word)) - average(log(P(other words)))
168
169         where anti log likelihood means likelihood of data X and model M belonging to competing categories
170         where log(P(X(i))) is the log-likelihood of the fitted model for the current word
171         (in terms of hmmlearn it is the model's score for the current word)
172         where "L" is likelihood of data fitting the model ("fitted" model)
173         where X is input training data given in the form of a word dictionary
174         where X(i) is the current word being evaluated
175         where M is a specific model
176
177     Note:
178         - log likelihood of the data belonging to model
179         - anti_log_likelihood of data X vs model M
180
181     Selection using DIC Model:
182         - Higher the DIC score the "better" the model.
183         - SelectorDIC accepts argument of ModelSelector instance of base class
184         with attributes such as: this_word, min_n_components, max_n_components,
185         - Loop from min_n_components to max_n_components
186         - Find the highest BIC score as the "better" model.
187
188     References:
189         [0] - http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.58.6208&rep=rep1&type=pdf
190     """
191
192     def calc_sum_anti_log_likelihoods(self, model, other_words):
193         anti_log_likelihoods = []
194         for word in other_words:
195             anti_log_likelihoods.append(model[1].score(word[0], word[1]))
196         return sum(anti_log_likelihoods)

```

AWESOME

Very good.

```

197
198     def calc_avg_anti_log_likelihood(self, model, other_words):
199         return self.calc_sum_anti_log_likelihoods(model, other_words) / (len(other_words) - 1)

```

SUGGESTION

Since other_words contain `m-1` words, you could just calculated the mean with `np.mean`

```

200
201     def calc_best_score_dic(self, score_dics):

```

```

202     # Max of list of lists comparing each item by value at index 0
203     return max(score_dics, key = lambda x: x[0])
204
205     def select(self):
206         warnings.filterwarnings("ignore", category=DeprecationWarning)
207
208         other_words = []
209         models = []
210         score_dics = []
211         for word in self.words:
212             if word != self.this_word:

```

AWESOME

 You skipped the word!

```

213             other_words.append(self.hwords[word])
214         try:
215             for num_states in range(self.min_n_components, self.max_n_components + 1):
216                 hmm_model = self.base_model(num_states)
217                 log_likelihood = hmm_model.score(self.X, self.lengths)
218                 models.append((log_likelihood, hmm_model))
219
220         # Note: Situation that may cause exception may be if have more parameters to fit
221         # than there are samples, so must catch exception when the model is invalid
222         except Exception as e:
223             # logging.exception('DIC Exception occurred: ', e)
224             pass
225         for index, model in enumerate(models):
226             log_likelihood, hmm_model = model
227             score_dic = log_likelihood - self.calc_avg_anti_log_likelihood(model, other_words)
228             score_dics.append(tuple([score_dic, model[1]]))
229         return self.calc_best_score_dic(score_dics)[1] if score_dics else None
230
231
232     class SelectorCV(ModelSelector):
233         """
234         Abbreviations:
235             - CV - Cross-Validation
236
237         About CV:
238             - Scoring the model simply using Log Likelihood calculated from
239             feature sequences it trained on, we expect more complex models
240             to have higher likelihoods, but doesn't inform us which would
241             have a "better" likelihood score on unseen data. The model will
242             likely overfit as complexity is added.
243             - Estimate the "better" Topology model using only training data
244             by comparing scores using Cross-Validation (CV).
245             - CV technique includes breaking-down the training set into "folds",
246             rotating which fold is "left out" of the training set.
247             The fold that is "left out" is scored for validation.
248             Use this as a proxy method of finding the
249             "best" model to use on "unseen data".
250             e.g. Given a set of word sequences broken-down into three folds
251             using scikit-learn Kfold class object.
252             - CV useful to limit over-validation
253
254         CV Equation:
255
256         Selection using CV Model:
257             - Higher the CV score the "better" the model.
258             - Select "best" model based on average log Likelihood
259             of cross-validation folds
260             - Loop from min_n_components to max_n_components
261             - Find the higher score(logL), the higher the better.
262             - Score that is "best" for SelectorCV is the
263             average Log Likelihood of Cross-Validation (CV) folds.
264
265         References:
266             [0] - http://scikit-learn.org/stable/modules/generated/sklearn.model\_selection.KFold.html
267             [1] - https://www.r-bloggers.com/aic-bic-vs-crossvalidation/
268         """
269
270         def calc_best_score_cv(self, score_cv):
271             # Max of list of lists comparing each item by value at index 0
272             return max(score_cv, key = lambda x: x[0])
273
274         def select(self):
275             warnings.filterwarnings("ignore", category=DeprecationWarning)
276             # logging.debug("Sequences: %r" % self.sequences)
277
278             # num_splits = min(3, len(self.sequences))
279             kf = KFold(n_splits = 3, shuffle = False, random_state = None)
280             log_likelihoods = []
281             score_cvs = []

```

```

282
283     for num_states in range(self.min_n_components, self.max_n_components + 1):
284         try:
285             # Check sufficient data to split using KFold
286             if len(self.sequences) > 2:
287                 # CV loop of breaking-down the sequence (training set) into "folds" where a fold
288                 # rotated out of the training set is tested by scoring for Cross-Validation (CV)
289                 for train_index, test_index in kf.split(self.sequences):
290                     # print("TRAIN indices:", train_index, "TEST indices:", test_index)
291
292                     # Training sequences split using KFold are recombined
293                     self.X, self.lengths = combine_sequences(train_index, self.sequences)
294
295                     # Test sequences split using KFold are recombined
296                     X_test, lengths_test = combine_sequences(test_index, self.sequences)

```

AWESOME

Very good making folds of training and testing!

```

297
298         hmm_model = self.base_model(num_states)

```

AWESOME

Nice, it will be fitted in the parent model!

```

299         log_likelihood = hmm_model.score(X_test, lengths_test)

```

AWESOME

Very good calculating the test score here.

```

300         else:
301             hmm_model = self.base_model(num_states)
302             log_likelihood = hmm_model.score(self.X, self.lengths)
303
304             log_likelihoods.append(log_likelihood)
305
306             # Find average Log Likelihood of CV fold
307             score_cvs_avg = np.mean(log_likelihoods)
308             score_cvs.append(tuple([score_cvs_avg, hmm_model]))
309
310         except Exception as e:
311             pass
312         return self.calc_best_score_cv(score_cvs)[1] if score_cvs else None
313

```

► my_recognizer.py

► asl_recognizer.html

RETURN TO PATH

[Student FAQ](#)