

Output tables for the test of Multiple comparisons.

June 12, 2017

1 Average rankings of Friedman test

Average ranks obtained by applying the Friedman procedure

| Algorithm | Ranking |
|-----------|---------|
| Base | 2.7344 |
| ADASYN | 5.1406 |
| SMOTE | 4.4062 |
| Bord | 4.1875 |
| NCL | 3.8438 |
| SMOTE+TL | 4.3125 |
| SMOTE+ENN | 4.5 |
| CCR | 6.875 |

Table 1: Average Rankings of the algorithms

Friedman statistic considering reduction performance (distributed according to chi-square with 7 degrees of freedom: 51.950521.

P-value computed by Friedman Test: 6.028686660997096E-9.

2 Post hoc comparisons

Results achieved on post hoc comparisons for $\alpha = 0.05$, $\alpha = 0.10$ and adjusted p-values.

2.1 P-values for $\alpha = 0.05$

| i | algorithms | $z = (R_0 - R_i)/SE$ | p | Shaffer |
|-----|------------------------|----------------------|----------|----------|
| 28 | Base vs. CCR | 6.761612 | 0 | 0.001786 |
| 27 | NCL vs. CCR | 4.950011 | 0.000001 | 0.002381 |
| 26 | Bord vs. CCR | 4.388669 | 0.000011 | 0.002381 |
| 25 | SMOTE+TL vs. CCR | 4.184545 | 0.000029 | 0.002381 |
| 24 | SMOTE vs. CCR | 4.031452 | 0.000055 | 0.002381 |
| 23 | Base vs. ADASYN | 3.92939 | 0.000085 | 0.002381 |
| 22 | SMOTE+ENN vs. CCR | 3.878359 | 0.000105 | 0.002381 |
| 21 | Base vs. SMOTE+ENN | 2.883254 | 0.003936 | 0.002381 |
| 20 | ADASYN vs. CCR | 2.832223 | 0.004623 | 0.0025 |
| 19 | Base vs. SMOTE | 2.73016 | 0.00633 | 0.002632 |
| 18 | Base vs. SMOTE+TL | 2.577067 | 0.009964 | 0.002778 |
| 17 | Base vs. Bord | 2.372943 | 0.017647 | 0.002941 |
| 16 | ADASYN vs. NCL | 2.117788 | 0.034193 | 0.003125 |
| 15 | Base vs. NCL | 1.811602 | 0.070048 | 0.003333 |
| 14 | ADASYN vs. Bord | 1.556447 | 0.119602 | 0.003571 |
| 13 | ADASYN vs. SMOTE+TL | 1.352322 | 0.176272 | 0.003846 |
| 12 | ADASYN vs. SMOTE | 1.199229 | 0.230439 | 0.004167 |
| 11 | NCL vs. SMOTE+ENN | 1.071652 | 0.283876 | 0.004545 |
| 10 | ADASYN vs. SMOTE+ENN | 1.046136 | 0.295498 | 0.005 |
| 9 | SMOTE vs. NCL | 0.918559 | 0.358326 | 0.005556 |
| 8 | NCL vs. SMOTE+TL | 0.765466 | 0.443994 | 0.00625 |
| 7 | Bord vs. NCL | 0.561341 | 0.574565 | 0.007143 |
| 6 | Bord vs. SMOTE+ENN | 0.51031 | 0.609834 | 0.008333 |
| 5 | SMOTE vs. Bord | 0.357217 | 0.720929 | 0.01 |
| 4 | SMOTE+TL vs. SMOTE+ENN | 0.306186 | 0.759463 | 0.0125 |
| 3 | Bord vs. SMOTE+TL | 0.204124 | 0.838256 | 0.016667 |
| 2 | SMOTE vs. SMOTE+TL | 0.153093 | 0.878325 | 0.025 |
| 1 | SMOTE vs. SMOTE+ENN | 0.153093 | 0.878325 | 0.05 |

Table 2: P-values Table for $\alpha = 0.05$

Shaffer's procedure rejects those hypotheses that have an unadjusted p-value ≤ 0.001786 .

2.2 P-values for $\alpha = 0.10$

| i | algorithms | $z = (R_0 - R_i)/SE$ | p | Shaffer |
|-----|------------------------|----------------------|----------|----------|
| 28 | Base vs. CCR | 6.761612 | 0 | 0.003571 |
| 27 | NCL vs. CCR | 4.950011 | 0.000001 | 0.004762 |
| 26 | Bord vs. CCR | 4.388669 | 0.000011 | 0.004762 |
| 25 | SMOTE+TL vs. CCR | 4.184545 | 0.000029 | 0.004762 |
| 24 | SMOTE vs. CCR | 4.031452 | 0.000055 | 0.004762 |
| 23 | Base vs. ADASYN | 3.92939 | 0.000085 | 0.004762 |
| 22 | SMOTE+ENN vs. CCR | 3.878359 | 0.000105 | 0.004762 |
| 21 | Base vs. SMOTE+ENN | 2.883254 | 0.003936 | 0.004762 |
| 20 | ADASYN vs. CCR | 2.832223 | 0.004623 | 0.00625 |
| 19 | Base vs. SMOTE | 2.73016 | 0.00633 | 0.00625 |
| 18 | Base vs. SMOTE+TL | 2.577067 | 0.009964 | 0.00625 |
| 17 | Base vs. Bord | 2.372943 | 0.017647 | 0.00625 |
| 16 | ADASYN vs. NCL | 2.117788 | 0.034193 | 0.00625 |
| 15 | Base vs. NCL | 1.811602 | 0.070048 | 0.006667 |
| 14 | ADASYN vs. Bord | 1.556447 | 0.119602 | 0.007143 |
| 13 | ADASYN vs. SMOTE+TL | 1.352322 | 0.176272 | 0.007692 |
| 12 | ADASYN vs. SMOTE | 1.199229 | 0.230439 | 0.008333 |
| 11 | NCL vs. SMOTE+ENN | 1.071652 | 0.283876 | 0.009091 |
| 10 | ADASYN vs. SMOTE+ENN | 1.046136 | 0.295498 | 0.01 |
| 9 | SMOTE vs. NCL | 0.918559 | 0.358326 | 0.011111 |
| 8 | NCL vs. SMOTE+TL | 0.765466 | 0.443994 | 0.0125 |
| 7 | Bord vs. NCL | 0.561341 | 0.574565 | 0.014286 |
| 6 | Bord vs. SMOTE+ENN | 0.51031 | 0.609834 | 0.016667 |
| 5 | SMOTE vs. Bord | 0.357217 | 0.720929 | 0.02 |
| 4 | SMOTE+TL vs. SMOTE+ENN | 0.306186 | 0.759463 | 0.025 |
| 3 | Bord vs. SMOTE+TL | 0.204124 | 0.838256 | 0.033333 |
| 2 | SMOTE vs. SMOTE+TL | 0.153093 | 0.878325 | 0.05 |
| 1 | SMOTE vs. SMOTE+ENN | 0.153093 | 0.878325 | 0.1 |

Table 3: P-values Table for $\alpha = 0.10$

Shaffer's procedure rejects those hypotheses that have an unadjusted p-value ≤ 0.003571 .

2.3 Adjusted p-values

| i | hypothesis | unadjusted p | p_{Shaf} |
|----|------------------------|----------------|------------|
| 1 | Base vs .CCR | 0 | 0 |
| 2 | NCL vs .CCR | 0.000001 | 0.000016 |
| 3 | Bord vs .CCR | 0.000011 | 0.000239 |
| 4 | SMOTE+TL vs .CCR | 0.000029 | 0.0006 |
| 5 | SMOTE vs .CCR | 0.000055 | 0.001164 |
| 6 | Base vs .ADASYN | 0.000085 | 0.001788 |
| 7 | SMOTE+ENN vs .CCR | 0.000105 | 0.002208 |
| 8 | Base vs .SMOTE+ENN | 0.003936 | 0.082654 |
| 9 | ADASYN vs .CCR | 0.004623 | 0.082654 |
| 10 | Base vs .SMOTE | 0.00633 | 0.101286 |
| 11 | Base vs .SMOTE+TL | 0.009964 | 0.159428 |
| 12 | Base vs .Bord | 0.017647 | 0.282352 |
| 13 | ADASYN vs .NCL | 0.034193 | 0.547088 |
| 14 | Base vs .NCL | 0.070048 | 1.050716 |
| 15 | ADASYN vs .Bord | 0.119602 | 1.554825 |
| 16 | ADASYN vs .SMOTE+TL | 0.176272 | 2.291538 |
| 17 | ADASYN vs .SMOTE | 0.230439 | 2.765265 |
| 18 | NCL vs .SMOTE+ENN | 0.283876 | 3.122641 |
| 19 | ADASYN vs .SMOTE+ENN | 0.295498 | 3.122641 |
| 20 | SMOTE vs .NCL | 0.358326 | 3.224938 |
| 21 | NCL vs .SMOTE+TL | 0.443994 | 3.551955 |
| 22 | Bord vs .NCL | 0.574565 | 4.021954 |
| 23 | Bord vs .SMOTE+ENN | 0.609834 | 4.021954 |
| 24 | SMOTE vs .Bord | 0.720929 | 4.021954 |
| 25 | SMOTE+TL vs .SMOTE+ENN | 0.759463 | 4.021954 |
| 26 | Bord vs .SMOTE+TL | 0.838256 | 4.021954 |
| 27 | SMOTE vs .SMOTE+TL | 0.878325 | 4.021954 |
| 28 | SMOTE vs .SMOTE+ENN | 0.878325 | 4.021954 |

Table 4: Adjusted p -values