## Output tables for the test of Multiple comparisons.

June 12, 2017

## 1 Average rankings of Friedman test

Average ranks obtained by applying the Friedman procedure

Table 1: Average Rankings of the algorithms

Friedman statistic considering reduction performance (distributed according to chi-square with 7 degrees of freedom: 12.177083.

## 2 Post hoc comparisons

Results achieved on post hoc comparisons for  $\alpha=0.05,\,\alpha=0.10$  and adjusted p-values.

## 2.1 P-values for $\alpha = 0.05$

i	algorithms	$z = (R_0 - R_i)/SE$	d	Shaffer
28	NCL vs. CCR	3.163924	0.001557	0.001786
27	Base vs. NCL	2.551552	0.010724	0.002381
26	SMOTE vs. NCL	2.143304	0.032089	0.002381
22	ADASYN vs. CCR	1.888148	0.059006	0.002381
24	NCL vs. SMOTE+ENN	1.786086	0.074085	0.002381
23	NCL vs. SMOTE+TL	1.735055	0.082731	0.002381
22	Bord vs. NCL	1.632993	0.10247	0.002381
21	Bord vs. CCR	1.530931	0.125786	0.002381
20	SMOTE+TL vs. CCR	1.428869	0.153042	0.0025
19	SMOTE+ENN vs. CCR	1.377838	0.168253	0.002632
18	Base vs. ADASYN	1.275776	0.202035	0.002778
17	ADASYN vs. NCL	1.275776	0.202035	0.002941
16	SMOTE vs. CCR	1.020621	0.307434	0.003125
15	Base vs. Bord	0.918559	0.358326	0.003333
14	ADASYN vs. SMOTE	0.867528	0.385653	0.003571
13	Base vs. SMOTE+TL	0.816497	0.414216	0.003846
12	Base vs. SMOTE+ENN	0.765466	0.443994	0.004167
11	Base vs. CCR	0.612372	0.540291	0.004545
10	ADASYN vs. SMOTE+ENN	0.51031	0.609834	0.005
6	SMOTE vs. Bord	0.51031	0.609834	0.005556
∞	ADASYN vs. SMOTE+TL	0.459279	0.646034	0.00625
7	Base vs. SMOTE	0.408248	0.683091	0.007143
9	SMOTE vs. SMOTE+TL	0.408248	0.683091	0.008333
2	ADASYN vs. Bord	0.357217	0.720929	0.01
4	SMOTE vs. SMOTE+ENN	0.357217	0.720929	0.0125
3	Bord vs. SMOTE+ENN	0.153093	0.878325	0.016667
2	Bord vs. SMOTE+TL	0.102062	0.918707	0.025
1	SMOTE+TL vs. SMOTE+ENN	0.051031	0.959301	0.05

Table 2: P-values Table for  $\alpha = 0.05$ 

	ı																											1
Shaffer	0.003571	0.004762	0.004762	0.004762	0.004762	0.004762	0.004762	0.004762	0.005	0.005263	0.005556	0.005882	0.00625	0.006667	0.007143	0.007692	0.008333	0.009091	0.01	0.011111	0.0125	0.014286	0.016667	0.02	0.025	0.033333	0.05	0.1
d	0.001557	0.010724	0.032089	0.059006	0.074085	0.082731	0.10247	0.125786	0.153042	0.168253	0.202035	0.202035	0.307434	0.358326	0.385653	0.414216	0.443994	0.540291	0.609834	0.609834	0.646034	0.683091	0.683091	0.720929	0.720929	0.878325	0.918707	0.959301
$z = (R_0 - R_i)/SE$	3.163924	2.551552	2.143304	1.888148	1.786086	1.735055	1.632993	1.530931	1.428869	1.377838	1.275776	1.275776	1.020621	0.918559	0.867528	0.816497	0.765466	0.612372	0.51031	0.51031	0.459279	0.408248	0.408248	0.357217	0.357217	0.153093	0.102062	0.051031
algorithms	NCL vs. CCR	Base vs. NCL	SMOTE vs. NCL	ADASYN vs. CCR	NCL vs. SMOTE+ENN	NCL vs. SMOTE+TL	Bord vs. NCL	Bord vs. CCR	SMOTE+TL vs. CCR	SMOTE+ENN vs. CCR	Base vs. ADASYN	ADASYN vs. NCL	SMOTE vs. CCR	Base vs. Bord	ADASYN vs. SMOTE	Base vs. SMOTE+TL	Base vs. SMOTE+ENN	Base vs. CCR	ADASYN vs. SMOTE+ENN	SMOTE vs. Bord	ADASYN vs. SMOTE+TL	Base vs. SMOTE	SMOTE vs. SMOTE+TL	ADASYN vs. Bord	SMOTE vs. SMOTE+ENN	Bord vs. SMOTE+ENN	Bord vs. SMOTE+TL	SMOTE+TL vs. SMOTE+ENN
i	28	27	56	25	24	23	22	21	20	19	18	17	16	15	14	13	12	11	10	6	<sub>∞</sub>	-1	9	ಬ	4	3	2	п

Table 3: P-values Table for  $\alpha = 0.10$ 

Shaffer's procedure rejects those hypotheses that have an unadjusted p-value  $\leq 0.003571$ .

-	hypothesis	unadjusted $p$	$p_{Shaf}$
1	NCL vs.CCR	0.001557	0.043584
2	Base vs .NCL	0.010724	0.225213
3	SMOTE vs.NCL	0.032089	0.673863
4	ADASYN vs. CCR	0.059006	1.239127
50	NCL vs .SMOTE+ENN	0.074085	1.555791
9	NCL vs .SMOTE+TL	0.082731	1.737351
7	Bord vs .NCL	0.10247	2.151879
<sub>∞</sub>	Bord vs .CCR	0.125786	2.641515
6	SMOTE+TL vs .CCR	0.153042	2.641515
10	SMOTE+ENN vs.CCR	0.168253	2.692053
11	Base vs .ADASYN	0.202035	3.232556
12	ADASYN vs. NCL	0.202035	3.232556
13	SMOTE vs.CCR	0.307434	4.918947
14	Base vs .Bord	0.358326	5.374897
15	ADASYN vs. SMOTE	0.385653	5.374897
16	Base vs .SMOTE+TL	0.414216	5.38481
17	Base vs.SMOTE+ENN	0.443994	5.38481
18	Base vs .CCR	0.540291	5.943205
19	ADASYN vs .SMOTE+ENN	0.609834	6.09834
20	SMOTE vs .Bord	0.609834	6.09834
21	ADASYN vs .SMOTE+TL	0.646034	6.09834
22	Base vs .SMOTE	0.683091	6.09834
23	SMOTE vs. SMOTE+TL	0.683091	6.09834
24	ADASYN vs. Bord	0.720929	6.09834
25	SMOTE vs .SMOTE+ENN	0.720929	6.09834
26	Bord vs .SMOTE+ENN	0.878325	6.09834
27	Bord vs .SMOTE+TL	0.918707	6.09834
28	SMOTE+TL vs .SMOTE+ENN	0.959301	6.09834

Table 4: Adjusted p-values