Output tables for the test of Multiple comparisons.

June 12, 2017

1 Average rankings of Friedman test

Average ranks obtained by applying the Friedman procedure

E E E E E E E E E E E E E E E E E E E	1	6.9375	$\frac{2.9688}{4.3281}$	5.25	5.0625	3.875	5.3906	2.1875
Base ADASY SMOT] Bord NCL NCL MOTE+	III IVAIINIII				<u>.</u> .			
SS	Algorium	Base	ADASY SMOTI	Bord	NCF	SMOTE+	SMOTE+I	CCR

Table 1: Average Rankings of the algorithms

Friedman statistic considering reduction performance (distributed according to chi-square with 7 degrees of freedom: 83.872396.

2 Post hoc comparisons

Results achieved on post hoc comparisons for $\alpha=0.05,\,\alpha=0.10$ and adjusted p-values.

2.1 P-values for $\alpha = 0.05$

algorithms	$z = (R_0 - R_i)/SE$	d	Shaffer
Base vs. CCR	7.756718	0	0.001786
Base vs. ADASYN	6.480942	0	0.002381
SMOTE+ENN vs. CCR	5.230681	0	0.002381
Base vs. SMOTE+TL	5.001042	0.000001	0.002381
Bord vs. CCR	5.001042	0.000001	0.002381
NCL vs. CCR	4.694855	0.000003	0.002381
Base vs. SMOTE	4.261092	0.00002	0.002381
ADASYN vs. SMOTE+ENN	3.954905	0.000077	0.002381
ADASYN vs. Bord	3.725266	0.000195	0.003125
SMOTE vs. CCR	3.495626	0.000473	0.003125
ADASYN vs. NCL	3.419079	0.000628	0.003125
Base vs. NCL	3.061862	0.0022	0.003125
Base vs. Bord	2.755676	0.005857	0.003125
SMOTE+TL vs. CCR	2.755676	0.005857	0.003333
Base vs. SMOTE+ENN	2.526036	0.011536	0.003571
SMOTE+TL vs. SMOTE+ENN	2.475005	0.013323	0.003846
Bord vs. SMOTE+TL	2.245366	0.024745	0.004167
ADASYN vs. SMOTE	2.21985	0.026429	0.004545
NCL vs. SMOTE+TL	1.939179	0.052479	0.005
SMOTE vs. SMOTE+ENN	1.735055	0.082731	0.005556
SMOTE vs. Bord	1.505416	0.132217	0.00625
ADASYN vs. SMOTE+TL	1.4799	0.1389	0.007143
ADASYN vs. CCR	1.275776	0.202035	0.008333
SMOTE vs. NCL	1.199229	0.230439	0.01
SMOTE vs. SMOTE+TL	0.73995	0.45933	0.0125
NCL vs. SMOTE+ENN	0.535826	0.592079	0.016667
Bord vs. NCL	0.306186	0.759463	0.025
Bord vs. SMOTE+ENN	0.22964	0.818372	0.05

Table 2: P-values Table for $\alpha = 0.05$

Shaffer	0.003571	0.004762	0.004762	0.004762	0.004762	0.004762	0.004762	0.004762	0.00625	0.00625	0.00625	0.00625	0.00625	0.006667	0.007692	0.007692	0.008333	0.009091	0.01	0.0111111	0.0125	0.014286	0.016667	0.02	0.025	0.033333	0.05	0.1
d	0	0	0	0.000001	0.000001	0.000003	0.00002	0.000077	0.000195	0.000473	0.000628	0.0022	0.005857	0.005857	0.011536	0.013323	0.024745	0.026429	0.052479	0.082731	0.132217	0.1389	0.202035	0.230439	0.45933	0.592079	0.759463	0.818372
$z = (R_0 - R_i)/SE$	7.756718	6.480942	5.230681	5.001042	5.001042	4.694855	4.261092	3.954905	3.725266	3.495626	3.419079	3.061862	2.755676	2.755676	2.526036	2.475005	2.245366	2.21985	1.939179	1.735055	1.505416	1.4799	1.275776	1.199229	0.73995	0.535826	0.306186	0.22964
algorithms	Base vs. CCR	Base vs. ADASYN	SMOTE+ENN vs. CCR	Base vs. SMOTE+TL	Bord vs. CCR	NCL vs. CCR	Base vs. SMOTE	ADASYN vs. SMOTE+ENN	ADASYN vs. Bord	SMOTE vs. CCR	ADASYN vs. NCL	Base vs. NCL	Base vs. Bord	SMOTE+TL vs. CCR	Base vs. SMOTE+ENN	SMOTE+TL vs. SMOTE+ENN	Bord vs. SMOTE+TL	ADASYN vs. SMOTE	NCL vs. SMOTE+TL	SMOTE vs. SMOTE+ENN	SMOTE vs. Bord	ADASYN vs. SMOTE+TL	ADASYN vs. CCR	SMOTE vs. NCL	SMOTE vs. SMOTE+TL	NCL vs. SMOTE+ENN	Bord vs. NCL	Bord vs. SMOTE+ENN
i	28	27	56	25	24	23	22	21	20	19	18	17	16	15	14	13	12	11	10	6	œ	-	9	ro	4	က	7	1

Table 3: P-values Table for $\alpha = 0.10$

Shaffer's procedure rejects those hypotheses that have an unadjusted p-value ≤ 0.003571 .

·i	hypothesis	unadjusted p	p_{Shaf}
1	Base vs .CCR	0	0
2	Base vs .ADASYN	0	0
3	SMOTE+ENN vs.CCR	0	0.000004
4	Base vs .SMOTE+TL	0.000001	0.000012
20	Bord vs .CCR	0.000001	0.000012
9	NCL vs .CCR	0.000003	0.000056
7	Base vs .SMOTE	0.00002	0.000427
∞	ADASYN vs .SMOTE+ENN	0.000077	0.001608
6	ADASYN vs. Bord	0.000195	0.003122
10	SMOTE vs. CCR	0.000473	0.007567
11	ADASYN vs. NCL	0.000628	0.010053
12	Base vs .NCL	0.0022	0.035194
13	Base vs .Bord	0.005857	0.093714
14	SMOTE+TL vs .CCR	0.005857	0.093714
15	Base vs.SMOTE+ENN	0.011536	0.149965
16	SMOTE+TL vs .SMOTE+ENN	0.013323	0.173204
17	Bord vs .SMOTE+TL	0.024745	0.296936
18	ADASYN vs. SMOTE	0.026429	0.296936
19	NCL vs.SMOTE+TL	0.052479	0.524795
20	SMOTE vs .SMOTE+ENN	0.082731	0.744579
21	SMOTE vs .Bord	0.132217	1.057738
22	ADASYN vs .SMOTE+TL	0.1389	1.057738
23	ADASYN vs. CCR	0.202035	1.212208
24	SMOTE vs.NCL	0.230439	1.212208
22	SMOTE vs .SMOTE+TL	0.45933	1.837321
26	NCL vs .SMOTE+ENN	0.592079	1.837321
27	Bord vs .NCL	0.759463	1.837321
28	Bord vs .SMOTE+ENN	0.818372	1.837321

Table 4: Adjusted p-values