Proposed title: The Noisy Work of Uncertainty Visualisation Research

Harriet Mason Dianne Cook Sarah Goodwin Emi Tanaka
Susan VanderPlas

1 Rationale

Better ways of including a representation of the uncertainty in a data visualisation is a focus of recent research activity. A problem with the current literature is that there is a lack of clarity in the definition of uncertainty, and what it means to represent it in a plot. This confusion can also be seen in literature describing experiments to test effectiveness of choices of different uncertainty representation. The purpose of this review article is to summarise the current literature, provide workable definitions, and illustrate with examples. It is hope that it will be useful to guide new graphics methodology and experimental work.

2 Outline

1. Common uses of the terms "uncertainty visualisation": Here we will provide some background to the use of the term "uncertainty visualisation" and tie it to statistical definitions of uncertainty.
2. Dangers of ignoring uncertainty representation in a visualisation. This part motivates the reason for the importance of this area of research.
3. Review of current approaches to representing uncertainty in plots, as gathered from discipline journals in information visualisation, statistics, environmental science and psychology.
4. Review of literature describing experiments testing effectiveness of different representations. The information visualisation literature is especially prolific in describing experiments assessing the relative merits of different uncertainty visualisations, and this section will critically summarise these efforts, and propose refining of procedures.
5. Examples:

- spatial data poses substantial challenges because of the difficulties of using the page for the map coordinates, and hence little room for representing uncertatinty. It also has been a place with useful recent work, providing some good solutions.
- comparing groups (boxplots, letter value plots, dotplots) OR
- confidence intervals, vs rainclouds, vs dotplots, vs transparency

6. Recommendations for research directions. Here we will gather the discussion into some suggestions for framing new work, developing methodology and designing experiments.

References

Amar, Robert, James Eagan, and John Stasko. 2005. "Low-level components of analytic activity in information visualization," 111–17. https://doi.org/10.1109/INFVIS.2005.1532136.

Anscombe, F. J. 1973. "Graphs in Statistical Analysis." *The American Statistician* 27 (1): 17–21. https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/00031305.1973.10478966.

Begg, Steve H., Matthew B. Welsh, and Reidar B. Bratvold. 2014. *Uncertainty Vs. Variability: What's the Difference and Why Is It Important?* Vol. SPE Hydrocarbon Economics and Evaluation Symposium. SPE Hydrocarbon Economics and Evaluation Symposium. https://doi.org/10.2118/169850-MS.

Bella, Sarah, Fiona Fidler, Jennifer Williams, and Geoff Cumming. 2005. "Researchers misunderstand confidence intervals and standard error bars." *Psychological Methods* 10 (4): 389–96. https://doi.org/10.1037/1082-989X.10.4.389.

Benjamin, Daniel M., and David V. Budescu. 2018. "The role of type and source of uncertainty on the processing of climate models projections." *Frontiers in Psychology* 9 (MAR): 1–17. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2018.00403.

Bivand, Roger, and Colin Rundel. 2023. *Rgeos: Interface to Geometry Engine - Open Source ('GEOS')*. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=rgeos.

Blenkinsop, Steve, Pete Fisher, Lucy Bastin, and Jo Wood. 2000. "Evaluating the perception of uncertainty in alternative visualization strategies." *Cartographica* 37 (1): 1–13. https://doi.org/10.3138/3645-4v22-0m23-3t52.

Boone, Alexander P., Peri Gunalp, and Mary Hegarty. 2018. "Explicit versus actionable knowledge: The influence of explaining graphical conventions on interpretation of hurricane forecast visualizations." *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Applied* 24 (3): 275–95. https://doi.org/10.1037/xap0000166.

Boukhelifa, Nadia, Anastasia Bezerianos, Tobias Isenberg, and Jean Daniel Fekete. 2012. "Evaluating sketchiness as a visual variable for the depiction of qualitative uncertainty." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 18 (12): 2769–78. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2012.220.

Boukhelifa, Nadia, Marc Emmanuel Perrin, Samuel Huron, and James Eagan. 2017. "How data workers cope with uncertainty: A task characterisation study." *Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems - Proceedings* 2017-May (May): 3645–56. https://doi.org/10.1145/3025453.3025738.

Bradley, Valerie C., Shiro Kuriwaki, Michael Isakov, Dino Sejdinovic, Xiao Li Meng, and Seth Flaxman. 2021. "Unrepresentative big surveys significantly overestimated US vaccine uptake." *Nature* 600 (7890): 695–700. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-021-04198-4.

Buja, Andreas, Dianne Cook, Heike Hofmann, Michael Lawrence, Eun Kyung Lee, Deborah F. Swayne, and Hadley Wickham. 2009. "Statistical inference for exploratory data analysis and model diagnostics." *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences* 367 (1906): 4361–83. https://doi.org/10.1098/rsta.2009.0120.

Carlin, John B., and Margarita Moreno-Betancur. 2023. "On the uses and abuses of regression models: a call for reform of statistical practice and teaching." http://arxiv.org/abs/2309.06668.

Carr, Daniel B., Anthony R. Olsen, and Denis White. 1992. "Hexagon Mosaic Maps for Display of Univariate and Bivariate Geographical Data." *Cartography and Geographic Information Systems* 19 (4): 228–36. https://doi.org/10.1559/152304092783721231.

Cheong, Lisa, Susanne Bleisch, Allison Kealy, Kevin Tolhurst, Tom Wilkening, and Matt Duckham. 2016. "Evaluating the impact of visualization of wildfire hazard upon decision-making under uncertainty." *International Journal of Geographical Information Science* 30 (7): 1377–1404. https://doi.org/10.1080/13658816.2015.1131829.

Cleveland, William S., and Robert McGill. 1984. "Graphical perception: Theory, experimentation, and application to the development of graphical methods." *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 79 (387): 531–54. https://doi.org/10.1080/01621459.1984.10478080.

Correll, Michael, and Michael Gleicher. 2014. "Error bars considered harmful: Exploring alternate encodings for mean and error." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 20 (12): 2142–51. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2014.2346298.

Correll, Michael, Dominik Moritz, and Jeffrey Heer. 2018. "Value-suppressing uncertainty Palettes." *Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems - Proceedings* 2018-April: 1–11. https://doi.org/10.1145/3173574.3174216.

Daniel, Kahneman. 2017. *Thinking, Fast and Slow*. Penguin Press.

Daradkeh, Mohammad. 2015. "Exploring the use of an information visualization tool for decision support under uncertainty and risk." *ACM International Conference Proceeding Series* 24-26-Sept. https://doi.org/10.1145/2832987.2833050.

Davis, Russell, Xiaoying Pu, Yiren Ding, Brian D. Hall, Karen Bonilla, Mi Feng, Matthew Kay, and Lane Harrison. 2022. "The Risks of Ranking: Revisiting Graphical Perception to Model Individual Differences in Visualization Performance." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* PP: 1–16. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2022.3226463.

Dyson, Freeman J. 2010. "Birds and frogs in mathematics and physics." *Physics-Uspekhi* 53 (8): 825–34. https://doi.org/10.3367/ufne.0180.201008f.0859.

Fernandes, Michael, Logan Walls, Sean Munson, Jessica Hullman, and Matthew Kay. 2018. "Uncertainty displays using quantile dotplots or CDFs improve transit decision-making." *Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems - Proceedings* 2018-April: 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1145/3173574.3173718.

Fischhoff, Baruch, and Alex L. Davis. 2014. "Communicating scientific uncertainty." *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 111: 13664–71.

https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1317504111.

Franconeri, Steven L. 2021. "Three Perceptual Tools for Seeing and Understanding Visualized Data." *Current Directions in Psychological Science* 30 (5): 367–75. https://doi.org/10.1177/09637214211009512.

Gohel, David, and Panagiotis Skintzos. 2024. *Flextable: Functions for Tabular Reporting*. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=flextable.

Goldstein, Daniel G., and David Rothschild. 2014. "Lay understanding of probability distributions." *Judgment and Decision Making* 9 (1): 1–14.

Grewal, Yashvir, Sarah Goodwin, and Tim Dwyer. 2021. "Visualising Temporal Uncertainty: A Taxonomy and Call for Systematic Evaluation." *IEEE Pacific Visualization Symposium* 2021-April (April): 41–45. https://doi.org/10.1109/PACIFICVIS52677.2021.00013.

Griethe, Henning, and Heidrun Schumann. 2006. "The Visualization of Uncertain Data: Methods and Problems." In *SimVis*, 6:143–56.

Gschwandtner, Theresia, Markus Bögl, Paolo Federico, and Silvia Miksch. 2016. "Visual Encodings of Temporal Uncertainty: A Comparative User Study." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 22 (1): 539–48. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2015.2467752.

Gustafson, Abel, and Ronald E. Rice. 2019. "The Effects of Uncertainty Frames in Three Science Communication Topics." *Science Communication* 41 (6): 679–706. https://doi.org/10.1177/1075547019870811.

Hofman, Jake M., Daniel G. Goldstein, and Jessica Hullman. 2020. "How Visualizing Inferential Uncertainty Can Mislead Readers about Treatment Effects in Scientific Results." *Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems - Proceedings*. https://doi.org/10.1145/3313831.3376454.

Hofmann, Heike, Lendie Follett, Mahbubul Majumder, and Dianne Cook. 2012. "Graphical Tests for Power Comparison of Competing Designs." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 18 (12): 2441–48. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2012.230.

Hullman, Jessica. 2016. "Why evaluating uncertainty visualization is error prone." *ACM International Conference Proceeding Series* 24-October: 143–51. https://doi.org/10.1145/2993901.2993919.

———. 2020. "Why Authors Don't Visualize Uncertainty." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 26 (1): 130–39. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2019.2934287.

Hullman, Jessica, and Andrew Gelman. 2021. "Designing for Interactive Exploratory Data Analysis Requires Theories of Graphical Inference." *Harvard Data Science Review*, 1–70. https://doi.org/10.1162/99608f92.3ab8a587.

Hullman, Jessica, Matthew Kay, Yea Seul Kim, and Samana Shrestha. 2018. "Imagining Replications: Graphical Prediction Discrete Visualizations Improve Recall Estimation of Effect Uncertainty." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 24 (1): 446–56. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2017.2743898.

Hullman, Jessica, Xiaoli Qiao, Michael Correll, Alex Kale, and Matthew Kay. 2019. "In Pursuit of Error: A Survey of Uncertainty Visualization Evaluation." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 25 (1): 903–13. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2018.2864889.

Hullman, Jessica, Paul Resnick, and Eytan Adar. 2015. "Hypothetical outcome plots outperform error bars and violin plots for inferences about reliability of variable ordering." *PLoS ONE* 10 (11). https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0142444.

Ibrekk, Harald, and M. Granger Morgan. 1987. "Graphical Communication of Uncertain Quantities to Nontechnical People." *Risk Analysis* 7 (4): 519–29. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1539-6924.1987.tb00488.x.

Kale, Alex, Matthew Kay, and Jessica Hullman. 2019. "Decision-making under uncertainty in research synthesis: Designing for the garden of forking paths." *Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems - Proceedings*. https://doi.org/10.1145/3290605.3300432.

———. 2021. "Visual reasoning strategies for effect size judgments and decisions." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 27 (2): 272–82. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2020.3030335.

Kale, Alex, Francis Nguyen, Matthew Kay, and Jessica Hullman. 2018. "Hypothetical Outcome Plots Help Untrained Observers Judge Trends in Ambiguous Data." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 25 (1): 892–902.

Kay, Matthew. 2019. "How Much Value Should an Uncertainty Palette Suppress if an Uncertainty Palette Should Suppress Value? Statistical and Perceptual Perspectives," October. https://doi.org/10.31219/osf.io/6xcnw.

———. 2023. "ggdist : Visualizations of Distributions and Uncertainty in the Grammar of Graphics k E." https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7770984.Index.

Kay, Matthew, Tara Kola, Jessica R. Hullman, and Sean A. Munson. 2016. "When (ish) is my bus? User-centered visualizations of uncertainty in everyday, mobile predictive systems." *Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems - Proceedings*, 5092–5103. https://doi.org/10.1145/2858036.2858558.

Kim, Yea Seul, Logan A. Walls, Peter Krafft, and Jessica Hullman. 2019. "A Bayesian cognition approach to improve data visualization." *Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems - Proceedings*, 1–14. https://doi.org/10.1145/3290605.3300912.

Kinkeldey, Christoph, Alan M. MacEachren, and Jochen Schiewe. 2014. "How to assess visual communication of uncertainty? a systematic review of geospatial uncertainty visualisation user studies." *Cartographic Journal* 51 (4): 372–86. https://doi.org/10.1179/1743277414Y.0000000099.

Kosslyn, Stephen M. 2006. *Graph Design for the Eye and Mind*. OUP USA.

Kuhnert, P. M., D. E. Pagendam, R. Bartley, D. W. Gladish, S. E. Lewis, and Z. T. Bainbridge. 2018. "Making management decisions in the face of uncertainty: A case study using the Burdekin catchment in the Great Barrier Reef." *Marine and Freshwater Research* 69 (8): 1187–1200. https://doi.org/10.1071/MF17237.

Li, Weihao, Dianne Cook, Emi Tanaka, and Susan VanderPlas. 2024. "A Plot Is Worth a Thousand Tests: Assessing Residual Diagnostics with the Lineup Protocol." *Journal of Computational and Graphical Statistics*, May, 1–19. https://doi.org/10.1080/10618600.2024.2344612.

Locke, Steph, and Lucy D'Agostino McGowan. 2018. *datasauRus: Datasets from the Datasaurus Dozen*. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=datasauRus.

Lucchesi, Lydia R., and Christopher K. Wikle. 2017. "Visualizing uncertainty in areal data

with bivariate choropleth maps, map pixelation and glyph rotation." *Stat* 6 (1): 292–302. https://doi.org/10.1002/sta4.150.

Lucchesi, Lydia, and Petra Kuhnert. 2020. *Vizumap: Visualizing Uncertainty in Spatial Data*.

Lucchesi, Lydia, Petra Kuhnert, and Christopher Wikle. 2021. "Vizumap: an R package for visualising uncertainty in spatial data." *Journal of Open Source Software* 6 (59): 2409. https://doi.org/10.21105/joss.02409.

MacEachren, Alan M. 1992. "cartographic perspectives Visualizing Uncertain Information." *Cartographic Perspectives* 13: 10–19.

Maceachren, Alan M., Robert E. Roth, James O'Brien, Bonan Li, Derek Swingley, and Mark Gahegan. 2012. "Visual semiotics & uncertainty visualization: An empirical study." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 18 (12): 2496–2505. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2012.279.

Mack, Arien. 2003. "Inattentional Blindness: Looking Without Seeing." *Current Directions in Psychological Science* 12 (5): 180–84.

Manski, Charles F. 2020. "The lure of incredible certitude." *Economics and Philosophy* 36 (2): 216–45. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0266267119000105.

Matejka, Justin, and George Fitzmaurice. 2017. "Same Stats, Different Graphs: Generating Datasets with Varied Appearance and Identical Statistics Through Simulated Annealing." In *Proceedings of the 2017 CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems*, 1290–94. CHI '17. New York, NY, USA: Association for Computing Machinery. https://doi.org/10.1145/3025453.3025912.

Meng, Xiao Li. 2014. "A trio of inference problems that could win you a nobel prize in statistics (if you help fund it)." *Past, Present, and Future of Statistical Science*, 537–62. https://doi.org/10.1201/b16720-52.

———. 2021. "Enhancing (publications on) data quality: Deeper data minding and fuller data confession" 184 (4): 1161–75. https://doi.org/10.1111/rssa.12762.

Moritz, Dominik, Danyel Fisher, Bolin Ding, and Chi Wang. 2017. "Trust, but Verify: Optimistic Visualizations of Approximate Queries for Exploring Big Data." In *Proceedings of the 2017 CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems*, 2904–15.

Munzner, Tamara. 2009. "A nested model for visualization design and validation." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 15 (6): 921–28. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2009.111.

Ndlovu, Akim, Hilson Shrestha, and Lane T Harrison. 2023. "Taken by Surprise? Evaluating How Bayesian Surprise & Suppression Influences Peoples' Takeaways in Map Visualizations." In *2023 IEEE Visualization and Visual Analytics (VIS)*, 136–40. IEEE.

Neuwirth, Erich. 2022. *RColorBrewer: ColorBrewer Palettes*. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=RColorBrewer.

Newburger, Eric, Michael Correll, and Niklas Elmqvist. 2022. "Fitting Bell Curves to Data Distributions Using Visualization." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 29 (12): 5372–83. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2022.3210763.

Newman, George E., and Brian J. Scholl. 2012. "Bar graphs depicting averages are perceptually misinterpreted: The within-the-bar bias." *Psychonomic Bulletin and Review* 19 (4): 601–7. https://doi.org/10.3758/s13423-012-0247-5.

North, Chris. 2006. "Toward measuring visualization insight." *IEEE Computer Graphics and Applications* 26 (3): 6–9. https://doi.org/10.1109/MCG.2006.70.

Nurse, Matthew, and Will Grant. 2020. "I'll See It When i Believe It: Motivated Numeracy in Perceptions of Climate Change Risk." *Environmental Communication* 14 (2): 184–201.

O'Neill, Onora. 2018. "Linking Trust to Trustworthiness." *International Journal of Philosophical Studies* 26 (2): 293–300. https://doi.org/10.1080/09672559.2018.1454637.

Olston, C., and J. D. Mackinlay. 2002. "Visualizing data with bounded uncertainty." *Proceedings - IEEE Symposium on Information Visualization, INFO VIS* 2002-Janua: 37–40. https://doi.org/10.1109/INFVIS.2002.1173145.

Otsuka, Jun. 2023. *Thinking About Statistics: The Philosophical Foundations*. 1st ed. New York: Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003319061.

Padilla, Lace, Matthew Kay, and Jessica Hullman. 2022. "Computational Statistics in Data Science." In, 405–26. John Wiley & Sons.

Padilla, Lace, Maia Powell, Matthew Kay, and Jessica Hullman. 2021. "Uncertain About Uncertainty: How Qualitative Expressions of Forecaster Confidence Impact Decision-Making With Uncertainty Visualizations." *Frontiers in Psychology* 11 (January). https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2020.579267.

Padilla, Lace, Ian Ruginski, and Sarah Creem-Regehr. 2017. "Effects of ensemble and summary displays on interpretations of geospatial uncertainty data." *Cognitive Research: Principles and Implications* 2 (1). https://doi.org/10.1186/s41235-017-0076-1.

Pang, Alex T., Craig M. Wittenbrink, and Suresh K. Lodha. 1997. "Approaches to uncertainty visualization." *Visual Computer* 13 (8): 370–90. https://doi.org/10.1007/s003710050111.

Pebesma, Edzer, and Roger Bivand. 2023. *Spatial Data Science: With applications in R*. Chapman and Hall/CRC. https://doi.org/10.1201/9780429459016.

Pham, Binh, Alex Streit, and Ross Brown. 2009. "Visualization of information uncertainty: Progress and challenges." In *Advanced Information and Knowledge Processing*, 36:19–48. Springer-Verlag London Ltd. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-84800-269-2_2.

Potter, K., J. Kniss, R. Riesenfeld, and C. R. Johnson. 2010. "Visualizing summary statistics and uncertainty." *Computer Graphics Forum* 29 (3): 823–32. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8659.2009.01677.x.

Potter, Kristin, Paul Rosen, and Chris R. Johnson. 2012. "From quantification to visualization: A taxonomy of uncertainty visualization approaches." *IFIP Advances in Information and Communication Technology* 377 AICT: 226–47. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-32677-6_15.

Pu, Xiaoying, and Matthew Kay. 2020. "A Probabilistic Grammar of Graphics." *Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems - Proceedings*. https://doi.org/10.1145/3313831.3376466.

Refsgaard, Jens Christian, Jeroen P. van der Sluijs, Anker Lajer Højberg, and Peter A. Vanrolleghem. 2007. "Uncertainty in the environmental modelling process - A framework and guidance." *Environmental Modelling and Software* 22 (11): 1543–56. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsoft.2007.02.004.

Roy Chowdhury, Niladri, Dianne Cook, Heike Hofmann, Mahbubul Majumder, Eun-Kyung Lee, and Amy L. Toth. 2015. "Using Visual Statistical Inference to Better Understand

Random Class Separations in High Dimension, Low Sample Size Data." *Computational Statistics* 30 (2): 293–316. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00180-014-0534-x.

Sanyal, Jibonananda, Song Zhang, Gargi Bhattacharya, Phil Amburn, and Robert J. Moorhead. 2009. "A user study to compare four uncertainty visualization methods for 1D and 2D datasets." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 15 (6): 1209–18. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2009.114.

Sarma, Abhraneel, Xiaoying Pu, Yuan Cui, Michael Correll, Eli T Brown, and Matthew Kay. 2024. "Odds and Insights: Decision Quality in Exploratory Data Analysis Under Uncertainty." In *Proceedings of the CHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems*. CHI '24. New York, NY, USA: Association for Computing Machinery. https://doi.org/10.1145/3613904.3641995.

Simons, Daniel J, and Christopher F Chabris. 1999. "Gorillas in Our Midst: Sustained Inattentional Blindness for Dynamic Events." *Perception* 28 (9): 1059–74.

Simunovic, MP. 2010. "Colour Vision Deficiency." *Eye* 24 (5): 747–55.

Slingsby, Aidan, Richard Reeve, and Claire Harris. 2023. "Gridded Glyphmaps for Supporting Spatial COVID-19 Modelling." https://www.staff.

Slowikowski, Kamil. 2024. *Ggrepel: Automatically Position Non-Overlapping Text Labels with 'Ggplot2'*. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=ggrepel.

Smart, Stephen, and Danielle Albers Szafir. 2019. "Measuring the separability of shape, size, and color in scatterplots." *Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems - Proceedings*, 1–14. https://doi.org/10.1145/3290605.3300899.

Spiegelhalter, David. 2017. "Risk and uncertainty communication." *Annual Review of Statistics and Its Application* 4: 31–60. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-statistics-010814-020148.

Stauffer, Reto, Georg J. Mayr, Markus Dabernig, and Achim Zeileis. 2009. "Somewhere over the Rainbow: How to Make Effective Use of Colors in Meteorological Visualizations." *Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society* 96 (2): 203–16. https://doi.org/10.1175/BAMS-D-13-00155.1.

Sterzik, Anna, Monique Meuschke, Douglas W. Cunningham, and Kai Lawonn. 2023. "Perceptually Uniform Construction of Illustrative Textures." http://arxiv.org/abs/2308.03644.

Strochak, Sarah, Kyle Ueyama, and Aaron Williams. 2024. *Urbnmapr: State and County Shapefiles in Sf and Tibble Format*. https://github.com/UrbanInstitute/urbnmapr.

Suh, Ashley, Gabriel Appleby, Erik W. Anderson, Luca Finelli, Remco Chang, and Dylan Cashman. 2023. "Are Metrics Enough? Guidelines for Communicating and Visualizing Predictive Models to Subject Matter Experts." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 14 (8). https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2023.3259341.

Thomson, Judi, Elizabeth Hetzler, Alan MacEachren, Mark Gahegan, and Misha Pavel. 2005. "A typology for visualizing uncertainty." *Visualization and Data Analysis 2005* 5669 (March 2005): 146. https://doi.org/10.1117/12.587254.

Tierney, Nicholas, and Dianne Cook. 2023. "Expanding Tidy Data Principles to Facilitate Missing Data Exploration, Visualization and Assessment of Imputations." *Journal of Statistical Software* 105 (7): 1–31. https://doi.org/10.18637/jss.v105.i07.

Tomasetti, Nathaniel, and Dianne Cook. 2015. "Comparing the Power of Plot Designs to Reveal Correlation."

Vanderplas, Susan, Dianne Cook, and Heike Hofmann. 2020. "Annual Review of Statistics and Its Application Testing Statistical Charts: What Makes a Good Graph?" https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-statistics-031219-041252.

Vanderplas, Susan, and Heike Hofmann. 2015. "Signs of the Sine Illusion — Why We Need to Care Signs of the Sine Illusion — Why We Need to Care" 8600. https://doi.org/10.1080/10618600.2014.951547.

VanderPlas, Susan, and Heike Hofmann. 2017. "Clusters Beat Trend!? Testing Feature Hierarchy in Statistical Graphics." *Journal of Computational and Graphical Statistics* 26 (2): 231–42. https://doi.org/10.1080/10618600.2016.1209116.

Vranas, Peter B. M. 2000. "Gigerenzer's normative critique of Kahneman and Tversky." *Cognition* 76 (3): 179–93. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0010-0277(99)00084-0.

Walker, W. E., P. Harremoes, J Rotmans, J. P. Van Der Sluijs, M. B. A. Van Asselt, P Janssen, and M. P. Krayer Von Krauss. 2003. "Defining Uncertainty." *Integrated Assessment* 4 (1): 5–17. https://www.narcis.nl/publication/RecordID/oai:tudelft.nl:uuid:fdc0105c-e601-402a-8f16-ca97e9963592.

Wallsten, Thomas S., David V. Budescu, Ido Erev, and Adele Diederich. 1997. "Evaluating and combining subjective probability estimates." *Journal of Behavioral Decision Making* 10 (3): 243–68. https://doi.org/10.1002/(sici)1099-0771(199709)10:3%3C243::aid-bdm268%3E3.0.co;2-m.

Wickham, Hadley, Mara Averick, Jennifer Bryan, Winston Chang, Lucy D'Agostino McGowan, Romain François, Garrett Grolemund, et al. 2019. "Welcome to the tidyverse." *Journal of Open Source Software* 4 (43): 1686. https://doi.org/10.21105/joss.01686.

Wickham, Hadley, Dianne Cook, Heike Hofmann, and Andreas Buja. 2010. "Graphical inference for infovis." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 16: 973–79. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2010.161.

Wickham, Hadley, and Heike Hofmann. 2011. "Product plots." *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* 17 (12): 2223–30. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2011.227.

Wickham, Hadley, Heike Hofmann, Charlotte Wickham, and Dianne Cook. 2012. "Glyph-maps for visually exploring temporal patterns in climate data and models." *Environmetrics* 23 (5): 382–93. https://doi.org/10.1002/env.2152.

Wickham, Hadley, Thomas Lin Pedersen, and Dana Seidel. 2023. *Scales: Scale Functions for Visualization*. https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=scales.

Wilkinson, Leland. 2005. *The Grammar of Graphics (Statistics and Computing)*. Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer-Verlag.

Wu, Yifan, Ziyang Guo, Michails Mamakos, Jason Hartline, and Jessica Hullman. 2023. "The Rational Agent Benchmark for Data Visualization." https://arxiv.org/abs/2304.03432.

Xie, Yihui. 2014. "Knitr: A Comprehensive Tool for Reproducible Research in R." In *Implementing Reproducible Computational Research*, edited by Victoria Stodden, Friedrich Leisch, and Roger D. Peng. Chapman; Hall/CRC.

Zhang, Sam, Patrick Ryan Heck, Michelle Meyer, Christopher F Chabris, Daniel G Goldstein, and Jake M Hofman. 2022. "An Illusion of Predictability in Scientific Results."

Zhao, Jieqiong, Yixuan Wang, Michelle V. Mancenido, Erin K. Chiou, and Ross Maciejewski.

2023. “Evaluating the Impact of Uncertainty Visualization on Model Reliance.” *IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics* PP (X): 1–15. https://doi.org/10.1109/TVCG.2023.3251950.