- 1 Porosity-Permeability Relationships in Mudstone from Pore-Scale Fluid Flow Simulations using the
- 2 Lattice Boltzmann Method
- 3 Harsh Biren Vora<sup>1</sup>, Brandon Dugan<sup>2</sup>
- <sup>1</sup>Department of Earth, Environment and Planetary Sciences, Rice University, Houston, TX 77005
- 5 <sup>2</sup>Department of Geophysics, Colorado School of Mines, Golden, CO 80401
- 6 Corresponding Author: Harsh Biren Vora (hv6@rice.edu)

# 7 Key Points:

- We develop a model to predict mudstone permeability from clay platelet geometry using lattice
- 9 Boltzmann simulations
- Modeled porosity-permeability predictions match experimental observations from synthetic and
- 11 natural mudstones
- Our model can simulate mudstone permeability response to compaction and grain rotation and to
- 13 fluid injection using porosity and clay mineralogy

#### Abstract

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22 23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

We model mudstone permeability during consolidation and grain rotation, and during fluid injection by simulating porous media flow using the lattice Boltzmann method. We define the mudstone structure using clay platelet thickness, aspect ratio, orientation and pore widths. Over the representative range of clay platelet lengths (0.1–3  $\mu$ m), aspect ratios (length/thickness=20-50) and porosities ( $\phi$ =0.07–0.80) our permeability results match matural-mudstone datasets well. Homogenous smectite and kaolinite models document a log-linear decline in vertical permeability from  $8.31 \times 10^{-15}$  m<sup>2</sup>--6.84×10<sup>-17</sup> m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi$ =0.73-0.80 to  $6.33 \times 10^{-19} \text{ m}^2$ --1.30×10<sup>-23</sup> m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi$ =0.07-0.16, showing good correlation with experimental trendsdata  $(R^2=0.42 \text{ and } 0.56).$ We then testemploy our methodology to predict the permeability inof two natural mudstones consisting mudstone samples composed of smectite, illite, and chlorite grains. Over \$\phi = 0.32-0.58\$, the permeability trends of two models replicating the mineralogical composition of the natural mudstones mudstone samples match experimental datasets well (R<sup>2</sup>=0.78 and 0.74). We extend our methodology to evaluate how vertical mudstone permeability might evolve during microfracture network growth or macrofracture propagation upon fluid injection. Fluid injection eausing a porosity increase from 0.07 to  $\frac{0.57}{10.57}$  results in a permeability increase from  $1.02 \times 10^{-20}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.07$  to  $\frac{9.59 \times 10^{-15}}{2.07 \times 10^{-16}}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.29$ for growth of a microfracture network, and from  $1.02 \times 10^{-20}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.07$  to  $\frac{3.85 \times 10^{-14}}{1.23 \times 10^{-16}}$  m<sup>2</sup> at *6*0.32 for macrofracture propagation. Our results suggest that a distributed microfracture network results in greater permeability during initial fluid injection in compacted mudstones ( $\phi$ =0.07-0.36), whereas 32) in comparison to a wide macrofracture yields greater permeability once it is wide enough to conduct the bulk of fluid flux (*ϕ*=0.36 0.57). Our modeling approach provides a simple means to estimate permeability during burial and compaction or fluid injection based on knowledge of porosity and mineralogy.

#### 1. Introduction

38 Mudstone comprises 60-70% of sedimentary basin fill. During burial to 5 km, mudstone porosity (φ) 39 decreases from 0.9 to 0.05, which coincides with decline in permeability (k) of up to 10 orders of magnitude [Neuzil, 1994]. These variations in permeability are important for several geological 40 41 applications such as pore pressure development [Lou and Vasseur, 1992], continental slope stability [Dugan and Flemings, 2000], hydrocarbon retention [England et al., 1987], and shale gas production 42 [Soeder, 1988]. Accurate prediction of mudstone permeability, however, remains challenging due to the 43 factors influencing permeability such as grain dimension [Schwartz and Banavar, 1989], platelet 44 orientation [Clennell et al., 1999], and pore geometry [Bowers and Katsube, 2002]. Clay minerals and 45 their dimensions are often suggested as primary controls on mudstone permeability [Olsen, 1962; 46 Dewhurst et al., 1996]. Clay platelet length ranges from 0.1 µm to 10 µm [Mondol et al., 2007] and 47 48 platelets have aspect ratios (length/thickness) of 1 to 100 [Santamarina et al., 2002]. This large variation in grain dimension is suggested as the dominant controlling factor in mudstone permeability spanning 3-4 49 50 orders of magnitude for a single porosity value [Dewhurst et al., 1999a; Mondol et al., 2008]. 51 Several models have been proposed to explain mudstone permeability. Many models assume a log-linear 52 relationship between permeability and porosity [Rose, 1945, Nagaraj et al., 1994; Neuzil, 1994], but fail to explain the observed range of mudstone permeability for a given porosity [Yang and Aplin, 2007]. 53 54 Another model used to predict mudstone permeability is the Kozeny-Carman model [Kozeny, 1927; 55 Carman, 1937], which requires information on tortuosity, pore factorshape, specific pore surface area, and 56 pore volume. While the Kozeny-Carman relationship can predict the permeability of unconsolidated 57 mudstones with reasonable accuracy [Chapuis and Aubertin, 2003], various studies document prediction 58 errors of several orders of magnitude [Yang and Aplin, 1998; Dewhurst et al., 1999a, b]. In other work, Yang and Aplin [2007] use pore size distribution measurements to develop an empirical power law 59 relationship between mudstone permeability and mean pore throat radius. Several other studies utilize 60 61 critical path analysis from percolation theory to predict the permeability of clay-rich samples using power-law distribution of pore sizes [Hunt and Gee, 2002; Daigle, 2016]. Thus, while several models 62

exist to predict mudstone permeability, their application requires knowledge of pore size and tortuosity, and do not directly account for the effect of clay platelet geometry.

To improve mudstone permeability characterization, we develop a model that directly includes clay platelet geometry. We employ a three-dimensional, pore-scale model using clay platelet dimensions, pore throat widths, platelet orientation, and porosity. We use this to evaluate the impacts of clay platelet geometry and porosity loss on permeability during burial. We estimate permeability in mudstones of homogenous and heterogenous mineralogy from lattice Boltzman simulations of water flow through mudstone pore structures and validate our results against compilation of experimental and field datasets.

We employ our modeling approach to predict porosity permeability relationships in natural mudstones of heterogenous clay mineralogy and compare our results against experimental datasets. Finally, we extend our model to fluid injection by modifying pore structure to assess how permeability changes with growth of a microfracture network and with propagation of a macrofracture. Thus, with information on clay mineralogy, clay content, and porosity, our new approach can help estimate permeability in mudstones subjected to compaction and anthropogenic fluid injection from wastewater disposal, hydraulic fracturing, and carbon sequestration.

### 2. Methods

### 2.1. Initial Mudstone Pore Structure

We build our mudstone models from cuboidal platelets arranged in bedding layers, with each platelet oriented at an angle  $\theta$  from the horizontal [Fig. 1a]. Each clay platelet has a thickness ( $\beta$ ) and a length and width ( $m\beta$ ), where m is the aspect ratio of the clay platelets. Pore space between particles is defined by intrabed pores of a finite width ( $\varepsilon$ ) and by interbed pores, each of length and width ( $\lambda$ ) [Fig. 1a]. To analyze mineralogy-specific porosity-permeability behavior of mudstones, we initially design three homogenous mudstone models using (1) kaolinite particles, (2) smectite particles, and (3) clay particles of

Formatted: Font: +Body (Calibri)

Formatted: Font: +Body (Calibri)

86 intermediate size. To analyze porosity-permeability behavior of natural mudstones, we design two 87 mudstone models of heterogenous mineralogy using smectite, illite and chlorite particles. 2.1. Homogenous Mudstone Pore Structures 88 89 In general, kaolinite particles have a length of 1- 10 µm and aspect ratios up to 25, whereas smectite 90 particles have a length up to 0.1 µm and aspect ratios up to 100 [Mitchell and Soga, 2005]. We simulate kaolinite mudstone starting with  $\phi$ =0.76 (m = 20;  $m\beta$  = 3  $\mu$ m;  $\varepsilon$  =  $\lambda$  = 360 nm). We simulate smectite 91 92 mudstone starting with  $\phi$ =0.80 (m = 50;  $m\beta$  = 0.1  $\mu$ m;  $\varepsilon$  =  $\lambda$  = 9 nm). We simulate the intermediate 93 mudstone starting with  $\phi$ =0.73 (m = 35;  $m\beta$  = 2  $\mu$ m;  $\varepsilon$  =  $\lambda$  = 137 nm). Our initial mudstone porosity of 94 0.73-0.80 lies within range of porosity for near-seafloor mud [Daigle and Screaton, 2015; Cook and Sawyer, 2015]. Our initial pore widths of 9-360 nm are consistent with pore sizes determined from 95 scanning electron microscopy and mercury intrusion porosimetry analyses of unconsolidated marine 96 97 mudstones (1-5000 nm) [Heath, 2010], siliceous mudstones (5-750 nm) [Loucks et al., 2009], and London 98 Clay (10-500 nm) [Dewhurst et al., 1999b]. 99 Mineral grains are oriented randomly at deposition [Bennett et al., 1989]. In contrast, clay platelets in our 100 model are oriented at the same angle with respect to the horizontal,  $\theta$  [Fig. 1a]. Daigle and Dugan [2011] 101 show that a porous medium with uniformly distributed grain orientations between  $\theta_1$  and  $\theta_2$  can be 102 represented using the mean orientation angle  $(\theta)$  of all grains in the matrix  $(\theta = (\theta_1 + \theta_2)/2)$ . Clay platelet 103 orientations can range between  $0^{\circ}$  to  $90^{\circ}$  from horizontal at deposition ( $\theta_1 = 0^{\circ}, \theta_2 = 90^{\circ}, \theta = 45^{\circ}$ ) [Deamer 104 and Kodama, 1990], therefore, we implement an initial platelet orientation of  $\theta = 45^{\circ}$  in our homogenous 105 mudstone models. 106 2.2. Heterogenous Mudstone Pore Structures 107 We test our modeling approach against the permeability of two natural mudstones from the Ursa Basin, 108 Gulf of Mexico [Sawyer et al., 2009]. Sample 1324C-1H-1 is from 51.3 mbsf has a clay mineral weight fraction of 70.4%, consisting dominantly of smectite and illite [Table 1]. Sample 1324B-7H-7 is from 109

110	60.6 mbsf has a clay mineral weight fraction of 68.9%, consisting dominantly of smectite, illite, and
111	chlorite [Table 1]. We adapt our model to include mineral weight fractions of smectite, illite, and chlorite
112	to simulate the mudstone pore structures of samples 1324C-1H-1 and 1324B-7H-7.
113	We assume constant density of clay minerals. The modeled volume of each clay platelet is calculated as
114	$m\beta \times m\beta \times \beta$ . For our heterogenous mudstone models, we assume smectite platelets have an aspect ratio
115	(m) of 50 and a length (m $\beta$ ) of 0.1 $\mu$ m, illite platelets have m=20 and m $\beta$ = 2 $\mu$ m [Santamarina et al.,
116	2012], and chlorite platelets have $m=25$ and $m\beta=2$ µm [Weber et al., 2014]. The maximum number of
117	smectite $(no_{smectite}^{max})$ , illite $(no_{illite}^{max})$ and chlorite $(no_{ehlorite}^{max})$ platelets in each model is calculated as:
118	$no_{smectite}^{max} = [0.1 \ \mu m * 0.1 \ \mu m * 0.002 \ \mu m] * smectite weight fraction. \tag{1}$
119	$no_{illite}^{max} = [2 \mu m * 2 \mu m * 0.1 \mu m] * illite weight fraction,$ (2)
120	$no_{chlorite}^{max} = [2 \ \mu m * 2 \ \mu m * 0.08 \ \mu m] * chlorite weight fraction.$ (3)
121	<u>HCF</u> is the highest common factor between $no_{smectite}^{max}$ , $no_{illine}^{max}$ and $no_{chlorite}^{max}$ . The number of smectite
122	$(no_{smectite})$ , illite $(no_{illite})$ , and chlorite $(no_{chlorite})$ platelets in each model is determined as $(no_{smectite})$
123	$(no_{illite}^{max}/HCF)$ and $(no_{chlorite}^{max}/HCF)$ respectively. The number bedding layers in each model $(no_{beds})$ is
124	determined as the highest common factor between no smective, no silline, and no chlorite. The minimum value of
125	$no_{beds}$ is three. The number of smectite $(no_{smectite}^{bed})$ , illite $(no_{illite}^{bed})$ , and chlorite $(no_{chlorite}^{bed})$ platelets in
126	each bedding layer is calculated as (no <sub>smectite</sub> /no <sub>peds</sub> ), (no <sub>illite</sub> /no <sub>peds</sub> ), and (no <sub>chlorite</sub> /no <sub>peds</sub> ) respectively. Each
127	bedding layer is modeled with $no_{smectite}^{bed}$ smectite platelets, $no_{illite}^{bed}$ illite platelets, and $no_{chlorite}^{bed}$ chlorite
128	platelets, distributed randomly with intrabed pore throats of diameter $\varepsilon$ between platelets.
129	The thickness of each bed $(T_{bed})$ is equal to the thickness of the largest platelet in the bed. For our
130	heterogenous mudstone models NM1 and NM2, the thickest platelets are illite platelets, thus $T_{bed} = 0.1$
131	μm. Each cuboidal bedding layer is initialized with $no_{smectite}$ smectite platelets, where $no_{smectite}$ is
132	determined as,

 $no_{smectite}^{initial} = no_{smectite}^{bed} + \frac{[2 \ \mu m*2 \ \mu m*0.1 \ \mu m]}{[0.1 \ \mu m*0.1 \ \mu m*0.002 \ \mu m]} no_{illite}^{bed} + \frac{[2 \ \mu m*2 \ \mu m*0.08 \ \mu m]}{[0.1 \ \mu m*0.1 \ \mu m*0.002 \ \mu m]} no_{chlorite}^{bed}$ (4) 133 no<sub>smectite</sub> represents the number of smectite platelets that equal the total volume of all platelets 134 135 (smectite, illite and chlorite) in a bedding layer. Each bedding layer can consist of several tiers of smectite 136 layers platelets [Fig. S1a]. The number of smectite tiers (t) is determined as the ratio of thickness of smectite platelets and associated interbed pore throat diameter ( $\lambda$ ) to the thickness of each bed. In our 137 heterogenous mudstone models NM1 and NM2,  $t=T_{bed}/(0.002 \, \mu m + \lambda)$ . The initial cuboidal bedding layer 138 is filled with  $no_{smectite}$  initial smectite platelets, arranged in t tiers, separated by intrabed pores of diameter  $\lambda$ 139 and interbed pores of diameter  $\varepsilon$ . We then chose  $no_{illire}^{bed}$  random locations within the smectite bedding 140 layer and fill the simulated matrix with illite platelets of dimension 2 µm x 2 µm x 0.1 µm, such that the 141 illite platelets maintain a distance of  $\varepsilon$  between platelets. Similarly, we then chose  $no_{chlorite}^{bed}$  random 142 143 locations within the bedding layer and fill them with chlorite platelets of dimension 2 µm x 2 µm x 0.08 144 μm, such that the chlorite platelets maintain a distance of  $\varepsilon$  with other platelets [Fig S1a]. The no<sub>beds</sub> 145 simulated beds are stacked vertically with interbed pore throat of diameter  $\lambda$  to develop the unrotated 146 mudstone model [Fig. S1a, Fig. S1b]. 2.2. The developed matrix is transformed by input grain orientation 147 angle,  $\theta$ , to simulate the rotated mudstone model [Fig. S1c]. 148 To model sample 1324C-1H-1, we simulate mudstone pore structure NM1 starting with  $\phi$ =0.72 consisting 149 of 81.5% smectite and 18.5% illite. Magnetic susceptibility analyses document a range of 0° to 15° for platelet orientations at 51.3 mbsf, corresponding to the burial depth of sample 1324C-1H-1 [Yamamoto 150 151 and Sawyer, 2012]. X-ray diffraction analyses reveal that degree of preferred platelet orientation at 51 152 mbsf is approximately double of observations at seafloor [Day-Stirrat et al., 2012]. We assume  $\theta_i = 0^\circ$  and 153  $\theta_2$ =30° at deposition and implement an initial platelet orientation ( $\theta = (\theta_1 + \theta_2)/2$ ) of 15° at  $\phi = 0.72$  in 154 mudstone model NM1. 155 To model sample 1324B-7H-7, we simulate mudstone pore structure NM2 starting with  $\phi$ =0.58 consisting 156 of 30.6% smectite, 41.7% illite, and 27.7% chlorite. Magnetic susceptibility analyses document a range of 0° to 12° for platelet orientations at 60.6 mbsf, corresponding to the burial depth of sample 1324B-7H-7 [Yamamoto and Sawyer, 2012]. X-ray diffraction analyses reveal that degree of preferred platelet at 60.6 mbsf is approximately double of observations at seafloor [Day-Stirrat et al., 2012]. We assume  $\theta_1$ =0° and  $\theta_2$ =24° at deposition and implement an initial platelet orientation ( $\theta = (\theta_1 + \theta_2)/2$ ) of 12° at  $\phi = 0.58$  in mudstone model NM2. 2.3. Lattice Boltzmann Simulations We use the open source code OpenLB [Latt, 2008] to simulate water flow through mudstone using the lattice Boltzmann method. We choose the lattice Boltzmann method because it has been used successfully to predict the permeability of sandstones [Bosl et al., 1998], to estimate sandstone permeability from thin sections [Keehm et al., 2004], and to model the development of permeability anisotropy in mudstones [Daigle and Dugan, 2011]. We employ the single-relaxation time Bhatnagar-Gross-Krook model [Qian et al., 1992] and the D3Q19 lattice for our simulations [Martys and Chen, 1996]. Lattice Boltzmann simulations of flow yield fluid flux (q) for an applied pressure differential ( $\Delta P$ ); conversions between lattice Boltzmann units and SI units are made using guidelines described by Chukwodzie [2011]. For all simulations, we apply a constant pressure differential ( $\Delta P$ ) of  $88 \times 10^3$  Pa across the model domain in the direction of flow and implement the particle bounce-back scheme [Bouzidi et al., 2001] along the orthogonal edges. Water (dynamic viscosity,  $\mu_w = 8.9 \times 10^{-4} \text{ Pa s}$ ; density,  $\rho_w = 1000 \text{ kg/m}^3$ ) is used as the permeating fluid. By applying 4Pa constant pressure gradient in different directions, we determine vertical water flux  $(q_v)$ , horizontal water flux in the plane of platelet rotation  $(q_{hl})$  and horizontal water flux orthogonal to plane of platelet rotation  $(q_{h2})$ . In our study, we focus on horizontal water flux in the plane of platelet rotation  $(q_{hl})$ , hereafter referred to as  $q_h$  [Fig. 1a]. 2.34. Calculation of Permeability and Tortuosity

We rearrange Darcy's law to calculate permeability (k) from our simulation results,

157

158159

160

161

162

163

164

165

166

167

168

169

170

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

178

 $k = \mu_w * q * L/\Delta P$  (1,

where k is permeability ( $m^2$ ) and L is the length (m) over which pressure differential is applied. Vertical permeability ( $k_v$ ) is calculated using water flux in the vertical direction ( $q_v$ ) and horizontal permeability ( $k_h$ ) is calculated using water flux in the horizontal direction ( $q_h$ ). Permeability anisotropy is calculated as  $k_h/k_v$ . To ensure the applicability of Darcy's Law, we maintain Reynolds Number ( $Re = (\rho_w * q * m\beta)/\mu_w$ ) less than 10 for all simulations. We do not consider osmotic and electrostatic effects of water flow through the simulated mudstone models, which can diminish permeability especially at low porosity conditions [Revil and Pessel, 2002].

We supplement permeability predictions with calculations of tortuosity ( $\tau$ ) to validate our methodology. We adapt the approach of NabovatiDaigle and Sousa [2007Dugan [2011]] to calculate vertical tortuosity ( $\tau_{\nu}$ ) and horizontal tortuosity ( $\tau_{h}$ ), based on porosity ( $\phi$ ), platelet aspect ratio (m) and grain orientation ( $\theta$ )

192 as

$$\tau_{y} = \frac{\sqrt{q_{y}^{2} + 2 q_{h}^{2}}}{q_{y}},\tag{2}$$

$$\tau_{h} = \frac{\sqrt{q_{v}^{2} + 2 \cdot q_{h}^{2}}}{q_{h}}.\tag{3}$$

$$\frac{2.4\tau_v = 1 + \frac{\frac{8}{9}m\cos\theta + \frac{2}{\pi}\sin\theta}{(\frac{3\pi}{8(1-\phi)} - \frac{1}{2})}}{(\frac{3\pi}{8(1-\phi)} - \frac{1}{2})} \quad \text{and}$$
 (6)

$$\tau_h = 1 + \frac{\frac{8}{9}m\sin\theta + \frac{2}{\pi}\cos\theta}{(\frac{3\pi}{8(1-\varphi)} - \frac{1}{2})}$$
 (7)

The average aspect ratio of platelets in our heterogenous mudstone models (*NM1* and *NM2*) is calculated as (50\*smectite weight fraction + 20\*illite weight fraction + 25\* chlorite weight fraction). We calculate an average aspect ratio of 44.45 and 30.57 for our heterogenous mudstone models *NM1* and *NM2* respectively.

# 201 2.5. Mudstone Compaction 202 We simulate compaction through simultaneous decline in mudstone porosity and grain orientation [Fig. 203 1b]. Porosity loss during compaction is simulated through imposed, step-wise reduction of intrabed and 204 interbed pore widths [Table S1, Table S2]. After compaction, our modeled mudstones have pore widths of 205 1-4060 nm, which is consistent with pore throat diameters in compacted mudstones measured by X-ray 206 diffraction and nitrogen gas-adsorption [Katsube and Williamson, 1994; Kuila and Prasad, 2012]. 207 Natural and experimental mudstone compaction document a decline in range of observed grain 208 orientations [Day-Stirrat et al., 2012] and an increase in horizontal bedding character [Aplin et al., 2006]. During compaction of our homogenous mudstone models we assume a decline in $\theta_2$ from 90° to 0° and 209 $\theta_I = 0^\circ$ . We implement a compaction orientation function in our <u>homogenous</u> mudstone models through the 210 211 prescribed decline in representative platelet orientation ( $\theta = (\theta_1 + \theta_2)/2$ ) from 45° to 0° [Table S1]. 212 Day-Stirrat et al. [2012] document a decline in range of platelet orientations with consolidation at IODP 213 Site 1324, with an increase in preferred horizontal orientation. Based on this, we assume $\theta_2$ approaches $0^{\circ}$ during compaction in the NMI mudstone model ( $\theta_1$ =0° and $\theta_2$ =30° at deposition). Thus, we simulate 214 215 compaction of mudstone model NM1 with uniform representative grain orientation ( $\theta = (\theta_1 + \theta_2)/2$ ) 216 declining from $\theta$ =15° at $\phi$ = 0.72 to $\theta$ =0° at $\phi$ = 0.32 [Table S2]. Similarly, we assume $\theta_2$ approaches 0° 217 during compaction in the NM2 mudstone model ( $\theta_1$ =0° and $\theta_2$ =24° at deposition). Thus, we simulate compaction of mudstone model NM2 with uniform representative grain orientation ( $\theta = (\theta_1 + \theta_2)/2$ ) 218 decreasing from $\theta$ =12° at $\phi$ = 0.58 to $\theta$ =0° at $\phi$ = 0.25 [Table S2]. 219 220 In general, the modeled compaction orientation function replicates the increase in horizontal bedding 221 character during compaction in mudstones, observed during natural and experimental compaction. We 222 simulate faster decline in platelet orientation angle at high porosity states in our models [Table S1: Table 223 <u>\$2</u>], consistent with experimental mudstone compaction [Dewhurst et al., 1999a]. Vertical and horizontal

permeability is calculated during the step-wise compaction of mudstone models [Table S1; Table S2].

### 3. Compaction Model Results

- In our kaolinite compaction model,  $k_v$  decreases from  $8.31 \times 10^{-15}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.76$  to  $6.33 \times 10^{-19}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi =$
- 227 0.14 [Fig. 2], following a log-linear trend ( $R^2 = 0.99$ ),

$$228 \quad log(k_v^{kaolinite}) = 6.48 \, \phi - 18.86 \, . \tag{48}$$

- Simultaneously,  $k_h$  decreases from  $1.01 \times 10^{-14}$  m<sup>2</sup> to  $1.43 \times 10^{-17}$  m<sup>2</sup> [Table S1] and  $k_h/k_v$  increases from 1.32
- 230 to 22.6 [Fig. 3]. The reduction in vertical permeability during compaction is accompanied by an increase
- 231 in vertical tortuosity from 1.023.98 to 2.0621.64 [Fig. S1aS2a] and a decrease in horizontal tortuosity
- 232 from <u>6.563.98</u> to 1.<u>6274</u> [Table S1].
- In our smectite compaction model,  $k_v$  decreases from  $6.48 \times 10^{-17}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.80$  to  $1.30 \times 10^{-23}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi =$
- 234 0.16 [Fig. 2], following a log-linear trend ( $R^2 = 0.99$ ),

235 
$$log(k_v^{smectite}) = 10.59 \phi - 24.44$$
. (59)

- Simultaneously,  $k_h$  decreases from  $1.33 \times 10^{-16}$  m<sup>2</sup> to  $9.35 \times 10^{-22}$  m<sup>2</sup> [Table S1] and  $k_h/k_v$  increases from 1.94
- 237 to 71.9 [Fig. 3]. The reduction in vertical permeability during compaction is accompanied by an increase
- 238 in vertical tortuosity from 1.017.08 to 2.5650.65 [Fig. S1aS2a] and a decrease in horizontal tortuosity
- 239 from 8.647.08 to 1.5471 [Table S1].
- In our intermediate mudstone compaction model,  $k_v$  decreases from  $6.10 \times 10^{-16}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.73$  to  $1.02 \times 10^{-16}$
- 241  $^{20}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.07$  [Fig. 2], following a log-linear trend (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.98),

242 
$$\log(k_v^{int}) = 6.73 \phi - 20.16$$
. (610)

- Simultaneously,  $k_h$  decreases from  $1.11 \times 10^{-15}$  m<sup>2</sup> to  $4.68 \times 10^{-19}$  m<sup>2</sup> [Table S1] and  $k_h/k_v$  increases from 1.82
- 244 to 45.6 [Fig. 3]. The reduction in vertical permeability during compaction is accompanied by an increase
- in vertical tortuosity from 1.026.72 to 2.2041.61 [Fig. S1aS2a] and a decrease in horizontal tortuosity
- 246 from 8.066.72 to 1.5983 [Table S1].
- 247 In our NM1 compaction model (designed after sample 1324C-1H-1), k<sub>v</sub> decreases from 1.54x10<sup>-16</sup> m<sup>2</sup> at φ
- 248 =  $0.72 (\theta = 15^{\circ})$  to  $7.09 \times 10^{-21}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.32 (\theta = 0^{\circ})$  [Fig. 4], following a log-linear trend (R<sup>2</sup>=0.99),
- 249  $log(k_v^{NM1}) = 10.93 \phi 23.63$  (11)

250	Simultaneously, $k_h$ decreases from 1.39x10 <sup>-15</sup> m <sup>2</sup> to 2.66x10 <sup>-19</sup> m <sup>2</sup> [Table S2] and $k_h/k_v$ increases from 8.9°			
251	to 37.59 [Fig. 3]. The reduction in vertical permeability during compaction is accompanied by an increase			
252	in vertical tortuosity from 11.30 to 32.95 [Fig. S2b] and a decrease in horizontal tortuosity from 3.91 to			
253	1.52 [Table S2].			
254	In our NM2 compaction model (designed after sample 1324B-7H-7), $k_{\nu}$ decreases from 3.11x10 <sup>-17</sup> m <sup>2</sup> at $\phi$			
255	=0.58 ( $\theta$ =12°) to 4.79x10 <sup>-20</sup> m <sup>2</sup> at $\phi$ =0.25 ( $\theta$ =0°) [Fig. 4], following a log-linear trend (R <sup>2</sup> =0.99),			
256	$log(k_v^{NM2}) = 8.28 \phi - 21.32 . \tag{12}$			
257	Simultaneously, $k_h$ decreases from $2.27 \times 10^{-16}$ m <sup>2</sup> to $1.51 \times 10^{-18}$ m <sup>2</sup> [Table S2] and $k_h/k_v$ increases from $7.29$			
258	to 31.6 [Fig. 3]. The reduction in vertical permeability during compaction is accompanied by an increase			
259	in vertical tortuosity from 12.46 to 26.54 [Fig. S2b] and a decrease in horizontal tortuosity from 3.69 to			
260	1.60 [Table S2].			
261	The modeled decreases in $k_{\nu}$ and $k_{h}$ during compaction are due to a reduction of pore throat widths.			
262	Greater values of $k_h$ compared to $k_v$ occur as interbed pores provide greater continuity in pathways for			
263	horizontal fluid flow, while clay platelets create a more tortuous pathway for vertical flow. Vertical			
264	tortuosity increases while horizontal tortuosity decreases during compaction which amplifies permeabilit			
265	anisotropy [Fig. 3].			
266	4. Discussion			
267	4.1. Validation of Porosity-Permeability Models			
268	We compare our modeled porosity-permeability relationships from homogenous mudstone models with			
269	experimental and field mudstone data [Mondol et al., 2008, Neuzil, 1994]. Our kaolinite and smectite			
270	models [Eq. $4,58.9$ ] show good correlation ( $R^2$ of 0.42 and 0.56) with experimental data [Fig. 2]. The			
271	modeled porosity-permeability relationships lie within range of experimental and natural mudstone			
272	datasets, [Fig. 2], and the intermediate mudstone model [Eq. 610] depicts the bulk compaction-			
273	permeability behavior of mudstones [Fig. 2]. These results validate our modeling approach over			
274	representative range of grain sizes (0.1-3 μm), aspect ratios (20-50), grain orientations (45°-0°), and			
275	porosity (0.80-0.07).			

Existing experimental and modeled values for mudstone tortuosity range from 1 to 3.5 as porosity from 0.9 to 0.1 [Iversen and Jørgensen, 1993; Boudreau and Meysmann, 2006]. We calculate of vertical tortuosity of 1.01-2.56 during compaction [Table S1], which lies within range of reported tortuosity values. The increase in τ<sub>a</sub> during compaction is accompanied by a decline in τ<sub>a</sub> (Table which is consistent with experimental observations [Dewhurst et al., 1999a]. This provides additional validation of our model approach. During compaction, our model results also homogenous mudstone models document increasing permeability anisotropy from 1.32-1.94 at  $\phi$ =0.72—\_0.80 to 22.6—\_71.9 at  $\phi$ =0.07—\_0.16 [Fig. 3]. Experimentally determined values of anisotropy in mudstones document an increase from 1.5 to 40 during compaction [Arch and Maltman, 1990; Bhandari et al., 2015; Yang and Aplin, 2007]. Over  $\phi$ =0.80—\_0.4516, predictions of  $k_h/k_v$  from our mudstone models lie within range of experimentally documented mudstone anisotropy values [Fig. 3]. At porosity less than 0.1516, when  $\theta=0^{\circ}$  in our models, our smectite and intermediate mudstone models predict  $k_b/k_v$  of 71.9 and 45.6 respectively, which exceeds the range of experimental mudstone anisotropy. This overprediction of  $k_b/k_v$  is due to the simplified horizontal layering of platelets when  $\theta$ =0°. This results in horizontally continuous interbed pores and overprediction of  $k_h$ , resulting in higher anisotropy values. While these Additionally, the vertical stacking of bedding layers of disparate intrinsic permeability in our mudstone models results in amplification of permeability anisotropy [Daigle and Dugan, 2011]. Finally, natural mudstones document lower values of permeability anisotropy due to the presence of larger silt grains which are disruptive to fabric development [Schneider et al., 2011]. Since our mudstone models do not account for the presence of larger silt particles, we calculate higher values of  $k_b/k_v$  compared to documented experimental values in <u>natural mudstones</u>. While the calculated  $k_h/k_v$  values lie outside experimentally observed anisotropy values, several field-scale studies infer  $k_h/k_v > 100$  based on basin-scale models [Freeze and Cherry, 1979; Garven and Freeze, 1984; Bolton et al., 2000; Day-Stirrat et al., 2008]. Our models suggest that high bedding character resulting in lateral continuity of interbed pores could explain the larger  $k_h/k_v$  values

276

277278

279

280

281

282

283

284

285

286

287

288

289

290

291

292

293

294295

296

297

298

299

inferred from analysis of natural flow systems. Thus, for compaction from \$\phi=0.80\$ to 0.07, our methodology of simulating flow through modeled mudstone pore structures provides good estimates of permeability, permeability anisotropy, and tortuosity for homogenous mudstones. While our results from homogenous mudstones lie within range of observations from natural mudstones [Fig. 2], they do not describe the porosity permeability character of mudstones of heterogenous clay mineralogy, so we assess our validated methodology against data from natural mudstones of known and heterogeneous clay mineralogy. 4.2. Permeability Prediction in Natural Mudstones We test our modeling approach against the porosity permeability character of two natural mudstones from the Ursa Basin, Gulf of Mexico [Sawyer et al., 2009]. Sample 1324C 1H 1 has a clay mineral weight fraction of 70.4%, consisting dominantly of smectite and illite [Table 1]. Sample 1324B-7H-7 has a clay mineral weight fraction of 68.9%, consisting dominantly of smectite, illite, and chlorite [Table 1]. To simulate the porosity permeability behavior of these two samples, we model permeability with clay platelets of heterogenous dimensions. We adapt our model to include mineral weight fractions of smectite, illite, and chlorite to simulate the mudstone pore structures of samples 1324C 1H 1 and 1324B 7H 7 [Text S1; Fig. S2]. For our models, we assume smectite platelets have an aspect ratio (m) of 50 and a length (mβ) of 0.1 μm, illite platelets m=20 and  $m\beta=2$  um [Santamarina et al., 2012], and chlorite platelets have m=25 and  $m\beta=2.5$  um Weber et al., 2014). To model sample 1324C-1H-1, we simulate mudstone pore structure NM1 consisting of 81.5% smeetite and 18.5% illite. To model sample 1324B-7H-7, we simulate mudstone pore structure NM2 consisting of 30.6% smectite, 41.7% illite, and 27.7% chlorite. Permeability data from the constant rate-of-strain consolidation experiment on sample 1324C-1H-1 document a decrease in vertical permeability from  $1.08 \times 10^{-17}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.58$  to  $5.39 \times 10^{-19}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.46$ [Long et al., 2008]. Magnetic susceptibility analyses document a range of 0° to 15° for platelet

301

302

303 304

305

306

307

308

309

310

311

312

313

314

315

316

317

318

319

320

321

322

323

325 orientations at 51.3 mbsf, corresponding to the burial depth of sample 1324C-1H-1 [Yamamoto and Sawyer, 2012]. X ray diffraction analyses reveal that degree of preferred platelet orientation at 51 mbsf is 326 327 [2012] record an increase in preferred horizontal orientation with consolidation at IODP Site 1324. Based 328 assume  $\theta_i = 0^\circ$  and  $\theta_i = 30^\circ$  at deposition, and  $\theta_i$  approaches  $0^\circ$  as compaction increases. Thus, 329 330 we simulate compaction of mudstone model NM1 with uniform representative grain orientation (0 331  $=(\theta_1+\theta_2)/2$ ) declining from  $\theta=15^\circ$  at  $\phi=0.72$  to  $\theta=0^\circ$  at  $\phi=0.32$ . During compaction of NM1 model,  $k_0$  $\frac{1}{2}$  from  $\frac{1}{2}$   $\frac{5}{4}$   $\frac{1}{10}$   $\frac{1}{10$ 332 a log linear trend (R<sup>2</sup>=0.99), 333 334  $log(k_v^{NM1}) = 10.93 \phi - 23.63$ Simultaneously, k<sub>k</sub> decreases from 1.39x10<sup>-15</sup> m<sup>2</sup> to 2.66x10<sup>-19</sup> m<sup>2</sup> [Table S2] and k<sub>k</sub>/k<sub>k</sub> increases from 8.97 335 336 to 37.59. The reduction in vertical permeability during compaction is accompanied by an increase in vertical tortuosity from 1.74 to 3.69 and a decrease in horizontal tortuosity from 1.73 to 1.47 [Table S2]. 337 338 Permeability data from the constant rate-of-strain consolidation experiment on sample 1324B-7H-7 document a decrease in vertical permeability from  $1.61 \times 10^{-17}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.50$  to  $3.95 \times 10^{-19}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.33$ 339 [Long et al., 2008]. Our modeled porosity-permeability trends for NMI (designed after sample 1324C-340 341 1H-1) and NM2 (designed after 1324B-7H-7) show good agreement with experimental consolidation 342 datasets (R<sup>2</sup> of 0.78 and 0.74) [Fig. 4]. In particular, the slopes of porosity-log permeability trends described by models NM1 and NM2 (10.93 and 8.28 respectively) are very similar to the experimental 343 344 trends described samples 1324C-1H-1 and 1324B-7H-7 (10.65 and 8.16 respectively) [Long et al., 2008] [Fig. 4]. Magnetic susceptibility analyses document a range of 0° to 12° for platelet orientations at 60.6 345 346 347 diffraction analyses reveal that degree of preferred platelet at 60.6 mbsf is approximately double of 348 vations at seafloor [Day Stirrat et al., 2012]. Since horizontal bedding orientation increases with 349 consolidation at IODP Site 1324 [Day Stirrat et al., 2012], we assume  $\theta = 0^{\circ}$  and  $\theta = 24^{\circ}$  at deposition.

Formatted: Space After: 8 pt

350 θ<sub>2</sub> approaches 0° as compaction is simulated. Thus, we simulate compaction of mudstone model NM2 351 352 353 354 355 356 357 vertical tortuosity from 1.29 to 3.66 and a decrease in horizontal tortuosity from 2.23 to 1.47 [Table S2]. 358 Our modeled porosity permeability trends for NM1 and NM2 shows good agreement with experimental 359 described by models NM1 and NM2 (Eq. 7 and Eq. 8 respectively) are very similar to the experimental 360 361 trends described by Long et al. [2008] [Fig. 4]. 362 Over  $\phi = 0.46 - 0.58$ , Eq. 7Over the range of experimentally constrained data ( $\phi = 0.46 - 0.58$ ), Eq. 11 363 underestimates the permeability of sample 1324C-1H-1. While model NM1 is simulated using clay platelets, sample 1324C-1H-1 also has 15 wt.% quartz, 8.6 wt.% plagioclase, and 6.0 wt.% calcite [Day-364 365 Stirrat et al., 2012]. Similarly, over \(\phi = \text{the range of experimentally constrained data (} \(\phi = 0.33 - 0.50\_7 \). Eq. 812 underestimates the permeability of sample 1324B-7H-7. While model NM2 is simulated using clay 366 367 platelets, sample 1324B-7H-7 also contains 17 wt.% quartz, 9.2 wt.% plagioclase, and 4.8 wt.% calcite 368 [John and Adatte, 2009]. Our modeled results from models NMI and NM2 predict slightly lower 369 permeability of natural samples as they do not account for the presence of sand, silt and marl, which have 370 been shown to have a permeability-enhancing effect in mudstones [Yang and Aplin, 2010; Dewhurst et 371 al., 1999a; Schneider et al., 2011]. However, over  $\phi$ =0.25-0.72 our model results exhibit good capability 372 to predict the permeability of natural mudstones with high clay weight fraction. In addition to simulating 373 experimental values of vertical permeability, our models also provide an estimate of horizontal 374 permeability, permeability anisotropy, and tortuosity.

Existing experimental values for mudstone tortuosity range from 1 to 34 as porosity decreases from 0.9 to 0.05 [Boudreau and Meysmann, 2006; Arch and Maltman, 1990; Backeberg et al., 2017]. Over  $\phi$ =0.16 = 0.8, we calculate values of  $\tau_v$  and  $\tau_b$  ranging from 1.52 to 32.95 [Table S1; Table S2], which lies within range of reported tortuosity values. At porosity less than 0.16, when  $\theta$ =0° in our models, our smectite and intermediate mudstone models predict  $\tau_v$  of 50.65 and 41.61 respectively, which exceeds the range of experimental mudstone tortuosity. We calculate these larger values of  $\tau_v$  at low porosity conditions due to the high aspect ratio of clay platelets in our smectite and intermediate mudstone models (m=35-50) and the lack of larger particles (e.g., silt) which reduce vertical tortuosity in natural mudstones by disrupting fabric development [Schneider et al., 2011; Dewhurst et al., 1996]. The increase in  $\tau_v$  during compaction is accompanied by a decline in  $\tau_b$  in our models [Table S1; Table S2], which is consistent with experimental observations [Dewhurst et al., 1999a]. This provides additional validation of our model approach. Thus, our methodology of simulating flow through mudstone pore structures provides a simple way to make first-order predictions of mudstone permeability based on clay composition and dimensions. We extend the developed methodology to understand the evolution of permeability during fluid injection in compacted mudstones.

### **<u>54.2</u>**. Permeability During Fluid Injection

### **5.1. Modeling Fluid Injection** in Mudstones

Anthropogenic activities such as wastewater disposal, hydraulic fracturing, and carbon sequestration involve injection of large fluid volumes into the subsurface, which can increase vertical mudstone permeability by several orders of magnitude [Soeder, 1988]. The increase in vertical permeability from fluid injection has been attributed to the growth of microfracture networks [Slatt and O'Brien, 2011] and propagation of macrofractures [Mayerhofer et al., 2006]. We extend our methodology to understand the permeability response of compacted mudstone systems to fluid injection. The compacted, intermediate mudstone with  $\phi$ =0.07 and  $k_{\nu}$  of 1.02x10<sup>-20</sup> m<sup>2</sup> ( $\theta$ =0°), is used as the starting model for fluid injection simulations. Using lattice Boltzmann simulations, we calculate evolution of vertical permeability for (a)

growth of microfracture network [Fig. 5a] where we simulate preferential dilation of intrabed pores during fluid injection [Table S3] and (b) macrofracture propagation [Fig. 5b] where we simulate the increase in macrofracture width during fluid injection [Table S4]. Following the approach In both scenarios, we simulate injection which ultimately drives a porosity increase to ~ 0.3, representing the upper limit of dilation during fluid injection in compacted mudstones. Following the approach from our compaction models, we employed in our compaction analysis, we also evaluate the log-linear relationship between vertical permeability and porosity in mudstones during fluid injection.

# 5.2. Permeability Evolution upon Fluid Injection

- As interbed intrabed pore throats ( $\varepsilon^{mf}$ ) [Fig. 5a] increase from 11.42 nm to 11.54377 nm in the
- 409 microfracture network model, [Fig. 5a], vertical permeability  $(k_v^{mf})$  increases from  $1.02 \times 10^{-20}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi =$
- 410 0.07 to  $\frac{9.59 \times 10^{-15}}{2.07 \times 10^{-16}}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.5729$  [Fig. 6], following the trend (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.8892),
- 411  $\log(k_v^{mf}) = \frac{10.79 \, \phi 19.38}{10.79 \, \phi 19.38}$
- 412  $\frac{9}{18.18 \, 0 20.58}$  (13)
- 413 This vertical permeability increase is accompanied by a decrease in vertical tortuosity from 2.2 to 1 [Fig.
- 414 S1b].

400

401

402

403

404

405

406

- As the macrofracture width ( $\varepsilon^{frac}$ ) [Fig. 5b] increases from 11.42 nm to  $\frac{62972206}{1}$  nm, in the
- 416 macrofracture propagation model [Fig. 5b], vertical permeability  $(k_v^{frac})$  increases from  $1.02 \times 10^{-20}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi$
- 417 = 0.07 to  $\frac{3.85 \times 10^{-14}}{1.23 \times 10^{-16}}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.5532$  [Fig. 6], following the trend (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.9391),
- 418  $\log(k_v^{frac}) = \frac{16.8718.02 \, \emptyset 21.5}{16.8718.02} \, \emptyset 21.5$
- 419 (10(14)
- 420 This vertical permeability increase is accompanied by a decline in vertical tortuosity from 2.2 to 1 [Fig.
- 421 S1b

# 5.3. Comparison of Permeability Evolution in Fluid Injection Models

422

- To compare the relative contribution of fracture flow to increases in mudstone permeability, we calculate
  the effective fracture width at each step of simulated fluid injection. Effective fracture width for growth of
- 425 microfracture network ( $\varepsilon_{eff}^{mf}$ ) and macrofracture propagation ( $\varepsilon_{eff}^{frac}$ ) are calculated as

426 
$$\varepsilon_{eff}^{mf} = n^{mf} * \varepsilon^{mf} - \varepsilon^{i}, \tag{11.15}$$

427 
$$\varepsilon_{eff}^{frac} = \varepsilon^{frac} - \varepsilon^{i}, \tag{1216}$$

- where  $n^{mf}$  is the number of microfractures simulated in our model ( $n^{mf}$ =3) and  $\varepsilon^i$  is the pore throat width of the starting model ( $\varepsilon^i$ =11.42 nm).
- 430 Over  $\phi$ =0.10-0.3632, we calculate greater values of  $k_v^{mf}$  than  $k_v^{frac}$  [Fig. 6]. Simultaneously,  $\varepsilon_{eff}^{mf}$
- 431 increases from 137 nm to  $\frac{13701100}{100}$  nm [Table S3],  $\varepsilon_{eff}^{frac}$  increases from 366 nm to  $\frac{27802190}{100}$  nm [Table
- 432 S4] and we calculate  $\tau_{\nu}^{mf} < \tau_{\nu}^{free}$  [Fig. S1b].]. This indicates that the growth of a distributed microfracture
- 433 network results in smallergreater vertical tortuositypermeability despite lower effective fracture width
- 434 compared to a single macrofracture. The lower values
- We assume that the modeled fracture systems are fractal in nature macrofractures of vertical tortuosity
- 436 associated with growth arger width ( $\varepsilon^{frac}$ ) are spaced more widely whereas microfractures of a
- 437 microfracture network compared to macrofracture propagation result in  $k_{\nu}^{mf} > k_{\nu}^{frae}$ . Over  $\phi = 0.36 \, 0.41$ , we
- 438 calculate greater values of  $k_{\nu}^{frae}$  than  $k_{\nu}^{mf}$  [Fig. 6]. Simultaneously,  $e_{eff}^{mf}$  increases from 1370 nm to 1890
- 439 | nm [Table S3], ε<sub>ut</sub> free increases from 2780 nm to 3430 nm [Table S4] and we calculate τ<sub>u</sub> free < τ<sub>u</sub> mf [Fig.
- 440 S1b]. The crossover of vertical permeability trends  $k_{\nu}^{\text{rif}}$  and  $k_{\nu}^{\text{free}}$  [Fig. 6] coincides with tortuosity in the
- 441 macrofracture model becoming lower than tortuosity in the microfracture network [Fig. S1b]. Over
- 442  $\phi$ =0.41-0.57, we calculate greater values of  $k_{\nu}^{frae}$  than  $k_{\nu}^{mf}$  and the rate of increase in vertical permeability
- 443 with respect to porosity declines in both models [Fig. 6]. Simultaneously,  $c_{eff}^{eff}$ -increases from 1890 nm to

Formatted: Font: Italic

Formatted: Font: Italic

3430 nm [Table S3],  $e_{\it eff}^{\it frac}$  increases from 3430 nm to 6290 nm [Table S4] and we calculate  $\tau_{\it eff}^{\it frac} \simeq \tau_{\it eff}^{\it mf} \simeq$ 4. smaller width  $(\varepsilon^{mf})$  have intergranular spacing. Our models suggest that upon-initial fluid injection in low porosity mudstones, the growth of a distributed microfracture network yields a greater vertical mudstone permeability compared to propagation of a macrofracture. This is consistent with several experimental, numerical, and field scale studies that record greater increase in mudstone permeability upon distributed fracture growth compared to a wide macrofracture [Backeberg et al., 2017; Matthäi and Belayneh, 2004; Dahl et al., 2015]. Recent studies show that productivity of shale gas wells increases with the use of micro-proppants (1-50 µm) compared to typical proppants (100-300 µm) due to greater permeability enhancement provided by microfractures of smaller width [Calvin et al., 2017]. Our models show that the growth of a distributed microfracture network results in faster decrease in tortuosity of the representative mudstone volume despite lower effective fracture width compared to a single macrofracture. Our results indicate that as porosity increases upon fluid injection, the macrofracture yields greater vertical mudstone permeability than a microfracture network as the macrofracture becomes to conduct the bulk of fluid flux. However, wide fractures resulting in representative mudstone volume porosities greater than 0.3 are not observed in the subsurface due to high fracture opening pressures [Fisher et al., 2002]. Our results suggest that over realistic porosities in compacted mudstones ( $\phi$ <0.3) the growth of a distributed microfracture network yields greater permeability increase than a single macrofracture. Thus, our modeling approach can be used to understand mudstone permeability response to fracture geometries. This predictive capability can help design injection strategies during anthropogenic activities such as hydraulic fracturing, wastewater disposal, and carbon sequestration. 5. Conclusions We develop a simple model that predicts mudstone permeability by simulating fluid flow through pore

structures using the lattice Boltzman method. We validate our model against porosity-permeability

444

445

446

447

448

449

450

451

452

453

454

455

456

457

458

459

460

461

462

463

464

465

466

observations and extend the methodology to predict how permeability changes during fluid injection. Our model represents mudstones as an assemblage of cuboidal grains with thickness ( $\beta$ ), aspect ratio (m), orientation  $(\theta)$  and with intrabed  $(\varepsilon)$  and interbed  $(\lambda)$  pore widths. Compaction models for three homogenous mudstones spanning the representative range of clay platelet lengths  $(0.1-3 \mu m)$  and aspect ratios (20-50) document a variation in mudstone permeability of over 3 orders of magnitude. Compaction of homogenous smectite and kaolinite models document log-linear declines in vertical permeability from  $8.31 \times 10^{-15} \text{ m}^2 - 6.84 \times 10^{-17} \text{ m}^2$  at  $\phi = 0.73 - 0.80$  to  $6.33 \times 10^{-19} \text{ m}^2 - 1.30 \times 10^{-23} \text{ m}^2$  at  $\phi = 0.14 - 0.16$ , showing good correlation with experimental datasets ( $R^2$ =0.42 and  $R^2$ =0.56). Additionally, modeled trends of permeability and tortuosity from compaction of homogenous mudstone models lie within range of experimentally observed values on natural mudstones. We advanceemploy our-validated methodology to predict the porosity-permeability character of two natural mudstones consisting of smectite, illite and chlorite platelets. Over porosity of 0.32-0.58, the porosity-permeability trends described by our heterogenous heterogeneous mudstone models replicating the mineralogical composition of two natural mudstones (models NM1 and NM2) show good correlation with experimental datasets (R<sup>2</sup>=0.78 and  $R^2=0.74$ ). We extend our methodology to permeability during fluid injection in compacted mudstone due to (1) growth of a microfracture network where  $k_v$  increases from  $1.02 \times 10^{-20}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.07$  to  $\frac{9.59 \times 10^{-20}}{1.02 \times 10^{-20}}$  $^{+5}2.07 \times 10^{-16}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.5729$  and to (2) propagation of a macrofracture where  $k_v$  increases from  $1.02 \times 10^{-16}$  $^{20}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.07$  to  $\frac{3.84 \times 10^{-15}}{1.23 \times 10^{-16}}$  m<sup>2</sup> at  $\phi = 0.5532$ . We document that a distributed microfracture network results in greater mudstone permeability at lower mudstone porosities (in compacted mudstones  $(\phi = 0.07 - 0.3632)$  despite lower effective fracture width, whereas a macrofracture yields greater permeability at higher porosity (0.36 0.57) once the macrofracture becomes wide enough to conduct the bulk of the fluid flux. In conclusion, we develop an approach to simulate mudstone permeability during compaction or fluid injection using a simple inputs of clay platelet type (mineralogy), platelet geometry

468

469

470 471

472

473

474

475

476

477

478

479

480

481

482

483

484

485

486

487

488

489

490

(thickness and aspect ratio) and pore throats (porosity). Thus, our model can be used to evaluate fluid flow in mudstone during geological processes or anthropogenic activities.

Acknowledgements: This work has been funded in part by fellowships to Harsh Biren Vora from the Department of Earth, Environment and Planetary Science, Rice University. Computing facilities were made available through the Center for Computational Geophysics. The authors benefitted from discussions on numerical modeling with Dr. Julia Morgan. Modeling results and information can be obtained in supporting information and at https://figshare.com/projects/LBM\_Mudstone\_k/58655.

500	References
200	Keier ences

- 501 Aplin, A. C., I. F. Matenaar, D. K. McCarty, and B. A. van der Pluijm (2006), Influence of mechanical 502 compaction and clay mineral diagenesis on the microfabric and pore-scale properties of deep-water 503 Gulf of Mexico mudstones, Clays Clay Miner., 54(4), 500-514, doi:10.1346/CCMN.2006.0540411.
- 504 Aplin, A. C., Matenaar, I. F., & van der Pluijm, B. (2003). Influence of mechanical compaction and 505 chemical diagenesis on the microfabric and fluid flow properties of Gulf of Mexico mudstones. 506 Journal of Geochemical Exploration, 78, 449-451
- Arch, J., & Maltman, A. (1990). Anisotropic permeability and tortuosity in deformed wet sediments. 507 Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 95(B6), 9035-9045. 508
- 509 Backeberg, N. R., F. Iacoviello, M. Rittner, T. M. Mitchell, A. P. Jones, R. Day, J. Wheeler, P. R. Shearing, P. Vermeesch, and A. Striolo (2017), Quantifying the anisotropy and tortuosity of 510 511 permeable pathways in clay-rich mudstones using models based on X-ray tomography, Sci. Rep., 7(1), 1–12, doi:10.1038/s41598-017-14810-1. 512
- Bennett, R. H., Fischer, K. M., Lavoie, D. L., Bryant, W. R., & Rezak, R. (1989). Porometry and fabric of 513 marine clay and carbonate sediments: determinants of permeability. Marine Geology, 89(1-2), 127-514 515 152.
- Bhandari, A. R., P. B. Flemings, P. J. Polito, M. B. Cronin, and S. L. Bryant (2015), Anisotropy and 516 Stress Dependence of Permeability in the Barnett Shale, Transp. Porous Media, 108(2), 393-411, 517 518 doi:10.1007/s11242-015-0482-0.
- Bolton, A. J., A. J. Maltman, and Q. Fisher (2000), Anisotropic permeability and bimodal pore-size 519 520 distributions of fine-grained marine sediments, Mar. Petrol. Geol., 17, 657–672.
- Bosl, W. J., J. Dvorkin, and A. Nur (1998), A study of porosity and permeability using a lattice 521 522 Boltzmann simulation, Geophys. Res. Lett., 25(9), 1475–1478, doi:10.1029/98g100859.
- 523 Boudreau, B. P., and F. J. R. Meysman (2006), Predicted tortuosity of muds, Geology, 34(8), 693–696, 524 doi:10.1130/G22771.1.
- 525 Bouzidi, M., M. Firdaouss, and P. Lallemand (2001), Momentum transfer of a Boltzmann-lattice fluid 526 with boundaries, Phys. Fluids, 13(11), 3452-3459, doi:10.1063/1.1399290.
- 527 Bowers, G. L., and T. J. Katsube (2002), The Role of Shale Pore Structure on the Sensitivity of Wire-Line Logs to Overpressure, Press. Regimes Sediment. Basins Their Predict. AAPG Mem. 76, 43-60. 528
- 529 Calvin, J., B. Grieser, and T. Bachman (2017), Enhancement of Well Production in the SCOOP 530 Woodford Shale through the Application of Microproppant, SPE Hydraul. Fract. Technol. Conf.
- Exhib., doi:10.2118/184863-MS. 531
- 532 Carman, P. C. (1937). Fluid flow through granular beds. Trans. Inst. Chem. Eng., 15, 150-166.

- Chukwudozie, C. P. (2011). Pore-scale Lattice Boltzmann simulations of inertial flows in realistic porous media: a first principle analysis of the forchheimer relationship.
- Clennell, M. B., D. N. Dewhurst, K. M. Brown, and G. K. Westbrook (1999), Permeability anisotropy of
   consolidated clays, *Muds Mudstones Phys. Fluid Flow Prop.*, *158*, 79–96,
   doi:10.1144/GSL.SP.1999.158.01.07.
- Cook, A. E., and D. E. Sawyer (2015), The mud-sand crossover on marine seismic data, *Geophysics*,
   80(6), A109–A114, doi:10.1190/geo2015-0291.1.
- Dahl, J., P. Nguyen, R. Dusterhoft, J. Calvin, and S. Siddiqui (2015), Application of micro-proppant to
   enhance well production in unconventional reservoirs: Laboratory and field results, SPE West. Reg.
   Meet. 2015 Old Horizons, New Horizons Through Enabling Technol., 2015–Janua, 923–946.
- Daigle, H. (2016), Application of critical path analysis for permeability prediction in natural porous
   media, Adv. Water Resour., 96, 43–54, doi:10.1016/j.advwatres.2016.06.016.
- Daigle, H., and B. Dugan (2011), Permeability anisotropy and fabric development: A mechanistic
   explanation, *Water Resour. Res.*, 47(12), 1–11, doi:10.1029/2011WR011110.
- Daigle, H., and E. J. Screaton (2016), Evolution of sediment permeability during burial and subduction,
   Crustal Permeability, 104–121, doi:10.1002/9781119166573.ch11.
- Day-Stirrat, R. J., A. C. Aplin, J. Środoń, and B. A. van der Pluijm (2008), Diagenetic reorientation of
   phyllosilicate minerals in Paleogene mudstones of the Podhale Basin, southern Poland, *Clays Clay Miner.*, 56(1), 100–111, doi:10.1346/CCMN.2008.0560109.
- Day-Stirrat, R. J., P. B. Flemings, Y. You, A. C. Aplin, and B. A. van der Pluijm (2012), The fabric of consolidation in Gulf of Mexico mudstones, *Mar. Geol.*, 295–298, 77–85,
  doi:10.1016/j.margeo.2011.12.003.
- Deamer, G. A., & Kodama, K. P. (1990). Compaction-induced inclination shallowing in synthetic and natural clay-rich sediments. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, 95(B4), 4511-4529.
- Dewhurst, D. N., A. C. Aplin, and J.-P. Sarda (1999b), Influence of clay fraction on pore-scale properties
   and hydraulic conductivity of experimentally compacted mudstones, *J. Geophys. Res.*, 104, 29261,
   doi:10.1029/1999JB900276.
- Dewhurst, D. N., K. M. Brown, M. B. Clennell, and G. K. Westbrook (1996), A comparison of the fabric
   and permeability anisotropy of consolidated and sheared silty clay, *Eng. Geol.*, 42(4), 253–267,
   doi:10.1016/0013-7952(95)00089-5.
- Dewhurst, D. N., Y. Yang, and a. C. Aplin (1999a), Permeability and fluid flow in natural mudstones,
   *Geol. Soc. London, Spec. Publ.*, *158*(1), 23–43, doi:10.1144/GSL.SP.1999.158.01.03.
- Dugan, B. (2000), Overpressure and Fluid Flow in the New Jersey Continental Slope: Implications for
   Slope Failure and Cold Seeps, *Science* (80-. )., 289(5477), 288–291,
   doi:10.1126/science.289.5477.288.

- England, W. A., A. S. Mackenzie, D. M. Mann, and T. M. Quigley (1987), The movement and
  entrapment of petroleum fluids in the subsurface, *J. Geol. Soc. London.*, 144(2), 327–347,
  doi:10.1144/gsjgs.144.2.0327.
- Fisher, M. K., C. A. Wright, B. M. Davidson, A. K. Goodwin, E. O. Fielder, W. S. Buckler, and N. P.
   Steinsberger (2002), Integrating Fracture Mapping Technologies to Optimize Stimulations in the
   Barnett Shale, SPE Annu. Tech. Conf. Exhib., doi:10.2118/77441-MS.
- 574 Freeze, R. A., and J. A. Cherry (1979), Groundwater, Prentice Hall, Englewood Cliffs, N. J.
- 575 Garven, G., and R. A. Freeze (1984), Theoretical analysis of the role of groundwater flow in the genesis 576 of stratabound ore deposits. 2: Quantitative results, Am. J. Sci., 284, 1125–1174.
- Heath, J. E. (2010), Multi-scale petrography and fluid dynamics of caprocks associated with geological
   CO2 storage, *Dep. Earth Environ. Sci.*, *PhD* (December), 437.
- Hunt, A. G., and G. W. Gee (2002), Application of critical path analysis to fractal porous media:
   Comparison with examples from the Hanford site, *Adv. Water Resour.*, 25(2), 129–146,
   doi:10.1016/S0309-1708(01)00057-4.
- Iversen, N., and B. B. Jorgensen (1993), Diffusion coefficients of sulfate and methane in marine
   sediment: Influence of porosity, *Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta*, 57(5), 571–578.
- John, C. M., and T. Adatte (2009), Data report: X-ray analyses of bulk sediment in IODP Holes U1320A and U1324B, northern Gulf of Mexico, 308, doi:10.2204/iodp.proc.308.214.2009.
- Katsube, T. J., & Williamson, M. A. (1994). Effects of diagenesis on shale nano-pore structure and
   implications for sealing capacity. *Clay minerals*, 29(4), 451-461.
- Keehm, Y. (2004), Permeability prediction from thin sections: 3D reconstruction and Lattice-Boltzmann flow simulation, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, *31*(4), 3–6, doi:10.1029/2003GL018761.
- Kozeny, J. (1927). Uber kapillare leitung der wasser in boden. Royal Academy of Science, Vienna, Proc.
   Class I, 136, 271-306.
- Kuila, U., and M. Prasad (2013), Specific surface area and pore-size distribution in clays and shales,
   *Geophys. Prospect.*, 61(2), 341–362, doi:10.1111/1365-2478.12028.
- 594 Latt, J. (2008), Choice of units in lattice Boltzmann simulations, Lattice Boltzmann How tos, (April), 1–6.
- Long, H., P. B. Flemings, J. T. Germaine, D. M. Saffer, and B. Dugan (2008), Data report: Consolidation characteristics of sediments from IODP Expedition 308, Ursa Basin, Gulf of Mexico, *Proc. Integr. Ocean Drill. Progr. Sci. Results*, 308, doi:10.2204/iodp.proc.308.204.2008.
- Loucks, R. G., R. M. Reed, S. C. Ruppel, and D. M. Jarvie (2009), Morphology, Genesis, and
   Distribution of Nanometer-Scale Pores in Siliceous Mudstones of the Mississippian Barnett Shale, *J. Sediment. Res.*, 79(12), 848–861, doi:10.2110/jsr.2009.092.

- Lucia, F. J., Jennings Jr, J. W., Rahnis, M., & Meyer, F. O. (2001). Permeability and rock fabric from
   wireline logs, Arab-D reservoir, Ghawar field, Saudi Arabia. *GeoArabia*, 6(4), 619-646.
- Martys, N. S., and H. Chen (1996), Simulation of multicomponent fluids in complex three-dimensional
   geometries by the lattice Boltzmann method, *Phys. Rev. E Stat. Physics, Plasmas, Fluids, Relat. Interdiscip. Top.*, 53(1), 743–750, doi:10.1103/PhysRevE.53.743.
- Matthäi, S. K., and M. Belayneh (2004), Fluid flow partitioning between fractures and a permeable rock
   matrix, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 31(7), 1–5, doi:10.1029/2003GL019027.
- Mayerhofer, M. J., E. P. Lolon, J. E. Youngblood, and J. R. Heinze (2006), Integration of Microseismic Fracture-Mapping Results with Numerical Fracture Network Production Modeling in the Barnett
   Shale, SPE Annu. Tech. Conf. Exhib., doi:10.2118/102103-MS.
- Mitchell, J. K., & Soga, K. (2005). Fundamentals of soil behavior (Vol. 3). New York: John Wiley &
   Sons.
- Mondol, N. H., Bjørlykke, K., & Jahren, J. (2008). Experimental compaction of clays: Relationship
   between permeability and petrophysical properties in mudstones. Petroleum Geoscience, 14(4), 319 337.
- Mondol, N. H., K. Bjørlykke, J. Jahren, and K. Høeg (2007), Experimental mechanical compaction of
   clay mineral aggregates-Changes in physical properties of mudstones during burial, *Mar. Pet. Geol.*,
   24(5), 289–311, doi:10.1016/j.marpetgeo.2007.03.006.
- Nabovati, A., and A. C. M. Sousa (2007), Fluid Flow Simulation in Random Porous Media at Pore Level
   Using the Lattice Boltzmann Method, J. Eng. Sci. Technol., 2(3), 226–237, doi:10.1007/978-3-540 75995-9-172.
- Nagaraj, T. S. (1994). Stress state permeability relationships for overconsolidated clays. Geotechnique, 44(2), 349-352.
- 624 Neuzil, C. E. (1994). How permeable are clays and shales?. Water resources research, 30(2), 145-150.
- Olsen, H. W. (1960), Hydraulic Flow Through Saturated Clays, *Clays Clay Miner.*, 9(1), 131–161,
   doi:10.1346/CCMN.1960.0090108.
- Qian, Y. H., D. D'Humières, and P. Lallemand (1992), Lattice BGK Models for Navier-Stokes Equation,
   Europhys. Lett., 17(6BIS), 479–484, doi:10.1209/0295-5075/17/6/001.
- Revil, A., and M. Pessel (2002), Electroosmotic flow and the validity of the classical Darcy equation in silty shales, Geophys. Res. Lett., 29(9), 14-1-14-4, doi:10. 1029/2001gl013480., and M. Pessel (2002), Electroosmotic flow and the validity of the classical Darcy equation in silty shales, Geophys.
   Res. Lett., 29(9), 14-1-14-4, doi:10.1029/2001gl013480.
- Rose, H. E. (1945). An investigation into the laws of flow of fluids through beds of granular materials.

  \*Proceedings of the Institution of Mechanical Engineers, 153(1), 141-148.

- 635 Santamarina, J. C., K. A. Klein, Y. H. Wang, and E. Prencke (2002), Specific surface: determination and relevance, *Can. Geotech. J.*, *39*(1), 233–241, doi:10.1139/t01-077.
- Sawyer, D. E., R. Jacoby, P. Flemings, and J. T. Germaine (2008), Data report: particle size analysis of
   sediments in the Ursa Basin, IODP Expedition 308 Sites U1324 and U1322, northern Gulf of
   Mexico, 308, 1–20, doi:10.2204/iodp.proc.308.205.2008.
- Schneider, J., P. B. Flemings, R. J. Day-Stirrat, and J. T. Germaine (2011), Insights into pore-scale
   controls on mudstone permeability through resedimentation experiments, *Geology*, 39(11), 1011–1014, doi:10.1130/G32475.1.
- Schwartz, L. M., and J. R. Banavar (1989), Transport properties of disordered continuum systems, *Phys. Rev. B*, 39(16), 11965–11970, doi:10.1103/PhysRevB.39.11965.
- Slatt, R. M., and N. R. O'Brien (2011), Pore types in the Barnett and Woodford gas shales: Contribution to understanding gas storage and migration pathways in fine-grained rocks, *Am. Assoc. Pet. Geol.* Bull., 95(12), 2017–2030, doi:10.1306/03301110145.
- Soeder, D. J. (1988). Porosity and permeability of eastern Devonian gas shale. SPE Formation
   Evaluation, 3(01), 116-124.
- Weber, C., M. Heuser, and H. Stanjek (2014), A collection of aspect ratios of common clay minerals
   determined from conductometric titrations, *Clay Miner.*, 49(3), 495–498,
   doi:10.1180/claymin.2014.049.3.10.
- Xiaorong Luo, and G. Vasseur (1992), Contributions of compaction and aquathermal pressuring to
   geopressure and the influence of environmental conditions, *Am. Assoc. Pet. Geol. Bull.*, 76(10),
   1550–1559, doi:10.1306/BDFF8FB0-1718-11D7-8645000102C1865D.
- Yamamoto, Y., & Sawyer, D. E. (2012). Systematic Spatial Variations in the Fabric and Physical
   Properties of Mass-Transport Deposits in the Ursa Region, Northern Gulf of Mexico. In Submarine
   Mass Movements and Their Consequences (pp. 649-658). Springer, Dordrecht.
- Yang, Y., and A. C. Aplin (1998), Influence of lithology and compaction on the pore size distribution and modelled permeability of some mudstones from the Norwegian margin, *Mar. Pet. Geol.*, *15*(2), 163–175, doi:10.1016/S0264-8172(98)00008-7.
- Yang, Y., and A. C. Aplin (2007), Permeability and petrophysical properties of 30 natural mudstones, *J. Geophys. Res. Solid Earth*, 112(3), doi:10.1029/2005JB004243.
- Yang, Y., and A. C. Aplin (2010), A permeability-porosity relationship for mudstones, *Mar. Pet. Geol.*,
   27(8), 1692–1697, doi:10.1016/j.marpetgeo.2009.07.001.

**Table 1:** Clay mineralogy of reference samples for mudstone porosity-permeability behavior. Data from

Long et al. [2008], Sawyer et al. [2009] and Day-Stirrat et al. [2012].

	Sample: 1324C-1H-1	Sample: <del>1324b</del> 1324B-7H-7
Core Top (mbsf)	51.1	60.3
Initial Porosity	0.59	0.51
Clay Mineral Fraction (wt. %)	70.4	68.9
Smectite (wt. %)	82.1	27.3
Illite (wt. %)	17.9	38.8
Chlorite (wt. %)	Trace	25.0
Quartz (wt. %)	Trace	8.8
Consolidation Experiment	CRS 799	CRS 015B

Formatted: Font: Bold

### **Figure Captions**

**Figure 1:** (a) Schematic of initial mudstone structure built from clay platelets (grey cuboids) using inputs of platelet thickness ( $\beta$ ) and aspect ratio (m) and intrabed ( $\varepsilon$ ) and interbed ( $\lambda$ ) pore throat widths and orientation angle with respect to horizontal ( $\theta$ ). Flux of fluid in vertical and horizontal direction are represented by  $q_v$  and  $q_h$  respectively. (b) Mudstone structure after compaction simulated by reduction in pore throat widths,  $\varepsilon$  and  $\lambda$ , and platelet orientation angle ( $\theta$ ).

**Figure 2:** Porosity-vertical permeability model results (symbols) and best-fit lines during compaction for kaolinite, smectite, and intermediate mudstone models. Modeled porosity-permeability trends show good correlation with natural and experimental mudstone permeability compilation [Neuzil, 1994] and experimental data on kaolinite and smectite [Mondol et al., 2008].

Figure 3: Permeability anisotropy  $(k_h/k_v)$  exhibits an inverse correlation with porosity  $(\phi)$  and platelet size  $(m\beta)$  during compaction of <u>homogenous</u> kaolinite, smectite and intermediate mudstone models, and <u>heterogenous NM1 (designed after sample 1324C-1H-1) and NM2 (designed after sample 1324B-7H-7) models.</u>

**Figure 4:** Porosity-permeability predictions (symbols) and best-fit lines during compaction of heterogenous mudstone models *NM1* (replicating mineralogy of designed after sample 1324C-1H-1) and *NM2* (replicating mineralogy of designed after sample 1324B-7H-7). Modeled porosity-permeability trends of *NM1* and *NM2* lie within range of mudstone permeability compilation [Neuzil, 1994], and show good correlation with experimental data on natural mudstones 1324C-1H-1 (Experiment CRS799) and 1324B-7H-7 (Experiment CRS015B) respectively [Long et al., 2008].

**Figure 5:** (a) Schematic of a microfracture network in compacted intermediate mudstone model during fluid injection. In our model microfracture width increases from 11.42 nm to <u>1154377</u> nm [Table S3] (b) Schematic of macrofracture through compacted intermediate mudstone model during fluid injection. In our model, macrofracture width increases from 11.42 nm to <u>62972206</u> nm [Table S4].

**Figure 6:** Porosity-vertical permeability model predictions (symbols) and best-fit lines during fluid injection accommodated through prescribed growth of microfracture network or propagation of a macrofracture. Upto For  $\phi$ =0.3607-0.32, growth of microfracture network  $(k_v^{mf})$  results in greater permeability increase than macrofracture propagation  $(k_v^{frac})$ . Beyond  $\phi$ =0.37,  $k_v^{frac} > k_v^{mf}$  as the macrofracture becomes wide enough to conduct the bulk of fluid flux. Mudstone permeability compilation [Neuzil, 1994] shown for reference.