
ASSIGNMENT 2

MATH 356

QUESTION 1

For part (a), we want $\mathbb{P}(A|Y)$, where A denotes the event that we pick the first bin, B the second bin, and Y a yellow ball. We have the following:

$$\mathbb{P}(A|Y) = \frac{\mathbb{P}(AY)}{\mathbb{P}(Y)}$$

$$\mathbb{P}(Y) = \mathbb{P}(Y|A)\mathbb{P}(A) + \mathbb{P}(Y|A^c)\mathbb{P}(A^c)$$

$$\implies \mathbb{P}(A|Y) = \frac{\mathbb{P}(AY)}{\mathbb{P}(Y|A)\mathbb{P}(A) + \mathbb{P}(Y|A^c)\mathbb{P}(A^c)} \quad \star$$

with the following probabilities:

$$\mathbb{P}(AY) = \frac{4}{10}\mathbb{P}(A) \quad \mathbb{P}(Y|A) = \frac{4}{10} \quad \mathbb{P}(Y|A^c) = \frac{4}{7}$$

since A^c is just the event we pick the other bin, and $\mathbb{P}(A^c) = 1 - \mathbb{P}(A)$

Thus we have:

$$\mathbb{P}(A|Y) = \frac{\frac{4}{10}\mathbb{P}(A)}{\frac{4}{10}\mathbb{P}(A) + \frac{4}{7}[1 - \mathbb{P}(A)]}$$

For part (b), we use the same equation from \star , but notate with Y_Y (the event one picks yellow twice from a bin, without replacement) instead of Y .

$$\implies \mathbb{P}(A|Y_Y) = \frac{\mathbb{P}(AY_Y)}{\mathbb{P}(Y_Y|A)\mathbb{P}(A) + \mathbb{P}(Y_Y|A^c)\mathbb{P}(A^c)}$$

with the following probabilities:

$$\mathbb{P}(AY_Y) = \frac{16}{100}\mathbb{P}(A) \quad \mathbb{P}(Y_Y|A) = \frac{16}{100} \quad \mathbb{P}(Y_Y|A^c) = \frac{16}{49}$$

Thus we have:

$$\mathbb{P}(A|Y_Y) = \frac{\frac{16}{100}\mathbb{P}(A)}{\frac{16}{100}\mathbb{P}(A) + \frac{16}{49}[1 - \mathbb{P}(A)]}$$

since, without replacement, picking a yellow ball twice is equal to the square of the probability of picking it once.

NOTE: I took the probability of choosing a bin at random to be arbitrary, as though it were it's own random variable $X \sim \text{Ber}(p) := \{A, B\}$, for bins A and B . If we take this “random pick” to have $X \sim \text{Ber}(\frac{1}{2})$, then the probabilities are as follows:

$$\text{For part (a), } \mathbb{P}(A|Y) = \frac{1/5}{1/5 + 2/7} = \frac{7}{17} \quad \text{For part (b), } \mathbb{P}(A|Y_Y) = \frac{2/25}{2/25 + 8/49} \approx \frac{1}{3}$$

QUESTION 2

To find $\mathbb{P}(\text{Best applicant hired})$, we split the probability into cases:

$$\begin{aligned}
 \mathbb{P}(\text{Best applicant hired}) &= \mathbb{P}(\text{Best applicant hired in first interview after rejects}) \\
 &+ \mathbb{P}(\text{Best applicant hired in second interview after rejects}) \\
 &\vdots \\
 &+ \mathbb{P}(\text{Best applicant hired in } N - k^{\text{th}} \text{ interview after rejects}) \\
 &= \sum_{i=1}^{N-k} \mathbb{P}(\text{Best applicant hired in } i^{\text{th}} \text{ interview after rejects})
 \end{aligned}$$

By conditional probability, we have

$$\sum_{i=1}^{N-k} \mathbb{P}(A \text{ hired in interview } i) = \sum_{i=1}^{N-k} \mathbb{P}(\text{Given that } A_i = A, A_i \text{ is hired}) \mathbb{P}(A_i = A)$$

where A_i is the i^{th} applicant interviewed after the round of rejects, and A is the best candidate. Immediately, we know that the probability of any candidate being the best, $\mathbb{P}(A_i = A)$, is $\frac{1}{N}$. If A_i is given to be the best, they are hired only if the best candidate thus far was insta-rejected (otherwise, that candidate would have been selected, not A_i). Thus, we have $\mathbb{P}(A_i \text{ hired} | A_i = A) = \frac{k}{k+i-1}$.

$$\mathbb{P}(A \text{ is hired}) = \sum_{i=1}^{N-k} \mathbb{P}(A \text{ hired in interview } i) = \sum_{i=1}^{N-k} \frac{k}{N(k+i-1)}$$

Parts (b) and (c): We'll need to consider subtler points to find "optimal" k 's. One could differentiate our series representation in order to maximize \mathbb{P} , but the following leads nowhere when N is finite:

$$\begin{aligned}
 \mathbb{P}'(k^*) &= \frac{d}{dk^*} \left[\frac{k^*}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N-k^*} \frac{1}{k^*+i-1} \right] \\
 &\implies \sum_{i=1}^{N-k^*} \frac{1}{k^*+i-1} - k^* \sum_{i=1}^{N-k^*} \frac{1}{(k^*+i-1)^2} = 0 \implies \sum_{i=k^*}^{N-1} \frac{1}{i} - \frac{k^*}{i^2} = 0 \quad \star \\
 &= \frac{1}{k^*+1} - \frac{k^*}{(k^*+1)^2} + \frac{1}{k^*+2} - \frac{k^*}{(k^*+2)^2} + \dots + \frac{1}{N-1} - \frac{k^*}{(N-1)^2} \\
 &= \frac{1}{k^*+1} \underbrace{\left(1 - \frac{k^*}{k^*+1}\right)}_{<1} + \frac{1}{k^*+2} \underbrace{\left(1 - \frac{k^*}{k^*+2}\right)}_{<1} + \dots + \frac{1}{N-1} \underbrace{\left(1 - \frac{k^*}{k^*+1}\right)}_{<1} \\
 &= 0 \text{ only when } k^* \text{ and } N \text{ are very large, if at all.}
 \end{aligned}$$

Thus, consider the case where N is large, and construct an integral analogous to our discrete formula for \mathbb{P} .

Let $m = \frac{k^*}{N}$, the ratio between k and N for a particular setup. We'll try to maximize \mathbb{P} in terms of this ratio:

$$\sum_{i=1}^{N-k} \frac{k}{N(k+i-1)} = m \sum_{i=1}^{N-k} \frac{1}{k+i-1}$$

Additionally, let $x = \frac{k+i-1}{N}$. Then we can have $dx = \frac{1}{N}$, since N is small.

$$m \sum_{i=1}^{N-k} \frac{1}{k+i-1} = m \sum_{i=1}^{N-k} \frac{1}{x} dx = m \int_D \frac{1}{x} dx$$

To find a suitable domain D , set $x_A = m \implies \frac{k+i-1}{N} = \frac{k}{N} \implies i = 1$, which is the desired lower index.

For an upper bound, have $x_B = 1 - dx = \frac{k+i-1}{N} \implies N - Ndx = k + i - 1 = N - 1 \implies i = N - k$, as desired.

$$m \int_m^{1-\varepsilon} \frac{1}{x} dx = m \ln(x) \Big|_m^{1-\varepsilon} = m \ln(1 - \varepsilon) - m \ln(m) = -m \ln(m)$$

Thus, for a ratio $\frac{k^*}{N}$, we can approximate the associated probability as $-m \ln(m)$.

To maximize, we take the derivative and set equal to 0:

$$-m \frac{1}{m} - \ln(m) = -1 - \ln(m) = 0 \implies m = \boxed{e^{-1} = \frac{k^*}{N} \text{ as } N \rightarrow \infty}$$

Thus, for any given N , the ideal k^* is $\lfloor N e^{-1} \rfloor$. Using \star , one could also express k^* using harmonic numbers:

$$k^* = \frac{H_{N-1} - H_{k-1}}{H_{N-1}^2 - H_{k-1}^2}$$

where $H_A^B = \sum_{i=1}^A \frac{1}{i^B}$

QUESTION 3

Note that the probability of flipping heads-then-tails is the same as flipping tails-then-heads: $p(1-p) = (1-p)p$. Also note that, in a sequence of infinite coin tosses, the probability of achieving a *fixed* $\omega = \{\omega_1, \omega_2, \dots\}$ is exactly 0 (analogous to this setup is the probability of pinning a dart at *exactly* a given radius, or choosing $c \in \mathbb{R}$ in the interval $a < b$; one could think of an infinite sequence of coin tosses as a binary expansion of a particular real number).

\Rightarrow in a given infinite sequence of coin tosses, one is guaranteed to encounter both combinations HT and TH , each of which is equally likely. Thus, the odds that one comes across HT first is $\frac{1}{2}$, and the odds one comes across TH first is $\frac{1}{2}$.

Or alternatively, the probability that the *second* like tosses is HT = or third, or fourth, biased coin there potential for infinite fair coins!

QUESTION 4

Let $y(X) = u(X) + v(X)$. Since both u and v are well defined from $\mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$, y is too.

Consider the case where X is discrete. We have:

$$\begin{aligned}
 \mathbb{E}[u(X) + v(X)] &= \mathbb{E}[y(X)] \\
 &= \sum_{x \in S} y(x) \mathbb{P}(X = x) \\
 &= \sum_{x \in S} [u(x) + v(x)] \mathbb{P}(X = x) \\
 &= \sum_{x \in S} u(x) \mathbb{P}(X = x) + \sum_{x \in S} v(x) \mathbb{P}(X = x) \\
 &= \mathbb{E}[u(X)] + \mathbb{E}[v(X)]
 \end{aligned}$$

Now let X be a continuous r.v. with PDF $f : \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$.

$$\begin{aligned}
 \mathbb{E}[u(X) + v(X)] &= \mathbb{E}[y(X)] \\
 &= \int_{\mathbb{R}} y(X) f(X) \\
 &= \int_{\mathbb{R}} [u(X) + v(X)] f(X) \\
 &= \int_{\mathbb{R}} u(X) f(X) + \int_{\mathbb{R}} v(X) f(X) \\
 &= \int_{\mathbb{R}} u(X) f(X) + \int_{\mathbb{R}} v(X) f(X) \\
 &= \mathbb{E}[u(X)] + \mathbb{E}[v(X)]
 \end{aligned}$$

following linearity of integration.

QUESTION 5

From the previous homework, recall the probability that *exactly* k people receive the correct hat:

$$\mathbb{P}(X = k) = \sum_{j=0}^{N-k} \frac{(-1)^j}{j!k!}$$

Note that X is a discrete random variable, with $S := \mathbb{N} \cup 0$ being the possible values it can take. We have that

$$\mathbb{E}X = \sum_{k \geq 0} k \mathbb{P}(X = k) = \sum_{k \geq 0} k \sum_{j \geq 0} \frac{(-1)^j}{j!k!}$$

Since the question is unclear about it, I am assuming both infinite hatchecks.

Again from the previous homework, the second summation is equivalent to $\frac{e^{-1}}{k!}$

$$\mathbb{E}X = e^{-1} \sum_{k \geq 0} \frac{k}{k!}$$

Consider the series expansion of $\frac{k}{k!}$ for $k \geq 0$: $1 + \frac{2}{2!} + \frac{3}{3!} + \dots$

$1 + 1 + \frac{1}{2!} + \frac{1}{3!} + \dots = e^1$ by Taylor series

$\implies \mathbb{E}X = e^{-1}e = 1$, so we can expect, interestingly, 1 person to receive their hat in an infinitely huge room of hat-checkers. Lucky guy.

Alternatively, if we take $X = k$ to be the event that k people get their hats in a *finite* scenario, then we can decompose X in much the same way we do $B \sim \text{Bin}(n, p)$, with X_i “heads” if person i gets his hat, “tails” if he doesn’t. Denote these events with a 1 or 0. Then $X = X_1 + X_2 + \dots + X_N$ and $\mathbb{E}X = \mathbb{E}X_1 + \mathbb{E}X_2 + \dots + \mathbb{E}X_N$ by linearity of expectation. For any X_i , we have $\mathbb{E}X_i = \sum_{k=0 \text{ and } 1} k \mathbb{P}(X_i = k) = 0 + 1 \mathbb{P}(X_i \text{ gets hat}) = \frac{1}{N}$. Thus $\mathbb{E}X = N(\frac{1}{N}) = 1$ once again. \square