

EXT: Reviewer Invitation for SMALLHOLDER FARMERS' COMMERCIALIZATION OF WHEAT PRODUCTION IN SAYINT ADJIBAR, NORTHERN ETHIOPIA: MARKET PARTICIPATION

em.cogentagri.0.68e3a3.75f9c648@editorialmanager.com
<em.cogentagri.0.68e3a3.75f9c648@editorialmanager.com>

on behalf of

Cogent Food and Agriculture <em@editorialmanager.com>

Mon 1/27/2020 12:27 AM

To: Herman Sahni <hsahni@bw.edu>

Dear Dr Sahni,

I would like to invite you to review a manuscript entitled "SMALLHOLDER FARMERS' COMMERCIALIZATION OF WHEAT PRODUCTION IN SAYINT ADJIBAR, NORTHERN ETHIOPIA: MARKET PARTICIPATION" which has been submitted to Cogent Food & Agriculture. This involves completing a scorecard and submitting your recommendation, with the entire process conducted via an easy online system. I would be grateful for your expertise in assessing this article.

If you are able to accept the invitation, please click this link:

[Agree to Review](#)

If you are unable to review the manuscript on this occasion, please click this link:

[Decline to Review](#)

Cogent Food & Agriculture follows a single-blind peer review process.

Reviewers should not recommend rejection of manuscripts purely on the grounds of perceived importance. This approach allows for a more objective consideration of negative findings, replication studies and new and experimental ideas. For more information about our criteria for publication, expectations of reviewers and our review process please visit the website at <https://www.cogentoa.com/reviewers>. If there is a conflict of interest that will prevent you from providing an unbiased view please let me know as soon as possible.

If you have reviewed a previous version of this manuscript, please note that you should be primarily assessing the revision based on whether authors have successfully made the requested amendments, rather than identifying new issues.

Please find the abstract for the manuscript below for your information. The full paper will be available to read on the online system if you accept the invitation.

Wheat is an important market oriented commodity and a major source of income that provides the livelihood for many smallholder farmers in Ethiopia. Despite of this, smallholder farmers are not enough to participate in wheat market and its level of commercialization is very low. The study aimed at analyzing the smallholder farmer's commercialization of wheat production in Sayint Adjibar, Northern Ethiopia; market participation. The data were collected from 190 randomly selected sampled households through using structured questionnaire. Both descriptive statistics and econometric model

were used to analyze the data. The determinants of smallholder wheat farmers' market participation and its intensity of participation was analyzed by Double Hurdle Model. Descriptive statistics revealed that the average commercialization index of the sampled wheat farmers was 10.26%, which is categorized under lower level of commercialization. The first hurdle estimation result showed that age, market experience, access to market, current selling price, family size and land size of wheat of the sampled households were significantly affecting the decision of smallholder wheat farmers to participate in wheat market. In the second hurdle, wheat market experience, educational level, current selling price, off/none farm income, land size of wheat, market orientation and distance to all weather road were appeared to be significant determinants of the intensity of market participation by smallholder wheat farmers. Therefore, designing an integrated policy and strategy that could improve/enhance level of commercialization of wheat, market access, market orientation, and education, productivity of land and infrastructures / road for wheat would be recommended.

*If these links do not work, please go to <https://www.editorialmanager.com/cogentagri/> and log-in as a reviewer.

Your username is: HermanSahni

[click here to reset your password](#)

The manuscript reference is COGENTAGRI-2019-0242R3.

If possible, I would appreciate receiving your review 10 days from the date of accepting this invitation.

We are collaborating with Publons to give you the recognition you deserve for your peer review contributions. On Publons you can effortlessly track, verify and showcase your review work and expertise without compromising anonymity. [Sign up](#) now for free so when you complete any reviews they can be instantly added to your profile.

Thank you in advance for your support,
Fatih Yildiz, Ph.D., Senior Editor

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. ([Remove my information/details](#)). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

EXT: Reviewer Invitation for SMALLHOLDER FARMERS' COMMERCIALIZATION OF WHEAT PRODUCTION IN NORTHERN ETHIOPIA: MARKET PARTICIPATION

em.cogentagri.0.6b5432.a897c44c@editorialmanager.com
<em.cogentagri.0.6b5432.a897c44c@editorialmanager.com>
on behalf of
Cogent Food and Agriculture <em@editorialmanager.com>

Sun 5/17/2020 1:15 AM

To: Herman Sahni <hsahni@bw.edu>

Dear Dr Sahni,

I would like to invite you to review a manuscript entitled "SMALLHOLDER FARMERS' COMMERCIALIZATION OF WHEAT PRODUCTION IN NORTHERN ETHIOPIA: MARKET PARTICIPATION" which has been submitted to Cogent Food & Agriculture. This involves completing a scorecard and submitting your recommendation, with the entire process conducted via an easy online system. I would be grateful for your expertise in assessing this article.

If you are able to accept the invitation, please click this link:

[Agree to Review](#)

If you are unable to review the manuscript on this occasion, please click this link:

[Decline to Review](#)

Cogent Food & Agriculture follows a single-blind peer review process.

Reviewers should not recommend rejection of manuscripts purely on the grounds of perceived importance. This approach allows for a more objective consideration of negative findings, replication studies and new and experimental ideas. For more information about our criteria for publication, expectations of reviewers and our review process please visit the website at <https://www.cogentoa.com/reviewers>. If there is a conflict of interest that will prevent you from providing an unbiased view please let me know as soon as possible.

If you have reviewed a previous version of this manuscript, please note that you should be primarily assessing the revision based on whether authors have successfully made the requested amendments, rather than identifying new issues.

Please find the abstract for the manuscript below for your information. The full paper will be available to read on the online system if you accept the invitation.

Wheat is an important market oriented commodity and a major source of income that provides the livelihood for many smallholder farmers in Ethiopia. Despite of this, smallholder farmers are not enough to participate in the wheat market and its level of commercialization is very low. The study aimed at analyzing the smallholder farmer's commercialization of wheat production in Sayint Adjibar, Northern Ethiopia; market participation. The data were collected from 190 randomly selected sample households through using a structured questionnaire. Both descriptive statistics and econometric model were used to analyze the data. The determinants of smallholder wheat farmers' market

participation and its intensity of participation was analyzed by Double Hurdle Model. Descriptive statistics revealed that the average commercialization index of the sampled wheat farmers was 10.26%, which is categorized under lower level of commercialization. The first hurdle estimation result showed that age, market experience, access to market, current selling price, family size and land size of wheat of the sampled households were significantly affecting the decision of smallholder wheat farmers to participate in wheat market. In the second hurdle, wheat market experience, educational level, current selling price, off/none farm income, land size of wheat, market orientation and distance to all weather road were appeared to be significant determinants of the intensity of market participation by smallholder wheat farmers. Therefore, designing an integrated policy and strategy that could improve/enhance level of commercialization of wheat, market access, market orientation, and education, productivity of land and infrastructures / road for wheat would be recommended.

*If these links do not work, please go to <https://www.editorialmanager.com/cogentagri/> and log-in as a reviewer.

Your username is: HermanSahni

[click here to reset your password](#)

The manuscript reference is COGENTAGRI-2019-0242R4.

If possible, I would appreciate receiving your review 10 days from the date of accepting this invitation.

We are collaborating with Publons to give you the recognition you deserve for your peer review contributions. On Publons you can effortlessly track, verify and showcase your review work and expertise without compromising anonymity. [Sign up](#) now for free so when you complete any reviews they can be instantly added to your profile.

Thank you in advance for your support,
Fatih Yildiz, Ph.D., Senior Editor

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. ([Remove my information/details](#)). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

EXT: A decision has been made on COGENTAGRI-2019-0242R5

em.cogentagri.0.6d5cc4.bc9fcf22@editorialmanager.com
<em.cogentagri.0.6d5cc4.bc9fcf22@editorialmanager.com>
on behalf of

Cogent Food and Agriculture <em@editorialmanager.com>

Mon 8/17/2020 2:21 PM

To: Herman Sahni <hsahni@bw.edu>

Ref: COGENTAGRI-2019-0242R5

SMALLHOLDER FARMERS' COMMERCIALIZATION OF WHEAT PRODUCTION IN NORTHERN ETHIOPIA:
MARKET PARTICIPATION

Cogent Food & Agriculture

Dear Dr Sahni,

Thank you for reviewing this manuscript. The Editor has decided not to publish this paper; a copy of the decision letter can be found below.

You can also access your review comments and the decision letter by logging onto Editorial Manager as a Reviewer.

To: *****

From: "Cogent Food and Agriculture" agriculture@cogentoa.com

Subject: 190519192 (Cogent Food & Agriculture) A decision has been made on your submission

Ref: COGENTAGRI-2019-0242R5

190519192

SMALLHOLDER FARMERS' COMMERCIALIZATION OF WHEAT PRODUCTION IN NORTHERN ETHIOPIA:
MARKET PARTICIPATION

Cogent Food & Agriculture

Dear *****,

Reviewers' comments on your manuscript have now been received. Having considered these comments alongside your paper I have decided that, unfortunately, we will not be able to publish your paper in Cogent Food & Agriculture on this occasion. If you feel that the manuscript could be significantly revised based on the reviewers' comments, you could consider resubmitting as a new manuscript in the future.

For your guidance, I append the reviewers' comments below.

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to consider your work.

Yours sincerely

Fatih Yildiz, Ph.D.

Senior Editor
Cogent Food & Agriculture

Comments from the Editors and Reviewers:

Do you want to get recognition for this review on Publons?</p><p><i> Don't let your reviewing work go unnoticed! Researchers the world over use Publons to effortlessly track their valuable peer review contributions for any journal. If you opt in, your Publons profile will automatically be updated to show a verified record of this review in full compliance with the journal's review policy. If you don't have a Publons profile, you will be prompted to create a free account. [Learn more]</i> </p>

Reviewer 11: Yes

Title, Abstract and Introduction – overall evaluation

Reviewer 11: Unsound or fundamentally flawed

Methodology / Materials and Methods – overall evaluation

Reviewer 11: Unsound or fundamentally flawed

Objective / Hypothesis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 11: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Figures and Tables – overall evaluation

Reviewer 11: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Results / Data Analysis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 11: Unsound or fundamentally flawed

Interpretation / Discussion – overall evaluation

Reviewer 11: Unsound or fundamentally flawed

Conclusions – overall evaluation

Reviewer 11: Unsound or fundamentally flawed

References – overall evaluation

Reviewer 11: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Compliance with Ethical Standards – overall evaluation

Reviewer 11: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Writing – overall evaluation

Reviewer 11: Unsound or fundamentally flawed

Supplemental Information and Data – overall evaluation

Reviewer 11: Unsound or fundamentally flawed

Comments to the author

Reviewer 11: The paper has lack of theoretical background.

The research questions are unclear.

The paper has lack of novelty.

There is no theoretical reasons for explaining the reasons behind the inclusion of the explanatory variables in the empirical model.

Do you want to get recognition for this review on <a

href="<https://nam11.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fpublons.com%2Fpublisher%2F24%2Ftaylor-francis&data=02%7C01%7Chsahni%40bw.edu%7C49f3a39ac84d47615b5a08d842da628a%7C3a9a104352cb404ebc8dcb2b5a92d3bc%7C1%7C0%7C637332853008700050&sdata=RUa%2F3jDXznt6mPxU6YENUV3GIA6XgCLBKAI4dMt%2FEGw%3D&reserved=0>

url=https%3A%2F%2Fpublons.com%2Fpublisher%2F24%2Ftaylor-francis&data=02%7C01%7Chsahni%40bw.edu%7C49f3a39ac84d47615b5a08d842da628a%7C3a9a104352cb404ebc8dcb2b5a92d3bc%7C1%7C0%7C637332853008700050&sdata=RUa%2F3jDXznt6mPxU6YENUV3GIA6XgCLBKAI4dMt%2FEGw%3D&reserved=0" target="_blank">Publons?</p><p><i> Don't let your reviewing work go unnoticed! Researchers the world over use Publons to effortlessly track their valuable peer review contributions for any journal. If you opt in, your Publons profile will automatically be updated to show a verified record of this review in full compliance with the journal's review policy. If you don't have a Publons profile, you will be prompted to create a free account. [Learn more]</i></p>

target="_blank">Publons?</p><p><i> Don't let your reviewing work go unnoticed! Researchers the world over use Publons to effortlessly track their valuable peer review contributions for any journal. If you opt in, your Publons profile will automatically be updated to show a verified record of this review in full compliance with the journal's review policy. If you don't have a Publons profile, you will be prompted to create a free account. [Learn more]</i></p>

href="<https://nam11.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fpublons.com%2Fpublisher%2F24%2Ftaylor-francis&data=02%7C01%7Chsahni%40bw.edu%7C49f3a39ac84d47615b5a08d842da628a%7C3a9a104352cb404ebc8dcb2b5a92d3bc%7C1%7C0%7C637332853008700050&sdata=RUa%2F3jDXznt6mPxU6YENUV3GIA6XgCLBKAI4dMt%2FEGw%3D&reserved=0>

url=https%3A%2F%2Fpublons.com%2Fpublisher%2F24%2Ftaylor-francis&data=02%7C01%7Chsahni%40bw.edu%7C49f3a39ac84d47615b5a08d842da628a%7C3a9a104352cb404ebc8dcb2b5a92d3bc%7C1%7C0%7C637332853008700050&sdata=RUa%2F3jDXznt6mPxU6YENUV3GIA6XgCLBKAI4dMt%2FEGw%3D&reserved=0" target="_blank">Learn more]</i></p>

more]</i></p>

Reviewer 12: Yes

Title, Abstract and Introduction – overall evaluation

Reviewer 12: Sound

Methodology / Materials and Methods – overall evaluation

Reviewer 12: Sound

Objective / Hypothesis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 12: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Figures and Tables – overall evaluation

Reviewer 12: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Results / Data Analysis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 12: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Interpretation / Discussion – overall evaluation

Reviewer 12: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Conclusions – overall evaluation

Reviewer 12: Sound

References – overall evaluation

Reviewer 12: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Compliance with Ethical Standards – overall evaluation

Reviewer 12: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Writing – overall evaluation

Reviewer 12: Sound

Supplemental Information and Data – overall evaluation

Reviewer 12: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Comments to the author

Reviewer 12: The study failed to carry out a proper review of literature as to bring out the uniqueness of this study. Also, a rough idea of farmers participating in wheat market should be provided .

The manuscript has several problems to be published , as indicated by reviewer no 11. The paper has lack of theoretical background.

The research questions are unclear. The paper has lack of novelty. There is no theoretical reasons for explaining the reasons behind the inclusion of the explanatory variables in the empirical model.

Please make all revisions and corrections before sending for reevaluation by reviewers.

Kind regards,

Fatih Yildiz, Ph.D.

Senior Editor

Cogent Food & Agriculture

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL:

[https://nam11.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?](https://nam11.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.editorialmanager.com%2Fcogentagri%2Flogin.asp%3Fa%3Dr&data=02%7C01%7Chsahni%40bw.edu%7C49f3a39ac84d47615b5a08d842da628a%7C3a9a104352cb404ebc8dcb2b5a92d3bc%7C1%7C0%7C637332853008710041&data=dD7cPIRzL1WMf7hk6zccZS3jwj9CLJt8NMi%7CdohSu1RQ%3D&reserved=0)

[url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.editorialmanager.com%2Fcogentagri%2Flogin.asp%3Fa%3Dr&data=02%7C01%7Chsahni%40bw.edu%7C49f3a39ac84d47615b5a08d842da628a%7C3a9a104352cb404ebc8dcb2b5a92d3bc%7C1%7C0%7C637332853008710041&data=dD7cPIRzL1WMf7hk6zccZS3jwj9CLJt8NMi%7CdohSu1RQ%3D&reserved=0](https://nam11.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.editorialmanager.com%2Fcogentagri%2Flogin.asp%3Fa%3Dr&data=02%7C01%7Chsahni%40bw.edu%7C49f3a39ac84d47615b5a08d842da628a%7C3a9a104352cb404ebc8dcb2b5a92d3bc%7C1%7C0%7C637332853008710041&data=dD7cPIRzL1WMf7hk6zccZS3jwj9CLJt8NMi%7CdohSu1RQ%3D&reserved=0)). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Verify journal review completion from Web of Science

<https://www.webofscience.com/wos/author/record/2258337>

The image shows a two-part screenshot of the Web of Science author profile for Herman Sahni. The top part shows the author's profile information, and the bottom part shows the 'Peer Review' tab with a list of verified peer reviews.

Top Screenshot:

- Browser address bar: [webofscience.com/wos/author/record/2258337](https://www.webofscience.com/wos/author/record/2258337)
- Author Name: **Herman Sahni** (verified)
- Organization: Baldwin Wallace University
- Web of Science ResearcherID: AAG-7762-2019
- Published name: Sahni, Herman
- Published Organization: Baldwin Wallace University
- Subject Categories: Business & Economics; Social Sciences - Other Topics; Family Studies
- Other Identifiers: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3862-1091>
- Navigation tabs: Documents, **Peer Review**

Bottom Screenshot:

- Browser address bar: [webofscience.com/wos/author/record/2258337](https://www.webofscience.com/wos/author/record/2258337)
- Navigation tabs: Documents, **Peer Review**
- Section: Verified peer reviews
- List of verified peer reviews:

Count	Journal Name
2	Cogent Economics & Finance
2	Cogent Food & Agriculture
1	Economia E Politica Industriale
1	Economies
1	International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health
1	Journal of African Development