

How Logic Works: Solutions to Problems

Hans Halvorson

November 27, 2025

Chapter 3

Exercise 3.1

1. $P \vdash Q \rightarrow (P \wedge Q)$

1	(1)	P	A
2	(2)	Q	A
1,2	(3)	$P \wedge Q$	1,2 $\wedge I$
1	(4)	$Q \rightarrow (P \wedge Q)$	2,3 CP

2. $(P \rightarrow Q) \wedge (P \rightarrow R) \vdash P \rightarrow (Q \wedge R)$

1	(1)	$(P \rightarrow Q) \wedge (P \rightarrow R)$	A
2	(2)	P	A
1	(3)	$P \rightarrow Q$	1 $\wedge E$
1	(4)	$P \rightarrow R$	1 $\wedge E$
1,2	(5)	Q	3,2 MP
1,2	(6)	R	4,2 MP
1,2	(7)	$Q \wedge R$	5,6 $\wedge I$
1	(8)	$P \rightarrow (Q \wedge R)$	2,7 CP

3. $P \rightarrow (Q \rightarrow R) \vdash Q \rightarrow (P \rightarrow R)$

1	(1)	$P \rightarrow (Q \rightarrow R)$	A
2	(2)	Q	A
3	(3)	P	A
1,3	(4)	$Q \rightarrow R$	3,1 MP
1,2,3	(5)	R	4,2 MP
1,2	(6)	$P \rightarrow R$	3,5 CP
1	(7)	$Q \rightarrow (P \rightarrow R)$	2,6 CP

4. $P \rightarrow Q \vdash (Q \rightarrow R) \rightarrow (P \rightarrow R)$

1	(1)	$P \rightarrow Q$	A
2	(2)	$Q \rightarrow R$	A
3	(3)	P	A
1,3	(4)	Q	1,3 MP
1,2,3	(5)	R	2,4 MP
1,2	(6)	$P \rightarrow R$	3,5 CP
1	(7)	$(Q \rightarrow R) \rightarrow (P \rightarrow R)$	2,6 CP

5. $P \rightarrow (P \rightarrow Q) \vdash P \rightarrow Q$

1	(1)	$P \rightarrow (P \rightarrow Q)$	A
2	(2)	P	A
1,2	(3)	$P \rightarrow Q$	1,2 MP
1,2	(4)	Q	3,2 MP
1	(5)	$P \rightarrow Q$	2,4 CP

6. $P \rightarrow (Q \rightarrow R) \vdash (P \wedge Q) \rightarrow R$

1	(1)	$P \rightarrow (Q \rightarrow R)$	A
2	(2)	$P \wedge Q$	A
2	(3)	P	2 \wedge E
2	(4)	Q	2 \wedge E
1,2	(5)	$Q \rightarrow R$	1,3 MP
1,2	(6)	R	5,4 MP
1	(7)	$(P \wedge Q) \rightarrow R$	2,6 CP

7. $(P \vee Q) \rightarrow R \vdash P \rightarrow R$

1	(1)	$(P \vee Q) \rightarrow R$	A
2	(2)	P	A
2	(3)	$P \vee Q$	2 \vee I
1,2	(4)	R	1,3 MP
1	(5)	$P \rightarrow R$	2,4 CP

8. $\neg P \vdash \neg(P \wedge Q)$

1	(1)	$\neg P$	A
2	(2)	$P \wedge Q$	A
2	(3)	P	2 \wedge E
	(4)	$(P \wedge Q) \rightarrow P$	2,3 CP
1	(5)	$\neg(P \wedge Q)$	4,1 MT

9. $\neg(P \vee Q) \vdash \neg P \wedge \neg Q$

1	(1)	$\neg(P \vee Q)$	A
2	(2)	P	A
2	(3)	$P \vee Q$	2 \vee I
	(4)	$P \rightarrow (P \vee Q)$	2,3 CP
1	(5)	$\neg P$	4,1 MT
6	(6)	Q	A
6	(7)	$P \vee Q$	6 \vee I
	(8)	$Q \rightarrow (P \vee Q)$	6,7 CP
1	(9)	$\neg Q$	8,1 MT
1	(10)	$\neg P \wedge \neg Q$	5,9 \wedge I

10. $P \rightarrow \neg P \vdash \neg P$

1	(1)	P	A
2	(2)	$P \rightarrow \neg P$	A
1,2	(3)	$\neg P$	2,1 MP
1	(4)	$(P \rightarrow \neg P) \rightarrow \neg P$	2,3 CP
1	(5)	$\neg \neg P$	1 DN
1	(6)	$\neg(P \rightarrow \neg P)$	4,5 MT
	(7)	$P \rightarrow \neg(P \rightarrow \neg P)$	1,6 CP
2	(8)	$\neg \neg(P \rightarrow \neg P)$	2 DN
2	(9)	$\neg P$	7,8 MT

Exercise 3.4

1. $P \rightarrow Q \vdash \neg(P \wedge \neg Q)$

1	(1)	$P \rightarrow Q$	A
2	(2)	$P \wedge \neg Q$	A
2	(3)	P	2 \wedge E
1,2	(4)	Q	1,3 MP
2	(5)	$\neg Q$	2 \wedge E
1,2	(6)	$Q \wedge \neg Q$	4,5 \wedge I
1	(7)	$\neg(P \wedge \neg Q)$	2,6 RA

2. $\neg(P \wedge Q) \vdash \neg P \vee \neg Q$

1	(1)	$\neg(P \wedge Q)$	A
2	(2)	$\neg(\neg P \vee \neg Q)$	A
3	(3)	$\neg P$	A
3	(4)	$\neg P \vee \neg Q$	3 \vee I
2,3	(5)	$(\neg P \vee \neg Q) \wedge \neg(\neg P \vee \neg Q)$	4,2 \wedge I
2	(6)	$\neg\neg P$	3,5 RA
2	(7)	P	6 DN
8	(8)	$\neg Q$	A
8	(9)	$\neg P \vee \neg Q$	8 \vee I
2,8	(10)	$(\neg P \vee \neg Q) \wedge \neg(\neg P \vee \neg Q)$	9,2 \wedge I
2	(11)	$\neg\neg Q$	8,10 RA
2	(12)	Q	11 DN
2	(13)	$P \wedge Q$	7,12 \wedge I
1,2	(14)	$(P \wedge Q) \wedge \neg(P \wedge Q)$	13,1 \wedge I
1	(15)	$\neg\neg(\neg P \vee \neg Q)$	2,14 RA
1	(16)	$\neg P \vee \neg Q$	15 DN

3. $\neg(P \rightarrow Q) \vdash P \wedge \neg Q$

1	(1)	$\neg(P \rightarrow Q)$	A
2	(2)	$\neg P$	A
3	(3)	$\neg Q$	A
4	(4)	P	A
2,4	(5)	$P \wedge \neg P$	2,4 \wedge I
2,4	(6)	$\neg\neg Q$	3,5 RA
2,4	(7)	Q	6 DN
2	(8)	$P \rightarrow Q$	4,7 CP
1,2	(9)	$(P \rightarrow Q) \wedge \neg(P \rightarrow Q)$	8,1 \wedge I
1	(10)	$\neg\neg P$	2,9 RA
1	(11)	P	10 DN
12	(12)	Q	A
12	(13)	$P \rightarrow Q$	4,12 CP
1,12	(14)	$(P \rightarrow Q) \wedge \neg(P \rightarrow Q)$	13,1 \wedge I
1	(15)	$\neg Q$	12,14 RA
1	(16)	$P \wedge \neg Q$	11,15 \wedge I

4. $\vdash (P \rightarrow Q) \vee (Q \rightarrow P)$

1	(1)	$\neg((P \rightarrow Q) \vee (Q \rightarrow P))$	A
2	(2)	P	A
3	(3)	Q	A
2	(4)	$Q \rightarrow P$	3,2 CP
2	(5)	$(P \rightarrow Q) \vee (Q \rightarrow P)$	4 \vee I
1,2	(6)	$((P \rightarrow Q) \vee (Q \rightarrow P)) \wedge \neg((P \rightarrow Q) \vee (Q \rightarrow P))$	5,1 \wedge I
1	(7)	$\neg P$	2,6 RA
8	(8)	$\neg Q$	A
1,2	(9)	$P \wedge \neg P$	2,7 \wedge I
1,2	(10)	$\neg\neg Q$	8,9 RA
1,2	(11)	Q	10 DN
1	(12)	$P \rightarrow Q$	2,11 CP
1	(13)	$(P \rightarrow Q) \vee (Q \rightarrow P)$	12 \vee I
1	(14)	$((P \rightarrow Q) \vee (Q \rightarrow P)) \wedge \neg((P \rightarrow Q) \vee (Q \rightarrow P))$	13,1 \wedge I
\emptyset	(15)	$\neg\neg((P \rightarrow Q) \vee (Q \rightarrow P))$	1,14 RA
\emptyset	(16)	$(P \rightarrow Q) \vee (Q \rightarrow P)$	15 DN

5. $P \rightarrow (Q \vee R) \vdash (P \rightarrow Q) \vee (P \rightarrow R)$

1	(1)	$P \rightarrow (Q \vee R)$	A
2	(2)	$\neg((P \rightarrow Q) \vee (P \rightarrow R))$	A
3	(3)	$\neg P$	A
4	(4)	P	A
5	(5)	$\neg Q$	A
3,4	(6)	$P \wedge \neg P$	4,3 \wedge I
3,4	(7)	$\neg\neg Q$	5,6 RA
3,4	(8)	Q	7 DN
3	(9)	$P \rightarrow Q$	4,8 CP
3	(10)	$(P \rightarrow Q) \vee (P \rightarrow R)$	9 \vee I
2,3	(11)	$((P \rightarrow Q) \vee (P \rightarrow R)) \wedge \neg((P \rightarrow Q) \vee (P \rightarrow R))$	10,2 \wedge I
2	(12)	$\neg\neg P$	3,11 RA
2	(13)	P	12 DN
1,2	(14)	$Q \vee R$	1,13 MP
15	(15)	Q	A
15	(16)	$P \rightarrow Q$	4,15 CP
15	(17)	$(P \rightarrow Q) \vee (P \rightarrow R)$	16 \vee I
18	(18)	R	A
18	(19)	$P \rightarrow R$	4,18 CP
18	(20)	$(P \rightarrow Q) \vee (P \rightarrow R)$	19 \vee I
1,2	(21)	$(P \rightarrow Q) \vee (P \rightarrow R)$	14,15,17,18,20 \vee E
1,2	(22)	$((P \rightarrow Q) \vee (P \rightarrow R)) \wedge \neg((P \rightarrow Q) \vee (P \rightarrow R))$	21,2 \wedge I
1	(23)	$\neg\neg((P \rightarrow Q) \vee (P \rightarrow R))$	2,22 RA
1	(24)	$(P \rightarrow Q) \vee (P \rightarrow R)$	23 DN

6.	$(P \wedge Q) \rightarrow \neg Q \vdash P \rightarrow \neg Q$		
1	(1)	$(P \wedge Q) \rightarrow \neg Q$	A
2	(2)	P	A
3	(3)	Q	A
2,3	(4)	$P \wedge Q$	2,3 \wedge I
1,2,3	(5)	$\neg Q$	1,4 MP
1,2,3	(6)	$Q \wedge \neg Q$	3,5 \wedge I
1,2	(7)	$\neg Q$	3,6 RA
1	(8)	$P \rightarrow \neg Q$	2,7 CP

Chapter 6

Exercise 6.1

1. No logicians are celebrities. (Lx, Cx)

$$\forall x (Lx \rightarrow \neg Cx)$$

Equivalently: $\neg \exists x (Lx \wedge Cx)$

2. Some celebrities are not logicians. (Lx, Cx)

$$\exists x (Cx \wedge \neg Lx)$$

3. Only students who do the homework will learn logic. (Sx, Hx, Lx)

Either

$$\forall x (Lx \rightarrow (Sx \wedge Hx))$$

or (inequivalently)

$$\forall x ((Sx \wedge Lx) \rightarrow Hx)$$

depending on whether one intends to restrict the claim to students.

4. All rich logicians are computer scientists. (Rx, Lx, Cx)

$$\forall x ((Rx \wedge Lx) \rightarrow Cx)$$

5. All students and professors get a discount. (Sx, Px, Dx)

$$\forall x ((Sx \vee Px) \rightarrow Dx)$$

6. No logician is rich, unless she is a computer scientist. (Lx, Rx, Cx)

$$\forall x ((Lx \wedge Rx) \rightarrow Cx)$$

Equivalent form: $\forall x ((Lx \wedge \neg Cx) \rightarrow \neg Rx)$

7. Not all logicians are computer scientists. (Lx, Cx)

$$\neg \forall x (Lx \rightarrow Cx)$$

Often put as: $\exists x (Lx \wedge \neg Cx)$.

8. Some logicians are rich computer scientists. (Lx, Rx, Cx)

$$\exists x (Lx \wedge (Rx \wedge Cx))$$

9. If there are rich logicians, then some logicians are computer scientists. (Rx, Lx, Cx)

$$\exists x (Rx \wedge Lx) \rightarrow \exists y (Ly \wedge Cy)$$

10. No pets except service animals are permitted in dorms. (Px, Sx, Dx)

Can be read in a minimal way as:

$$\forall x ((Px \wedge Dx) \rightarrow Sx),$$

which says only that no non-service pets are allowed in dorms. However, ordinary policy language is typically understood more strongly: among pets, *being permitted in the dorms* and *being a service animal* coincide. That reading is captured by:

$$\forall x (Px \rightarrow (Dx \leftrightarrow Sx)).$$

This biconditional formalization is therefore closer to the intended rule.

11. If anyone is rich, then Mary is. (Rx, m)

$$(\exists x Rx) \rightarrow Rm$$

Exercise 6.2

1. Mary loves everyone who loves her. (m, Lxy)

$$\forall x (Lxm \rightarrow Lmx)$$

2. Mary loves all and only those people who don't love themselves. (Lxy, m)

$$\forall x (Lmx \leftrightarrow \neg Lxx)$$

3. Everyone loves their mother. (Lxy, Mxy)

$$\forall x \forall y (Myx \rightarrow Lxy)$$

4. Some people love only those people who love their mother. (Lxy, Mxy)

$$\exists x \forall y (Lxy \rightarrow \forall z (Mzy \rightarrow Lyz))$$

5. Snape killed someone. (Kxy, s)

$$\exists x Ksx$$

6. Snape is a killer. (Kxy, s)

$$\exists x Ksx$$

7. Someone was killed by Snape. (Kxy, s)

$$\exists x Ksx$$

8. Some wizards only marry other wizards. (Wx, Mxy)

$$\exists x (Wx \wedge \forall y (Mxy \rightarrow Wy))$$

9. There is no greatest number. $(Nx, x < y)$

$$\forall x (Nx \rightarrow \exists y (Ny \wedge x < y))$$

10. c is the least upper bound of a and b . $(a, b, c, x \leq y)$

$$(a \leq c \wedge b \leq c) \wedge \forall x ((a \leq x \wedge b \leq x) \rightarrow c \leq x)$$

11. c is the greatest common divisor of a and b . $(a, b, c, Dxy, x \leq y)$

$$(Dca \wedge Dcb) \wedge \forall x ((Dxa \wedge Dxb) \rightarrow x \leq c)$$

Exercise 6.8

1. $\neg \exists x (Fx \wedge Gx) \vdash \forall x (Fx \rightarrow \neg Gx)$

1	(1)	$\neg \exists x (Fx \wedge Gx)$	A
2	(2)	Fa	A
3	(3)	Ga	A
2,3	(4)	$Fa \wedge Ga$	2,3 $\wedge I$
2,3	(5)	$\exists x (Fx \wedge Gx)$	4 EI
1,2,3	(6)	$\exists x (Fx \wedge Gx) \wedge \neg \exists x (Fx \wedge Gx)$	5,1 $\wedge I$
1,2	(7)	$\neg Ga$	3,6 RA
1	(8)	$Fa \rightarrow \neg Ga$	2,7 CP
1	(9)	$\forall x (Fx \rightarrow \neg Gx)$	8 UI

2. $\forall xFx \vdash \exists xFx$

1	(1)	$\forall xFx$	A
1	(2)	Fa	1 UE
1	(3)	$\exists xFx$	2 EI

3. $\forall x(Fx \rightarrow Gx), Fa \vdash \exists xGx$

1	(1)	$\forall x(Fx \rightarrow Gx)$	A
2	(2)	Fa	A
1	(3)	$Fa \rightarrow Ga$	1 UE
1,2	(4)	Ga	3,2 MP
1,2	(5)	$\exists xGx$	4 EI

4. $\neg Fa \vdash \exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$

1	(1)	$\neg Fa$	A
1	(2)	$Fa \rightarrow P$	1 negative paradox
1	(3)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	2 EI

5. $\neg \forall xFx \vdash \exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$

1	(1)	$\neg \forall xFx$	A
2	(2)	$\neg \exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	A
3	(3)	$Fa \rightarrow P$	A
3	(4)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	3 EI
2,3	(5)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P) \wedge \neg \exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	4,2 \wedge I
2	(6)	$\neg(Fa \rightarrow P)$	3,5 RA
2	(7)	Fa	6 material conditional
2	(8)	$\forall xFx$	7 UI
1,2	(9)	$\forall xFx \wedge \neg \forall xFx$	8,1 \wedge I
1	(10)	$\neg \neg \exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	2,9 RA
1	(11)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	10 DN

6. $\neg \exists xFx \vdash \forall x(Fx \rightarrow Gx)$

1	(1)	$\neg \exists xFx$	A
2	(2)	Fa	A
3	(3)	$\neg Ga$	A
2	(4)	$\exists xFx$	2 EI
1,2	(5)	$\exists xFx \wedge \neg \exists xFx$	4,1 \wedge I
1,2	(6)	$\neg \neg Ga$	3,5 RA
1,2	(7)	Ga	6 DN
1	(8)	$Fa \rightarrow Ga$	2,7 CP
1	(9)	$\forall x(Fx \rightarrow Gx)$	8 UI

7. $\forall x \forall y Rxy \vdash \exists x Rxx$

1	(1)	$\forall x\forall yRxy$	A
1	(2)	$\forall yRay$	1 UE
1	(3)	Raa	2 UE
1	(4)	$\exists xRxx$	3 EI

8. $P \rightarrow Fa \vdash P \rightarrow \exists xFx$

1	(1)	$P \rightarrow Fa$	A
2	(2)	P	A
1,2	(3)	Fa	1,2 MP
1,2	(4)	$\exists xFx$	3 EI
1	(5)	$P \rightarrow \exists xFx$	2,4 CP

9. $\exists xFx \rightarrow P \vdash \forall x(Fx \rightarrow P)$

1	(1)	$\exists xFx \rightarrow P$	A
2	(2)	Fa	A
2	(3)	$\exists xFx$	2 EI
1,2	(4)	P	1,3 MP
1	(5)	$Fa \rightarrow P$	2,4 CP
1	(6)	$\forall x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	5 UI

There is a typo here in the book: the direction $\forall x(Fx \rightarrow P) \vdash \exists xFx \rightarrow P$ cannot be proven without EE, which is only introduced in the next section.

10. $\neg\exists xFx \vdash \forall x(Fx \rightarrow P)$

1	(1)	$\neg\exists xFx$	A
2	(2)	Fa	A
2	(3)	$\exists xFx$	2 EI
1,2	(4)	$\exists xFx \wedge \neg\exists xFx$	3,1 \wedge I
1	(5)	$\neg Fa$	2,4 RA
1	(6)	$Fa \rightarrow P$	5 neg paradox
1	(7)	$\forall x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	6 UI

11. $\neg\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P) \vdash \forall xFx \wedge \neg P$

1	(1)	$\neg\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	A
2	(2)	$Fa \rightarrow P$	A
2	(3)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	2 EI
1,2	(4)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P) \wedge \neg\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	3,1 \wedge I
1	(5)	$\neg(Fa \rightarrow P)$	2,4 RA
1	(6)	$Fa \wedge \neg P$	5 material conditional
1	(7)	$\neg P$	6 \wedge E
1	(8)	Fa	6 \wedge E
1	(9)	$\forall xFx$	8 UI
1	(10)	$\forall xFx \wedge \neg P$	9,7 \wedge I

12. $\forall xFx \rightarrow P \vdash \exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$

1	(1)	$\forall xFx \rightarrow P$	A
2	(2)	$\neg \exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	A
3	(3)	$\neg Fa$	A
3	(4)	$Fa \rightarrow P$	3 neg paradox
3	(5)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	4 EI
2,3	(6)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P) \wedge \neg \exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	5,2 \wedge I
2	(7)	$\neg \neg Fa$	3,6 RA
2	(8)	Fa	7 DN
2	(9)	$\forall xFx$	8 UI
1,2	(10)	P	1,9 MP
1,2	(11)	$Fb \rightarrow P$	10 pos paradox
1,2	(12)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	11 EI
1,2	(13)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P) \wedge \neg \exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	12,2 \wedge I
1	(14)	$\neg \neg \exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	2,13 RA
1	(15)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	14 DN

Exercise 6.11

1. $\exists xFx \vee \exists xGx \vdash \exists x(Fx \vee Gx)$

1	(1)	$\exists xFx \vee \exists xGx$	A
2	(2)	$\exists xFx$	A
3	(3)	Fa	A
3	(4)	$Fa \vee Ga$	3 \vee I
3	(5)	$\exists x(Fx \vee Gx)$	4 EI
2	(6)	$\exists x(Fx \vee Gx)$	2,3,5 EE
7	(7)	$\exists xGx$	A
8	(8)	Ga	A
8	(9)	$Fa \vee Ga$	8 \vee I
8	(10)	$\exists x(Fx \vee Gx)$	9 EI
7	(11)	$\exists x(Fx \vee Gx)$	7,8,10 EE
1	(12)	$\exists x(Fx \vee Gx)$	1,2,6,7,11 \vee E

2. $\forall x(Fx \rightarrow Gx), \neg \exists xGx \vdash \neg \exists xFx$

1	(1)	$\forall x(Fx \rightarrow Gx)$	A
2	(2)	$\neg \exists xGx$	A
3	(3)	$\exists xFx$	A
4	(4)	Fa	A
1	(5)	$Fa \rightarrow Ga$	1 UE
1,4	(6)	Ga	5,4 MP
1,4	(7)	$\exists xGx$	6 EI
1,3	(8)	$\exists xGx$	3,4,7 EE
1,2,3	(9)	$\exists xGx \wedge \neg \exists xGx$	8,2 \wedge I
1,2	(10)	$\neg \exists xFx$	3,9 RA
3. $\forall x(Fx \rightarrow Gx) \vdash \exists x\neg Gx \rightarrow \exists x\neg Fx$			
1	(1)	$\forall x(Fx \rightarrow Gx)$	A
2	(2)	$\exists x\neg Gx$	A
3	(3)	$\neg Ga$	A
1	(4)	$Fa \rightarrow Ga$	1 UE
1,3	(5)	$\neg Fa$	4,3 MT
1,3	(6)	$\exists x\neg Fx$	5 EI
1,2	(7)	$\exists x\neg Fx$	2,3,6 EE
1	(8)	$\exists x\neg Gx \rightarrow \exists x\neg Fx$	2,7 CP
4. $\forall x(Fx \rightarrow P) \vdash \exists xFx \rightarrow P$			
1	(1)	$\forall x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	A
2	(2)	$\exists xFx$	A
3	(3)	Fa	A
1	(4)	$Fa \rightarrow P$	1 UE
1,3	(5)	P	4,3 MP
1,2	(6)	P	2,3,5 EE
1	(7)	$\exists xFx \rightarrow P$	2,6 CP
5. $P \wedge \exists xFx \vdash \exists x(P \wedge Fx)$			
1	(1)	$P \wedge \exists xFx$	A
1	(2)	P	1 \wedge E
1	(3)	$\exists xFx$	1 \wedge E
4	(4)	Fa	A
1,4	(5)	$P \wedge Fa$	2,4 \wedge I
1,4	(6)	$\exists x(P \wedge Fx)$	5 EI
1	(7)	$\exists x(P \wedge Fx)$	3,4,6 EE
6. $\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P) \vdash \forall xFx \rightarrow P$			

1	(1)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	A
2	(2)	$\forall xFx$	A
3	(3)	$Fa \rightarrow P$	A
2	(4)	Fa	2 UE
2,3	(5)	P	3,4 MP
3	(6)	$\forall xFx \rightarrow P$	2,5 CP
1	(7)	$\forall xFx \rightarrow P$	1,3,6 EE

Exercise 6.13

1. $P \rightarrow \exists xFx \vdash \exists x(P \rightarrow Fx)$

1	(1)	$P \rightarrow \exists xFx$	A
\emptyset	(2)	$\exists xFx \vee \neg \exists xFx$	prop taut
3	(3)	$\exists xFx$	A
4	(4)	Fa	A
4	(5)	$P \rightarrow Fa$	4 prop taut
4	(6)	$\exists x(P \rightarrow Fx)$	5 EI
3	(7)	$\exists x(P \rightarrow Fx)$	3,4,6 EE
8	(8)	$\neg \exists xFx$	A
1,8	(9)	$\neg P$	1,8 MT
1,8	(10)	$P \rightarrow Fb$	9 prop taut
1,8	(11)	$\exists x(P \rightarrow Fx)$	10 EI
1	(12)	$\exists x(P \rightarrow Fx)$	2,3,7,8,11 \vee E

2. $\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P) \vdash \forall xFx \rightarrow P$

1	(1)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow P)$	A
2	(2)	$\forall xFx$	A
3	(3)	$Fa \rightarrow P$	A
2	(4)	Fa	2 UE
2,3	(5)	P	3,4 MP
1,2	(6)	P	1,3,5 EE
1	(7)	$\forall xFx \rightarrow P$	2,6 CP

Exercise 6.14

1. $\vdash \forall x(Fx \rightarrow Fx)$

1	(1)	Fa	A
\emptyset	(2)	$Fa \rightarrow Fa$	1,1 CP
\emptyset	(3)	$\forall x(Fx \rightarrow Fx)$	2 UI

2. $\vdash \forall xFx \vee \exists x\neg Fx$

\emptyset	(1)	$\neg\exists x\neg Fx \vee \exists x\neg Fx$	prop taut
2	(2)	$\neg\exists x\neg Fx$	A
3	(3)	$\neg Fa$	A
3	(4)	$\exists x\neg Fx$	3 EI
2,3	(5)	$\exists x\neg Fx \wedge \neg\exists x\neg Fx$	4,2 \wedge I
2	(6)	$\neg\neg Fa$	3,5 RA
2	(7)	Fa	6 DN
2	(8)	$\forall xFx$	7 UI
2	(9)	$\forall xFx \vee \exists x\neg Fx$	8 \vee I
10	(10)	$\exists x\neg Fx$	A
10	(11)	$\forall xFx \vee \exists x\neg Fx$	10 \vee I
\emptyset	(12)	$\forall xFx \vee \exists x\neg Fx$	1,2,9,10,11 \vee E

3. $\vdash \forall x\neg(Fx \wedge \neg Fx)$

1	(1)	$Fa \wedge \neg Fa$	A
\emptyset	(2)	$\neg(Fa \wedge \neg Fa)$	1,1 RA
\emptyset	(3)	$\forall x\neg(Fx \wedge \neg Fx)$	2 UI

4. $\vdash \neg\exists x(Fx \wedge \neg Fx)$

1	(1)	$\exists x(Fx \wedge \neg Fx)$	A
2	(2)	$Fa \wedge \neg Fa$	A
2	(3)	$\neg\exists x(Fx \wedge \neg Fx)$	1,2 RA
1	(4)	$\neg\exists x(Fx \wedge \neg Fx)$	1,2,3 EE
1	(5)	$\exists x(Fx \wedge \neg Fx) \wedge \neg\exists x(Fx \wedge \neg Fx)$	1,3 \wedge I
\emptyset	(6)	$\neg\exists x(Fx \wedge \neg Fx)$	1,5 RA

5. $\vdash \forall x\exists y(Rxy \rightarrow Rxx)$

1	(1)	Raa	A
\emptyset	(2)	$Raa \rightarrow Raa$	1,1 CP
\emptyset	(3)	$\exists y(Ray \rightarrow Raa)$	2 EI
\emptyset	(4)	$\forall x\exists y(Rxy \rightarrow Rxx)$	3 UI

6. $\vdash \forall x\exists y(Rxy \rightarrow Ryx)$

1	(1)	Raa	A
\emptyset	(2)	$Raa \rightarrow Raa$	1,1 CP
\emptyset	(3)	$\exists y(Ray \rightarrow Ryx)$	2 EI
\emptyset	(4)	$\forall x\exists y(Rxy \rightarrow Ryx)$	3 UI

7. $\vdash \exists x(Fx \rightarrow \forall yFy)$

1	(1)	$\neg\exists x(Fx \rightarrow \forall yFy)$	A
2	(2)	$\neg Fa$	A
2	(3)	$Fa \rightarrow \forall yFy$	2 prop taut
2	(4)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow \forall yFy)$	3 EI
1,2	(5)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow \forall yFy) \wedge \neg\exists x(Fx \rightarrow \forall yFy)$	4,1 \wedge I
1	(6)	$\neg\neg Fa$	2,5 RA
1	(7)	Fa	6 DN
1	(8)	$\forall yFy$	7 UI
1	(9)	$Fa \rightarrow \forall yFy$	8 prop taut
1	(10)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow \forall yFy)$	9 EI
1	(11)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow \forall yFy) \wedge \neg\exists x(Fx \rightarrow \forall yFy)$	10,1 \wedge I
\emptyset	(12)	$\neg\neg\exists x(Fx \rightarrow \forall yFy)$	1,11 RA
\emptyset	(13)	$\exists x(Fx \rightarrow \forall yFy)$	12 DN

8. $\vdash \exists x\forall y(Fx \rightarrow Fy)$

1	(1)	$\neg\exists x\forall y(Fx \rightarrow Fy)$	A
2	(2)	$\neg Fa$	A
2	(3)	$Fa \rightarrow Fb$	2 prop taut
2	(4)	$\forall y(Fa \rightarrow Fy)$	3 UI
2	(5)	$\exists x\forall y(Fx \rightarrow Fy)$	4 EI
1,2	(6)	$\exists x\forall y(Fx \rightarrow Fy) \wedge \neg\exists x\forall y(Fx \rightarrow Fy)$	5,1 \wedge I
1	(7)	$\neg\neg Fa$	2,6 RA
1	(8)	Fa	7 DN
1	(9)	$Fc \rightarrow Fa$	8 prop taut
1	(10)	$\forall y(Fc \rightarrow Fy)$	9 UI
1	(11)	$\exists x\forall y(Fx \rightarrow Fy)$	10 EI
1	(12)	$\exists x\forall y(Fx \rightarrow Fy) \wedge \neg\exists x\forall y(Fx \rightarrow Fy)$	11,1 \wedge I
\emptyset	(13)	$\neg\neg\exists x\forall y(Fx \rightarrow Fy)$	1,12 RA
\emptyset	(14)	$\exists x\forall y(Fx \rightarrow Fy)$	13 DN

9. $\forall x\exists y(Fx \rightarrow Gy) \vdash \exists y\forall x(Fx \rightarrow Gy)$

1	(1)	$\forall x \exists y (Fx \rightarrow Gy)$	A
\emptyset	(2)	$\exists y Gy \vee \neg \exists y Gy$	prop taut
3	(3)	$\exists y Gy$	A
4	(4)	Ga	A
4	(5)	$Fb \rightarrow Ga$	4 prop taut
4	(6)	$\forall x (Fx \rightarrow Ga)$	5 UI
4	(7)	$\exists y \forall x (Fx \rightarrow Gy)$	6 EI
3	(8)	$\exists y \forall x (Fx \rightarrow Gy)$	3,4,7 EE
9	(9)	$\neg \exists y Gy$	A
10	(10)	Fc	A
1	(11)	$\exists y (Fc \rightarrow Gy)$	1 UE
12	(12)	$Fc \rightarrow Gd$	A
10,12	(13)	Gd	12,10 MP
10,12	(14)	$\exists y Gy$	13 EI
9,10,12	(15)	$\exists y Gy \wedge \neg \exists y Gy$	14,9 \wedge I
9,12	(16)	$\neg Fc$	10,15 RA
9,12	(17)	$Fc \rightarrow Ge$	16 prop taut
1,9	(18)	$Fc \rightarrow Ge$	11,12,17 EE
1,9	(19)	$\forall x (Fx \rightarrow Ge)$	18 UI
1,9	(20)	$\exists y \forall x (Fx \rightarrow Gy)$	19 EI
1	(21)	$\exists y \forall x (Fx \rightarrow Gy)$	2,3,8,9,20 \vee E

10. $\vdash \forall x \exists y (Rxy \rightarrow \forall z Rxz)$

\emptyset	(1)	$\exists y \neg Ray \vee \neg \exists y \neg Ray$	prop taut
2	(2)	$\exists y \neg Ray$	A
3	(3)	$\neg Rab$	A
3	(4)	$Rab \rightarrow \forall z Raz$	3 prop taut
3	(5)	$\exists y (Ray \rightarrow \forall z Raz)$	4 EI
2	(6)	$\exists y (Ray \rightarrow \forall z Raz)$	2,3,5 EE
7	(7)	$\neg \exists y \neg Ray$	A
8	(8)	$\neg Rac$	A
8	(9)	$\exists y \neg Ray$	8 EI
7,8	(10)	$\exists y \neg Ray \wedge \neg \exists y \neg Ray$	9,7 \wedge I
7	(11)	$\neg \neg Rac$	8,10 RA
7	(12)	Rac	11 DN
7	(13)	$\forall z Raz$	12 UI
7	(14)	$Rab \rightarrow \forall z Raz$	13 prop taut
7	(15)	$\exists y (Ray \rightarrow \forall z Raz)$	14 EI
\emptyset	(16)	$\exists y (Ray \rightarrow \forall z Raz)$	1,2,6,7,15 \vee E
\emptyset	(17)	$\forall x \exists y (Rxy \rightarrow \forall z Rxz)$	16 UI

Exercise 6.17

$$\forall x(\exists z Rxz \rightarrow \forall y Rxy), \exists x \exists y \vdash \exists x \forall y Rxy$$

1	(1)	$\forall x(\exists z Rxz \rightarrow \forall y Rxy)$	A
2	(2)	$\exists x \exists y Rxy$	A
3	(3)	$\exists y Ray$	A
4	(4)	Rab	A
4	(5)	$\exists z Raz$	4 EI
1	(6)	$\exists z Raz \rightarrow \forall y Ray$	1 UE
1,4	(7)	$\forall y Ray$	6,5 MP
1,4	(8)	$\exists x \forall y Rxy$	7 EI
1,3	(9)	$\exists x \forall y Rxy$	3,4,8 EE
1,2	(10)	$\exists x \forall y Rxy$	2,3,9 EE

Question: Does it follow from these premises that $\forall x \forall y Rxy$?

Answer: No. $\bigcirc a \longrightarrow b$

Chapter 7

Exercise 7.1

Here the proof is lengthened because of the strictness of the $=$ rules. From $a = c$ and $b = c$, we cannot immediately apply $=E$ to get $a = b$.

1	(1)	$\exists x \forall y (Py \rightarrow y = x)$	A
2	(2)	$Pa \wedge Pb$	A
3	(3)	$\forall y (Py \rightarrow y = c)$	A
3	(4)	$Pa \rightarrow a = c$	3 UE
3	(5)	$Pb \rightarrow b = c$	3 UE
2	(6)	Pa	2 $\wedge E$
2	(7)	Pb	2 $\wedge E$
2,3	(8)	$a = c$	4,6 MP
2,3	(9)	$b = c$	5,7 MP
\emptyset	(10)	$b = b$	$=I$
2,3	(11)	$c = b$	10,9 $=E$
2,3	(12)	$a = b$	8,11 $=E$
1,2	(13)	$a = b$	1,3,12 EE
1	(14)	$(Pa \wedge Pb) \rightarrow a = b$	2,13 CP
1	(15)	$\forall y ((Pa \wedge Py) \rightarrow a = y)$	14 UI
1	(16)	$\forall x \forall y ((Px \wedge Py) \rightarrow x = y)$	15 UI

Exercise 7.2

1	(1)	$Fa \wedge \forall x(Fx \rightarrow x = a)$	A
2	(2)	Fb	A
1	(3)	$\forall x(Fx \rightarrow x = a)$	1 \wedge E
1	(4)	$Fb \rightarrow b = a$	3 UE
1,2	(5)	$b = a$	4,2 MP
6	(6)	$b = a$	A
1	(7)	Fa	1 \wedge E
\emptyset	(8)	$b = b$	=I
6	(9)	$a = b$	8,6 =E
1,6	(10)	Fb	7,9 =E
1	(11)	$Fb \leftrightarrow b = a$	2,5,6,10 CP \times 2
1	(12)	$\forall x(Fx \leftrightarrow x = a)$	11 UI
1	(1)	$\forall x(Fx \leftrightarrow x = a)$	A
1	(2)	$Fa \leftrightarrow a = a$	1 UE
\emptyset	(3)	$a = a$	=I
1	(4)	Fa	2,3 MP
1	(5)	$Fb \leftrightarrow b = a$	1 UE
1	(6)	$Fb \rightarrow b = a$	5 \wedge E
1	(7)	$\forall x(Fx \rightarrow x = a)$	6 UI
1	(8)	$Fa \wedge \forall x(Fx \rightarrow x = a)$	4,7 \wedge I

Chapter 9

Exercise 9.14

1. As a warmup, we will show that all occurrences of \rightarrow can be eliminated from valid proofs, along with all uses of MP and CP. Define a function f from sentences to sentences as the identity on atomic sentences, then extend by commuting with \wedge, \vee, \neg , and by setting $f(\varphi \rightarrow \psi) = \neg(f(\varphi) \wedge \neg f(\psi))$. We now show that any proof of $\varphi_1, \dots, \varphi_n \vdash \psi$ can be converted to a proof of $f(\varphi_1), \dots, f(\varphi_n) \succ f(\psi)$.

Here's a way to simulate CP. Suppose first that φ is assumed, and that ψ is derived with

dependencies Δ . We can then continue in this way:

1	(1)	φ	A
Δ	(2)	ψ	
3	(3)	$\varphi \wedge \neg\psi$	A
3	(4)	$\neg\psi$	3 \wedge E
$\Delta, 3$	(5)	$\psi \wedge \neg\psi$	2, 4 \wedge I
$\Delta', 3$	(6)	$\neg\varphi$	1, 5 RA
3	(7)	φ	3 \wedge E
$\Delta', 3$	(8)	$\varphi \wedge \neg\varphi$	7, 6 \wedge I
Δ'	(9)	$\neg(\varphi \wedge \neg\psi)$	3, 8 RA

Here $\Delta' = \Delta \setminus \{1\}$, so that line 9 reproduces the effect of CP on lines 1 and 2.

Now we can simulate MP.

Γ	(1)	$\neg(\varphi \wedge \neg\psi)$	
Δ	(2)	φ	
3	(3)	$\neg\psi$	A
$\Delta, 3$	(4)	$\varphi \wedge \neg\psi$	2, 3 \wedge I
$\Gamma, \Delta, 3$	(5)	$(\varphi \wedge \neg\psi) \wedge \neg(\varphi \wedge \neg\psi)$	4, 1 \wedge I
Γ, Δ	(6)	$\neg\neg\psi$	3, 5 RA
Γ, Δ	(7)	ψ	6 DN