CSE 250A. Assignment 2

Hao-en Sung (A53204772) wrangle1005@gmail.com

October 10, 2016

2.1 Probabilistic inference

(a)
$$P(E = 1|J = 1)$$

Sol. For the writing simplicity, I would like to calculate P(A=1) first.

$$\begin{split} P(A=1) &= \sum_{e,b} P(A=1,E=e,B=b) \\ &= \sum_{e,b} P(E=e) \cdot P(B=b) \cdot P(A=1|E=e,B=b) \\ &= P(E=0) \cdot P(B=0) \cdot P(A=1|E=0,B=0) \\ &+ P(E=0) \cdot P(B=1) \cdot P(A=1|E=0,B=1) \\ &+ P(E=1) \cdot P(B=0) \cdot P(A=1|E=1,B=0) \\ &+ P(E=1) \cdot P(B=1) \cdot P(A=1|E=1,B=1) \\ &= (1-0.002) \cdot (1-0.001) \cdot 0.001 + (1-0.002) \cdot 0.001 \cdot 0.94 \\ &+ 0.002 \cdot (1-0.001) \cdot 0.29 + 0.002 \cdot 0.001 \cdot 0.95 \\ &\approx 0.002516 \end{split}$$

$$P(J=1) = \sum_{a} P(J=1, A=a) = \sum_{a} P(J=1|A=a) \cdot P(A=a)$$

$$= P(J=1|A=0) \cdot P(A=0) + P(J=1|A=1) \cdot P(A=1)$$

$$= 0.05 \cdot (1 - 0.002516) + 0.90 \cdot 0.002516 = 0.052139$$

$$\begin{split} P(E=1|J=1) &= \frac{P(E=1,J=1)}{P(J=1)} = \frac{\sum_{a,b} P(A=a,B=b,E=1,J=1)}{P(J=1)} \\ &= \frac{\sum_{a,b} P(B=b) \cdot P(E=1) \cdot P(A=a|B=b,E=1) \cdot P(J=1,A=a)}{P(J=1)} \\ &= \frac{P(E=1) \cdot P(B=0) \cdot P(A=0|E=1,B=0) \cdot P(J=1,A=0)}{P(J=1)} \\ &+ \frac{P(E=1) \cdot P(B=1) \cdot P(A=0|E=1,B=1) \cdot P(J=1,A=0)}{P(J=1)} \\ &+ \frac{P(E=1) \cdot P(B=0) \cdot P(A=1|E=1,B=0) \cdot P(J=1,A=1)}{P(J=1)} \\ &+ \frac{P(E=1) \cdot P(B=0) \cdot P(A=1|E=1,B=0) \cdot P(J=1,A=1)}{P(J=1)} \\ &= \frac{0.002 \cdot (1-0.001) \cdot (1-0.29) \cdot 0.05}{P(J=1)} + \frac{0.002 \cdot 0.001 \cdot (1-0.95) \cdot 0.05}{P(J=1)} \\ &+ \frac{0.0002 \cdot (1-0.001) \cdot 0.29 \cdot 0.90}{P(J=1)} + \frac{0.002 \cdot 0.001 \cdot 0.95 \cdot 0.90}{P(J=1)} \\ &\approx \frac{0.000594}{0.052139} \approx 0.011393 \end{split}$$

(b) P(E=1|J=1, B=1)

Sol. For the writing simplicity, I would like to calculate P(J=1,B=1) first.

$$\begin{split} P(J=1,B=1) &= \sum_{a,e} P(E=e,B=1,A=a,J=1) \\ &= \sum_{a,e} P(E=e) \cdot P(B=1) \cdot P(A=a|E=e,B=1) \cdot P(J=1|A=a) \\ &= P(E=0) \cdot P(B=1) \cdot P(A=0|E=0,B=1) \cdot P(J=1|A=0) \\ &+ P(E=1) \cdot P(B=1) \cdot P(A=0|E=1,B=1) \cdot P(J=1|A=0) \\ &+ P(E=0) \cdot P(B=1) \cdot P(A=1|E=0,B=1) \cdot P(J=1|A=1) \\ &+ P(E=1) \cdot P(B=1) \cdot P(A=1|E=1,B=1) \cdot P(J=1|A=1) \\ &+ P(E=1) \cdot P(B=1) \cdot P(A=1|E=1,B=1) \cdot P(J=1|A=1) \\ &= (1-0.002) \cdot 0.001 \cdot (1-0.94) \cdot 0.05 + 0.002 \cdot 0.001 \cdot (1-0.95) \cdot 0.05 \\ &+ (1-0.002) \cdot 0.001 \cdot 0.94 \cdot 0.90 + 0.002 \cdot 0.001 \cdot 0.95 \cdot 0.90 \\ &\approx 0.000849 \end{split}$$

$$\begin{split} P(E=1|J=1,B=1) &= \frac{P(E=1,J=1,B=1)}{P(J=1,B=1)} = \frac{\sum_a P(E=1,J=1,B=1,A=a)}{P(J=1,B=1)} \\ &= \frac{\sum_a P(B=1) \cdot P(E=1) \cdot P(A=a|B=1,E=1) \cdot P(J=1,A=a)}{P(J=1,B=1)} \\ &= \frac{P(E=1) \cdot P(B=1) \cdot P(A=0|E=1,B=1) \cdot P(J=1,A=0)}{P(J=1,B=1)} \\ &+ \frac{P(E=1) \cdot P(B=1) \cdot P(A=1|E=1,B=1) \cdot P(J=1,A=1)}{P(J=1,B=1)} \\ &= \frac{0.002 \cdot 0.001 \cdot (1-0.95) \cdot 0.05}{P(J=1,B=1)} + \frac{0.002 \cdot 0.001 \cdot 0.95 \cdot 0.90}{P(J=1,B=1)} \\ &\approx \frac{0.000002}{0.000849} \approx 0.002356 \end{split}$$

(c) P(A = 1|M = 0)

Sol. For the writing simplicity, I would like to calculate P(M=0) first.

$$\begin{split} P(M=0) &= \sum_a P(M=0,A=a) \\ &= P(M=0,A=0) + P(M=0,A=1) \\ &= P(M=0|A=0) \cdot P(A=0) + P(M=0|A=1) \cdot P(A=1) \\ &\approx (1-0.01) \cdot (1-0.002516) + (1-0.70) \cdot 0.002516 \approx 0.988264 \end{split}$$

$$P(A = 1|M = 0) = P(M = 0|A = 1) \cdot \frac{P(A = 1)}{P(M = 0)}$$

$$\approx (1 - 0.70) \cdot \frac{0.002516}{0.988264}$$

$$\approx 0.000764$$

(d) P(A=1|J=0, M=0)

Sol. For the writing simplicity, I would like to calculate P(J=0,M=0) first.

$$\begin{split} P(J=0,M=0) &= \sum_a P(J=0,M=0,A=a) \\ &= P(J=0,M=0,A=0) + P(J=0,M=0,A=1) \\ &= P(J=0|A=0) \cdot P(M=0|A=0) \cdot P(A=0) \\ &+ P(J=0|A=1) \cdot P(M=0|A=1) \cdot P(A=1) \\ &\approx (1-0.05) \cdot (1-0.01) \cdot (1-0.002516) + (1-0.90) \cdot (1-0.70) \cdot 0.002516 \\ &\approx 0.938209 \end{split}$$

$$P(A = 1|J = 0, M = 0) = P(J = 0, M = 0|A = 1) \cdot \frac{P(A = 1)}{P(J = 0, M = 0)}$$

$$= P(J = 0|A = 1) \cdot P(M = 0|A = 1) \cdot \frac{P(A = 1)}{P(J = 0, M = 0)}$$

$$\approx 1 - 0.90) \cdot (1 - 0.70) \cdot \frac{0.002516}{0.938209}$$

$$\approx 0.000080$$

(e) P(A=1|M=1)

Sol. From (c) we know that P(M = 1) = 1 - P(M = 0) = 0.011736.

$$P(A=1|M=1) = P(M=1|A=1) \cdot \frac{P(A=1)}{P(M=1)}$$

$$\approx 0.70 \cdot \frac{0.002516}{1 - 0.988264}$$

$$\approx 0.150068$$

(f) P(A = 1|M = 1, B = 0)

Sol. For the writing simplicity, I would like to calculate P(A=1|B=0) first.

$$P(A = 1|B = 0) = \sum_{e} \frac{P(A = 1, B = 0, E = e)}{P(B = 0)} = \sum_{e} \frac{P(B = 0) \cdot P(E = e) \cdot P(A = 1|B = 0, E = e)}{P(B = 0)}$$

$$= P(E = 0) \cdot P(A = 1|E = 0, B = 0) + P(E = 1) \cdot P(A = 1|E = 1, B = 0)$$

$$= (1 - 0.002) \cdot 0.001 + 0.002 \cdot 0.29$$

$$= 0.001578$$

Later, I can utilize P(A=0|B=0) and P(A=1|B=0) to derive P(M=1,B=0) to finally solve P(A=1|M=1,B=0).

$$\begin{split} P(M=1,B=0) &= \sum_{a} P(M=1,B=0,A=a) \\ &= P(M=1,B=0,A=0) + P(M=1,B=0,A=1) \\ &= P(M=1|A=0) \cdot P(A=0|B=0) \cdot P(B=0) \\ &+ P(M=1|A=1) \cdot P(A=1|B=0) \cdot P(B=0) \\ &= 0.01 \cdot (1-0.001578) \cdot (1-0.001) + 0.70 \cdot 0.001578 \cdot (1-0.001) \\ &\approx 0.011078 \end{split}$$

$$\begin{split} P(A=1|M=1,B=0) &= P(M=1,B=0|A=1) \cdot \frac{P(A=1)}{P(M=1,B=0)} \\ &= P(M=1|A=1) \cdot P(A=1|B=0) \cdot \frac{P(B=0)}{P(A=1)} \cdot \frac{P(A=1)}{P(M=1,B=0)} \\ &\approx 0.70 \cdot 0.001578 \cdot \frac{1-0.001}{0.011078} \\ &\approx 0.099611 \end{split}$$

2.2 Probabilistic reasoning

- (a) Compute the ratio r_k as a function of k. How does the doctor's diagnosis depend on the day of the month? Show your work.
- $Sol.\$ I firstly focus on the numerator and I have derivations as follows.

$$\begin{split} P(D=1|S_1=1,...,S_k=1) &= P(S_1=1,...,S_k=1|D=1) \cdot \frac{P(D=1)}{P(S_1=1,...,S_k=1)} \\ &= \prod_{i=1}^k P(S_i=1|D=1) \cdot \frac{P(D=1)}{P(S_1=1,...,S_k=1)} \\ &= \prod_{i=1}^k P(S_i=1|D=1) \cdot \frac{P(D=1)}{\sum_d P(D=d,S_1=1,...,S_k=1)} \\ &= \prod_{i=1}^k P(S_i=1|D=1) \cdot \frac{P(D=1)}{\sum_d P(D=d) \cdot P(S_1=1,...,S_k=1|D=d)} \\ &= \prod_{i=1}^k P(S_i=1|D=1) \cdot \frac{1}{\sum_d \prod_{i=1}^k P(S_i=1|D=d)} \\ &= \frac{\prod_{i=1}^k P(S_i=1|D=0) + \prod_{i=1}^k P(S_i=1|D=1)}{\prod_{i=1}^k P(S_i=1|D=0) + \prod_{i=1}^k P(S_i=1|D=1)} \\ &= \frac{\frac{1}{2^k + (-1)^k}}{\frac{1}{2^k} + \frac{1}{2^k + (-1)^k}} \end{split}$$

Then, we can calculate r_k as follows.

$$r_k = \frac{P(D=1|S_1=1,...,S_k=1)}{P(D=0|S_1=1,...,S_k=1)}$$

$$= \frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{1}{2^k+(-1)^k}}{\frac{1}{2^k}+\frac{1}{2^k+(-1)^k}}}{1-\frac{\frac{2^k+(-1)^k}{\frac{1}{2^k}+\frac{1}{2^k+(-1)^k}}}{\frac{1}{2^k}}}$$

$$= \frac{\frac{1}{2^k+(-1)^k}}{\frac{1}{2^k}}$$

$$= \frac{2^k}{2^k+(-1)^k}$$

One can tell that $r_k > 1$ if k is odd and $r_k < 1$ if k is even.

(b) Does the diagnosis become more or less certain as more symptoms are observed? Explain.

Sol. If the higher certainty is defined as the larger value of $|r_k - 1|$, one can find out that certainty reduces while k gets larger. A easy example is to consider k = 1 and k = 2.

$$r_1 = \frac{2}{2-1} = 2$$

$$r_2 = \frac{4}{4+1} = \frac{4}{5}$$

One can tell that $|r_1 - 1| > |r_2 - 1|$.

2.3 Sigmoid function

(a)
$$\sigma'(z) = \sigma(z) \cdot \sigma(-z)$$

Sol.

$$\sigma'(z) = \frac{0+1 \cdot -e^{-z}}{(1+e^{-z})^2} = \frac{1}{1+e^{-z}} \cdot \frac{-e^{-z}}{1+e^{-z}}$$
$$= \frac{1}{1+e^{-z}} \cdot \frac{1}{e^z+1} = \sigma(z) \cdot \sigma(-z)$$

(b) $\sigma(-z) + \sigma(z) = 1$

Sol.

$$\sigma(-z) + \sigma(z) = \frac{1}{1 + e^z} + \frac{1}{1 + e^{-z}} = \frac{1 + e^{-z} + 1 + e^z}{1 + e^z + e^{-z} + e^0} = 1$$

(c) $L(\sigma(z)) = z$, where $L(p) = \log\left(\frac{p}{1-p}\right)$ is the log-odds function

Sol.

$$L(\sigma(z)) = \log\left(\frac{\sigma(z)}{1 - \sigma(z)}\right) = \log\left(\frac{\frac{1}{1 + e^{-z}}}{\frac{e^{-z}}{1 + e^{-z}}}\right) = \log\left(\frac{1}{e^{-z}}\right) = \log(e^z) = z$$

(d) $w_i = L(p_i)$, where $p_i = P(Y = 1 | X_i = 1, X_j = 0, \forall j \neq i)$

Sol.

$$L(p_i) = \log \left(\frac{P(Y = 1 | X_i = 1, X_j = 0, \ \forall j \neq i)}{1 - P(Y = 1 | X_i = 1, X_j = 0, \ \forall j \neq i)} \right) = \log \left(\frac{\sigma(w_i)}{1 - \sigma(w_i)} \right) = L(\sigma(w_i))$$

According the conclusion from (c), $L(\sigma(w_i)) = w_i$.

2.4 Conditional independence

Sol. Response and simple reason is described in Table 1.

```
P(M,W|S,R)
                         P(M|S,R) \cdot P(W|S,R)
                         P(M|S,R,A) \cdot P(W|S,R,A)
P(M, W|S, R, A)
     P(M, A|W) = P(M|W) \cdot P(A|W)
   P(M, A|R, W) = P(M|R, W) \cdot P(A|R, W)
\begin{array}{rcl} P(M,A|S,W) & = & P(M|S,W) \cdot P(A|S,W) \\ P(M,A|S,R,W) & = & P(M|S,R,W) \cdot P(A|S,R,W) \\ P(M,A|S,R) & = & P(M|S,R) \cdot P(A|S,R) \end{array}
      P(R, S|M) = P(R|M) \cdot P(S|W)
      P(R, A|W) = P(R1W) \cdot P(A|W)
   P(R, A|M, W) =
                         P(R|M,W) \cdot P(A|M,W)
   P(R, A|S, W)
                         P(R|S,W) \cdot P(A|S,W)
P(R, A|M, S, W)
                         P(R|M, S, W) \cdot P(A|M, S, W)
      P(S, A|W)
                         P(S|W) \cdot P(A|W)
                         P(S|M,W) \cdot P(A|M,W)
   P(S, A|M, W)
   P(S, A|R, W)
                         P(S|R,W) \cdot P(A|R,W)
                    =
P(S, A|M, R, W)
                          P(S|M,R,W) \cdot P(A|M,R,W)
```

Table 1: Conditional Independence

2.5 Markov blanket

Case 1. Via a parent of a parent of X, i.e. node 1 in the hint figure.

Sol. Since the parent of X is given, it applies to type-1 d-separate.

Case 2. Via a parent of a parent of a child of X, i.e. node 2 in the hint figure.

Sol. Denote node 2 as N_2 , the child of N_2 as A and the co-child of A and X as B. We would like to prove $P(X, N_2 | A, B) = P(X | A, B) \cdot P(N_2 | A, B)$.

$$\begin{split} P(X, N_2 | A, B) &= \frac{P(X, 3, A, B)}{P(A, B)} = \frac{P(X) \cdot P(N_2) \cdot P(A | N_2) \cdot P(B | A, X)}{P(A, B)} \\ &= \frac{P(X) \cdot P(N_2) \cdot P(A | N_2) \cdot P(B | A, X) \cdot \frac{P(A, X)}{P(A, X)}}{P(A, B)} \\ &= P(X | A, B) \cdot \frac{P(X) \cdot P(N_2) \cdot P(A | N_2)}{P(A) \cdot P(X)} \\ &= P(X | A, B) \cdot P(N_2 | A) \\ &= P(X | A, B) \cdot P(N_2 | A, B) \end{split}$$

П

 \Box

П

Case 3. Via a child of a parent of a child of X, i.e. node 3 in the hint figure.

Sol. Denote node 3 as N_3 , the parent of N_3 as A and the co-child of A and X as B. We would like to prove $P(X, N_3|A, B) = P(X|A, B) \cdot P(N_3|A, B)$.

$$P(X, N_3|A, B) = \frac{P(X, 3, A, B)}{P(A, B)} = \frac{P(X) \cdot P(A) \cdot P(B|A, X) \cdot P(N_3|A)}{P(A, B)}$$

$$= \frac{\frac{P(X) \cdot P(A)}{P(X, A)} \cdot P(X, A) \cdot P(B|A, X) \cdot P(N_3|A)}{P(A, B)}$$

$$= 1 \cdot P(X|A, B) \cdot P(N_3|A)$$

$$= P(X|A, B) \cdot P(N_3|A, B)$$

Case 4. Via a child of a child of X, i.e. node 4 in the hint figure.

Sol. Since the child of X is given, it applies to type-1 d-separate.

Case 5. Via a child of a parent of X, i.e. node 5 in the hint figure.

Sol. Since the parent of X is given, it applies to type-2 d-separate.

2.6 True or false

Sol. Response and simple reason is described in Table 2.

<u>True</u>	P(C,D A)	=	$P(C A) \cdot P(D A)$
$\underline{\text{False}}$	P(A D)	=	P(A B,D)
<u>True</u>	P(C, E)	=	$P(C) \cdot P(E)$
$\underline{\text{False}}$	P(C, D, E)	=	$P(C) \cdot P(D) \cdot P(E)$
$\underline{\text{False}}$	P(F,G)	=	$P(F) \cdot P(G)$
$\underline{\text{False}}$	P(F,G D)	=	$P(F D) \cdot P(G D)$
$\underline{\text{False}}$	P(A, D, G)	=	$P(A) \cdot P(D A) \cdot P(G D)$
$\underline{\text{False}}$	P(B E)	=	P(B E,G)
$\underline{\text{False}}$	P(C E)	=	P(C E,G)

Table 2: True or false

2.7 Subsets

Sol. Response is recorded in the Table 3.

```
P(A|S)
                                    S = \{B, D, G\}
          P(A)
        P(A|C)
                     P(A|S)
                                    S = \{B, C, D, E, F, G\}
                 =
          P(C)
                     P(C|S)
                                    S = \{B, D, G\}
                    P(C|S)
                                    S = \{A, B, D, G\}
        P(C|A)
                 =
                     P(C|S)
P(C|S)
     P(C|A,E)
                 =
                                    S = \{A, B, D, E, G\}
  P(C|A,E,F)
                                    S = \{A, E, F\}
P(C|A,D,E,F)
                     P(C|S)
                                    S = \{A, B, D, E, F, G\}
          P(F)
                     P(F|S)
                                    S = \{\}
                     P(F|S)
        P(F|C)
                                    S = \{A, C, E\}
                 =
     P(F|C,D)
                      P(F|S)
                                    S = \{A, B, C, D, E, G\}
       P(B,G)
                                    S = \{A, C, E\}
                     P(B,G|S)
```

Table 3: Subsets

2.8 Noisy-OR

Sol. Response is recorded in the Table 4. Since I have no intuition for last three comparisons, I assumed P(X = 1) = a and P(Y = 1) = b and extend all probabilistic formulas...

6

П

```
\begin{array}{ccccc} P(Z=1|X=0,Y=0) & < & P(Z=1|X=0,Y=1) \\ P(Z=1|X=1,Y=0) & < & P(Z=1|X=0,Y=1) \\ P(Z=1|X=1,Y=0) & < & P(Z=1|X=1,Y=1) \\ P(X=1) & = & P(X=1|Y=0) \\ P(X=1) & < & P(X=1|Z=1) \\ P(X=1|Z=1) & > & P(X=1|Y=1,Z=1) \\ P(X=1)P(Y=1)P(Z=1) & < & P(X=1,Y=1,Z=1) \end{array}
```

Table 4: Noisy-OR

2.9 Polytree inference

(a) Consider just the subgraph of the DAG containing the nodes A and B. Compute the marginal probability P(B) from the CPTs in this subgraph.

Sol.

$$P(B) = \sum_{a} P(A, B) = \sum_{a} P(A) \cdot P(B|A)$$

(b) Consider just the subgraph of the DAG containing the nodes A, B, C, and D. Compute the conditional probability P(D|C) from the CPTs in this subgraph.

Sol.

$$\begin{split} P(D|C) &= \frac{P(C,D)}{P(C)} = \frac{\sum_{a,b} P(A,B,C,D)}{P(C)} \\ &= \frac{\sum_{a,b} P(A) \cdot P(B|A) \cdot P(C) \cdot P(D|B,C)}{P(C)} \\ &= \sum_{b} \sum_{a} P(A,B) \cdot P(D|B,C) \\ &= \sum_{b} P(B) \cdot P(D|B,C) \end{split}$$

(c) Compute the conditional probability P(F|C, E).

Sol.

$$\begin{split} P(F|C,E) &= \frac{P(C,E,F)}{P(C,E)} = \frac{\sum_{b,d} P(B,C,D,E,F)}{P(C) \cdot P(E)} \\ &= \frac{\sum_{b,d} P(B) \cdot P(C) \cdot P(D|B,C) \cdot P(E) \cdot P(F|D,E)}{P(C) \cdot P(E)} \\ &= \frac{\sum_{b,d} \frac{P(B) \cdot P(C)}{P(B,C)} \cdot P(B,C) \cdot P(D|B,C) \cdot P(E) \cdot P(F|D,E)}{P(C) \cdot P(E)} \\ &= \frac{\sum_{b,d} 1 \cdot P(B,C,D) \cdot P(F|D,E)}{P(C)} \\ &= \sum_{d} \frac{P(C,D)}{P(C)} \cdot P(F|D,E) \\ &= \sum_{d} P(D|C) \cdot P(F|D,E) \end{split}$$

(d) Compute the posterior probability P(E|C,F).

Sol.

$$\begin{split} P(E|C,F) &= P(F|C,E) \cdot \frac{P(C,E)}{P(C,F)} \\ &= P(F|C,E) \cdot \frac{P(C) \cdot P(E)}{\sum_{d,e} P(C) \cdot P(D|C) \cdot P(E) \cdot P(F|D,E)} \\ &= P(F|C,E) \cdot \frac{P(E)}{\sum_{d,e} P(D|C) \cdot P(E) \cdot P(F|D,E)} \end{split}$$

(e) Suppose that each node in the belief network can take on n possible values. Consider the complexity of your overall calculation for P(E=e|C=c,F=f), assuming that it need only be done for one particular triplet of values $\{e,c,f\}$. Is it linear, polynomial, or exponential in n? If polynomial, what is the degree? Justify your answer.

Sol. Given e, c, f, I break down the overall procedures into several steps.

- 1. According to (a): calculate P(B=b') takes O(n) time to sum up over a
- 2. Follow step 1: calculate P(B = b'), $\forall b'$ takes $O(n^2)$ time
- 3. According to (b): calculate P(D = d' | C = c) takes O(n) time
- 4. Follow step 3: calculate P(D=d'|C=c), $\forall d'$ takes $O(n^2)$ time to sum up over b
- 5. According to (c): calculate P(F=f|C=c,E=e) takes O(n) time to sum up over d
- 6. According to (d): calculate P(E = e | C = c, F = f) takes $O(n^2)$ time to sum up over d and e

With step 2, step 4, step 5 and step 6, the time complexity is $O(n^2 + n^2 + n + n^2) = O(n^2)$. In other words, this algorithm is a polynomial one with degree 2.