# Task 3

**Task 3:** Build a logistic-LASSO model to select features, and implement a path-wise coordinate-wise optimization algorithm to obtain a path of solutions with a sequence of descending  $\lambda$ 's.

Reference: Friedman J, Hastie T, Tibshirani R. Regularization Paths for Generalized Linear Models via Coordinate Descent. J Stat Softw. 2010;33(1):1-22. PMID: 20808728; PMCID: PMC2929880.

https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2929880/#FD14

### Algorithm

Log-likelihood f in task 1:

$$f(\boldsymbol{\beta}; \mathbf{y}, \mathbf{X}) = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \left[ Y_i \mathbf{x}_i^{\mathsf{T}} \boldsymbol{\beta} - \log \left( 1 + e^{\mathbf{x}_i^{\mathsf{T}} \boldsymbol{\beta}} \right) \right]. \tag{1}$$

LASSO estimates the logistic model parameters  $\beta$  by optimizing a penalized loss function:

$$\min_{\beta} -\frac{1}{n} f(\beta) + \lambda \sum_{k=1}^{p} |\beta_k|. \tag{2}$$

where  $\lambda \geq 0$  is the tuning parameter. Note that the intercept is not penalized and all predictors are standardized.

#### Algorithm Structure

OUTER LOOP: Decrement  $\lambda$ .

MIDDLE LOOP: Update  $\tilde{w}_i$ ,  $\tilde{p}_i$ , and thus the quadratic approximation  $\ell$  using the current parameters  $\tilde{\beta}$ . INNER LOOP: Run the coordinate descent algorithm on the penalized weighted-least-squares problem.

**OUTER LOOP** In the outer loop, we compute the solutions of the optimization problem (2) for a decreasing sequence of values for  $\lambda$ :  $\{\lambda_1, \ldots, \lambda_m\}$ , starting at the smallest value  $\lambda_1 = \lambda_{max}$  for which the estimates of all coefficients  $\hat{\beta}_j = 0, \ j = 1, 2, \ldots, p$ , which is

$$\lambda_{max} = \max_{j \in \{1, \dots, p\}} \left| \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} X_{ij} (Y_i - \bar{Y}) \right|, \tag{3}$$

where  $\bar{Y} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} Y_i$ . For tuning parameter value  $\lambda_{k+1}$ , we initialize coordinate descent algorithm at the computed solution for  $\lambda_k$  (warm start). Apart from giving us a path of solutions, this scheme exploits warm starts, and leads to a more stable algorithm.

**MIDDLE LOOP** In the middle loop, we find the estimates of  $\beta$  by solving the optimization problem (2) for a fixed  $\lambda$ . For each iteration of the middle loop, based on the current parameter estimates  $\tilde{\beta}$ , we form a

quadratic approximation to the log-likelihood f using a Taylor expansion:

$$\begin{split} f(\boldsymbol{\beta}) &\approx \ell(\boldsymbol{\beta}) = f(\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}) + (\boldsymbol{\beta} - \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}})^{\top} \nabla f(\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}) + \frac{1}{2} (\boldsymbol{\beta} - \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}})^{\top} \nabla^{2} f(\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}) (\boldsymbol{\beta} - \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}) \\ &= f(\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}) + [\mathbf{X}(\boldsymbol{\beta} - \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}})]^{\top} (\mathbf{y} - \tilde{\mathbf{p}}) - \frac{1}{2} [\mathbf{X}(\boldsymbol{\beta} - \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}})]^{\top} \tilde{\mathbf{W}} \mathbf{X} (\boldsymbol{\beta} - \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}) \\ &= f(\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}) + \sum_{i=1}^{n} (Y_{i} - \tilde{p}_{i}) \mathbf{x}_{i}^{\top} (\boldsymbol{\beta} - \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}) - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \tilde{w}_{i} \left[ \mathbf{x}_{i}^{\top} (\boldsymbol{\beta} - \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}) \right]^{2} \\ &= -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \tilde{w}_{i} \left\{ \left[ \mathbf{x}_{i}^{\top} (\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}} - \boldsymbol{\beta}) \right]^{2} + 2 \frac{Y_{i} - \tilde{p}_{i}}{\tilde{w}_{i}} \left[ \mathbf{x}_{i}^{\top} (\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}} - \boldsymbol{\beta}) \right] \right\} + f(\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}), \\ &= -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \tilde{w}_{i} \left[ \mathbf{x}_{i}^{\top} (\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}} - \boldsymbol{\beta}) + \frac{Y_{i} - \tilde{p}_{i}}{\tilde{w}_{i}} \right] + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \tilde{w}_{i} \left( \frac{Y_{i} - \tilde{p}_{i}}{\tilde{w}_{i}} \right)^{2} + f(\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}), \end{split}$$

where  $\tilde{\mathbf{p}} = (\tilde{p}_1, \dots, \tilde{p}_n)^{\top}$  and  $\tilde{\mathbf{W}} = \operatorname{diag}(\tilde{w}_1, \dots, \tilde{w}_n)$  are the estimates of  $\mathbf{p}$  and  $\mathbf{W}$  based on  $\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}$ . We rewrite the function  $\ell(\boldsymbol{\beta})$  as follows:

$$\ell(\boldsymbol{\beta}) = -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \tilde{w}_i (\tilde{z}_i - \mathbf{x}_i^{\top} \boldsymbol{\beta})^2 + C(\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}), \tag{4}$$

where

$$\tilde{z}_i = \mathbf{x}_i^{\mathsf{T}} \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}} + \frac{Y_i - \tilde{p}_i}{\tilde{w}_i}$$

is the working response,  $\tilde{w}_i$  is the working weight, and C is a function that does not depend on  $\beta$ .

**INNER LOOP.** In the inner loop, we find the estimates of  $\beta$  by solving a modified optimization problem of (2). With fixed  $\tilde{w}_i$ 's,  $\tilde{z}_i$ 's, and a fixed form of  $\ell$  based on the estimates of  $\beta$  in the previous iteration of the middle loop, we use coordinate descent to solve the penalized weighted least-squares problem

$$\min_{\beta} -\frac{1}{n}\ell(\beta) + \lambda \sum_{k=1}^{p} |\beta_k|, \tag{5}$$

and update the estimates of  $\beta$ . For each iteration of the inner loop, suppose we have the current estimates  $\tilde{\beta}_k$  for  $k \neq j$  and we wish to partially optimize with respect to  $\beta_j$ :

$$\min_{\beta_j} \frac{1}{2n} \sum_{i=1}^n \tilde{w}_i \left( \tilde{z}_i - X_{ij}\beta_j - \sum_{k \neq j} X_{ik} \tilde{\beta}_k \right)^2 + \lambda |\beta_j| + \lambda \sum_{k \neq j} |\tilde{\beta}_k|.$$

Updates:

$$\tilde{\beta}_0 \leftarrow \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n \tilde{w}_i (\tilde{z}_i - \sum_{k=1}^p X_{ik} \tilde{\beta}_k)}{\sum_{i=1}^n \tilde{w}_i},$$

$$\tilde{\beta}_j \leftarrow \frac{S\left(\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \tilde{w}_i X_{ij} (\tilde{z}_i - \sum_{k \neq j} x_{ik} \tilde{\beta}_k), \lambda\right)}{\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \tilde{w}_i X_{ij}^2}, \ j = 1, \dots, p$$

where  $S(z, \gamma)$  is the soft-thresholding operator with value

$$S(z,\gamma) = \operatorname{sign}(z)(|z| - \gamma)_{+} = \begin{cases} z - \gamma, & \text{if } z > 0 \text{ and } \gamma < |z| \\ z + \gamma, & \text{if } z < 0 \text{ and } \gamma < |z| \\ 0, & \text{if } \gamma \ge |z| \end{cases}$$

We can then update estimates of  $\beta_j$ 's repeatedly for j = 0, 1, 2, ..., p, 0, 1, 2, ... until convergence.

Note: Care is taken to avoid coefficients diverging in order to achieve fitted probabilities of 0 or 1. When a probability is within  $\epsilon = 10^{-5}$  of 1, we set it to 1, and set the weights to  $\epsilon$ . 0 is treated similarly.

#### **Algorithm 1** Path-wise coordinate-wise optimization algorithm

```
Require: g(\beta, \lambda) = -\frac{1}{n}f(\beta) + \lambda \sum_{k=1}^{p} |\beta_k| - target function, where f(\beta) is given in (1); \beta_0 - starting value; \{\lambda_1, \ldots, \lambda_m\} - a sequence of descending \lambda's, where \lambda_1 = \lambda_{max} is given in (3); \epsilon - tolerance; N_s, N_t -
          maximum number of iterations of the middle and inner loops
Ensure: \hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}(\lambda_r) such that \hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}(\lambda_r) \approx \arg\min_{\boldsymbol{\beta}} q(\boldsymbol{\beta}, \lambda_r), r = 1, \dots, m
    1: \boldsymbol{\beta}_0(\lambda_1) \leftarrow \boldsymbol{\beta}_0
   2: OUTER LOOP
   3: for r \in \{1, ..., m\}, where r is the current number of iterations of the outer loop, do
                     s \leftarrow 0, where s is the current number of iterations of the middle loop
                     q(\beta_{-1}(\lambda_r), \lambda_r) \leftarrow \infty
    5:
                     MIDDLE LOOP
    6:
                     while t \geq 2 and s < N_s do
    7:
    8:
                             Update \tilde{w}_i^{(s)}, \tilde{z}_i^{(s)} (i = 1, ..., n), and thus \ell_s(\boldsymbol{\beta}) as given in (4) based on \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}_{s-1}(\lambda_r) t \leftarrow 0, where t is the current number of iterations of the inner loop
 10:
                             \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}_{s}^{(0)}(\lambda_{r}) \leftarrow \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}_{s-1}(\lambda_{r})
 11:
                             h_s(\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}_s^{(-1)}(\lambda_r), \lambda_r) \leftarrow \infty, \text{ where } h_s(\boldsymbol{\beta}, \lambda) = -\frac{1}{n}\ell_s(\boldsymbol{\beta}) + \lambda \sum_{k=1}^p |\beta_k| 
INNER LOOP
while \left|h_s(\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}_s^{(t)}(\lambda_r), \lambda_r) - h_s(\tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}_s^{(t-1)}(\lambda_r), \lambda_r)\right| > \epsilon  and t < N_t do
 12:
 13:
 15:
                                      \tilde{\beta}_{0}^{(t)}(\lambda_{r}) \leftarrow \sum_{i=1}^{n} \tilde{w}_{i}^{(s)} \left( \tilde{z}_{i}^{(s)} - \sum_{k=1}^{p} X_{ik} \tilde{\beta}_{k}^{(t-1)}(\lambda_{r}) \right) / \sum_{i=1}^{n} \tilde{w}_{i}^{(s)}
 16:
 17:
                                               \tilde{\beta}_{j}^{(t)}(\lambda_{r}) \leftarrow S\left(\frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^{n} \tilde{w}_{i}^{(s)} X_{ij} \left(\tilde{z}_{i}^{(s)} - \sum_{k < j} X_{ik} \tilde{\beta}_{k}^{(t)}(\lambda_{r}) - \sum_{k > j} X_{ik} \tilde{\beta}_{k}^{(t-1)}(\lambda_{r})\right), \lambda_{r}\right) / \frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^{n} \tilde{w}_{i}^{(s)} X_{ij}^{2}
 18:
                                       end for
 19:
                             \begin{array}{l} \mathbf{end} \ \mathbf{while} \\ \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}_s(\lambda_r) \leftarrow \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}_s^{(t)}(\lambda_r) \end{array}
 20:
 21:
                     end while
 22:
                     \hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}(\lambda_r) \leftarrow \tilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}_s(\lambda_r)
 23:
                     \widetilde{\boldsymbol{\beta}}_0(\lambda_{r+1}) \leftarrow \widehat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}(\lambda_r)
 24:
 25: end for
```

## Implementation in R

target functions needed to be optimized and soft-threshold operator

```
# function -ell/n (without C) with penalties (minimize!) used in inner loop's convergence
coordinate_func <- function(X, z, w, betavec, lambda) {
    0.5 * sum(w * (z - X %*% betavec)^2) / nrow(X) + lambda * sum(abs(betavec[-1]))
}

# soft-threshold operator used in inner loop
soft.threshold <- function(z, gamma) {
    sign(z) * max(abs(z) - gamma, 0)
}</pre>
```

We implement the algorithm in  $\mathbf{R}$ .

```
# outer loop
LogisticLASSO <- function(dat, start, lambda) {</pre>
  r <- length(lambda)
  X <- as.matrix(cbind(rep(1, nrow(dat)), dat[, -1])) # design matrix
  y <- dat[, 1] # response vector
  res <- matrix(NA, nrow = r, ncol = ncol(dat) + 1)
  for (i in 1:r) {
    betavec <- MiddleLoop(X = X, y = y, start = start, lambda = lambda[i])
    res[i, ] <- c(lambda[i], betavec)</pre>
    start <- betavec
  }
  colnames(res) <- c("lambda", "(Intercept)", names(dat)[-1])</pre>
  return(res)
}
# middle loop
MiddleLoop <- function(X, y, start, lambda, maxiter = 100) {</pre>
  betavec <- start
  s <- 0
  eps <- 1e-5
  repeat {
    s <- s + 1
    u <- X %*% betavec
    p_{vec} \leftarrow sigmoid(u) \# function `sigmoid` to compute <math>exp(x)/(1 + exp(x))
    w <- p_vec * (1 - p_vec)
    # see note
    p_vec[p_vec < eps] <- 0</pre>
    p_{vec}[p_{vec} > 1 - eps] \leftarrow 1
    w[p_{vec} == 1 | p_{vec} == 0] \leftarrow eps
    z \leftarrow u + (y - p_vec) / w
    betavec <- InnerLoop(X = X, z = z, w = w, betavec = betavec, lambda = lambda)
    t <- betavec[1]
    betavec <- betavec[-1]</pre>
    if (t == 1 || s >= maxiter) { # if number of iterations of inner loop = 1, converge.
      break
    }
  }
```

```
return(betavec)
}
# inner loop
InnerLoop <- function(X, z, w, betavec, lambda, tol = 1e-10, maxiter = 1000) {</pre>
  prevfunc <- Inf</pre>
  curfunc <- coordinate_func(X = X, z = z, w = w, betavec = betavec, lambda)</pre>
  while (abs(curfunc - prevfunc) > tol && t < maxiter) {</pre>
    t < -t + 1
    prevfunc <- curfunc</pre>
    betavec[1] \leftarrow sum(w * (z - X[, -1] %*% betavec[-1])) / sum(w)
    for (j in 2:length(betavec)) {
      betavec[j] \leftarrow soft.threshold(z = sum(w * X[, j] * (z - X[, -j] %*% betavec[-j])) / nrow(X), gamma)
    }
    curfunc <- coordinate_func(X = X, z = z, w = w, betavec = betavec, lambda = lambda)</pre>
  }
  return(c(t, betavec))
```

## Model fit on training data

We fit a logistic-LASSO model on the training data using our function LogisticLASSO with a sequence of descending  $\lambda$ 's.

```
lambda_max <- max(abs(t(x) %*% (y - mean(y)))) / length(y) + 1e-10 # avoid computational error
lambdas <- exp(seq(log(lambda_max), log(lambda_max) - 4, length = 15))
res <- LogisticLASSO(dat = Training, start = rep(0, ncol(Training)),
                    lambda = lambdas)
res
##
             lambda (Intercept) radius_mean texture_mean perimeter_mean area_mean
  [1,] 0.395134947 -0.5295835
                                         0
                                               0.0000000
## [2,] 0.296934940 -0.5524566
                                               0.0000000
                                                                      0
                                                                                0
                                          Ω
   [3,] 0.223139865 -0.5910713
                                          0
                                               0.0000000
                                                                      0
                                                                                0
## [4,] 0.167684542 -0.6318088
                                          0
                                                                      0
                                                                                0
                                               0.0000000
## [5,] 0.126011126 -0.6701188
                                          0
                                               0.0000000
                                                                      0
                                                                                0
## [6,] 0.094694500 -0.7025876
                                          0
                                                                      0
                                                                                0
                                               0.0000000
## [7,] 0.071160766 -0.7272230
                                          0
                                               0.0000000
                                                                      0
                                                                                0
## [8,] 0.053475700 -0.7460048
                                                                      0
                                                                                0
                                          0
                                               0.0000000
## [9,] 0.040185774 -0.7499579
                                          0
                                               0.0000000
                                                                      0
                                                                                0
## [10,] 0.030198697 -0.7444002
                                                                      0
                                          0
                                               0.0447684
                                                                                0
## [11,] 0.022693635 -0.7233096
                                          0
                                               0.1545311
                                                                      0
                                                                                0
                                              0.2505568
                                                                      0
                                                                                0
## [12,] 0.017053751 -0.6932370
                                          0
## [13,] 0.012815507 -0.6538671
                                          0
                                               0.3306242
                                                                      0
                                                                                0
                                                                      0
                                                                                0
## [14,] 0.009630562 -0.5998805
                                          0
                                               0.4043298
## [15,] 0.007237149 -0.5372183
                                          0
                                               0.4708138
                                                                      0
##
        smoothness mean compactness mean concavity mean concave.points mean
## [1,]
                      0
                                                      0
                                       0
                                                                 0.00000000
## [2,]
                      0
                                       0
                                                      0
                                                                 0.00000000
## [3,]
                      0
                                       0
                                                      0
                                                                 0.00000000
```

```
##
    [4,]
                          0
                                              0
                                                               0
                                                                            0.0000000
##
    [5,]
                          0
                                              0
                                                               0
                                                                            0.0000000
##
    [6,]
                          0
                                              0
                                                               0
                                                                            0.05439274
                          0
                                              0
##
    [7,]
                                                               0
                                                                            0.17198760
##
    [8,]
                          0
                                              0
                                                               0
                                                                            0.30216261
##
    [9,]
                          0
                                              0
                                                               0
                                                                            0.44702109
## [10,]
                          0
                                              0
                                                               0
                                                                            0.55167107
## [11,]
                          0
                                              0
                                                               0
                                                                            0.54744077
##
   [12,]
                          0
                                              0
                                                               0
                                                                            0.52852121
                          0
                                              0
                                                               0
##
   [13,]
                                                                            0.49336236
##
   [14,]
                          0
                                              0
                                                               0
                                                                            0.48457215
                          0
                                              0
                                                               0
##
   [15,]
                                                                            0.52735694
##
          symmetry_mean fractal_dimension_mean radius_se texture_se perimeter_se
                                                                                           0
##
    [1,]
                        0
                                                  0 0.00000000
                                                                            0
##
    [2,]
                        0
                                                  0 0.00000000
                                                                            0
##
    [3,]
                        0
                                                  0 0.00000000
                                                                            0
##
    [4,]
                        0
                                                  0 0.00000000
                                                                            0
##
    [5,]
                        0
                                                  0 0.00000000
                                                                            0
##
    [6,]
                        0
                                                  0 0.00000000
                                                                            0
                                                                                           0
##
    [7,]
                        0
                                                  0 0.00000000
                                                                            0
##
    [8,]
                        0
                                                  0 0.00000000
                                                                            0
                                                                                           0
##
    [9,]
                        0
                                                  0 0.00000000
                                                                            0
## [10,]
                                                  0 0.02939158
                        0
                                                                            0
##
   Γ11.]
                        0
                                                  0 0.18251978
                                                                            0
                        0
                                                                            0
                                                                                           0
##
   [12,]
                                                  0 0.35993143
   [13,]
##
                        0
                                                  0 0.56091818
                                                                            0
                                                                                           0
   [14,]
                        0
                                                  0 0.83094267
                                                                            0
                                                                                           0
##
##
   [15,]
                        0
                                                  0 1.14904111
##
          area_se smoothness_se compactness_se
                                                    concavity_se concave.points_se
                 0
                                                                 0
##
    [1,]
                                 0
                                                  0
                                                                                      0
##
    [2,]
                 0
                                 0
                                                  0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
##
    [3,]
                 0
                                 0
                                                  0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
                                                  0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
##
    [4,]
                 0
                                 0
##
    [5,]
                 0
                                 0
                                                  0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
##
    [6,]
                 0
                                 0
                                                  0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
##
    [7,]
                 0
                                 0
                                                  0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
##
    [8,]
                 0
                                 0
                                                  0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
##
    [9,]
                 0
                                 0
                                                  0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
##
   [10,]
                 0
                                 0
                                                  0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
                                 0
                                                  0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
##
   [11,]
                 0
   [12,]
                 0
                                 0
                                                  0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
   [13,]
                 0
                                 0
                                                  0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
##
                 0
                                 0
                                                  0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
##
   [14,]
                                 0
                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
##
   [15,]
                 0
##
          symmetry_se fractal_dimension_se radius_worst texture_worst
##
    [1,]
                      0
                                   0.0000000
                                                   0.000000
                                                                 0.00000000
                      0
##
    [2,]
                                   0.0000000
                                                   0.0000000
                                                                 0.00000000
    [3,]
                      0
##
                                   0.0000000
                                                   0.1206156
                                                                 0.00000000
##
    [4,]
                      0
                                   0.0000000
                                                   0.4297921
                                                                 0.00000000
##
    [5,]
                      0
                                   0.0000000
                                                   0.6085099
                                                                 0.00000000
##
    [6,]
                      0
                                   0.0000000
                                                   0.7826490
                                                                 0.001346751
                      0
##
    [7,]
                                   0.0000000
                                                   0.9300058
                                                                 0.121096185
##
    [8,]
                      0
                                   0.0000000
                                                   1.1000975
                                                                 0.238337349
##
    [9,]
                      0
                                   0.0000000
                                                   1.3387832
                                                                 0.343497992
```

0

0

0

0

0

0

0

0

0

```
## [10,]
                    0
                                 0.00000000
                                                1.6009253
                                                             0.403611300
                                                1.8367239
## [11.]
                    0
                                 0.00000000
                                                             0.398189345
## [12,]
                    0
                                 0.0000000
                                                2.0987475
                                                             0.404090305
  [13,]
                    0
##
                                 0.0000000
                                                2.3938984
                                                             0.424786650
##
   [14,]
                    0
                                -0.05238337
                                                2.6381938
                                                             0.451675214
##
   [15,]
                    0
                                -0.16690242
                                                2.8315938
                                                             0.487159914
##
         perimeter_worst area_worst smoothness_worst compactness_worst
##
    [1,]
                0.000000
                                    0
                                             0.0000000
##
    [2,]
                0.1051523
                                    0
                                             0.0000000
                                                                          0
##
    [3,]
                                    0
                                                                          0
                0.1500945
                                             0.0000000
    [4,]
                0.000000
                                    0
                                             0.0000000
                                                                          0
    [5,]
                                    0
                                                                          0
##
                0.000000
                                             0.0000000
##
                                    0
                                                                          0
    [6,]
                0.000000
                                             0.0000000
                                                                          0
##
    [7,]
                0.000000
                                    0
                                             0.0000000
    [8,]
##
                0.000000
                                    0
                                             0.0000000
                                                                          0
##
    [9,]
                0.000000
                                    0
                                             0.04691526
                                                                          0
##
   [10,]
                0.000000
                                    0
                                                                          0
                                             0.12680700
   [11,]
                                    0
                                                                          0
##
                0.000000
                                             0.21826754
   [12,]
##
                0.000000
                                    0
                                             0.31530738
                                                                          0
                                    0
                                                                          0
##
   [13,]
                0.000000
                                             0.42083435
##
   [14,]
                0.000000
                                    0
                                             0.51734612
                                                                          0
##
   [15,]
                0.000000
                                    0
                                             0.60122136
                                                                          0
##
         concavity_worst concave.points_worst symmetry_worst
##
    [1,]
               0.0000000
                                       0.0000000
                                                     0.00000000
##
    [2,]
               0.0000000
                                      0.3195118
                                                     0.0000000
    [3,]
               0.0000000
                                       0.5322324
                                                     0.00000000
##
    [4,]
               0.0000000
                                      0.7359560
                                                     0.0000000
##
    [5,]
               0.0000000
                                                      0.0000000
                                       0.9157618
##
    [6,]
               0.0000000
                                       1.0522435
                                                     0.0000000
##
    [7,]
               0.0000000
                                      1.1076377
                                                     0.0000000
    [8,]
##
               0.00000000
                                       1.1412645
                                                     0.01450593
##
    [9,]
               0.0000000
                                       1.0643104
                                                     0.08829545
##
   [10,]
               0.0000000
                                       0.9974356
                                                     0.15469660
##
   [11,]
               0.0000000
                                                     0.22109589
                                       1.0095475
##
   [12,]
               0.02287587
                                       1.0163350
                                                      0.27882331
##
   [13,]
               0.07606781
                                       1.0097876
                                                     0.32768971
##
  [14,]
               0.16307403
                                       1.0185758
                                                     0.36826630
##
  [15,]
               0.28610709
                                       1.0381665
                                                     0.40163889
##
         fractal_dimension_worst
##
    [1,]
                                 0
##
    [2,]
                                 0
                                 0
##
    [3,]
##
    [4,]
                                 0
##
    [5,]
                                 0
##
    [6,]
                                 0
##
    [7,]
                                 0
##
    [8,]
                                 0
##
   [9,]
                                 0
## [10,]
                                 0
## [11,]
                                 0
##
   [12,]
                                 0
## [13,]
                                 0
## [14,]
                                 0
## [15,]
                                 0
```