ing department) to teach end users to use enterprise resource planning software. Training sessions were conducted in computer-equipped classrooms, each with 11 multimedia PCs for the trainees and one for the facilitator. The training material was stored in a company-owned Web server and delivered to the training computers through the company's intranet. A typical training session took approximately four hours, beginning with an introduction to important concepts by the facilitator. The trainees then reviewed the training material at their own pace; hands-on exercises followed, guided by the facilitator.

We used structured interviews to collect the responses of the training providers and managers and questionnaire surveys to collect responses from the trainees. The framework was found to be helpful in guiding training evaluation while providing a comprehensive assessment of the training program. Evaluation of the technology component (level 1 in the evaluation dimension) revealed strengths and weaknesses of the tools and technologies used to develop and deliver the training. For example, the company's training developers felt the authoring software was easy to use and enhanced their personal productivity. The trainees reported they liked the software demonstration modules these developers had created using Lotus Screencam, a popular screen-recording application for PCs.

Contrary to the designer's expectations, the trainees only rarely accessed the training material stored on the Web site as a resource for post-training support. Subsequent investigation revealed that the limited availability of multimedia workstations in user departments was partly to blame. The trainees felt that hands-on exercises emphasizing real-world applications were helpful in holding their attention during training, further facilitating skills acquisition. These results reflect the importance of crafting training material to match the background and experience of each user group. We found cross validation of the transfer of skills from the trainee and the manager viewpoints to be a useful feature of the framework.

Our experience suggests that, with proper planning, the evaluation framework can be integrated into any organization's EU training program. It also revealed the importance of goal setting. The training manager (in consultation with business managers) must define training goals early in the program, then track effectiveness against this benchmark. Defining training goals and linking them to organizational goals is especially important in measuring the organizational effect (level 5 of the evaluation dimension) of EU training.

Conclusion

Although evaluation is critical for ensuring that EU training programs help create a computer-literate work force, it remains a weak link in the training process. We've addressed this issue by designing, testing, and now presenting a comprehensive framework for evaluating EU training programs. Our proposed framework is readily integrated into all kinds of EU training programs, especially for teaching the basic skills involved in using mainstream business applications. Business managers and training managers alike can use it to design their own EU training-evaluation process as a feedback system for monitoring training effectiveness and for generating the information they need to improve their EU training programs. C

References

1. Baldwin, T. and Ford, K. Transfer of training: A review and directions for future research. *Personnel Psych. 41,* 1 (Spring 1988), 63–105.
2. Copeland, L. Attacks breed disaster plans. *Computerworld 34,* 20 (May 15, 2000), 4.
3. Fox, R. INS high-tech holdup. *Commun. ACM 45,* 8 (Aug. 2002), 9–10.
4. Galvin, T. Industry 2001 report. *Training 41,* 10 (Oct. 2001).
5. Kirkpatrick, D. *Evaluating Training Programs.* Berrett-Koehler Publishers, San Francisco, 1998.
6. Leidner, D. and Jarvenpaa, S. The use of information technology to enhance management school education: A theoretical view. *MIS Quarterly 19,* 3 (Sept. 1995), 265–291.
7. Nelson, R., Whitener, E., and Philcox, H. The assessment of end-user training needs. *Commun. ACM 38,* 7 (July 1995), 27–39.
8. Piccoli, G., Ahmad, R., and Ives, B. Web-based virtual learning environments: A research framework and a preliminary assessment of effectiveness in basic IT skills training. *MIS Quart. 25,* 4 (Dec. 2001), 401–426.
9. Tsui, A. A multiple-constituency model of effectiveness: An empirical examination at the human resource subunit level. *Admin. Sci. Quart. 35,* 3 (Sept. 1990), 458–483.
10. Yin, R. *Case Study Research.* Sage Publications, Newbury Park, CA, 1984.

RadhaKanta Mahapatra (mahapatra@uta.edu) is an associate professor of information systems in the Department of Information Systems and Operations Management at the University of Texas at Arlington.

Vincent S. Lai (vslai@cuhk.edu.hk) is a professor of MIS and associate dean (graduate studies) of the Faculty of Business Administration at the Chinese University of Hong Kong.