

# CSC373 Worksheet 2 Solution

July 26, 2020

1)  $[a_{11} = [12, 16]]$

$i$	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11
$s_i$	1	3	0	5	3	5	6	8	8	2	12
$f_i$	4	5	6	7	9	9	10	11	12	14	16

A red arrow points from  $s_{11} = 12$  to  $f_8 = 11$ . A blue arrow labeled  $k$  points up to  $s_{11} = 12$ .

3)  $[a_{11} = [12, 16], a_2 = [8, 11], a_4 = [5, 7]]$

$i$	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11
$s_i$	1	3	0	5	3	5	6	8	8	2	12
$f_i$	4	5	6	7	9	9	10	11	12	14	16

A red arrow points from  $s_4 = 5$  to  $f_2 = 5$ . A blue arrow labeled  $k$  points up to  $s_4 = 5$ .

2)  $[a_{11} = [12, 16], a_2 = [8, 11]]$

$i$	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11
$s_i$	1	3	0	5	3	5	6	8	8	2	12
$f_i$	4	5	6	7	9	9	10	11	12	14	16

A red arrow points from  $s_8 = 8$  to  $f_7 = 10$ . A blue arrow labeled  $k$  points up to  $s_8 = 8$ .

3)  $[a_{11} = [12, 16], a_2 = [8, 11], a_4 = [5, 7], a_1 = [1, 4]]$

$i$	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11
$s_i$	1	3	0	5	3	5	6	8	8	2	12
$f_i$	4	5	6	7	9	9	10	11	12	14	16

A blue arrow labeled  $k$  points up to  $s_1 = 1$ .

1.

This approach is a greedy algorithm because algorithm

- 1) Has the greedy choice: selecting the last activity to start that is compatible with all previously selected activities
- 2) Has the greedy choice that is always part of optimal solution:

## Claim:

Consider any nonempty subproblem  $S_k$ . Let  $a_m$  be an activity in  $S_k$  with the last activity to start that is compatible with all previously selected activities. Then  $a_m$  is included in some maximum-size subset of mutually compatible activities of  $S_k$

*Proof.* Let  $A_k$  be a maximum-size subset of mutually compatible activities in  $S_k$ , and let  $a_j$  be the activity in  $A_k$  with the last activity to start that is compatible with all previously selected activities.

If  $a_j = a_m$ , we are done, since we have shown that  $a_m$  is the maximum-size subset of mutually compatible activities of  $S_k$ .

If  $a_j \neq a_m$ , let the set  $A'_k = A_k = \{a_j\} \cup \{a_m\}$  be  $A_k$  but substituting  $a_m$  for  $a_j$ . The activities in  $A'_k$  are disjoint, which follow because the activities in  $A_k$  are disjoint,  $a_j$  is the first activity in  $A_k$  to finish, and  $s_j \leq s_m$ .

Since  $|A'_k| = |A_k|$ , we conclude that  $A'_k$  is a maximum-size subset of mutually compatible activities of  $S_k$ , and it includes  $a_m$ .  $\square$

### Notes:

- Greedy Algorithm
  - Always makes the choice that looks best at the moment
    - \* Locally optimal solution leads to globally optimal solution
- Activity-selection Problem (Greedy algorithm using dynamic programming)
  - Goal: Selecting maximum size set of mutually compatible activities

### Example:

$i$	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11
$s_i$	1	3	0	5	3	5	6	8	8	2	12
$f_i$	4	5	6	7	9	9	10	11	12	14	16

- Suppose a set exists  $S = \{a_1 = [s_1, f_1), a_2 = [s_2, f_2), \dots, a_n = [s_n, f_n)\}$ 
  - \*  $a_i$  represents an  $i^{th}$  activity
  - \*  $s_i$  represents starting time
  - \*  $f_i$  represents finishing time
  - \*  $0 \leq s_i < f_i < \infty$
  - \*  $a_1, \dots, a_n$  sorted in monotonically increasing order of finish time

i.e.

$$f_1 \leq f_2 \leq f_3 \leq \dots \leq f_{n-1} \leq f_n$$

- \*  $a_i$  and  $a_j$  are **compatible**, if intervals  $[s_i, f_i)$  and  $[s_j, f_j)$  don't overlap

i.e

$$s_i \geq f_j \text{ and } s_j \geq f_i$$

- Steps
  1. Think about dynamic programming solution
    - \* Construct optimal solution using two subproblems

$S_{ij}$ : activities that start after activity  $a_i$  finishes and before activity  $a_j$  starts

i.e.

$$S_{19} = \{a_4 = [5, 7), a_6 = [5, 9), a_7 = [6, 10)\}$$

$A_{ij}$ : maximum set of mutually compatible activities in  $S_{ij}$  (including  $a_k$ )

- $A_{ik} = A_{ij} \cap S_{ik}$
- $A_{kj} = A_{ij} \cap S_{kj}$
- $A_{ij} = A_{ik} \cup \{a_k\} \cup A_{kj}$
- So,  $|A_{ij}| = |A_{ik}| + |A_{kj}| + 1$

- \* Verify that optimal solution  $A_{ij}$  must include optimal solution to the two subproblems for  $S_{kj}$

Let  $A'_{kj}$  be another mutually compatible activities in  $S_{kj}$  where  $|A'_{kj}| > |A_{kj}|$ .

Then we could use  $A'_{kj}$  in a solution to subproblem of  $S_{ij}$

Then we have  $|A_{ik}| + |A'_{kj}| + 1 > |A_{jk}| + |A_{kj}| + 1 = |A_{ij}|$  mutually compatible activities

This contradicts assumption that  $A_{ij}$  is an optimal solution

- \* Verify that optimal solution  $A_{ij}$  must include optimal solution to the two subproblems for  $S_{ik}$

The same applies for activities in  $S_{ik}$

2. Observe that only one choice - greedy choice, and that when we make the greedy choice, only one subproblem remains

- \* Steps

1. Make a greedy choice
  - Choose an activity that makes the most resource possible (intuition)
  - Choose an activity that finishes the earliest (intuition)
2. Solve a subproblem: Find activities that start after  $a_1$  finishes
3. Verify that making greedy choices always arrive at optimal solution

### **Theorem 16.1 (Page 418):**

Consider any non-empty subproblem  $S_k$ , and let  $a_m$  be an activity in  $S_k$  with the earliest finish time. Then  $a_m$  is included in some maximum-size

subset of mutually compatible activities of  $S_k$

### 3. Develop recursive greedy solution



### 4. Convert the recursive algorithm into iterative one



### 2. • Greedy Choice

- Choose  $x_i$  that is greater than the current maximum as the upper bound of unit length closed interval
- Choose  $x_i$  that is smaller than the current minimum as the lower bound of unit length closed interval

**Example:**

$$\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5\} \rightarrow [0, 5]$$

$$\{0, -1, 3, 5, 2\} \rightarrow [-1, 5]$$

- Optimal Substructure

Let  $I$  be the following instance of the problem: Let  $n$  be the number of items, and let  $x_i$  be the  $i^{th}$  point in the set.

Let  $A = [x_{\min}, x_{\max}]$  be the solution. The greedy algorithm works by assigning  $x_{\min} = \min(x_{\min}, x_n)$  and  $x_{\max} = \max(x_{\max}, x_n)$ , and then continuing by solving the subproblem

$$I' = (n - 1, \{x_1, \dots, x_{n-1}\}) \quad (1)$$

until  $n = 0$ .

We need to show that the strategy gives optimal solution.

**Correct Solution:**

- 1) Consider the left-most interval.
- 2) Set the left most point  $x$  in the set as its value (since we know it must contain the leftmost point)
- 3) For any point that is within the unit distance of the point  $x$  (i.e.  $[x, x + 1]$ ), remove the points since they are covered
- 4) Move to the next closest point not covered by the unit interval of  $x$ , and repeat until all points in the set are covered.
- 5) Since each step has a clearly optimal choice for where to put the leftmost interval, the final solution is optimal

**Notes:**

- I stopped because it's taking too much time.
- I struggled on this problem.

- I had trouble understanding the meaning of unit interval
  - I felt there is missing knowledge regarding optimal substructure
  - I felt tunnel visioned to provide one interval that covers all
- I had difficulty arguing why the algorithm is correct
  - i.e. How can i generate a claim?
- Unit length
  - $[1, 25, 2.25]$  includes all  $x_i$  such that  $1.25 \leq x_i \leq 2.25$ .
- Greedy-choice property and optimal substructure to problem are the two key ingredients
- Summary of Steps for Greedy Algorithm
  1. Determine the optimal structure of the problem
  2. Develop a recursive solution.
  3. Show that if we make the greedy choice, then only one subproblem remains
  4. Prove that it is always safe to make the greedy choice
  5. Develop a recursive algorithm that implements the greedy strategy
  6. Convert the recursive algorithm to an iterative algorithm
- Criteria for Greedy Algorithm
  1. Greedy-choice property
    - Exists if we can assemble a globally optimal solution by making a locally optimal (greedy) choices
  2. Optimal Substructure
    - Exists if an optimal solution to the problem contains within it optimal solutions to subproblems.
- Greedy vs Dynamic Programming
  - 0-1 Knapsack Problem

1)



Capacity: 50 lbs  
Current: 50lbs

**0-1 Knapsack Problem**

item 1  
weight: 10 lbs  
worth: \$60  
value: \$6/lbs

item 2  
weight: 20 lbs  
worth: \$100  
value: \$5/lbs

item 3  
weight: 30 lbs  
worth: \$120  
value: \$4/lbs

2)



Capacity: 50 lbs  
current: 40 lbs

item 1  
weight: 10 lbs  
worth: \$60  
value: \$6/lbs

item 2  
weight: 20 lbs  
worth: \$100  
value: \$5/lbs

item 3  
weight: 30 lbs  
worth: \$120  
value: \$4/lbs

3)



Capacity: 50 lbs  
current: 20 lbs

item 1  
weight: 10 lbs  
worth: \$60  
value: \$6/lbs

item 2  
weight: 20 lbs  
worth: \$100  
value: \$5/lbs

item 3  
weight: 30 lbs  
worth: \$120  
value: \$4/lbs

Uh oh. This is not greedy!

– Fractional Knapsack Problem

1)



Capacity: 50 lbs  
Current: 50lbs

Fractional Knapsack Problem

item 1  
weight: 10 lbs  
worth: \$60  
value: \$6/lbs

item 2  
weight: 20 lbs  
worth: \$100  
value: \$5/lbs

item 3  
weight: 30 lbs  
worth: \$120  
value: \$4/lbs

2)



Capacity: 50 lbs  
current: 40 lbs

item 1  
weight: 10 lbs  
worth: \$60  
value: \$6/lbs

item 2  
weight: 20 lbs  
worth: \$100  
value: \$5/lbs

item 3  
weight: 30 lbs  
worth: \$120  
value: \$4/lbs

3)



Capacity: 50 lbs  
current: 20 lbs

item 1  
weight: 10 lbs  
worth: \$60  
value: \$6/lbs

item 2  
weight: 20 lbs  
worth: \$100  
value: \$5/lbs

item 3  
weight: 30 lbs  
worth: \$120  
value: \$4/lbs

item 2  
weight: 20 lbs  
worth: \$100  
value: \$5/lbs



4)



### 3. Notes:

- Optimal Substructure

- A problem is said to have optimal substructure if an optimal solution can be constructed from optimal solutions of its subproblems.

- Huffman Codes

- Is an algorithm that uses greedy algorithm for lossless (without loss of data) data compression
- Has two types of codewords

	a	b	c	d	e	f
Frequency (in thousands)	45	13	12	16	9	5
Fixed-length codeword	000	001	010	011	100	101
Variable-length codeword	0	101	100	111	1101	1100

- \* Fixed Length Code

- has codeword with the same length

- \* Variable Length

- has codeword that may be of different lengths

- Constructs optimal prefix codes

\* Means no codeword is a prefix of some other codewords

e.g.

The following is not prefix codes

a - 110

b - 1101

e.g.

The following is prefix codes

a - 110

b - 111