

Furious Five: QuEra Technical Challenge

Chris Liu, Ava Brule, Ryan Ruiz, Claire Mao, Krisztina Tolotti

This document contains a detailed explanation of our approach to the QuEra Technical Challenge as well as all the code involved in our final submission.

Background

We started by reading the attached resources in the challenge description. As a freshman-only team, we struggled to understand many technical details related to the challenge. Instead of giving up, we took a heuristic approach to the technique and started by implementing the two quantum circuits depicted in the document.

We mapped out the individual gates (\sqrt{Y}^\dagger , \sqrt{Y} , CZ , $CNOT$) to the appropriately numbered qubits and initially implemented the circuit directly in `stim`:

```
SQRT_Y_DAG 0 1 2 3 4 5
CZ 1 2 3 4 5 6
SQRT_Y 6
CZ 0 3 2 5 4 6
SQRT_Y 2 3 4 5 6
CZ 0 1 2 3 4 5
SQRT_Y 1 2 4

H 13
SQRT_Y_DAG 7 8 9 10 11 12
CZ 8 9 10 11 12 13
SQRT_Y 13
CZ 7 10 9 12 11 13
SQRT_Y 9 10 11 12 13
CZ 7 8 9 10 11 12
SQRT_Y 8 9 11

CX 0 7 1 8 2 9 3 10 4 11 5 12 6 13
MZ 7 8 9 10 11 12 13

<more gates>

CZ rec[-7] 0 rec[-6] 1 rec[-5] 2 rec[-4] 3 rec[-3] 4 rec[-2] 5 rec[-1] 6
CX rec[-14] 0 rec[-13] 1 rec[-12] 2 rec[-11] 3 rec[-10] 4 rec[-9] 5 rec[-8] 6

SQRT_Y_DAG 1 2 4
CZ 0 1 2 3 4 5
SQRT_Y_DAG 2 3 4 5 6
CZ 0 3 2 5 4 6
SQRT_Y_DAG 6
CZ 1 2 3 4 5 6
SQRT_Y 0 1 2 3 4 5

MZ 0 1 2 3 4 5 6
```

Due to an inaccurate understanding of how the error correction code works, we attempted to undo the MSD encoding circuit at the end by applying its inverse. During lunch time, we asked for help from the QuEra staff. They were kind and explained to us the details of the error correction mechanism as well as how the referenced libraries are intended to be used (`stim` for Clifford-only simulation and `tsim` for T -gates).

For the remainder of the day, we synthesized our new understanding of the problem as well as various heuristic engineering techniques into the solution described in this Jupyter Notebook.

The solution

Our solution to the challenge is exploratory in nature. We will explain each individual part as we demonstrate the corresponding code.

```
In [1]: # Part 0: Setup

import numpy as np
import bloqade
import bloqade.stim
import bloqade.tsim
from bloqade import squin
from kirin.dialects.ilst import IList
```

Part 1: MSD encode

We implemented the MSD encode circuit in `squin` and we simulated it using `stim`. We considered cases where there is no noise as well as a constant depolarizing noise at the end of the circuit. We calculated the syndromes as well as the logical observable after measuring the qubits. We noticed that while the physical observable is consistent with the input state $|0\rangle$, two of the syndromes are consistent of the opposite polarity (-1 instead of 1). While we were unable to understand why this is the case, we applied an X gate to the third qubit which flips all three syndromes back to 1.

We sampled the circuit and dropped shots where the syndromes indicate an error. We calculated the corresponding logical and physical errors and noticed a significant decrease in error rate after the syndrome-filtering mechanism.

MSD circuit:

```
q0: -SQRT_Y_DAG---@-----@-----DEPOLARIZE1(0.2)-M(0):rec[0]-----
q1: -SQRT_Y_DAG-@-|-----@-----SQRT_Y-DEPOLARIZE1(0.2)-M(0):rec[1]-----
q2: -SQRT_Y_DAG-@-|-----@-SQRT_Y-@-----SQRT_Y-DEPOLARIZE1(0.2)-M(0):rec[2]-----
q3: -SQRT_Y_DAG-@-@-----|SQRT_Y-@-----DEPOLARIZE1(0.2)-X-----M(0):rec[3]-
q4: -SQRT_Y_DAG-@-----|@-----SQRT_Y-@-----SQRT_Y-----DEPOLARIZE1(0.2)-M(0):rec[4]-
q5: -SQRT_Y_DAG-@-----@-|-----SQRT_Y-@-----DEPOLARIZE1(0.2)-M(0):rec[5]-
q6: -----@-SQRT_Y--@-----SQRT_Y-----DEPOLARIZE1(0.2)-M(0):rec[6]-
```

```
In [ ]: # Part 1: MSD encode

@squin.kernel
def msd_0():
    """Equivalent stim code:

    SQRT_Y_DAG 0 1 2 3 4 5
    CZ 1 2 3 4 5 6
    SQRT_Y 6
    CZ 0 3 2 5 4 6
    SQRT_Y 2 3 4 5 6
    CZ 0 1 2 3 4 5
    SQRT_Y 1 2 4
    """

    q = squin.qalloc(7)

    squin.broadcast.sqy_adj(q[:6])
    squin.broadcast.cz(IList([q[1], q[3], q[5]]), IList([q[2], q[4], q[6]]))
    squin.sqy(q[6])
    squin.broadcast.cz(IList([q[0], q[2], q[4]]), IList([q[3], q[5], q[6]]))
    squin.broadcast.sqy(q[2:7])
```

```

squin.broadcast.cz(IList([q[0], q[2], q[4]]), IList([q[1], q[3], q[5]]))
squin.broadcast.sqrt_y(IList([q[1], q[2], q[4]]))

# optional noise
squin.broadcast.depolarize(0.2, q)

# flipping qubit 3 because some syndromes are -1???
squin.x(q[3])
squin.broadcast.measure(q)

circ = bloqade.stim.Circuit(msd_0)
circ.diagram()

```

```

In [3]: def sample(circ, shots=100):
        """Sample from the circuit and convert to -1/+1"""
        return circ.compile_sampler().sample(shots=shots) * (-2) + 1

def logical_obs(arr):
    """Calculate logical observables from measurement results"""
    return arr[:, 0] * arr[:, 1] * arr[:, 5]

def syndromes(arr):
    """Calculate syndromes from measurement results"""
    return [
        arr[:, 0] * arr[:, 1] * arr[:, 2] * arr[:, 3],
        arr[:, 1] * arr[:, 5] * arr[:, 4] * arr[:, 2],
        arr[:, 6] * arr[:, 4] * arr[:, 2] * arr[:, 3],
    ]

def noise_free_mask(arr):
    """Get mask of shots with no noise (all syndromes +1)"""
    syn = syndromes(arr)
    return syn[0] + syn[1] + syn[2] == 3

def logical_error(values, true_value=1):
    """Calculate logical error rate given logical values and true value"""
    if len(values) == 0:
        return float("nan")
    return float(((values != true_value).sum()) / len(values))

samples = sample(circ)
values = logical_obs(samples)
synds = syndromes(samples)
mask = noise_free_mask(samples)

print("Values: ", values)
print("Syndromes: ", synds)
print("Noise-free mask: ", mask)
print("Values (no noise): ", values[mask])
print("Logical error rate: ", logical_error(values[mask]))

```



```

q8: -----SQRT_Y_DAG-----
q9: -----SQRT_Y_DAG-----
q10: -----SQRT_Y_DAG-----
q11: -----SQRT_Y_DAG-----
q12: -----SQRT_Y_DAG-----
q13: -----H-----

q0: -----@-----
q1: -----|-----@-----
q2: -----|-----|-----@-----
q3: -----|-----|-----|-----@-----
q4: -----|-----|-----|-----|-----@-----
q5: -----|-----|-----|-----|-----@-----
q6: -----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----@-----
q7: --@-----@-----DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)--X-----|-----|-----|-----|-----M(0):rec[0]
q8: --@-|-----@-----SQRT_Y-DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----X-|-----|-----|-----M(0):rec[1]
q9: --@-|-----@-SQRT_Y-@-----SQRT_Y-DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----X-|-----|-----|-----M(0):rec[2]
q10: --@-@-----|-----SQRT_Y-@-----DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----X-|-----|-----|-----M(0):rec[3]
q11: --@-----|-----@-----SQRT_Y-@-----SQRT_Y-----DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----X-|-----|-----M(0):rec[4]
q12: --@-----@-|-----SQRT_Y-@-----DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----X-|-----M(0):rec[5]
q13: --@-SQRT_Y--@-----SQRT_Y-----DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----X-M(0):rec[6]

q0: -DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----
q1: -DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----
q2: -DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----
q3: -DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----
q4: -DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----
q5: -DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----
q6: -DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----

q7: -R-----SQRT_Y_DAG--@-----@-----DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)
q8: -R-----SQRT_Y_DAG-@-|-----@-----SQRT_Y-DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)
q9: -R-----SQRT_Y_DAG-@-|-----@-SQRT_Y-@-----SQRT_Y-DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)
q10: -R-----SQRT_Y_DAG-@-@-----|-----SQRT_Y-@-----DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)
q11: -R-----SQRT_Y_DAG-@-----|-----@-----SQRT_Y-@-----SQRT_Y-----

```

```

q12: -R-----SQRT_Y_DAG-@-----@-|-----SQRT_Y-@-----
      |               |               |
q13: -R-----H-----@-SQRT_Y--@-----SQRT_Y-----

q0: -@-----M(0):rec[14]-
    |
q1: -|-----@-----M(0):rec[15]-
    |               |
q2: -|-----|-----@-----M(0):rec[16]-
    |               |   |
q3: -|-----|-----|-----@-----M(0):rec[17]-
    |               |   |   |
q4: -|-----|-----|-----|-----@-----M(0):rec[18]-
    |               |   |   |   |
q5: -|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----@-----M(0):rec[19]-
    |               |   |   |   |   |
q6: -|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----@-----M(0):rec[20]-
    |               |   |   |   |   |   |
q7: -X-----|-----|-----|-----|-----M(0):rec[7]--R-----
    |               |   |   |   |   |
q8: -----X-----|-----|-----|-----M(0):rec[8]--R-----
    |               |   |   |   |   |
q9: -----X-----|-----|-----|-----M(0):rec[9]--R-----
    |               |   |   |   |   |
q10: -----X-----|-----|-----|-----M(0):rec[10]--R-----
    |               |   |   |   |   |
q11: -DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----X-----|-----M(0):rec[11]--R-----
    |               |   |   |   |   |
q12: -DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----X-----|-----M(0):rec[12]--R-----
    |               |   |   |   |   |
q13: -DEPOLARIZE1(0.1)-----X-----M(0):rec[13]--R-----

```

In []: # Part 2: QEC cycle

```

@squin.kernel
def msd(q, noise):
    """Parametric MSD encoding with noise"""

    squin.broadcast.sqrt_y_adj(q[6])
    squin.broadcast.cz(IList([q[1], q[3], q[5]]), IList([q[2], q[4], q[6]]))
    squin.sqrt_y(q[6])
    squin.broadcast.cz(IList([q[0], q[2], q[4]]), IList([q[3], q[5], q[6]]))
    squin.broadcast.sqrt_y(q[2:7])
    squin.broadcast.cz(IList([q[0], q[2], q[4]]), IList([q[1], q[3], q[5]]))
    squin.broadcast.sqrt_y(IList([q[1], q[2], q[4]]))

    # noise:
    if noise > 0:
        squin.broadcast.depolarize(noise, q)

def qec_factory(*, iterations: int = 1, noise: float = 0, noise_model=None):
    """Create a QEC cycle kernel with noise"""

    @squin.kernel
    def qec():
        q = squin.qalloc(14)
        msd(q[0:7], 0)

        for _ in range(iterations):
            # apply noise to simulate decoherence over time
            if noise > 0:
                squin.broadcast.depolarize(noise, q[0:7])
            squin.h(q[13])
            msd(q[7:14], noise)
            squin.broadcast.cx(q[0:7], q[7:14])

```

```

        squin.broadcast.measure(q[7:14])

        # gotta reset the auxiliary state!
        squin.broadcast.reset(q[7:14])

    squin.broadcast.measure(q[0:7])

    if noise_model is not None:
        from bloqade.cirq_utils import load_circuit
        from bloqade.cirq_utils.emit import emit_circuit
        from bloqade.cirq_utils.noise import transform_circuit

        cirq_qec = emit_circuit(qec)
        noisy_cirq_qec = transform_circuit(cirq_qec, model=noise_model)
        return load_circuit(noisy_cirq_qec)
    return qec

circ = bloqade.stim.Circuit(qec_factory(iterations=2, noise=0.1))
circ.diagram()

```

```

In [ ]: from bloqade.cirq_utils.noise import GeminiOneZoneNoiseModel

circ = bloqade.stim.Circuit(qec_factory(noise_model=GeminiOneZoneNoiseModel()))
circ.diagram()

```

```

In [6]: samples = sample(circ)
values = logical_obs(samples[:, 7:14])
synds = syndromes(samples[:, 0:7])
mask = noise_free_mask(samples[:, 0:7])

print("Values: ", values)
print("Syndromes: ", synds)
print("Noise-free mask: ", mask)
print("Values (no noise): ", values[mask])
print("Logical error rate: ", logical_error(values[mask]))

```

```

Values: [ 1  1  1  1 -1  1  1  1  1 -1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1
 1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1
 1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1 -1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1 -1  1  1  1
 1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1 -1  1  1  1
 1  1 -1  1]
Syndromes: [array([ 1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,
-1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,
 1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,
 1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,
-1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,
 1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1]), array([ 1,  1,  1, -1, -1, -1, -1,  1,  1, -
1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,
-1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1, -1, -1,  1, -1,  1, -1, -1,  1,
 1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,
 1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1,
 1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,
 1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1]), array([ 1,  1,  1, -1, -1, -1, -1,  1,  1,
1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,
 1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,
 1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,
 1, -1,  1,  1, -1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,
-1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,
 1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,
 1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1,  1, -1, -1, -1])])
Noise-free mask: [ True  True  True False False False False  True  True False  True  True
 True False True True False True False True True True True True True False
 True True False False True False True False False True True False
 True True False True False True True True True True True True True
 False True True False True True False True True False True True
 True True False False True True True True True True True False True
 True True True False True True True False True False True True
 True False False False]
Values (no noise): [ 1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1
 1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1
 1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1  1 -1  1  1  1]
Logical error rate: 0.014925373134328358

```

```
In [7]: logical_error(values)
```

```
Out[7]: 0.06
```

Part 3: Post-selection

We implemented post selection by analyzing the measurement data from the QEC circuit. We calculated a binary mask that corresponds to whether the syndromes indicate the corresponding qubit is noise-free or not. We also calculated the logical error rate, physical error rate, as well as the survival rate of qubits over multiple iterations. We continue to observe a decrease in the logical error rate compared to the physical error rate. The survival rate, however, is quite a bit lower than we expected.

```
In [8]: # Part 3: Post-selection over multiple iterations
```

```

def post_select(*, iterations: int, shots: int = 100, verbose: bool = True, **kwargs):
    """Post-select memory qubits based on no detected errors over multiple iterations"""

    circ = bloqade.stim.Circuit(qec_factory(iterations=iterations, **kwargs))
    samples = sample(circ, shots=shots)
    values = logical_obs(samples[:, -7:])

    alive_mask = np.ones(shots, dtype=bool)
    for i in range(iterations):
        synds = syndromes(samples[:, 7 * i : 7 * (i + 1)])
        mask = noise_free_mask(samples[:, 7 * i : 7 * (i + 1)])
        alive_mask &= mask

    if verbose:
        print(f"Step {i+1}: ", "".join([str(int(s)) for s in alive_mask]))

    if verbose:

```



```
post_select(iterations=7, noise=0.02, shots=100)
```

```
Out[8]: (0.0, 0.17, 0.31)
```

```
Out[9]: (0.0, 0.04, 0.67)
```

```
import pandas as pd
import itertools

grid_iterations = [1, 2, 3, 5, 8, 13, 21]
grid_noise = [0.0, 0.001, 0.005, 0.01, 0.02, 0.05, 0.1, 0.2]
grid_nm_scaling = [0.01, 0.02, 0.1, 0.2, 0.5]

print("Depolarizing noise results:")
depol_results = []
for iterations, noise in itertools.product(grid_iterations, grid_noise):
    log, phys, survival = post_select(
        iterations=iterations, noise=noise, shots=1000, verbose=False
    )
    print(f"({iterations}, {noise:.3f}) => ({log:.4f}, {phys:.4f}, {survival:.4f})")
    depol_results.append([iterations, noise, log, phys, survival])

print()

print("Gemini noise model results:")
nm_results = []
```

```
for iterations, scaling in itertools.product(grid_iterations, grid_nm_scaling):
    noise_model = GeminiOneZoneNoiseModel(scaling_factor=scaling)
    log, phys, survival = post_select(
        iterations=iterations, noise_model=noise_model, shots=1000, verbose=False
    )
    print(f"({iterations}, {scaling:.3f}) => ({log:.4f}, {phys:.4f}, {survival:.4f})")
    nm_results.append([iterations, scaling, log, phys, survival])
```

Depolarizing noise results:

(1, 0.000) => (0.0000, 0.0000, 1.0000)
(1, 0.001) => (0.0000, 0.0040, 0.9890)
(1, 0.005) => (0.0000, 0.0120, 0.9490)
(1, 0.010) => (0.0000, 0.0140, 0.9220)
(1, 0.020) => (0.0000, 0.0330, 0.8380)
(1, 0.050) => (0.0046, 0.0830, 0.6470)
(1, 0.100) => (0.0268, 0.1960, 0.3730)
(1, 0.200) => (0.1567, 0.3090, 0.2170)
(2, 0.000) => (0.0000, 0.0000, 1.0000)
(2, 0.001) => (0.0000, 0.0050, 0.9800)
(2, 0.005) => (0.0000, 0.0190, 0.9050)
(2, 0.010) => (0.0000, 0.0360, 0.8340)
(2, 0.020) => (0.0000, 0.0770, 0.6830)
(2, 0.050) => (0.0026, 0.1770, 0.3880)
(2, 0.100) => (0.0195, 0.2730, 0.1540)
(2, 0.200) => (0.2069, 0.3870, 0.0290)
(3, 0.000) => (0.0000, 0.0000, 1.0000)
(3, 0.001) => (0.0000, 0.0060, 0.9730)
(3, 0.005) => (0.0000, 0.0250, 0.8670)
(3, 0.010) => (0.0000, 0.0620, 0.7550)
(3, 0.020) => (0.0017, 0.1140, 0.5740)
(3, 0.050) => (0.0087, 0.2210, 0.2310)
(3, 0.100) => (0.0196, 0.3570, 0.0510)
(3, 0.200) => (0.1667, 0.4740, 0.0060)
(5, 0.000) => (0.0000, 0.0000, 1.0000)
(5, 0.001) => (0.0000, 0.0130, 0.9600)
(5, 0.005) => (0.0000, 0.0490, 0.7810)
(5, 0.010) => (0.0000, 0.0900, 0.6410)
(5, 0.020) => (0.0000, 0.1770, 0.3930)
(5, 0.050) => (0.0091, 0.3050, 0.1100)
(5, 0.100) => (0.0000, 0.4530, 0.0070)
(5, 0.200) => (1.0000, 0.4880, 0.0010)
(8, 0.000) => (0.0000, 0.0000, 1.0000)
(8, 0.001) => (0.0000, 0.0250, 0.9160)
(8, 0.005) => (0.0000, 0.0690, 0.7120)
(8, 0.010) => (0.0020, 0.1600, 0.4910)
(8, 0.020) => (0.0000, 0.2210, 0.2480)
(8, 0.050) => (0.0000, 0.4320, 0.0190)
(8, 0.100) => (nan, 0.5060, 0.0000)
(8, 0.200) => (nan, 0.4800, 0.0000)
(13, 0.000) => (0.0000, 0.0000, 1.0000)
(13, 0.001) => (0.0000, 0.0190, 0.8900)
(13, 0.005) => (0.0000, 0.1160, 0.5350)
(13, 0.010) => (0.0000, 0.1930, 0.3020)
(13, 0.020) => (0.0000, 0.3150, 0.0970)
(13, 0.050) => (0.0000, 0.4630, 0.0040)
(13, 0.100) => (nan, 0.4890, 0.0000)
(13, 0.200) => (nan, 0.5000, 0.0000)
(21, 0.000) => (0.0000, 0.0000, 1.0000)
(21, 0.001) => (0.0000, 0.0370, 0.8300)
(21, 0.005) => (0.0000, 0.1620, 0.4150)
(21, 0.010) => (0.0000, 0.2820, 0.1550)
(21, 0.020) => (0.0000, 0.4060, 0.0220)
(21, 0.050) => (nan, 0.4830, 0.0000)
(21, 0.100) => (nan, 0.5060, 0.0000)
(21, 0.200) => (nan, 0.5130, 0.0000)

Gemini noise model results:

(1, 0.010) => (0.0000, 0.0020, 0.9970)
(1, 0.020) => (0.0000, 0.0040, 0.9870)
(1, 0.100) => (0.0052, 0.0080, 0.9660)
(1, 0.200) => (0.0077, 0.0210, 0.9090)
(1, 0.500) => (0.0164, 0.0490, 0.7930)
(2, 0.010) => (0.0010, 0.0050, 0.9890)
(2, 0.020) => (0.0020, 0.0060, 0.9820)
(2, 0.100) => (0.0022, 0.0240, 0.8960)
(2, 0.200) => (0.0060, 0.0270, 0.8290)
(2, 0.500) => (0.0131, 0.0700, 0.6120)
(3, 0.010) => (0.0010, 0.0010, 0.9870)

```

(3, 0.020) => (0.0010, 0.0050, 0.9650)
(3, 0.100) => (0.0000, 0.0160, 0.8430)
(3, 0.200) => (0.0028, 0.0450, 0.7020)
(3, 0.500) => (0.0052, 0.1030, 0.3840)
(5, 0.010) => (0.0000, 0.0020, 0.9640)
(5, 0.020) => (0.0000, 0.0060, 0.9350)
(5, 0.100) => (0.0015, 0.0290, 0.6500)
(5, 0.200) => (0.0021, 0.0730, 0.4800)
(5, 0.500) => (0.0066, 0.1480, 0.1520)
(8, 0.010) => (0.0000, 0.0040, 0.9270)
(8, 0.020) => (0.0000, 0.0180, 0.8540)
(8, 0.100) => (0.0045, 0.0640, 0.4420)
(8, 0.200) => (0.0049, 0.1170, 0.2040)
(8, 0.500) => (0.0667, 0.2440, 0.0150)
(13, 0.010) => (0.0000, 0.0090, 0.8200)
(13, 0.020) => (0.0015, 0.0180, 0.6860)
(13, 0.100) => (0.0000, 0.0900, 0.1760)
(13, 0.200) => (0.0000, 0.1810, 0.0310)
(13, 0.500) => (nan, 0.3210, 0.0000)
(21, 0.010) => (0.0031, 0.0140, 0.6490)
(21, 0.020) => (0.0000, 0.0330, 0.3970)
(21, 0.100) => (0.0000, 0.1390, 0.0240)
(21, 0.200) => (nan, 0.2040, 0.0000)
(21, 0.500) => (nan, 0.3900, 0.0000)

```

```

In [12]: depol_df = pd.DataFrame(
    depol_results,
    columns=[
        "iterations",
        "depol_noise",
        "logical_error",
        "physical_error",
        "survival_rate",
    ],
)
nm_df = pd.DataFrame(
    nm_results,
    columns=[
        "iterations",
        "nm_scaling",
        "logical_error",
        "physical_error",
        "survival_rate",
    ],
)

depol_df.to_csv("depol_results.csv", index=False)
nm_df.to_csv("nm_results.csv", index=False)

```