Reviewing the Islamic Principles used in Performance Appraisal Method

Amiruddin Ismail
Ph.D. Candidate at UBD School of Business and Economics
Jalan Tungku Link, Gadong BE1410
17H8718@ubd.edu.bn

Nur Annisa Sarbini
Lecturer, Faculty of Islamic Economics and Finance,
Universiti Islam Sultan Sharif Ali (UNISSA)
Brunei Darussalam
nurannisa.sarbini@unissa.edu.bn

Pang Li Li
Lecturer, School of Business and Economics,
Universiti Brunei Darussalam
Jalan Tungku Link, Gadong BE1410 Lili.pang@ubd.edu.bn

Abstract

The theory behind performance appraisal is good, but in practice, it suffers from imperfect implementation due to managerial errors when carrying out their responsibility. This led to issues commonly observed in the literature such as rating bias, insufficient feedback and unattainable criteria among the employees. In order to reduce these problems, this paper attempts to look at the role of context in term of religion, on how it can act as a positive reinforcement to the PA system. This paper then explored the role of Islamic principles such as *al-'Adl* and *Taqwa* upon stages in the PA system. This theoretical paper posits that these Islamic principles which are based from Al-Quran and Al-Hadith can act as ethical guidelines that guide the PA implementation by managers, using the perspectives of Ethical theory, thereby reducing the risk of issues aforementioned. This, in turn, shed the light on the potential influence of Islamic principles towards PA system among Muslim countries.

Keywords: performance appraisal, Islamic management, context

1   Performance Appraisal and Its Context

Performance appraisal (hereafter mentioned as PA) is a process which involve identifying, evaluating and developing employee's performance based on organizational objectives (Cvetkovska, 2013). The practice of appraisal was recorded as early as the third century A.D. in China during the Wei Dynasty in evaluating the performance of official royal family members (Wiese and Buckley, 1997). Even back then, there were ethical issues of favoritism to it where the rater bias was highlighted (Patten, 1977). The modern formal practice of PA, which focused in organisations, was started in 1813 in the United States (Wiese and Buckley, 1997). It was not until years later when the practices became globalized, as organizations be it public or private sectors, aim to ensure organizational goals are achieved through their personnel, and compensation are given to those who achieve these goals.

As the practices widely practised around the world, the role of local context started to gain attention in the literature, whereby according to Murphy, Cleveland and Hanscom (2019), context is the single most important barrier to the successful implementation of PA. This is because the local context can act as either positive or negative reinforcements to the PA system. One of the local contexts which is understudied is the role of religion, as the role of religious influence on management practice has largely been ignored in the literature (Abuznaid, 2005; Ababneh, 2016; Rahman, 2018). The role of religion is especially relevant in Muslim countries as the adaptation of western practices without considering the influence of Islam can lead to gaps in fairness, responsibility, and trust among the employees (Osman, Mahphoth and Hashim, 2014), as religion can act as spiritual guideline for personal and organisational behavior (Ali, Gibbs and Camp, 2000).

Islam has always been quoted as a way of life for Muslims who practice this religion. Even within an organization, there are Islamic teachings in terms of principles and theories that govern the management field since the beginning (Heneidi, 2012). According to Loqman and Bulbul (2012), there are three basic principles in Islamic management which man made management system are lacking of, namely, *Al-Tawhid* (the uniqueness of Allah), *Khilafah* (viceregency) and *Al-'Adl* (Justice). This Islamic management had been emphasized by Hashim (2008), who stated that Muslim human resource manager should be aware of the Islamic way of managing human resources, especially in comparison with the western approaches. Osman et al. (2014) also in favor of the idea that involvement of Islamic principles in human resources (HR) activities such as PA can lessen the problems of unfairness among employees.

This paper seeks to understand the influence of Islam as religion which may influence the implementation of PA system. The role of religion towards PA implementation in details had been largely ignored in the literature, therefore this paper hope to provide a detailed explanations based on Islamic principles mentioned in Al-Quran and Al-Hadith that can act as ethical guidelines to the practicing managers of PA in Muslim countries and how these principles can help lessen the problems encountered in the current PA practice originating from

the western context as highlighted in the literature (see Cvetkovska, 2013; Hashim, 2008; Lunenberg, 2012; Murphy et al, 2019). By using qualitative methodology of reviewing literatures from secondary sources of Al- Quran, Al-Hadith and other related literatures in the area of performance appraisals and human resource management, the aim of this paper is to extract related Quranic verses and Hadith that can act as a reference to the Islamic practice of PA. For clarity purpose, the term 'Islamic' refers to the phenomenon with Islamic credentials through Islamic character, while 'Muslim' refers to the person practicing the religion (Khaki, 2013). Hence, Islamic PA system, Muslim countries and Muslim managers will be used throughout the paper as reference to how PA should be conducted and implemented.

This paper will start by explaining the principles in Islam, as mentioned in Al-Quran and their implication towards management, in brief. Then, it will talk about the benefits of these Islamic principles towards organisations when applied in human resources management in general. From there, it will describe the use of Ethical theory as theoretical lens in order to study how Al-Quran and Hadith can act as ethical guidelines towards the practice of PA, followed by an in-depth description of relevant verses from Al-Quran and Hadith in every stages of PA. Finally, a discussion about the future of Islamic PA practices in terms of further research will be discussed.

2 Islamic Values and Principles

Islamic values can be defined as the set of beliefs and ethics that act as a social doctrine to a Muslim's life (Nik, Alias, Shahid, Hamid and Alam, 2013). They can affect the way the managers act in the implementation of the PA system. Based on Al-Quran, there are several Islamic principles that can guide the management of organisations nowadays, especially in human resources. The first principle is (1) *taqwa,* which can be defined as forever mindful of the Almighty God. Any Muslims who are in fear with Allah, will always be aware of their actions between good and evil, and they will always try to control themselves from behaving in an unfair manner (Branine, 2010). This principle of *taqwa* is what guides the ethical behavior in Muslims, as the higher their *taqwa* is, the more they able to resist from doing evils (Ahmad, 2012). This is because they believed Allah had already guide them in doing the right things, in line with what Allah SWT said in Al-Quran, "*Then He showed him what is wrong for him and what is right for him" (30:8).*

The second principle is (2) *niat,* where every act should be guide by their intentions. In organisations, there should be clear intended objectives, ideas and strategies, that will guide their employees in carrying out their responsibilities (Rahman, 2018). This is important to ensure the goals of employees is in line with the organizational goals, for the successful achievement of human resource management practices, as related to a verse in Al-Quran, "*God does not change the condition of people unless they change what is in their hearts" (13:11).* The third Islamic principle is Al-Adl, or otherwise known as justice (fairness). It is important for all parties involved in an organization, there should be fairness in treatment of one another (Mohiuddin, 2012). Managers should treat their employees with respect, listen to their views, and reward them fairly (Branine, 2010). This is to ensure that managers able to maintain humbleness, professionalism and humility when dealing with employees (Rahman, 2018), in lone with a verse in Al-Quran, "*O you who believe! Stand out firmly for Allah, as witnesses to fair dealing, and let not the hatred of others to you make you swerve to wrong and depart from justice" (5:8).*

The fourth principle is (4) *amanah* or known as trust, where Muslim managers should not misuse the trust given to them in carrying out their responsibilities (Branine, 2010). This is because Allah had entrusted power, wealth and knowledge to men, so they should strive to not abuse it especially in dealings with nepotism and favoritism, which is in line with what had been said in Al-Quran, *"O ye that believe! Betray not the trust of Allah and the Messenger, nor misappropriate knowingly tings entrusted to you" (8:27).* Both managers and employees are responsible to each other, whereby managers should value the trust given to him by their employees, while employees are accountable to their organisations (Salim and Alarimy, 2015; Rahman, 2018). The fifth principle is (5) *Ikhlas* which refers to sincerity and keeping promises (Branine, 2010). This means that managers should strive to fulfill their promises to employees, otherwise they might be considered as hypocrites, as Allah mentioned in Al-Quran, *"O you who believe! Fulfill (all) obligations" (5:1).* Employees should also possessed sincerity in doing their work as it can help them to become committed to their organisations, without any material wealth that can deviate them from the right path (Ahmad, 2012), in line with a verse in Al-Quran, *"No reward do I ask for it; my reward is only from the Lord of the worlds" (19:109).*

The sixth principle is (6) *shura* or consultation, where it was advised that Muslims should seek feedback from others in making decisions (Rahman, 2018). This is related to organisations where managers are advised to seek employees feedback in regards to human resource decisions, as it can generate a feeling of teamwork and created a perception of fairness among employees in decisions taken (Mohiuddin and Amin, 2012; Salim and Alarimy, 2015). The concept of *shura* had been mentioned in Al-Quran, *"Those who hearken to their Lord and establish regular prayer; who (conduct) their affairs by mutual consultation; who spend out of what We bestow on them for sustenance" (42:38).* It can be seen from all these Islamic principles that they should be practiced and embedded in the daily lives of Muslim managers and employees to further make an impact and a difference in the implementation of PA, that could result in a positive repercussion in the working environment of the organization and experiences of the employees. Thus, it can be seen that literature had begun to recognize the importance of Islamic values to organization by exploring its beliefs and ethics, and some even provided practical benefits of practicing Islamic PA system. A summary of these Islamic principles, along with their definitions is provided in Table 1 below:

Table 1
Islamic principles and their definitions

Islamic Principles	Definitions
Taqwa	Forever fearful of Allah (SWT) (Branine, 2010)
Niat	All actions should be followed by their intentions (Rahman, 2018)
Al-Adl	Equal payment and treating them fairly (Mohiuddin and Amin, 2012)
Amanah	Not abusing the power, wealth and knowledge given by Allah (Mohiuddin and Amin, 2012)

Ikhlas	Sincerity and keeping promises (Branine, 2010)
Shura	Consultations with employees in taking decisions (Branine, 2010)

Source: Author's compilations

3 Islamic PA practices and its implication towards the organisation

The literature on Islamic PA is getting traction as previous studies reported positive outcomes on the organisations. In term of organizational commitment, it was reported by Hashim (2010) that the practice of Islamic PA by the organisations itself had positively strengthened employee's commitment to the organization, such as by putting extra effort for their work and inspiring them to improve their performance. A similar result had also been reported by Nik and Rahman (2011) for which the presence of Islamic PA system creates a positive impression among good performers, which in turn positively influence their productivity and commitment to the organizations.

Other outcomes such as the justice perceptions had also been observed, where Hashim (2008) proved the Islamic PA practice could positively influence employee's justice perception in terms of distributive, procedural and interactional justice. The same study also found that the Islamic PA practice positively influenced employees' job satisfaction in terms of getting the respect and fair treatment from the supervisor, and the feeling of satisfaction from doing their job. Thus Islamic PA practice also helps reduce turnover intention by decreasing the possibility of employees leaving the organization searching for another job due to the feeling of satisfaction they received (ibid). The literature of Islamic PA also highlighted the positive influence that Islamic PA as practiced by the organization itself had a positive influence on the organizational performance through higher job satisfaction, higher service quality and higher productivity (Azmi, 2010).

However, a study by Rahman (2013) had revealed contrasting results where the practice of Islamic PA did not significantly influence employees trust towards the organization. This warrants further research on Islamic PA and trust in the organization and why it did not give significant influence on their trust.

Therefore, it can be seen that there are many benefits associated with practicing Islamic PA. It should be noted also that many Muslim countries had practiced to some extent Islamic PA by their managers, including Malaysia (Hashim, 2010); Oman (Al-Hamadi, Budhwar, and Shipton, 2007); Algeria (Mellahi and Frynas, 2003); and Iran (Yeganeh and Su, 2008). With an increasing number of Muslim countries practicing Islamic PA, this established the importance of further understanding on the importance of the guidelines used in carrying out Islamic PA practices and comparing the differences and similarities between Islamic PA and the Western practice of PA which can be useful for practicing managers in other Muslim countries.

4 The use of Ethical theory in understanding the role of Islamic values towards PA

Ethical theory can be defined as the theory that provided advice on the way people should be, and the way they should behave (Miles, 2012). It can be divided into two, namely, the ethics of character and also ethics of conduct. This theory is considered suitable to study how Islamic values that mainly come from Quran and Hadith able to influence the practice of PA. Firstly, the ethics of character allow the studying of right behaviors based on a virtuous person (Sandler, 2010). In this context, this refers to Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) as the virtuous person that can guide the behaviors in the PA situation, as the life of Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) offers valuable lessons in the effective leadership of men (Abuznaid, 2005).

Secondly, the ethics of conduct provided guidance on actions that should be taken which maximise the benefits it offers (Hull, 1979). In this study, it refers to how the Quran and Hadith will offer advice on the PA implementation, as they offered guidelines that helps with both individual and group interest in human activities (Abuznaid, 2005). In addition, the theory discussed about the behavior that people must performed as moral obligation (Miles, 2012). These moral obligations include the need for fairness and keeping promises to others. Therefore, the use of this theory can act as theoretical lens to explain how Quran and Hadith act as ethical guideline to the implementation of PA system.

5 Islamic Perspectives of the PA Practice

The PA system can be seen as a process where it involves developing the purposes, criteria used in evaluating employee's performance, rating process by the managers, feedback session between the employers and employees and decision of PA-related rewards such as bonus and training. There are related verses from Al-Quran and Hadith that can be used as guidance on how to carry out the PA in an Islamic way for the managers, and how employees should act in stages of the PA system.

5.1 The Purposes of PA

Before implementing and conducting the PA system in any organisation, both employers and employees need to understand the purposes of the system in order for them to relate their actions with their intentions, as according to Branine and Pollard (2010), in Islamic teachings, every act should be supported with intentions/purposes. This is primarily derived from a renowned hadith where Umar ibn al-Khattab said, I heard the Messenger of Allah (PBUH) said:

> *"Actions shall be judged only by intention, and a man shall have what he intends; so whoever flies from his home for the sake of Allah and His Messenger, his flight shall be accounted for the sake of Allah and His Messenger, and whoever flies from his home for the sake of worldly gain which he aims to attain or a woman whom he wants to marry, his flight shall be accounted for that which he flies." (Hadith Bukhari 83: 23; 1: 1)*

As a Muslim appraiser and employer, the primary purpose of the PA is to evaluate employee's performance, and from there, decisions can be made based on these results whether the employees have performed according to the standard and expectations of the employer. This practice is in line with verse in the Quran about rewards and punishment for someone's work, and Muslims should base their decisions with this verse, where any good work should be rewarded and vice versa:

"Whoever doth wrong, him shall we punish; then shall be sent back to his Lord, and He will punish him with a punishment unheard-of (before). However, whoever believes, and work righteousness, he shall have a goodly reward, and easy will be his task as we order it by our command." (18: 87-88).

Meanwhile, for the employees, they should view the PA system transparently as an opportunity for them to observe and benchmark their performance based on the manager's report, as Allah mentioned in Quran that even the smallest form of good and evil should be transparent, *"Then shall everyone who has done an atom's weight of good, see it. And anyone who has done an atom's weight of evil shall see it." (35:7-8).* The employees should then take that opportunity to reflect upon themselves on how they can initiate corrections and improve their performance as Allah (SWT) said *"Nay, man is a witness against himself" (75:14).*

From these perspectives, it shows that by having mutual understanding as the basis of Islamic teachings and values, both employer and employees can be mindful of what and how they carry out the PA in any organization. This is because they understand that they are deemed accountable for their actions and decisions made on the review of performance made by the employers on their respective employees. Employees on the other hand also have the rights to be treated fairly and knowing that their employer practiced Islamic values in conducting the PA, it gives them more confident and assurance that they are being assessed justly.

5.2 Criteria used in PA

Before evaluating employee's performance, the measurement of employee's roles and responsibilities must be based on certain criteria. These criteria should serve as guidance for employees in performing their tasks. These criteria must be acceptable by the employees themselves, as part of the agreement between employers and them, with employers to be reminded not to lie about these criteria as Allah (SWT) said, *"Be that (the agreement) between me and you: whichever of the two terms I fulfill, let there be no, ill-will to me. Be Allah a witness to what we say" (28: 26-28).*

By understanding the impact and importance of telling the truth, both managers (and appraisers) and employees should be truthful and fair in reaching an agreed criteria used as the basis of assessment in the PA. For the employers, they must ensure that the criteria used to evaluate employee's performance must be reasonable for employees to attain, as Allah (SWT) had reminded that He will still accept work based on the ability offer *"No soul shall have a burden laid on it greater than it can bear." (2:233).* Another verse from Al-Quran also talked about the issues of the burden by referring to Shu'ayeb (AS) who declared a term of contract to Musa (AS) during the time of appointment:

"And I do not intend to put heavy burden on you. Allah willing, you will find me among the righteous people. He (Musa) replied; so be it (the contract) between me and you, achiever of the two terms I fulfill, (I trust) I will not be wronged. Allah is witness of what we say" (28: 27-28).

From the Islamic perspective, the provision of unreasonable criteria may prevent the employees from fulfilling their job due to their inadequacies (Hashim, 2008). Prophet (SAW) also reminded on this issue by saying *"Those working under you are your brothers. They have*

been made by God subservient to you and should not be burdened with tasks beyond their powers and if such a burden has been put on their shoulders, then you should help them" *(Hadith Al-Bukhari 2: 21).* Unreasonable criteria can lead to employees feeling demotivated for not fulfilling the expectations set by the organization and also other problems such as lack of commitment and inability to perform the job and tasks given by their superior.

For the employees themselves, they must show their sincerity and devotion to the organization in achieving the criteria agreed and assigned. Being sincere and devoted to the work assigned is evident in the Quran as Allah (SWT) said, *"O you who believe! Fulfill (all) obligations" (5:1).* In Arabic terms, this is known as '*uqud*' where they should fulfill all obligations made in the contract, as long as it is not morally wrong. They also are reminded that per the agreement, they must be committed to it *"You will surely be held responsible for every work you have done." (16:93).* Prophet (SAW) also voiced out in relation to this matter, where Ibn 'Umar reported, The Prophet (PBUH) said: *"To hear and obey (the authorities) is binding, so long as one is not commanded to disobey (God); when one is commanded to disobey (God), he shall not hear or obey." (Hadith Bukhari. 56:108.)*

5.3 Rating Process by the Managers

Based on criteria agreed, the managers then rate the employee's performance by assigning them grades, whereby managers must rate their employees fairly as Allah (SWT), said that everyone should be judged based on their action, no matter good or bad deeds, *"And to all are ranked according to their deeds," (46:19).* It is also the manager's responsibility to evaluate those under his responsibility, as Ibn 'Umar reported, I heard the Messenger of Allah (PBUH) say: *"Every one of you is a ruler and every one of you shall be questioned about those under his rule...' (Hadith Bukhari. 11:11.)*

The issue that is always associated with the rating process is the practice of rating biases by the managers. There are three common rating biases committed, namely, halo, strictness and leniency, and central tendency. Halo is the practice where the initial impression of the manager on the employees influences his or her overall judgments (Thorndike, 1920). This practice is forbidden in Islam especially in giving testimonies or rating grades where Allah (SWT) said:

"O you who have believed, be persistently standing firm in justice, witnesses for Allah, even if it be against yourselves or parents and relatives. Whether one is rich or poor, Allah is more worthy of both. So follow not (personal) inclination, lest you not be just. And if you distort (your testimony) or refuse (to give it), then indeed Allah is ever, with what you do, Acquainted" (4:135)

Furthermore, strictness and leniency in rating also occur when managers tend to rate their employees higher or lower than what they deserve (Lunenburg, 2012). The managers might provide higher ratings which can be based on favoritism, and this act can be considered as hypocrite as Abu Hurairah reported on the authority of the Prophet (PBUH). He said: *"The signs of the hypocrite are three: when he speaks, he lies; and when he makes a promise, he breaks it; and when he is charged with a trust, he is unfaithful." (Hadith Bukhari. 2:23)*

In contrast, managers may provide lower ratings to employees that they disliked, and again this is forbidden in Islam as Allah (SWT) said:

"O mankind! We created you from a single (pair) of a male and female and made you into nations and tribes are that you may know each other (not that you may despise each other). (49:13).

It is also advisable for the employers to avoid finding employees flaws with the sole intentions of giving lower grades as Allah (SWT) said, *"O you who believe avoid suspicion as much (as possible): For suspicion some cases is a sin. And spy not each other; nor speak ill of each other behind their back" (59:12).* The practice of being suspicious can lead to cruel injustice to innocent employees that can sever their relationships, as the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allah be on him) said: *"Do not hate one another and do not be jealous of one another and do not boycott one another..." (Hadith Bukhari. 78: 57.)*

Finally, central tendency refers to the manager's unwillingness to give higher or lower ratings, therefore, their marks were near to average scale. This behavior is not acceptable as Islam had stated that men should not betray the trust of Allah and His Prophet by manipulating their knowledge about employee's performance as Allah (SWT) said: "*God doth command you to render back your trust to those to whom they are due; and when ye judge between man and man, that ye judge with justice..." (4:58).*

Meanwhile, employees are also advised not to practice any form of fraud and false-hood in carrying out their works with the intentions of getting higher rating grades, which may not be a reflection of their true performance. It was mentioned in Al-Quran that Allah (SWT) dislikes those who practiced fraud, *"Contend no on behalf of such as betray their own souls; for Allah loveth not one given to perfidy and sin" (4:107).*

5.4   Feedback Session between Employers and Employees

After the rating session, managers should consult their employees during the feedback meeting in regards to their work, as it will give awareness to the employees on the strengths and weaknesses of their performance (Ilgen and Davis, 2000). This act of consultation is also encouraged in Islam, as Allah (SWT) had said in this verse: *"And those who have responded to their lord and established prayer and whose affairs is [determined by] consultation among themselves..." (42: 38).* Consulting with employees is recommended because it is an ideal way for employer to make decision about his/her employee and for them to inform their employees on how the employees can improve their performance. This is in line with a hadith which Abd Allah ibn Mas'ud said, The Prophet (PBUH) said:

"There shall be no envy but (emulate) two: the person whom Allah has given wealth and the power to spend it in the service of Truth, and the person whom Allah has granted knowledge of things and he judges by it and teaches it (to others)." (Hadith Bukhari. 3: 15)

The problem could be resulted from when managers refused to give accurate feedback to their employees, especially the negative aspects of the performance as they are afraid of the possible employees' reactions (Waung and Highhouse, 1997). The managers should not practice the act of hiding the truth about employee's performance, as Islam does not encourage this based on the Quranic verse *"And never mix truth false, nor conceals the truth when ye know (what it is)" (2:42).* It is clear from this Quranic verse that they should strive to provide

accurate feedback to the employees, as mentioned again in another Quranic verse *"And shun the word that is false" (22:30).*

One of the risks associated during the feedback session is with employees' dislike receiving negative feedback on their performance, as this is associated with higher negative emotions and counterproductive behavior (Belschak et al., 2009). With this risk of negative behavior from the employee, this calls for manager's ability to carefully relaying these feedbacks in order to prevent these adverse reactions from the employees. In Islam, there are several qualities of managers that should present in any Muslim managers especially towards their employees. They should view their employees as their brothers in term of their relations, as Prophet (SAW) said: "*Those who are working under you are your brothers. Allah has placed them under your custody" (Hadith Al-Bukhari).* This means that managers should behave well with their employees, showing some tolerance especially with the faults of employees, and avoiding showing anger towards employees (Mohiuddin and Amin, 2012). Managers should also show some compassion and not be harsh in their speech, as mentioned by Allah (SWT) to Prophet (SAW):

> *"So by mercy from Allah, O Muhammad, you were lenient with them. So if you had been rude in speech and harsh in heart, they would have disbanded from about you. So pardon them and ask forgiveness for them and consult them in the matter" (3:159)*

For the employees, there is a tendency for them to dislike receiving negative feedbacks from their managers (Belschak et al., 2009). Thus, it is advisable for them to practice *sabr* or patience in controlling their emotions, as according to Ahmad (2012), by being patience, it can help prevent the employees from doing portraying prohibited behaviors, which can lead to greater acceptance of managers feedback in order to improve their performance. This concept of *sabr* had been stressed out several times in Al-Quran, *"O you who believe! Seek help in patience and the prayer. Truly! Allah is with the patient" (2:153). "Therefore, be patient as did the Messengers of strong will" (26:35).*

It can be seen from each stages of PA detailed above, Al-Quran and Hadith can provide ethical guidelines for the Muslim managers and employees in their implementation of the PA system. A typology of specific PA tasks and its situation, along with the ethical theory perspectives is presented in Table 2 below.

It should be noted that, even though the table highlighted the issues associated with the modern PA practice, it never implied that there is no benefit with the current modern practices. It is obvious from many studies that modern PA practices offers several benefits such as improving employee's performance (Selvarajan, Singh and Solansky, 2018), and improvement in employee's commitment to the organization and satisfaction (Cheng, 2014; Palaiologos, Papazekos, and Panayotopoulou, 2011; Thurston and McNall, 2010). Thus, this table merely highlighted issues found from the modern practices and ways on how Islamic values and principals may help in lessening these issues as ethical guidance for both managers and employees.

Table 2

Ethical Islamic Guidelines for both Managers and Employees in PA implementation

Performance Appraisal Components	Issues Arise from the Modern Practices	Islamic Ethical Guidelines
Goals of PA	● Multiple, conflicting goals ● Ignorance of one goal in PA	● The primary goal in deciding rewards or punishments for employees (Surah AlKahf, verses 87-88) ● Employees accountability of their performance (Surah Al-Fatir, verses 7-8) ● Not withholding the employee's rewards that they deserved based on their performance (Surah Al-Araf, verse 85) ● Provision of training to employees in order to improve their performance (Surah Al-Mujadilah, verse 11)
Criteria	● Unattainable criteria ● Not specific criteria ● No commitment by employees in achieving these criteria ●	● Mutual agreement between employers and employees in regards to the criteria used (Surah Al-Qasas, verse 28) Developing attainable criteria for the employees (Surah Al-Baqarah, verse 286) ● Developing criteria that are specific to employees' roles and responsibilities (Surah Yusuf, verse 55) ● Employees achieve all the criteria with all sincerity and devotion (Surah Al-Ma'idah, verse 1)
Ratings	● Rating bias by managers ● Employees practicing fraud in their work to achieve higher grades	● Managers should remember the intention behind the rating process is to grade employees according to work done (Surah Al-Ahqaf, verse 19)

		• Do not practice favoritism in rating employees, no matter what the personal relation is (Surah Al-Nisa, verse 135) • Avoid evaluating employees with the sole reason of finding their fault in order to reduce their grades (Surah Al-Hujurat, verse 12) • Managers must not practice discrimination such as gender and racial when evaluating (Surah Al-Hujurat, verse 13) • Employees should show sincerity in their work (Surah An-Nisa, verse 107)
Feedback	• Inaccurate feedback by managers • Verbal aggression by employees when receiving feedback	• Both managers and employees should always seek each other to consult about employee's performance (Surah AlShura, verse 38) • Managers should not practice feedback inflation especially about hiding information about employee's negative performance (Surah Al-Baqarah, verse 42) • Managers should not be harsh when delivering comments on employee's performance (Surah Al-Imran, Verse 159) • Employees should practice patience in receiving negative feedbacks (Surah Al-Baqarah, verse 153)

Source: Author's Compilation

6   The Islamic Practices of PA: Where Do We Go from Here?

From a theoretical perspective, there are differences between western and Islamic practices of PA, for which the western practice of PA only came from an understanding of man while Islamic viewpoint on PA is based on Allah (SWT) words to His people (Salim and Alarimy, 2015). For example, organizational justice theory was used to understand employee's perception of fairness in the organization including PA (Rowland and Hall, 2012), however Islam had already emphasized on the concept of justice as evidently in the Quran for which the term 'justice' occurs 138 times (Ababneh and Avramenko, 2013). Furthermore, Gauhar (1976) had provided his translations of the Quran for which he stated that there are four concepts of justice based in Quran, namely, balance, equity, duty, and trust. The concept of equity refers to the administration of justice to other fellow beings (ibid). This is similar with organizational justice theory that concerned with distributive justice in terms of equity for distribution of rewards.

Even though there are differences theoretically as can be seen from the example above, but when viewed from practical perspectives based on real organisations, it can be seen that there are similarities between the Western and Islamic PA practice. For example, when talked about *shura* (consultation), most organisations do practice consultation, to some extent, in giving performance feedback. The issue of providing accurate ratings also remain a priority in most organisations, regardless of their religious context. Therefore, investigating the differences between western and Islamic practices of PA in depth is beyond the scope of this theoretical

paper, as it requires future empirical research in this area. Future research can conduct interviews of managers and employees in regards to these two PA practices in different organisations in order to address this question.

In conclusion, this paper can offer useful guidelines for Muslim managers and employees to know and apply the Islamic approach in PA implementation, especially considering how the PA practices came from the western context, as those who work in Muslim countries may not previously give serious considerations to religious guidelines (Ali et al., 2000). Any Muslim organizations should give considerations to the use of Islamic principles in PA due to the benefits it offers in terms of fairness perceptions, employee commitment and organizational performance (Azmi, 2010; Hashim, 2008; Nik and Rahman, 2011). As Rahman (2013) stated that any organization that is concerned with organizational justice and harmonious employment relationship simply cannot ignore the benefits that Islamic PA practice may bring. It should also be noted that PA is consist of multi-level actors, which involves both managers and employees in ensuring its successful implementation. Therefore, both Muslim managers and employees should consider how Islamic principles may guide their ethical behaviors in PA practice.

An interesting area for research is to investigate circumstances where social consensus prevails more than Islamic values, which can be a valuable contribution to Ethical theory. When faced with an ethical dilemma in PA implementation, an in-depth investigation can be conducted among the Muslim managers and employees to observe whether they stand firmly on Islamic values or rely more on social consensus such as local culture. Overall, the role of context in terms of religion should be view as a positive reinforcement to the PA system, and not as a barrier to the success of PA system.

Acknowledgements

References

Ababneh, H. T., & Avramenko, A. (2016). Impact of Islamic values on HRM practices: An empirical study of Jordanian universities. *International Journal of Business Excellence, 10*(1), 1-19

Abuznaid, S. (2005). Islam and Management: What can be learned? *Thunderbird International Business Review, 48,* 125-139

Ahmad, S. (2012). Introjecting the core Islamic values for raising the employee's behavior. In Ahmad, K., Islam. R., & Ismail, Y. (Ed.). *Issues in Islamic Management Theories and Practices.* Malaysia: International Islamic University Malaysia Press

Al-Gufeili, I. (1983). *An Islamic approach to the study of management.* Cairo, Egypt: Al Mansura University

Al-Hamadi, A. B., Budhwar, P. S., & Shipton, H. (2007). Management of human resources in Oman. *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, *18*, 100–113. https://doi.org/10.1080/09585190601068383

Ali, A. J., Gibbs, M., & Camp, R. C. (2000). Human resource strategy: The Ten Commandments perspective. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, *20*, 114–132.
https://doi.org/10.1108/01443330010789205

Azmi, I. A. G. (2010). Islamic Human Resource Practices and Organizational Performance: A Preliminary Finding of Islamic Organizations in Malaysia. *Journal of Global Business and Economics*, *1*, 27–42.

Belschak, F. D., & Den hartog, D. N. (2009). Consequences of Positive and Negative Feedback: The Impact on Emotions and Extra-Role Behaviors. *Applied Psychology, 58,* 274303.

Branine, M., & Pollard, D. (2010). Human resource management with Islamic management principles: A dialectic for a reverse diffusion in management. *Personnel Review*, *39*, 712–727. https://doi.org/10.1108/00483481011075576

Cheng, S. Y. (Cheryl). (2014). The Mediating Role of Organizational Justice on the Relationship Between Administrative Performance Appraisal Practices and Organizational Commitment. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, *25*, 1131– 1148.

Cvetkovska, M. (2013). *Performance Appraisal System in the Macedonian Civil service: Comparative - Descriptive and Empirical Analysis of the Performance Appraisal System's Design and Implementation*. Germany: LAMBERT Academic Publishing.

Gauhar, A. (1976). *Translations from the Quran.* Karachi, Pakistan: Shalimar Publication (PVT) LTD.

Hashim, J. (2008). The Quran-Based Human Resource Management and its Effects on Organisational Justice, Job Satisfaction and Turnover Intention. *The Journal of International Management Studies, 3,* 148-159

Hashim, J. (2010). Human resource management practices on organisational commitment: The Islamic perspective. *Personnel Review*, *39*, 785–799. https://doi.org/10.1108/00483481011075611

Heneidi, A. M. (2012), "Management of self-reliance: the entrance to the proposed in Islamic administration". http://www.alukah.net/Web/culture

Hull, R. T. (1979, March 27). *The varieties of ethical theories*. Presented at the Buffalo Psychiatric Center, Buffalo, New York.

Ilgen, D., & Davis, C. (2000). Bearing Bad News: Reactions to Negative Performance Feedback. *Applied Psychology*, *49*, 550–565. https://doi.org/10.1111/1464-0597.00031

Khaki, J. E. A. (2013, May 17). 'Muslim' vs 'Islamic'. *DAWN*. Retreived from http://www.dawn.com/news/1011860

Khan, B., Farooq, A., & Hussain, Z. (2010). Human resource management: An Islamic perspective. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Business Administration*, *2*, 17–34. https://doi.org/10.1108/17574321011037558

Loqman, M., & Bulbul, A. (2012). Convergence and divergence between conventional approach and Islamic approach to management. In Ahmad, K., Islam, R., & Ismail, Y. (Ed).

   Issues in Islamic Management Theories and Practices. Malaysia: International Islamic University Malaysia Press

Lunenburg, F. C. (2012). Performance Appraisal: Methods and Rating Errors. *International Journal of Scholarly Academic Intellectual Diversity, 14*(1), 1-9

Miles, J. A. (2012). *Management and Organization Theory : a Jossey-Bass Reader.* San Francisco: John Wiley & Sons. Retrieved from https://www.wiley.com/enbn/Management+and+Organization+Theory%3A+A+Jossey+Bass+Reader-p-9781118196601

Mohiuddin, M. G., & Amin, M. R. (2012). Human Resource Management: An Islamic Perspective. In Ahmad, K., Islam. R., & Ismail, Y. (Ed.). *Issues in Islamic Management Theories and Practices.* Malaysia: International Islamic University Malaysia Press

Mellahi, K., & Frynas, J. G. (2003). An exploratory study into the applicability of western HRM practices in developing countries: An Algerian case study. *International Journal of Commerce and Management*, *13*, 61–80. https://doi.org/10.1108/eb047460

Murphy, K. R., Cleveland, J., & Hanscom, M. E. (2019). *Performance Appraisal and Management.* Thousand Oaks, California: SAGE Publications Inc.

Nik, M. N. A. R., & Rahman, S. S. (2011). Relationship between Islamic HRM practices and employee commitment: An empirical study of Islamic banks in Bangladesh. *Journal of Applied Sciences Research, 7,* 1269-1278.

Nik, N. M., Alias, M. A., Shahid, S., Abdul Hamid, M., & Alam, S. S. (2013). Relationship between Islamic human resource management (IHRM) practices and trust: An empirical

study. *Journal of Industrial Engineering and Management*, *6*, 1105–1123. https://doi.org/10.3926/jiem.794

Osman, I., Mahphoth, M. H., & Hashim, M. J. (2014). Human Resource Management from An Islamic Perspective: Experiences of GLCs. In Proceedings of the International Conference on Science, Technology and Social Sciences (ICSTSS) 2012 (pp. 217–227). Springer Singapore. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-287-077-3_26

Palaiologos, A., Papazekos, P., & Panayotopoulou, L. (2011). Organizational Justice and Employee Satisfaction in Performance Appraisal. *Journal of European Industrial Training*, *35*, 826–840.

Patten, T.H., Jr (1977). *Pay: Employee Compensation and Incentive Plans.* Free Press: London

Rahman, F. N. (2018). Islamic approaches to human resource management in organizations. *International Journal of Development Research, 8,* 23542-23546

Rowland, C. A., & Hall, R. D. (2012). Organizational Justice and Performance: Is Appraisal Fair? *EuroMed Journal of Business*, *7*, 280–293. https://doi.org/10.1108/14502191211265334

Salim, A., & Alarimy, J. (2015). Islamic and western approaches to human resource management in organizations: a practical approach. *International Journal of Information Technology and Business Management*, *29*(1), 1-13, Retrieved from www.jitbm.com

Sandler, R. (2010). Ethical theory and the problem of inconsequentialism: Why environmental ethicists should be virtue-oriented ethicists. *Journal of Agriculture and Environmental Ethics*, *23*, 167–183.

Selvarajan, T. T., Singh, B., & Solansky, S. (2018). Performance Appraisal Fairness, Leader Member Exchange and Motivation to Improve Performance: A Study of US and Mexican Employees. *Journal of Business Research*, *85*, 142–154.

Thorndike, E. L. (1920). A constant error in psychological ratings. *Journal of Applied Psychology, 4,* 25-29

Thurston, P. W., & McNall, L. (2010). Justice Perceptions of Performance Appraisal Practices. *Journal of Managerial Psychology, 25,* 201-228

Waung, M., & Highhouse, S. (1997). Fear of Conflict and Empathic Buffering: Two Explanations for the Inflation of Performance Feedback. *Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes*, *71*, 37–54. https://doi.org/10.1006/OBHD.1997.2711

Wiese, D. S., & Buckley, M. R. (1998). The evolution of the performance appraisal process. *Journal of Management History (Archive)*, *4*, 233–249. https://doi.org/10.1108/13552529810231003

Yeganeh, H., & Su, Z. (2008). An examination of human resource management practices in Iranian public sector. *Personnel Review*, *37*, 203–221. https://doi.org/10.1108/00483480810850542