Forecasts Based on Linear Projection

DENG Yanfei dengyf@fudan.edu.cn www.scholat.com/idengyf.en

November 10, 2019

1 Principles of Forecasting

Suppose we want to know the value of y_{T+1} based on a sample of size T (i.e., $y_1 = Y_1, y_2 = Y_2, \dots, y_T = Y_T$). Let $\mathbf{x}_T = \{y_1, y_2, \dots, y_T\}$ and let $y_{T+1|T}^*$ denote a forecast of y_{T+1} based on \mathbf{x}_T . To evaluate the usefulness of this forecast, we need to specify a loss function (the mean squared error, MSE) and

$$\min_{\phi} \text{MSE}(y_{T+1|T}^*) \equiv \mathbb{E}(y_{T+1} - y_{T+1|T}^*)^2,$$

$$\Rightarrow y_{T+1|T}^* = \mathbb{E}(y_{T+1}|\mathbf{x}_T),$$

i.e., the forecast with the smallest mean squared error turns out to be the expectation of y_{T+1} conditional on \mathbf{x}_T .

Proof: See table 1.

The representation with general notations

Suppose we want to forecast Y_{t+1} based on its T most recent values, i.e., $(c, Y_t, Y_{t-1}, \dots, Y_{t-T+1})' \equiv \mathbf{x}_t$,

$$\min_{\phi} \text{MSE}(y_{t+1|t}^*) \equiv \mathbb{E}(y_{t+1} - y_{t+1|t}^*)^2,$$

$$\Rightarrow y_{t+1|t}^* = \mathbb{E}(y_{t+1}|\mathbf{x}_t).$$

1) Recall forecasts of AR(1) without an initial condition

$$y_t = \phi y_{t-1} + \epsilon_t = \sum_{i=0}^{\infty} \phi^i \epsilon_{t-i}, \quad |\phi| < 1.$$

$$\underbrace{\begin{array}{l} y_{t+1} = \phi y_t + \epsilon_{t+1}, \\ y_{t+2} = \phi y_{t+1} + \epsilon_{t+2} = \phi(\phi y_t + \epsilon_{t+1}) + \epsilon_{t+2} = \phi^2 y_t + \phi \epsilon_{t+1} + \epsilon_{t+2}, \\ \vdots \\ y_{t+h} = \phi y_{t+h-1} + \epsilon_{t+h}; \\ \\ \underline{\begin{array}{l} \text{unconditional expectation} \\ \text{E}_t y_t = 0, \\ \\ \underline{\begin{array}{l} \text{conditional expectation} \\ \text{E}_t y_t = \phi y_{t-1}, \\ \\ \underline{\begin{array}{l} \text{1 step ahead forecast} \\ \text{E}_t y_{t+1} = \mathbb{E}_t(\phi y_t) + \mathbb{E}_t \epsilon_{t+1} = \phi \mathbb{E}_t y_t + 0 = \phi y_t, \\ \\ \underline{\begin{array}{l} \text{2 steps ahead forecasts} \\ \text{E}_t y_{t+2} = \mathbb{E}_t(\phi y_{t+1}) = \phi \mathbb{E}_t y_{t+1} = \phi(\phi y_t) = \phi^2 y_t, \\ \\ \vdots \\ \\ \vdots \\ \text{var}_t y_{t+1} = \mathbb{E}_t[(y_{t+1} - \mathbb{E}_t y_{t+1})^2] = \mathbb{E}_t[(y_{t+1} - \phi y_t)^2] = \sigma_\epsilon^2, \\ \\ \text{var}_t y_{t+2} = \mathbb{E}_t[(y_{t+2} - \phi^2 y_t)^2] = \mathbb{E}_t[(\phi \epsilon_{t+1} + \epsilon_{t+2})^2] = (1 + \phi^2)\sigma_\epsilon^2, \\ \\ \vdots \\ \\ \text{var}_t y_{t+h} = \mathbb{E}_t[(y_{t+h} - \phi^h y_t)^2] = (1 + \phi^2 + \phi^4 + \dots + \phi^{2(h-1)})\sigma_\epsilon^2. \end{array} \end{array}$$

2) Consider forecasts of AR(1) with an initial condition

$$y_t = \phi y_{t-1} + \epsilon_t = \phi^t y_0 + \sum_{i=0}^{t-1} \phi^i \epsilon_{t-i}, \quad |\phi| < 1, \ y_0 \text{ given.}$$

$$\underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} y_{t+1} = \phi y_t + \epsilon_{t+1}, \\ y_{t+2} = \phi y_{t+1} + \epsilon_{t+2} = \phi(\phi y_t + \epsilon_{t+1}) + \epsilon_{t+2} = \phi^2 y_t + \phi \epsilon_{t+1} + \epsilon_{t+2}, \\ \vdots \\ y_{t+h} = \phi y_{t+h-1} + \epsilon_{t+h}; \\ \hline \underline{ \begin{array}{c} 1 \text{ step ahead forecast} \\ 2 \text{ steps ahead forecasts} \end{array}} \mathbb{E}_t y_{t+1} = \mathbb{E}_t (\phi y_t) + \mathbb{E}_t \epsilon_{t+1} = \phi \mathbb{E}_t y_t + 0 = \phi y_t, \\ \hline \underline{ \begin{array}{c} 2 \text{ steps ahead forecasts} \\ 2 \text{ steps ahead forecasts} \end{array}} \mathbb{E}_t y_{t+2} = \mathbb{E}_t (\phi y_{t+1}) = \phi \mathbb{E}_t y_{t+1} = \phi(\phi y_t) = \phi^2 y_t, \\ \vdots \\ \hline \underline{ \begin{array}{c} h \text{ steps ahead forecasts} \\ 2 \text{ steps ahead forecasts} \end{array}} \mathbb{E}_t y_{t+h} = \mathbb{E}_t (\phi y_{t+h-1}) = \phi \mathbb{E}_t y_{t+h-1} = \phi^h y_t. \end{array}$$

Q1: What's differences about forecasts with and without an initial condition?

$$\mathbb{E}_t \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad \mathbb{E}[\cdot|\mathbf{x}_t]$$

Q2: What's differences about forecasts between conditional expectations and projections?

nonlinear vs. linear

Linear Projection vs. Conditional Expectation $\mathbf{2}$

$$y_{t+1|t}^* = c + \phi_1 y_t + \phi_2 y_{t-1} + \dots + \phi_T y_{t-T+1} = \begin{bmatrix} c & \phi_1 & \phi_2 & \dots & \phi_T \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ y_t \\ y_{t-1} \\ \vdots \\ y_{t-T+1} \end{bmatrix} \equiv \boldsymbol{\phi}' \mathbf{x}_t = \mathbb{P}(y_{t+1}|1, \mathbf{x}_t) = \mathbb{E}(y_{t+1}|\mathbf{x}_t).$$

$$\mathbf{0}' = \mathbb{E}[(y_{t+1} - \mathbb{E}_t y_{t+1}) \mathbf{x}_t'] \overset{\text{posit the forecase error} \perp \mathbf{x}_t}{\Leftrightarrow} \mathbb{E}[(y_{t+1} - \boldsymbol{\phi}' \mathbf{x}_t) \mathbf{x}_t'] = \mathbf{0}' \leftarrow \text{linear projection of } y_{t+1} \text{ on } \mathbf{x}_t.$$

$$\mathbf{0}' = \mathbb{E}[(y_{t+1} - \mathbb{E}_t y_{t+1}) \mathbf{x}_t'] \overset{\text{posit the forecase error} \perp \mathbf{x}_t}{\Leftrightarrow} \mathbb{E}[(y_{t+1} - \boldsymbol{\phi}' \mathbf{x}_t) \mathbf{x}_t'] = \mathbf{0}' \leftarrow \text{linear projection of } y_{t+1} \text{ on } \mathbf{x}_t.$$

The linear projection turns out to produce the smallest mean squared error among the class of linear forecasting rules.

Table 1: Proof Conditional Expectation Linear Projection Let $\mathbf{a}'\mathbf{x}_t$ is any arbitrary linear forecasting rule Let $y_{t+1|t}^* = f(\mathbf{x}_t)$ is any function other than conditional expectation $\Rightarrow \mathbb{P}(y_{t+1}|\mathbf{x}_t) \equiv \hat{y}_{t+1|t} = \boldsymbol{\phi}'\mathbf{x}_t$ $MSE[\mathbb{P}(y_{t+1}|\mathbf{x}_t)] = \min MSE \ge MSE[\mathbb{E}(y_{t+1}|\mathbf{x}_t)] = \min MSE$ The conditional expectation offers the best possible forecast.

3 Linear Projection vs. OLS Regression

key words: ϕ and observations.

LP

The coefficient for a linear projection (LP) of y_{t+1} on \mathbf{x}_t is the value of $\boldsymbol{\phi}$ that

$$\mathbf{0}' = \mathbb{E}[(y_{t+1} - \phi' \mathbf{x}_t) \mathbf{x}_t'],$$

$$\Rightarrow \mathbb{E}(y_{t+1} \mathbf{x}_t') = \phi' \mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_t \mathbf{x}_t') \quad \text{assume } \mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_t \mathbf{x}_t') \text{ is nonsingular}$$

$$\Rightarrow \quad \phi' = \mathbb{E}(y_{t+1} \mathbf{x}_t') [\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_t \mathbf{x}_t')]^{-1} \quad \text{when } \mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_t \mathbf{x}_t') \text{ is singular, see Hamilton, p.75, footnote2.}$$

The MSE/forecast error associated with a linear projection given a sample of T observations on \mathbf{x}_t is given by:

$$\mathbb{E}(y_{t+1} - \boldsymbol{\phi}'\mathbf{x}_{t})^{2} = \mathbb{E}y_{t+1}^{2} - 2\mathbb{E}(\boldsymbol{\phi}'\mathbf{x}_{t}y_{t+1}) + \mathbb{E}(\boldsymbol{\phi}'\mathbf{x}_{t}\mathbf{x}'_{t}\boldsymbol{\phi})
= \mathbb{E}y_{t+1}^{2} - 2\boldsymbol{\phi}'\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}y_{t+1}) + \boldsymbol{\phi}'\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}\mathbf{x}'_{t})\boldsymbol{\phi}
= \mathbb{E}y_{t+1}^{2} - 2\mathbb{E}(y_{t+1}\mathbf{x}'_{t})[\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}\mathbf{x}'_{t})]^{-1}\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}y_{t+1}) + \mathbb{E}(y_{t+1}\mathbf{x}'_{t})\{[\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}\mathbf{x}'_{t})]^{-1}\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}\mathbf{x}'_{t})\}[\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}\mathbf{x}'_{t})]^{-1}\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}y_{t+1})
= \mathbb{E}y_{t+1}^{2} - 2\mathbb{E}(y_{t+1}\mathbf{x}'_{t})[\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}\mathbf{x}'_{t})]^{-1}\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}y_{t+1}) + \mathbb{E}(y_{t+1}\mathbf{x}'_{t})[\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}\mathbf{x}'_{t})]^{-1}\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}y_{t+1})
= \mathbb{E}y_{t+1}^{2} - \mathbb{E}(y_{t+1}\mathbf{x}'_{t})[\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}\mathbf{x}'_{t})]^{-1}\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_{t}y_{t+1}).$$

LP is closely related to ordinary least squares (OLS) regression, but still have differences between them.

OLS

A linear regression model (given a sample of T observations on y_{t+1}):

$$\begin{cases} Y_{2} = \phi Y_{1} + \epsilon_{1} \\ Y_{3} = \phi Y_{2} + \epsilon_{2} \\ Y_{4} = \phi Y_{3} + \epsilon_{3} \\ \vdots \\ Y_{T} = \phi Y_{T-1} + \epsilon_{T-1} \\ Y_{T+1} = \phi Y_{T} + \epsilon_{T} \end{cases}$$

$$\begin{cases} Y_{t+1} = c + \phi_{1} Y_{t} + \phi_{2} Y_{t-1} + \dots + \phi_{T} Y_{t-T+1} + \epsilon_{t} & \Leftrightarrow & Y_{t+1} = \phi' \mathbf{X}_{t} + \epsilon_{t}; \\ Y_{T+1} = c + \phi_{1} Y_{1} + \phi_{2} Y_{1} + \dots + \phi_{T} Y_{T} + \epsilon_{T} & \Leftrightarrow & Y_{T+1} = \phi' \mathbf{X}_{T} + \epsilon_{T}. \end{cases}$$

Given a sample of T observations on y_{t+1} and \mathbf{x}_t (i.e., 2T observations), the sample sum of squared residuals (SSR)

$$Y_{2} = c + \phi_{1}Y_{1} + \phi_{2}Y_{0} + \dots + \phi_{-T+2}Y_{-T+2} + \epsilon_{1} = \phi'\mathbf{X}_{1} + \epsilon_{1}$$

$$Y_{3} = c + \phi_{1}Y_{2} + \phi_{2}Y_{1} + \dots + \phi_{-T+2}Y_{-T+3} + \epsilon_{2} = \phi'\mathbf{X}_{2} + \epsilon_{2}$$

$$Y_{4} = c + \phi_{1}Y_{3} + \phi_{2}Y_{2} + \dots + \phi_{-T}Y_{-T+4} + \epsilon_{3} = \phi'\mathbf{X}_{3} + \epsilon_{3}$$

$$\vdots$$

$$Y_{T} = c + \phi_{1}Y_{T-1} + \phi_{2}Y_{T-2} + \dots + \phi_{-T+2}Y_{1} + \epsilon_{T-1} = \phi'\mathbf{X}_{T-1} + \epsilon_{T-1}$$

$$Y_{T+1} = c + \phi_{1}Y_{T} + \phi_{2}Y_{T-1} + \dots + \phi_{-T+2}Y_{1} + \epsilon_{T} = \phi'\mathbf{X}_{T} + \epsilon_{T}$$

$$Y_{T+1} = c + \phi_{1}Y_{T} + \phi_{2}Y_{T-1} + \dots + \phi_{-T+2}Y_{1} + \epsilon_{T} = \phi'\mathbf{X}_{T} + \epsilon_{T}$$

$$\min \text{MSE} \Rightarrow \begin{cases}
0' = \mathbb{E}[(y_{t+1} - \phi' \mathbf{x}_t) \mathbf{x}_t'] \Rightarrow \\
\mathbb{E}(y_{t+1} \mathbf{x}_t') = \phi' \mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_t \mathbf{x}_t') \Rightarrow \\
\phi' = \mathbb{E}(y_{t+1} \mathbf{x}_t') [\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}_t \mathbf{x}_t')]^{-1}.
\end{cases}$$

$$\min_{\phi} \text{SSR} = \sum_{t=1}^{T} (Y_{t+1} - \phi' \mathbf{X}_t)^2$$

$$= \sum_{t=1}^{T} [Y_{t+1}^2 - 2Y_{t+1} \phi' \mathbf{X}_t + (\phi' \mathbf{X}_t)^2]$$

$$= \sum_{t=1}^{T} (Y_{t+1}^2 - 2Y_{t+1} \phi' \mathbf{X}_t + \phi' \mathbf{X}_t \mathbf{X}_t' \phi)$$

$$= \sum_{t=1}^{T} (Y_{t+1}^2 - 2Y_{t+1} \mathbf{X}_t' \phi + \phi' \mathbf{X}_t \mathbf{X}_t' \phi)$$

$$\Rightarrow \quad \mathbf{0} = \sum_{t=1}^{T} (-2\mathbf{X}_t Y_{t+1} + 2\mathbf{X}_t \mathbf{X}_t' \hat{\phi})$$

$$\Rightarrow \quad \hat{\phi} = \left[\sum_{t=1}^{T} \mathbf{X}_t \mathbf{X}_t'\right]^{-1} \left[\sum_{t=1}^{T} \mathbf{X}_t Y_{t+1}\right]$$

$$= \left[\frac{1}{T} \sum_{t=1}^{T} \mathbf{X}_t \mathbf{X}_t'\right]^{-1} \left[\frac{1}{T} \sum_{t=1}^{T} \mathbf{X}_t Y_{t+1}\right].$$

Obviously, ϕ' in linear projection is constructed from population moments while it in OLS regression is constructed from sample moments. In other words, OLS regression is a summary of the particular sample observations $\{\mathbf{X}_t\}_{t=0}^T$ and $\{Y_t\}_{t=1}^{T+1}$, whereas linear projection is a discription of the population characteristics of the stochastic process $\{\mathbf{x}_t, y_{t+1}\}_{t=-\infty}^{\infty}$. However, there is a formal mathematical sense in which the two operations are the same.

Parallel between OLS and LP (cf. Hamilton, 1994, appendix 4.A, pp.113-114)

$$\begin{cases} \text{OLS} & \to & \text{the particular sample moments, } (X_1, X_2, \dots, X_T) \text{ and } (Y_2, Y_3, \dots, Y_{T+1}); \\ \text{LP} & \to & \text{the population moments, } \{\mathbf{x}_t, y_{t+1}\}_{t=-\infty}^{\infty}. \end{cases}$$

Consider an artificial discrete-valued random variable x that can take on only one of sample of size T, each with probability $\frac{1}{T}$:

$$\operatorname{prob}\{x = X_1 = x_1\} = \frac{1}{T},$$
$$\operatorname{prob}\{x = X_2 = x_2\} = \frac{1}{T},$$
$$\vdots$$
$$\operatorname{prob}\{x = X_T = x_T\} = \frac{1}{T}.$$

Denote $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, \dots, x_t)'$ as the explanatory vector and $\mathbf{X}_t = (X_1, X_2, \dots, X_t)'$ as the real value of explanatory vector.

We can construct a second artificial variable y that can take on one of the discrete values $(y_2, y_3, \ldots, y_{T+1})$. Notice that these are not observations on y.

Posit that the joint distribution of \mathbf{x} and y is given by

$$\text{prob}\{\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{X}_t, y = Y_{t+1}\} = \frac{1}{T}, \text{ for } t = 1, 2, \dots, T.$$

Then

$$\mathbb{E}(\mathbf{x}y) = \frac{1}{T} \sum_{t=1}^{T} \mathbf{X}_t Y_{t+1}.$$

The coefficient for a linear projection of y on x is the value of ϕ that minimizes

min MSE
$$\equiv \mathbb{E}(y - \phi' \mathbf{x})^2 = \frac{1}{T} \sum_{t=1}^{T} (Y_{t+1} - \phi' \mathbf{X}_t)^2 = \min \text{SSR}$$

Thus, the formulas for an OLS regression can be viewed as a special case of formulas for a linear projection.

Notice that is the stochastic process $\{\mathbf{x}_t, y_{t+1}\}_{t=-\infty}^{\infty}$ is covariance-stationary and ergodic¹ for second moments, then the sample moments will converge to the population moments as the sample size T goes to infinity, i.e.,

$$\hat{\phi} \stackrel{p}{\rightarrow} \phi \leftarrow \text{a consistent estimator.}$$

¹cf. Miao 2014 ch.4, p.115