5/27/2017 Reviews For Paper

VLDB 2017

43rd International Conference on Very Large Data Bases

Reviews For Paper

Track Demonstrations

Paper ID 1214

Title ClaimBuster:The First-ever End-to-end Fact-checking System

Masked Reviewer ID: Assigned_Reviewer_1

Review:

Question	
Relevant for VLDB	Yes
Originality of the Demo	Interesting But Not Too Novel
Overall Rating	Weak Accept
Strong Points	+ Presented an end-to-end system for fact checking + Presentation is clear and a working prototype system available online
	+ Presentation is clear and a working prototype system available online
Weak Points	- Proposed system comprises of several components, which are independently well researched topics. This brings in the novelty part of the proposed system. It would be nice if authors point to the technical difficulties in claim spotting w.r.t fact spotting [1,2]
	[1] Tomasz Tylenda, Yafang Wang and Gerhard Weikum. Spotting Facts in the Wild, WACCK 2014 (in conjunction with SIGMOD 2014) [2] Tomasz Tylenda, Sarath Kumar Kondreddi, Gerhard Weikum. Spotting Knowledge Base Facts in Web Texts. AKBC 2014 (in conjunction with NIPS 2014)
Detailed Comments (incl. Video, if available)	The paper presents ClaimBuster, a system for end-to-end fact checking. The system comprises of several components: claim monitor, spotter, matcher, checker, and reporter. The system is nicely integrated with several social networks like twitter, slack, etc.
	Authors report that the system is being widely used on several occasions for fact checking.
	There exist few related works, e.g. fact spotting[1] w.r.t knowledge bases. It would be interesting to have a discussion and comparison with the existing works.
	[1] Tomasz Tylenda, Yafang Wang and Gerhard Weikum. Spotting Facts in the Wild, WACCK 2014 (in conjunction with SIGMOD 2014)
	[2] Tomasz Tylenda, Sarath Kumar Kondreddi, Gerhard Weikum. Spotting Knowledge Base Facts in Web Texts. AKBC 2014 (in conjunction with NIPS 2014)
Candidate for Best Demo Award	No

Masked Reviewer ID: Assigned_Reviewer_2

Review:

Question	
Relevant for VLDB	Yes
Originality of the Demo	Substantially New Idea

Overall Rating	Weak Accept
Strong Points	S1. Timely, highly relevant topic S2. Components for spotting facts, gathering evidence, and reporting the results
Weak Points	W1. Demonstration not ready at time of submission W2. Unclear if system output is trustworthy (who checks the fact checker?)
Detailed Comments (incl. Video, if available)	This demo proposes a system called ClaimBuster, which aims to automate or help automating fact checks. The system has components for spotting potential claims worth checking, for gathering evidence (e.g., from web sources or knowlege bases), and for scoring claims. This is a highly relevant topic and a potentially very useful system, even when only used as a tool for reporters.
	The individual components of the system have not been integrated, however, so that it's not clear what will actually be demoed. In fact, the authors state that "these functions are expected to be ready by the time of demonstration". I am hesitant to recommend accepting this proposal for this reason.
	I am also somewhat concerned about the validity of ClaimBuster; it's unclear to me to what extent one can "trust" the individual components, what the assumptions are, etc. This may be less a concern for a demo though and may actually spur interesting discussions in case the demo gets accepted. What's demoed here is a UI or idea, in my point of view, not necessarily the techniques and models behind it.
	Finally, VLDB may not be the ideal venue for this line of work.
Candidate for Best Demo Award	No

Masked Reviewer ID: Assigned_Reviewer_3

Review:

Question	
Relevant for VLDB	Yes
Originality of the Demo	Substantially New Idea
Overall Rating	Accept
Strong Points	s1. Interesting topic on a mature system. Great demo quality. s2. Will likely generate a lot of discussion.
Weak Points	w1.
Detailed Comments (incl. Video, if available)	# Summary This paper proposes a demonstration of ClaimBuster, a system that automates fact-checking across a number of news/social-media sources. ClaimBuster essentially creates a knowledge base of facts. It then creates a workflow pipeline for both creating new facts (based on known news/fact sites) and checking new claims (e.g., from twitter) against these facts. # Comments

	This demo will certainly attract attention. While not a "core" database topic, I think it beings together a nice mix of IE topics within a mature system. It will certainly geenrate a lot of discussion.
Candidate for Best Demo Award	No