Reviews For Paper

VLDB 2017

5/8/2017

43rd International Conference on Very Large Data Bases

Reviews For Paper

Track Demonstrations

Paper ID 1267

Title Tabview: A Visual Interface for Generating Preview Tables of Entity Graphs

Masked Reviewer ID: Assigned_Reviewer_1

Review:

Question	
Relevant for VLDB	Yes
Originality of the Demo	Interesting But Not Too Novel
Overall Rating	Accept
Strong Points	None.
Weak Points	None.
Detailed Comments (incl. Video, if available)	None.
Candidate for Best Demo Award	No

Masked Reviewer ID: Assigned_Reviewer_2

Review:

Review:	
Question	
Relevant for VLDB	Yes
Originality of the Demo	Interesting But Not Too Novel
Overall Rating	Reject
Strong Points	The paper targets an interesting topic.
Weak Points	The paper is vague in many aspects and does not explicitly state which datasets will be available during the demo.
Detailed Comments (incl. Video, if available)	This submission does not include a video. The paper states that the tool selects a few important entity types from the schema graph. How exactly are these entity types chosen? And what happens if the schema graph is not provided separately from the instance data? The introduction states that "In our final product, we will show the most representative sample records." What does "our final product" refer to? The text states that Freebase is supported. How does the tool support general datasets? What datasets will be available at the demo?

5/8/2017 Reviews For Paper

	The text states that users can select domains. But who determines these domains for a dataset? And when are they determined? Does this work automatically?
	How exactly is a distance measure defined?
	The text states that the preview panel shows a summarized schema graph. How is it summarized?
	This paper would benefit from another round of proofreading to remove the grammatical mistakes.
Candidate for Best Demo Award	No

Masked Reviewer ID: Assigned_Reviewer_3

Review:

Question	
Relevant for VLDB	Yes
Originality of the Demo	Substantially New Idea
Overall Rating	Weak Accept
Strong Points	S1. The idea of presenting a summary of large entity-relationship graphs in the form of preview-tables is quite useful, and is of interest to many an attendee in VLDB.
Weak Points	W1. Although the authors claim that they can demonstrate the tabview in multiple dataset scenario, it is unclear how. W2. The demonstration scenario does not highlight the advantages of preview tables over other methods of summarizing the entity graph, or let users interactively change the paramets such as minimum/maximum distance, preview size, etc. W3. The writing quality of key Section 2 is quite poor. W4. Many entity-graphs do not come with type information (OWL2/RDFS), can such entity graphs be used as well? How will multiple datagraphs be previewed in a integrated fashion? Can the system work when the entity-graphs are not thematically separable like the Freebase example?
Detailed Comments (incl. Video, if available)	The paper presents a very interesting demonstration system, but the scenarios outlined as well as the explanation of the system are quite poorly written (please see comments in Q5 above).
Candidate for Best Demo Award	No