# **IEEE VIS Charter**

This document presents a governance structure for IEEE VIS to unify the three V-I-S conferences: VAST, InfoVis, and SciVis. It replaces the <u>IEEE VIS Executive Committee (VEC) Charter of 2015</u>. It is guided by the VIS Restructuring reports delivered to the Phoenix and Berlin meetings, the reVISe committee Amended Recommendations (Area Model, Governance, Keywords, Transition Plan) of October 2019 (presented in Vancouver) and subsequent work by the reVISe committee, which has delivered a series of concrete proposals for an area model and governance structure for the new conference.

## I. Purpose of IEEE VIS

The objective of IEEE VIS is to provide the premier international forum for presenting innovations in visualization and visual analytics methods and applications across science, engineering, medicine, humanities, commerce, the arts and other areas.

From 2021, VIS consists of one conference spanning several areas, and associated symposia, workshops, tutorials and other events. The full name of the conference is "IEEE VIS: Visualization and Visual Analytics".

The governance structure of VIS is based on several independent but tightly linked bodies:

- A VIS Steering Committee (VSC) carries the long term responsibility and oversight of IEEE VIS.
- An Area Curation Committee (ACC) monitors, considers and proposes changes to the areas that are the focus of the research presented at the conference.
- A Paper Chairs Committee (PCC) consisting of area co-chairs and coordinated by overall paper chairs, conducts selection of full research papers for publication at the conference each year.
- A VIS Executive Committee (VEC) oversees the planning and success of IEEE VIS.
- A VIS Organizing Committee (OC) delivers an individual conference, as managed and coordinated by the General Chairs.

Each committee will maintain a single complete and up to date digital record of decisions and actions in a secure location that is accessible to all members.

Each committee will maintain a publicly available summary of issues discussed and decisions made at all meetings and in all teleconferences.

All committees should be diverse in their membership in terms of research area, academic lineage, gender, geographic origin, sector (academia, industry, government), demographics and other characteristics as they emerge.

The VSC and VEC will provide a dedicated channel for community motions. They will make an effort to table these motions and respond to them within a reasonable time frame, as permitted by workload.

The VSC and VEC will establish voting processes including quora, majorities - whether these are absolute, special or require unanimity - and ways in which votes may be cast (e.g. through teleconference). Initial procedures for decision-making are specified in Appendix III. These will be evaluated and adjusted as necessary to ensure that committees can operate swiftly (remotely and asynchronously) but fairly while achieving legitimacy, authority and transparency.

The functions of each committee are described in the following sections.

### II. Sponsorship

The IEEE Computer Society's Visualization and Graphics Technical Committee (VGTC) is the sponsor of IEEE VIS. Any change in sponsorship must be approved by the VSC, the VGTC Executive Committee, and the Vice President of Conferences and Tutorials of the IEEE Computer Society or his/her designee.

## III. The VIS Steering Committee (VSC)

### **Purpose**

To provide long-term scientific and organizational oversight of the IEEE VIS.

Its remit includes handling of all cross-year policy questions. The VSC should be consulted on key initiatives arising from the GCs, the VEC, and the community and should establish mechanisms for this communication.

#### Tasks

The main routine responsibilities of the VSC are:

- Appointment of:
  - VEC members (x2)
  - o ACC
  - o PCC
  - o Test of Time Committee
  - Chairs for all content-related aspects of IEEE VIS, including short papers, workshops, posters, tutorial, and doctoral colloquium
- Ratification of and input into:
  - o Chairs for non-content aspects of IEEE VIS, proposed by VEC
  - Unified program committee and short paper program committee, proposed by PCC
  - Call for Papers, proposed by the PCC
  - Future General Chairs and conference locations, based on VEC recommendation

- Area evolution proposals, generated by ACC
- Strategic:
  - Relationship with journals (TVCG, CG&A, ...)
  - Initiatives that benefit the conference as the community and discipline develop

### Composition

The VSC has 9 members, all serving 4-year terms. One member of the VGTC is appointed by the VGTC ExCom chair (this could be the VGTC ExCom chair, but may change with a new chair). Four members are appointed by VSC. Four members are elected by VIS attendees and community for a 4 year term.

Criteria for VSC members are: evidence of leadership; significant and continuing active contribution to VIS; outstanding proven track record as responsive and engaged organizer; willingness to participate, lead and follow through by contributing to regular meetings and initiatives.

VSC members may not serve on the VEC or ACC during their term. This restriction also applies to VGTC Chair, who can personally serve only on either the VSC or the VEC. Repeat appointments are possible following a four-year break from service on VSC and a two-year break from positions on the VEC and ACC.

### Leadership

The chair is elected by VSC members. Any VSC member who has served on the VSC for at least 1 year and has at least 1 year left in their term on the VSC is eligible to be elected as chair. The VSC chair will serve a 3 year term (which means that the chair's term on the VSC may be extended by up to 2 years to enable that). Each year, the VSC chair will select one or more vice-chairs or co-chairs from among the other members of the VSC to assist in VSC leadership activities. VSC members should be willing to take up a committee leadership position after 1 year's service.

### Meetings

A VSC meeting is held at each meeting of IEEE VIS. In addition, the VSC will meet several times per year by teleconference and decisions may be reached by email as and when VSC input is required. VSC members are expected to attend the VSC meeting at each IEEE VIS. Members who miss two consecutive meetings at the VIS conference or who attend less than half of the teleconference meetings held in any 6 month period without giving sufficient cause are considered withdrawn from the VSC, subject to review by the rest of the VSC.

Summary minutes, documenting all decisions, actions and topics discussed, will be taken by a member of the VSC designated by the chair. Minutes will be delivered to the chair within 1 week of the meeting. The chair will maintain minutes of the past VSC meetings in a location accessible to all VSC members. A publicly accessible summary of issues discussed and decisions made will be made available within 1 month. This will omit any content that would create a privacy or confidentiality concern or is of a sensitive nature.

The VSC shall discuss and vote on motions that arise in line with agreed upon procedures for decision-making.

## IV. The Area Curation Committee (ACC)

#### **Purpose**

Monitoring the areas used as the focus of the research presented at VIS and proposing changes as the discipline develops.

Monitoring of areas and related topics such as keywords, proposing area-related motions to VIS Steering Committee, responding to recommendations made by the VSC. Multi-year data analyses of submission patterns, and communication with the VSC will allow this group to understand and react to changing trends in the community, culminating in proposals to adjust areas as part of an established conference organization process.

#### Tasks

The main routine responsibilities of the ACC are to:

- conduct the intellectual work of determining areas, driven by both ongoing data analysis and strategic concerns.
- collect and archive data needed for analysis of the area model and decision making on area evolution proposals.
- provide a forum for Associated Events to discuss their interaction with the main conference, as defined by the area model, and the topics represented by Associated Events, as well as other content-related conference arrangements.

### Composition

The ACC has 9 members, all serving 3-year terms. All 9 members are appointed by the VSC. Three members rotate on and off each year.

The committee should be broad enough in expertise to represent traditional areas, emerging areas, and adjacent communities. Criteria for all ACC members are: significant active contribution to VIS; proven track record as responsive and engaged organizer; analytical capability.

ACC members may not serve on VSC or VEC during their term. Repeat appointments are possible, following a three year break from the ACC and a two-year break from service on the VEC and VSC.

#### Leadership

Each year the ACC members will appoint a chair. All ACC members are eligible to serve as chair. The ACC chair will select one or more vice- or co-chairs to assist in ACC leadership activities.

### Meetings

A joint meeting between ACC and VSC is held at each IEEE VIS conference. ACC will furthermore organize a meeting at each IEEE VIS conference with representatives of Associated Events (typically one organizer or steering committee member per associated event), with the purpose of providing a formal point of exchange on all aspects of the area model that affect Associated Events, and to solicit corresponding input. The ACC will otherwise operate in a mode and with a schedule of its own choosing.

### **Area Model Reports and Proposals**

The ACC will prepare:

- a formal report on performance and state of the area model, and strategic considerations, published to the community, and
- a formal proposal to the VSC on any possible modifications to the area model in advance of every IEEE VIS conference. For this, the ACC operates within the initial framework set up by reVISe: areas need to split/merge if submissions fall below a minimum or above a maximum, as determined appropriate by ACC, for several years in a row.

Both are due 15 months before the conference instance where the proposed changes would take effect. This timespan is selected because it allows incorporation of current submission data (taking place three months after submission), but also provides sufficient time for discussion and decisions (i.e. three month in advance of IEEE VIS, where reporting and decisions would be communicated).

Each proposal for area model modification should be accompanied by a rationale and include the main arguments reflecting discussion within ACC. Where possible, arguments should be supported by the data collected and archived by ACC.

During proposal preparation, the ACC will consult with the TVCG EIC to determine whether newly introduced areas are considered within scope, in line with agreements between the conference and TVCG.

#### **Data Collection and Archiving**

The ACC is collectively responsible for collection and archival of anonymized data that it requires for continued analysis of the area model. ACC will receive these data from the Paper Chair Committee and the OC at regular intervals, typically immediately following the conclusion of both the IEEE VIS papers submission process, as well as following the review process. ACC will make this dataset publicly available together with the area model report.

### V. Papers Chair Committee (PCC)

#### **Purpose**

To select the full research papers for conference presentation and journal proceedings in each of the areas specified by the ACC.

#### Tasks

- Manage and execute papers selection process
- Propose Call for Papers to VSC
- Propose Best Paper Committee to VEC
- Propose Unified Program Committee to VEC
- Coordinate and support Programme Committee in its activity
- Provide recommendations for candidates for Organizing Committee to VEC and VSC

#### Composition

The PCC is based on a two-tier structure: There are three overall papers chairs (OPCs) and two area papers chairs (APCs) per area. All are guest editors of the TVCG special issue that publishes the IEEE VIS proceedings.

The OPCs manage the papers process in the large (timeline, PCS operation, session planning, preface, etc.), provide assistance and oversight, and ensure consistency across areas. They are resources for APCs with questions about conference level issues - such as plagiarism, conflicts, etc. OPCs are also responsible for integrating APC materials into a unified call for papers, which they propose for ratification to the VSC. Once approved, they are responsible for its dissemination.

#### **Criteria for Membership**

For individual OPCs: Experience as APC, with outstanding performance.

Collectively, the OPCs will need a balance of knowledge and experience across research areas. At least one OPC must have experience as a TVCG Associate Editor (or equivalent experience at a commensurate journal). An OPC cannot also be an APC in the same year; an OPC cannot be reappointed after their term (2 years typical, 3 years max).

For APCs: research excellence and impact; excellent service record as thoughtful reviewer and fair minded decision-maker on the PC; proven responsibility through previous OC jobs or equivalent experience;

Collectively, the APCs should exhibit diverse characteristics in terms of a mix of lineage, research area, geographic origin, sector, gender and other demographics. At least one APC in each area should be at a career stage typically expected for TVCG Associate Editors (post-tenure and h-index of 20+). An APC cannot serve for more than one area at any one time, and must take a break of at least one year before becoming APC again. Two chairs in the same

area cannot be involved in a conflict of interest. A conflict includes co-authorship on publications in the past 5 years, in addition to the established VGTC conflict of interest criteria.

### Meetings

The OPCs are responsible for consistency across areas and so meetings and teleconferences should be scheduled as required throughout the year. APCs of particular areas will need to communicate regularly to conduct the papers selection process.

A PCC meeting is held at each meeting of IEEE VIS and organized by the OPCs. At the meeting, both newly appointed chairs and chairs rotating off are expected to attend. The meeting is of informational and discussion character, and its main purpose is to facilitate continuity and raise issues to be forwarded to the VEC and the VSC. During the paper handling cycles several virtual PCC meetings may be called by the OPCs.

## VI. The VIS Executive Committee (VEC)

#### **Purpose**

To oversee the planning and success of IEEE VIS. The VEC solicits bids for future VIS conferences, is involved in their planning and evaluates how well each VIS has achieved the objectives stated above. The VEC makes proposals for change for ratification by the VSC, and implements improvements to better meet conference objectives.

#### Tasks

The main routine responsibilities of the VEC are:

- General oversight of each IEEE VIS conference.
- Multi-year operational aspects of VIS (finance, web, archives, etc.)
- Recommendation of future General Chair(s) and conference locations to the VIS Steering Committee in line with IEEE VIS Bid Guidelines.
- OC structure and appointments, which are not already appointed by VSC, to be ratified by VSC
- Oversight of the election process for VSC and VEC elected positions organizing the vote may be delegated to OC Elections chairs.
- Operational relationship with journals (TVCG, CG&A, and any others that develop).
- Liaison with Associated Events (annual meeting) on governance and organization.
- Pre-approval of Associated Events (all symposia, some workshops)
- Ratification of Best Paper Committee, proposed by PCC

#### Composition

The VEC has 11 members, all serving 4-year terms. One member of the VGTC is appointed by the VGTC Chair (this could be VGTC ExCom chair, but may change with a new chair). Four members are appointed by the VEC. Two members are appointed by the VSC. Four members are elected by VIS attendees and the VIS community for a 4 year term.

Rationale: In contrast to the VSC, VEC is predominantly appointed (as opposed to elected). This reflects the operational nature of VEC, where an established track record to follow through with tasks is critical.

Criteria for all VEC members: Longstanding and continuing active contribution to VIS (participant for 6 years, 2 years of OC service or equivalent); proven track record as responsive and engaged organizer; willingness to participate actively in multiple meetings per year - in person at VIS and through teleconferences scheduled as required (approximately monthly) throughout the year; willingness to take on responsibilities in light of actions agreed at such meetings, and deliver on these.

Collectively, the VEC should contain an overall mix of lineage, research area, geographic origin, sector, gender and other demographics

VEC members may not serve on the VSC or ACC during their term; this also applies to the VGTC chair, who can serve on one of these committees at most. Repeat appointments are possible following a four-year break from service on the VEC and a two year break from positions on the VEC and ACC.

#### Leadership

The chair is elected by VEC members. Any VEC member who has served on the VEC for at least 1 year and has at least 1 year left in their term on the VEC is eligible to be elected as chair. The VEC chair will serve a 3 year term (which means that the chair's term on the VEC may be extended by up to 2 years to enable that). Each year, the VEC chair will select one or more vice-chairs or co-chairs from among the other members of the VEC to assist in VEC leadership activities. VEC members should be willing to take up a committee leadership position after 1 year's service.

#### Meetings

At least one VEC meeting is held at each IEEE VIS conference. In addition, meetings throughout the year are organised via teleconference as needed. VEC members are expected to attend the VEC meeting at each IEEE VIS. Members who miss two consecutive meetings at the VIS conference or who attend less than half of the teleconference meetings held in any 6 month period, without giving sufficient cause, are considered withdrawn from the VEC, subject to review by the rest of the VEC.

Summary minutes, documenting all decisions, actions and topics discussed, will be taken by a member of the VEC designated by the chair. Minutes will be delivered to the chair within 1 week of the meeting. The chair will maintain minutes of the past VEC meetings in a location accessible to all VEC members. A publicly accessible summary of issues discussed and decisions made will be made available within 1 month. This will omit any content that would create a privacy or confidentiality concern or is of a sensitive nature.

The VEC shall discuss and vote on motions that arise in line with agreed procedures for decision-making.

At each IEEE VIS conference, VEC will organize:

- a meeting with representatives of Associated Events (typically one organizer or steering committee member per associated event), with the purpose of providing a formal point of exchange on all aspects of IEEE governance and organization that affect Associated Events, and to solicit corresponding input.
- 2. an open 'Town Hall' style meeting to receive views on the conference from VIS attendees.

## VII. Constituting VIS

The VEC obtains, through open and informal solicitations, proposals for: VIS locations, names of individuals who are suitable to serve as VIS General Chair, and names of supporting institutions (if any).

This process is undertaken according to the separately documented IEEE VIS Bid Guidelines document, which includes a detailed timeline.

## VIII. Rules governing the IEEE VIS Organizing Committee Positions

A. The General Chair(s) of IEEE VIS is (are) selected by the VEC according to the IEEE VIS Bid Guidelines. The General Chair(s) for VIS will be an ex-officio member of the OC the year before leading it. The OC also includes the liaison of any associated event, but no other members of co-located symposia are members of the OC.

- B. The structure of the VIS Organizing Committee (OC) is determined by the General Chair(s), VSC, and VEC, with the advice and consent of the VSC, as described in the Responsibilities Matrix found on <a href="ieeevis.org">ieeevis.org</a>. The goal will be to appoint committee members who are able and reliable, with a mix of new people and people with past VIS committee experience. Proposals should be ready for presentation by the start of VIS, allowing for in-person discussions over the week, with the goal of decisions being finalized by the end of the week. Invitations should not be issued by the proposer until final approval is obtained. The Matrix is a living document that changes at the discretion of the VEC and GCs, without requiring ratification at the VSC level.
- C. PCC and all other content-related posts are appointed by the VSC. All other non-content related posts are appointed by the VEC, and ratified by the VSC. Non-content posts may be suggested by the GCs but must be appointed by the VEC to ensure consistency and diversity in appointments.
- D. Elected members on VEC and VSC are chosen by the VIS community in a free and open election, following the timeline specified in Appendix I. Terms of elected members begin during the VIS conference, and the election process is conducted in the year leading up to the conference. Any person who has attended VIS or contributed to it in some capacity (e.g., organization, content, ...) in at least three of the five years leading up to the conference for which the election is conducted is considered eligible to vote. Furthermore, any person can self-declare as a member of the community. VEC may opt to review eligibility in these cases.

- E. The VEC shall identify and announce positions open for election on VSC and VEC and solicit nominations. Nominations are expected to include a brief statement on the qualifications and goals of the nominee. Self-nominations are permissible. Nominees will be vetted by VEC to ensure that committee eligibility criteria are met, and vetting results are communicated to the nominees. If rejected by these criteria, a nominee will be notified. VEC will announce vetted candidates and election modalities.
- F. Elections shall be held in electronic form. VEC will ensure that election results are announced to the community at VIS.
- G. VEC may delegate organization of voting procedures (voter eligibility, voting process, vote count) to Elections Chairs, who are appointed to coordinate this activity and thereby join the OC.

## IX. General Chair(s) and the Organizing Committee

- A. The General Chair(s) is (are) responsible for the overall running of each IEEE VIS conference, serving as Chair(s) of the OC.
- B. The General Chair(s) and the Finance Chair share joint responsibility for the finances of VIS. At the option of the VEC, the Finance Chair may be required to approve all expenditures made by the OC. The General Chair oversees local arrangements.
- D. The General Chair and the appointed Publicity Chairs are responsible for the publicity of VIS. All notices requesting papers and other content as well as the advance program announcement and registration material shall be widely distributed in all recognized community channels in a timely manner. The goal is to allow full participation in all facets of VIS by a worldwide audience.

#### X. Financial Matters

- A. The IEEE VIS budget will be developed by the General Chair and Finance Chair and approved by the VGTC Chair. The General Chairs and Finance Chair will then submit the budget for approval by the IEEE CS no later than nine months prior to the VIS. The budget must be approved by IEEE CS prior to the distribution of any publication of registration fees.
- B. VIS accounts shall be closed within 120 days following the completion of IEEE VIS. At that time, all surplus funds shall be distributed to IEEE CS. A final report and the closing bank statement must be submitted to IEEE CS no later than 120 days after an IEEE VIS meeting by the General Chair and Finance Chair. IEEE CS will receive a list of IEEE VIS attendees with names and full address information no later than 120 days after the VIS meeting.
- C. Contracts that require IEEE CS review, approval, and signature are: all hotel and exhibit facility contracts and all conference service or management contracts. Members of the VEC and OCs are not authorized to sign these contracts.

### XI. Intellectual Property

This section describes the ownership of the VIS name, slogan, copyright for publications, and/or logo ownership. Note Section 6.17 of the IEEE Computer Society's Policies and Procedures Manual. IEEE will hold the copyright on the conference proceedings. The proceedings shall carry the names, logos, and addresses of the IEEE and the IEEE Computer Society. The disposition of rights and permissions, and the maintenance of the authors' copyright assignments, rests solely with the copyright holder. The revenue from the dispensation of rights and permission shall be the sole property of the rights owner. Requests for reprint or re-use from third-party material will be handled according to the existing reprint policies of the copyright holder. The VEC shall ensure that the Publication Chair is collecting copyright release forms prior to publishing the proceedings. The VEC shall ensure that an electronic version of the proceedings is forwarded to the IEEE Computer Society. The IEEE Computer Society shall include an electronic version of the proceedings in its Digital Library.

#### XII. Termination of VIS

The termination of the IEEE VIS may be proposed by the VSC or by IEEE CS, and will be approved by the IEEE Computer Society's Visualization and Graphics Technical Committee (VGTC) and IEEE CS. In the event of a termination, the IEEE CS VGTC and IEEE CS will assume any assets and liabilities of IEEE VIS.

#### XIII. Amendments

Amendments to this charter of the IEEE VIS and the associated Letter of Agreement (Memorandum of Understanding) require the approval by two thirds of the VSC members (two-thirds absolute majority). VSC is expected to consult with VEC on any proposals to modify these documents.

### **Appendix I. Elections Timeline**

### May 1

VEC announces to-be-elected positions on VEC and VSC that will become vacant at the next VIS and calls for nominations in an open and community-wide manner, including any relevant open mailing lists (e.g. ieee-vis) and web pages (ieeevis.org).

Nominations are to include a brief statement on qualification and goals, following the requirements for the respective body. Self-nominations are possible and invited.

#### Jun 1

Call for nominations closes; VEC begins vetting nominees according to formal requirements.

#### Jul 1

VEC announces vetting results to nominees. In case of negative vetting, candidates can request a formal statement detailing the reasons for rejection.

#### Aug 1

VEC announces vetting results and final list of candidates for each of VEC and VSC, as well as detailed information about the voting procedure, on relevant open mailing lists, social media and web pages. Rejected nominees can request the inclusion of their vetting rationale statement, which is not included by default.

### Sep 1 – one week before VIS

Voting is conducted electronically.

### at VIS

Announcement of election results; start of electees' terms.

### **Appendix II. Transition of Committees**

### **Bootstrapping VSC**

- VGTC ExCom chair appoints one VSC member
- Current V-I-S steering committees nominate 2 individuals each to serve on VSC:
  - 1 member from each SC will be assigned a long-serving slot (3 or 4 years, randomly selected);
  - 1 member from each SC will be assigned a short-serving slot (1 or 2 years, randomly selected)

SC can choose to nominate into long/short slots or have this be randomized.

- The VSC elects its chair from amongst their ranks in the constituting meeting. The chair's term will be that member's term and can be extended once by two years. The VSC chair also appoints one of the members as vice chair.
  - The chair internally chosen by the VSC could be an existing member of the VSC or could be somebody not previously serving on the VSC. If they are an existing member, that slot opens up (as if they'd rotated out of it), so a replacement member would be then be added to the VSC according to the type of the slot (either externally elected or internally appointed).
- The final inaugural member of VSC will be nominated from among the eligible reVISe members (past and current), to carry on the institutional knowledge and legacy built in reVISe, and will be appointed with a one or two year term, on an elected position.
- Test of Time Committee appointed for 2020 by VSC

Elections would begin in September 2021, with typically one slot per year (4 elected members, with 4 year terms).

#### **Bootstrapping ACC**

The Area Curation Committee will be appointed by the VSC at VIS 2020, drawing from former reVISe members and V-I-S steering committees, and the wider community when appropriate. 1, 2 or 3 year terms will be assigned at random.

### Transition from V-I-S paper chairs to PCC

Before VIS 2020:

- 3 OPCs for VIS 2021 are appointed by VEC (VSC does not exist yet). These OPCs should have been paper chairs before, but should not be 2020 paper chairs. Two of the OPCs will serve for two years (2020: transition year, 2021: "real year"). The third OPC will serve for three years (2020: transition year, 2021 & 22: "real years").

By VIS 2020 for VIS 2021:

- VSC appoints 12 area chairs, two for each area. In each case one will serve a 1-year term and a 2-year term, drawing from the current paper chairs that are not about to rotate out and the general eligible population.
- Term served are adopted as much as possible, or randomly assigned if needed.

### Transitioning the current VEC to the new VEC

- The VEC chair will be grandfathered in as a VEC lead and likely VEC chair.
- The VGTC chair can either sit themselves on VEC or appoint a representative.
- The remaining VEC slots can be filled by the other current VEC members, unless term limits require rotation out or VEC members are withdrawn in line with VEC membership rules, in which case new members can be appointed as required.
- The current VEC will assign each VEC member to an "elected" or "appointed" slot considering current term limits and staging goals.
- The VEC will appoint leads from the existing membership.

Depending on the schedule of rotations and term limits, the first elections could be held in 2020.

## Appendix III. Procedures for Decision-Making

The VSC and VEC shall conduct votes among members to reach decisions about major proposals.

All votes require an absolute majority, involving more than half of the committee membership.

Votes may be cast at meetings, or subsequently by communicating with the chair up to an agreed time following the meeting at which a proposal was voted upon.