



Knapsack Problem

Nombre del Alumno: Jorge Alejandro González Guerra

Matrícula: 1889169

Carrera: Ingeniería en Tecnologías de la Información (ITS)

Maestro: Iris Abril Martínez Salazar

Curso: Temas Selectos de Optimización

Hora: Jueves M4-M6

Fecha de Entrega: 28 de Mayo de 2020

Description:

It is required to test 3 different strategies to solve a Knapsack problem:

- 1. Considering Most Valuable Items first.
- 2. Considering Items with Less Weight first.
- 3. Considering Value/Weight relation, with the better relations first.

Our knapsack has a Maximum capacity of 100 (weight carry capacity), and we're provided with 35 items to test:

| Item | Value | Weight |
|------|-------|--------|
| 1 | 36 | 15 |
| 2 | 32 | 19 |
| 3 | 31 | 13 |
| 4 | 12 | 8 |
| 5 | 43 | 15 |
| 6 | 12 | 16 |
| 7 | 18 | 6 |
| 8 | 47 | 22 |
| 9 | 29 | 12 |
| 10 | 31 | 25 |
| 11 | 41 | 19 |
| 12 | 33 | 11 |
| 13 | 26 | 21 |
| 14 | 20 | 10 |
| 15 | 23 | 23 |
| 16 | 41 | 20 |
| 17 | 44 | 16 |
| 18 | 46 | 5 |
| 19 | 47 | 16 |
| 20 | 20 | 7 |
| 21 | 48 | 14 |
| 22 | 17 | 21 |
| 23 | 45 | 25 |
| 24 | 33 | 9 |
| 25 | 14 | 17 |
| | | |

| 26 | 16 | 21 |
|----|----|----|
| 27 | 41 | 20 |
| 28 | 36 | 9 |
| 29 | 29 | 21 |
| 30 | 30 | 8 |
| 31 | 34 | 13 |
| 32 | 12 | 22 |
| 33 | 14 | 8 |
| 34 | 30 | 7 |

First Strategy: Most Valuable First

Our results were not what we expected. We ended up adding way less items than initially predirected:

```
**** Add using Value strategy (Most Valuable First)...
   Adding Item 23 (Value: 25) →
Adding Item 23 (Value: 25) → Capacity: 100 43 - 33 Adding Item 10 (Value: 25) → Capacity: 55 - 31 = 24 ✓ Adding Item 15 (Value: 23) → Capacity: 24 - 23 = 1 ✓ Adding Item 32 (Value: 22) → Capacity: 1 - 12 = -11 ★ Adding Item 8 (Value: 21) → Capacity: 1 - 47 = -46 ★ Adding Item 29 (Value: 21) → Capacity: 1 - 29 = -28 ★ Adding Item 26 (Value: 21) → Capacity: 1 - 16 = -15 ★ Adding Item 13 (Value: 21) → Capacity: 1 - 26 = -25 ★ Adding Item 22 (Value: 21) → Capacity: 1 - 17 = -16 ★ Adding Item 16 (Value: 20) → Capacity: 1 - 41 = -40 ★ Adding Item 27 (Value: 20) → Capacity: 1 - 41 = -40 ★ Adding Item 11 (Value: 19) → Capacity: 1 - 41 = -40 ★ Adding Item 2 (Value: 19) → Capacity: 1 - 32 = -31 ★ Adding Item 25 (Value: 17) → Capacity: 1 - 14 = -13 ★ Adding Item 19 (Value: 16) → Capacity: 1 - 47 = -46 ★ Adding Item 17 (Value: 16) → Capacity: 1 - 47 = -46 ★ Adding Item 17 (Value: 15) → Capacity: 1 - 44 = -43 ★ Adding Item 1 (Value: 15) → Capacity: 1 - 48 = -47 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 14) → Capacity: 1 - 36 = -35 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 34 = -33 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 34 = -33 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ Adding Item 31 (Value: 13) → Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30 ★ 
                                                                                                                          Capacity: 100 - 45 = 55 ✔
                                                                                                                           Capacity: 55 - 31 = 24 🗸
                                                                                                                    Capacity: 1 - 31 = -30
Capacity: 1 - 29 = -28
   Adding Item 3 (Value: 13)
   Adding Item 9 (Value: 12)
                                                                                                                                Capacity: 1 - 33 = -32
   Adding Item 12 (Value: 11)
                                                                                                                                 Capacity: 1 - 20 = -19
   Adding Item 14 (Value: 10)
                                                                                                                                 Capacity: 1 - 33 = -32
   Adding Item 24 (Value: 9)
   Adding Item 28 (Value: 9)
                                                                                                                                Capacity: 1 - 36 = -35
   Adding Item 33 (Value: 8)
                                                                                                                                Capacity: 1 - 14 = -13
                                                                                                                           Capacity: 1 - 12 = -11
   Adding Item 4 (Value: 8)
   Adding Item 30 (Value: 8)
                                                                                                                                Capacity: 1 - 30 = -29
                                                                                                                                Capacity: 1 - 30 = -29
   Adding Item 34 (Value: 7)
                                                                                                                                 Capacity: 1 - 20 = -19
   Adding Item 20 (Value: 7)
                                                                                                                                 Capacity: 1 - 18 = -17
   Adding Item 7 (Value: 6)
   Adding Item 18 (Value: 5)
                                                                                                                                  Capacity: 1 - 46 = -45
   **** Total Items Added: 3
```

Second Strategy: Less Weight First

Here, our results were aswell not what we expected. We were able to add more items than predicted:

```
**** Add using Weight strategy (Less Weight First)...
Adding Item 4
               (Weight: 12)
                                       Capacity: 100 - 12 = 88 <
Adding Item 32 (Weight: 12)
                                       Capacity: 88 - 12 = 76 🗸
Adding Item 6
               (Weight: 12)
                                       Capacity: 76 - 12 = 64 🗸
Adding Item 33 (Weight: 14)
                                       Capacity: 64 - 14 = 50 <
Adding Item 25 (Weight: 14)
                                       Capacity: 50 - 14 = 36 🗸
Adding Item 26 (Weight: 16)
                                       Capacity: 36 - 16 = 20 <
Adding Item 22 (Weight: 17)
                                       Capacity: 20 - 17 = 3
Adding Item 7
               (Weight: 18)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 18 = -15
                                       Capacity: 3 - 20 = -17
Adding Item 20 (Weight: 20)
Adding Item 14 (Weight: 20)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 20 = -17
                                       Capacity: 3 - 23 = -20
Adding Item 15 (Weight: 23)
Adding Item 13 (Weight: 26)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 26 = -23
Adding Item 29 (Weight: 29)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 29 = -26
Adding Item 9
               (Weight: 29)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 29 = -26
                                       Capacity: 3 - 30 = -27
Adding Item 30 (Weight: 30)
Adding Item 34 (Weight: 30)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 30 = -27
                                       Capacity: 3 - 31 = -28
Adding Item 10 (Weight: 31)
Adding Item 3
               (Weight: 31)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 31 = -28
Adding Item 2
               (Weight: 32)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 32 = -29
Adding Item 24 (Weight: 33)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 33 = -30
Adding Item 12 (Weight: 33)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 33 = -30
Adding Item 31 (Weight: 34)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 34 = -31
Adding Item 28 (Weight: 36)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 36 = -33
Adding Item 1
               (Weight: 36)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 36 = -33
Adding Item 27 (Weight: 41)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 41 = -38
Adding Item 11 (Weight: 41)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 41 = -38
Adding Item 16 (Weight: 41)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 41 = -38
Adding Item 5
               (Weight: 43)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 43 = -40
Adding Item 17 (Weight: 44)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 44 = -41
Adding Item 23 (Weight: 45)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 45 = -42
Adding Item 18 (Weight: 46)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 46 = -43
Adding Item 8
               (Weight: 47)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 47 = -44
Adding Item 19 (Weight: 47)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 47 = -44
Adding Item 21 (Weight: 48)
                                       Capacity: 3 - 48 = -45
**** Total Items Added: 7
```

Third Strategy: Value/Weight Relation

Our results were almost those that we expected. Enough values were added to the knapsack (considering the overall weight) but we ended up adding a little less items than with the second strategy:

```
**** Add using Value/Weight strategy...
Adding Item 32 (Value/Weight: 1.8333) →
                                                 Capacity: 100 - 12 = 88 <
                                                 Capacity: 88 - 12 = 76 ✓
Adding Item 6
                (Value/Weight: 1.3333) \rightarrow
Adding Item 26 (Value/Weight: 1.3125) →
                                                 Capacity: 76 - 16 = 60 <
Adding Item 22 (Value/Weight: 1.2353) →
                                                 Capacity: 60 - 17 = 43
Adding Item 25 (Value/Weight: 1.2143) \rightarrow
                                                 Capacity: 43 - 14 = 29
Adding Item 15 (Value/Weight: 1.0000) →
                                                 Capacity: 29 - 23 = 6
Adding Item 13 (Value/Weight: 0.8077) →
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 26 = -20
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 31 = -25
Adding Item 10 (Value/Weight: 0.8065) →
Adding Item 29 (Value/Weight: 0.7241)
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 29 = -23
Adding Item 4
                (Value/Weight: 0.6667) \rightarrow
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 12 = -6
Adding Item 2
                (Value/Weight: 0.5938) \rightarrow
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 32 = -26
Adding Item 33 (Value/Weight: 0.5714) \rightarrow
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 14 = -8
Adding Item 23 (Value/Weight: 0.5556) →
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 45 = -39
Adding Item 14 (Value/Weight: 0.5000) \rightarrow
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 20 = -14
Adding Item 16 (Value/Weight: 0.4878)
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 41 = -35
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 41 = -35
Adding Item 27 (Value/Weight: 0.4878) →
Adding Item 8
                (Value/Weight: 0.4681) \rightarrow
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 47 = -41
Adding Item 11 (Value/Weight: 0.4634) →
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 41 = -35
Adding Item 3
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 31 = -25
                (Value/Weight: 0.4194) \rightarrow
Adding Item 1
                (Value/Weight: 0.4167) \rightarrow
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 36 = -30
Adding Item 9
                (Value/Weight: 0.4138) \rightarrow
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 29 = -23
Adding Item 31 (Value/Weight: 0.3824) →
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 34 = -28
Adding Item 17 (Value/Weight: 0.3636) \rightarrow
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 44 = -38
Adding Item 20 (Value/Weight: 0.3500) →
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 20 = -14
Adding Item 5
                (Value/Weight: 0.3488) \rightarrow
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 43 = -37
Adding Item 19 (Value/Weight: 0.3404) →
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 47 = -41
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 33 = -27
Adding Item 12 (Value/Weight: 0.3333) \rightarrow
Adding Item 7
                (Value/Weight: 0.3333) \rightarrow
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 18 = -12
Adding Item 21 (Value/Weight: 0.2917) →
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 48 = -42
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 33 = -27
Adding Item 24 (Value/Weight: 0.2727) →
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 30 = -24
Adding Item 30 (Value/Weight: 0.2667) \rightarrow
Adding Item 28 (Value/Weight: 0.2500) \rightarrow
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 36 = -30
Adding Item 34 (Value/Weight: 0.2333) →
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 30 = -24
Adding Item 18 (Value/Weight: 0.1087) →
                                                 Capacity: 6 - 46 = -40
**** Total Items Added: 6
```

So, which strategy turned out to work better?

The *Less Weight First* strategy ended up working better for this scenario. I believe that the *Value/Weight Relation* strategy can work better in some other scenarios where the knapsack has a higher capacity, or the overall value and weight of the items are not that similar, a better categorization can take place with the third strategy.