

Module 8

Methods of Proof: Contradiction

↑
Indirect

Proof by Contradiction $\neg P \rightarrow F_0$

We want to prove P :

Proof by Contradiction.

- ① Claim $\neg P$
- ② Begin a direct proof of $\neg P$
- ③ Real goal: end up with two contradictory statements.
 - i) q
 - ii)
 - iii)
 - iv) $\neg q$
- ④ Recognise contradiction $(q \wedge \neg q) \Rightarrow F_0$
- ⑤ Conclusion: Because $\neg P \Rightarrow F_0$, P is true.

Ex 1: Prove $\sqrt{2}$ is irrational

$P: \sqrt{2} \notin Q \leftarrow$ set of rational numbers (P/q)

Proof by contradiction:

(i) $\sqrt{2} \in Q$

Premise.

(ii) $\exists p, q \in \mathbb{Z}$ such that $\sqrt{2} = p/q$, definition of Q

restriction

(iii) p/q is irreducible

(ii), algebra

(iv) $2 = p^2/q^2$

algebra

(v) $2q^2 = p^2$

(v), definition of even(\mathbb{Z}_E)

(vi) $p^2 \in \mathbb{Z}_E$, therefore $p \in \mathbb{Z}_E$

define

(vii) Let $K \in \mathbb{Z}$

(vi), (vii), algebra

(viii) $p = 2K$

(viii), (v), substitution

(ix) $2q^2 = (2K)^2$

Proof by contradiction
algebra

(x) $2q^2 = 4K^2$

~~Ex 2 Prove no integer is both even and odd.~~

(xi) $q^2 = 2k^2$

algebra

(xii) $q^2 \in \mathbb{Z}_E$, therefore $q \in \mathbb{Z}_E$ algebra

(xiii) P/q is reducible

(vi), (xii')

(xiv) P/q is reducible $\wedge P/q$ is irreducible

(iii), (xiii')
contradiction.

Conclusion, $\neg P \Rightarrow F_0$

Therefore P is true.

Ex2. Prove no Integer is both even and odd

~~Prove there is no integer which is both even and odd.~~

$$P: \forall n \in \mathbb{Z}, \neg(n \in \mathbb{Z}_E \wedge n \in \mathbb{Z}_o)$$

Proof by Contradiction :

$$\neg P: \neg(\forall n \in \mathbb{Z}, \neg(n \in \mathbb{Z}_E \wedge n \in \mathbb{Z}_o))$$

$$\therefore \exists n, n \in \mathbb{Z}_E \wedge n \in \mathbb{Z}_o$$

(i) $n \in \mathbb{Z}_E$

Principle

(ii) $n \in \mathbb{Z}_o$

Principle

(iii) Let $k_1, k_2 \in \mathbb{Z}$

define

(iv) $n = 2k_1, n = 2k_2 + 1$

(i), (ii), definition of odd and even

(v) $2k_1 = 2k_2 + 1$

equality.

Ex2. Prove no Integer is both even and odd

~~Prove there is no integer which is both even and odd.~~

Assume:

$$p, q \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$p-q \in \mathbb{Z}$$

$$(vi) 2k_1 - 2k_2 = 1$$

algebra

$$(vii) 2(k_1 - k_2) = 1$$

algebra, factoring

$$(viii) k_1 - k_2 = \frac{1}{2}$$

algebra

$$(ix) k_1 - k_2 \in \mathbb{Z}, k_1 - k_2 = \frac{1}{2} \notin \mathbb{Z} \quad (iii), (viii), k_1, k_2 \in \mathbb{Z}, k_1 - k_2 \in \mathbb{Z}$$

Conclusion: $\neg P \Rightarrow F_0$

Therefore, P is true.

Ex 3: Prove the hypotenuse of a right triangle is less than the sum of the lengths of the other two sides.

P: $\forall a, b, c \in \mathbb{R}^+$ such that $a^2 + b^2 = c^2$, $c < a+b$

Proof by contradiction:

$\neg P: \exists a, b, c \in \mathbb{R}^+$ such that $a^2 + b^2 = c^2$, $c \geq a+b$

ASSUMPTIONS: Pyth. Theorem

 $c^2 = a^2 + b^2$
a, b are the legs of right \triangle and c is the hypotenuse

(i) $a, b, c \in \mathbb{R}^+$

Premise

(ii) $c \geq a+b$

Premise

(iii) Let $k \in \mathbb{R}$, $k \geq 0$

Defining

(iv) $c = a+b+k$

def, (ii), (iii)

(v) $c^2 = a^2 + b^2$

Pythagoras theorem

(vi) $a^2 + b^2 = (a+b+k)^2$

(iv), (v), Substitution

(vii) $\cancel{a^2 + b^2} = \cancel{a^2 + b^2} + k^2 + 2ab + 2bk + 2ak$

algebra
Proof by contradiction

$$\begin{aligned}(a+b+k)^2 &= a^2 + b^2 + k^2 + 2ab \\ &\quad + 2ak + 2bk.\end{aligned}$$

Ex 3: Prove the hypotenuse of a right triangle is less than the sum of the lengths of the other two sides.

(viii) $O = k^2 + 2ab + 2bk + 2ak$ algebra

(ix) $a=0$ or $b=0$ algebra, assume
 $k=0$.

(x) $(a=0 \vee b=0) \wedge (a, b) \in \mathbb{R}^+$ (i), (ix), contradiction.

Conclusion

$$\neg P \rightarrow F_0$$

Therefore, P is True.

Ex 4: Prove there is an infinite number of even integers.

$$P: |\mathbb{Z}_E| = \infty$$

$$\bar{P}: \exists k \in \mathbb{Z}, |\mathbb{Z}_E| = k.$$

Proof by contradiction

$$\neg P: \exists k \in \mathbb{Z}, |\mathbb{Z}_E| = k$$

(i) because \mathbb{Z}_E is finite, $\exists z_{\max}$ largest element of \mathbb{Z}_E

Property of finite sets

(ii) $\forall z \in \mathbb{Z}, (z > z_{\max}) \rightarrow z \notin \mathbb{Z}_E$

definition of max.

$$\frac{P}{P \rightarrow q} q.$$

def^n

(iii), Property of add^n

(ii), (iv) modulus ponens

(i), definition of even set \mathbb{Z}_E .

(iii) let $z = z_{\max} + 2$

(iv) $z > z_{\max}$

(v) $| z \notin \mathbb{Z}_E$

(vi) let $k_{\max} \in \mathbb{Z}, z_{\max} = 2k_{\max}$

Ex 4: Prove there is an infinite number of even integers.

$$(vii) \quad z = 2k_{\max} + 2$$

$$(viii) \quad z = 2(k_{\max} + 1)$$

$$(ix) \quad z \in \mathbb{Z}_E$$

$$(x) \quad z \notin \mathbb{Z}_E \wedge z \in \mathbb{Z}_E$$

(vi), (iii) substitution .

(vii), factoring .

(viii), defⁿ of \mathbb{Z}_E , $k_{\max} + 1 \in \mathbb{Z}$

(v), (ix) contradiction .

Conclusion:

$\neg P \rightarrow F_0$, P is true .