THE GLOBALIZATION OF PENTECOSTAL AND CHARISMATIC CHRISTIANITY

Joel Robbins

*Department of Anthropology, University of California, San Diego, La Jolla,
California 92093-0532; email: jrobbins@weber.ucsd.edu*

Key Words   Pentecostalism, religion, cultural change, modernity

■   **Abstract**   Pentecostal-charismatic Christianity (P/c), the form of Christianity in which believers receive the gifts of the Holy Spirit, is rapidly spreading and can be counted as one of the great success stories of the current era of cultural globalization. Literature on P/c presents a paradoxical picture of the cultural dynamics accompanying its spread. Many scholars argue that P/c is markedly successful in replicating itself in canonical form everywhere it spreads, whereas others stress its ability to adapt itself to the cultures into which it is introduced. Authors thus use P/c to support both theories that construe globalization as a process of Westernizing homogenization and those that understand it as a process of indigenizing differentiation. This review argues that approaches to P/c globalization need to recognize that P/c posesses cultural features that allow it, in most cases, to work in both ways at once. After considering definitional and historical issues and explanations for P/c's spread, the review examines how P/c culture at once preserves its distinctness from the cultures into which it comes into contact and engages those cultures on their own terms. Also discussed are the conceptions that allow P/c to establish locally run and supported institutions in a wide range of settings. A final section considers the nature of the culture P/c, in its homogenizing guise, introduces, examining that culture's relation to modernity and its effects on converts' ideas about gender, politics, and economics.

INTRODUCTION

The form of Christianity in which believers receive the gifts of the Holy Spirit and have ecstatic experiences such as speaking in tongues, healing, and prophesying is one of the great success stories of the current era of cultural globalization. Commonly called Pentecostal-charismatic Christianity (P/c), its origin can be traced to early twentieth-century developments within Christianity in the West, particularly in North America. Yet despite its originally Western provenience, just a hundred years after its birth two thirds of P/c's 523 million adherents live outside the West in areas such as Africa, Latin America, Asia, and Oceania, as do most of the nine million people who convert to it each year (Barrett & Johnson 2002,

p. 284). Although some question these statistics (Corten 1997, p. 313; Levine 1995, p. 157; Stoll 1990, p. 6), even conservative estimates see the P/c movement as having at least 250 million adherents worldwide, and all agree that its most explosive growth has occurred in the southern hemisphere (Martin 2002, p. xvii). This growth has made P/c the "the most dynamic and fastest growing sector of Protestant Christianity worldwide" and one that many predict will soon surpass Catholicism "to become the predominant global form of Christianity of the 21st century" (Casanova 2001, p. 435).

P/c's success as a globalizing movement is attested to not only by its rapid growth, but also by the range of social contexts to which it has spread. Appearing throughout the world in urban and rural areas, among emerging middle classes and, most spectacularly, among the poor, it has been deeply engaged by many populations that otherwise remain only peripherally or tenuously involved with other global cultural forms. As such, P/c represents a paradigm case of a global cultural flow that starts historically in the West and expands to cover the globe.

In recent decades anthropologists and other scholars have begun to register the global impact of P/c. A number of edited volumes taking regional or comparative approaches have appeared (Boudewijnse et al. 1998, Cleary & Stewart-Gambino 1997, Coleman 2002a, Corten & Marshall-Fratani 2001b, Dow & Sandstrom 2001, Garrard-Burnett & Stoll 1993, Glazier 1980, Hunt et al. 1997b, Poewe 1994, Robbins et al. 2001), as have several widely read synthetic accounts (Brouwer et al. 1996; Cox 1995; Hollenweger 1972, 1997; Jenkins 2002; Martin 1990, 2002). All of these works make the global spread of P/c central to their discussions. What is striking, however, is the apparently paradoxical picture these and other works present of the spread of P/c as a cultural process. On the one hand, many argue that P/c consistently replicates its doctrines, organizational features, and rituals in canonical, Western form wherever it is introduced. Lehmann (2003, p. 121), for example, notes that P/c churches are "notoriously uniform across the globe" and that they display a "radical similarity of practice" despite the radical "dissimilarity" of the contexts in which they appear (see also Berger 1990, p. vii; Brouwer et al. 1996, p. 179; Coleman 2000, p. 67; d'Epinay 1969, p. xxxii; Lehmann 1996, p. 8; Lyon 2000, p. 102; Meyer 1999a, p. 159; Olson 2001, p. 24; Robbins 2001a; Smilde 1997, p. 347). On the other hand, many authors, including many of those who remark on P/c's ability to replicate itself successfully in different cultures, stress that converts are quick to indigenize P/c forms of Christianity, and they credit these churches with a remarkable ability to adapt themselves to the cultures into which they are introduced (Bastian 1993, Manning 1980). In terms of debates on cultural globalization, then, P/c appears to weigh in both for theories that stress processes of Western cultural domination and homogenization and those that emphasize the transformative power of indigenous appropriation and differentiation (Robbins 2003).

In response to such seemingly contradictory assertions, it is hard to dispute Corten's (1997) claim that the study of the cultural processes underlying P/c's spread has been beset by a "lack of precision" (p. 321). As an initial remedy, one

might be tempted to refuse the distinction between indigenizing differentiation and globalizing homogenization and instead construe the globalization of Pentecostalism as a prime example of a widespread kind of cultural hybridization poorly captured by either of these alternatives. Yet, in reviewing the P/c literature, it is more productive to note how important these two frameworks of interpretation have been and ask what about P/c Christianity leads it to globalize in a way that appears to fit both of them (cf. Casanova 2001). Following Droogers' (2001) call that scholars attend to the "specific characteristics of Pentecostalism" (p. 41) in discussing its globalization, I assume that specific elements of P/c culture have steered its globalization in this paradoxical direction. After a section defining P/c and briefly recounting its history, and another considering explanations for its growth, I focus on issues of globalization in three sections: one on world-breaking that examines how P/c introduces its own cultural logics while also preserving those of people's traditional cultures; a second on world-making that considers how P/c's globally diffused cultural form establishes churches that are organizationally local and responsive to local cultural concerns; and a third that takes up the relation of P/c to the globalization of modernity by examining its impact in the three well-studied spheres of gender relations, political engagement, and economic behavior.

HISTORICAL AND DEFINITIONAL ISSUES

There is little standardization in social scientific usages of terms such as Pentecostal and charismatic, and several scholars have worried that these terms have become so broad as to be meaningless (Corten & Marshall-Fratani 2001b, p. 4; Droogers 2001, p. 46; Kamsteeg 1998, pp. 10–11). The problem stems from at least two sources. First, all of the terms social scientists use as analytic categories (Pentecostalism, charismatic Christianity, fundamentalism, evangelicalism, etc.) are also folk terms possessed of a wide range of meanings (Kamsteeg 1998, pp. 9–10). Scholars often employ the folk terms used by the groups they study, mistakenly assuming that local meanings will be widely understood by those working elsewhere. In the literature on Spanish-speaking Latin America, for example, scholars often translate the folk term *evangélico* as "evangelical" even when it is clear that the groups they are discussing are best understood, for comparative purposes, as P/c (Annis 1987, p. 76; Brusco 1995, pp. 14–15; Kamsteeg 1998, pp. 9–10; Smilde 1998, p. 287).

A second reason for terminological confusion among social scientists is their lack of attention to P/c's history. Although a basic historical sketch cannot solve all definitional problems, it can establish some useful terminological parameters.

Pentecostalism's roots lie in the Protestant evangelical tradition that grew out of the eighteenth–century, Anglo-American revival movement known as the Great Awakening. Evangelical Christianity, which includes such denominations as Methodists and Baptists, is marked by its emphasis on conversion. People are

not born into the evangelical faith but must "voluntarily" choose it on the basis of powerful conversion experiences (often glossed as being "born again"). Because evangelicals believe this experience is available to everyone, they strongly emphasize the importance of evangelistic efforts to convert others. They also hold the Bible in high regard as a text possessed of the highest religious authority and often endeavor to read it in what they take to be literal terms (Noll 2001).

During the nineteenth century, Methodism was the most important evangelical denomination in North America. It was distinguished from others by its doctrine of "Christian perfection" or "sanctification." This doctrine holds that the saved will experience a "second blessing" or "second work of grace" after that of conversion during which the inbred sin people carry, owing to Adam's fall, is removed. In the second half of the nineteenth century, a largely Methodist Holiness movement arose around groups that experimented with different understandings of the nature and number of postconversion experiences that affected a person's salvation. Some Holiness groups understood sanctification, often referred to as "baptism in the Holy Spirit," as the removal of sin, though others saw it as giving converts an "endeument of power" for Christian service, particularly for evangelism. To these ideas, Holiness followers added a commitment to a form of Christian millenarianism known as dispensational premillennialism and an emphasis on faith healing (Anderson 1979; Synan 1997; Wacker 1988, pp. 935–36).

Pentecostalism was born from the ferment of Holiness efforts to work out a stable form of frankly supernatural and experientially robust Christianity around the notion of the second blessing of the Spirit. Its primary innovation was to see speaking in tongues as the necessary "initial physical evidence" of Spirit baptism. Credit for this innovation belongs to Charles Fox Parham, a Holiness preacher who made it central to his teaching from 1900 on. William Seymour, an African American itinerant holiness preacher from Louisiana, was one of his students. After a brief period of study, Seymour moved to Los Angles in 1906, where he eventually opened a ministry in an abandoned African Methodist Episcopal Church on Azusa Street. The revival his Asuza Street preaching initiated is widely recognized as the birth of Pentecostalism.

The Asuza Street revival lasted from 1906 to 1909. Along with the doctrine of tongues, Seymour and others promoted a model of ecstatic Christian life based on the experience of the Apostles during the original Pentecost as reported in Acts 2. Synan (1997, p. 98) describes the scene at Asuza Street:

> Men and women would shout, weep, dance, fall into trances, speak and sing in tongues, and interpret their messages into English. In true Quaker fashion, anyone who felt "moved by the Spirit" would preach or sing. There was no robed choir, no hymnals, no order of services, but there was an abundance of religious enthusiasm.

This pattern of enthusiastic worship, relatively unscripted and egalitarian in offering the floor to all those who the Spirit calls, is the one observers would find all over the world by the end of the twentieth century.

Aside from its emphasis on tongues, Pentecostal doctrine bears much in common with that of the Holiness tradition from which it developed. Sometimes described as the fourfold, foursquare, or "full gospel" pattern of Pentecostal theology, it stresses that (*a*) Jesus offers salvation; (*b*) Jesus heals; (*c*) Jesus baptizes with the Holy Spirit; (*d*) Jesus is coming again (Dayton 1987, pp. 19–23). Along with a strict moralism, these are the core Pentecostal doctrines, and they are the elements of the religion that have proved immensely portable, seemingly able to enter any number of cultural contexts without losing their basic shape.[1]

From the beginning of the revival, Pentecostalism rapidly spread throughout the world and in time established such major denominations as the Assemblies of God (AOG), the Church of God in Christ, and the Church of God (Cleveland), as well as such para-church organizations as the Full Gospel Business Men's Fellowship International. The most momentous event in the history of P/c after Asuza Street came around 1960 with the opening up of the mainline Protestant churches to the gifts of the Spirit. Prior to this time, members of non-Pentecostal churches who experienced Spirit baptism, spoke in tongues, or received other gifts of the Spirit were usually compelled to leave their churches and join Pentecostal ones. But once what became known as the neo-Pentecostal or charismatic movement began to spread, those who had received gifts of the Spirit retained membership in mainline churches and often formed charismatic subgroups within them. By 1970, it was estimated that 10% of clergy and one million lay members of mainline Protestant churches had received the baptism of the Spirit (Synan 1997, p. 233). And in 1967, the charismatic movement also entered Catholicism, and Catholics who received the gifts of the Spirit began staying in their churches and calling themselves Pentecostal or charismatic Catholics (Csordas 1994, McGuire 1982). In keeping with this history, the term charismatic Christian has come to refer to members of non-Pentecostal denominations who believe the gifts of the Spirit are available to contemporary believers.

Since 1970, the charismatic movement has spawned a large number of what many call third-wave or neo-charismatic churches (Miller 1997; Synan 1997, pp. 271–72). Often independent of larger denominations, these churches affirm the availability of the gifts of the Spirit but refuse either the Pentecostal or charismatic label.

The charismatic and neo-charismatic movements differ in several ways from what has come to be called classical Pentecostalism. They often drop the requirement that one speak in tongues to prove one's Spirit baptism and moderate the ascetic moralism of the classical Pentecostal churches, some even allowing members to drink wine or wear jewelry (Synan 1997, pp. 253–54). Both changes are

---

[1]Of the core doctrines, millenarianism is the most variable in its presence in different historical and cultural milieus (Dayton 1987, p. 33). In some places, such as Oceania (Douglas 2001), it is very prominent, whereas in other places, such as Africa and Latin America, it is less so. Finding explanations for the pattern of its presence and absence both historically and cross-culturally is an outstanding issue in Pentecostal studies.

correlated with a generally higher-social-class location, as these movements draw primarily from the established or emerging middle classes of the societies in which they are located (Freston 1997, pp. 187–88; Hallum 2002, p. 227; Hunt et al. 1997b, p. 7; Ojo 1988).

Possessed of middle-class leadership with the educational and financial resources to formulate and project their own visions, the charismatic and neo-charismatic movements have proven to be hotbeds for doctrinal innovation, and many new ideas generated within them play important roles in the contemporary globalization of P/c. For example, the Faith Movement, which promotes the "health and wealth" or "prosperity" gospel, has spread a set of doctrines promising believers both physical health and material success on earth (Coleman 2000, 2002b). North American in origin, the movement has had striking success in parts of Europe, Africa, and Latin America (Corten & Marshall-Fratani 2001b, Gifford 2001, Hunt 2000). Another neo-Charismatic doctrine enjoying worldwide popularity is that of spiritual warfare, which encourages believers to view daily life as dominated by an ongoing struggle between God and local, demonic "territorial spirits," and which often promotes rituals of "deliverance" designed to rid believers of demonic influence (DeBernardi 1999, Gifford 2001, Stritecky 2001).

This historical account has barely touched on the wide variation in aspects of P/c church structure, doctrine, and practice. The great range of churches grouped under the P/c rubric needs to be remembered when evaluating statistics on the size of the P/c movement. It also raises the question of whether it makes analytic sense to lump all of these churches together. Many scholars assume that it does make sense on the basis of their common features, most notably their shared emphasis on ecstatic experiences that are available to all believers. This review takes this tack and tests the value of treating P/c churches as members of a single category for the purpose of examining how they have globalized. Yet as Willems (1967, p. 257) noted long ago, there is also room for work that looks comparatively at what distinguishes churches within the movement, and systematic social scientific (as opposed to theological) work in this area has hardly begun (see Chesnut 1997; Englund 2001; Kamsteeg 1998, p. 234; Lehmann 2001; Marshall 1993).

As broad a category as P/c is, it should be distinguished from Christian fundamentalism. Pentecostalism and fundamentalism both are elements of the broader evangelical movement and both emerged in the early twentieth century. As such, they share general evangelical features such as conversionism, respect for the Bible, and ascetic tendencies. These similarities sometimes lead even well-informed scholars to treat Pentecostalism as a branch of fundamentalism (e.g., Stoll 1990, p. 49). But even as it makes sense in some analytic contexts for scholars to group P/c and Christian Fundamentalism together as brands of conservative Christianity (Woodberry & Smith 1998), it is both a historical and an analytic mistake to assume they are the same (Cox 1997; Freston 2001, p. 288; Hackett 1995, p. 200; Spittler 1994).

On the historical side, fundamentalists, relying on the widespread doctrine that the gifts of the Spirit ceased to be available to people after they were given

to the Apostles during the original Pentecost, from the outset firmly rejected Pentecostalism (Cox 1995, pp. 74–76; Spittler 1994, pp. 108–10). Fundamentalists today cling to this rejection (e.g., Harding 2000, pp. 19, 140–41). Less concerned with boundary maintenance, Pentecostals are not as vociferous in their rejection of fundamentalism, but they too recognize the distinction.

Scholars have yet to determine the precise historical reasons for the fundamentalist rejection of Pentecostalism (Riesebrodt 1993). However, several analysts point to cultural differences between the two movements that suggest reasons for their incompatibility and indicate the analytic reasons it is useful to distinguish them. Cox (1995) distinguishes between "fundamentalist" religions focused on doctrinal purity and "experientialist" ones that stress the ability of followers to experience the transcendent. Although he argues that these two tendencies struggle for dominance in contemporary P/c, he admits that historically P/c has been experientialist, and others have used this distinction to distinguish P/c from fundamentalist Christianity (Corten 1997, p. 312; Corten & Marshal-Fratani 2001b, p. 5; Cox 1995, pp. 310, 319). Riesebrodt (1993, pp. 45–46) offers a second distinction, noting that fundamentalists take as the sign of their salvation their ability to live by a strict ethical code, a stance challenged by P/c Christians who find their assurance in ecstatic experience (see also Ammerman 1987). Finally, Martin (1990, 2002) notes that fundamentalists aim to remake the political sphere along religious lines, whereas P/c Christians tend to withdraw from politics and thus to respect the modern separation of church and state. For Martin, this is part of a broader argument that fundamentalists react against modernity, whereas P/c Christians find ways to work within it.

EXPLAINING P/c GROWTH: BEYOND DEPRIVATION AND DISORGANIZATION

The rapid growth and worldwide spread of P/c regularly inspire scholars to ask why it attracts so many converts. Their answers routinely deploy broad sociological arguments about the role of deprivation and anomie in fostering the growth of ecstatic, sectarian, and millenarian religious movements. This section focuses on what such explanations overlook, suggesting that those who use them ignore important aspects of P/c culture and that their narrow emphasis on explaining the *why* of conversion leads them to disregard the question of *how* P/c transforms the cultures into which it is introduced.

This is not to say that deprivation and disorganization arguments are without value. The majority of Azusa Street converts, like the majority of converts in Latin America, Africa, and elsewhere, have been rural migrants to cities, people at the lower end of the social class scale, or rural stay-at-homes displaced from the center of their own worlds by social change (Martin 1990, pp. 190–91). To displaced people, unsure of their social links and morally adrift, P/c's formation of tight communities around a high-intensity, time-consuming ritual life (services in these

churches rarely last less that two hours and sometimes go most of the night) and a collectively policed ascetic moral code surely provides a social foundation and sense of direction. To the deprived, those who feel they are not getting their lot in life, P/c offers ecstatic escape, hope for millennial redress, and an egalitarian environment in which everyone is eligible for the highest religious rewards (i.e., salvation and the gifts of the Spirit). Many of the early classics in P/c history and ethnography convincingly deployed these kinds of disorganization and deprivation arguments (e.g., Anderson 1979, d'Epinay 1969, Willems 1967), and these arguments have become so much the common sense of the P/c literature that most works draw on them at least implicitly.

Yet even as deprivation and disorganization arguments are regularly used, they are widely criticized in the P/c literature, and beyond, for attempting to explain a narrower phenomenon (conversion) with a wider one (absolute or felt deprivation or anomie) and for the tautological ways scholars often deploy them (making the fact of conversion the proof of prior experiences of deprivation or anomie) (Chesnut 1997; Gerlach & Hine 1970; Hine 1974; Heelas & Haglund-Heelas 1988; Holston 1999; Hunt 2002a,b; Wacker 1982). Scholars also have taken these arguments to task for failing to give a place to native models of the conversion process (Brodwin 2003, 87; Levine 1995, p. 166; Wacker 2001, p. 60). Even in the face of such criticisms, no one denies that these explanations do tell part of the conversion story in many cases. Yet these criticisms do reveal that there are aspects of P/c Christianity other than those highlighted by deprivation and disorganization arguments, and they suggest that in many cases these neglected aspects of P/c Christianity are important for understanding its growth and global development.

Foremost among these neglected aspects is the paramount importance P/c churches place on evangelization, encouraging all members to act as evangelists working to convert others. The emphasis on outreach was apparent from the start of the movement, with visitors to Asuza Street carrying the message all over North America and the world almost from the outset of the revival (Cox 1995, pp. 101–2, McGee 2001, p. 73). The P/c emphasis on evangelism is also a mainstay of the cross-cultural literature, in which reports of recent converts becoming evangelists are common, and a pattern has been well established in which the movement spreads by indigenous channels (e.g., local evangelists, street-corner preaching, returning labor migrants) as soon as a first group has converted (Annis 1987, pp. 77, 106; Bowen 1996, p. 41; Chesnut 1997, pp. 138–39; Kamsteeg 1998, p. 68; d'Epinay 1969, p. 55; Lehmann 2001, p. 63; Stoll 1990; Martin 1990, p. 121).

Given that evangelization is the most important activity in P/c culture, as d'Epinay (1969, p. 55) and Blumhofer (1993, pp. 208–9) argue, one can say that the culture is rationalized around the value accorded to it. On the level of doctrine, such rationalization in evident in the belief that anyone inspired by the Spirit can evangelize regardless of educational qualifications, a belief that encourages all converts to see themselves as evangelists (Willems 1967). The Spirit is also expected to sustain evangelists, and all over the world people "go out on faith" as

missionaries and evangelists, asking for no funding from their home congregations and assuming that if they are truly inspired they will succeed in building churches whose tithes will sustain them (Blumhofer 1993; Stoll 1990, p. 127; Wacker 2001, pp. 130–31).

The egalitarianism of P/c doctrine also supports evangelical efforts as it aids evangelists in attracting a following. Led by an African American preacher and attended by many whites, Asians, and Latinos the Azusa Street mission was, at its outset, strikingly integrated, and on the assumption that all are equal when used by the Spirit it was notable for its openness to letting African Americans and women speak at services (Anderson 1979, p. 69; Synan 1997, p. 99; Wacker 2001, pp. 103–5, 144). Although racial divisions were reinstated in North America as the Pentecostal church grew, P/c has continued to feature its egalitarian inspirational logic both in its outreach, which is often to the poor or otherwise marginalized, and in the life it offers its converts, who are encouraged to see their most important identity not as one of class, race, gender, or ethnicity, but as children of God (Burdick 1998, p. 123; Freston 1998, p. 81; Robbins 1998). Burdick (1993, p. 172) highlights the force of P/c egalitarianism as an evangelistic tool, noting that in Brazil *negros* are flattered when light-skinned evangelists speak to them on the street, and if they attend church they are further impressed by the number of negros in the congregation, some serving as preachers. From the point of view of evangelism, P/c egalitarianism both makes the field of potential converts truly universal and serves as an important ground for appealing to the unconverted.

To the doctrinal factors that fit P/c for evangelization must be added the contribution of P/c's distinctive social organization. P/c Christians are a far-flung network of people held together by their publications and other media productions, conferences, revival meetings, and constant travel. Gerlach & Hine (1970), the first to give this point due emphasis, describe the organization of global P/c as decentralized, segmentary, and reticulate. It is characterized both by a lack of centralized authority able to question the propriety of local evangelical efforts and by a web-like structure of personal connections that allows members to easily find support in new locales they enter for evangelical purposes. Histories of early Pentecostalism are rich in data on how these networks functioned to promote evangelism (e.g., Blumhofer 1993, Synan 1997), and similar networks today support the globe-trotting efforts of well-known evangelists and the more limited but equally important evangelizing circuits of countless lesser-known P/c Christians operating at all scales throughout the world. Coleman (2000) examines in detail the shape of one of these networks and the conferences, media productions, and ideas about language and exchange that underpin it (see also Csordas 1992). Further work is needed on how such networks function and particularly on the role P/c uses of media have played and continue to play within them (Anderson 1979, Hackett 1998).

Turning from evangelism, another factor in P/c's success often underplayed in deprivation and disorganization accounts is the appeal of its ritual life. As Brouwer et al. (1996) state, "one of the greatest appeals of the new Pentecostal groups is

the manner of worship. Services appear spontaneous, experiential and exuberant" (p. 179). They have an eventful quality, with people waiting to see what the Spirit will do (Corten 1999, pp. 42–43; d'Epinay 1969, pp. 52–53), and they often erase older boundaries between worship and leisure (Burdick 1993, p. 87). Many people are compelled to attend services, revivals, and other ritualized gatherings by a "spiritual acquisitiveness" generated in them that presses believers "relentlessly on to the next experience" (Blumhofer 1993, pp. 210–11). These ecstatic rituals clearly are, in part, a counterpoint to the ascetic lives converts are enjoined to live outside of religious contexts, and their structures frequently reiterate the alternation of control and release (Kiernan 1976; McGuire 1982; Robbins 2004; Stringer 1999, p. 159; cf. Thompson 1966, pp. 368–69). Further examination of P/c ritual life focused on the ways it engages issues of the management liberation and constraint in the face of modernizing cultural change would be valuable. Yet despite its widely acknowledged importance, detailed study of P/c ritual is notably scarce in the literature. From an anthropological perspective, it represents probably the greatest lacuna in the work done thus far.

A final explanation for the rapid global spread of P/c Christianity neglected in deprivation and disorganization accounts begins with the argument that African religious elements, as mediated through African American culture, have been part of P/c's composition from the outset (MacRobert 1988). Hollenweger (1984, p. 405), the dean of Pentecostal historians, singles out the "black roots" of P/c as the most important reason for P/c's growth. These roots show in P/c's "orality of liturgy," "narrativity of theology and witness," emphasis on participation, use of dreams and visions in worship, and model of mind/body correspondence that promotes healing by prayer. Other influential scholars have developed related ideas to suggest that P/c Christianity expands because it is connected to "a kind of primal spirituality" made up of "archetypal modes of worship, elements that lie close to the surface in some cultures but are buried more deeply in others" (Cox 1995, pp. 101–2; Martin 1990). From an anthropological perspective, these arguments skate close to a kind of generic primitivism and at least implicitly invoke binaries the discipline no longer charters.

Yet even as most anthropologists step back from the "mythic" framings of these arguments (Corten 1997, pp. 313, 321), it is important to recognize that many of them promulgate similar forms of cultural explanation when they assert that P/c proves attractive to people around the world because it embraces enchanted and ecstatic cultural forms very much like their own. Such claims underwrite much of the work that sees P/c as highly malleable and quick to localize because it is extraordinarily open to syncretizing with indigenous forms of worship.

On close inspection, however, these more anthropologically acceptable arguments often prove to be as troublesomely broad and insensitive to the nuances of cultural dynamics as their less acceptable cousins. To begin with, they assume ecstatic experience is generic, such that, for example, possession is possession regardless of its cultural framings. They also overlook the very conscious antisyncretism of most P/c adherents, who are quick to point out that any resemblance

between P/c and traditional practice is illusory (Corten 1997, p. 312; Dombrowski 2001, p. 153). Finally, they fail to register the sense in which P/c accepts local enchanted cosmologies only to attack them, thus profoundly altering the way they are understood (e.g., Maxwell 1999, pp. 195–96; Robbins 2003, p. 223). These and related cultural dynamics, dynamics that arguments for easy local cultural assimilation based on similarity often overlook, are precisely what give P/c cultural globalization its distinct profile, and they are the focus of the next section.

WORLD-BREAKING: DUALISM, ASCETICISM, AND ONTOLOGICAL PRESERVATION

Martin (1990) argues that the P/c symbolic world is "integrated around the key notion of transformation" (p. 163). True in almost all cases,[2] the kind of transformation involved is a radical one that separates people both from their pasts and from the surrounding social world. This is why Burdick (1993) calls P/c not just a "cult of transformation" but also one of "discontinuity" (p. 224). Converts are routinely enjoined, as Meyer (1998) found in Ghana, to make a complete break with their pasts, and as Gill (1990, p. 714) reports from Bolivia they sharply distinguish between their pre- and postconversion lives. Similarly, once they make the break, they keep themselves separate from the surrounding social world by adhering to an ascetic moral code that prohibits most of its pleasures and figures it as a realm governed by Satan.

P/c discourse is littered with images of rupture and discontinuity. This emphasis on discontinuity is an important part of how P/c globalizes. Its commitment to schemes of discontinuous transformation effectively makes it, as Dombrowski (2001) aptly puts it, a culture "against culture." All conversionist religions share this concern for transformation to some extent. But the literature suggests four ways the P/c approach to transformation is distinctive: P/c elaborately ritualizes discontinuity; it maintains discontinuity through an ascetic code embedded in a thoroughgoing dualism of great hermeneutic force; it preserves that which it breaks from; and its dualism provides a flexible language of satanic influence that is very sensitive to local social concerns. I address each of these topics in turn.

Baptism is an important ritual of discontinuity in Christian traditions that emphasize adult conversion, and it is in P/c as well (Maxwell 1999, p. 68). Yet P/c also offers a host of postconversion rituals aimed at deepening the break made at conversion. Thoroughgoing in their emphasis on disjunction, these varied rites

---

[2]Though not discussed in detail here, the one exception would be charismatic Catholicism, for which McGuire (1982, p. 50) notes an emphasis on continuity in the rhetoric of conversion, and Csordas (1994) offers accounts of rituals for healing memories and healing ancestry that recuperate the past. In this emphasis on continuity, charismatic Catholicism is likely influenced by a tendency in this direction in Catholicism more generally (Burdick 1993, p. 151; Lester 2003).

can be grouped as "rituals of rupture" that ground the P/c concern with discontinuity in ritually effective action (Robbins 2003, pp. 224–27). The baptism of the Spirit, understood as annulling the influence of Adam's sin, is perhaps the prototype. Other examples of formal techniques P/c has developed to help people break with their pasts include the deliverance rituals by which Ewe Pentecostals in Ghana seek to rid themselves of the demonic influences brought upon them by the traditional ritual practices of their unconverted kin (Meyer 1998, 1999b), and the ritualized practices of "spiritual warfare" by which communities attempt to rid themselves of territorial spirits they engaged with in the past (DeBernardi 1999, p. 86; Robbins 2003, p. 226). There are also rituals of rupture that drive a wedge between converts and the contemporary social world. Sessions aimed at Spiritual "in-filling" and tongue speaking that aim to "seal off" Malawian Pentecostals from the society around them and the evil forces that it harbors (e.g., witchcraft) are a good example (van Dijk 1998), as are in a mundane way the numerous lengthy church services and prayer group meetings that P/c Christians everywhere attend in lieu of participating in their communities' non-P/c social lives.

These rituals of rupture must be understood in the context of the dualistic schemes P/c regularly establishes to define the ruptures it produces. In the first instance, P/c dualism divides the world into those whose lives are directed by God and those who follow the devil (Droogers 2001, p. 46). But the divine and the satanic operate in this scheme as symbols with an open-ended range of referents so that in some places or contexts their opposition comes to figure the opposition between the past and the present (Meyer 1998, Robbins 2004, Tuzin 1997), whereas in others it provides an understanding of the differences between the church and the world, or the public and private realms (Brusco 1995; Chesnut 1997, p. 125). P/c dualism also brings itself to bear on action through its moral codes, which ban contact with the satanic world by forbidding drinking and drug use, extramarital sexuality, fighting and aggressive displays, gambling, ostentatious dress, and participation in secular entertainments such as cinema and dancing (Brodwin 2003, p. 88; Wacker 2001, p. 122). The asceticism these codes enjoin provides people with guides for living with the ruptures P/c ritual and dualism create. Some analysts suggest that their reorientations of people's moral fields are one of the most important aspects of P/c cultural transformation (Austin-Broos 1997; Brodwin 2003; Levine 1995, pp. 171–72; Mariz 1994, p. 8, 1998; Marshall 1993, p. 234; Robbins 2004).

P/c dualism also brings about what is perhaps P/c's most distinctive quality in comparison with other forces for cultural change: its tendency to preserve peoples' beliefs concerning the reality and power of the spiritual worlds from which they have broken. P/c preserves these beliefs in the sense of accepting their cognitive claims concerning the existence of spiritual forces, but it does not retain the "normative presuppositions" about the moral value of the spiritual world that often accompany them (Mariz 1994, p. 68; Csordas 1992, p. 6). By a process of demonization, P/c makes indigenous spirits representatives of the devil (Meyer 1999b). Having demonized the indigenous spirit world, P/c dualism then leads people to

devote much of their energy to struggling against it, an activity that has the effect of further proving its existence and demonstrating its relevance to postconversion life (Casanova 2001, pp. 437–38; Corten 1999, p. 36; van Dijk 1997; Werbner 1998a, pp. 11–14).

P/c's preservation of indigenous spiritual ontologies and, most importantly, its continued ritual engagement with the spirits that populate them distinguishes it from other forms of Christianity (Casanova 2001, pp. 437–38; Meyer 1999b) and from other sorts of globalizing projects, such as development (Marshall-Fratani 1998, p. 291). Through such preservation, P/c avails itself of locally meaningful idioms for talking about the past and about current social problems—for spirits always are a language for talking about broader concerns. This openness to local spiritual languages allows P/c dualism to operate differently and mean different things in different places (cf. Corten & Marshall-Fratani 2001b, p. 10). Among the Ewe of Ghana it is an idiom for breaking from kin relations (Meyer 1999b). Among young urban preachers in Malawi, it is the gerontocratic power structure and the witchcraft it controls against which one must struggle (van Dijk 1992, 1995, 1998; see also Maxwell 1999 on Zimbabwe). In many parts of Latin America, it is the male prestige sphere of drink, adultery, and popular Catholic ritual investment that represents the realm of Satan (Annis 1987; Brusco 1995; Burdick 1993, 114; Chesnut 1997), though in others, Satan's domain is also represented for young people by the demonic attractions of a youth culture focused on sexuality and status competition (Burdick 1993), the lures of the drug trade (Lehmann 2001, p. 65), or the domination of traditional elites (Bastian 1993, pp. 46–47). Among the Tlingit and Haida of Southeast Alaska, the demonization of traditional culture provides an idiom for contesting emerging socio-conomic differences (Dombrowski 2001). In these and other cases, the demonized content shows great variation as P/c followers construct it out of local social concerns. Yet even as it absorbs local content, P/c dualism also maintains its globally recognizable shape as a struggle between the divine and the demonic (Barker 2001, 107).

Understanding that this struggle, although similar in form everywhere, is so diverse in content, we can appreciate why investigators often say of P/c that it is both "radically antisyncretic" and "profoundly localized" (DeBernardi 1999, p. 77); that it "is often most indigenous when inveighing against the local most strongly" (Gifford 2001, p. 74); or, finally, that regarding P/c churches "it is in their very struggle against local culture that they prove how locally rooted they are" (Casanova 2001, p. 438). P/c localizes not by fitting into indigenous cultures via some sort of syncretic melding prepared by its "primal" qualities, but by accepting as real local spirit worlds and the problems they represent. This allows P/c converts to turn their new religion immediately to addressing local issues in locally comprehensible terms.

This section has picked apart the tangle that has developed around discussions of P/c globalization that represent it both as a prime example of a homogenizing cultural force and as one of the Western cultural forms most susceptible to localization. If read carefully, the literature shows that P/c's homogenizing force is in

large part based on its emphasis on rupture, dualism, and moral asceticism. These features encourage believers to distinguish P/c from what they come to see as their traditional culture and to work to keep the two separate, thus leading believers to maintain relatively canonical versions of P/c itself. Its localization is also a product of its dualism. Although that dualism is antisyncretic, it does lead to the preservation of local ontologies and the social concerns they reflect, albeit as resituated within P/c as an aspect of the demonic world. The resulting cultural formation is a particular kind of hybrid in which the parts of the mixture are kept distinct despite the relations that exist between them (Robbins 2004). The nature of this hybrid accounts for why global and local features appear with equal intensity within P/c cultures.

WORLD-MAKING: INSTITUTIONAL PRODUCTIVITY AND THE LOCALIZATION OF RELIGIOUS AUTHORITY

When scholars refer to P/c as localized, they often have in mind its engagement with local ontologies. Yet frequently they are also making a point about the way the governance of P/c churches tends to be in local hands. P/c churches are often local from the start, having been created by evangelists with local roots. Even when they are part of major Pentecostal denominations such as the AOG, local churches tend to be run by local people. Where the church is dominated by foreign missionaries from non-P/c groups, charismatic revivals often provide "a handy and effective means for local indigenous Christian leaders to break free of domination by missions" and make their churches effectively local regardless of their denominational embeddedness (Bays 1993, p. 175; Robbins 2001b). In most cases, then, P/c churches are staffed from top to bottom with locals who constitute them as institutions responsive to local situations. The question this raises is that of how P/c lends itself so readily to generating locally constructed and operated institutions.

The answer is rooted in the cultural assumptions that make P/c a tool for producing institutions inexpensively and with local materials. One of these assumptions, previously mentioned, is that believers do not need special education to preach or run a church; only Spiritual inspiration is required (d'Epinay 1969, p. 75; Stoll 1990, p. 13; Willems 1967, p. 136). The lack of prerequisite credentials for leadership gives nascent P/c churches a large pool of potential local talent from which to draw. And most converts are given an opportunity to serve in some capacity, since P/c churches sport numerous lay preachers, deacons, and leaders of various men's, women's, and youth groups (D'Epinay 1969, p. 49). Blacking (1981) writes of the South African Zionist church, "the general principle seemed to be that as many members as possible should have an opportunity of holding positions . . ." (p. 45), and even in the large, highly structured AOG church studied by Chesnut (1997, p. 135) in Brazil, 79.5% of the people he interviewed had held church office. By letting so many members occupy formal roles, P/c churches mobilize large numbers of local people in their institution-building efforts.

P/c churches also successfully demand heavy participation from members, who attend church services, meetings, and home Bible studies and participate in evangelization efforts. Chesnut's (1997, p. 141) quantitative data again is telling: the Brazilians he studied participated in an average of 4.7 church activities per week. Such high involvement keeps local P/c institutions active and stable (Gill 1990; Willems 1967, p. 168).

The requirement to tithe and give offerings is another aspect of P/c culture that fosters its ability to create local institutions (Mariz 1994, p. 73). d'Epinay (1969, p. 54) claims that tithing maintains the local autonomy of P/c churches in Chile. Other researchers argue that poor members find in tithing a way to experience the power of occupying the donor role, thereby furthering their sense of involvement in the church (Chesnut 1997, p. 119; Corten 1999, p. 59).

These features of P/c culture give "the tools of association to everyone" and create local social worlds possessed of strong institutional grounding (Levine 1995, p. 169). This institutional productivity is crucial to P/c's value because many of the places where it flourishes are, as Martin (1998, pp. 117–18, after Lash & Urry 1994) puts it, experiencing an "institutional deficit." Comaroff & Comaroff (2003) similarly suggest that P/c-like movements flourish where "neoliberal forces have eroded the capacity of liberal democratic states to provide education, health and welfare..." (p. 121). In such situations, P/c can quickly establish locally run and funded institutions that provide their own manner of health, job placement, and educational services (Chesnut 1997; Marshall 1993, p. 225; Willems 1967). The community-building success of P/c churches is of course a mainstay of deprivation and disorganization accounts of its appeal. But it is also important to note that this success is rooted in ideas of Spiritual empowerment, institutional commitment, and religious generosity, which distinguish P/c from other globalizing cultural forms.

P/c FORMATIONS OF GENDER, POLITICS, AND ECONOMICS

This review has focused thus far on aspects of P/c culture that allow it to engage local cultures and establish local institutions. But P/c's other tendency—to establish its own cultural frameworks wherever it travels—raises the issue of the nature of the culture it carries. Taking into account P/c's Western origins and looking back to Weber (1946, 1958) and sometimes to Halévy's (1937) and Thompson's (1966) work on Methodism, scholars speculate on the extent to which P/c culture can be seen as initiating converts into modernity, introducing them to individualism and preparing them for lives in the global capitalist economy (Martin 1990, Martin 2001). Debates on this issue are not well developed or close to consensus. Indeed, they indicate difficulties with any argument that would simply equate P/c with modernity or gloss it merely as an enchanted version thereof. P/c is far from Weber's Calvinism (Cox 1995, p. 230; see also Thompson 1966, p. 363 on Methodism); its evident inner-worldly asceticism is tempered by an equally evident

mysticism (Weber 1946, pp. 325–26). And Pentecostalism was developed not by the bourgeoisie but by people whose own relationships to early twentieth-century modernity were contradictory and complex (Comaroff 1985). The ambiguously modern culture their efforts bequeathed to global P/c is best seen in the literature on P/c constructions of gender, political engagement, and economic behavior.

A consistent finding in studies of P/c churches worldwide is that more women than men are active members. Martin (2001, p. 56) reports that 75% of adult evangelicals are women, and studies more narrowly focused on P/c churches report similar percentages (Chesnut 1997, p. 22; Comaroff 1985, p. 204; Cucchiari 1990, p. 698; Gill 1990, p. 712; Hunt 2002c, pp. 159–60). In general women outnumber men in Christianity (Woodhead 2001, p. 73). But P/c's strong commitment to Pauline notions of patriarchy in which women are expected to subordinate themselves to men and participate in churches formally run by men has stimulated much research aimed at determining why P/c Christianity appeals to women.

Discussions of this issue focus either on the openness of P/c institutions to women's involvement and leadership or on the distinctiveness of P/c patriarchy. In looking at the scope P/c churches provide for women's involvement, many investigators note that these churches recognize two bases of authority: inspirational and institutional (Corten 1999, pp. 27–28; Cucchiari 1990, pp. 693–94; Ireland 1991, p. 96). Whereas men monopolize formal institutional positions such as pastor or missionary, women are routinely seen as receiving more gifts of the Spirit, and these gifts underwrite their work as lay preachers, healers, evangelists, and prophets whose voices are often heard in church and other public settings (Chesnut 1997, p. 99, 2003, pp. 141–43; Cucchiari 1990, pp. 689–94; d'Epinay 1969, p. 202; Hunt 2002c, pp. 159–60; Mariz & Machado 1997, pp. 43, 49; Martin 2001, p. 54). P/c churches also foster the creation of all or predominantly female services and prayer groups. These settings provide opportunities for women to develop public leadership skills and are often the one place in patriarchal societies where women can forge new relations outside their kin networks without exposing themselves to charges of immorality (Brusco 1995, pp. 133, 138; Chesnut 1997, p. 139, 2003, p. 145; Dombrowski 2001, pp. 36, 60; Gill 1990, p. 712; Hunt 2002c, p. 159; Stewart & Strathern 2001).

Studies of the nature of P/c patriarchy examine how, despite its support for male domination, it manages to enhance "women's autonomy and equality" and improve relations within their households (Smilde 1997, p. 343; Brusco 1995; Chesnut 1997; Cucchiari 1990; Martin 2001, p. 54). The solution to this "paradox" lies in the way P/c dualism and asceticism contribute to its construction of gender relations. Many of the behaviors P/c asceticism prohibits (e.g., adultery, gambling, drinking, and fighting) were valued primarily by men in preconversion culture (Austin-Broos 1997, p. 123; Chesnut 2003, p. 136; Kiernan 1994, 1997, p. 250; Mariz & Machado 1997, p. 50; Willems 1967, p. 49). In prohibiting these behaviors, converts demonize traditional patriarchy and the public sphere of male prestige competition (Burdick 1993, p. 114; Chesnut 1997, p. 112; Maxwell 1999, p. 106). At the same time, P/c dualism enjoins respect for the marital bond and the household,

realms defined as female in many preconversion cultures (Brusco 1995, p. 123; Burdick 1993; Mariz & Machado 1997, pp. 42–43; Marshall 1993; Ojo 1997). By promoting the household while condemning traditional male activities, P/c dualism "domesticates" men by turning their attention and resources to traditionally female concerns (Brusco 1995, pp. 5, 125; Burdick 1993, p. 114; Gill 1990, p. 717; Mariz & Machado 1997, p. 42; Willems 1967, pp. 169–73). Because of the domestic cooperation it demands of men, P/c gender models are only a "patriarchy in the last instance," according to Stacey & Gerard (1990, p. 108).

P/c patriarchy also reconfigures women's understanding of their own positions. Women converts see themselves as obedient primarily to God (Burdick 1993, p. 11). Their submission to men is legitimate only when men fulfill their tasks as God's chosen leaders and do not make demands women would have to sin to fulfill (Smilde 1997, pp. 345, 348). On this basis, observant women feel comfortable criticizing men who sin (Burdick 1993, pp. 112–13) and can draw on divinely given dreams and visions of male misbehavior to lend authority to their criticisms (Chesnut 1997, p. 101). They can also invoke their commitment to God and P/c morality to resist unwanted male sexual advances and regain control of their sexuality (Marshall 1993, pp. 231–32).

Pointing to the scope P/c gives women to limit men's claims to authority, Smilde (1997) says P/c establishes a distinct "religiously bounded patriarchy" (pp. 354–55). Yet it also appeals to men because it does not publicly question their authority and even solidifies it within the household by taking the antagonistic edge off of marital relations (Burdick 1993, p. 114; Mariz & Machado 1997, p. 46; Martin 2001, p. 55). As Chesnut (1997:112) puts it for the Brazilian case, male converts go from being "king of the street" to being "master of the household" (Chesnut 1997, pp. 112). And beyond the household, male converts also can rebuild their identities by taking up leading roles in the church (Austin-Broos 1997, p. 126).

Several classic works suggest that P/c constructions of gender find their value in modernizing situations. Willems (1967, pp. 169–73) argues that P/c constructions of gender render meaningful changes in women's roles caused by industrialization and urbanization in Brazil and Chile. Looking at the Colombian case, Brusco (1995) argues that P/c rearticulates men's and women's values after capitalism has sundered their relative conjunction within the peasant household. Cucchiari (1990, pp. 699–70) and Austin-Broos (1997) offer similarly rich historical analyses for the Italian and Jamaican cases, respectively. There is, however, little discussion in the cross-cultural literature of how P/c gender constructions relate to those of secular modernity. Discussions of women's involvement in churches and their use of church institutions to forge new social networks suggest that in many places P/c churches serve as hybrid public/private spaces (Cucchiari 1990) that, like the department store in Western history (Felski 1995), facilitate women's efforts to construct public social lives for themselves as modernity develops. But Mariz & Machado (1997, pp. 49–52; Mariz 1998, p. 206) argue that scholars working on P/c gender constructions, at least in Brazil, understand them only partially and evaluate them only poorly if they insist on viewing them through the lens

of modern liberal political thought. They note that P/c models of oppression and liberation are grounded in ideas about demonic influence and freedom as the ability to choose to follow P/c's ascetic moral codes that are distinct from canonical modern formulations in the West (cf. Mahmood 2001).

Much of the literature on P/c political culture focuses on its potential contribution to movements toward democratization. The two primary positions on this issue were staked out early and are based on judgments of the relative novelty of P/c church organization in relation to the political structures of the surrounding society. Willems (1967, p. 157), writing on Chile and Brazil, argued that the emphasis on egalitarianism and lay control in Pentecostal congregational church structures was a "symbolic subversion of the traditional social order" organized by notions of hierarchy. In response, d'Epinay (1969), also writing on Chile, claimed that Pentecostal churches, centered as they are on the authority of their founding pastors, restored the authoritarian patron/client structure of the collapsed hacienda system and thus failed to transform traditional constructions of political relations.

Bastian (1993) and Martin (1990, 2002) revived this debate in the 1990s. Bastian (1993, pp. 35, 50) picked up d'Epinay's line of argument and claimed that P/c embraced the authoritarianism of traditional popular religion, becoming a "Catholicism without priests" that supported corporatist political structures. Martin (1990, 2002), by contrast, embedded Willems' claims in a sweeping and influential argument that P/c in Latin America (and elsewhere outside the West) is destined to play the politically (and economically) modernizing role its Methodist progenitor played in England and the United States. The core of his argument claims that P/c's dualistic rejection of the secular world allows its members to withdraw into churches that constitute a "free space," a "protective social capsule," in which they can innovate new social forms without challenging elites (Martin 1990, pp. 187–89, 202; cf. Comaroff 1985, p. 213). Within this space, they experiment with voluntaristic and egalitarian social relations and develop new skills in leadership, literacy, public speaking, organization, and self-help (Burdick 1993, p. 226; Dodson 1997, p. 34; Marshall 1993, pp. 224–25; Martin 1990, pp. 108, 234, 284; Stoll 1990, p. 117). Through these experiments, Martin and others suggest, P/c introduces radical changes in the structures that traditionally governed social and political life in Latin America and elsewhere, preparing people for democratic participation.

Ireland's (1991) finding that, in terms of the classic church/sect dichotomy, institutionalized P/c churches operate differently at different levels suggests a way out of the impasse that marks the debate on P/c organizational structure. In their hierarchies, Sunday services, and Sunday schools, P/c churches operate like churches, but in their small-group prayer meetings and home services, they function as sects (Ireland 1991, pp. 89–93). Members tend to emphasize only one of these sets of activities; some are, in effect, church members, whereas others belong to a sect. Willems' and Martin's arguments about P/c transformations of traditional political culture are correct for sect members, but arguments for continued authoritarianism better represent the situation of those who attend church (Ireland 1991, pp. 214–15, 221–22).

Ireland's thesis is supported by Dodson's (1997, p. 32) claim that Bastian extrapolates from the experience of large P/c denominations, as do other exponents of the authoritarian position (e.g., Chesnut 1997). By contrast, those asserting P/c's transformative potential stress its sectarian and schismatic character, arguing that by keeping churches small it maintains their participatory, egalitarian features (Brusco 1995, p. 143; Willems 1967, pp. 113–16).

Ireland's argument indicates the complexity of the empirical situation. P/c church organization is very flexible, and generalizations about organizational experience need to be based on a range of careful ethnographic reports (Kamsteeg 1998, p. 6). Making a related point, Gifford (1998, p. 37) and Freston (1998, p. 45) assert that arguments in favor of P/c's democratizing force are generally speculative. Martin's (1990, pp. 267–68) argument, for example, is ultimately couched in subjunctive terms; he suggests that the political changes P/c makes within the free space of its churches exist in a latent state, waiting to emerge as full-fledged democratization movements when political conditions allow. Those who have done the most far-reaching empirical studies prefer to adopt a neutral stance, neither pessimistic nor optimistic, on the question of P/c's potential contributions to democratization, and they counsel caution when trying to read from what Martin (1990, p. 6) calls P/c's "cultural logic" to its socially modernizing effects (Freston 2001, p. 310; Steigenga 2001, pp. 145–46).

Another common observation about P/c political culture is that it leads to conservatism. What Stoll (1990, p. 327) labels the conspiracy theory view—that P/c churches are largely funded and ideologically shaped by the North American new right—has met with little scholarly support and critics stress that P/c churches are usually run by local leaders whose own agendas resist cooptation (Bastian 1993, p. 51; Coleman 2002b, pp. 12–13; Corten & Marshall-Fratani 2001b, p. 6; Englund 2003; Freston 2001, p. 289; d'Epinay 1969, pp. 87–88; Marshall 1993, pp. 213–15; Steigenga 2001, p. 140). Empirical studies of voting behavior also challenge claims of P/c conservatism, generally finding that church members tend to vote the way others of their social class do (Gill 2002, p. 214; Martin 1990, p. 240; Smilde 1998, pp. 299–30).

Yet several aspects of P/c culture can sometimes foster kinds of conservatism that may not come out in election surveys. For example, the P/c tendency toward withdrawal from public life, even as it may create Martin's free space, can encourage conservatism or at least political quietism. Many authors find that although P/c Christians vote, they tend to shy away from "hard" political acts that they consider immoral, such as working for parties, criticizing public officials, or running for office (Steigenga 2001, p. 141). But other researchers point to the political complexity of P/c withdrawal, noting that it can be a way of maintaining political autonomy (Stoll 1990, p. 319), avoiding the depoliticizing blandishments of mass culture (Freston 2001, p. 302) or building associations that may contribute to the construction of civil society (Dodson 1997, p. 33). P/c withdrawal's embeddedness in narratives of the struggle between God and Satan also makes it sometimes capable of generating radical critiques of the existing order

(Burdick 1993, pp. 218–19; Englund 2003, p. 96; Kamsteeg 1998; Marshall 1993, p. 234).

Another aspect of P/c culture that lends it a conservative caste is its individualism (Smilde 1998, p. 288; Martin 1990, p. 266). By emphasizing evangelization as the remedy for all ills, P/c promotes individual as opposed to structural solutions for social problems and leaves its followers without models of an ideal earthly society on which to base political action (Martin 1990, p. 266; Robbins 2002). As with withdrawal, scholars temper this view by stressing that P/c individualism should not be seen in all cases as apolitical and as hindering a concern for collective well-being (Mariz 1998, p. 215; Martin 1990, p. 234; Stoll 1990, p. 310). In particular, some argue that it is tempered by the moral links the religion fosters between converts and by the way it locates converts within their families (Chordas 1980; van Dijk 1998, p. 176; Martin 2001, p. 95).

Finally, there is a widespread pattern of P/c Christians construing themselves as leaping over their immediate political environment to identify with and recruit real or imagined support from distant P/c sources (Martin 2002, p. 26; Englund 2003). Via such distant identifications, people can resist identifying themselves in ethnic or national terms (Corten & Marshall-Fratani 2001b, p. 3; Robbins 1998); claim formal powers, such as the ability to conduct marriage ceremonies, usually denied them by local authorities (Austin-Broos 1997, pp. 111–12); and connect with members of socially distant classes (Csordas 1992, p. 12; Gifford 1998, p. 341). These identifications may at times appear quixotic—if withdrawal leads to too great a narrowing of the political domain, leaping over sometimes expands the political domain beyond workable limits. Yet it remains true that these distant identifications transform the local political field in ways not captured by common models of political modernization.

The key debate in discussions of P/c economic culture concerns the extent to which P/c plays a role in establishing the "Protestant ethic" in today's converts similar to the one played by Calvinism in Weber's (1958) account of the development of capitalism. Empirical studies of the effect of conversion on economic status are inconclusive (Martin 1990), with some arguing that the status of converts rises (Annis 1987) and others arguing that it does not (Brouwer et al. 1996, pp. 235–36). Analyses of P/c cultural conceptions of the economic domain present a similarly complicated picture. P/c asceticism renders members trustworthy and reliable workers who employers often seek out (Chesnut 1997, p. 166; d'Epinay 1969, p. 133; Martin 1995; Maxwell 1998, p. 354). By hiring P/c Christians to fill lightly supervised positions in the postfordist service economy, employers can, in effect, outsource the task of work discipline to the churches (Martin 1995, p. 111, cf. Thompson 1966). Disciplined though they are, however, P/c Christians' first commitment is to the church. On account of their dualism, they do not sacralize earthly work, may not focus on it as they execute it, and sometimes may quit to pursue evangelical goals (Chesnut 1997, p. 116; d'Epinay 1969, pp. 151–52). Their attitudes toward accumulation also are mixed. Forgoing investment in traditional ritual and male prestige pursuits, and often cutting their ties with their extended families, the way is open for P/c Christians to keep what they earn, but

the requirement that they give generously to their churches can prevent substantial accumulation (Maxwell 1998, p. 369). Considering this mixed picture, many scholars settle on characterizing the P/c economic ethos as one that stresses "coping," the avoidance of extreme poverty and ill health, but does not aim to produce great prosperity—and they have found that P/c asceticism often allows converts to meet these goals even in difficult circumstances (Brusco 1995, pp. 144–46; Chesnut 1997, p. 117; Mariz 1994; Maxwell 1998). Some researchers may see this ethos as an adjustment to converts' life chances. But it is more than just resignation; its disregard for prosperity is anchored in P/c's demonization of the world and its pleasures and can, in some cases, issue in partial criticisms of capitalist cultural models of individualism, accumulation, and desire (Burdick 1993, pp. 119–23; Meyer 1995, 1999a).

The discussion has thus far focused on the traditional P/c economic ethos. This ethos has been significantly transformed in the teachings of Faith churches that recently have become popular. The prosperity gospel preached in these churches holds that health and wealth are the believer's due and that illness and poverty are caused by sin and demonic influence (Coleman 2002b, Gifford 2001). Converts are encouraged to give generously with the promise that their gifts will be returned lavishly. With the donations this doctrine generates, Faith churches have grown quickly and heavily invested in media technology to further spread their message (Coleman 2000; Freston 1995, p. 132; Hackett 1995, p. 202). Although Faith churches encourage accumulation, individualism, and entrepreneurship in a way the traditional P/c ethos does not, their "magical" approach to wealth and heavy emphasis on tithing ensures that they too do not promote the classic Protestant ethic but instead represent "an advanced stage of. . .[its] decline" (Freston 1995, p. 131; see also Eves 2003; Gifford 1998, p. 337; Hunt 1998). Although the ultimate scope of Faith churches' popularity remains to be seen, it is interesting to note that members of more traditional P/c churches draw on their own economic ideas to formulate criticisms of these churches, even participating in riots aimed at Faith church members who flaunt their wealth and disregard community obligations (Maxwell 1998, p. 367; Smith 2001).

CONCLUSION

Several years before the booms in anthropological writing on both P/c and globalization, Comaroff (1985) wrote that the charismatic Zionist church she studied was "part of a second global culture. . .lying in the shadow of the first" (p. 254). This review examines what the literature tells us about the dynamics of this second global culture. Its gender, political, and economic constructions suggest that it would be a mistake to reduce it to a mere reflex of the modern as defined by the secular market and political ideas of the first global culture. At the same time, P/c's complex relationship with the traditional cultures it encounters—a relationship of both rejection and preservation—indicate that to see it as a simple force for indigenizing cultural localization is equally wide of the mark. Further studies of

the mechanics of P/c's spread promise to enrich not only our understanding of P/c but also of the range of dynamics that mark cultural globalization more generally.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The *Annual Review of Anthropology* is online at http://anthro.annualreviews.org

LITERATURE CITED

Ammerman NT. 1987. *Bible Believers: Fundamentalists in the Modern World*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers Univ. Press

Anderson RM. 1979. *Vision of the Disinherited: The Making of American Pentecostalism*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson

Annis S. 1987. *God and Production in a Guatemalan Town*. Austin: Univ. Texas Press

Austin-Broos DJ. 1997. *Jamaica Genesis: Religion and the Politics of Moral Orders*. Chicago: Univ. Chicago Press

Barker J. 2001. Afterword. *J. Ritual. Stud.* 15(2):105–8

Barrett DB, Johnson TM. 2002. Global statistics. In *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, ed. SM Burgess, EM van der Maas, pp. 283–302. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan

Bastian J-P. 1993. The metamorphosis of Latin American Protestant groups: a sociohistorical perspective. *Lat. Am. Res. Rev.* 28:33–61

Bays DH. 1993. Christian revivals in China, 1900–1937. In *Modern Christian Revivals*, ed. EL Blumhofer, R Balmer, pp. 161–79. Urbana: Univ. Ill. Press

Berger P. 1990. Forward. See Martin 1990, pp. vii–x

Blacking J. 1981. Political and musical freedom in the music of some black South African churches. In *The Structure of Folk Models*, ed. L Holy, M Stuchlik, pp. 35–62. London: Academic

Blumhofer EL. 1993. *Aimee Semple McPherson: Everybody's Sister*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans

Boudewijnse B, Droogers A, Kamsteeg F, eds. 1998. *More Than Opium: An Anthropological Approach to Latin American and Caribbean Pentecostal Praxis*. Lanham: Scarecrow

Bowen K. 1996. *Evangelism and Apostasy: the Evolution and Impact of Evangelicals in Modern Mexico*. Montreal: McGill-Queen's Univ. Press

Brodwin P. 2003. Pentecostalism in translation: religion and the production of community in the Haitian diaspora. *Am. Ethnol.* 30:85–101

Brouwer S, Gifford P, Rose SD. 1996. *Exporting the American Gospel: Global Christian Fundamentalism*. New York: Routledge

Brusco EE. 1995. *The Reformation of Machismo: Evangelical Conversion and Gender in Colombia*. Austin: Univ. Texas Press

Burdick J. 1993. *Looking for God in Brazil: The Progressive Catholic Church in Urban Brazil's Religious Arena*. Berkeley: Univ. Calif. Press

Burdick J. 1998. *Blessed Anastácia: Women,*

Race, and Popular Christianity in Brazil. New York: Routledge

Casanova J. 2001. Religion, the new millennium, and globalization. *Soc. Relig.* 62:415–41

Chesnut RA. 1997. *Born Again in Brazil: The Pentecostal Boom and the Pathogens of Poverty.* New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers

Chesnut RA. 2003. *Competitive Spirits: Latin America's New Religious Economy.* Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press

Chordas TJ. 1980. Catholic Pentecostalism: a new word in a new world. See Glazier 1980, pp. 143–75

Cleary El, Stewart-Gambino HW, eds. 1997. *Power, Politics, and Pentecostals in Latin America.* Boulder, CO: Westview

Coleman S. 2000. *The Globalisation of Charismatic Christianity: Spreading the Gospel of Prosperity.* Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press

Coleman S, ed. 2002a. The Faith Movement: a global religious culture? *Cult. Relig.* 3(1):Spec. issue

Coleman S. 2002b. The Faith Movement: a global religious culture? *Cult. Relig.* 3:3–19

Comaroff J. 1985. *Body of Power, Spirit of Resistance: The Culture and History of a South African People.* Chicago: Univ. Chicago Press

Comaroff J, Comaroff J. 2003. Second comings: neo-Protestant ethics and millennial capitalism in Africa, and elsewhere. In *2000 Years and Beyond: Faith, Identity and the 'Common Era'*, ed. P Gifford, D Archard, TA Hart, N Rapport, pp. 106–26. London: Routledge

Corten A. 1997. The growth of the literature on Afro-American, Latin American and African Pentecostalism. *J. Contemp. Relig.* 12:311–34

Corten A. 1999. *Pentecostalism in Brazil: Emotion of the Poor and Theological Romanticism.* New York: St. Martin's

Corten A, Marshall-Fratani R, eds. 2001a. *Between Babel and Pentecost: Transnational Pentecostalism in Africa and Latin America.* Bloomington: Ind. Univ. Press

Corten A, Marshall-Fratani R. 2001b. Introduction. See Corten & Marshall-Fratani 2001a, pp. 1–21

Cox H. 1995. *Fire From Heaven: The Rise of Pentecostal Spirituality and the Reshaping of Religion in the Twenty-First Century.* Reading, MA.: Addison-Wesley

Cox H. 1997. Into the age of miracles: culture, religion, and the market revolution. *World Policy J.* 14:87–95

Csordas TJ. 1992. Religion and the world system: the Pentecostal ethic and the spirit of monopoly capital. *Dialect. Anthropol.* 17:3–24

Csordas TJ. 1994. *The Sacred Self: A Cultural Phenomenology of Charismatic Healing.* Berkeley: Univ. Calif. Press

Cucchiari S. 1990. Between shame and sanctification: patriarchy and its transformation in Sicilian Pentecostalism. *Am. Ethnol.* 17:687–707

Dayton DW. 1987. *Theological Roots of Pentecostalism.* Peabody, MA: Hendrickson

DeBernardi J. 1999. Spiritual warfare and territorial spirits: the globalization and localisation of a 'practical theology'. *Relig. Stud. Theol.* 18:66–96

D'Epinay CL. 1969. *Haven of the Masses: A Study of the Pentecostal Movement in Chile.* London: Lutterworth

Dodson M. 1997. Pentecostals, politics, and public space in Latin America. See Cleary & Stewart-Gambino 1997, pp. 25–40

Dombrowski K. 2001. *Against Culture: Development, Politics, and Religion in Indian Alaska.* Lincoln: Univ. Neb. Press

Douglas B. 2001. From invisible Christians to gothic theatre: the romance of the millennial in Melanesian anthropology. *Curr. Anthropol.* 42:615–50

Dow JW, Sandstrom AR, eds. 2001. *Holy Saints and Fiery Preachers.* Westport, CT: Praeger

Droogers A. 2001. Globalisation and Pentecostal studies. See Corten & Marshall-Fratani 2001a, pp. 41–61

Englund H. 2001. The quest for missionaries: transnationalism and township

Pentecostalism in Malawi. See Corten & Marshall-Fratani 2001a, pp. 235–55

Englund H. 2003. Christian independency and global membership: Pentecostal extraversions in Malawi. *J. Relig. Afr.* 33:83–111

Eves R. 2003. Money, mayhem and the beast: narratives of the world's end from New Ireland (Papua New Guinea). *J. R. Anthropol. Inst.* 9:527–47

Felski R. 1995. *The Gender of Modernity*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press

Freston P. 1995. Pentecostalism in Brazil: a brief history. *Religion* 25:119–33

Freston P. 1997. Charismatic evangelicals in Latin America: mission and politics on the frontiers of Protestant growth. See Hunt et al. 1997a, pp. 184–204

Freston P. 1998. Evangelicalism and globalization: general observations and some Latin American dimensions. In *A Global Faith: Essays on Evangelicalism and Globalization*, ed. M Hutchinson, O Kalu, pp. 69–88. Sydney: Cent. Study Aust. Christ.

Freston P. 2001. *Evangelicals and Politics in Asia, Africa and Latin America*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univ. Press

Gerlach LP, Hine VH. 1970. *People, Power, Change: Movements of Social Transformation*. Indianapolis: Bobbs-Merrill

Garrard-Burnett V, Stoll D, eds. 1993. *Rethinking Protestantism in Latin America*. Philadelphia: Temple Univ. Press

Gifford P. 1998. *African Christianity: Its Public Role*. Bloomington: Ind. Univ. Press

Gifford P. 2001. The complex provenance of some elements of African Pentecostal theology. See Corten & Marshall-Fratani 2001a, pp. 62–79

Gill A. 2002. Religion and democracy in South America: challenges and opportunities. In *Religion and Politics in Comparative Perspective: The One, The Few, The Many*, ed. TG Jelen, C Wilcox, pp. 195–221. New York: Cambridge Univ. Press

Gill L. 1990. 'Like a veil to cover them': women and the Pentecostal movement in La Paz. *Am. Ethnol.* 17:708–21

Glazier S, ed. 1980. *Perspectives on Pentecostalism: Case Studies from the Caribbean and Latin America*. Lanham: Univ. Press Am.

Hackett RIJ. 1995. The gospel of prosperity in West Africa. In *Religion and the Transformations of Capitalism: Comparative Approaches*, ed. RH Roberts, pp. 199–214. London: Routledge

Hackett RIJ. 1998. Charismatic/Pentecostal appropriation of media technologies in Nigeria and Ghana. *J. Relig. Afr.* 28:258–77

Halévy E. 1937. *A History of the English People in 1815*. London: Penguin

Hallum AM. 2002. Looking for hope in Central America: the Pentecostal movement. See Jelen & Wilcox 2002, pp. 225–39

Harding SF. 2000. *The Book of Jerry Falwell: Fundamentalist Language and Politics*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton Univ. Press

Heelas P, Haglund-Heelas AM. 1988. The inadequacy of 'deprivation' as a theory of conversion. In *Vernacular Christianity: Essays in Social Anthropology of Religion Presented to Godfrey Lienhardt*, ed. W James, DH Johnson, pp. 112–19. Oxford: J. Anthropol. Soc. Oxford Occas. Pap.

Hine VH. 1974. The deprivation and disorganization theories of social movements. In *Religious Movements in Contemporary America*, ed. II Zaretsky, MP Leone, pp. 646–61. Princeton, NJ: Princeton Univ. Press

Hollenweger WJ. 1972. *The Pentecostals*. Minneapolis, MN: Augsburg

Hollenweger WJ. 1984. After twenty years' research on Pentecostalism. *Theology* 87:403–12

Hollenweger WJ. 1997. *Pentecostalism: Origins and Development Worldwide*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson

Holston J. 1999. Alternative modernities: statecraft and religious imagination in the Valley of the Dawn. *Am. Ethnol.* 26:605–31

Hunt S. 1998. Magical moments: an intellectualist approach to the neo-Pentecostal faith ministries. *Religion* 28:271–80

Hunt S. 2000. 'Winning ways': globalisation and the impact of the health and wealth gospel. *J. Contemp. Relig.* 15:331–47

Hunt S. 2002a. Deprivation and western Pentecostalism revisited: the case of 'classical' Pentecostalism. *PentecoStudies* 1(1):1–32

Hunt S. 2002b. Deprivation and western Pentecostalism revisited: neo-Pentecostalism. *PentecoStudies* 1(2):1–29

Hunt S. 2002c. 'Neither here nor there': the construction of identities and boundary maintenance of West African Pentecostals. *Sociology* 36:146–69

Hunt S, Hamilton M, Walter T, eds. 1997a. *Charismatic Christianity: Sociological Perspectives*. New York: St. Martin's

Hunt S, Hamilton M, Walter T. 1997b. Tongues, Toronto and the millennium. See Hunt et al. 1997a, pp. 1–16

Ireland R. 1991. *Kingdom's Come: Religion and Politics in Brazil*. Pittsburgh, PA: Univ. Pittsburgh Press

Jelen TG, Wilcox C, eds. 2002. *Religion and Politics in Comparative Perspective: The One, The Few, The Many*. New York: Cambridge Univ. Press

Jenkins P. 2002. *The Next Christendom: The Coming of Global Christianity*. Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press

Kamsteeg FH. 1998. *Prophetic Pentecostalism in Chile: A Case Study on Religion and Development Policy*. Lanham: Scarecrow

Kiernan JP. 1976. The work of Zion: an analysis of an African Zionist ritual. *Africa* 46:340–56

Kiernan JP. 1994. Variation on a Christian theme: the healing synthesis of Zulu Zionism. In *Syncretism/Anti-Syncretism: The Politics of Religious Synthesis*, ed. C Stewart, R Shaw, pp. 69–84. London: Routledge

Kiernan JP. 1997. Images of rejection in the construction of morality: Satan and sorcerer as moral signposts in the social landscape of urban Zionists. *Soc. Anthropol.* 5:243–54

Lash S, Urry J. 1994. *Economies of Signs and Space*. London: Sage

Lehmann D. 1996. *Struggle for the Spirit: Religious Transformation and Popular Culture in Brazil and Latin America*. Cambridge: Blackwell

Lehmann D. 2001. Charisma and possession in Africa and Brazil. *Theory Cult. Soc.* 18:45–74

Lehmann D. 2003. Review of D. Martin, Pentecostalism: The World Their Parish. *J. Relig. Afr.* 33:120–22

Lester RJ. 2003. The immediacy of eternity: time and transformation in a Roman Catholic convent. *Relig.* 33:201–19

Levine DH. 1995. Protestants and Catholics in Latin America: a family portrait. In *Fundamentalisms Comprehended*, ed. ME Marty, RS Appleby, pp. 155–78. Chicago: Univ. Chicago Press

Lyon D. 2000. *Jesus in Disneyland: Religion in Postmodern Times*. Cambridge: Polity

MacRobert I. 1988. *The Black Roots and White Racism of Early Pentecostalism in the USA*. London: Macmillan

Mahmood S. 2001. Feminist theory, embodiment, and the docile agent: some reflections on the Egyptian Islamic revival. *Cult. Anthropol.* 16:202–36

Manning FE. 1980. Pentecostalism: Christianity and reputation. See Glazier 1980, pp. 177–87

Mariz CL. 1994. *Coping With Poverty: Pentecostals and Base Communities in Brazil*. Philadelphia: Temple Univ. Press

Mariz CL. 1998. Deliverance and ethics: an analysis of the discourse of Pentecostals who have recovered from alcoholism. See Boudewijnse et al. 1998, pp. 203–23

Mariz CL, Machado MdDC . 1997. Pentecostalism and women in Brazil. See Cleary & Stewart-Gambino 1997, pp. 41–54

Marshall R. 1993. 'Power in the name of Jesus': social transformation and Pentecostalism in western Nigeria 'revisited'. In *Legitimacy and the State in Twentieth-Century Africa: Essays in Honour of A.H.M. Kirk-Greene*, ed. T Ranger, O Vaughan, pp. 213–46. London: Macmillian

Marshall-Fratani R. 1998. Mediating the global and the local in Nigerian Pentecostalism. *J. Relig. Afr.* 28:278–315

Martin D. 1990. *Tongues of Fire: The Explosion of Protestantism in Latin America*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell

Martin B. 1995. New mutations of the Protestant ethic among Latin American Pentecostals. *Religion* 25:101–17

Martin B. 1998. From pre- to postmodernity in Latin America: the case of Pentecostalism. In *Religion, Modernity and Postmodernity*, ed. P Heelas, D Martin, P Morris, pp. 102–46. Oxford: Blackwell

Martin B. 2001. The Pentecostal gender paradox: a cautionary tale for the sociology of religion. In *The Blackwell Companion to Sociology of Religion*, ed. RK Fenn, pp. 52–66. Oxford: Blackwell

Martin D. 2002. *Pentecostalism: The World Their Parish*. Oxford: Blackwell

Maxwell D. 1998. 'Delivered from the spirit of poverty?': Pentecostalism, prosperity and modernity in Zimbabwe. *J. Relig. Afr.* 28: 350–73

Maxwell D. 1999. *Christians and Chiefs in Zimbabwe: A Social History of the Hwesa People*. Westport, CT: Praeger

McGee GB. 2001. To the regions beyond: the global expansion of Pentecostalism. In *The Century of the Holy Spirit: 100 Years of Pentecostal and Charismatic Renewal*, ed. V Synan, pp. 69–95. Nashville, TN: Nelson

McGuire MB. 1982. *Pentecostal Catholics: Power, Charisma, and Order in a Religious Movement*. Philadelphia: Temple Univ. Press

Meyer B. 1995. 'Delivered from the powers of darkness': confessions of satanic riches in Christian Ghana. *Africa* 65:236–55

Meyer B. 1998. 'Make a complete break with the past': memory and postcolonial modernity in Ghanaian Pentecostal discourse. See Werbner 1998b, pp. 182–208

Meyer B. 1999a. Commodities and the power of prayer: Pentecostalist attitudes towards consumption in contemporary Ghana. In *Globalization and Identity: Dialectics of Flow and Closure*, ed. B Meyer, P Geschiere, pp. 151–76. Oxford: Blackwell

Meyer B. 1999b. *Translating the Devil: Religion and Modernity among the Ewe in Ghana*. Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press

Miller DE. 1997. *Reinventing American Protestantism*. Berkeley: Univ. Calif. Press

Noll MA. 2001. *American Evangelical Christianity: An Introduction*. Oxford: Blackwell

Ojo MA. 1988. The contextual significance of the charismatic movements in independent Nigeria. *Africa* 58:175–92

Ojo MA. 1997. Sexuality, marriage and piety among charismatics in Nigeria. *Religion* 27:65–79

Olson E. 2001. Signs of conversion, spirit of commitment: the Pentecostal church in the Kingdom of Tonga. *J. Ritual Stud.* 15:13–26

Poewe K, ed. 1994. *Charismatic Christianity as a Global Culture*. Columbia: Univ. South Carolina Press

Riesebrodt M. 1993. *Pious Passion: The Emergence of Modern Fundamentalism in the United States and Iran*. Berkeley: Univ. Calif. Press

Robbins J. 1998. On reading 'world news': apocalyptic narrative, negative nationalism, and transnational Christianity in a Papua New Guinea Society. *Soc. Anal.* 42:103–30

Robbins J. 2001a. Introduction: global religions, Pacific island transformations. *J. Ritual Stud.* 15:7–12

Robbins J. 2001b. Whatever became of revival: from charismatic movement to charismatic church in a Papua New Guinea society. *J. Ritual Stud.* 15:79–90

Robbins J. 2002. 'My wife can't break off part of her belief and give it to me:' apocalyptic interrogations of Christian individualism among the Urapmin of Papua New Guinea. *Paideuma* 48:189–206

Robbins J. 2003. On the paradoxes of global Pentecostalism and the perils of continuity thinking. *Religion* 33:221–31

Robbins J. 2004. *Becoming Sinners: Christianity and Moral Torment in a Papua New Guinea Society*. Berkeley: Univ. Calif. Press

Robbins J, Stewart PJ, Strathern A, eds. 2001. Charismatic and Pentecostal Christianity in Oceania. *J. Ritual Stud.* 15(2):Spec. Issue

Smilde DA. 1997. The fundamental unity of the conservative and revolutionary tendencies in Venezuelan evangelicalism: the case of conjugal relations. *Religion* 27:343–59

Smilde DA. 1998. 'Letting God govern': supernatural agency in the Venezuelan Pentecostal approach to social change. *Soc. Relig.* 59:287–303

Smith DJ. 2001. 'The arrow of God': Pentecostalism, inequality, and the supernatural in south-eastern Nigeria. *Africa* 71:587–613

Spittler RP. 1994. Are Pentecostals and charismatics fundamentalists? A review of American uses of these categories. See Poewe 1994, pp. 103–16

Stacey J, Gerard SE. 1990. 'We are not doormats': the influence of feminism on contemporary evangelicals in the United States. In *Uncertain Terms: Negotiating Gender in American Culture*, ed. F Ginsburg, AL Tsing, pp. 98–117. Boston: Beacon

Steigenga TJ. 2001. *The Politics of the Spirit: The Political Implications of Pentecostalized Religion in Costa Rica and Guatemala*. Lanham, MD: Lexington

Stewart PJ, Strathern A. 2001. The great exchange: moka with God. *J. Ritual Stud.* 15(2):91–104

Stoll D. 1990. *Is Latin America Turning Protestant? The Politics of Evangelical Growth*. Berkeley: Univ. Calif. Press

Stringer MD. 1999. *On the Perception of Worship: the Ethnography of Worship in Four Christian Congregations in Manchester*. Birmingham, AL: Univ. Birmingham Press

Stritecky JM. 2001. Israel, America, and the ancestors: narratives of spiritual warfare in a Pentecostal denomination in Solomon Islands. *J. Ritual Stud.* 15:62–78

Synan V. 1997. *The Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition: Charismatic Movements in the Twentieth Century*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans

Thompson EP. 1966. *The Making of the English Working Class*. New York: Vintage

Tuzin D. 1997. *The Cassowary's Revenge: The Life and Death of Masculinity in a New Guinea Society*. Chicago: Univ. Chicago Press

van Dijk R. 1992. Young Puritan preachers in post-independence Malawi. *Africa* 62:159–81

van Dijk R. 1995. Fundamentalism and its moral geography in Malawi: the representation of the diasporic and the diabolical. *Crit. Anthropol.* 15:171–91

van Dijk R. 1998. Pentecostalism, cultural memory and the state: contested representations of time in Pentecostal Malawi. See Werbner 1998b, pp. 155–81

van Dijk RA. 1997. From camp to encompassment: discourses of transsubjectivity in the Ghanaian Pentecostal Diaspora. *J. Relig. Afr.* 27:135–59

Wacker G. 1982. Taking another look at the Vision of the Disinherited. *Relig. Stud. Rev.* 8:15–22

Wacker G. 1988. Pentecostalism. In *Encyclopedia of the American Religious Experience: Studies of Traditions and Movements, Vol. II*, ed. CH Lippy, PW Williams, pp. 933–45. New York: Scribner

Wacker G. 2001. *Heaven Below: Early Pentecostals and American Culture*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press

Weber M. 1946. *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology*. New York: Oxford Univ. Press

Weber M. 1958. *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*. New York: Scribner

Werbner R. 1998a. Beyond oblivion: confronting memory crisis. See Werbner 1998b, pp. 1–17

Werbner R, ed. 1998b. *Memory and the Postcolony: African Anthropology and the Critique of Power*. London: Zed Books

Willems E. 1967. *Followers of the New Faith: Culture Change and the Rise of Protestantism in Brazil and Chile*. Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt Univ. Press

Woodberry RD, Smith CS. 1998. Fundamentalism et al: conservative protestants in America. *Annu. Rev. Sociol.* 24:25–56

Woodhead L. 2001. Feminism and the sociology of religion: from gender-blindness to gendered difference. In *The Blackwell Companion to Sociology of Religion*, ed. RK Fenn, pp. 67–84. Oxford: Blackwell

CONTENTS

ERRATA
An online log of corrections to *Annual Review of Anthropology*
chapters may be found at http://anthro.annualreviews.org/errata.shtml