# cca\_paper\_example

### 7/6/2020

### Load packages and Data set

```
## Loading required package: Matrix
## Loading 'metafor' package (version 2.1-0). For an overview
## and introduction to the package please type: help(metafor).
## Loading required package: OpenMx
## To take full advantage of multiple cores, use:
     mxOption(key='Number of Threads', value=parallel::detectCores()) #now
     Sys.setenv(OMP_NUM_THREADS=parallel::detectCores()) #before library(OpenMx)
##
##
## Attaching package: 'OpenMx'
## The following objects are masked from 'package:Matrix':
##
       %%%, expm
## "SLSQP" is set as the default optimizer in OpenMx.
## mxOption(NULL, "Gradient algorithm") is set at "central".
## mxOption(NULL, "Optimality tolerance") is set at "6.3e-14".
## mxOption(NULL, "Gradient iterations") is set at "2".
```

#### Subset of the data

## x tidyr::unpack() masks Matrix::unpack()

```
## -- Attaching packages -----
## v tibble 2.1.1
                      v purrr
                               0.3.3
## v tidyr 1.1.0
                     v dplyr
                               0.8.3
## v readr 1.3.1
                    v stringr 1.4.0
## v tibble 2.1.1
                      v forcats 0.4.0
## -- Conflicts -----
## x tidyr::expand() masks Matrix::expand()
## x dplyr::filter() masks stats::filter()
## x dplyr::lag()
                   masks stats::lag()
## x tidyr::pack()
                   masks Matrix::pack()
## x purrr::rerun() masks metaSEM::rerun()
```

```
##
  ******************
## Note: As of version 1.0.0, cowplot does not change the
     default ggplot2 theme anymore. To recover the previous
##
##
     behavior, execute:
##
     theme_set(theme_cowplot())
   *****************
##
## Attaching package: 'gridExtra'
   The following object is masked from 'package:dplyr':
##
##
       combine
gg_summary_covariate_miss(data_adt_cca)
                                             В
Α
                                                                       91perwhite (3.35%)
                          91perwhite
                                                              se_9 (0%)
                                                          es_9 (0%)
        Studyid
            es_g
    0
                                                  0
  100
                                                100
Observations
  200
                                                200
  300
                                                300
                                                                 Missing
                                                                           Present
            Type integer
                         numeric NA
                                                                 (4.1\%)
                                                                           (95.9%)
data.frame(k.NA=colSums(is.na(data_adt_cca)))
##
                k.NA
## studyid
                   0
                   0
## es_g
## se_g
                   0
                   9
## g1permale
## g1perwhite
                  11
## glage
                   7
## g1hrsperweek
                  79
```

```
## g1txdays
table(rowSums(is.na(data_adt_cca)))
##
##
                 3
                      4
## 232 89
             4
                 1
                      2
#Percentage missing by variable
miss_var_summary(data_adt_cca)
## # A tibble: 8 x 3
##
     variable
               n_miss pct_miss
##
     <chr>
                   <int>
                             <dbl>
## 1 g1hrsperweek
                       79
                            24.1
## 2 g1perwhite
                       11
                             3.35
                             2.74
## 3 g1permale
                       9
                       7
                             2.13
## 4 g1age
## 5 g1txdays
                        2
                             0.610
                        0
## 6 studyid
                             0
                        0
                             0
## 7 es_g
                        0
                             0
## 8 se_g
#Percentage missing by Effect Size case
miss_case_summary(data_adt_cca)
## # A tibble: 328 x 3
##
       case n_miss pct_miss
      <int> <int>
##
                       <dbl>
##
   1
         15
                 4
                        50
##
   2
         16
                        50
##
   3
        199
                 3
                       37.5
##
   4
          7
                 2
                        25
##
  5
          8
                 2
                        25
                 2
##
  6
          9
                        25
##
  7
        185
                 2
                        25
##
    8
          5
                 1
                        12.5
## 9
          6
                        12.5
                  1
## 10
         17
                  1
                        12.5
## # ... with 318 more rows
Complete case analysis
While effect sizes and sampling variances are not missing for this dataset, there are a number of moderator
(covariates) variables that are. A total of 328 ES available in the data.
#Meta-regression
#random-effects model
mr_cca<- rma(es_g, se_g^2, mods= ~ g1permale + g1perwhite + g1age +</pre>
                            g1hrsperweek + g1txdays , data= data_adt_cca)
## Warning in rma(es_g, se_g^2, mods = ~g1permale + g1perwhite + g1age +
```

## g1hrsperweek + : Studies with NAs omitted from model fitting.

## Mixed-Effects Model (k = 232; tau^2 estimator: REML)

mr\_cca

```
##
## tau^2 (estimated amount of residual heterogeneity):
                                                          0.0348 \text{ (SE = } 0.0083)
## tau (square root of estimated tau^2 value):
                                                          0.1865
## I^2 (residual heterogeneity / unaccounted variability): 40.55%
## H^2 (unaccounted variability / sampling variability):
                                                          1.68
## R^2 (amount of heterogeneity accounted for):
                                                          6.78%
## Test for Residual Heterogeneity:
## QE(df = 226) = 388.2926, p-val < .0001
## Test of Moderators (coefficients 2:6):
## QM(df = 5) = 23.1900, p-val = 0.0003
## Model Results:
##
##
                 estimate
                                     zval
                                             pval
                                                     ci.lb
                                                              ci.ub
                              se
                                                  -0.2293
                                                             1.3890
## intrcpt
                  0.5799 0.4128
                                   1.4045 0.1602
## g1permale
                 -0.3926 0.1377 -2.8514 0.0044
                                                   -0.6625
                                                            -0.1227
                                  1.7595 0.0785
                                                   -0.0197
## g1perwhite
                  0.1728 0.0982
                                                             0.3653
## glage
                 -0.0117 0.0247 -0.4738 0.6356
                                                   -0.0602
                                                             0.0367
## g1hrsperweek
                  0.0570 0.0170
                                   3.3475 0.0008
                                                    0.0236
                                                             0.0904
## g1txdays
                 -0.0012 0.0006 -2.1821 0.0291 -0.0023 -0.0001
##
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

Only k=232 ES were included in the analysis. Thus, approximetly 30% of the ES were excluded from the analysis. illustrating the loss of data that can occur when conducting a complete case analysis.

# Complete case analysis - Nested models

```
##delete NA
data_adt_na<- na.omit(data_adt_cca)</pre>
#Meta-regression
#random-effects model
#Using rma.mv
rma_mv_cca<- rma.mv(es_g, se_g^2, mods= ~ 1 + g1permale + g1perwhite + g1age +
                                    g1hrsperweek + g1txdays,
                                    random= ~ 1|studyid,
                                   data= data_adt_na,
                                    method="REML")
rma_mv_cca
##
## Multivariate Meta-Analysis Model (k = 232; method: REML)
## Variance Components:
##
##
                         sqrt nlvls fixed
               estim
                                              factor
## sigma^2
              0.1055 0.3247
                                  34
                                         no studyid
##
## Test for Residual Heterogeneity:
```

```
## QE(df = 226) = 388.2926, p-val < .0001
##
## Test of Moderators (coefficients 2:6):
## QM(df = 5) = 18.4383, p-val = 0.0024
## Model Results:
##
##
                estimate
                              se
                                     zval
                                             pval
                                                    ci.lb
                                                           ci.ub
                                   1.6461 0.0997 -0.3877 4.4543
## intrcpt
                 2.0333 1.2352
## g1permale
                 -0.5452 0.3742 -1.4571 0.1451
                                                  -1.2786
                                                           0.1882
## g1perwhite
                 0.6605 0.2064
                                   3.2007 0.0014
                                                   0.2560
                                                           1.0649 **
                 -0.1072 0.0685 -1.5654 0.1175
                                                  -0.2414
## glage
                                                           0.0270
                                                  -0.0416
## g1hrsperweek
                  0.0417 0.0425
                                  0.9806 0.3268
                                                           0.1250
## g1txdays
                 -0.0013 0.0014 -0.9435 0.3454
                                                  -0.0041 0.0015
##
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
# Then use robust.rma.mv
robustrma_cca<- robust.rma.mv(rma_mv_cca, data_adt_na$studyid)</pre>
robustrma_cca
##
## Number of outcomes:
## Number of clusters:
                        34
## Outcomes per cluster: 1-36 (mean: 6.82, median: 4)
## Test of Moderators (coefficients 2:6):
## F(df1 = 5, df2 = 28) = 3.6155, p-val = 0.0120
## Model Results:
##
##
                estimate
                                     tval
                                             pval
                                                    ci.lb
                                                            ci.ub
                              se
                                   2.3254 0.0275
                                                    0.2422 3.8244 *
## intrcpt
                  2.0333 0.8744
## g1permale
                 -0.5452 0.3076 -1.7724 0.0872
                                                  -1.1753
                                                           0.0849
## g1perwhite
                                  2.3453 0.0263
                                                   0.0836
                  0.6605 0.2816
                                                           1.2374 *
                 -0.1072 0.0534 -2.0079 0.0544
## glage
                                                  -0.2165
                                                           0.0022
                 0.0417 0.0238
## g1hrsperweek
                                  1.7492 0.0912
                                                  -0.0071
                                                           0.0905
                 -0.0013 0.0017 -0.7858 0.4386 -0.0049 0.0022
## g1txdays
##
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
#Using mr3 with moderators
mr3<- meta3(es_g, se_g^2, cluster= studyid, data= data_adt_na,
           intercept.constraints = 0,
           x=model.matrix( ~ 1 + g1permale + g1perwhite + g1age +
                          g1hrsperweek + g1txdays))
summary(mr3)
##
## Call:
## meta3(y = es_g, v = se_g^2, cluster = studyid, x = model.matrix(~1 +
      g1permale + g1perwhite + g1age + g1hrsperweek + g1txdays),
##
##
      data = data_adt_na, intercept.constraints = 0)
##
```

```
## 95% confidence intervals: z statistic approximation (robust=FALSE)
## Coefficients:
                       Std.Error
##
             Estimate
                                       lbound
                                                   ubound z value Pr(>|z|)
## Slope_1 1.8417e+00 1.1390e+00 -3.9063e-01 4.0741e+00 1.6170 0.105877
## Slope_2 -5.4519e-01 3.4417e-01 -1.2198e+00 1.2937e-01 -1.5841 0.113176
## Slope 3 5.8655e-01 2.1655e-01 1.6213e-01 1.0110e+00 2.7087 0.006755
## Slope 4 -9.3703e-02 6.4010e-02 -2.1916e-01 3.1754e-02 -1.4639 0.143224
## Slope_5 4.4610e-02 3.9431e-02 -3.2673e-02 1.2189e-01 1.1314 0.257904
## Slope_6 -1.2636e-03 1.2864e-03 -3.7850e-03 1.2577e-03 -0.9823 0.325954
## Tau2_2
          1.0000e-10 7.6231e-03 -1.4941e-02 1.4941e-02 0.0000 1.000000
## Tau2_3
          8.0166e-02 2.8867e-02 2.3588e-02 1.3674e-01 2.7771 0.005485
##
## Slope_1
## Slope_2
## Slope_3 **
## Slope_4
## Slope_5
## Slope 6
## Tau2 2
## Tau2 3 **
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## \mathbb{Q} statistic on the homogeneity of effect sizes: 423.0366
## Degrees of freedom of the Q statistic: 231
## P value of the Q statistic: 1.946221e-13
## Explained variances (R2):
                            Level 2 Level 3
## Tau2 (no predictor)
                         1.0000e-10 0.0817
## Tau2 (with predictors) 1.0000e-10 0.0802
## R2
                          1.1102e-16 0.0193
##
## Number of studies (or clusters): 34
## Number of observed statistics: 232
## Number of estimated parameters: 8
## Degrees of freedom: 224
## -2 log likelihood: 67.28976
## OpenMx status1: 6 ("0" or "1": The optimization is considered fine.
## Other values may indicate problems.)
## Warning in print.summary.meta(x): OpenMx status1 is neither 0 or 1. You are advised to 'rerun' it ag
#Using robu
#Intercept only model
#use .8 as correlation between ES
mr_robu<- robu( es_g ~ 1 , data=data_adt_na, studyid, se_g^2, rho=.8, small=TRUE)
print(mr_robu)
## RVE: Correlated Effects Model with Small-Sample Corrections
##
## Model: es_g ~ 1
##
## Number of studies = 34
```

## Number of outcomes = 232 (min = 1 , mean = 6.82 , median = 4 , max = 36 )

```
## Rho = 0.8
## I.sq = 59.67843
## Tau.sq = 0.06944127
##
                 Estimate StdErr t-value dfs P(|t|>) 95% CI.L 95% CI.U Sig
## 1 X.Intercept.
                    0.193 0.0536
                                     3.6 29.7 0.00113 0.0836
## Signif. codes: < .01 *** < .05 ** < .10 *
## Note: If df < 4, do not trust the results
sensitivity(mr_robu)
## RVE: Correlated Effects Model with Small-Sample Corrections
## Model: es_g ~ 1
##
## Sensitivity Analysis
##
                            Rho = 0 Rho = 0.2 Rho = 0.4 Rho = 0.6 Rho = 0.8
##
## X.Intercept. Coefficient 0.1929 0.1930
                                              0.1930
                                                        0.1931
                                                                  0.1931
                Std. Error 0.0535 0.0535
                                              0.0536
                                                        0.0536
                                                                  0.0536
## Tau.sq
                            0.0687 0.0689
                Estimate
                                              0.0691
                                                        0.0693
                                                                  0.0694
## Rho = 1
## 0.1931
## 0.0536
## 0.0696
#with moderators
mr_robu2<- robu(es_g ~ g1permale + g1perwhite + g1age +g1hrsperweek + g1txdays ,</pre>
                data=data_adt_na, modelweights="HIER", studyid, se_g^2, small=TRUE)
print(mr_robu2)
## RVE: Hierarchical Effects Model with Small-Sample Corrections
## Model: es_g ~ g1permale + g1perwhite + g1age + g1hrsperweek + g1txdays
##
## Number of clusters = 34
## Number of outcomes = 232 (min = 1 , mean = 6.82 , median = 4 , max = 36 )
## Omega.sq = 0.002653204
## Tau.sq = 0.05106938
##
##
                 Estimate StdErr t-value dfs P(|t|>) 95% CI.L 95% CI.U
## 1 X.Intercept. 0.64770 0.60010
                                   1.08 3.87
                                                  0.343 -1.04080 2.33620
       g1permale -0.38983 0.23543
                                   -1.66 3.59
                                                  0.181 -1.07424 0.29457
## 2
                                    1.01 10.45
## 3
      g1perwhite 0.20714 0.20480
                                                  0.335 -0.24654
                                                                  0.66082
           glage -0.01605 0.03647
                                    -0.44 3.53
                                                  0.686 -0.12290
                                                                  0.09081
                                                  0.141 -0.02940 0.14519
## 5 g1hrsperweek 0.05789 0.03184
                                    1.82 4.13
## 6
        g1txdays -0.00137 0.00121
                                   -1.14 11.47
                                                  0.279 -0.00402 0.00127
## Sig
## 1
## 2
## 3
## 4
## 5
## 6
```

```
## ---
## Signif. codes: < .01 *** < .05 ** < .10 *
## ---
## Note: If df < 4, do not trust the results</pre>
```

## Shifting units analysis

```
#g1permale
mr_shu_cov1<- rma(es_g, se_g^2, mods= ~ g1permale, data= data_adt_cca)
## Warning in rma(es_g, se_g^2, mods = ~g1permale, data = data_adt_cca):
## Studies with NAs omitted from model fitting.
mr_shu_cov1
## Mixed-Effects Model (k = 319; tau^2 estimator: REML)
## tau^2 (estimated amount of residual heterogeneity):
                                                          0.0229 \text{ (SE = } 0.0052)
## tau (square root of estimated tau^2 value):
                                                          0.1515
## I^2 (residual heterogeneity / unaccounted variability): 35.42%
## H^2 (unaccounted variability / sampling variability):
                                                          1.55
## R^2 (amount of heterogeneity accounted for):
                                                          2.89%
##
## Test for Residual Heterogeneity:
## QE(df = 317) = 536.1762, p-val < .0001
## Test of Moderators (coefficient 2):
## QM(df = 1) = 4.3603, p-val = 0.0368
##
## Model Results:
##
##
             estimate
                                                 ci.lb
                                                           ci.ub
                           se
                                  zval
                                          pval
## intrcpt
              0.2518 0.0695
                                3.6201 0.0003
                                                 0.1155
                                                          0.3881
              ## g1permale
##
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
#319 EF out of 328
#g1perwhite
mr_shu_cov2<- rma(es_g, se_g^2, mods= ~ g1perwhite, data= data_adt_cca)</pre>
## Warning in rma(es_g, se_g^2, mods = ~g1perwhite, data = data_adt_cca):
## Studies with NAs omitted from model fitting.
mr_shu_cov2
##
## Mixed-Effects Model (k = 317; tau^2 estimator: REML)
##
## tau^2 (estimated amount of residual heterogeneity):
                                                          0.0295 (SE = 0.0059)
## tau (square root of estimated tau^2 value):
                                                          0.1719
## I^2 (residual heterogeneity / unaccounted variability): 41.12%
## H^2 (unaccounted variability / sampling variability):
```

```
## R^2 (amount of heterogeneity accounted for):
                                                         0.00%
##
## Test for Residual Heterogeneity:
## QE(df = 315) = 570.7818, p-val < .0001
## Test of Moderators (coefficient 2):
## QM(df = 1) = 0.0412, p-val = 0.8391
## Model Results:
##
              estimate
                                 zval
                                         pval
                                                 ci.lb
                                                        ci.ub
                            se
                0.1165 0.0391 2.9765 0.0029
                                                0.0398 0.1931 **
## intrcpt
## g1perwhite
                0.0130 0.0641 0.2031 0.8391 -0.1125 0.1386
##
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
#317 EF out of 328
#glage
mr_shu_cov3<- rma(es_g, se_g^2, mods= ~ glage, data= data_adt_cca)
## Warning in rma(es_g, se_g^2, mods = ~glage, data = data_adt_cca): Studies
## with NAs omitted from model fitting.
mr shu cov3
##
## Mixed-Effects Model (k = 321; tau^2 estimator: REML)
##
## tau^2 (estimated amount of residual heterogeneity):
                                                         0.0260 \text{ (SE = } 0.0055)
## tau (square root of estimated tau^2 value):
                                                         0.1611
## I^2 (residual heterogeneity / unaccounted variability): 38.07%
## H^2 (unaccounted variability / sampling variability):
                                                         1.61
## R^2 (amount of heterogeneity accounted for):
                                                         0.68%
## Test for Residual Heterogeneity:
## QE(df = 319) = 556.1142, p-val < .0001
##
## Test of Moderators (coefficient 2):
## QM(df = 1) = 1.1035, p-val = 0.2935
## Model Results:
##
##
           estimate
                         se
                                zval
                                       pval
                                               ci.lb ci.ub
           ## intrcpt
## glage
             0.0190 0.0181
                            1.0505 0.2935 -0.0164 0.0544
##
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
#321 EF out of 328
#q1hrsperweek
mr_shu_cov4<- rma(es_g, se_g^2, mods= ~ g1hrsperweek, data= data_adt_cca)
```

```
## Warning in rma(es_g, se_g^2, mods = ~g1hrsperweek, data = data_adt_cca):
## Studies with NAs omitted from model fitting.
mr shu cov4
##
## Mixed-Effects Model (k = 249; tau^2 estimator: REML)
##
## tau^2 (estimated amount of residual heterogeneity):
                                                           0.0398 \text{ (SE = } 0.0085)
## tau (square root of estimated tau^2 value):
                                                           0.1995
## I^2 (residual heterogeneity / unaccounted variability): 43.86%
## H^2 (unaccounted variability / sampling variability):
## R^2 (amount of heterogeneity accounted for):
                                                           1.51%
## Test for Residual Heterogeneity:
## QE(df = 247) = 460.4483, p-val < .0001
##
## Test of Moderators (coefficient 2):
## QM(df = 1) = 6.7655, p-val = 0.0093
## Model Results:
##
##
                 estimate
                               se
                                     zval
                                             pval
                                                    ci.lb ci.ub
                  0.1203 0.0320 3.7575 0.0002 0.0576 0.1831
## intrcpt
                                                                    ***
## g1hrsperweek
                   0.0379  0.0146  2.6011  0.0093  0.0093  0.0665
##
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
#249 EF out of 328
#q1txdays
mr_shu_cov5<- rma(es_g, se_g^2, mods= ~ g1txdays, data= data_adt_cca)
## Warning in rma(es_g, se_g^2, mods = ~g1txdays, data = data_adt_cca):
## Studies with NAs omitted from model fitting.
mr_shu_cov5
##
## Mixed-Effects Model (k = 326; tau^2 estimator: REML)
## tau^2 (estimated amount of residual heterogeneity):
                                                           0.0275 \text{ (SE = } 0.0056)
## tau (square root of estimated tau^2 value):
## I^2 (residual heterogeneity / unaccounted variability): 39.38%
## H^2 (unaccounted variability / sampling variability):
                                                           1.65
## R^2 (amount of heterogeneity accounted for):
                                                           0.00%
## Test for Residual Heterogeneity:
## QE(df = 324) = 570.2498, p-val < .0001
## Test of Moderators (coefficient 2):
## QM(df = 1) = 6.7439, p-val = 0.0094
##
## Model Results:
##
```

```
## estimate se zval pval ci.lb ci.ub

## intrcpt 0.2144 0.0395 5.4299 <.0001 0.1370 0.2918 ***

## g1txdays -0.0008 0.0003 -2.5969 0.0094 -0.0014 -0.0002 **

##

## ---

## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

#326 EF out of 328
```