## **Appendix: Data**

## The (5, 7)-game Message treatment

In the tables below: R = Roll, D = Don't. We classify messages as HR = Promise High & Roll, IHR = Implicit promise High & Roll, LD = Promise Low, then Don't, ILD = Implicit promise Low, then Don't, PH = Promise High, PL = Promise Low, PNS = Promise not selfish, PD = Promise Don't, E = Empty Talk, and N = No Message. This classification scheme maps onto the scheme in the text as follows: 1) HR, IHR, and PH are considered to be HR-messages, 2) LD, ILD, PD, and PNS are considered to be LD-messages (promises one will choose Don't or not be selfish only really make sense for a low-talent agent), and 3) E and N are considered to be Silence.

| Session | ID(B) | Message  | Class | Type     | Α   | В   |
|---------|-------|--|-------|----------|-----|-----|
|         |       | Hi☺,   |       |          |     |     |
|         |       | Choose IN and you'll receive \$7 in addition to the              |       |          |     |     |
| 1       | 1     | show up fee (For Sure).  | LD    | L        | IN  | D   |
|         |       | -Low-type  |       |          |     |     |
|         |       | -Rolling is not for me   |       |          |     |     |
|         |       | -Choose the maximum to get the maximum                           |       |          |     |     |
| 1       | 2     | return [Prisoner's Dilemma]                                      | LD    | L        | IN  | D   |
|         |       | 12 dollars is waiting for you ☺. I don't think I am              |       |          |     |     |
| 1       | 3     | so unlucky that I will roll a die of one. Thank you.             | IHR   | Η        | IN  | R   |
| 1       | 4     | Go with the flow. Don't think too much.                          | Е     | L        | OUT | _   |
| 1       | 5     | ☺  | Е     | L        | OUT | _   |
|         |       | HIGH risk,   |       |          |     |     |
|         |       | HIGH reward~   |       |          |     |     |
|         |       | ©  |       |          |     |     |
|         |       | l trust u ☺.   | _     |          |     | _   |
| 1       | 6     | Have mercy pls!!!  | E     | Н        | IN  | R   |
|         |       | Hey! I am LOW please <u>choose</u> IN. I will choose DON'T ROLL. |       |          |     |     |
|         |       |  |       |          |     |     |
| 1       | 7     | So, ME: \$12 (7+5) in the end. You: \$12 (7+5).                  | LD    | L        | OUT |     |
|         | /     | Choose IN!   | LD    |          | 001 | _   |
| 1       | 8     | Definitely can earn more than \$5!                               | Е     | L        | IN  | D   |
|         |       | I am a high type.  |       |          |     |     |
| 1       | 9     | Therefore, choosing IN will maximise our profit.                 | HR    | Н        | IN  | R   |
|         |       |  |       |          |     |     |
|         |       | I am LOW so choose IN and I'll choose DON'T                      |       |          |     |     |
| 1       | 10    | ROLL and both of us will get \$7. Awesome right. Thanks! ☺       | LD    |          | IN  | D   |
| 1       | 10    | LOW  | PL    | <u> </u> | OUT | _ U |
| 1       | 11    | LOVV   | PL    | L        | UUI | _   |

|   |     | Please choose IN   |      |      |     |     |
|---|-----|--|------|------|-----|-----|
|   |     | 1, If you choose IN, and ① I'm LOW, I'll choose                                  |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | DON'T ROLL→We both \$7.  |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | (2) If I'm HIGH, 1) if I choose Don't Roll, we still                             |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | get \$7 each. 2) if I choose roll, your expected                                 |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | return would be: $\frac{1}{6} \times 0 + \frac{5}{6} \times 12 = $10$ , so do I. |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | In this case, our expected return would be both                                  |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | \$10>\$7.  |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | 2, If you choose OUT, we'll both end up with only \$5.                           |      |      |     |     |
| 1 | 12  | So, please choose IN! Thank you!   | Е    | Н    | IN  | R   |
|   |     | Hello,   |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | Choose <u>IN</u> please.   |      |      |     |     |
| 1 | 13  | Thanks! ©  | Ε    | L    | IN  | D   |
|   |     | Hi A,  |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | I am of type <u>LOW</u> . I'm gonna choose <u>DON'T ROLL</u>                     |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | so that we can each walk away with \$7. So                                       |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | choose IN please☺.   |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | Trust me!  |      |      |     |     |
| 1 | 14  | Nash Equilibrium 5-5.  | LD   | L    | IN  | D   |
|   |     | Hey A,   |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | Good news for you, I got number 15, which is                                     |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | HIGH type. That means if you choose IN, you'll                                   |      |      |     |     |
| 1 | 15  | have a big chance to earn more money!  | HR   | Н    | IN  | R   |
|   |     | Choose "IN" please. Let's earn more money  | -    |      |     |     |
| 1 | 16  | together:-).   | E    | L    | IN  | D   |
|   |     | Just choose IN. I'll wisely decide so that both of us                            |      |      |     |     |
| 1 | 17  | will get the best outcome, depending on my type. Thanks ©                        | Е    | L    | IN  | D   |
| 1 | 17  | If I am LOW, I will choose not to roll;  |      | _ L  | IIN | U   |
| 1 | 18  | If I am HIGH, I will choose to roll.   | Е    | Н    | IN  | R   |
| Т | 10  | I am a low type, choose 'IN', I will choose 'Don't                               | L    | 11   | IIN | IX. |
|   |     | Roll' and we all can get \$7 each. \$7-\$5=\$2 MORE.                             |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | Fair, both get same amount. Trust me. We all                                     |      |      |     |     |
| 2 | 1   | come here to get the \$ only.  | LD   | L    | IN  | D   |
|   |     | Please choose "IN" and "DON'T ROLL".   |      |      |     |     |
| 2 | 2   | It will be the best option for both of us ©                                      | ILD  | L    | IN  | D   |
|   |     | High Type. So the chance for u to get \$0 is super                               |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | low. And give a shot for \$12. The p(\$12 for                                    |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | u)=5/6. I'm not that bad in dice. Or I choose                                    |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | "Don't Roll", which is also \$7 for u. How lucky I'm                             |      |      |     |     |
|   |     | high type. So grab this opportunity! Let's do this                               |      |      |     |     |
| 2 | 3   | together!  O You have my fully trust!  | PH   | Н    | OUT |     |
|   |     | CHOOSE IN TO EARN MORE.  |      |      |     |     |
| 2 | 4   | (LOW TYPE_B)   | PL   | L    | IN  | D   |
|   |     | I have LOW TYPE and I will choose "don't roll" if                                |      |      |     |     |
| 2 | 5   | you choose in, so we get \$7 each :)   | LD   | L    | IN  | D   |
| _ |     | Hi A ©,  |      | _    |     |     |
|   |     | Please choose IN, let's maximise our earnings! I                                 |      |      |     |     |
| 2 | 6   | am a HIGH TYPE© -B   | PH   | Н    | IN  | R   |
|   | 1 0 | am a montrible -b  | r 11 | - '' | IIV | 11  |

|             |    | Win-win situation →\$17 for you: I will try to get                              |     |          |     |   |
|-------------|----|---|-----|----------|-----|---|
| 2           | 7  | as much \$ for both of us. Choose IN.   | IHR | L        | IN  | R |
|             |    | L⊗W   |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | But we're gonna leave with \$12!  |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | ☺   |     |          |     |   |
| 2           | 8  | (I'm so nice)   | LD  | L        | IN  | D |
|             |    | I am HIGH type. So if you choose OUT we will only                               |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | get \$5 each. So choose IN, in which case I can                                 |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | choose DON'T ROLL& we will get \$7 each. Even if                                |     |          |     |   |
| 2           | 9  | I roll, the probability that you get \$12 is more.                              | PH  | Н        | IN  | R |
| 2           | 10 | Hi I am a Low type  | PL  | L        | OUT | - |
|             |    |   |     |          |     |   |
|             |    |   |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | ①CHOOSE IN SO THAT YOU AT LEAST EARN \$7,                                       |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | INSTEAD OF \$5. 2 YOUR CHOICE WHETHER TO  |     |          |     |   |
| 2           | 11 | 'ROLL' OR 'DON'T ROLL'. IN, CHOOSE THIS! =)                                     | Ε   | L        | IN  | D |
|             |    | Congrats! I am a high B! © ©  |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | I will choose ROLL.   |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | Your expected additional pay if you choose                                      |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | ① OUT=\$5   |     |          |     |   |
| 2           | 12 | ② $IN = \frac{5}{6} \times \$12 = \$12$   | PHR | Н        | IN  | R |
|             |    | Hello! I guess its fate that I'm being paired with                              |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | you, and I guess we are both here for a common                                  |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | reason, that is to earn money. As such, I think                                 |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | that the best thing that both of us could do is to                              |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | try to earn as much money as we can! I have                                     |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | gotten the card for the HIGH type, I was thinking                               |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | that if you choose IN, and I'll choose to roll (since                           |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | the probability for you to win \$12 is 5/6) and I                               |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | believe that we will be able to win BIG MONEY                                   |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | here (Total payouts: \$12 (yours)+\$10(mine)). In                               |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | this way, that's the most that we both can win                                  |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | out of here. Let's cooperate and work together to                               |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | win BIG MONEY since we are fated to be paired                                   |     |          |     |   |
| 2           | 13 | together! ©   | PHR | L        | OUT | _ |
| <del></del> |    | ① A-out-worst case→5-5 ② A-IN   |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | B-LOW-don't Roll→7, 7 fair  |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | B-LOW-Roll→0, 10 Not fair   |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | $\rightarrow$ A choose IN and Roll Die=2, 3,4,5,6 or Don't                      |     |          |     |   |
| 2           | 14 | Roll $\rightarrow$ Fair Enough.   | Е   | L        | IN  | R |
|             |    | I am a high type B→I <u>will</u> choose to roll. If you                         |     | <u>-</u> | -   |   |
|             |    | choose IN: 5/6 chance for you to win \$12, 1/6                                  |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | chance for you to win \$0.  |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | If you choose out: 100% chance to win \$5.                                      |     |          |     |   |
|             |    | $\frac{5}{6} \times 12 + \frac{1}{6} \times 0 = 10 > \frac{1}{1} \times 5 = 5.$ |     |          |     |   |
| 2           | 10 | 1   | DHD | Ц        | INI | D |
| 2           | 15 | YOUR CHOICE!!☺  | PHR | Н        | IN  | R |

|   |    | T   |       |        |     |    |
|---|----|---|-------|--------|-----|----|
|   |    | Hi A,   |       |        |     |    |
|   |    | I request you to choose "IN". If you do so, I would see to that you won't get a zero, and both of us    |       |        |     |    |
|   |    | can get extra amount. I'm sure I would play it safe   |       |        |     |    |
| 3 | 1  | for both of us. Thank you.  | PNS   | L      | IN  | D  |
|   |    | I'm low, so if you choose IN, I'll choose DON'T   |       |        |     |    |
| 3 | 2  | ROLL so both of us will get \$7   | LD    | LD L I |     | D  |
|   |    | Hello! I got 3 which is HIGH-type ⊕YAY. Just  |       |        |     |    |
|   |    | choose IN always, I will probably choose ROLL   |       |        |     |    |
|   |    | since it's 5/6 probability you get \$12. It's more  |       |        |     |    |
| 3 | 3  | worth than \$7, unless the dice is wonky then I'll choose to not roll. All the best, partner!           | PHR   | Н      | IN  | R  |
|   | 3  | I have a high type and I will roll, so you can  | TIIIX | !!     | 110 | 11 |
| 3 | 4  | choose IN if you like.  | PHR   | L      | IN  | R  |
|   |    | I am feeling very high ☺  |       |        |     |    |
|   |    | Stakes are high, choose wisely©   |       |        |     |    |
| 3 | 5  | LOL☺  | Е     | L      | IN  | D  |
| 3 | 6  | Choose IN →Don't ROLL.  | ILD   | Н      | OUT | -  |
|   |    | Hey there,  |       |        |     |    |
|   |    | I will roll when it's HIGH, so pls go all in! Don't be afraid because your chance of getting a 0 is not |       |        |     |    |
|   |    | large (~16%) when it's high. If it's low, I won't roll.   |       |        |     |    |
| 3 | 7  | Yeah©   | Е     | L      | IN  | D  |
|   |    | I'll ensure a fair distribution of \$.All you need to   |       |        |     |    |
| 3 | 8  | do in go IN. WIN-WIN.   | PNS   | L      | IN  | D  |
|   |    | Hi,   |       |        |     |    |
|   |    | I want to give you a Boolean expression to solve,   |       |        |     |    |
|   |    | OR Gate expression, what is A+1=?, that is me. If you are into the game, we both won't get AND          |       |        |     |    |
| 3 | 9  | Gate expression $A\cdot 0=$ ?   | Е     | Н      | IN  | R  |
|   |    | Please choose 'IN' to receive more than \$5.  | _     |        |     |    |
| 3 | 10 | We will both get \$7 instead of \$5.  | PD    | L      | IN  | D  |
|   |    | Hi! I am High type ©Let's play the game and see   |       |        |     |    |
| 3 | 11 | if you are lucky. :)  | PHR   | L      | OUT | ı  |
| 3 | 12 | -   | N     | Н      | IN  | R  |
|   |    | You choose in, I will choose Don't Roll. Then we  | _     |        |     | _  |
| 4 | 1  | can both have \$7.  | PD    | L      | IN  | D  |
| 4 | 2  | Choose IN okay, don't worry I'm nice ©  | PNS   | L      | IN  | D  |
|   |    | I'm high type, so choose in☺<br>I will probably roll, so there's an 80% chance of                       |       |        |     |    |
| 4 | 3  | you getting \$12.   | PHR   | Н      | IN  | R  |
|   |    | I'd hope you choose in. LOL.  |       |        |     |    |
| 4 | 4  | No point trying convince you. I'm HIGH anyway.  | PH    | L      | IN  | R  |
|   |    | Feeling tired today,  |       |        |     |    |
|   |    | ©   |       |        |     |    |
| 1 |    | but hope you have a good day today,   | С     | ı      | INI | D  |
| 4 | 5  | &win some moolah! Cheers!   | Е     | L      | IN  | R  |

|   |    | Hi A Lam a HIGH type B. Since there is a E/G  |     |      |     |    |
|---|----|---|-----|------|-----|----|
|   |    | Hi A, I am a HIGH type B. Since there is a <u>5/6</u> chance for you to earn \$12, I am going to roll the |     |      |     |    |
|   |    | die. Although in the end I will get \$10 anyways, I   |     |      |     |    |
|   |    |   |     |      |     |    |
| 4 | 6  | feel that you would prefer a gamble for \$12.  Good luck!   | PHR | Н    | IN  | R  |
| 4 | 7  | Choose IN and we'll both benefit.   | E   | L    | IN  | D  |
| 4 | 8  | Choose whatever you really want.  | E   | L    | IN  | R  |
|   | -  | HI, I GOT HIGH TYPE. IF U CHOOSE IN, BOTH OF  |     |      | 111 | 11 |
| 4 | 9  | US CAN GET MAX PAYOFF.  | PH  | Н    | IN  | R  |
|   |    | I am B with low type. You can choose IN. I will be  |     |      |     |    |
|   |    | choosing Don't Roll, so that we both can get \$7  |     |      |     |    |
| 5 | 1  | each.   | LD  | L    | IN  | D  |
|   |    | Hi ©, I've tried but I'll make sure our time here is  |     |      |     |    |
| 5 | 2  | not wasted!!  | Е   | L    | IN  | D  |
|   |    |   |     |      |     |    |
|   |    | Choose IN & I will do my best for your high pay.  |     |      |     |    |
| 5 | 3  | © Let's get high pay together.  | E   | Н    | IN  | R  |
|   |    | Hello!  |     |      |     |    |
|   |    | I think we would both be better off if you choose   |     |      |     |    |
|   |    | "IN" as both our payoffs will be higher! And for  |     |      |     |    |
|   |    | that, promise to act in your best interest! I won't   |     |      |     |    |
|   |    | be rolling the dice.  |     |      |     |    |
| 5 | 4  | Thank you!  | PNS | L    | IN  | R  |
|   |    | Hi A,   |     |      |     |    |
|   |    | It would be beneficial for both of us if you choose   |     |      |     |    |
|   |    | IN and I choose not to roll, we will each then be   |     |      |     |    |
|   |    | able to get an additional amount of money. So   |     |      |     |    |
| 5 | 5  | that will be mutually beneficial to both of us.   | PD  | L    | IN  | D  |
|   |    | High, will roll-shouldn't be unlucky :) Don't   |     |      |     |    |
| 5 | 6  | choose out!   | IHR | Н    | IN  | R  |
|   |    | You might not get any money if I choose ROLL.   |     |      |     |    |
|   |    | But I may choose not to roll since I believe I am   |     |      |     |    |
|   |    | quite kind. Furthermore, choosing not to roll will  |     |      |     |    |
|   |    | be a better option for the greater good.  |     |      |     | _  |
| 5 | 7  | So, I will not roll the option.   | ILD | L    | IN  | D  |
| 5 | 8  | Hello!!!  | Е   | L    | OUT |    |
| _ |    | Yay   | _   | 11   | OUT |    |
| 5 | 9  | Free Money  | Е   | Н    | OUT |    |
| F | 10 | I am a low type and would choose Don't Roll. You  | 10  | ,    | INI |    |
| 5 | 10 | could choose out if you want to play safe though.   | LD  | L    | IN  | D  |
| 5 | 11 | IF YOU CHOOSE 'IN', I SHALL MAXIMISE YOU PAYOUT.  | E   | L    | IN  | D  |
| 5 | 12 | I win, you WIN.   | E   | Н    | IN  | R  |
| ر | 12 | i wiii, you wiiw.   | L   | - 11 | 111 | 11 |

The (5, 7)-game No-Message Treatment

| Session | ID(B) | Туре | А   | В |
|---------|-------|------|-----|---|
| 1       | 1     | L    | IN  | D |
| 1       | 2     | L    | IN  | R |
| 1       | 3     | Н    | IN  | R |
| 1       | 4     | L    | IN  | D |
| 1       | 5     | L    | OUT | _ |
| 1       | 6     | Н    | OUT | _ |
| 1       | 7     | L    | IN  | R |
| 1       | 8     | L    | IN  | R |
| 1       | 9     | Н    | IN  | R |
| 1       | 10    | L    | IN  | D |
| 1       | 11    | L    | IN  | D |
| 1       | 12    | Н    | IN  | R |
| 1       | 13    | L    | IN  | R |
| 1       | 14    | L    | IN  | D |
| 1       | 15    | Н    | OUT | _ |
| 2       | 1     | L    | IN  | D |
| 2       | 2     | L    | IN  | R |
| 2       | 3     | Н    | IN  | R |
| 2       | 4     | L    | IN  | R |
| 2       | 5     | L    | IN  | R |
| 2       | 6     | Н    | IN  | R |
| 2       | 7     | L    | OUT | _ |
| 2       | 8     | L    | IN  | R |
| 2       | 9     | Н    | OUT | _ |
| 2       | 10    | L    | OUT | _ |
| 2       | 11    | L    | IN  | D |
| 2       | 12    | Н    | OUT | _ |
| 2       | 13    | L    | IN  | R |
| 2       | 14    | L    | OUT | _ |
| 2       | 15    | Н    | OUT | _ |
| 2       | 16    | L    | OUT | _ |
| 3       | 1     | L    | OUT | _ |
| 3       | 2     | L    | OUT | _ |
| 3       | 3     | Н    | OUT | _ |
| 3       | 4     | L    | IN  | R |
| 3       | 5     | L    | IN  | D |
| 3       | 6     | Н    | IN  | R |
| 3       | 7     | L    | IN  | D |
| 3       | 8     | L    | IN  | D |
| 3       | 9     | Н    | OUT | _ |
| 3       | 10    | L    | OUT | _ |
| 3       | 11    | L    | OUT | _ |
| 4       | 1     | L    | IN  | R |
| 4       | 2     | L    | OUT | _ |

| 4 | 3  | Н | IN  | R |
|---|----|---|-----|---|
| 4 | 4  | Г | OUT | _ |
| 4 | 5  | L | IN  | D |
| 4 | 6  | Н | IN  | R |
| 4 | 7  | L | IN  | R |
| 4 | 8  | L | OUT | _ |
| 4 | 9  | Н | IN  | R |
| 4 | 10 | L | OUT | _ |
| 4 | 11 | L | IN  | D |
| 5 | 1  | L | OUT | _ |
| 5 | 2  | L | OUT | _ |
| 5 | 3  | Н | OUT | _ |
| 5 | 4  | L | OUT | _ |
| 5 | 5  | L | IN  | R |
| 5 | 6  | Н | IN  | R |
| 5 | 7  | L | IN  | R |
| 5 | 8  | L | IN  | D |
| 5 | 9  | Н | IN  | R |
| 5 | 10 | L | IN  | R |
| 5 | 11 | L | IN  | R |
| 5 | 12 | Н | IN  | R |
| 5 | 13 | L | OUT | _ |