

[13.26] Express the coefficients of the polynomial


$$\det(\mathbf{T} - \lambda \mathbf{I}) = (\lambda_1 - \lambda) \cdots (\lambda_n - \lambda) = 0$$

in diagrammatic form. Work them out for $n = 2$ and $n = 3$.

Proof. Beckmann produced a very nice proof that was then further simplified by an elegant enhancement provided by Dean. However, as far as I can tell, neither of them actually “worked out the equations for $n = 2$ or $n = 3$ ” as Penrose requested to generate the polynomial $(\lambda_1 - \lambda) \cdots (\lambda_n - \lambda)$.

Let $\mathbf{R} = \square$, $\mathbf{T} = \nabla$, and $\mathbf{S} = \bullet = -\lambda$, and set

$$\square = \nabla + \bullet = \nabla - \lambda \quad \Rightarrow \quad \square = \nabla - \lambda \delta^a_b = T^a_b - \lambda \delta^a_b$$

Recall that $\text{Det}(\mathbf{T}) = \frac{1}{n!}$ .

We use the following fact repeatedly:

$$\square \square = \square \nabla + \square \bullet :$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Proof: } \square \square &= \epsilon^{ab} R^c_a R^d_b \epsilon_{cd} = \epsilon^{ab} R^c_a (S^d_b + T^d_b) \epsilon_{cd} \\ &= \epsilon^{ab} R^c_a S^d_b \epsilon_{cd} + \epsilon^{ab} R^c_a T^d_b \epsilon_{cd} \\ &= \square \nabla + \square \bullet \quad \checkmark \end{aligned}$$

$n = 2$:

$$\begin{aligned} 2! \text{Det}(\mathbf{T} - \lambda \mathbf{I}) &= \square \square = \square \nabla - \lambda \square \\ &= (\square \nabla - \lambda \square \nabla) - \lambda (\square \nabla - \lambda \square) \end{aligned}$$

$$= \text{Diagram 1} - \lambda (\text{Diagram 2} + \text{Diagram 3}) + \lambda^2 \text{Diagram 4}.$$

There is a basis such that the matrix of T is triangular, so that

$$\mathbf{T} = \begin{pmatrix} T_1^1 & T_1^2 \\ T_2^1 & T_2^2 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \lambda_1 & b \\ 0 & \lambda_2 \end{pmatrix}.$$

(This is the Jordan Canonical Form. Penrose mentions it in Footnote 13.12.)

I will use the fact that $\epsilon^{12} \epsilon_{12} = -\epsilon^{12} \epsilon_{21} = -\epsilon^{21} \epsilon_{12} = \epsilon^{21} \epsilon_{21} = 1$ which I proved in problem [13.22]. So,

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Diagram 1} &= \epsilon^{ab} T_a^c T_b^d \epsilon_{cd} \\ &= \epsilon^{12} T_1^1 T_2^2 \epsilon_{12} + \epsilon^{12} T_1^2 T_2^1 \epsilon_{21} + \epsilon^{21} T_1^1 T_2^2 \epsilon_{12} + \epsilon^{21} T_1^2 T_2^1 \epsilon_{21} \\ &= \lambda_1 \lambda_2 - (0)(b) - (b)(0) + \lambda_2 \lambda_1 \\ &= 2\lambda_1 \lambda_2 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Diagram 2} &= \epsilon^{ab} \delta_a^c T_b^d \epsilon_{cd} \\ &= \epsilon^{12} \delta_1^1 T_2^2 \epsilon_{12} + \epsilon^{12} \delta_1^2 T_2^1 \epsilon_{21} + \epsilon^{21} \delta_2^1 T_1^2 \epsilon_{12} + \epsilon^{21} \delta_2^2 T_1^1 \epsilon_{21} \\ &= \lambda_2 - (0)(b) - (0)(0) + \lambda_1 \\ &= \lambda_1 + \lambda_2. \end{aligned}$$

Similarly we find that

$$\text{Diagram 3} = \lambda_1 + \lambda_2.$$

Finally,

$$\text{Diagram 4} = 2! = 2.$$

So

$$\det(\mathbf{T} - \lambda \mathbf{I}) = \frac{1}{2} [2(\lambda_1 \lambda_2) - 2\lambda(\lambda_1 + \lambda_2) + 2\lambda^2] = \lambda^2 - \lambda(\lambda_1 + \lambda_2) + \lambda_1 \lambda_2$$

$$= (\lambda_1 - \lambda)(\lambda_2 - \lambda) \quad \checkmark$$

$n = 3$:

$$3! \text{ Det}(\mathbf{T} - \lambda \mathbf{I}) = \begin{array}{c} d \quad e \quad f \\ \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \square & \square & \square \\ \hline \end{array} \\ a \quad b \quad c \end{array} = \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \square & \square & \nabla \\ \hline \end{array} \\ - \lambda \begin{array}{|c|c|} \hline \square & \square \\ \hline \end{array} \end{array}$$

$$= \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \square & \nabla & \nabla \\ \hline \end{array} - \lambda \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \square & \square & \nabla \\ \hline \end{array} - \lambda \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \square & \nabla & \square \\ \hline \end{array} + \lambda^2 \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \square & \square & \square \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \nabla & \nabla & \nabla \\ \hline \end{array} - \lambda \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \nabla & \nabla & \square \\ \hline \end{array} - \lambda \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \nabla & \square & \nabla \\ \hline \end{array} + \lambda^2 \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \nabla & \square & \square \\ \hline \end{array} \\ - \lambda \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \nabla & \nabla & \square \\ \hline \end{array} + \lambda^2 \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \nabla & \square & \square \\ \hline \end{array} + \lambda^2 \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \nabla & \square & \square \\ \hline \end{array} - \lambda^3 \begin{array}{|c|c|c|} \hline \square & \square & \square \\ \hline \end{array} \end{array}$$

$$= \epsilon^{abc} \epsilon_{def} \left(T_a^d T_b^e T_c^f - \lambda \delta_a^d T_b^e T_c^f - \lambda T_a^d \delta_b^e T_c^f + \lambda^2 \delta_a^d \delta_b^e T_c^f \right)$$

$$= \epsilon^{123} \epsilon_{123} \left(T_1^1 T_2^2 T_3^3 - \lambda \delta_1^1 T_2^2 T_3^3 - \lambda T_1^1 \delta_2^2 T_3^3 + \lambda^2 \delta_1^1 \delta_2^2 T_3^3 \right)$$

$$+ \epsilon^{123} \epsilon_{312} \left(T_1^1 T_2^2 T_3^3 - \lambda \delta_1^1 T_2^2 T_3^3 - \lambda T_1^1 \delta_2^2 T_3^3 + \lambda^2 \delta_1^1 \delta_2^2 T_3^3 \right)$$

$$+ \dots$$

$$+ \epsilon^{321} \epsilon_{321} \left(T_3^3 T_2^2 T_1^1 - \lambda \delta_3^3 T_2^2 T_1^1 - \lambda T_3^3 \delta_2^2 T_1^1 + \lambda^2 \delta_3^3 \delta_2^2 T_1^1 \right)$$

(There are 36 sets of expressions involving T and δ corresponding to 6 permutations of ϵ times 6 permutations of ϵ .)

By choosing an appropriate basis we can assume T is in triangular form:

$$\mathbf{T} = \begin{pmatrix} T_1^1 & T_2^1 & T_3^1 \\ T_1^2 & T_2^2 & T_3^2 \\ T_1^3 & T_2^3 & T_3^3 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \lambda_1 & b & c \\ 0 & \lambda_2 & f \\ 0 & 0 & \lambda_3 \end{pmatrix}.$$

We also use the following fact that I proved in problem [13.22]:

$$\epsilon^{123}_{123} = \epsilon^{132}_{132} = \dots = \epsilon^{321}_{321} = -\epsilon^{123}_{132} = -\epsilon^{132}_{123} = \dots = -\epsilon^{321}_{31} = 1$$

In any of the 36 sets of expressions, unless all three of the upper and lower indices match, the given set consists of the sum of eight zeros:

- Each of the 8 terms has at least one factor of δ or T from the lower left of its matrix. Those values are zero.

So, there are only 6 sets that have non-zero terms, and we can write

$$\begin{aligned} & 3! \text{Det}(\mathbf{T} - \lambda \mathbf{I}) \\ &= \epsilon^{123}_{123} \left(T_1^1 T_2^2 T_3^3 - \lambda \delta_1^1 T_2^2 T_3^3 - \lambda T_1^1 \delta_2^2 T_3^3 + \lambda^2 \delta_1^1 \delta_2^2 T_3^3 \right) \\ & \quad - \lambda T_1^1 T_2^2 \delta_3^3 + \lambda^2 \delta_1^1 T_2^2 \delta_3^3 + \lambda^2 T_1^1 \delta_2^2 \delta_3^3 - \lambda^3 \delta_1^1 \delta_2^2 \delta_3^3 \\ &+ \epsilon^{312}_{312} \left(T_3^3 T_1^1 T_2^2 - \lambda \delta_3^3 T_1^1 T_2^2 - \lambda T_3^3 \delta_1^1 T_2^2 + \lambda^2 \delta_3^3 \delta_1^1 T_2^2 \right) \\ & \quad - \lambda T_3^3 T_1^1 \delta_2^2 + \lambda^2 \delta_3^3 T_1^1 \delta_2^2 + \lambda^2 T_3^3 \delta_1^1 \delta_2^2 - \lambda^3 \delta_3^3 \delta_1^1 \delta_2^2 \\ &+ \epsilon^{231}_{231} \left(T_2^2 T_3^3 T_1^1 - \lambda \delta_2^2 T_3^3 T_1^1 - \lambda T_2^2 \delta_3^3 T_1^1 + \lambda^2 \delta_2^2 \delta_3^3 T_1^1 \right) \\ & \quad - \lambda T_2^2 T_3^3 \delta_1^1 + \lambda^2 \delta_2^2 T_3^3 \delta_1^1 + \lambda^2 T_2^2 \delta_3^3 \delta_1^1 - \lambda^3 \delta_2^2 \delta_3^3 \delta_1^1 \\ &+ \epsilon^{132}_{132} \left(T_1^1 T_3^3 T_2^2 - \lambda \delta_1^1 T_3^3 T_2^2 - \lambda T_1^1 \delta_3^3 T_2^2 + \lambda^2 \delta_1^1 \delta_3^3 T_2^2 \right) \\ & \quad - \lambda T_1^1 T_3^3 \delta_2^2 + \lambda^2 \delta_1^1 T_3^3 \delta_2^2 + \lambda^2 T_1^1 \delta_3^3 \delta_2^2 - \lambda^3 \delta_1^1 \delta_3^3 \delta_2^2 \\ &+ \epsilon^{213}_{213} \left(T_2^2 T_1^1 T_3^3 - \lambda \delta_2^2 T_1^1 T_3^3 - \lambda T_2^2 \delta_1^1 T_3^3 + \lambda^2 \delta_2^2 \delta_1^1 T_3^3 \right) \\ & \quad - \lambda T_2^2 T_1^1 \delta_3^3 + \lambda^2 \delta_2^2 T_1^1 \delta_3^3 + \lambda^2 T_2^2 \delta_1^1 \delta_3^3 - \lambda^3 \delta_2^2 \delta_1^1 \delta_3^3 \\ &+ \epsilon^{321}_{321} \left(T_3^3 T_2^2 T_1^1 - \lambda \delta_3^3 T_2^2 T_1^1 - \lambda T_3^3 \delta_2^2 T_1^1 + \lambda^2 \delta_3^3 \delta_2^2 T_1^1 \right) \\ & \quad - \lambda T_3^3 T_2^2 \delta_1^1 + \lambda^2 \delta_3^3 T_2^2 \delta_1^1 + \lambda^2 T_3^3 \delta_2^2 \delta_1^1 - \lambda^3 \delta_3^3 \delta_2^2 \delta_1^1 \\ &= 6\lambda_1 \lambda_2 \lambda_3 - 6\lambda(\lambda_1 \lambda_2 + \lambda_1 \lambda_3 + \lambda_2 \lambda_3) + 6\lambda^2(\lambda_1 + \lambda_2 + \lambda_3) - 6\lambda^3. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Det}(\mathbf{T} - \lambda \mathbf{I}) &= \lambda_1 \lambda_2 \lambda_3 - \lambda(\lambda_1 \lambda_2 + \lambda_1 \lambda_3 + \lambda_2 \lambda_3) + \lambda^2(\lambda_1 + \lambda_2 + \lambda_3) - \lambda^3 \\ &= (\lambda_1 - \lambda)(\lambda_2 - \lambda)(\lambda_3 - \lambda). \quad \checkmark \end{aligned}$$