

Bradley J. Sawatzke Columbia Generating Station P.O. Box 968, PE08 Richland, WA 99352-0968 Ph. 509.377.4300 | F. 509.377.4150 bjsawatzke@energy-northwest.com

January 13, 2012 GO2-12-006

10 CFR 50.73

U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission ATTN: Document Control Desk Washington, D.C. 20555-0001

Subject:

COLUMBIA GENERATING STATION, DOCKET NO. 50-397

LICENSEE EVENT REPORT NO. 2012-001-00

Dear Sir or Madam:

Transmitted herewith is Licensee Event Report No. 2012-001-00 for Columbia Generating Station. This report is submitted pursuant to 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(i)(B).

There are no commitments being made to the NRC herein. If you have any questions or require additional information, please contact Mr. ZK Dunham at (509) 377-4735.

Respectfully,

B.I. Sawatzke

Vice President, Nuclear Generation & Chief Nuclear Officer

Enclosure: Licensee Event Report 2012-001-00

cc: NRC Region IV Administrator NRC NRR Project Manager

NRC Senior Resident Inspector/988C

RN Sherman - BPA/1399

WA Horin - Winston & Strawn

TEZZ

NRC FORM 366 U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION APPROVED BY OMB NO. 3150-0104 EXPIRES 10/31/(10-2010) Estimated burden per response to comply with this mandatory collection reques															
					8 fe S	80 hours. Reported lessons learned are incorporated into the licensing process and fed back to industry. Send comments regarding burden estimate to the FOIA/Privacy Section (T-5 F53), U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission, Washington, DC 20555-0001, or by internet e-mail to infocollects.resource@nrc.gov, and to the Desk Officer,									
LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER) (See reverse for required number of					l C	Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs, NEOB-10202 (3150-0104), Office of									
digits/characters for each block)						ir N	Management and Budget, Washington, DC 20503. If a means used to impose an information collection does not display a currently valid OMB control number, the NRC may not conduct or sponsor, and a person is not required to respond to, the information collection.								
1. FACILITY NAME					2	2. DOCKET NUMBER				3. PAGE					
Columbia Generating Station						05000397				1 OF 3					
4. TITLE															
DG-3 Inoperable for Longer than Allowed by TS Due to Failed Governor															
5. E\	/ENT D	ATE	6.	LER NUMBE		7.	REPORT	DATE	FACILITY N	OTHE	R FAC	ILITIES		VED KET NUMBER	
MONTH	DAY	YEAF	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REV NO.	MONTH	H DAY	YEAR						05000	
2	28	2010	20	12 – 001 – 0	00	1	13	2012	FACILITY N	IAME				KET NUMBER 5000	
1				201(b) 201(d)	=		203(a)(3)(i 203(a)(3)(i		_ ``).73(a)(i).73(a)(i	2)(VII) 2)(viii)(A)	
			20.2	203 (a)(1)	Ī] 20.22	203(a)(4)] 50.73(a)(2))(ii)(B)		□ 50).73(a)(2)(viii)(B)	
10. POWE	D I EVI	=					36(c)(1)(i)(A)				50.73(a)(2)(ix)(A)				
10. FOWE	U FEAT	-					5(c)(1)(ii)(<i>i</i> 5(c)(2)	י ב כ			☐ 50.73(a)(2)(x) ☐ 73.71(a)(4)			, , ,	
'''			20.2	☐ 20.2203(a)(2)(iv) ☐ 50.			46(a)(3)(ii))(v)(B)	73.71(a)(5)				
				203(a)(2)(v) 203(a)(2)(vi)			8(a)(2)(i)(A 8(a)(2)(i)(E		= ` ` ^ `				THER	Abstract below	
)(V)(D)				Form 366A	
12. LICENSEE CONTACT FOR THIS LER															
FACILITY NAME TELEPHONE NUMBER (Include Area Code) Kyle D. Christianson, Principal Licensing Engineer (509) 377-4315															
Kyle D. (Christia	anson,			-										
Kyle D. (Christi	anson,		TE ONE LINE				FAILURE DI	SCHIBED IN	· · · · · · ·					
CAUSE		STEM		TE ONE LINE MANU- FACTURES	RE	CH COMP PORTABLE TO EPIX		CAUSE	SYSTEM		ONENT	MA	NU- URER	REPORTABLE TO EPIX	
		STEM	13. COMPLE	MANU-	RE	PORTABLE						MA			
CAUSE	SY EK	STEM	13. COMPLE COMPONENT 65 SUPPLEMEN	MANU- FACTURES W290	R Y T EXPEC	PORTABLE TO EPIX	E	CAUSE	SYSTEM 15. EXPECTE	COMPO	MON	FACT	DAY	TO EPIX YEAR	
CAUSE	SY EK	STEM	13. COMPLE COMPONENT 65 SUPPLEMEN	FACTURES W290	R Y T EXPEC	PORTABLE TO EPIX		CAUSE	SYSTEM	COMPO	ONENT	FACT	URER	TO EPIX	
CAUSE E VES (SY EK	STEM 14 complete	13. COMPLE COMPONENT 65 SUPPLEMEN 15. EXPECTE	MANU- FACTURES W290	T EXPEC	PORTABLE TO EPIX TED	E	CAUSE	SYSTEM 15. EXPECTE SUBMISSIO DATE	COMPO	MON	FACT	DAY	TO EPIX YEAR	
CAUSE E YES (EK If yes, c	STEM 14. complete	13. COMPLE COMPONENT 65 SUPPLEMENT 15. EXPECTE 1400 space	W290 WAND-FACTURER W290 WANTAL REPOR	T EXPECTON DATE	TED 15 singl	E	CAUSE O It typewritte	SYSTEM 15. EXPECTE SUBMISSIO DATE n lines)	COMPO	MON 03	MA FACT	DAY	YEAR 2012	
E YES (ABSTR On Feb division	EK Style St	14. complete (Limit to / 28, 2 nerge	13. COMPLE COMPONENT 65 SUPPLEMEN 15. EXPECTE 1400 space 2010, folioncy diese	W290 WTAL REPORTED SUBMISSIONS, i.e., approximation investigations and the control of the contro	T EXPECTON DATE ximately estigation or (DG-	TED 15 single ons of -3) ele	□ N le-space f a sma ectro-h	o d typewritte lll amour	15. EXPECTE SUBMISSIO DATE In lines) It of oil for type gove	composition compos	MON 03 n the	TH S	DAY 13 nity of	YEAR 2012	
E YES (ABSTR On Feb division	EK Style St	14. complete (Limit to / 28, 2 nerge	13. COMPLE COMPONENT 65 SUPPLEMEN 15. EXPECTE 1400 space 2010, folioncy diese	W290 WTAL REPORTED SUBMISSIONS, i.e., approximation investigation of the control	T EXPECTON DATE ximately estigation or (DG-	TED 15 single ons of -3) ele	□ N le-space f a sma ectro-h	o d typewritte lll amour	15. EXPECTE SUBMISSIO DATE In lines) It of oil for type gove	composition compos	MON 03 n the	TH S	DAY 13 nity of	YEAR 2012	
E YES (ABSTR On Feb division being of oscillation	EK Oruany Operations of	14. complete (Limit to / 28, 2 nerge ted to of app	component 65 SUPPLEMENT 15. EXPECTE 1400 space 2010, follourcy diese validate in	W290 WTAL REPORTED SUBMISSION s, i.e., approximation of the control of the contr	T EXPECTON DATE ximately estigation (DG- kage from	TED 15 single ons of -3) election the	le-space f a sma ectro-h e gove	o d typewritte	15. EXPECTE SUBMISSION DATE In lines) at of oil for type gove i-3 started operation	ound it	MON 03 n the (gov	TH S vicing equer	DAY 13 nity of load	YEAR 2012 f the 3-3 was	
CAUSE E YES (ABSTR On Feb division being o oscillati actions	EK ACT (pruary 3 em perations (reve	14. complete (Limit to / 28, 2 nerge ted to of appaled t	component 65 SUPPLEMEN 15. EXPECTE 1400 space 2010, follourcy diese validate in validate i	W290 WTAL REPORED SUBMISSION S, i.e., appropriate of the control o	T EXPECTON DATE eximately estigation or (DG- cage from	TED 15 single ons of -3) ele om the 15 min preser	le-space f a smalectro-hipe gove nutes ont in al	o d typewritte all amour ydraulic troor. DG f full load I modes	15. EXPECTE SUBMISSION DATE of oil for type gove a starte of operation of operation of operation of operation of operations.	eund iternor dexpon. Stion (i	MON 03 n the (gov perier ubse	TH vicing remains a second remains a sec	DAY 13 nity of load load speed	YEAR 2012 I the G-3 was estigative ed, and	
E YES (ABSTR On Feb division being of the oscillations fully load	EK Oruany Operations (coreve	14. complete (Limit to / 28, 2 nerge ted to of app aled t whicl	13. COMPLE COMPONENT 65 SUPPLEMENT 15. EXPECTE 1400 space 2010, follourcy diese validate in coximatel the load in a indicate	W290 WTAL REPORT S. i.e., approximately generated to oil leak by 300 kW astabilities da govern	Y TEXPECTON DATE ximately estigation or (DG- cage from after 4 s were nor con	15 single ons of the present of p	le-space f a sma ectro-h e gove nutes o nt in al	o typewritte	15. EXPECTI SUBMISSION DATE In lines) at of oil for type gove in-3 starte if operation	eund iternor d expon. Scion (iblesho	mon 03 n the (gov perier ubse dle,	TH sernor rated g, the	DAY 13 nity of load load in inverse DG-	YEAR 2012 I the G-3 was estigative ed, and 3	
CAUSE E VES (ABSTR On Feb division being of oscillati actions fully load governe	EK Oruany Operations (coreveaded) or wa	14. complete (Limit to / 28, 2 nerge ted to of app aled t which is rep	component 65 SUPPLEMEN 15. EXPECTE 1400 space 2010, follourcy diese validate in roximatel he load in indicate daced. Do	W290 WTAL REPORED SUBMISSION IS, i.e., approximately 300 kW astabilities dispersed a governing testing	T EXPECTON DATE ximately estigation (DG- cage from after 4) s were nor cong was o	TED 15 single ons of -3) ele om the presented	le-space f a sma ectro-h e gove nutes o nt in al eroblen eted a	o typewritte all amour ydraulic fror. DG full load modes n. Follownd was re	15. EXPECTE SUBMISSION DATE In lines) It of oil for type gove i-3 started of operation of operation trouble eturned to the start of the	ound items of the control of the con	MON 03 n the (gov periel ubset dle, potin vice	TH servicing equer rated g, the on M	DAY 13 nity of load of invested DG-arch	YEAR 2012 If the 3-3 was estigative ed, and 34, 2010.	
CAUSE E ABSTR On Feb division being of oscillati actions fully load governed The dir	EK Oruany operations of revealed) or was	14. complete (Limit to / 28, 2 nerge ted to of app aled t which as replaces	13. COMPLE COMPONENT 65 SUPPLEMENT 15. EXPECTE 1400 space 2010, follouncy diese validate in roximatel the load in indicate aced. Do of the eve	W290 WTAL REPORED SUBMISSION S, i.e., appro- Dewing invention oil leak by 300 kW stabilities d a gover G-3 testing ont is belie	T EXPECTON DATE eximately estigation after 4 after 4 awere nor cong y was oved to	TED 15 single ons of -3) ele om the l5 min presentrol p comple be rel	le-space a smale gove nutes on the all problem eted a lated to	o d typewritte all amour ydraulic fror. DC f full load I modes a. Follow ad was re o foreign	15. EXPECTE SUBMISSION DATE In lines) at of oil for type gove a-3 starte of operation of operation troubeturned to material	eund i ernor d exp on. S ion (i olesho o sen left ir	mon 03 n the (gov periel ubse dle, potin vice n the	TH servicing equer rated g, the gove	DAY 13 nity of load at inverse DG-arch ernor	YEAR 2012 I the G-3 was estigative ed, and 3 4, 2010. as early	
CAUSE E VES (ABSTR On Feb division being of oscillati actions fully loa governed The dir as 2008	EK Oruany operations (a reveaded) or water (a cate of the cate	14. complete (Limit to / 28, 2 nerge ted to of app aled t which as replause	13. COMPLE COMPONENT 65 SUPPLEMENT 15. EXPECTE 1400 space 2010, follourcy diese validate in indicate i	W290 WTAL REPORED SUBMISSION IN I.e., approact In generate In o oil leak In y 300 kW In stabilities In a gover	T EXPECTON DATE eximately estigation (DG- cage from after 4 s were nor cong was one even to be even	15 single on the preser of trol promple be release.	le-space a smale ctro-hie gove nutes on the in all problem eted a lated to organ	o typewritte all amour ydraulic from DG modes all modes all foreign izational	15. EXPECTE SUBMISSION DATE In lines) Int of oil for type gove in 3 starte in operation of operation of operation in other in operation	eund in ernor dexpon. Sion (in oleshoo sen left in maki	mon 03 n the (gov perier ubse dle, potin vice n the	TH vicing equer rated g, the gove lid no	DAY 13 nity of load nt inverse DG-arch ernor t ade	YEAR 2012 If the G-3 was estigative ed, and 3 4, 2010. as early quately	
CAUSE E VES (ABSTR On Feb division being of oscillati actions fully load governed The dir as 2008 consider	EK Oruany Orectal Freve ACT (Oruany Orectal Freve Aded) Or wa ect ca and Freve The peral Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (Freve Act (14. complete (Limit to / 28, 2 nerge ted to of app aled t which is replaced if that	component component 65 supplement 15. EXPECTE 1400 space 2010, follourcy diese validate in croximatel he load in indicate aced. Do of the even the root can risks an	W290 WTAL REPORT S. i.e., appro- owing invention oil leak by 300 kW astabilities d a govern G-3 testing ant is belief ause of the	T EXPECTON DATE eximately estigation or (DG- cage from after 4 s were nor con g was on eved to ne ever uences	15 single on the present of period pe	le-space a smale ctro-hie gove nutes o nt in all problem eted a lated to organiciated	o typewritte all amour ydraulic from DG full load modes and was reported for for eign izational with ope	15. EXPECTE SUBMISSION DATE In lines) Int of oil for type gove in 3 starte in operation of operation trouble turned to material decision rating the	eund iternor dexpon. Scion (iteleshoo serieft ir makie gov	mon 03 n the (gov peried ubset dle, potin vice n the ing d erno	TH servicing equer rated g, the gove lid no r with	DAY 13 nity of load of invested DG-arch ernor t ade	YEAR 2012 If the G-3 was estigative ed, and 3 4, 2010. as early quately wn	
CAUSE E VES (ABSTR On Feb division being of oscillati actions fully load governed The dir as 2009 consider foreign	EK ACT (pruary 3 en perations (reve aded) or wa ect ca 5 and er lon mate	14. complete (Limit to / 28, 2 nerge ted to of app aled t which as replanted that g term erial in	component 65 SUPPLEMENT 15. EXPECTE 1400 space 2010, follourcy diese validate in roximatel the load in the indicate aced. Do of the eventhe root contribution. I	W290 WTAL REPORED SUBMISSION S, i.e., appropriate of the consequence o	T EXPECTON DATE ON DATE OF (DG) age from a congress of the con	15 single ons of the present to EPIX	le-space f a smale ctro-hip gove nutes on the in all problem eted a lated to organiciated actors s	o d typewritte all amour ydraulic fror. DG f full load I modes a. Follow ad was re o foreign izational with ope	15. EXPECTE SUBMISSION DATE In lines) at of oil for the control of operation of operation of operation the control of operation the control of operation of operation of operation of operation of operation o	eund iternor dexpon. Scion (iteleshoo sendent imakite governor to ag	n the (govoeried ubsets of the ing dering, ing,	TH vicing equer rated g, the gove lid no r with flushi	DAY 13 nity of load of inverse DG- arch ernor t ade of knowing the	YEAR 2012 If the G-3 was estigative ed, and 3 4, 2010. as early quately wn e	
CAUSE E VES (ABSTR On Feb division being of oscillati actions fully load governed The dir as 2009 consider foreign	EK ACT (pruary 3 en perations (reve aded) or wa ect ca 5 and er lon mate	14. complete (Limit to / 28, 2 nerge ted to of app aled t which as replanted that g term erial in	component 65 SUPPLEMENT 15. EXPECTE 1400 space 2010, follourcy diese validate in roximatel the load in the indicate aced. Do of the eventhe root contribution. I	W290 WTAL REPORT S. i.e., appro- owing invention oil leak by 300 kW astabilities d a govern G-3 testing ant is belief ause of the	T EXPECTON DATE ON DATE OF (DG) age from a congress of the con	15 single ons of the present to EPIX	le-space f a smale ctro-hip gove nutes on the in all problem eted a lated to organiciated actors s	o d typewritte all amour ydraulic fror. DG f full load I modes a. Follow ad was re o foreign izational with ope	15. EXPECTE SUBMISSION DATE In lines) at of oil for the control of operation of operation of operation the control of operation the control of operation of operation of operation of operation of operation o	eund iternor dexpon. Scion (iteleshoo sendent imakite governor to ag	n the (govoeried ubsets of the ing dering, ing,	TH vicing equer rated g, the gove lid no r with flushi	DAY 13 nity of load of inverse DG- arch ernor t ade of knowing the	YEAR 2012 If the G-3 was estigative ed, and 3 4, 2010. as early quately wn e	
CAUSE E YES (ABSTR On Feb division being of oscillati actions fully loa governed The dir as 2009 consider foreign governed The Ro	EK Oruany Operations of reve aded) or water lone mater oot Care	14. complete (Limit to / 28, 2 nerge ted to of app aled t which as replaced that g tern crial in the fuel	component 65 SUPPLEMENT 15. EXPECTE 1400 space 2010, follourcy diese validate in roximatel he load in he indicate laced. Do of the even the root contribution. It	W290 WTAL REPORED SUBMISSION S, i.e., appropriate the coll leak by 300 kW astabilities da govern G-3 testing and consequences of the consequences	T EXPECTON DATE OXIMATE OXIMAT	15 single ons of the present was associated as vernor	le-space f a smale ctro-hip e gove nutes on the in all problem eted a lated to organiciated actors strould	o d typewritte all amour ydraulic fror. DG full load and was reported for for eign izational with operation as word by the control of the con	15. EXPECTE SUBMISSION DATE In lines) at of oil for the second of operation operat	eund iternor dexpon. Scion (iteleshoo sende iteleshoo sende it	n the (govoeried ubsets of the ing derno ing, ntrib	TH vicing equer rated g, the gove lid no r with flushiutors	DAY 13 nity of load of inverse DG- arch ernor t ade of knowing the total control of the control	YEAR 2012 I the G-3 was estigative ed, and 3 4, 2010. as early quately wn e e cause.	

NRC FORM 366A (10-2010)	U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION									
LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER) CONTINUATION SHEET										
1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET		6. LER NUMBER	3. PAGE						
Columbia Generating Station	05000397	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REV NO.	2 OF 3					
Columbia Generating Station	05000597	2	2012 – 001 – 00	2010						

NARRATIVE

Plant Condition

Columbia Generating Station (CGS) was operating in Mode 1 at 100% power. There were no structures, systems, or components that were inoperable at the start of this event and that contributed to this event.

Description of Event

On February 28, 2010, following investigations of a small amount of oil found in the vicinity of the division 3 emergency diesel generator (DG-3) [DG] electro-hydraulic type governor (governor) [65], DG-3 was being operated to validate no oil leakage from the governor. DG-3 started experiencing load oscillations of approximately 300 kW after 45 minutes of full load operation. Subsequent investigative actions revealed the load instabilities were present in all modes of operation (idle, rated speed, and fully loaded) which indicated a governor control problem. Following troubleshooting, the governor was replaced. DG-3 completed testing and was returned to service on March 4, 2010.

The forensic investigation of the removed governor revealed a large amount of foreign material throughout. Prior to disassembly, the oil was drained from the governor and evidence of oil product breakdown and fuel oil contamination was found. There were small pieces of terminal strip material (blue in color) that fell into the governor in 2005 found throughout the governor. Although the blue material was identified as a major contributor to the load oscillations by the forensic investigation vendor, other factors such as wear from aging, flushing the governor with fuel oil, and overfilling the governor could also have contributed to the failure.

On October 14, 2005, during the repair of a failed shutdown solenoid [SOL], a vendor broke a terminal strip which resulted in a broken piece approximately 1/8" by 3/16" falling into the governor. The governor was flushed with fuel oil in an effort to retrieve the piece of broken strip, however, the piece was not found nor recovered. DG-3 was returned to service on October 15, 2005 following satisfactory completion of the monthly surveillance. The justification for continued operation with the foreign material assumed that the softness and the physical size of the material would not adversely impact the ability of the governor to maintain DG-3 engine speed at a specified value. In addition, the foreign material was heavier than the oil and was assumed to sink to the bottom of the oil reservoir. No load oscillations were observed in DG-3 during subsequent surveillance runs prior to the February 28, 2010 event.

Total run time on DG-3 from the last biennial 24 hour surveillance run on May 21, 2008 until the load oscillation event on February 28, 2010 was approximately 78 hours. An evaluation was initiated to assess DG-3 operability status from May 21, 2008 to February 28, 2010. Based on the results of the evaluation, assuming the presence of the foreign material was the direct cause, from September 10, 2009 through February 28, 2010, it is postulated that DG-3 may not have been able to fulfill a 24 hour mission time and thus, is considered inoperable during that time. Technical Specifications (TS) 3.8.1, Condition B requires an inoperable DG to be restored to operable status within 14 days, otherwise Condition F requires the unit to be in Mode 3 within 12 hours and Mode 4 within 36 hours. Consequently, the condition of CGS not in compliance with Condition F is a condition prohibited by TS and reportable to the NRC in accordance with 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(i)(B).

NRC FORM 366A **U.S. NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION** (10-2010) LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER) **CONTINUATION SHEET** 1. FACILITY NAME 2. DOCKET 3. PAGE 6. LER NUMBER SEQUENTIAL REV YEAR NO. NUMBER Columbia Generating Station 3 OF 3 05000397 2012 - 001 - 00

NARRATIVE

Immediate Corrective Actions

DG-3 was declared inoperable on February 28, 2010, the governor was replaced on March 2, 2010, surveillance testing was completed, and DG-3 was declared operable on March 4, 2010.

Causes

The direct cause of the event is believed to be related to foreign material left in the governor as early as 2005 and that the root cause of the event was organizational decision making did not adequately consider long term risks and consequences associated with operating the governor with known foreign material intrusion. However, additional factors such as wear due to aging, flushing the governor with fuel oil, and overfilling the governor could not be ruled out as contributors to the cause.

The RCE is under revision to consider other forensic analysis and a supplemental LER is planned.

Further Corrective Actions

Further corrective actions included strengthening foreign material intrusion actions in operability determinations and maintenance procedures and providing training on lessons learned to the management committee responsible for station health issues.

The RCE is under revision and additional corrective actions are being taken to address failure to report within 60 days in accordance with 10 CFR 50.73.

Assessment of Safety Consequences

There were no actual safety consequences as a result of this condition. Critical electrical bus SM-4 [BU] is normally energized from Normal Auxiliary transformer TR-N1 [XFMR] thru non-critical bus SM-2 when the main generator [GEN] is operating and from Startup Auxiliary transformer TR-S thru SM-2 when the main generator is not operating. DG-3 provides emergency power to SM-4. SM-4 was available and powered by either TR-N1 or TR-S throughout the time frame DG-3 was postulated to be inoperable.

Similar Events

A search of CGS Licensee Event Reports and the Corrective Action Program for the last 10 years found no other instances where load oscillations were observed on an emergency diesel generator due to a failed governor.

Energy Industry Identification System (EIIS) Information

EIIS information is denoted as [XX], [XXX], or [XXXX] throughout the narrative.