

Study 1 Comparison Mediations

Cognitive Awareness & Study Approach Decision Making

Jessica Macaluso

2024-06-07

Abstract

Why do learners not choose ideal study strategies when learning? Past research suggests that learners frequently misinterpret the effort affiliated with efficient strategies as being indicative of poor learning. Expanding on past findings, we explored the integration of study habits into this model. We conducted two experiments where learners experienced two contrasting strategies—blocked and interleaved schedules—to learn to discriminate between images of bird families. After experiencing each strategy, learners rated each according to its perceived effort, learning, and familiarity. Next, learners were asked to choose which strategy they would use in the future. Mediation analyses revealed, for both experiments, that the more mentally effortful interleaving felt, the less learners felt they learned, and the less likely learners were to use it in future learning. Further, in this study, strategy familiarity predicted strategy choice, also mediated by learners' perceived learning. Additionally, Study 2 verified that, in contrast to learners' judgments, the less familiar interleaving schedule resulted in better learning. Consequently, learners are making ineffective learning judgments based on their perceptions of effort and familiarity and, therefore, do not make use of optimal study strategies in self-regulated learning decisions.

Load Packages

```
library(psych)
library(tidyverse)
```

```
## — Attaching core tidyverse packages — tidyverse 2.0.0 —
## ✓ dplyr      1.1.2      ✓ readr      2.1.4
## ✓ forcats    1.0.0      ✓ stringr    1.5.0
## ✓ ggplot2     3.4.2      ✓ tibble     3.2.1
## ✓ lubridate  1.9.2      ✓ tidyr      1.3.0
## ✓ purrr      1.0.1
## — Conflicts — tidyverse_conflicts() —
## ✖ ggplot2::%>%() masks psych::%>%()
## ✖ ggplot2::alpha() masks psych::alpha()
## ✖ dplyr::filter() masks stats::filter()
## ✖ dplyr::lag() masks stats::lag()
## i Use the conflicted package (<http://conflicted.r-lib.org/>) to force all conflicts to become errors
```

```
library(mediation)
```

```
## Loading required package: MASS
##
## Attaching package: 'MASS'
##
## The following object is masked from 'package:dplyr':
##
##     select
##
## Loading required package: Matrix
##
## Attaching package: 'Matrix'
##
## The following objects are masked from 'package:tidyr':
##
##     expand, pack, unpack
##
## Loading required package: mvtnorm
## Loading required package: sandwich
## mediation: Causal Mediation Analysis
## Version: 4.5.0
##
##
## Attaching package: 'mediation'
##
## The following object is masked from 'package:psych':
##
##     mediate
```

```
library(powerMediation)
```

Disable Scientific Notation and set.seed

```
options(scipen = 999)
set.seed(1)
```

Study 1 Set Up

Read in Data and Reverse Score

```
# Joined/Merged
study1 <- read.csv("study1-final.csv")
# Blocked -> Interleaved (list_one) rows 2-180
# Interleaved -> Blocked (list_two) rows 181-329

study1 %>% mutate(CompareEnjoyable.Rev = 7 - CompareEnjoyable) -> study1
study1 %>% mutate(CompareNewer.Rev = 7 - CompareNewer) -> study1
```

Variables of Interest

Mental Effort (X)

Familiarity/Habits (X)

Perceived Learning (M)

Final Strategy (Y)

Blocked versus Interleaved Compare

1 = Blocked, 6 = Interleaved, 3.5 no preference

Mental Effort

```
study1$compare_effort <- ((study1$CompareMentalEffort + study1$CompareHarderForOthers +
                          study1$CompareEnjoyable.Rev + study1$CompareHarder)/4)
summary(study1$compare_effort)
```

##	Min.	1st Qu.	Median	Mean	3rd Qu.	Max.	NA's
##	1.000	4.500	5.250	4.867	5.812	6.000	1

Perceived Learning

```
study1$compare_learn <- ((study1$CompareRememberAnswers + study1$CompareEffectiveYou +
                          study1$CompareEffectiveAveragePerson + study1$CompareYouStudy
                          Future)/4)
summary(study1$compare_learn)
```

##	Min.	1st Qu.	Median	Mean	3rd Qu.	Max.	NA's
##	1.000	1.000	1.750	2.309	3.000	6.000	1

Familiarity/Habits

```
study1$compare_habits <- ((study1$CompareClassStructure + study1$CompareFamiliar +
                          study1$CompareNewer.Rev + study1$CompareMatchHabits)/4)
summary(study1$compare_habits)
```

##	Min.	1st Qu.	Median	Mean	3rd Qu.	Max.	NA's
##	1.000	1.750	2.500	2.543	3.250	6.000	1

Final Study Strategy Choice

```
study1$strategy_choice <- (study1$ChooseActivity)

# Dummy Variable Coding for Binomial Family
study1$chooseInterleaved <- ifelse(study1$strategy_choice == "Blocked", 0, 1)
```

Study 1 Mental Effort Mediation

a path

```
# a path
med.compare.effort <- lm(compare_learn ~ compare_effort, data = study1)
summary(med.compare.effort)
```

```
##
## Call:
## lm(formula = compare_learn ~ compare_effort, data = study1)
##
## Residuals:
##      Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
## -4.4577 -0.4399 -0.2936  0.1797  4.6135
##
## Coefficients:
##              Estimate Std. Error t value      Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept)    6.27192    0.23615   26.56 <0.0000000000000002 ***
## compare_effort -0.81424    0.04703  -17.31 <0.0000000000000002 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Residual standard error: 1.05 on 326 degrees of freedom
## (1 observation deleted due to missingness)
## Multiple R-squared:  0.479, Adjusted R-squared:  0.4774
## F-statistic: 299.7 on 1 and 326 DF, p-value: < 0.00000000000000022
```

```
# compare_effort = a path (p < .001)
# R2 = 0.48
```

c prime and b path

```
# c' path and b path
med.compare.learn1 <- glm(chooseInterleaved ~ compare_effort + compare_learn, data = study1, family=binomial)
summary(med.compare.learn1)
```

```
##
## Call:
## glm(formula = chooseInterleaved ~ compare_effort + compare_learn,
##      family = binomial, data = study1)
##
## Deviance Residuals:
##      Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
## -3.6604  -0.1680  -0.0678  -0.0500   2.2230
##
## Coefficients:
##              Estimate Std. Error z value      Pr(>|z|)
## (Intercept)   -11.6229     2.4817  -4.683 0.00000282186478 ***
## compare_effort    0.3707     0.3456   1.073    0.283
## compare_learn    2.9917     0.4309   6.944 0.000000000000382 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## (Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
##
##      Null deviance: 355.113  on 327  degrees of freedom
## Residual deviance:  81.619  on 325  degrees of freedom
## (1 observation deleted due to missingness)
## AIC: 87.619
##
## Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 7
```

```
# compare_learn = b path (p < .001)
# partial R2 = 0.77
# c' (direct) = compare_effort (p = 0.28)
# partial R2 = 0.02
```

c path

```
# c path
med.compare.learn2 <- glm(chooseInterleaved ~ compare_effort, data = study1, family=binomial)
summary(med.compare.learn2)
```

```
##
## Call:
## glm(formula = chooseInterleaved ~ compare_effort, family = binomial,
##      data = study1)
##
## Deviance Residuals:
##      Min        1Q      Median        3Q        Max
## -2.3766  -0.5910  -0.4001  -0.3501   2.3760
##
## Coefficients:
##              Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
## (Intercept)      3.8679      0.6372   6.070 0.00000000127578421 ***
## compare_effort  -1.1049      0.1381  -7.998 0.000000000000000126 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## (Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
##
##      Null deviance: 355.11  on 327  degrees of freedom
## Residual deviance: 261.00  on 326  degrees of freedom
## (1 observation deleted due to missingness)
## AIC: 265
##
## Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 5
```

```
# compare_effort = c (indirect) (p < .001)
# partial R2 = 0.39
```

Mediation for Mental Effort

```
mediation_compare1 <- mediate(med.compare_effort, med.compare_learn1, sims=1000, boot=TR
UE, treat = "compare_effort", mediator = "compare_learn")
```

```
## Running nonparametric bootstrap
```

```
## Warning: glm.fit: fitted probabilities numerically 0 or 1 occurred
```

```
## Warning: glm.fit: fitted probabilities numerically 0 or 1 occurred
```

```
summary(mediation_compare1) #ACME = -0.08022 (p < .01)
```

```
##
## Causal Mediation Analysis
##
## Nonparametric Bootstrap Confidence Intervals with the Percentile Method
##
##
```

	Estimate	95% CI Lower	95% CI Upper	p-value
## ACME (control)	-0.08722	-0.20649	-0.01	<0.0000000000000002
## ACME (treated)	-0.07321	-0.15196	-0.01	<0.0000000000000002
## ADE (control)	0.00583	-0.00134	0.06	0.24
## ADE (treated)	0.01984	-0.00478	0.11	0.24
## Total Effect	-0.06738	-0.10091	-0.01	<0.0000000000000002
## Prop. Mediated (control)	1.29450	0.79762	2.21	<0.0000000000000002
## Prop. Mediated (treated)	1.08646	0.95340	1.58	<0.0000000000000002
## ACME (average)	-0.08022	-0.18025	-0.01	<0.0000000000000002
## ADE (average)	0.01283	-0.00298	0.08	0.24
## Prop. Mediated (average)	1.19048	0.87584	1.85	<0.0000000000000002

```
##
## ACME (control) ***
## ACME (treated) ***
## ADE (control)
## ADE (treated)
## Total Effect ***
## Prop. Mediated (control) ***
## Prop. Mediated (treated) ***
## ACME (average) ***
## ADE (average)
## Prop. Mediated (average) ***
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Sample Size Used: 328
##
##
## Simulations: 1000
```

```
# total effect of -0.07*** (p < .001)
```

Correlation with Mental Effort and Final Study Strategy Decision

```
cor.test(study1$compare_effort, study1$chooseInterleaved, method = "pearson") #-0.55 (p<.001)
```

```
##
## Pearson's product-moment correlation
##
## data: study1$compare_effort and study1$chooseInterleaved
## t = -11.906, df = 326, p-value < 0.00000000000000022
## alternative hypothesis: true correlation is not equal to 0
## 95 percent confidence interval:
## -0.6217393 -0.4702544
## sample estimates:
## cor
## -0.5505123
```

Study 1 Familiarity Mediation

a path

```
# a path
med.compare.habit <- lm(compare_learn ~ compare_habits, data = study1)
summary(med.compare.habit)
```

```
##
## Call:
## lm(formula = compare_learn ~ compare_habits, data = study1)
##
## Residuals:
##      Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
## -3.0815 -0.7740 -0.2964  0.4329  4.4824
##
## Coefficients:
##              Estimate Std. Error t value      Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept)    1.00487    0.17706   5.675 0.000000030623278 ***
## compare_habits  0.51277    0.06339   8.089 0.000000000000012 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Residual standard error: 1.328 on 326 degrees of freedom
## (1 observation deleted due to missingness)
## Multiple R-squared:  0.1672, Adjusted R-squared:  0.1646
## F-statistic: 65.44 on 1 and 326 DF, p-value: 0.0000000000001196
```

```
# compare_habits output = a path (p < .001)
# R2 = 0.17
```

c prime and b path

```
# c' path and b path
med.compare.learn1 <- glm(chooseInterleaved ~ compare_habits + compare_learn, data = stu
dy1, family=binomial)
summary(med.compare.learn1)
```



```
##
## Call:
## glm(formula = chooseInterleaved ~ compare_habits + compare_learn,
##      family = binomial, data = study1)
##
## Deviance Residuals:
##      Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
## -3.7863  -0.1791  -0.0626  -0.0359   2.1904
##
## Coefficients:
##              Estimate Std. Error z value      Pr(>|z|)
## (Intercept)   -8.9340     1.2611  -7.084 0.00000000000140 ***
## compare_habits -0.2907     0.3277  -0.887    0.375
## compare_learn   2.9137     0.4117   7.077 0.00000000000147 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## (Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
##
##      Null deviance: 355.113  on 327  degrees of freedom
## Residual deviance:  82.038  on 325  degrees of freedom
## (1 observation deleted due to missingness)
## AIC: 88.038
##
## Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 7
```

```
# compare_learn = b path (p < .001)
# partial R2 = 0.83
# c' (direct) = compare_habits (p = 0.38)
# partial R2 = 0.01
```

c path

```
# c path
med.compare.learn2 <- glm(chooseInterleaved ~ compare_habits, data = study1, family=binomial)
summary(med.compare.learn2)
```

```
##
## Call:
## glm(formula = chooseInterleaved ~ compare_habits, family = binomial,
##      data = study1)
##
## Deviance Residuals:
##      Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
## -1.6003  -0.7255  -0.5370  -0.4245   2.2142
##
## Coefficients:
##              Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
## (Intercept)    -3.0244     0.3771  -8.021 0.000000000000000105 ***
## compare_habits  0.6632     0.1200   5.525 0.000000003303287940 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## (Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
##
##      Null deviance: 355.11  on 327  degrees of freedom
## Residual deviance: 321.14  on 326  degrees of freedom
## (1 observation deleted due to missingness)
## AIC: 325.14
##
## Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 4
```

```
# compare_habits = c (indirect) path (p < .001)
# partial R2 = 0.16
```

Mediation for Familiarity/Habits

```
mediation_compare2 <- mediate(med.compare.habit, med.compare.learn1, sims=1000, boot=TRUE,
E, treat = "compare_habits", mediator = "compare_learn")
```

```
## Running nonparametric bootstrap
```

```
summary(mediation_compare2) # ACME = Average calculated mediation effect
```

```
##
## Causal Mediation Analysis
##
## Nonparametric Bootstrap Confidence Intervals with the Percentile Method
##
##
```

	Estimate	95% CI Lower	95% CI Upper	p-value
## ACME (control)	0.0633	0.0312	0.11	<0.0000000000000002
## ACME (treated)	0.0576	0.0329	0.09	<0.0000000000000002
## ADE (control)	-0.0090	-0.0507	0.01	0.32
## ADE (treated)	-0.0147	-0.0657	0.01	0.32
## Total Effect	0.0486	0.0282	0.07	<0.0000000000000002
## Prop. Mediated (control)	1.3018	0.7723	3.19	<0.0000000000000002
## Prop. Mediated (treated)	1.1850	0.8650	2.67	<0.0000000000000002
## ACME (average)	0.0605	0.0316	0.10	<0.0000000000000002
## ADE (average)	-0.0118	-0.0582	0.01	0.32
## Prop. Mediated (average)	1.2434	0.8144	2.96	<0.0000000000000002

```
##
## ACME (control) ***
## ACME (treated) ***
## ADE (control)
## ADE (treated)
## Total Effect ***
## Prop. Mediated (control) ***
## Prop. Mediated (treated) ***
## ACME (average) ***
## ADE (average)
## Prop. Mediated (average) ***
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Sample Size Used: 328
##
##
## Simulations: 1000
```

```
# total effect of 0.05*** (p < .001)
```

Correlation with Familiarity/Habits and Final Study Strategy Decision

```
cor.test(study1$compare_habits, study1$chooseInterleaved, method = "pearson") #.33 (p<.001)
```

```
##  
## Pearson's product-moment correlation  
##  
## data: study1$compare_habits and study1$chooseInterleaved  
## t = 6.2373, df = 326, p-value = 0.00000000138  
## alternative hypothesis: true correlation is not equal to 0  
## 95 percent confidence interval:  
## 0.2262238 0.4199609  
## sample estimates:  
## cor  
## 0.3265176
```