

SECOND DRAFT:
JUNE 2012

**FROM EURO-COLONIAL COLLEGES
TO THE GLOBAL UNIVERSITY:
TRANSITIONS IN MUSLIM
AND AFRICAN EXPERIENCE**

by
Ali A. Mazrui

Director, Institute of Global Cultural Studies
and
Albert Schweitzer Professor in the Humanities
Binghamton University
State University of New York at Binghamton, New York, USA

Andrew D. White Professor-at-Large Emeritus
and Senior Scholar in Africana Studies
Cornell University, Ithaca, New York, USA

Senior Fellow,
Prince Alwaleed Bin Talal Center for Muslim-Christian Understanding,
Georgetown University, Washington, DC, USA

Albert Luthuli Professor-at-Large
University of Jos, Jos, Nigeria

This paper was written at the invitation of the International Institute of Islamic Thought, Herndon, Virginia, U.S.A. The paper is partly indebted to the author's previous work, including his early contribution to the *The Harvard Educational Review*, Cambridge, Massachusetts. My gratitude also to Anukware Selase Adzima for invaluable research assistance.

This paper addresses the evolution of higher education towards the emergence of the global university. We are focusing on how Africa and the Muslim world have been part of the history of academic globalization.

This paper is about the impact of Western-style institutions of higher learning in Africa and the Muslim world. During the period of colonial rule the Western-style institutions emanated from Western Europe, and were sometimes overseas extensions of major universities in European cities. Thus the University of Ibadan in Nigeria, Gordon Memorial College in Khartoum, were de facto offspring of the University of London.

While Western institutions in such developing countries during the colonial period were European in conception, Western institutions in the post-colonial era have been disproportionately American.

Let us look more closely at the similarities and differences between Euro-colonial colleges and postcolonial American overseas branches.

Both Euro-colonial imitations and post-colonial American extensions were based on the assumption that the Western model of higher education was the international “gold standard of academia.” Both the Euro-colonial paradigm and the post-colonial American experimentation have, in fact, been stages in the evolution of *“the global university.”*

It has therefore been widely assumed that the syllabus and content of higher education in Africa and the Muslim world should, as closely as possible, approximate the education values, principles and content of the parent institutions in the Western world.

The original Euro-colonial institutions in Africa and the Muslim world included Makerere College in Uganda, Ibadan College in Nigeria, the College of Malaya in Kuala Lumpur, Gordon College in Khartoum, and Legon College in Accra, Ghana.

In the post-colonial American phase the most spectacular example has been the Education City in Doha, Qatar, which has been in existence for about a decade. It has included branch campuses of Texas A and M Engineering, Cornell Medical School, Northwestern University's School of Journalism, Computer Science and Business Studies from Carnegie Mellon, International Affairs from Georgetown, and Fine Arts from Virginia Commonwealth.

A post-colonial attempt in Muslim West Africa was by Suffolk University in Senegal. But this turned out to be less than cost-effective. It has since been decided that it would be cheaper just to bring the Senegalese students to the base in Boston, rather than continue with a branch in Dakar.

But while American extensions abroad have often closed down because of the unhappy news of inadequate enrollment, Euro-colonial universities like Makerere in Uganda and Ibadan were transformed into expanding national universities by the happy news of political independence of their countries.

A related issue is that Euro-colonial universities in Africa declined in standards partly because of the massive expansion of enrollments due to the increase of national populations.

On the other hand, Michigan State University had to close down a Middle Eastern campus in 2010 partly due to inadequate demand. George Mason University had a similar problem in the Middle East in 2011. In the words of Philip Altbach, a leading scholar in the field of international higher education: "Many [branch campuses] are under-enrolled, or they may be enrolled by people who will not fit the standards of the home campus. That happens quite a lot. Are you going to damage a brand name?"¹

While Euro-colonial universities have partly suffered in standards because classes have become too large, some post-colonial American branches abroad have suffered because classes have been too small. While Euro-colonial universities in Africa after independence have often found it necessary to lower standards of student admission because of the massive demands of an expanding population, some American branches abroad have often felt compelled to dilute their standards of admission because of inadequate local demand.

The Euro-colonial universities were created mainly in the first half of the 20th century when much of Africa and the Muslim world was regarded as consisting of “low income countries.” The post-colonial American branches abroad developed mainly in the era of petro-wealth in the Muslim world. Indeed, many of the metropolitan American universities decided to build extensions abroad in the hope that academic exports would help their budgetary problems in the United States. Much of the Muslim world was no longer “low income” economically.

But what is permitted to be taught in the Euro-colonial institutions and in the post-colonial American branches abroad? During the colonial period in Louvanium University in Leopoldville [now Kinshasa] anti-Royalist and anti-colonial perspectives were discouraged in the classroom prior to the late 1950s. At Makerere in Uganda the teaching of Marxism and socialist thought was discouraged until after Uganda’s independence in 1962 — mainly because decision-makers at the University of London were cautious about promoting Marxism in either Africa or the Muslim world.

In the post-colonial American branches in the Middle East the ordering of books for each new semester is often complicated and delayed because of government

censorship. In classrooms in the Gulf states there are also religious inhibitions in any discussions about constitutionalism and gay rights. There are also political inhibitions concerning discussions about relations with Israel or the history of Zionism. Euro-colonial taboo subjects were often very different from taboo subjects of American branches abroad. Some sexual topics are particularly taboo to women students.

The Global University: Afro-Islamic Origins

While Euro-colonial and post-colonial American branches have been important stages towards the emergence of the global university, we should bear in mind the real origins of the global university. Muslim Africa virtually invented the global university in its simpler form. The standing monuments to that Muslim African invention consist today of Al-Azhar University in Cairo and the Qarawiyn Center of Learning in Morocco, both of which are over a thousand years old. These two Afro-Muslim institutions are centuries older than Oxford and Cambridge in England, and certainly even more ancient than Harvard, Yale and Princeton.

But if a range of the cultural taboos in Middle Eastern universities can be traced back to Islamic origins, so can the very principle of a global university. It is not often realized that Muslim Africa invented the global university. Then there was the distinguished Timbuktu Academy in ancient Mali, which was a flourishing intellectual beehive before the establishment of higher education in the Americas. Although the archives and other assets of historical Timbuktu are currently at risk following the 2012 military coup in today's Bamako, those archives and assets are recognized by UNESCO as part of the cultural heritage of human kind.

The Center of Learning of Qarawiyyin Mosque (founded in 859 C.E.) is part of the origins not merely of the university but of the *global university*. Indeed, all the three institutions of Muslim Africa [Fez, Al-Azhar and Timbuktu] were magnets attracting students from far and wide across generations. It was partly this magnetic power which gave those early Afro-Islamic institutions an influence well beyond their borders, and constituted the beginnings of a global university.

But Muslim Africa was not only the mother of the origins of the global university. It also produced the father of the social sciences, Ibn Khaldun. He was born in 1332 C.E., more than one hundred and fifty years before Christopher Columbus crossed the Atlantic Ocean. Ibn Khaldun's greatest work was, of course, *Al Muqaddimah* which has been described as follows by the British macro-historian, Arnold J. Toynbee:

Undoubtedly the greatest work of its kind that has ever been created by any mind in any time or place ... the most comprehensive and illuminating analysis of how human affairs work that has been made anywhere.²

Another globalizing public intellectual produced by Muslim Africa was the geographer Ibn Battuta whose research was no less than travelling around the world. Born in Tangier, Morocco in 1304, Ibn Battuta covered over 75,000 thousand miles [121,000km], across countries which were as diverse as West Africa, Persia, East Africa, Sumatra and China. His book about his global experiences was more than a major historic travel

book. It contributed to the study of world geography and to the globalization of the Muslim Academy.³

Also as part of Muslim impact on intellectual globalization has been the Arabic numerals which were a product of a synthesis between Indian and Muslim mathematics. The more general Islamic impact on Western intellectual heritage is testified by the following English words which are of Arabic origin.

*Algebra, average, amalgam, cable, rocket, atlas, cipher,
chemistry, logarithm, zenith, tariff and (ironically)
alcohol.*⁴

Nor must it be forgotten that the academic gowns which Western professors used to wear regularly, and which young graduands continue to wear at graduation ceremonies, were originally an imitation of Muslim robes worn by the learned for sacred and academic occasions.

The Postcolonial University as a Multinational Corporation

In recent years multinational corporations have been criticized for their exploitation of postcolonial economies as well as for their influence on indigenous culture. In this article, we argue that Western influence is expressed through another postcolonial institution — the university. Our thesis in this section is that the university is an analogue to a multinational corporation: born as an extension of a metropolitan university whose direction and instructions come from a European country, the postcolonial university

continues to serve other than postcolonial interests. We must also pay attention to the symbiotic relationship between education and economic development, and identify strategies for changing the university in Africa and the Muslim world so it will foster cultural as well as economic independence in postcolonial nations.

Many characteristics attributed to commercial multinational corporations in Africa, the Middle East and Asia may also apply to *cultural* multinational corporations, of which the university is a preeminent example. Almost all postcolonial universities started as overseas extensions of European metropolitan institutions, and decisions about priorities for educational development followed the dictates of parent cultural corporations in Britain, France or Belgium. The cultural goods which the universities sold were not necessarily relevant to the needs of the new postcolonial clientele.

In this part of the essay I shall first briefly discuss the European motives for the cultural penetration of Asia and Africa which resulted in the emergence of the university as the most sophisticated instrument of cultural dependency. I shall then examine the nature of this dependency, and finally, I shall consider the slow but fundamental process of decolonization of the university. The more recent American universities and multinational businesses in the Arab world also face the same fundamental problem — *how to decolonize the process of modernization without ending it*. An examination of American universities abroad partly on the basis of the analogy with business enterprises, should also illustrate the relationships between economic and cultural dependency, as well as between economic and cultural development. The American University in Cairo and the American University in Beirut have set the pace among Arabs. They are not

branches of some parent universities in the United States, but are autonomous influences in the Arab world.

The Roots of Dependency

Every postcolonial Muslim country now celebrates a day of independence. But independence in this context is purely political. The heavy weight of foreign economic and cultural domination persists. Postcolonial economies, for example, depend too much on foreign capital and capital-intensive projects and too little on the efficient use of surplus labor. They still rely excessively on export markets in determining what to produce. Muslim preoccupation with petroleum shapes whole economies. They still import foreign goods almost indiscriminately rather than developing schemes for substituting local products.

This economic aspect of domination was rooted in European imperialist expansion.⁵ Europe needed to control Asia and Africa, in part, because of the rise of industrial capitalism, the need for raw materials for the new factories, the need for energy resources, the desire to create new overseas markets, the interest in the mineral wealth of distant countries and the quest for new land for large-scale plantations growing tropical products. Industrial and commercial motives thus converged to create a compelling drive for expansion.

Most analysts of Asian and African development have emphasized economic dependency; little attention in the literature or in policy forums has been paid to issues of *cultural dependency*. This oversight is surprising in view of the struggles of some Muslim nations to reduce Western cultural influences. It becomes all the more startling if we

recall how the West originally regarded its Muslim colonies from Algeria to Indonesia. Imperial expansion was profoundly conditioned by ethnocentrism, and ethnocentrism is, in the final analysis, a cultural phenomenon. Images of ruling races and subordinate tribes, and theories of Social Darwinism were powerful cultural motives underlying the rise of imperialism. Secular and religious evangelism were also important. Secular evangelism sought to spread Western civilization, to end ignorance and “barbarism” in underdeveloped societies, to marginalize religions other than Christianity, and to bring the torch of European enlightenment to “dark and backward” societies. Religious evangelism, committed to the spread of the Gospel and the expansion of Christendom, even in Muslim colonies, was for a time the dominant of the two impulses. Christian missionaries were a major lobby in Europe urging continued imperialism. There was a time in England when the government was convinced that Her Majesty had enough black subjects, but English missionaries thought the Church did not have enough black followers. Nigeria was annexed partly due to missionary pressure and other parts of Africa might not have been colonized or settled as early, but for the pressure of religious groups.

With time, both economic and cultural motives for imperialism found expression through institutions established in Asia and Africa. Economic penetration manifested itself preeminently in the multinational company, which typically engaged in petroleum, in mining, in selling Western products, or in growing cash crops for export. The postcolonial university became the clearest manifestation of cultural domination. By the 1950s it had replaced primary schools and churches as the prime symbol of cultural penetration. The functions served by these two multinational institutions have been

mutually reinforcing. The university is a cultural corporation with political and economic consequences, and the multinational commercial company is an economic corporation with political and cultural consequences. At risk among students are not only indigenous cultures but also Islamic values. Westernization and secularization often erode Muslim norms.

Perhaps it is surprising to the reader that I indict postcolonial universities for promoting cultural dependency. From their birth, the Euro-colonial universities have been a potential force for liberation. From colonial Malaya to colonial Khartoum they generated substantial political unrest which contributed to independence movements in many African colonies. In the words of British historian Sir Eric Ashby:

From the graduates of the universities the currents of nationalism flowed into the press and the people.... Africa has stretched the word “nationalism” to cover new meanings.... It, too, was born in America and Britain: in the editorial room of the *African Interpreter* published by African students in the United States, at meetings of the West African Students’ Union in London, in Paris cafés. Its sources of inspiration were Jefferson and Lincoln, J. A. Hobson and the Fabians. It grew into a popular movement in the newspapers and election platforms and goals of West Africa.⁶

After independence, university graduates were the hope for future development in these countries.

Even such an astute observer as Ashby assumed too readily that cultural liberation accompanied political liberation. Euro-colonial universities were capable of being at once mechanisms for political liberation and agencies of cultural dependency. Euro-colonial University graduates in Africa, precisely because they were the most deeply Westernized Africans, were the most culturally dependent. They have neither been among the major cultural revivalists nor have they shown respect for indigenous belief systems, linguistic heritage, religious paradigms, modes of entertainment or aesthetic experience. The same educational institutions which have produced nationalists eager to end colonial rule and to establish African self-government have also perpetuated cultural colonialism. Euro-colonial colleges carried the torch of Westernization in one hand and the torch of secularization in the other hand.

Before independence it was *European* countries like Great Britain, Belgium and French which had universities at home which had extensions as colleges in the colonies. But in the postcolonial era it is universities in the *United States* like Cornell and New York University which have been establishing extensions in the Middle East and elsewhere. This is quite apart from older US institutions in the Arab world like the American university in Beirut. By the end of 2011 there were two hundred international branch campuses. The parent universities were disproportionately American.

University Structure and Cultural Dependency

The postcolonial university, like the multinational corporation, is not autonomous in a developing country today, nor was it ever in the past. It relies on cultural exports from Europe and America. The basic assumption was that a university system appropriate for

Europeans could still be made to serve Nigerians or Kuwaitis without major transformation. Many colonial universities were created as overseas colleges, or official extensions, of universities in Britain, France and Belgium.

As we illustrated earlier, Gordon Memorial College in Anglo-Egyptian Sudan, Makerere College in Uganda, the University College at Ibadan in Nigeria, and the University College at Legon in Ghana were all originally branches of the University of London. They each admitted students on the basis of requirements specified by the University of London; they appointed lecturers and professors partly through the good services of the Inter-University Council for Higher Education in London. Although there was consultation between London and the African branches, London approval was needed even for syllabuses and examinations. Examination questions were first formulated in the colleges in Africa and then submitted to London for criticism and revision. Once the questions were approved in London, they were printed, put into envelopes, sealed, returned to the African campuses, and not opened until the actual taking of the examination. If changes had been made in London, they were discovered by the professor too late to do anything about it. Consequently, African faculty had little control over their courses.

When I was an assistant professor in the department of political science at Makerere in Uganda, the faculty wanted to introduce Marx in a course on political philosophy. Upon receiving the recommendation, London questioned whether Karl Marx was a political philosopher at all but, in the end, permitted his works to be included in the Uganda syllabus. Ironically, Marxism was at the time more popular at the University of Khartoum than at our college in Uganda.

I taught the political philosophy course and encouraged my students to pay particular attention to the political thought of Marx and Lenin in preparing for the final examination. When I drafted the examination, I wrote three out of twelve questions on Marxism and, as required, submitted the examination to London for criticism and revision. On the day of the examinations, I was serving as invigilator (proctor) for my class. It was a solemn occasion. I broke the seal and distributed the paper to the nervous students. When I looked at the paper, it was much shorter than the one I had submitted. There was only one question on Marxism. I tried not to show the shock and anxiety I suddenly felt. But in the eyes of some of the students I thought I detected a charge of betrayal.

According to university rules, I could not explain to my students what had happened. I could only complain secretly to the chairman of my department. Much later we heard from London that the mistake was not really intended as an act of censorship, but had taken place in the printing house. We were assured that the deletion of the additional questions on Marxism was a printing error rather than a deliberate policy decision. Perhaps it was.

After the examination was over I evaluated the papers and then dispatched them for authoritative grading in London. A period of waiting ensued until London returned its verdict on the students at Makerere. A similar procedure was followed at the other overseas branches of the University of London and at Fourah Bay College in Sierra Leone, an extension of the University of Durham. As it turned out, Muslim Northern Sudan had in the early 1960s the biggest Communist Party on the African continent.

As closely governed as the British African universities were, French African institutions were even more intimately tied to their parent universities. For example, French students could attend the University of Dakar in Senegal as part of their program of study and French professors often moved back and forth between universities in Paris or Bordeaux and Dakar. Indeed, the overwhelming number of professors in the early 1960s at Dakar were Frenchmen. The overwhelming majority of students were Muslim.

Integration with the metropolitan system deeply affected the priorities of African scholars. In West Africa, Greek, Latin, and the history of Greece and Rome formed the core of the humanities. Plato and Aristotle were better known than the North African Ibn Khaldun. For many years no African language, not even Arabic, could be studied at the university level. As long as the University College at Ibadan in Nigeria maintained formal ties with the University of London, three of its seven one-subject honors schools were in the European classics.⁷ At Makerere University in Uganda, even after independence, English was the only language taught. Later the university added French and German, followed experimentally by Russian. All this occurred before any action was taken toward teaching an indigenous Ugandan language, or Kiswahili (which is widely understood in Uganda and throughout much of Eastern Africa), or Arabic (the most important language of Uganda's neighbors in the Nile Valley). In the American universities in the Arab world, the Farsi language of Iran is often avoided like the plague.

Recently, African linguistics has been introduced as a subject at Makerere University. Students can study the technicalities of Bantu linguistic structure, but the teaching of African indigenous languages is still, at best, an aspiration rather than an

accomplished fact. In American branches in the Arab world Ottoman history and the Turkish language receive inadequate attention.

Louvanium University in Kinshasa, the Congo, originally affiliated with Louvain in Belgium, was an early exception to this pattern in that it incorporated courses in African languages and culture. Students at Louvanium were at least introduced to the history, literature, philosophy and psychology of Africa. In addition, Louvanium offered a course of study in the Faculty of Philosophy and Letters, called “Philologies africaines,” based substantially on the study of African languages and cultures. Belgium’s aspiration to make colonial education practical and relevant, and its missionaries’ desire to produce African clergy versed in African cultural ways, contributed to cultural relevance at Louvanium. But Louvanium was by no means completely independent of metropolitan standards. The Faculty of Philosophy and Letters, for example, continued to require a *diplôme homologué d’humanités gréco-latines* as a university admissions requirement. The study of Islam and Islamic philosophy were alien to such an African campus.

What is astonishing about this indifference to African languages is that so many black intellectuals and scholars continue to regard it as justified. Exhortations to pay more attention to African languages, or to promote Arabic south of the Sahara, or to build systematically vocabularies for certain new areas of national life such as the law courts, parliament, and scientific research centers, and to integrate them more fully into educational systems, have often encountered either silent skepticism or outright derision among many black intellectuals and scholars. European languages have been triumphant in most Euro-colonial universities.

Also strikingly absent from most African education systems is the study of African music. Muslim universities are profoundly distrustful of schools of music. Because song and dance are domains of leisure in Europe, African and Muslim educational institutions have treated song and dance as if they were similarly divorced from work and productivity. But in fact, these pursuits play an important social role in both Muslim and African societies.⁸

While industrialized countries worry about inflation and recession, agricultural communities worry about floods or drought. In times of famine there is always the danger of bitter jealousies and acrimony as families compete for meager resources. Songs foster economic solidarity when the need to share what is available is compelling. Communities need to reassert the importance of their collective identity, and they often turn to song and dance not merely in quest of cheerfulness or in pursuit of morale under trying circumstances, but also to emphasize the constraints needed to remain a community.

Although Muslim conservatives are reluctant to acknowledge, dance and song in a highly oral society also have significant functions in the socialization of the young. In all countries economic socialization involves teaching children values and skills necessary for their society's economic survival and emphasizes the need to serve the family. In Africa, proverbs and songs are the devices which enable the young to memorize lessons of social commitment and service and to remember with awe the hazards of disloyalty to kinsmen and ancestors. Poetry is much valued in Islam but seldom when it is put to music.

Europe's colonization of Africa resulted in the partial demise of African dance patterns. Many schools were started by even Christian missionaries and others who

regarded African dance as primitive and sexually suggestive, leading to sin and collective orgies. School children were thus discouraged from experimenting with their own dance heritage. As adults, educated Africans moved away from traditional dance in favor of imported varieties of ballroom dancing, and, later, rock and roll. Traditional dance lost the respect of Africans as they became Westernized. Both Christianity and Islam were often at war against certain African dances and songs.

In the universities, both social scientists and specialists in the arts have appeared to be supremely indifferent to this aspect of African experience. University systems in much of Africa have no provision at all for the study of African music. Even at universities in Ghana, Senegal, and Nigeria, where African dance has achieved new respectability, the sociology of African music has not yet been adequately integrated into an effective teaching program. This fundamental feature of African cultural life is taken seriously only by departments of theater arts at such universities as Ife in Nigeria and Dar es Salaam in Tanzania. Such departments are small and influence only a handful of the next generation of educated Africans.

What has happened in the study of music and languages, as in other areas of university content and structure, is that African systems of values have been marginalized. Like commercial multinational corporations, universities have responded faithfully to decision makers in Europe; they have used the metropole as the ultimate reference point. Like the multinationals, the universities have been engaged in a kind of commerce. They have sold cultural goods to a new African market — goods marked “made in Europe.”

FROM A MUSLIM COLLEGE TO AN ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY

A Muslim educational institution is not to be confused with an Islamic university. A Muslim college usually seeks to serve a Muslim constituency or community but is not necessarily religious in conception. Towards the end of the colonial era in East Africa I served on the staff of the Mombasa Institute of Muslim Education (M.I.O.M.E.) in British-ruled Kenya. It was created by the British to serve the British dependencies of Kenya, Uganda, Tanganyika, Zanzibar and British Somaliland. But the whole purpose was to enable His Britannic Majesty's Muslim subjects "to catch up with the 20th century" by introducing young Muslims to science and technology.

Although MIOME was officially designated as an "Institute of Muslim Education" it taught no Islamic studies apart from one hour every Friday. The entire curriculum consisted of science, engineering and, ironically, the nautical sciences of navigation. Although all the students in the 1950s were Muslim (African, Arab, Somali and Indian), almost none of the instructors were.⁹ MIOME recruited almost its entire teaching staff from the United Kingdom. My own role in the institution was initially that of a junior clerk, and later as a non-teaching Boarding Supervisor in charge of the residential and catering needs of the students.

The Chairman of the Board of Governors was no less a person than the British Governor of Kenya at the time, Sir Philip Mitchell. It was a remarkable illustration of how an educational institution could be designated as "Muslim," and how a hundred percent of its student body could consist of young Muslims, without having a single

Muslim instructor, and without teaching Islamic studies apart from a single lecture on Friday (the Muslim Sabbath).

The University of Cairo in Egypt is primarily an Arab institution, but not necessarily Muslim. On the other hand, Al-Azhar University in the same city has been an Islamic university for most of the one thousand years of its history — teaching Islamic, Qur’anic and Arabic studies.

However, in the 20th century Al-Azhar opened new departments which taught more secular subjects, including technology and business studies. This part of Al-Azhar still constituted a Muslim institution in terms of the composition of the student-body, but Islamic Al-Azhar had a separate agenda of religious studies. Al-Azhar had become half Muslim in our sense, and half Islamic as a religious institution.

In Kuala Lumpur the University of Malaya was originally Euro-colonial, built under British rule. But in the same Malaysian city has been the International Islamic University, partly sponsored by the International Institute of Islamic Thought.

An Islamic university is partly defined by what is taught. The curriculum would include Fiqh or Islamic theology, Qur’anic studies, the study of the Sunnah. There would also be the history of Muslim civilization, the geography of Global Islam from Sumatra to Senegal, the study of the Arabic language, the study of comparative Muslim literature, and political Islam in world affairs.

These Islamic and Arabic studies can of course be combined with other broader disciplines in the same university. An Islamic university can also produce surgeons and cardiologists in modern medical tradition, modern electrical engineers, specialists in aviation, and even nuclear physicists [if Western powers would permit it].

The arts which are least controversial in Islam include calligraphy, architecture, textile design, Persian-style carpets, Ottoman-style furniture, classical Abbaside prayer-mat the verbal arts of poetry and oratory, and decorative carpentry of elaborate doors and windows.

Islamic doctrine seems least friendly to sculpture which creates images of people or animals, portrait painting, animal-drawing, decorated tombs, theatre which involves impersonating the life of the Prophet Muhammad on the stage, or in front of a cinema-camera (Hollywood style).

Can a School of Music find a friendly home at an Islamic university? Although the Qur'an is often recited musically, and some celebrations of the Prophet Muhammad's birthday include songs and drums in some parts of the Muslim world, conservative Islam is very suspicious of secular music and of romantic songs and tunes about love.

Of course, all Muslim societies have produced their own music over the centuries. In the 20th century Egypt led the Muslim world in music and in many other respects. Oum Kalthum became the greatest female Muslim singer in fourteen centuries of Islamic history. And Muhammad Abdul Wahab of Egypt was widely regarded as the most brilliant Arab composer in centuries.

What are the special areas of censorship in Islamic education? In this 21st century the issue of equal rights for women has become less and less of a taboo. Discourses on re-interpreting the Qur'an and the Shari'a have become more feminine-friendly since the final years of the 20th century.

How far can secularism be analysed in an Islamic university? Can secular values be examined objectively in a non-adversarial manner?

In a department of philosophy at an Islamic university secular values can be examined short of atheism (the denial of the existence of God). But can agnosticism be explored in a philosophical seminar at an Islamic university? [Agnosticism legitimized uncertainty as to whether God exists or not].

We referred earlier to taboo-subjects in Euro-colonial African colleges and in postcolonial American branches abroad. Gay rights may pose special challenges in both African and Muslim institutions of higher learning. Muslims of the world are almost unanimous in regarding homosexuality as a *sin*. But should homosexual behaviour also be made a *crime* in contemporary times? Need every *sin* be made a *crime*? Telling a lie is a sin, but very few lies are criminalized. Why should sexual sins lead to imprisonment, let alone to the capital penalty of the *hududs*?

The issue here is not to give an answer, but to decide whether such subjects can be legitimately debated in graduate seminars at an Islamic university.

What should the language policy of an Islamic university be? In one of my conversations with the late Libyan leader, Muammar Qaddafi he and I addressed this issue of language policy for both Africa and the Muslim world. I was stimulated by Qaddafi's concept of a three-language policy. He focused especially on sub-Saharan Africa, arguing that every country should promote, firstly, the main indigenous language of that country (e.g., Kiswahili in Tanzania); secondly, the language of the relevant European imperial power (e.g., French in Mali); and thirdly, the Arabic language (which has more native-speakers in Africa than any other language). This three-language policy may not work very neatly in the Arab world, but it can be sustained in much of the rest of the Muslim world.

Thus each Pakitsani child would learn Urdu, English and Arabic; each Indonesian child would learn Bahasa, Arabic, and either English or Dutch; each Senegalise student would learn Wolof, Arabic and the French language. However, Qaddafi's triple-language policy may need to be finessed and polished in the years ahead.

Towards the Global University

The struggle to globalize the university institution must begin with the decolonization of modernity. In both Africa and the Muslim world the process of modernization has been aided by the establishment of Western-type educational institutions, including the university. The question arises once again whether modernization can be decolonized without being destroyed.

To a large extent, this question is what development is all about. One could indeed define development in the Third World as modernization minus dependency. That is the challenging equation that Muslim and African societies face. The changes which improve living standards, reduce infant mortality, curtail ignorance and disease, and enhance knowledge of human beings and their environments, are ones which imperialism helped to initiate. These changes deserve to survive. But those aspects of modernization which reduce local autonomy, erode local self-confidence, and undermine the capacity of Africa and the Muslim world to contribute to a genuinely shared world culture should be eliminated. In time, the concept of modernization should become distinct from the concept of Westernization.

Like commercial multinational corporations, universities must reexamine what they import and determine the extent to which substitutions can reduce dependency. The

university, a cultural corporation dealing in skills and values, must ask itself: which skills need to be developed locally and which values should the educational system sustain? Two concepts of relevance are pertinent to this reexamination: practical relevance focusing on issues of skills, and cultural relevance relating to issues of values. While the two dimensions are intertwined, they can be distinguished analytically.

Debates about practical relevance in Euro-colonial and American colleges abroad have been concerned with whether universities are producing appropriate personnel for the processes of economic and social development. Is there enough emphasis on training people skilled in modern agriculture? Are universities sensitive to the need for veterinarians in pastoral regions? Do they emphasize Shakespeare more than rural development? In oil-rich countries universities are already trying to cultivate petro-relevant skills and engineering.

Many Euro-colonial universities started as liberal arts colleges, not as training centers for skilled manpower. Part of their prejudice against technical courses was inherited from the metropolitan powers themselves. In much of Europe, practical courses at the university level were latecomers and to the present day have often been placed in separate educational institutions. Universities were reserved for the study of high culture, for the pursuit of pure scholarship. In Africa the University College of Ibadan in Nigeria offered courses in Latin, Greek, Christian Doctrine and Medieval European History long before it recognized the need for courses in engineering, economics, geology, public administration, or even teacher training. Makerere in Uganda existed for more than forty years before it considered the idea of teaching engineering, forestry or veterinary science. American models of higher education have been more responsive to the practical needs.

In developing the University of Nigeria at Nsukka, Nnamdi Azikiwe used the land-grant college model, which encouraged the study of applied subjects. In Ghana, Kwame Nkrumah helped to promote Kumasi as a major center of technological training. These were important steps towards academic globalization. But such advances have resulted much more often as a result of pressures from African governments than as a result of initiatives from within the ranks of academic communities. The problem of forging practically relevant education also involves the questions of emphasis in the applied departments and faculties which already exist. What types of personnel should a medical school produce, for example? Graham Bull, a distinguished British professor of medicine, stated the problem in a West African medical journal way back in 1960, the year of Nigeria's independence:

Expenditure should be mainly in the field of public health. Curative medicine is a luxury which must be dispensed very sparingly. . . . Public opinion is sufficiently ill-informed to prefer a hospital to a piped water supply, although the latter will probably save ten times as many lives. . . . British and American medical schools do not provide a suitable curriculum for doctors who are to work in Nigeria and other tropical countries. . . .¹⁰

Since 1960, medical schools in Euro-colonial universities and American branches abroad have indeed developed departments of preventive medicine. But in each school, preventive medicine is only one of a dozen or more departments, each jealous of its

separate identity. Some interdepartmental collaboration and much sound research on tropical diseases do take place, but the emphasis on preventive medicine remains weaker than African circumstances dictate.

A related question is whether African and Middle Eastern medical schools should only produce doctors who are traditionally trained and who can be employed anywhere in the world, or whether a more limited training program should be designed to produce large numbers of paramedical practitioners for rural clinics. Traditionally, most Euro-colonial universities have been reluctant to “dilute” their standards. Even the idea of different types of medical degrees meets considerable resistance from the University of Zambia in Lusaka to the University of Khartoum in Sudan.

As for schools of engineering or faculties of technology, there is still a marked lack of interest in the phenomenon of intermediate technology. Such schools could profitably examine experiments in other developing countries using small-scale, labor-intensive technologies for their applicability in Africa and the Muslim world. But once again, the compulsion to imitate the metropolitan model has prevented much progress in this area.

Performance has been even more deficient in the case of the humanities. We have referred to the insensitivity to African languages, music, dance, and more generally, the oral tradition. Iranians learn Arabic more readily than Arabs learn Farsi. Changes are taking place in some areas. Most African historians now agree that oral traditions are proper material for historical reconstruction. Interpretations of the African past using linguistic evidence, oral tradition, and archeological findings have introduced important breakthroughs in African historiography. While departments of literature have begun to

follow historians in studying oral literature, their performance has been less impressive. Some of the best oral poetry on the African continent is reportedly Somali poetry, but there are more urgent problems in Somalia than recording oral poetry.

In the social sciences there have been changes in *what* is studied but not in *how* it is studied. More and more courses on Africa, Muslim social sciences and on the economics of development have been initiated, but few methodological innovations comparable to the use of oral tradition in historiography have been introduced. Some academic reformers have substituted Marxian approaches to political science and economics for the standard Western analyses, yet Marxism, though radical, is also a Western tradition and its uncritical invocation by African scholars and Muslim intellectuals reflects a form of residual intellectual dependence. Until African scholars and Muslim researchers change foreign methodologies to fit the conditions of their own societies, they cannot move much further along the path of cultural import-substitution.¹¹

Many continue to blame all postcolonial troubles on outside forces and at the same time they continue to seek solutions from the outside. As the Ugandan social philosopher, the late Okot p'Bitek, put it:

We blame colonialists and imperialists and neo-colonialists; we blame Communists both from Moscow and Peking, and sent their representatives packing. We blame the Americans and the CIA.... Another, but contradictory phenomenon is the belief that the solution to our social ills can be imported. Foreign “experts” and peace-corps swarm the country

like white ants. Economic “advisers,” military “advisers” and security “advisers” surround our leaders.¹²

Okot p’Bitek criticizes these attitudes, and argues, in contrast, “that most of our social ills are indigenous, that the primary sources of our problems are native. They are rooted in the social set-up, and most effective solutions cannot be imported, but must be the result of deliberate reorganization of the resources available for tackling specific issues.”¹³

My own view lies between p’Bitek’s position and the attitudes he criticizes. The worst form of cultural dependency is indeed that dual dependency that blames all misfortunes on external forces and seeks all solutions from outside. Many African and Middle Eastern problems are indeed indigenous, but there are others which have been created by external forces. Some solutions to the Global South problems require external cooperation or changes in the total world environment, but many solutions can be found within.

The reluctance to transform educational systems to enable Southern societies to take greater part in solving their own problems has been one of the most obstinate aspects of cultural dependency.

Three Strategies for Development

If true development for Africa and the Muslim world requires the decolonization of modernization, then three major strategies are needed. The first strategy concerns the domestication of modernity, a bid to relate modernization more firmly to local cultural

and economic needs. The second involves the diversification of the cultural content of modernity. Under this approach, the foreign reference group for an African or Muslim institution expands beyond the West. For example, interest in Chinese culture is becoming an imperative. The third strategy is perhaps the most ambitious: it involves an attempt by Africans and Muslims to counter-penetrate Western civilization itself. The first two strategies can be implemented rapidly; the third requires more sustained patient efforts.

The Strategy of Domestication

In the very process of producing educated manpower, creating new forms of stratification and accelerating Westernization and modernization, Euro-colonial educational institutions have been major instruments through which the Western world has affected and changed the African and Asian universe. Universities have been virtually defined as institutions for the promotion of Western civilization. In order to change this definition, African and Muslim societies must fundamentally influence their educational systems. It is not enough for a local university to send a traveling theater to villages to perform a play by Shakespeare or even one by the Nigerian playwright, Wole Soyinka. Nor is it sufficient to establish extramural departments and extension services, however valuable these may be for increasing skills and expanding social awareness in rural communities. Muslim audiences are particularly responsive to didactic plays with either a moral or religious message. Among Arabs the love between Layla and Qays is at least as compelling as that between Romeo and Juliet.

The first task toward decolonizing modernity is to enable the local society's influence on university policy to balance that of the West. In concrete terms, how can this be realized? To domesticate local educational systems, three major areas must be reexamined: university admissions requirements and their implications for primary and secondary curricula, criteria for faculty recruitment, and university organization.

University admissions requirements should be reformed to give new weight to indigenous subjects and Islamic topics. Admissions should formally require demonstrated competence in Arabic and/or an African or other Islamic language just as some faculties used to require Latin for entry. Some knowledge of African history, literature, and social and cultural anthropology should also be required for university entrance, and rigorous examinations in these subjects should promote their teaching at the primary and secondary levels. Similarly, dance and music should be given a new legitimacy in pre-university education, regardless of the sensitivities of mullahs and the missionaries in power (Muslim or Christian).

Commitment to indigenous cultures will also affect criteria for faculty recruitment at the university. Must all teachers have formal degrees or should there be areas of expertise where faculty could be appointed on the basis of other criteria? For example, there are uncertified specialists in the Arabic language or indigenous languages who not only speak those languages but also have a command of their linguistic properties. I know one such specialist from Kenya who for many years taught Kiswahili in an American University with a sophistication unmatched by many who have degrees in that subject. In the United States he could never hope to receive tenure or even obtain a rank above instructor since he did not possess an advanced degree. When he returned to

Kenya, the university there applied similar standards and would not consider him for appointment as a professor. Yet the same university would appoint a British Swahilist with a formal degree but less intimate knowledge of certain African languages than the Kenyan had already demonstrated over several decades. There are also superb experts in the Arabic language, or Urdu, or Bengali, or Bahasa Indonesia who have no degrees.

What all this means is that there is a case for broadening the recruitment criteria to include both formal degrees and, where appropriate, demonstrable indigenous skills. Faculties of sociology could include indigenous specialists in oral traditions; departments of medicine could have courses in the uses of natural herbs in treating disease and, as part of the training of rural doctors, might even examine the medical implications of the psychology of consulting saints. Departments of history, literature, musicology, philosophy and religious studies could consider recruiting faculty with skills other than those honored in Western institutions.

Furthermore, the structure and organization of the university should be examined in light of local needs. In addition to the traditional Western disciplines, there is a case for having on the one hand, a School of Rural Studies, encompassing agriculture, anthropology and rural preventive medicine, and on the other, a School of Urban Studies, sensitized to the link between city and country, labor migrations, ethnic associations, criminology and urban preventive medicine. Other possibilities include schools of Oral Tradition and Historiography, Languages and Oral Literature, and Religion and the supernatural. In the years which are now unfolding, *water* may be the big cause of conflicts of the future. Middle Eastern societies are particularly vulnerable to rivalry about water supplies.

More generally, the university's role in society should be examined. In Tanzania, the late Julius Nyerere recognized a link between a country's educational system and its people's economic ambitions and therefore has sought to modify drastically the Tanzanian educational system. Under Nyerere's watch the University of Dar es Salaam was being reorganized to change the type of manpower it produces and to transform the type of values it transmits. Changes in admissions policies, such as assessing motivation as well as intellectual competence. Class sizes were already being determined on the basis of planned manpower projections. While it is too early to predict the final outcome of such experiments, Tanzania has clearly recognized the need to domesticate its cultural multinational corporation.

The Strategy of Diversification

Another strategy for decolonizing modernity involves diversifying the cultural content of modernity. This approach rests partly on the assumption that just as economically it is a greater risk to be dependent on one country than on many, so also culturally one foreign benefactor is more constraining than many. To be owned by one person is to be enslaved outright; to be owned by many masters, who can be played against one another, may be the beginning of freedom. In terms of culture, reliance on one external reference group is outright dependency; reliance on a diversity of external civilizations may be the beginning of autonomy. That is true globalization.

It is not enough, however, for the universities to combine African traditions with those from the West. A dual process must occur: increased localization, as the society is permitted to reciprocate the impact of the university; and increased internationalization,

as the foreign component in the university becomes less Eurocentric and more attentive to other aspects of the total human heritage.

It is more important than ever that both Euro-colonial and American branch campuses take seriously the cultures and experiments of other civilizations. The educational system should focus not only on Europe and Africa, but also on Indian, Chinese and, most important, Islamic civilizations. Although Arabic is the most widely spoken language on the African continent, it has received little attention in African curricula south of the Sahara, even in those countries which border Arabic-speaking areas or have large numbers of Muslim citizens. This insensitivity to Arabic needs to change.

As for Chinese studies, interest in Mao Tse-tung and beyond is evident in some political science departments these days, but Confucius is still ignored. Contemporary China is becoming a major factor in world affairs. We definitely need to learn about American historical traditions, as well as European. A conscious effort to learn more about what is done in India, and to understand its relevance to African and Muslim needs could contribute important practical knowledge. Both India and China have much to teach about intermediate technology, intermediate medicine and new methods of agriculture, as well as about ideology and economic organization.

CONCLUSION

In the 20th century European imperial powers experimented with branches of their universities located in their colonies. These Euro-colonial educational branches included Gordon Memorial College in Sudan, the University of Hong Kong established

by Lord Lugard, and the sub-Saharan academic jewels at Ibadan, Legon in Ghana, Makerere in Uganda, and the University of Malaya in Kuala Lumpur.

In the postcolonial era it is American universities which have taken the lead in establishing branches in the Global South. But the American University in Beirut, and the American universities in Cairo and Nairobi are not branches of metropolitan institutions but have been autonomous cultural influences. Such inferences have helped in creating an Americanized elite in their respective countries in Africa and/or the Muslim world.

Somewhere between the ancient approximations of international centers of learning like Timbuktu and the more recent trends towards a global university, there lies the stage of universities as cultural multinational corporations. We have examined the ramifications, and the effort to decolonize modernity. Africa and the Muslim world have needed to distinguish between Westernization and modernization.

But at least as fundamental is the issue of how much Western science owes to other civilizations. From the Indus Valley to ancient Egypt, from imperial China to medieval Islam, the West has found intellectual and scientific benefactors. Very little of this history is communicated to young children in African schools. Their sense of awe about the West becomes a foundation for subsequent intellectual dependency. African secondary school curricula should contain a compulsory paper which places science in its proper historical context, reveals the diversity of the human heritage and breaks the dangerous myth of a Western scientific monopoly.

Another change which should be introduced into primary and secondary schools would require each African child to learn a minimum of three languages — one European, one Asian, and one African. The era of learning multiple European languages,

some ancient and some modern, while other linguistic heritages are ignored, should come rapidly to an end.

At the university level a course on “Great Systems of Thought,” with examples drawn from the range of human cultures, should be required of all undergraduates in the humanities and social sciences. All undergraduates, regardless of field, should take either an African or an Asian language at an advanced level. In addition, they should take a course on a Third World civilization, preferably but not necessarily linked to the language of their choice.

University reforms will require a fundamental change in attitude for all departments of African and Muslim universities — away from excessive Eurocentrism and toward both increased localization and increased internationalization. This broader focus could change the African university into a truly multicultural corporation.

The Strategy of Counter-Penetration

Domestication of modernity and diversification of Africa’s cultural content will not be fully achieved until Islam can once again influence Western civilization. There are reformers in Africa and the Muslim world who urge only localization, some of them to the extent of espousing cultural autarky. But withdrawal from world culture would result in the continuing marginality of Africa and the Ummah in global affairs in a world which has shrunk to the point where many decisions can affect the entire human race. It would be futile for Muslims to attempt a strategy of withdrawal or total disengagement. Modernity is here to stay; the task is to decolonize it. A world culture is evolving fast; the task is to save it from excessive Eurocentrism.¹⁴

Here the strategy of counter-penetration becomes vital. If African Islamic cultures have been so permeated by Western culture, can they in turn affect Western thought and values?

Islamic influence was once great in the West. The West has not completely escaped Africa's cultural influence either. It has been asserted that the first piece of African carving to reach Europe arrived on a Portuguese trading ship in 1504. African workmanship in leather and probably gold reached Europe much earlier.¹⁵ Africa's impact on jazz and related forms of music through its sons and daughters enslaved and exported to the New World has already been documented. So has the influence of African tales on the literature of other lands, particularly the Southern United States and the Caribbean.¹⁶

But when all is said and done, Africa's recent cultural influence on the West has been far more modest than the West's influence on Africa. The asymmetry will continue for at least the rest of this century, but the balance of cultural trade can begin to be restored. Africa will need allies in its efforts at counter-penetration. The continent's most natural allies consist of the Arab world and the Black Diaspora. Arabs share a continent with black people. Indeed, the majority of Arabs and the bulk of Arab land are within Africa. The organization of African Unity includes both black and Arab states. It may be possible to exploit these circumstances to the advantage of both peoples.

Arab oil producers have already started economic counter-penetration of the West. Their activities range from buying real estate in England to controlling banks in the United States, from acquiring shares in West German industry to extending loans to Italy. As a result, the West, while eager for petroleum dollars, is anxious about their long-term

consequences for Western economic independence.¹⁷ There is some risk that the Arab oil producers might start playing an imperial role in Africa. They have begun to invest in multinational corporations operating in Africa. But with the risk of a new imperialism comes an opportunity for a Third World alliance. Once again economic power and cultural influence might be linked.

The rise of the Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries (OPEC) in world affairs, however transient, may herald the political resurrection of Islam. Presently, two-thirds of the membership of OPEC — that portion which controls more than two-thirds of OPEC's oil reserves — is Muslim. Before the end of this century African Muslims may outnumber Arabs and will be making a strong bid for shared leadership of Islam. While money for Islamic counter-penetration would probably come from Arab oil-producers, Islamic counter-penetration in the United States could be, in part, a process of transmitting African indigenous perspectives. It would not be surprising if, within the next decade, black African Muslims establish schools and hospitals in Harlem and preach Islam to African Americans. Globalization will unravel more surprises, every new decade.

African Americans are at least as important as Arab money for African cultural entry into the West. As citizens of the richest and mightiest country in the twentieth century, they form, after Nigeria, the largest black nation in the English-speaking world. As African Americans become more affluent, as they confront fewer social and political barriers and as they participate more vigorously in the intellectual and creative world, their influence is bound to rise. The rise of Barack Obama to the presidency of the United States was the pinnacle of Black empowerment.

Both Euro-colonial and American universities can play a critical role in building the alliance with African Americans. Through black America they could reach the other Western nations. In pursuit of globalization, African universities would do well to encourage more African Americans to study in Africa. Here again, Arab money could be used for scholarships. South American and Caribbean Blacks similarly could be encouraged to attend African universities. We should remember that counter-penetration will take longer than diversification but it is critical for globalization. Counter-penetration would require that Africans possess the economic and technical resources to develop innovations which the rest of the world could use. If Africans can build a genuine partnership between indigenous cultures and educational systems, stimulated by the input of foreign cultural, intellectual, and technical skills, they may become leaders, not just followers, of academic trends. In the first decade of this century half a dozen more African countries have become oil-rich. This petro-wealth may help African empowerment, alongside their Arab neighbors.

The full maturity of global education will come only when Africans and Muslims develop a capacity to innovate independently. That independence will require Africans and Muslims to attempt three great tasks: balancing the weight of Western influence with its own culture, permitting non-Western civilizations to reveal their secrets to their neighbors, to researchers and teachers. Africans and Muslims should aspire to transform their own educational and intellectual world. They should aspire to make genuine creativity possible. Only then will Africans and Muslims be on the way toward meeting that elusive but compelling imperative — not only to decolonize modernity, nor even merely to participate in it, but also to help define modernity in Islamic and African terms.

A universal religion called Islam is in search of a global university worthy of that universalism. And a continent which gave birth to the human species has started the process of globalizing its cultural influence. The struggle continues.

NOTES

1. "U.S. Universities Overseas Abroad: Failure is a Reality," *Huffington Post*, <http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2011/10/20/US-universities-overseas>.
2. Quoted from *The Observer* (London). See back cover of Ibn Khaldun *The Muqaddimah: An Introduction to History*, translated from the Arabic by Franz Rosenthal (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1989 reprint).
3. Ibn Battuta, (1304 to 1369) born in Tangier, Morocco; Islamic scholar; considered one of the greatest travelers of all time. He journeyed more than 75,000 miles (121,000 km).
4. See Garland Hampton Cannon and Alan S. Kaye, *The Arabic Contributions to the English Language; An Historical Dictionary*, (Weisbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 1994).
5. For a general discussion of imperialism, see George H. Nadel, (ed.), *Imperialism and Colonialism* (London: Macmillan, 1964); Harrison M. Wright, (ed.), *The New Imperialism* (Boston: D. C. Heath, 1961); Carlton J. H. Hayes, *A Generation of Materialism, 1871–1900* (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1941), p. 218–22; Joseph A. Schumpeter, *Imperialism and Social Classes*, Heinz Norden, (trans.) and Paul Sweezy (ed.) (New York: A. M. Kelley, 1961).
6. Eric Ashby, *African Universities and Western Tradition* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1964), p. 3.
7. Ashby, p. 38.
8. Judith Lynn Hanna, "African Dance: The Continuity of Change," *Yearbook of the International Folk Music Council*, 5 (1974). I am grateful to Dr. Hanna for allowing me to read her article in typescript.

9. The first non-European instructor who was hired by MIOME was an Ismaili Indian, Badruddin Pirmohamad. Although he was the first instructor of Muslim faith, his field was electrical engineering.
10. Graham M. Bull, "Impressions of a Medical Tour of the Eastern and Western Regions of Nigeria," *West African Medical Journal*, NS IX (1960), pp. 139–144.
11. For examples of works which have creatively used Marxist categories, see Samir Amin, "Capitalism and Development in the Ivory Coast," in *African Politics and Society*, Irving Leonard (ed.) (New York: Free Press, 1970), pp. 277–288; and Giovanni Arrighi and John S. Saul, *Essays on the Political Economy of Africa* (New York: Monthly Review Press, 1973); E. A. Brett, *Colonialism and Underdevelopment in East Africa* (London: Heinemann, 1972); and Colin Leys, *Underdevelopment in Kenya: The Political Economy of Neo-Colonialism* (London: Heinemann, 1975).
12. Okot p'Bitek, "Indigenous Ills," *Transition* 7, No. 32 (1967), p. 47.
13. p'Bitek, p. 47.
14. The Eurocentrism of world culture is discussed with passion and insight by Chinweizu, *The West and the Rest of Us: White Predators, Black Slavers and the African Elite* (New York: Random House, 1975); chapters 14–16 are particularly relevant to this article. See also Ali A. Mazrui, *World Culture and the Black Experience* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1974).
15. Paul Bohannon and Philip Curtin, *Africa and Africans* (New York: Natural History Press, 1971), pp. 97–98.
16. Bohannon and Curtin, p. 82.

17. For a fuller discussion, see Ali A. Mazrui, “The New Interdependence: From Hierarchy to Symmetry,” in *The U.S. and World Development: Agenda for Action, 1975*, James W. Howe (ed.) (Washington, DC: Overseas Development Council, 1975).