**Examining Distributed Ledger Technology (DLT) for V2X Communication: A Self-Organizing Renewable Energy Grid using the IOTA 2.0 Framework**

Author

**James O’Connor**

**Masters in Engineering (MEng) in Connected and Autonomous Vehicles**

Institute of Technology, Sligo

Supervisor of Research:  Donny Hurley

Submitted to the Quality Qualifications Ireland (QQI)

Month, Year

###### TABLE OF CONTENTS

[1. INTRODUCTION 1](#_Toc85741244)

[1.1 Problem Statement 1](#_Toc85741245)

[1.2 Rationale For Research 2](#_Toc85741246)

[1.3 Purpose and Scope 5](#_Toc85741247)

[1.4 Hypothesis 5](#_Toc85741248)

[2. Literature Review 1](#_Toc85741249)

[3. Methodology 1](#_Toc85741250)

[3.1 Research Design 1](#_Toc85741251)

[3.2 Procedure 1](#_Toc85741252)

[3.3 Project Plan 2](#_Toc85741253)

[References 1](#_Toc85741254)

**STUDENT DECLARATION**

By inserting my name below, I declare that this material, which I now submit for assessment, is my own work and that any assistance I received in its preparation is fully acknowledged and disclosed in the document. To the best of my knowledge and belief, all sources have been properly acknowledged, and the assessment task contains no plagiarism.

I understand that plagiarism, collusion, and/or copying is a grave and serious offence in the Institute and am aware that penalties could include a zero mark for this module, suspension or expulsion from the Institute.

I acknowledge that this assessment submission may be transferred and stored in a database for the purposes of data-matching to help detect plagiarism. I declare that this document was prepared by me for the purpose of partial fulfilment of requirements for the Degree Programme I am registered on. I also declare that this assignment, or any part of it, has not been previously submitted by me or any other person for assessment on this or any other course of study either at IT Sligo or another college.

Signed: **James O’Connor** Date: 19/10/2021

**Ethical Considerations (where applicable)**

I will follow the conditions of the Ethical Conduct for research involving humans. If required, Ethical approval for this research will be obtained from the Institute of Technology Sligo Ethics Commi

###### CHAPTER ONE

# INTRODUCTION

## Problem Statement

With driverless cars already operational in a number of countries, autonomous driving systems are rapidly becoming a reality as a mode of intelligent transportation. It has been predicted that by 2025 there will be over eight million vehicles on our roads with level three and above autonomy [1], based on the SAE definitions for automation systems for on-road motor vehicles [2]. Vehicle-to-everything (V2X) communication is an over-arching term that encapsulates vehicle-to-vehicle (V2V), vehicle-to-infrastructure (V2I) and vehicle-to-pedestrian (V2P). With the projected rate of growth in vehicles of this magnitude, finding a way for these vehicles to communicate with each other, with users and with their environment that is secure, scalable and standardised remains an open research question [3]. From a security perspective, a number of challenges still exist including availability (flooding, blackhole and greyhole attacks), data privacy (eavesdropping, location tracking, non-repudiation), data integrity (injection, replay and spoofing attacks) and authenticity (Sybil and man-in-the-middle attacks) [3]. From a scalability perspective, it is estimated that 125 million cars with embedded connectivity will ship between 2018 and 2022, which will lead to higher traffic and usage of autonomous vehicle services and applications and their supporting DSRC and C-V2X protocols. In addition to this, as the industry moves towards autonomy, these supporting services and applications will also need to be autonomous to capture the benefits and opportunities of autonomous vehicles. In terms of standardization, there is no universal standardised framework for V2X integration. Many of the standards for 5G communication are still under development, and standards differ across countries, geopolitical areas and consortiums [4]. The lack of operability among heterogeneous devices poses a challenge to adoption rates of autonomous vehicles [3].

## Rationale For Research

Approximately 94% of all serious accidents on roads are due to human error [5]. Autonomous vehicles have the capability to dramatically increase safety on our roads, which is beneficial on both an economic and societal level. From an environmental perspective autonomous vehicles can provide smooth traffic control, a reduction traffic congestion and vehicle ownership, cutting fuel cost and vehicle emissions [5]. The current challenges for V2X communication outlined in the problem statement (security, scalability and standardisation) could hinder the rollout and adoption of autonomous vehicles and inevitably the benefits that come with them. In order to solve for these issues a ubiquitous communication platform for frictionless data and value transfer between machines and humans that is secure, scalable and standardised may be the solution to this problem.

This is the promise by the open-source IOTA Framework. The IOTA framework is a relatively new Distributed Ledger Technology (DLT), a term synonymous with the recent blockchain paradigm. A distributed ledger is a database of recorded transactions between two parties that is shared and synced across multiple sites, institutions or geographies that is accessible by multiple people. The core principle of the IOTA network is “The Tangle”, which is a Directed Acyclic Graph (DAG) data structure that the network is formed around. The IOTA Foundation (a non-profit organization and creator of IOTA) defines the Tangle as the first distributed ledger technology solution built for the “Internet of Everything” that enables relationships between machines and humans through a network designed for exchanging value and data [6].

From a security perspective, distributed ledger technologies provide accurate and immutable records for data exchanges and interactions between users, vehicles and infrastructure. They are more resistant than the traditional client-server architectures to the aforementioned cyber-attacks such as Sybil and man-in-the-middle attacks due to the removal of the centralized server as a single point of failure [7]. Once a transaction is confirmed and added to the network, it cannot be modified or tampered with. Each time a transaction is added to the network, a cryptographic problem needs to be solved, which requires some computational power. This is called “Proof-of-Work” (PoW). The Tangle network uses PoW to discourage spamming through adapting the difficulty of the cryptographic problem to be solved if a node tries to spam the network. This has the potential to reduce the likelihood of Brute-Force and DDoS attacks on AVs and their supporting infrastructure.

From a scalability perspective, the Tangle network operates in such a way that it is more performant the more nodes participate in the network. In essence, it gets faster the more users it has [8].

From a standardisation perspective, the IOTA framework is open-source, feeless and can be run on any type of computing device that is connected to the internet. This is in contrast to the current state-of-the-art in V2X communication protocols. Already there are two protocols for V2X communications, namely the DSRC protocol developed in the US [9] and the ITS-G5 protocol developed to be the European standard [10], showing a divergence in approaches on a global level.

In recent years, DLT networks, particularly Proof-of-Work (PoW) networks have faced scrutiny over the energy cost of running their underlying networks. Each time a transaction is added to the network, a cryptographic problem is presented to the network to be solved or “mined” by a “miner”, which requires computational power and thus consumes energy. As a reward for this work, the miner that solves the problem first gets rewarded. Most notably, the Bitcoin network has been estimated to consume between 73 and 78.3 terrawatt-hours (TWh) per year due to this mining approach [11]. The Tangle network, by comparison, has no miners and all PoW is done on the node where the transaction originates, thus resulting in a drastic reduction in energy consumption to run the network. A recent paper classified the IOTA network as “exceptional” when comparing the network to other networks and payment protocols such as Bitcoin, Ethereum, VISA and Mastercard [12].

In order to explore the IOTA framework, a use-case scenario is presented in this research proposal. The use-case scenario to test the applicability of the IOTA framework will be a **smart connected energy grid** simulation**.** The general idea is that charge points and autonomous vehicles can communicate over the IOTA network to optimise the supply and demand of energy consumption and production, utilising the autonomy of the vehicles to self-organise and charge themselves without human intervention.

In terms of the use-case scenario; there are many potential advantages to investigating this use case:

1. The ability for the IOTA framework to provide seamless data and value transfer between charge points and autonomous vehicles can be tested.
2. When there is excess energy being produced by energy sources (solar, wind) the supply can be more dynamically priced so that energy becomes cheaper as a function of its supply and demand.
3. Machine learning models can be deployed to create a smart grid; where vehicles can forecast the generation of energy at charge points at any point in time.
4. Autonomous vehicles could collectively provide a battery storage system for a glut of renewable energy.
5. Autonomous vehicles could sell energy back to the grid when the demand is high using the IOTA protocol.
6. Private charge points could potentially be connected to the IOTA network and used as a revenue stream, promoting the production of renewable energy charge points.

The IOTA framework has already been proven to work in a number of use cases, and this is further expanded upon in the literature review. However, as of September 2021 the IOTA foundation launched IOTA 2.0 with a number of radical upgrades, including a fully decentralized network, more robust security features, marking an important milestone in the IOTA foundation history [13]. The IOTA foundation have also, as of 2021, introduced smart contract capabilities [14]. Smart contracts are digital contracts stored on a blockchain that automatically get executed when predetermined conditions are met [15]. Combining the IOTA framework with smart contract functionality could have huge potential for automating service and applications within the autonomous vehicle eco-system. As of today this space has been relatively unexplored.

## Purpose and Scope

This research has two purposes. The predominant purpose is to examine the demonstrate the benefits and limitations of the IOTA 2.0 Framework for V2X communication (data and value transfers). To be specific, this research will:

1. Compare DLT to the current state-of-the-art to traditional architectures.
2. Identify the benefits and limitations of the IOTA Framework.
3. Quantify the ease of developing decentralized applications using the IOTA framework.
4. Propose an approach to deploying next-generation applications for autonomous vehicles.
5. Highlight future applications and areas for future research.

The scope of this research will be limited to a simple use-case scenario: A smart grid, with a set number of energy producers and energy consumers, where the connected autonomous vehicles (the consumers) can decide when to go and get charged at charge points (producers), based on availability of energy at nearby charge points.

## Hypothesis

In order to examine the new IOTA 2.0 framework and its applications in detail, the following hypothesis is proposed:

**The IOTA framework can be used as a viable V2X communication layer that allows for secure and scalable data and value transfer between autonomous vehicles and charge points in a self-organizing renewable energy grid.**

###### CHAPTER TWO

# Literature Review

The IOTA framework has already demonstrated value in a number of areas. In [16] a DLT-based charging and billing mechanism for EAVs was proposed to demonstrate machine-to-machine (M2M) micropayments for electric vehicles. The study conceptualised the charger-to-vehicle relationship using a Raspberry Pi and a temperature sensor; and created a framework that demonstrated the viability of using the Tangle for transferring value from one machine to another. In [17] the authors examined the Tangle as a viable alternative to the shortcomings of traditional blockchains for vehicular applications, namely large transaction confirmation times, concluding smaller transaction delays as well as high performance using the encryption mechanism provided by the Tangle.

From an implementation perspective, Jaguar Land Rover, in collaboration with the Mobility Open Blockchain Initiative (MOBI) have demonstrated a system using the IOTA framework that allows drivers to earn cryptocurrency by allowing their cars to report useful road conditions including potholes and traffic congestion to authorities and navigation providers [18]. Another interesting project based on the IOTA framework was carried out by the research institute ElaadNL who have created “the first ever IOTA-based EV charging station” [19]. This research group built both the charging station hardware as well as the IOTA software and demonstrated how IOTA can be used to monitor energy usage.

In [20] and [21] the use of the IOTA framework for access control of IoT systems (information which would traditionally be stored on a centralized server) was investigated. Both studies proved that the framework was lightweight enough to create a decentralized and scalable access control framework solution for IoT devices.

From the perspective of the use case scenario, a self-organizing connected renewable energy grid, there have been a number of approaches to this. [22] looked at modelling shared autonomous electric vehicles from the perspective of the benefits to the energy grid. Using a case study in Tokyo, this research showed that shared autonomous electric vehicle fleet would only need to be about 10 – 14% in comparison to a fleet of private cars based on today private vehicle ownership levels. Optimising the charging schedules of this reduced fleet size of connected autonomous electric vehicles has the potential to act as an energy storage solution for surplus renewable energy. This was demonstrated in [23] where it was proposed that autonomous electric vehicles could absorb 50% of the yearly excess renewable energy generation that would have to be otherwise curtailed, in a forecasted model for Germany in 2030. Linking these ideas using V2X communication over the IOTA network for data and value transfer between machines is the core idea of the use-case scenario for this research.

Sections

1. V2X Technology
   1. Intro
   2. V2X Standard
      1. Dedicated Short-Range Communications (DSRC) protocol (US)
      2. Intelligent Transportation System (ITS)-G5 protocol (Europe)
   3. V2X Access Layers
      1. IEEE 802.11p communication system
      2. C-V2X communication system
   4. Current Issues & Limitations
2. Distributed Ledger Technology
   1. Intro

The definition of Distributed Ledger Technology (DLT) is not an easily defined concept. Definitions can be wide-varying and often conflicting, depending on the author, audience and industry in which it is defined. Some definitions are more ontological with others being more technical.

[24] defines DLT as a consensus machine; a system with multiple actors who agree on a set of shared data and its validity, in the absence of a centralized co-ordinator. In comparison to traditional databases, both distributed and centralized, DLTs key features are rooted in data integrity in an adversarial environment. It is a system of electronic records that enables a network of participants (nodes) to reach a consensus on the authoritative order of transactions, which are linked using cryptographic hashes and persisted across all nodes of the network. This multi-party consensus produces a ledger, which is the authoritative version of transaction history.

In the financial realm, the European Central Bank defines DLTs as a technology that enables users to store and access information relating to one or more assets in a shared database of transactions and balances [25]. A transaction is a cryptographically signed authorised attempt to change the status of this database. It allows users to reach a consensus on a specific version of the ledger, meaning that with enough actors, there cannot be any manual alteration of the ledger. Cryptographic solutions with economic incentives replace the concept of central validation.

<one more definition here>

* 1. Blockchain as form of DLT

DLT has been around in concept since the mid 1990s, built on a thought experiment on a consensus mechanism called “The Byzantine Generals’ Problem” created in 1982 [26]. In many cases the terms DLT and blockchain are used interchangeably. In some sense this is true, blockchain is a type (and most popular form) of DLT. Bitcoin, which is a cryptocurrency developed in 2008 under the pseudonym Satoshi Nakamoto [27], made use of the blockchain protocol and brought the technology into mainstream focus for the first time.

Ethereum is another open-source blockchain protocol second in popularity and similar to the Bitcoin protocol, but with the addition of smart contract functionality. Smart contracts are codified business rules that automatically execute on network nodes allowing the network to operate in a fully autonomous and decentralized manner [28].

* 1. DLT Tech in AV industry

Search Keywords:

Blockchain, Autonomous Vehicle

Although research into DLTs has been increasing rapidly over the last ten years, the research within the CAV space, seems to be lagging behind other industries such as the financial, healthcare, education <give the example here>.

[29] looked at using a blockchain framework for securing CAVs from smart device tampering by malicious attackers looking to compromise the communication channels of the vehicles. Using a blockchain framework, where vehicles operate as both nodes in the network, (much like the structure of today’s VANETs), each vehicle is aware of all valid actors and devices in the network. Any alteration or deletion of information to vehicle data or user data will come to the notice of other devices. This approach showed a 79% success rate in the detection of malicious attacks when compared to the traditional VANET architecture.

[30] highlight the need for novel Machine-to-Machine (M2M) communication paradigms to connect energy producers, consumers and providers. This paper states that blockchain transactions could be fundamental to energy trading applications and platforms. This paper highlights the possibility for the use of the Ethereum platform to build this trading application. [30] concludes by highlighting the abundance of additional service applications that could be built on top of this using the Ethereum platform including reservation of charge points, selection based on traffic conditions, battery status, charging intensity.

Indicative of the advance in the technology, five years since [30] outlined a conceptual model, [[link](file:///Users/joconnor/Downloads/sustainability-13-07962%20(1).pdf)] built on this idea by creating a fully-fledged P2P payment and energy trading system using IBM blockchain technology. This solution aims to reduce the level of human interaction and increase privacy, transparency and trust among EV participants. Scalability was also highlighted as another key benefit of blockchain technology, in this instance, optimal transaction confirmations of 825 per second were observed.

[Link](https://click.endnote.com/viewer?doi=10.1109%2Ftetci.2018.2880693&token=WzM0OTYyNjAsIjEwLjExMDkvdGV0Y2kuMjAxOC4yODgwNjkzIl0.t6cv3SgRqE08JaSKn2kPI_OkL5g) – builds on above point

From a security perspective, [31] explores the use of blockchain to increase the robustness of AV security to cyberattacks. The study proposes that the majority of solutions to current cybersecurity threats to AVs today are based on centralized hub-and-spoke architecture which creates a single point of failure and that blockchain-based solutions. Research challenges highlighted include system throughput, scalability, and proper authentication of nodes prior to joining the network.

* 1. Intro to IOTA

1. The IOTA Framework – Makes this the biggest section
   1. Background
   2. Current Use Cases
2. Renewable Energy
   1. Intro to energy with re to AVs
   2. Utilization of renewable resources currently
   3. Studies on smart grids/ connected grids
   4. DLT in renewable energy

\*Manchester University Phrase Bank

<https://www.phrasebank.manchester.ac.uk/>

Other Papers :

Route Guidance Decision Scheme - [Link](https://click.endnote.com/viewer?doi=10.1109%2Ftvt.2016.2572123&token=WzM0OTYyNjAsIjEwLjExMDkvdHZ0LjIwMTYuMjU3MjEyMyJd.hnv9TDtW7_dLtjqGDtUcGx6gPpk)

Simulator - [Link](http://nile.wpi.edu/NS/)

“Hub-and-spoke”

## 

# References

[1] ABIResearch. "ABI Research Forecasts 8 Million Vehicles to Ship with SAE Level 3, 4 and 5 Autonomous Technology in 2025." <https://www.abiresearch.com/press/abi-research-forecasts-8-million-vehicles-ship-sae-level-3-4-and-5-autonomous-technology-2025/> (accessed October 31, 2020, 2020).

[2] *Taxonomy and Definitions for Terms Related to Driving Automation Systems for On-Road Motor Vehicles*, S. International, 2021. [Online]. Available: <https://www.sae.org/standards/content/j3016_202104/>

[3] A. Alnasser, H. Sun, and J. Jiang, "Cyber security challenges and solutions for V2X communications: A survey," *Computer Networks,* vol. 151, pp. 52-67, 2019-03-01 2019, doi: 10.1016/j.comnet.2018.12.018.

[4] A. Moubayed and A. Shami, "Softwarization, Virtualization, & Machine Learning For Intelligent & Effective V2X Communications," *IEEE Intelligent Transportation Systems Magazine,* pp. 0-0, 2020-01-01 2020, doi: 10.1109/mits.2020.3014124.

[5] NHTSA. "Automated Vehicles for Safety." NHTSA. <https://www.nhtsa.gov/technology-innovation/automated-vehicles-safety/> (accessed 19th Oct, 2021).

[6] I. Foundation. "What is IOTA." The IOTA Foundation. <https://www.iota.org/get-started/what-is-iota> (accessed October 19th  2021).

[7] R. Zhang, R. Xue, and L. Liu, "Security and Privacy on Blockchain," *ACM Computing Surveys,* vol. 52, no. 3, pp. 1-34, 2019-07-27 2019, doi: 10.1145/3316481.

[8] Interestingengineering.com. "IOTA : A Cryptocurrency With Infinite Scalability And No Fees." <https://interestingengineering.com/iota-a-cryptocurrency-with-infinite-scalability-and-no-fees> (accessed October 19th, 2021).

[9] K. Abboud, H. A. Omar, and W. Zhuang, "Interworking of DSRC and Cellular Network Technologies for V2X Communications: A Survey," *IEEE Transactions on Vehicular Technology,* vol. 65, no. 12, pp. 9457-9470, 2016-12-01 2016, doi: 10.1109/tvt.2016.2591558.

[10] R. F. Atallah, M. J. Khabbaz, and C. M. Assi, "Vehicular networking: A survey on spectrum access technologies and persisting challenges," *Vehicular Communications,* vol. 2, no. 3, pp. 125-149, 2015-07-01 2015, doi: 10.1016/j.vehcom.2015.03.005.

[11] L. Badea and M. C. Mungiu-Pupazan, "The Economic and Environmental Impact of Bitcoin," *IEEE Access,* vol. 9, pp. 48091-48104, 2021-01-01 2021, doi: 10.1109/access.2021.3068636.

[12] A. A. Sori, M. Golsorkhtabaramiri, and A. M. Rahmani, "Cryptocurrency Grade of Green; IOTA Energy Consumption Modeling and Measurement," in *2020 IEEE Green Technologies Conference(GreenTech)*, 2020-04-01 2020: IEEE, doi: 10.1109/greentech46478.2020.9289803.

[13] T. I. Foundation. "IOTA 2.0: Details on Current Status and Next Steps." <https://blog.iota.org/iota-2-0-details-on-current-status-and-outlook/> (accessed.

[14] T. I. Foundation. "IOTA Smart Contracts Protocol Alpha Release." The IOTA Foundation. <https://blog.iota.org/iota-smart-contracts-protocol-alpha-release/> (accessed October 21st 2021).

[15] IBM. "What are smart contracts on blockchain?" IBM. <https://www.ibm.com/topics/smart-contracts> (accessed October 21, 2021).

[16] D. Strugar, R. Hussain, M. Mazzara, V. Rivera, J. Young Lee, and R. Mustafin, "On M2M Micropayments: A Case Study of Electric Autonomous Vehicles," in *2018 IEEE International Conference on Internet of Things (iThings) and IEEE Green Computing and Communications (GreenCom) and IEEE Cyber, Physical and Social Computing (CPSCom) and IEEE Smart Data (SmartData)*, 2018-07-01 2018: IEEE, doi: 10.1109/cybermatics\_2018.2018.00283.

[17] P. C. Bartolomeu, E. Vieira, and J. Ferreira, "IOTA Feasibility and Perspectives for Enabling Vehicular Applications," in *2018 IEEE Globecom Workshops (GC Wkshps)*, 2018-12-01 2018: IEEE, doi: 10.1109/glocomw.2018.8644201.

[18] J. L. Rover. "ON THE MONEY: EARN AS YOU DRIVE WITH JAGUAR LAND ROVER." <https://www.jaguarlandrover.com/news/2019/04/money-earn-you-drive-jaguar-land-rover> (accessed October 19th, 2021).

[19] Elaad. "IOTA Charging Station." <https://www.elaad.nl/projects/iota-charging-station/> (accessed.

[20] S. K. Pinjala and K. M. Sivalingam, "DCACI: A Decentralized Lightweight Capability Based Access Control Framework using IOTA for Internet of Things," in *2019 IEEE 5th World Forum on Internet of Things (WF-IoT)*, 2019-04-01 2019: IEEE, doi: 10.1109/wf-iot.2019.8767356.

[21] R. Nakanishi, Y. Zhang, M. Sasabe, and S. Kasahara, "IOTA-Based Access Control Framework for the Internet of Things," in *2020 2nd Conference on Blockchain Research & Applications for Innovative Networks and Services (BRAINS)*, 2020-09-01 2020: IEEE, doi: 10.1109/brains49436.2020.9223293.

[22] R. Iacobucci, B. Mclellan, and T. Tezuka, "Modeling shared autonomous electric vehicles: Potential for transport and power grid integration," *Energy,* vol. 158, pp. 148-163, 2018-09-01 2018, doi: 10.1016/j.energy.2018.06.024.

[23] D. Dallinger and M. Wietschel, "Grid integration of intermittent renewable energy sources using price-responsive plug-in electric vehicles," *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews,* vol. 16, no. 5, pp. 3370-3382, 2012-06-01 2012, doi: 10.1016/j.rser.2012.02.019.

[24] M. Rauchs *et al.*, "Distributed Ledger Technology Systems: A Conceptual Framework," *SSRN Electronic Journal,* 2018-01-01 2018, doi: 10.2139/ssrn.3230013.

[25] A. Pinna and W. Ruttenberg, "Distributed ledger technologies in

securities post-trading," ed: European Central Bank, 2016.

[26] L. LAMPORT, R. SHOSTAK, and M. PEASE, "The Byzantine Generals Problem," *ACM Transactions on Programming Languages and System,* vol. 4, pp. 382-401, 1982.

[27] S. Nakamoto, "Bitcoin: A Peer-to-Peer Electronic Cash System," 2008,

[28] V. Buterin. "A Next-Generation Smart Contract and Decentralized Application Platform." <https://ethereum.org/en/whitepaper/> (accessed Nov 20th, 2021).

[29] Rathee, Sharma, Iqbal, Aloqaily, Jaglan, and Kumar, "A Blockchain Framework for Securing Connected and Autonomous Vehicles," *Sensors,* vol. 19, no. 14, p. 3165, 2019-07-18 2019, doi: 10.3390/s19143165.

[30] M. Pustisek, A. Kos, and U. Sedlar, "Blockchain Based Autonomous Selection of Electric Vehicle Charging Station," in *2016 International Conference on Identification, Information and Knowledge in the Internet of Things (IIKI)*, 2016-10-01 2016: IEEE, doi: 10.1109/iiki.2016.60.

[31] R. Gupta, S. Tanwar, N. Kumar, and S. Tyagi, "Blockchain-based security attack resilience schemes for autonomous vehicles in industry 4.0: A systematic review," *Computers & Electrical Engineering,* vol. 86, p. 106717, 2020-09-01 2020, doi: 10.1016/j.compeleceng.2020.106717.